

## **Background Information:**

### **Consent Calendar:**

2. **Approval of the June 8, 2016 Meeting Minutes**
3. **Direct staff to continue collecting public input on the proposed schedule changes to meet minimum farebox recovery ratios, schedule a public hearing for the September 14, 2016 Transit Agency meeting, and work with transit partners to bring a revised schedule forward for adoption in September.**

Tuolumne County Transit services are constantly being reviewed and analyzed by staff. Staff recommends alterations to the schedule to meet established performance standards and State mandated farebox recovery ratios at regular intervals.

One trend in public transportation that has been persistent and unwavering is increasing costs. This takes an especially harsh toll on performance measures as it drives numbers down. As contract costs have continued to rise, TCT farebox recovery has continued to fall. The farebox threshold for rural operators such as TCT is 10%. Historically, this number has been achieved without fail. Over the course of the last few years, farebox recovery for the system has been steadily falling. In addition to operating cost increases, population decline, low fuel costs and significant declines in enrollment in Columbia College, have contributed to ridership declines.

Over this same period, staff has made a series of changes to services and policies to help correct this trend. Strategies have included:

- Attempting to promote fixed route service ridership over Dial-a-Ride service
- Trying to increase ridership through incentives offered to target cohorts including, students and Veterans.
- Improving connections between routes
- Increasing service on selected routes
- Serving more directly potential high ridership locations, such as Columbia College and Chicken Ranch Casino
- Implement GPS tracking and NextBus technology

Although these recommendations have helped in various ways, none have proved to be the silver bullet. As a result, staff has identified changes that will be less popular for certain segments of the population, but will likely have a more substantial impact on curbing the downward progress of farebox. For the TCTA and public consideration, staff offers the following changes to the current schedule:

- Eliminate Route 6, replace with General Public Dial-a-Ride
- Eliminate 2 runs on Route 5 (one of the two proposed is not a full run of the route)
- Eliminate 1 run on Route 4
- Eliminate 1 run on Route 3
- Eliminate 1 run on Route 2
- Eliminate 1 run on Route 1

This strategy for cuts leaves the runs unchanged. Most of the routes during the day show consistent ridership. However, ridership dips considerably on the final run of the day on all routes. By eliminating this run, we preserve what is working and serve the community when ridership is strong.

Route 6 is the only route that will get a complete overhaul. Route 6 serves the rural low density residential neighborhoods of Phoenix Lake, Sonora Meadows and Crystal Falls. This type of development is particularly difficult to serve because of the lack of density in the area, and the distance of homes from the route. This route is performing so poorly, that staff believes the only way to correct the issue, is to employ a totally different strategy for the area. We are recommending eliminating the fixed route runs entirely in favor of serving the area with a General Public Dial-a-Ride.

This will allow Tuolumne County Transit to continue serving the area with budgeted 'service hours', while offering a more cost efficient service. The service is recommended to be general public, as our Saturday service is, so our existing riders in the area can continue to be served, albeit, at a higher cost (\$3 fare, as opposed to \$1.50). As an On Demand service, buses will only serve areas upon request.

### Fiscal Impacts

#### *Service Cuts Savings*

The cuts identified above, offer roughly 5 hours in reduced service hours. This pencils out to roughly 80,000 dollars in contract cost savings.

### Operating Contract

There is a clause in the operating contract for Tuolumne County Transit that changes to service hours of the contract; either a reduction or addition equivalent to 10% of the contracted number can trigger revisiting the service hour charge. This is potentially problematic as an increase in the contracted service hour charge will partially offset some of the proposed cuts. Staff will be particularly cognizant of this while considering options for the final schedule recommendations in September. If the TCTA conceptually supports a decrease in service hours, staff will initiate negotiations with Storer representatives. The purpose of these negotiations will be to comply with contracted obligations by allowing Storer to spread fixed overhead costs over fewer service hours.

### Outreach

Staff is seeking robust input on this update. This process is supported by this agenda item which will open a 30 day public comment period, with direct public input being accepted at the September 14, 2016 meeting of the Transit Agency. Additional outreach includes:

- a. Presentation of Draft service cuts and schedule changes to the Social Services Transit Advisory Council (SSTAC)- July 22, 2016
- b. Notice of proposed service changes on Tuolumne County Transit website
- c. Notice of proposed service changes posted on TCT vehicles

- d. Notice of proposed service changes shared with Columbia College administration
- e. Notice of proposed service changes shared via Facebook
- f. Notice of proposed service changes via Nextbus
- g. Notice of proposed service changes shared with community destinations likely to have TCT riders at their locations, including:
  - 1. Senior Center
  - 2. Columbia College
  - 3. Area 12 on Aging
- h. Targeted outreach to riders of Route 6, likely to be most affected by changes
- i. Coordination with Calaveras Transit
- j. Media release on proposed service changes

### Farebox Recovery Impact

Staff anticipates a 2-3% increase to Farebox recovery on each route as a result of the identified service reductions.

Route 6 currently has nearly 5 service hours dedicated to it (4hrs 42 minutes). Storer's initial estimate to serve the area with general public Dial-a-ride is 3 additional service hours. This results in 1 hour 42 minutes of 'service hour' savings. Currently, the farebox recovery for route 6 drags the system wide average down dramatically. Storer has made DAR service very efficient in recent years, and staff anticipates this new route will also be operated efficiently to the benefit of the system as a whole.

### **Attachments:**

*There are no attachments for this item.*

### **Recommendation:**

*Direct staff to continue collecting public input on the proposed service reductions, schedule a public hearing for the September 14, 2016 Transit Agency meeting, negotiate service hours and changes with Storer and work with Transit partners to bring a revised schedule forward for adoption in September.*

### **Regular Agenda:**

#### **4. Approval of donating surplus bus to Old Oak Ranch**

The Tuolumne County Transit agency is in receipt of a letter from the Old Oak Ranch administration, requesting the donation of 2 Tuolumne County Transit vehicles for evacuation and transportation purposes at the site.

Old Oak Ranch serves as a camp, conference center and educational facility teaching California Gold Rush history to private and public schools between the Bay Area and Central Valley. The site hosts 24 employees, all of which reside in Tuolumne County. The conference center intends to act as a resource to the community in time of need, offering lodging and meals to those who have been displaced.

Currently, Tuolumne County Transit has 5 new buses that it intends to receive with the first likely coming in August 2016 according the manufacturer. These new buses will require the surplus of the vehicles that they are replacing, or placement of current rolling stock as back up vehicles. The arrival of new vehicles will allow this request to be fulfilled should the TCTA wish to donate a vehicle to Old Oak Ranch.

Furthermore, the buses being replaced will have reached their useful life milestone and be under the \$5,000 threshold and according to FTA Circular guidance, eligible to be disposed of as the Transit Agency wishes.

*CIRCULAR FTA C 5010.1D November 1, 2008 Rev. 1, August 27, 2012*

Fair Market Value of Less than \$5,000 Value. After the service life of project property is reached, rolling stock and equipment with a unit market value of \$5,000 or less, or supplies with a total aggregate market value of \$5,000 or less, may be retained, sold, or otherwise disposed of with no obligation to reimburse FTA. Records of this action must be retained.

Although the request is for 2 buses, staff is recommending the donation of only one. There are typically many interested parties in the buses. Limiting the donation to 1 bus will still ensure the public at large has an opportunity to acquire buses for a very reasonable cost.

**Attachments:**

*Letter from Old Oak Ranch to Transit Manager requesting bus donation.*

**Recommendation:**

*Approve the donation of one bus to Old Oak Ranch as presented.*

**5. Approval of amendments to the Bus Advertising Policy to include the new contract amounts for advertising space on Tuolumne County Transit vehicles**

Recently, Tuolumne County Transit Agency contracted with Helen Foraker Advertising to sell advertising on Tuolumne County Transit vehicles.

This program is moving along very successfully. All of the spaces that have been made available for advertising are sold!

After analyzing pricing structure, a request was made to consider raising the advertising rates to better reflect what the market will support.

Provided below are current advertising rates, which are consistent with the original proposal and pricing structure laid out by Helen Foraker. Also included is the proposed pricing for comparison.

<u>Location</u>	<u>Current Cost</u>	<u>Proposed Cost:</u>
Trolley Tail Mount	\$100/month	\$175/month
Trolley Rear Window	\$200/month	\$250/month
Non-Trolley Tail Mount	\$195/month	\$250/month
Side (passenger or driver)	\$150/month	\$195/month
Interior spot	\$50/month	No Change

Currently, TCTA portion of transit advertising is being reinvested towards unifying the fleet with the new brand. This additional revenue will assist the TCTA in generating this funding more quickly. This change, if adopted, will not affect any of the current contracts put in place by Helen Foraker.

Businesses that have contracted for advertising on Tuolumne County Transit vehicles include:

- |                             |                         |                        |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------|
| • Black Oak Casino          | Jatco Water Systems     | Public Health          |
| • Chicken Ranch Casino      | Mark Twain Hospital     | Sierra Bridal          |
| • Columbia College          | McCoy Tire              | Sonora Trading Post    |
| • Earth and Ocean Boardshop | Melissa Oliver, Realtor | Sonora Lumber          |
| • Gatewood Heating and Air  | National Flooring       | Sonora Mattress Outlet |
| • Greenview Landscape       | PMZ Real Estate         | Sonora Regional        |
| • TCVB                      | Sonora Transmissions    |                        |

**Attachments:**

*There are no attachments for this item.*

**Recommendation:**

*Adopt pricing structure for future advertising on Tuolumne County Transit vehicles*

**6. Update on the Law and Justice Transit Center Project, and consideration of recommending the County reject bids received to construct the Transit Center or support a funding increase of \$745,639 to the Tuolumne Transit Center Project.**

Since the last project update on the Tuolumne Transit Center, to be located at the Law and Justice Center, the project has moved forward on many fronts. As a quick recap:

1. The TCTA/County contracted for a Geo Technical investigation at the site
2. A revised cost estimate was completed
3. A firm was selected to provide Testing and Inspection Services
4. A firm was selected to provide Biological Services
5. The project was put out to bid
6. Bids for the project were received

**Geo Technical Report**

A firm out of Big Oak Flat, Tuolumne Geo Science, was hired to complete the Geo Technical report for the project site. Due to complication with the initial report, a second report was issued. Both reports had the same conclusion, that the site was appropriate for the planned developments. The cost for the GEO Technical reports was \$1800.00.

## Cost Estimate

Cummings revisited the cost to build the Transit Hub and Law and Justice Center drive after extensive input from staff, policy makers, TUD and other stakeholders. The plan revision and revised cost estimate is \$10,250.00. The Construction Cost Summary anticipated the Justice Center Drive, Jail Access road and Justice Building Grading and Jail Access Utilities at a combined cost of \$1,923,265. The Transit building and the shade structure along with associated improvements was estimated to cost \$1,343,088. The combined project cost was anticipated to be \$3,351,188. The Engineers Estimate recommends a 10-15% construction contingency be reserved for un-anticipated costs. (\$200,000).

## Testing and Inspection Services

The Scope of Service for this contractor is to provide independent soils and materials testing required for the project along with California Building Code compliance inspections. Quality assurance inspections are also sought. The TCTA cost for Testing and Inspection Services is \$5,000.

## Biological Services

The Scope of Services for this element of the project includes tasks such as:

- Monitoring of construction activities within 250 feet of wetlands or water feature on site
- Provide environmental awareness training to construction personnel (identifying red-legged frog/Valley Elderberry Beetle and host plant)
- Inspections for sensitive species
- Fencing and flagging of areas to be avoided during construction

The TCTA's share of costs for Biological Services is \$9,600.

## Notice to Bidders

The project was put out to bid on June 10, 2016 by Tuolumne County.

The notice indicated that the project has two separate and distinct funding sources, as such, bidders would be required to submit a Base Bid A (Transit Center) and Base Bid B (Justice Center Drive, grading, etc). The lowest responsible bid of the two combined would be recommended for contract award.

The two projects:

1. Tuolumne County Transit Agency is responsible for the Bus Shelter and associated improvements, planters/seatwalls, utilities on their property, landscaping and site furnishings. All of these construction components and associated costs need to be incorporated into Base Bid A.
2. Tuolumne County is responsible for the extension of Justice Center Drive, Jail Access Road, rough grading for the Justice Building Site, and utilities in these areas. All of these construction components and associated costs need to be incorporated into Base Bid B.

A mandatory pre-bid meeting was held on Thursday, June 23 at 1pm in the BOS chambers. There was also an optional site visit that was offered for potential proposers. Plans and specifications for the project were made available through Sonora Blueprint and Copy.

### Incidentals

The cost of permits, furnishings, security and technology devices is estimated at \$86,706.

Bids for the project were to be received by Thursday, July 14, at 2pm.

### Bids Received

Three bids were received to build the projects:

Simile Construction:	\$2,365,000 (Bid pulled)
Bobo Construction:	\$3,562,000
F and H Construction:	\$3,439,000 (apparent low bidder)

When the bids were further scrutinized, Base Bids A and B read:

The total estimated cost remaining cost for the transit Center construction, incidentals and 10% contingency is \$2,336,656. (see attachment)

The remaining budget available to the project is \$1,584,257 leaving a funding deficit of \$752,399. At previous TCTA meetings, when project finances were discussed it was understood that at least some of the TCTC's \$544,000 restricted fund balance would likely be needed to award the construction contractor. Additionally, the auditor-controller has reviewed current assets less current liabilities and committed projects and deferred revenue to determine adequate funding is presently available in TCTA account to fund the project.

**Transit Center and Associated work - \$1,995,000 (Cummings estimate \$1,343,088- variance \$651,912, +48%)**

**County Road and Associated work - \$1,444,000 (Cummings estimate \$1,923,265- variance \$479,265, -25%)**

### Moving Forward

The County Administrators office took an item to the Board of Supervisors on August 2, 2016 to reject all bids. This staff recommendation was not adopted by the Board. Instead, they directed County staff to work with the TCTA to accept the low bid and discuss funding options to make the project whole-- citing likely cost increases, project schedules, staff time and the value of the projects.

### *Alternative A*

Reject low bid to construct the Transit Center and direct staff to separate its project from the County's Justice Center drive and work towards bringing the project within existing budget

## *Alternative B*

Consistent with the August 2, 2016 Board of Supervisors action, cover cost increases and the \$752,399 funding gap through approval of a resolution allocating capital revenue to Transit Center Project fund.

The Citizen's Advisory and Technical Advisory Committees considered the above option. Since the agenda item did not include the possibility of increasing project funding through a funding agreement, no formal action was taken. However, the Committees did indicate general support for a funding increase on the project necessary to award the construction contract.

### **Attachments:**

*Bid documents and funding chart.*

### **Recommendations:**

*Support funding increase of \$745,693 to the Tuolumne Transit Center from capital project reserves.*

## **7. Adopt Resolution 33-16 allocating \$744,833 in fund balance in the TCTA-Public Transportation Budget Fund to the Tuolumne Transit Center Project.**

As you may recall, the cost estimate for the construction phase of the Tuolumne Transit Center (formerly called the Law and Justice Center Transit Facility) increased significantly from the original engineer's estimate and the actual bids from contractors. Staff has been challenged to find additional funds to cover the increase.

We met with Ms. Debi Bautista, the Auditor-Controller, to refine budget numbers as of the close of the Fiscal Year 2015/16 Budget year and determine the unrestricted fund balance within the TCTA Budget Fund. According to the calculations from late Friday afternoon, the Fund appears to have a balance of \$744,833 to contribute to the revenue shortfall. As you may recall, the TCTA allocated \$133,208 in Fund Balance to the project in the Recommended Budget. These two figures total \$878,041, which should provide the funds needed.

### **Attachments:**

*Since figures are still being refined, staff will present the final revenue breakdown for the project along with Resolution 33-16 for adoption at the meeting.*

### **Recommended Action:**

*Adopt Resolution 33-16 allocating \$744,833 in fund balance in the TCTA-Public Transportation Budget Fund to the Tuolumne Transit Center Project.*

## **8. Presentation of the new Tuolumne County Transit/Tuolumne County Transportation Council websites**

Staff has launched two new websites in support of the Transit Agency, Transportation Council and Tuolumne County Transit services.

A contract with Cole Video allowed the sites to be created. The site sits on the Wix platform. One of the advantages of this type of site is the user friendly nature of making changes and updates to the site. Each of the staff has been trained to make updates on the site, especially where primary responsibilities lie.

It should be noted that full functionality of these websites will take a few month to achieve. In the meantime, the new sites are capable of handling the majority of user needs.

**Attachments:**

*There are no attachments for this item. However, staff will perform a live web site presentation.*

**Recommendation:**

*Accept and file this report as presented.*

**9. Reports**