

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLORADO**

Civil Action No. 16-cv-00834-RBJ

Christopher Mechaca, individually and as Personal Representative of the Estate of Irma
Menchaca,

plaintiff,

v.

DaVita, Inc.

defendant

consolidated with,

Civil Action No. 16-cv-00834-RBJ

Sherri Saldana, individually and as Personal Representative of the Estate of Gary Gene Saldana,

plaintiff,

v.

DaVita, Inc.,

defendant.

consolidated with,

Civil Action No. 16-cv-02586-RBJ

Frankquin Hardin, individually and as Personal Representative of the Estate of Deborah Hardin,

plaintiff,

v.

DaVita, Inc.,

defendant.

VERDICT

We, the jury, unanimously answer the questions of the Court as follows:

1. Did one or more plaintiffs prove by a preponderance of the evidence the negligence claim according to the elements listed in Instruction No. 8 as to

- a. Plaintiff Menchaca: X yes _____ no
- b. Plaintiff Saldana: X yes _____ no
- c. Plaintiff Hardin: X yes _____ no

2. Did one or more plaintiffs prove by the applicable standard of proof the fraud by concealment claim according to the elements listed in Instruction No. 10 as to

- a. Plaintiff Menchaca: X yes _____ no
- b. Plaintiff Saldana: X yes _____ no
- c. Plaintiff Hardin: X yes _____ no

If you answered "no" to all these questions, then your verdict is for the defendant, and you should proceed to date and sign the Verdict without answering additional questions. But if you answered "yes" to any of these questions, please proceed as appropriate to questions 3 through 5.

3. What amount of compensatory damages, if any, as described in Instruction No. 12 do you award to

- a. Plaintiff Menchaca: \$ 2,000,000
- b. Plaintiff Saldana: \$ 1,500,000
- c. Plaintiff Hardin: \$ 5,000,000

4. What amount of punitive damages, if any, as described in Instruction No. 13, do you award to

- a. Plaintiff Menchaca: \$ 125,000,000
- b. Plaintiff Saldana: \$ 125,000,000
- c. Plaintiff Hardin: \$ 125,000,000

Dated June 27, 2018

JUROR NAMES REDACTED