

Summary of Amendments in 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition of *Aragorn: J. R. R. Tolkien's Undervalued Hero*  
**(Finalised in June 2017)**

Entries prefixed with **[W]** appeared on my website for a while as I didn't envisage ever being in a position to do a 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. They were removed from the website when Luna Press took me on.

New/amended text is in red.

Comments/explanations are shown in [...]

\*\*\*\*\*

**Chapter 1.6, p. 60 [For greater accuracy]**

I first read *LotR* over forty years ago, so it's difficult to recall my initial impressions exactly, but I'm sure it took several readings to appreciate the true nature of what Aragorn had done and how momentous it was **in the context of the other events which were happening at the time**. The real significance is not immediately obvious and **an understanding** of the full impact of this heroic deed can only be achieved by a certain amount of interpretation and reading between the lines, and by studying the time-tables for all the characters involved.

\*\*\*\*\*

**[W] Chapter 1.6, pp. 65-6 [Inclusion of extra points]**

**March 6th**

- Aragorn looked into the Palantír early in the morning thereby making Sauron aware that his worst nightmare had come true: an heir of Isildur existed and the sword which had robbed him of the Ring had been reforged. From his own recent travels in the Emyrn Muil and Dead Marshes while searching for Gollum, Aragorn was aware that, ten days since the breaking of the Fellowship, Frodo would probably be getting near to Mordor and it was therefore time that Sauron had something to distract him. This explains his conviction that it was time to abandon his incognito.

Later that day he set out from Helm's Deep for his journey through the Paths of the Dead

- As if confirming Aragorn's estimate this was actually the day when Frodo started the journey down the west side of the Mountains of Shadow thus making himself more visible and running a high risk of meeting enemy troops from the south on their way to the Morannon. **In fact the Hobbits had narrowly avoided a meeting with a troop of Haradrim only the previous morning (*LotR* 4.3.645-6)**. However, during the night of March 6th-7th, they heard no-one on the road.
- Was this the first sign of Sauron in shock, leaving his servants without proper guidance?

**March 7th**

- Aragorn arrived at Dunharrow and the entrance to the Paths of the Dead at

nightfall.

- Frodo met Faramir and his Rangers and was thus safe **when another troop of Haradrim appeared. After these had been defeated** Faramir told the Hobbits *“You cannot go along the road southwards, if that was your purpose. It will be unsafe for some days, and **always more closely watched after this affray than it has been yet.**”*. Frodo too recognised the increased danger. However **some hours later** Faramir’s Rangers reported that *“Of the enemy no movement could be seen; **not even an orc-spy was abroad.**”*
- This situation was a further indication of Sauron’s shock at seeing Aragorn in the Palantír. He was ignoring his borders - even when a party of his allies had just been wiped out by Gondor’s Rangers - withdrawing all his spies and troops inside Mordor while he brooded on how to deal with the new threat.

\*\*\*\*\*

### **Chapter 1.6, p.70 [Tidying up wording]**

#### **March 19th**

- *“All the land now brooded as at the coming of a great storm...”* because Aragorn and Gandalf had broken down the bridge at Minas Morgul and set fire to the land around it - another little distraction for Sauron before they turned north. *“So the desperate journey went on, as the Ring went south and the banners of the kings rode north.”*
- This extra distraction coincided with the point when Frodo and Sam, **having managed to escape from the Orcs in the confusion of the converging armies** near the Isenmouthe, now made themselves more visible by taking to the Barad-dûr road. During their three days of travelling along it they would meet no-one.
- As for Sauron: *“... even in the fastness of his own realm he sought the secrecy of night, fearing the winds of the world that had turned against him, tearing aside his veils, and troubled with tidings of bold spies that had passed through his fences”* - because he had been ignoring reports of “spies on the Stairs” and concentrating exclusively on the *“bright sword”* and *“stern and kingly face”* he had seen in the Palantír, instead of keeping a proper watch.

\*\*\*\*\*

### **[W] Chapter 1.9, pp. 89 [New source/information available]**

#### **Aragorn**

This was a Sindarin name and was given to him at his birth. It was often combined with his patronymic, hence “Aragorn son of Arathorn” or “Aragorn, Arathorn’s son”. In Rohan, after Gandalf had informed people of Aragorn’s identity, he was usually referred to as “Lord Aragorn” or “The Lord Aragorn” though Théoden addressed him as “son of Arathorn” at one point (*LotR* 3.7.539) as did Éomer (*LotR* 3.2.436).

In *HoM-e* XII Foreword Christopher Tolkien refers to a letter he received from Christopher Gilson (a leading member of the Elvish Linguistic Fellowship) informing him of a passage relating to *The Tale of Aragorn and Arwen* which he had seen in a text at Marquette University<sup>2</sup>. Part of this passage states: *“... and his father gave him the*

name *Aragorn*, a name used in the House of the Chieftains. But Ivorwen [Aragorn's maternal grandmother] at his naming stood by, and said '**Kingly Valour**' (for so that name is interpreted)..." [My emphasis]. Christopher Gilson had gone on to observe that this seemed to be the only place where the name Aragorn is translated, referring to a letter Tolkien wrote to Richard Jeffery on December 17th 1972 to back this up: "*The names in the line of Arthedain are peculiar in several ways; and several, though S. [Sindarin] in form, are not readily interpretable. But it would need more historical records and linguistic records of S. [Sindarin] than exist (sc. than I have found time or need to invent!) to explain them.*" Elizabeth M. Stephen refers to an alternative meaning of the name<sup>4</sup> in Tolkien's commentary, *Words, Phrases and Passages in various tongues in the Lord of the Rings*, published by Gilson in Parma Eldalamberon XVII (a journal of the Elvish Linguistic Fellowship). Here the meaning of "gorn" is given as "dread", "reverence" or "awe", thus giving the meaning "revered king" when combined with "ara".

\*\*\*\*\*

### **Chapter 1.9, p. 93 [For greater accuracy]**

One of the misconceptions about Aragorn is that he was continually announcing his names and titles to all and sundry in a manner which was boastful and arrogant. Rachel C. A. M. Hawes accuses him of continually "enumerating his titles", "showing off" and never losing an opportunity "to thrust his position down the throats of any assembled company". In answer to this Valerie M. Sleith, purporting to write in defence of Aragorn, stresses that his behaviour is due to his character being based on the tradition of the pre-Christian or Celtic hero "whose ethos permits, indeed compels him to broadcast his feats and lineage to everyone he meets, and to repeat them frequently". She carries on to state that Aragorn "lacks humility" and "trumpets his achievements endlessly", thus in fact seeming to agree with Hawes as to the nature of his behaviour, if not the reason for it. These two articles were written **over** thirty years ago, but more recent examples of a belief in Aragorn's arrogance can be found in Web discussion forums by searching for "Aragorn" and "arrogant".

\*\*\*\*\*

### **Chapter 1.9, p. 93 In retrospect I felt these were less relevant]**

Removal of two website links relating to "Aragorn/Arrogant" web search:

<http://www.warofthering.net/forums/showthread.php?6286-Aragorn-s-quot-dream-quot/page3>

[http://www.lotrplaza.com/forum/forum\\_posts.asp?TID=219330](http://www.lotrplaza.com/forum/forum_posts.asp?TID=219330)

\*\*\*\*\*

### **Chapter 1.10, p. 99 [Insertion of abstract at beginning of chapter]**

Inclusion of abstract at the beginning of the chapter, as follows:

**As well as discussing Aragorn's appearance, this chapter also looks at the issues of disguise,**

## invisibility and transformation.

\*\*\*\*\*

### **Chapter 1.10, p. 100** [For greater accuracy]

In *LotR* 1.9.156-7 there are two examples of Aragorn's eyes being described as “*keen*” and Frodo felt very uncomfortable under their scrutiny.

\*\*\*\*\*

### **Chapter 1.10, p. 101** [Correction of date from 1953]

These features were also part of Aragorn’s Elvish (via Elrond’s family) and Númenórean legacy. For example in *LotR* we are told that Elrond’s hair was “*dark as the shadows of twilight*” while his eyes were “*grey as a clear evening, and in them was a light like the light of stars.*”<sup>17</sup> Arwen’s hair and eyes are similarly described in the same chapter, while Elladan and Elrohir are “*dark-haired, grey-eyed, and their faces elven-fair*”. *UT* 2.2 Note 3 states that when the Númenóreans first began to sail to Middle-earth the inhabitants were “*in awe*” of them as they “*resembled rather Elvish lords than mortal Men in bearing and apparel*”<sup>19</sup>, while a copy of a letter to Milton Waldman from - probably - late 1951 describes them as “*hardly distinguishable from the Elves*” in appearance - thus implying considerable beauty.

\*\*\*\*\*

### **Chapter 1.10, p. 107** [Inclusion of extra point]

All Aragorn’s adult life his appearance had been subject to the conflict between his natural beauty from his **Maian**, Elvish and Númenórean descent and the ravages of the unrelenting hardship of his life of wandering.

\*\*\*\*\*

### **[W] Chapter 2.1, p. 116** [Inclusion of extra point]

The standard is worthy of consideration in its own right. It was first unfurled at the Stone of Erech as Aragorn summoned the Dead Men of Dunharrow : “... ***and behold!*** *it was black, and if there was any device upon it, it was hidden in the darkness.*” [My emphasis]. Nevertheless it had the desired effect on the Dead who heeded the call to redeem their oath, clearly satisfied that this was indeed the heir of Isildur. The standard was unfurled again by Halbarad at the Battle of the Pelennor Fields in the light of day : “***and behold!*** *upon the foremost ship a great standard broke...*” [My emphasis]. In contrast it now appeared as a work of great splendour and intricacy with the White Tree of Gondor and the Seven Stars and crown of Elendil depicted in gems, mithril and gold. During the battle Halbarad was killed, but the standard survived to be displayed again at the Battle of the Morannon (where it flew “*fair and desperate*”) **and then at the honouring of the Ring-bearers on the Field of Cormallen (*LotR* 6.4.953)**. The next time it was used was in Minas Tirith as King Elessar entered the city after his coronation. Note that “*behold*” followed by an exclamation-mark (used many times in *LotR* to denote some momentous

occurrence) precedes the first two unfurlings of the standard. It was clearly something out of the ordinary. Is it fanciful to suggest that the cloth itself was partly woven from Arwen's own hair (in imitation of the enchanted cloak of Lúthien in *TSil* 19.202), thus incorporating a protective spell in it?

\*\*\*\*\*

**[W] Chapter 2.1, p. 117** [\[Inclusion of extra point\]](#)

Continuing with the events described in *LotR* 6.6: as Arwen sat with Aragorn by the fountain we are told that she “... *sang a song of Valinor, while the Tree grew and blossomed.*”<sup>24</sup> The implication here seems to be that her song encouraged the White Tree to grow, thereby strengthening not only the Tree, but the kingship itself. In *TSil* 4.54 it is stated that Melian was akin to the Vala Yavanna who sang the original White Tree into existence in Valinor - so there would technically be a streak of Yavanna in Arwen. **The description of Yavanna's singing in *TSil* (“*Under her song the saplings grew and became fair and tall, and came to flower...*”) is remarkably similar to that of Arwen's.** Compare also the song of Galadriel in *LotR*: “*I sang of leaves, of leaves of gold, and leaves of gold there grew*”. Arwen is impressive in this chapter - as she is elsewhere if one reads between the lines.

\*\*\*\*\*

**[W] Chapter 2.1, p. 118** [\[New source/information available\]](#)

It is not clear whether Arwen came to share Aragorn's faith in the end and died voluntarily, or whether she just wasted away and died from grief, though Hammond and Scull's reference to the Eileen Elgar letter suggests the former. **Denis Bridoux believes that Aragorn, by his last words, was “*showing [Arwen] the way*”, and “*inviting her to follow him*”.** There is also a ray of hope in the last two paragraphs of *LotR* 2.6 in the incident where Frodo climbed Cerin Amroth and witnessed Aragorn reliving his betrothal. After speaking a few words to Frodo “... *he left the hill of Cerin Amroth and came there never again as living man.*” [My emphasis]. The implication is surely that although he did not come there again when living, he did come there again after death, thus indicating a spiritual reunion with Arwen. I cannot see why the last three words would be needed if this sentence simply meant that Aragorn never went to Cerin Amroth again. A similar quotation about Frodo in *LotR* 2.8 makes no such distinction, just simply states “*To that fair land Frodo never came again*”. The last lines of the Tale of Tinúviel which Aragorn had chanted to Frodo and his friends on Weathertop also give cause for optimism: “*And long ago they passed away/In the forest singing sorrowless.*”. One can only hope that a similar “sorrowless” fate was in store for Aragorn and Arwen.

\*\*\*\*\*

**Chapter 2.1, p. 125** [\[1<sup>st</sup> edition erroneously had “meet again in the Spring”\]](#)

[I am not clear on the significance of Galadriel's comment quoted above that she and Aragorn might not meet again “... *unless it be far hence upon a road that has no returning*”. Was she referring

to a time after the end of the world when possibly all the races would meet again? This is perhaps borne out by her words to Treebeard after the end of the War of the Ring when she hinted that they would not meet again “... *until the lands that lie under the wave are lifted up again. Then in the willow-meads of Tasarinan we may meet in the Spring*”, presumably referring to Beleriand drowned at the end of the First Age - which was where Tasarinan was.]

\*\*\*\*\*

**Chapter 2.1, p. 130 [Inclusion of extra point]**

There is no real indication as to how Elladan and Elrohir viewed Aragorn’s relationship with Arwen. **One** hint we have is the fact that it was Halbarad rather than the brothers who carried Arwen’s gift of the standard and delivered her personal message to Aragorn. This arrangement was perhaps more diplomatic as it prevented the family being involved in what was a very intimate matter between Aragorn and his betrothed. Also with Halbarad being designated standard-bearer it would have been more appropriate for him to bring the standard. **Other incidents with the potential to shed light on the matter are those at Dunharrow when Éowyn’s feelings for Aragorn became obvious to the Grey Company. Unfortunately there is no indication of what Elladan and Elrohir felt, so one can only speculate as to what was going through their minds.**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Chapter 2.2, p. 137 [1<sup>st</sup> edition erroneously had “home”]**

Long before Aragorn’s time all that was left of the Northern Dúnedain (or the Rangers as they were called in Bree) was “... *a strange people wandering secretly in the wild, and other men knew not their homes nor the purpose of their journeys, and save in Imladris, in the house of Elrond, their ancestry was forgotten.*”

\*\*\*\*\*

**Chapter 2.2, p. 145 [Tidying up wording]**

**His premonition raises several questions. Was Aragorn (and the rest of the Grey Company for that matter) aware of it? Or had Halbarad just been talking to himself rather than out loud?**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Chapter 2.2, p. 146 [Tidying up wording]**

**When Éowyn welcomed the Grey Company to Dunharrow: “... no mightier men had she seen than the Dúnedain ... but on Aragorn most of all her eyes rested.”**

\*\*\*\*\*

**[W] Chapter 2.2, p. 146 [New source/information available]**

When the young Aragorn, in the guise of Thorongil (App A.I.iv.1055), served the

Steward of Gondor he gained his alias partly from the star brooch he wore on his cloak - similar to those worn by the members of the Grey Company. Murray Smith has suggested that these brooches could have been a symbol of the authority of the king, acting as a secret reminder to the Dúnedain of their allegiance

\*\*\*\*\*

**Chapter 2.3. p. 160 [Tidying up wording]**

Further examples of Gandalf's respect for Aragorn relate to the Palantír of Orthanc. In *LotR* 3.11.594 he bowed to him as he presented him with the Stone addressing him as "lord". Later on he told Pippin of his suspicion that Aragorn had used the Palantír to reveal himself to Sauron, praising his boldness and determination and his ability to "... take his own counsel and dare great risks at need."

\*\*\*\*\*

**[W] Chapter 2.3. p. 166 [Inclusion of extra point]**

This Dwarf city beneath the Misty Mountains had been in existence since the First Age. In SA 750 (App B.1083) a settlement of Noldorin Elves was established in Eregion close to the western entrance of Moria. Since these Elven craftsmen needed precious stones and metals (including mithril) for their work, friendly relations - and a pooling of skills - grew up between them and the Dwarves of Moria. From SA 1200 onwards Sauron (*incognito and still beautiful in appearance*) succeeded in seducing the Eregion Elves by teaching them to make, among other things, Rings of Power. This situation lasted until SA 1600 when Sauron forged the One Ring in Mordor leading to the Elves' realisation of his plans to control them. War resulted and Eregion was destroyed by Sauron's forces in SA 1697. The Dwarves meanwhile had shut the west gate of Moria to protect their city. They continued to live and work there until TA 1980 (App B.1087) when, in their continuing search for mithril, they delved deep under Caradhras and disturbed a Balrog which had secreted itself in Moria following the defeat of Morgoth at the end of the First Age. It became known as Durin's Bane as it was responsible for the death of the Dwarf King Durin VI and others. The following year those Dwarves who were still alive fled from Moria. By TA 2480 Sauron was sending his creatures to live there and Orcs were multiplying in the Misty Mountains. Three hundred years later Thrór, the (probably deranged) grandfather of Thorin Oakenshield, entered Moria alone and was killed by Orcs, this incident leading to the War of Dwarves and Orcs during the years 2793-9. Then in TA 2989 Balin made another attempt to recolonise Moria, but this failed six years later with Balin and his company being killed either by Orcs or by the Watcher-in-the-Water.

\*\*\*\*\*

**Chapter 2.3, p. 170 [Tidying up wording]**

The emphasis in both versions is purely on finding a trustworthy bearer for the Palantír to keep it out of Pippin's way - in contrast to the final version where Gandalf was returning

an important heirloom to Aragorn **in addition** to finding a safe location for it. Later in *HoM-e* VIII.3.2.257 it was Gandalf, **not** Aragorn, who looked into the Palantír and revealed himself to Sauron. This occurred in Minas Tirith during the Siege of Gondor, and Christopher Tolkien **states** that the incident **was** the germ of the idea of Denethor using the Anor-stone **and perhaps also of Aragorn revealing himself to Sauron in the Palantír of Orthanc.**

\*\*\*\*\*

**[W] Chapter 2.3, pp. 178 [Inclusion of extra point]**

*UT* 3.1.358-9 describes the incident where Gimli and Aragorn visited Orthanc during the Fourth Age and searched the heirlooms which Saruman had stolen and hoarded. These included the Elendilmir and Isildur's chain and casket which had borne the One Ring round his neck. Thus the implication was that Isildur's remains had not, as was assumed, been carried down to the sea but had remained in shallower water to be subsequently found by Saruman and robbed of these two precious items. Since no trace had ever been found of Isildur's bones the question was raised as to whether Saruman had removed them and dishonoured them by burning them in one of his furnaces - not something which would have endeared him to King Elessar. Ironically this incident provides a good example of Gandalf's observation to Pippin during the Siege of Gondor (*LotR* 5.4.815) that a traitor may do good he does not intend. Saruman's behaviour enabled Aragorn and Gimli to find

the original Elendilmir, and due to the evidence they uncovered, the story of Isildur was finally able to be set down in its entirety. The same could be said for Gríma's act in throwing the Palantír out of Orthanc as it was this which eventually enabled it to come into the possession of Aragorn. **Gandalf's action in preventing Éomer killing Gríma (*LotR* 3.6.520) ensured his survival for the purpose.**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Chapter 2.3, p.178 [Tidying up wording]**

However all the indications in the *LotR* narrative are vague as to Radagast's whereabouts.

**When**

Gandalf spoke of his meeting with him on the Greenway not far from Bree: he said that Radagast had dwelt in Rhosgobel "*at one time,*" but that he had not seen him for "*... many a year.*"

\*\*\*\*\*

**[W] Chapter 2.3, p. 179 [Whole section rewritten following reader feedback.]**

ALATAR AND PALLANDO

(Also called, or known as, the Blue Wizards, the Ithryn Luin, and Morinehter and Rómestámo)

The Blue Wizards are mentioned indirectly in *LotR* 3.10.583 during the parley at



Isengard when Saruman referred to the rods of the Five Wizards. However the main sources of information on them are the essay in *UT* 4.2.502-520 written around 1954, and the somewhat different account in *HoM-e* XII.13.384-5 which contains some of Tolkien's last writings from the early 1970s.

In the 1954 version of their story they are named Alatar and Pallando and are recorded as being Oromë's Maiar, with Pallando accompanying Alatar as a friend rather than as an emissary in his own right. Christopher Tolkien hazards a guess that Oromë, of all the Valar, had the greatest knowledge of the further parts of Middle-earth, and that the Blue Wizards were destined to remain in those regions. Thus when they landed in Middle-earth they went East with Saruman and, unlike him, never returned. In a letter to Rhona Beare written in 1958 Tolkien states that they went East and South "*far out of Númenórean range*", as "*missionaries to 'enemyoccupied' lands*". He carries on to suggest that they probably failed in their mission, maybe starting "*secret cults and 'magic' traditions that outlasted the fall of Sauron*". The only possible link I can see here between Aragorn and the Blue Wizards is that both were travellers in the East and South. Earlier in this chapter I referred to Gandalf going as far east as Lake Núrnen in Mordor, but more as a "one-off" journey rather than regularly. The implication is that the Blue Wizards went further east than that. In App A Aragorn is stated as having travelled "... *far into the East and deep into the South...*", one of his missions being to acquaint himself with the peoples who were in league with Sauron. The Easterlings came from Rhûn, most of which was further east than Mordor in a northerly direction. The people of Khand were also allied to Sauron, and their land was immediately south-east of Mordor. Meanwhile Far Harad extended "*deep into the South*". Maybe Aragorn encountered one or both of the Blue Wizards on his journeys without knowing who they were. I don't feel that the phrase "*far out of Númenórean range*" rules out such a meeting, as Aragorn was, in Gandalf's words "... *the greatest traveller ... of this age of the world*" and his journeys sometimes **were** "*out of Númenórean range*". On the other hand what were the time-scales involved here? Like Gandalf, Saruman and Radagast, the Blue Wizards would have been in Middle-earth since approximately TA 1000. By Aragorn's lifetime they could have long disappeared in one way or another if we take the view of them given above in Letter 211, though he might have seen evidence of the "*secret cults and 'magic' traditions*" - assuming these actually existed.

The later account in *HoM-e* XII confirms that the Blue Wizards remained in the East, but instead of coming to Middle-earth in the Third Age, they are said to have arrived around SA 1600, the time of Sauron's forging of the One Ring. Their names are now Morinehter and Rómestámo - meaning Darkness-slayer and East-helper respectively. Their mission was: to help the few tribes of Men in those areas who had not been corrupted by Sauron; to stir up rebellion; and to find out Sauron's hiding-place after his fall in the drowning of Númenor at the end of the Second Age. Although they failed in the third task they seem to have succeeded in the first two, as shown by the following passage: "*They must have had very great influence on the history of the Second Age and Third Age in weakening and disarraying the forces of East ... who would both in the Second Age and Third Age otherwise have ... outnumbered the West.*" As suggested to me in feedback from reader José Colón, this new version of their activities perhaps means that Aragorn was more

likely to have encountered them.

\*\*\*\*\*

**[W] Chapter 2.4, p. 180 [Inclusion of extra point]**

This brief history from *TSil*, along with the different - and sometimes conflicting - versions of the story of Galadriel and Celeborn in *Unfinished Tales*<sup>3</sup>, helps us to understand the attitude to Gimli when the Fellowship entered Lothlórien (*LotR* 2.6.343-8 and 2.7.355-6). Celeborn and Galadriel had both lived in Doriath in the First Age and the assumption is made in *UT* 2.4.301, 303 that they were present at its plundering. In the section *Concerning Galadriel and Celeborn* it is stated that afterwards Celeborn had no liking for Dwarves of any race and never forgave them even though it was only the Nogrod Dwarves who were involved. (In fact *TSil* 22.280 states that the Dwarves from the neighbouring city of Belegost actually advised against continuing the conflict.) His hostility to Gimli in TA 3019 was extended to blaming the Dwarves of Moria for arousing the Balrog, Durin's Bane. Galadriel, on the other hand, had been on good terms with the Dwarves of Moria in the Second Age - who, like Gimli himself, were not of the Nogrod race - and, as a Noldorin Elf, appreciated their craftsmanship. In addition *UT* 2.4.303 states that she realised that the evil in Middle-earth could only be overcome by a union of **all** those opposed to it. To this end she recognised the potential of the Dwarves as warriors. For these reasons she supported Gimli and empathised with his yearning to see Moria.

\*\*\*\*\*

**Chapter 2.4, p. 190 [1<sup>st</sup> edition erroneously had "or" instead of "and"]**

Also, spoken to Legolas and Gimli: "*Boromir is dead. I am unscathed, for I was not here with him*"

and "... *I did not ask him [Boromir] if Frodo or Sam were with him: not until it was too late.*"

\*\*\*\*\*

**Chapter 2.4, p. 198 ["stated" is a change from "specified" to avoid repetition]**

This would be particularly the case given that the Dúnedain had been sent south specifically to aid their Chieftain. In earlier versions of these events given in *HoM-e* VIII the prophecy **stated** that an Elf-lord and a Dwarf-lord would also be present to summon the Dead, but this idea was later rejected.

\*\*\*\*\*

**Chapter 2.4, p. 200 [Tidying up of punctuation]**

I feel that Gimli's reaction to Aragorn's use of the Palantír was due to shock - at the deed itself and the resulting physical state of Aragorn - and fear. After all, he had done something which even Gandalf had doubted his ability to do. [Regarding the two versions of the text in this incident, I came across the following support (though for a different

reason) for retaining the original wording: “*I always found it a shame he [Tolkien] edited out Aragorn’s blackly humorous snap-back at Gimli after his Palantír ordeal*”.]

\*\*\*\*\*

**Chapter 2.4, p. 203 [Passage amended to correct errors in wording and references.]**

In addition to bringing fountains, trees and songbirds to Minas Tirith, Legolas brought some of his

people from Mirkwood and founded a settlement in Ithilien. *LotR* records Legolas’s appreciation of

“*this fair land*”<sup>79</sup> and his stated intention of asking his father’s permission to move there.

A passage in *HoM e XII* refers to Faramir’s new house in the Hills of Emyrn Arnen [part of Ithilien] “*whose gardens devised by the Elf Legolas were renowned.*”.

\*\*\*\*\*

**Chapter 2.4, pp. 205-6 [Tidying up of wording]**

In the Epilogue to *LotR*, Sam told Elanor that Legolas would carry on living in Gondor as long as Gimli did but that he would probably go to the Sea one day, thus apparently linking Legolas’s long-term plans with the lifespan of Gimli (*HoM-e IX* Part 1, Chapter 11). There appears to be no awareness in this passage of the plan for Gimli to sail, but that could be explained by the fact that this is Sam talking to his daughter only about sixteen years after the destruction of the Ring. Such a plan would undoubtedly have been kept quiet until it became a reality. **The Epilogue is also at variance with the evidence in *LotR* from an additional perspective.** For example Legolas spoke - perhaps prophetically - of his intention to come and live in Ithilien “*For a while: a month, a life, a hundred years of Men. But Anduin is near, and Anduin leads down to the Sea.*”. The phrase “*a hundred years of Men*” seems to relate to Aragorn rather than Gimli and fits roughly with Legolas’s eventual time-scale. Also App A states that “*... when King Elessar gave up his life Legolas followed at last the desire of his heart...*” [My emphasis]. The implication here is surely that it was the death of Aragorn which prompted Legolas to sail, that as long as Aragorn was alive he could not bring himself to leave Middle-earth in spite of the call of the Sea. **If his plan had just been for Gimli to take ship** with him he could have sailed at any time. The longer he waited, the greater was the chance of Gimli dying before this could happen. That Legolas chose not to sail implies that his attachment to Aragorn took priority. Perhaps it was a joint decision between him and Gimli, and perhaps Legolas “knew” that Gimli would outlive Aragorn. [He was two hundred and sixty-two when he sailed.]

\*\*\*\*\*

**[W] Chapter 2.5, p. 224 [Inclusion of extra point]**

This episode showed that Aragorn was going to great lengths to win Sam’s trust. He displayed patience and gentleness as he reassured Sam that he was not connected with the Nazgûl. He could see his own similarity to the Black Riders and understood Sam’s fears.

Again he tried to tackle Sam's doubts by sharing information with him, confiding his thoughts and concerns, and leaving Sam in no doubt as to the seriousness of the general situation but at the same time trying to keep his spirits up. In addition his insistent "*You must trust me now*" had more the semblance of an order than a statement, thus providing the necessary firmness in the circumstances. Having one member of their company refusing to trust the leader could only increase their danger. [What if Sam had actually wounded Aragorn instead of merely drawing his sword?] Aragorn's charge to Sam to guard Frodo showed that he recognised and respected Sam's role as Frodo's protector.

\*\*\*\*\*

#### **Chapter 2.5, p. 240 [Tidying up wording]**

Later as the company prepared to leave Lothlórien it was Pippin who asked the Elves if the cloaks they were giving them were magic. During the river journey, he shared Merry's **unease** at Boromir's restlessness, muttering, nail-biting and excessive closeness to Aragorn's boat, and also noticed a "*queer gleam*" in Boromir's eye as he "*peered forward gazing at Frodo.*"

\*\*\*\*\*

#### **Chapter 2.5, p. 242 ["profound" replaced "deep" to avoid repetition]**

With Denethor he was expecting to see a resemblance to Boromir but the Steward's face with its noble bone structure, ivory skin and deep eyes reminded him more of Aragorn's. His first sight of Faramir made a **profound** impression on him as he realised that he was the sort of person men would follow anywhere out of love - indeed he felt that way himself and went on to name his first son after him.

\*\*\*\*\*

#### **Chapter 2.6, p. 261 [Tidying up wording]**

By the time Aragorn's standard was raised at the Harlond Denethor was dead. If he had lived a few hours longer he would presumably have witnessed **the healing of Faramir and realised that Aragorn's healing hands showed him to be the rightful king.**

\*\*\*\*\*

#### **Chapter 2.6, p. 287 [Correction of wording and reference]**

Faramir was aware that Elves had once lived in Ithilien and though he had never actually seen any at the time he met Frodo and Sam he made it clear that he regarded them with reverence. During Aragorn's reign Legolas would bring a group of his people to live there thus re-establishing the Elves. *HoM-e XII mentions Faramir's "... fair new house ... whose gardens devised by the Elf Legolas were renowned."*

\*\*\*\*\*

#### **[W] Chapter 2.7, p. 301 [Inclusion of extra name]**

For completeness the following Rohirrim, mentioned in the main narrative of *LotR*, should also be considered for potential acquaintance with Thorongil:

- **Ceorl**: the rider who met Théoden and company as they rode towards Helm's Deep and brought news of the second defeat at the Fords of Isen on March 2nd 3019 (*LotR* 3.7.527)
- **Déorwine**: chief of the knights of Théoden's household
- **Dúnhere**: Lord of Harrowdale, nephew of Erkenbrand
- **Elfhelm**: a marshal of Rohan
- **Erkenbrand**: Master of Westfold and the Hornburg
- **Gálmód**: father of Gríma
- **Gamling**: one of the leaders at the Battle of The Hornburg
- **Gléowine**: Théoden's minstrel
- **Gríma/Wormtongue**
- **Grimbold**: a junior marshal under Théodred
- **Guthláf**: Théoden's standard-bearer
- **Háma**: Théoden's Door-ward
- **Widfara**: The rider who sensed the coming south wind as the Rohirrim approached Minas Tirith

\*\*\*\*\*

#### **Chapter 2.7, p. 302 [Amendment of list for accuracy]**

With the other characters in the list - Ceorl, Déorwine, Elfhelm, Gléowine, Grimbold, Guthláf, Háma and Widfara - there is no indication either way. Most of them were in positions of responsibility but they could easily have attained these as relatively young men. If they were in their forties or fifties in 3019 they would either have been born after Thorongil left Rohan or else have been young children during his service - in which case **he** may have remembered **them** but not the other way round.

\*\*\*\*\*

#### **[W] Chapter 2.7, p. 302 [Inclusion of extra point]**

There are many indications in the *LotR* narrative that Aragorn had absorbed the culture and values of Rohan and that he had found his service there enjoyable and rewarding:

- In *LotR* 3.2.430 he described the Rohirrim to Legolas and Gimli as being bold, proud and wilful but also true-hearted and generous - as well as wise in spite of their lack of learning, being more inclined to song than writing. He made it clear that he valued their long friendship with Gondor.
- He was suspicious at the lack of any signs of life as they crossed the Eastemnet of Rohan as he remembered there being studs and herds there, along with herdsmen living in tents - even in winter.
- He also stated that he didn't believe they supplied horses to Sauron. When he met Éomer shortly afterwards he was quick to assure him that he and his companions meant no harm to Rohan neither to man **nor horse** - thus showing his appreciation of the Rohirrim's regard for their horses. Earlier, at the Council of Elrond, he had given his reaction to this

rumour: “... *it grieves me more than many tidings that might seem worse to learn that Sauron levies such tribute.*”.

- In *LotR* 3.6.507 as Aragorn, Legolas and Gimli - now accompanied by Gandalf - drew near to Edoras they passed the burial mounds of the Rohirrim. Aragorn remarked on the fact that there were nine mounds in the right-hand line (these were for the first nine Kings of Rohan from Eorl to Helm) and seven in the left-hand line. Was he thinking to himself that the last time he had been in Rohan there were only six on the left? Thengel, the King he had served as Thorongil, had since died.
- He showed his awareness of the language and history of Rohan explaining how their speech was now sundered from that of their Northern forebears, and chanting the ancient poem describing Eorl (“*Where now the horse and the rider?... etc.*”), first in Rohirric then translating it into Common Speech. He also recounted the story of Eorl, later pointing out the tapestry in the hall of Meduseld which depicted him at the Battle of the Field of Celebrant.
- Also when Théoden announced that he was ready to ride to battle even if it led to his death, Aragorn declared: “*Then even the defeat of Rohan will be glorious in song*”<sup>20</sup>, thus further indicating his awareness of the importance of song in Rohan’s culture.
- In *LotR* 5.2.787, during the journey through the Paths of the Dead, the Company came upon the bones of Baldor lying as if he had been trying to claw his way through a closed stone door when he died. He had been the heir of Eorl’s son Brego and potentially the third King of Rohan, and had entered the Paths after making a drunken vow to do so. Aragorn stopped to examine his remains, referring again to the nine and seven burial mounds, lamenting the absence [i.e. in the Paths] of the white sýmbelmynë flowers which covered them, and wondering why Baldor was trying to get through the door. He was obviously aware of the story - from his general knowledge of the history and lore of Middle-earth and from his time as Thorongil in Rohan. Murray Smith has likened Aragorn’s behaviour to Baldor to his attitude to the dying Boromir: taking the time to show compassion even in a situation of grave urgency and danger.

\*\*\*\*\*

### **Chapter 2.7, p. 312 [Inclusion of extra point]**

Galadriel had also sent a message to Elrond that Aragorn needed his kindred, obviously meaning for the journey through the Paths of the Dead. Aragorn would therefore have assumed that his kinsfolk were all going via that route, while Galadriel’s words and his knowledge of the prophecy convinced him that his path was “*appointed*”. He now told Éowyn that he undertook to do the journey alone if necessary - thus presumably implying that Legolas and Gimli too could back out of their agreement to go with him. This was a new development and his announcement of his intention silenced Éowyn’s arguments. For the rest of the meal she couldn’t take her eyes off him and her distress was clear for everyone else to see. [Perhaps fortunately she was unaware that the brothers of Aragorn’s betrothed were among those present.]

\*\*\*\*\*

### **[W] Chapter 2.7, p. 335 [Inclusion of extra points]**

Éomer died in FA 64 at the age of ninety-three and was succeeded by his son, Elfwine the Fair. Aragorn survived Éomer by fifty-seven years but I can find no reference to any dealings between him and Elfwine. Indeed in view of the timescales involved Aragorn would almost certainly have outlived Elfwine too. Éomer married Elfwine's mother Lothíriel in the first year of the Fourth Age when he was about thirty. **Even if as much as ten years elapsed before Elfwine was born, which perhaps seems unlikely, he would have been fifty-three when Éomer died and if he had then survived Aragorn he would have been a hundred and ten. This also seems unlikely given that the Rohirrim did not have the extended lifespan of the Dúnedain - unless the smidgeon of Silvan Elf blood in Lothíriel (as the daughter of Prince Imrahil) played a part here, resulting in a longer life as well as the beauty and the friendship for Elves implied by her son's name and epithet.**

\*\*\*\*\*

#### **Chapter 2.8, p. 362 [Tidying up wording]**

Legolas's comment about Aragorn, "... *all those who come to know him come to love him...*" [My emphasis], found an exception in Gollum, though perhaps the significance lies in the words I have emphasised. Gollum did **not** come to know Aragorn as Aragorn did **not** come to know **him**.

\*\*\*\*\*

#### **Chapter 2.9, p. 384 ["elder" correction for "eldest"]**

These events must have occurred during winter as we are told that in March 1975 a ship was sent north by Círdan who had been informed by Arvedui's **elder** son Aranarth of his father's escape and approximate whereabouts.

\*\*\*\*\*

#### **Chapter 2.9, p. 389 ["patronage" correction for "patronisation"]**

These points seem to me to illustrate Tom's personal and emotional interest in Aragorn and his people, both at the time of the War of the Ring and earlier, along with an awareness of the prophecies regarding Aragorn's destiny. On a more mundane level, if he communicated with the Dúnedain he would have known of their **patronage** and appreciation of the Prancing Pony. [As an aside, it has been suggested to me that the Prancing Pony was actually named after Bombadil's own pony Fatty Lumpkin. The pony on the inn's signboard, rearing up on its hind legs, was fat and white. Fatty Lumpkin was, as his name suggested, fat but nevertheless more agile than would be expected from his girth and therefore capable of prancing. However his colour is not specified. The inn had presumably had its name for many years - or even centuries - so subscribing to this theory would mean that Fatty Lumpkin could not have been an ordinary "mortal" animal - which he probably wasn't.]

\*\*\*\*\*

#### **Chapter 2.9, p. 405 [Tidying up wording]**

Aragorn's experience of travelling by water is very evident in *LotR* as indicated by the journey down the Anduin with the Fellowship and then the capture of the ships of the Corsairs of Umbar prior to sailing up-river to Minas Tirith. In addition App A refers to **him** as a great leader "by land or by sea" before going on to describe his earlier exploits against the Corsairs which involved sea rather than river travel.

\*\*\*\*\*

### **Genealogical Table 5, p. 416 [spelling corrected]**

#### **Rómendacil**

\*\*\*\*\*

[W] *The Silmarillion: Chief Names and Concepts Used*, p. 420 [Added extra name to list]

**Valar** (singular **Vala**, female plural **Valier**): those of the Ainur who descended into the world and took up residence there.

The following are mentioned in the book: Aulë, Estë, Irmo/Lórien, Manwë, Námo/Mandos, Nienna, Oromë, Ulmo, **Vana**, Varda/Elbereth, Yavanna.

Also Melkor who, in the First Age, rebelled against his fellow Valar and against Ilúvatar. Called Morgoth (the Black Enemy) by the Elves.

\*\*\*\*\*

[W] *The Silmarillion: Chief Names and Concepts Used*, p. 420 [Added extra name to list]

**Eldar** (singular **Elda**): Elves who completed (or started) the journey West to Valinor in the First Age. The name also applied to their descendants.

The Elf kindreds who completed the journey to Valinor were the Vanyar, the Noldor and the Teleri. Some of the Teleri, who made the decision to stay in Beleriand and not go over Sea, became known as the Sindar or Grey Elves.

Some Elves refused the journey to Valinor, or abandoned it very early on. Among their number were Silvan Elves from Mirkwood Forest and Lothlórien.

Elves were immortal for as long as the world lasted, but they could die of grief or be killed in battle, in which circumstances their spirits went to the Halls of Mandos in Valinor. Their bodies could subsequently be reincarnated.

Elves mentioned in the book are: Aegnor, Beleg, Celeborn, Celebrimbor, Círdan, Eärwen, Elmo, Elwë/Thingol, Erestor, Fëanor, Finduilas, Finrod Felagund, Finwë, Galadriel, Gil-galad, **Gildor Inglorion**, Glorfindel, Gwindor, Haldir, Idril Celebrindal, Indis, Legolas, Lindir, Lúthien Tinúviel, Mithrellas, Nimloth, Nimrodel, Olwë, Oropher, Thranduil, Turgon.

\*\*\*\*\*

[W] *The Silmarillion: Chief Names and Concepts Used*, p. 421 [Inclusion of extra point]

**Dúnedain** (singular **Dúnadan**): the Third Age survivors of Númenor (and their descendants) following its downfall and drowning at the end of the Second Age.



\*\*\*\*\*

**[W] Bibliography, p. 422-4**

**[The following entries added:]**

- J. R. R. Tolkien and Donald Swann - *The Road Goes Ever On*
- Christopher Gilson Ed. - *Words, Phrases and Passages in various tongues in 'The Lord of the Rings'*
- Denis Bridoux - Re-readings and Re-interpretations 1: The Tale of Aragorn and Arwen
- *Encyclopedia of Arda*
- Murray Smith - Samwise Gamgee SD? Hobbits, heroism and honours
- Elizabeth Stephen - *Hobbit to Hero: The Making of Tolkien's King*

\*\*\*\*\*

**Other Amendments:**

Addition of index entries for new sources

Addition/correction of index entries for missing people, (e.g. Golasgil, Widfara), topics or pages

Various punctuation/spelling/font corrections

Rewording for the purpose of clarification or avoidance of repetition