

(A) Council Minutes Extracts – Mar 2014-May 2015

(documentation which should have issued with original response but inadvertently omitted)

MEDICAL COUNCIL

The 312th meeting of the Medical Council was held at 12:30hrs on Thursday 27th March and Friday 28th March 2014 in Kingram House, Kingram Place, Dublin 2.

Item 4 – President’s Business

4.6 Opinion from [REDACTED] BL - Accreditation of Medical Training Programme at RCSI Bahrain

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

MEDICAL COUNCIL

The 314th meeting of the Medical Council was held at 14:00hrs on Wednesday 9th July and Thursday 10th July 2014 in Kingram House, Kingram Place, Dublin 2.

Item 6 – Education, Training & Professional Development Committee (ETPDC)

6.1 Report of Education, Training & Professional Development Committee meeting held on 11th June 2014

Professor Johnson presented the report to Council of the ETPDC meeting which was held on 11th June 2014.

Basic Medical Education and Training.

Council was also updated on the inspection of RCSI Bahrain which is scheduled for 13th and 14th October 2014.

Council agreed that approval would be deferred pending consideration of terminological amendments

MEDICAL COUNCIL

The 317th meeting of the Medical Council was held at 12:30hrs on Thursday 18th and Friday 19th September 2014 in Kingram House, Kingram Place, Dublin 2.

Item 6 – Education, Training & Professional Development Committee (ETPDC)

6.1 Report of Education, Training & Professional Development Committee meeting held on 11th September 2014

Professor O' Herlihy presented the report of the Education, Training & Professional Development Committee.

Council noted that the preparations for the forthcoming accreditation visit to RCSI Bahrain which is due to take place in October 2014 are under way. These preparations include, as previously agreed, the provision of human rights documentation to the agreed assessor panel which includes international assessors.

Dr Hanley advised Council that it has come to his attention that the heads of a number of prominent Human Rights organisations have publicly expressed doubt as to the ability of the Medical Council to accredit the medical school in Bahrain. He understands that they have written to the Oireachtas in this regard. Council noted Dr Hanley's comments and re-iterated its cognisance of the human rights issues in Bahrain.

Dr Hanley went on to suggest that consideration be given to inviting Professor O'Brien, who previously visited Bahrain as part of a human rights group, to join the assessor panel for the upcoming visit to Bahrain. The President advised Council that the assessor panel including international assessors has already been appointed. This agreed assessor panel will provide a report to Council following the visit in October.

On the proposal of Ms Carrigy and seconded by Dr Walsh, Council approved the report of the Education, Training & Professional Development Committee.

MEDICAL COUNCIL

The 319th meeting of the Medical Council was held at 1:30hrs on Wednesday 5th and Thursday 6th November 2014 in Kingram House, Kingram Place, Dublin 2.

Item 6 – Education, Training & Professional Development Committee (ETPDC)

6.1 Report of Education, Training & Professional Development Committee meeting held on 22nd October 2014

Professors O'Herlihy presented the report of the Education, Training & Professional Development Committee held on 22nd October 2014.

Basic Medical Education and Training

Council noted the Committee's update on recent undergraduate medical education accreditation activities. RCSI Bahrain was inspected on 13th and 14th October 2014 and University College Cork and National University of Ireland, Galway were inspected on 20th and 21st October 2014 respectively. The reports are currently being drafted and will be circulated to the Committee in due course.

Following a proposal by Dr Hanley, seconded by Ms Murphy, Council approved the report of the Education, Training & Professional Development Committee

MEDICAL COUNCIL

The 321st meeting of the Medical Council was held at 12:30hrs on Tuesday 16th December and Wednesday 17th December 2014 in Kingram House, Kingram Place, Dublin 2.

Item 10 – Education, Training & Professional Development Committee (ETPDC)

10.1 Report of Education, Training & Professional Development Committee meeting held on 3rd December 2014

Professor Johnson presented the report of the Education, Training & Professional Development Committee held on 3rd December 2014.

10.1.7 Appendix 1 – Report of the inspection visit to RCSI Bahrain

The President and Professor Johnson absented themselves for this agenda item.

A query arose as to whether Council members who had participated in an accreditation visit should then participate in the discussion of that accreditation report. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] It was agreed by Council to continue the practice that Council members can discuss the reports of accreditation visits they have attended.

Ms Bulbulia introduced the report which was then presented by Ms Carrigy. Ms. Carrigy gave an overview of the Inspection which took place on 13th and 14th October 2014. As in all inspections of undergraduate medical programmes and the bodies that deliver them, the Inspection Team used the World Federation for Medical Education (WFME) guidelines. The Team included experienced external assessors from outside the jurisdiction. The Team were circulated with the WFME questionnaire completed by RCSI Bahrain, the Appendices submitted by RCSI Bahrain and all relevant background information, including the Ceartas Report.

The recommendations to Council were that:

1. The Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain's six year Medical Programme should be approved for a period of five years under the terms of Section 88(2)(a)(i)(I) of the Medical Practitioners Act 2007.

2. The Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain should be approved for a period of five years under Section 88(2)(a)(II) of the Medical Practitioners Act 2007 as the body which may deliver the Basic programme.

There followed significant discussion in relation to the context and recommended outcome of the accreditation visit. Mr Nisbet and Dr Hanley spoke to their email correspondence which expressed some concern that while RCSI Bahrain was delivering an identical curriculum to RCSI Dublin, there were environmental and political factors in place which could ultimately impact on the safety of students attending RCSI Bahrain. Concern was also expressed that there had been insufficient consideration during the accreditation process of ethical and human rights concerns in Bahrain, as articulated in the Ceartas report. Dr Golden expressed concerns about due process being followed.

Ms Carrigy, on behalf of the accreditation team, confirmed that team members had raised every matter with representatives of RCSI Bahrain, and with students in private session which was deemed relevant in order to apply the relevant WFME standards with representatives of RCSI Bahrain, and with students. It was also confirmed that there were no restraints on the Team's ability to raise queries, and that engagement with faculty and students was extremely thorough.

Some members expressed the view that the broader issues of human rights and ethical concerns would be more appropriately addressed by the Irish government, and that it was important that Council should act within its statutory remit and focus on matters relating to education and training. A proposal was made by Cllr Mulready, seconded by Ms Bulbulia, to accept the report and its recommendations.

A counter-proposal was then put forward not to accept the accreditation report, nor the recommendations contained therein. On the proposal of Dr Hanley, seconded by Mr Nisbet, Council voted, with 7 members in favour, 10 members against and one member abstaining.

A vote was then taken in relation to the original proposal to accept the report and its recommendations. Council voted, with 11 members in favour, 6 members against and one member abstaining. The proposal was approved by Council.

Dr Golden and Dr Hanley requested that their dissent to this decision be recorded in the minute.

Following a proposal by Dr Doyle, seconded by Dr Breslin, Council approved the report of the Education, Training and Professional Development Committee.

(B) ETPDC Minutes Extracts – 2014-2015

(documentation which should have issued with original response but inadvertently omitted)

ETPDC 3rd December 2014

1.3 Declarations of possible conflicts of interest in relation to the discussion of the report of the visit to Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland, Bahrain were made by Professor Alan Johnson, Professor Arthur Tanner and Professor Freddie Wood. These members agreed to absent themselves during the discussion of the report under item 5.1.1 and it was agreed that Dr John Jenkins would chair the meeting during discussion of this item. Dr Hanley queried whether it should be a Council member chairing this part of the discussion, and Dr Kavanagh and Dr Keane replied to state that this is not a requirement in the Terms of Reference.

Professor Johnson, Professor Tanner and Professor Wood left the meeting during consideration of Item 5.1.1.

5.1.1 Dr Jenkins assumed the Chair during the duration of the consideration of the Report of the Inspection of the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain.

Ms Bulbulia gave an overview of the Inspection which took place on 13th and 14th October 2014. As in all inspections of undergraduate medical programmes and the bodies that deliver them, the Inspection Team used the *World Federation for Medical Education Global Standards for Quality Improvement in Medical Education: European Specifications*. The Team included experienced external assessors from outside the jurisdiction. The Team were circulated with the WFME questionnaire completed by RCSI Bahrain, the Appendices submitted by RCSI Bahrain and all relevant background information, including the Ceartas Report. In keeping with the usual agenda for medical school inspections, the Team met academic and clinical staff, students (in confidential session) and visited the RCSI Bahrain Campus, along with three clinical training sites, namely the Salmaniya Medical Complex, the King Hamad University Hospital and the Bahrain Defence Force Hospital.

The programme is based on the existing programme delivered by the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland (RCSI) at its campuses in Dublin and Malaysia. The programme is well designed and to date has been effectively delivered. The Team recommends that:

1. The Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain's six year Medical Programme should be approved for a period of 5 years under the terms of Section 88(2)(a)(i)(I) of the Medical Practitioners Act 2007. This recommendation is made on the grounds the programme adheres to the rules, criteria, guidelines and standards approved by Council, as specified in Section 88(2)(a) and 88(2)(d) of the Medical Practitioners Act 2007. This approval is subject to interim monitoring and a possible re-inspection, under the terms of Section 88(2)(a)(i)(I) of the Medical Practitioners Act.

The Medical Council Team is satisfied that, while not a separate programme, and therefore not being separately accredited under the Act, the five year programme as delivered by RCSI Bahrain is satisfactory.

2. The Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain should be approved for a period of 5 years under Section 88(2)(a)(II) of the Medical Practitioners Act 2007 as the body which may deliver the Basic programme. This recommendation is made on the grounds of the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland's ongoing compliance with the rules, criteria, guidelines and standards approved by Council as specified in Section 88(2)(a)(i)(II) and 88(2)(e) of the Medical Practitioners Act 2007. This approval is subject to interim monitoring and a possible re-inspection, under the terms of Section 88(2)(a)(i)(I) of the Medical Practitioners Act.

Ms Bulbulia drew the attention of the Committee to the following recommendations in addition to the recommendations above:

Recommendation 3

That opportunities are identified to provide for more comprehensive and formal assessment and feedback on student professionalism, which link with student progress decisions; assessment should include acknowledgement of positive attitudes and behaviours

Recommendation 4

That inter-professional learning should be a more comprehensive element of the education programme

Recommendation 7

That Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain considers how it can better support students in sourcing suitable and convenient accommodation

Recommendation 8

That further resources or supports be allocated to providing Arabic translators, as delays are affecting some students full participation in bedside learning with patients

Recommendation 10

That Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain continues to monitor the implementation of the formal curriculum at clinical sites to ensure that consistency is achieved

Recommendation 14

That implementation of research objectives under the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain Strategic Plan 2012-2017 be appropriately resourced and monitored to ensure that the research agenda grows at Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain, and that Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain explore opportunities to integrate population

health, health services and healthcare professional education research with other strategic objectives, including community engagement

Recommendation 15

That Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain monitors variances in student feedback at Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain versus other campuses to determine if specific action is required and that the effectiveness of 'closing the loop' measures are reviewed

Recommendation 18

That through its governance structures and risk management procedures, Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain satisfies itself that it has adequate assessment, monitoring and control of any potential impacts on programme delivery and achievement of educational outcomes both at its campus and at the clinical sites which it uses to deliver its educational programme

Recommendation 19

That Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain explores further opportunities to recognise the contribution of teachers.

Ms Bulbulia stated that the Team were particularly impressed with the orientation programme, the Peer Assisted Learning (PAL) programme and the Centre for Student Success. The Team believe there is much to commend in RCSI Bahrain, in particular the benchmarking across the three international RCSI sites, and the Team made some recommendations in the report for future development.

Dr Hanley commenced the discussion stating that he has previously spoken on the issue of accreditation of RCSI Bahrain. He stated that while not questioning the integrity of the Inspection Team, who were clearly experienced, he did not support the recommendation of the Team to approve RCSI Bahrain, on the basis that he believes that Human Rights were being contravened in Bahrain. Dr Hanley outlined his rationale for this view, stating that in September 2014, seven reputable organisations wrote to the Committee on Education and Social Protection, outlining their concerns that Bahrain was a 'repressive environment.

Dr Hanley explained that an RCSI graduate remains, in his view, unlawfully detained in prison and that Professor Tom Collins, previous President of RCSI Bahrain, tendered his resignation saying that the political environment was directly interfering with medical education in Bahrain. Dr Hanley stated that there is an inherent risk to the Council as there is no reference in the Medical Council report to human rights violations and that this will give legitimacy to the regime.

Dr Hanley stated that he could not accept the conclusions and recommendations made in the report, proposed that it should not be accepted and stated that he would be making the same proposal to Council when it considers the report at its next meeting.

Following a question by the Chair, Dr Jenkins, the Chief Executive Officer explained that it is the duty of the Committee to adjudge the report that is

before them today, consider the recommendations from the report and determine the overall recommendation that should go to the Medical Council.

Dr Kavanagh stated that the Medical Council has a discrete and technical role to undertake in reviewing a programme against the World Federation for Medical Education standards. Dr Hanley refuted that this was the sole role of the Medical Council.

Ms Bulbulia stated that she stood over the report taking into account the diligence and experience of the accreditation team. She recommended that the Committee brings the report forward to the Medical Council for approval. She further stated that the accreditation team met with the students who were fine young people who deserved to have their programme recognised.

Dr Hanley stated that one of his concerns was that the Medical Council team would be kept well away from any individuals or organisations who would speak against the Bahraini regime and that this issue has been highlighted by many human rights organisations. Dr Clarke assured Dr Hanley that the team questioned the students at length.

Ms Bulbulia proposed that the report of the visit be accepted and Dr Morgan seconded the proposal.

On being put to a vote, three members voted for acceptance of the report (Dr Clarke, Ms Bulbulia and Dr Morgan) and one member voted against (Dr Hanley). Dr Hanley requested his dissent to the decision to be formally noted.

Professor Johnson, Professor Tanner and Professor Wood rejoined the meeting following consideration of Item 5.1.1.

Dr Jenkins demitted the Chair and left the meeting.

Dr Hanley and Mr Nisbet left the meeting after consideration of Item 5.1.1.

ETPDC - 22nd October 2014

- 5.2. Ms Willis gave the Committee an overview of recent undergraduate medical education accreditation activities. RCSI Bahrain was inspected on 13th and 14th October 2014 and a report is currently being drafted. University College Cork and National University of Ireland, Galway were inspected on 20th and 21st October 2014 respectively, with the specific intention of monitoring the impact on students following the dissolution of the twinning agreement with Allianza University College of Medical Sciences. The reports are currently being drafted and will be circulated to the Committee in due course.

ETPDC 11th September 2014

Item 5 - Basic Education and Training

- 5.1. The Committee were updated on preparations for the forthcoming accreditation visit to RCSI Bahrain which is due to take place in October 2014. The Committee also noted that arrangements are being made to support the forthcoming monitoring visit to NUIG and UCC. These monitoring visits will assess the impact on students of the recent termination of the AUCMS Twinning Programme. Previously, students on this programme would spend time in both Malaysia, and Cork / Galway. Arising from the termination of the programme, UCC and UCG have put in place measures to accommodate Malaysian students who otherwise would have returned to Malaysia to complete their programme, but who will now remain in Ireland for the duration of their training.

ETPDC 11th June 2014

Item 5 - Basic Education and Training

- 5.1. Dr Keane gave an overview of the upcoming accreditation activity, including an inspection of University College Cork and National University of Ireland, Galway to assess the impact of the termination of the twinning agreement with Allianz University College of Medical Sciences. The Medical Council are closely monitoring the situation to ensure there has been no adverse impact following the increase in student numbers during the clinical years.

An inspection has been scheduled for RCSI Bahrain on 13th and 14th October 2014, utilising a team of experienced assessors comprising two Council members, one external assessor from within the jurisdiction, two external assessors from outside the jurisdiction and three members of the executive. Mr Carey raised the question as to whether there would be the opportunity for inexperienced assessors to participate in the RCSI Bahrain inspection. Dr Keane stated that the Team has already been formed, following the Council decision that an experienced Team be utilised. Dr Keane stated that there will be other opportunities to participate in an inspection Team in the future, particularly in postgraduate accreditation activities.

Dr Kavanagh raised the plan regarding provision of documentation (including the Ceartas Report) to the inspection team. This plan reflects Council decisions arising from discussion of the decision to inspect RCSI Bahrain. He reminded the Committee of the minute of its meeting of 23rd October 2013 at 2.30pm where it was noted that external reports or approaches from third parties are not currently factored into Council's accreditation policies and procedures. He also reminded the Committee that the Risk Register notes a risk in relation to failure to take a standard approach in relation to the assessment of RCSI Bahrain, reflecting Senior Counsel advice, and that implementing the current plan will not support control of this risk. Dr Kavanagh referenced that this plan could be seen to operate against fair process and suggested, given that documentation other than that received from RCSI Bahrain was being provided to the inspection team, that RCSI Bahrain be placed on notice in this regard. Dr Keane stated that if Council were to invite a response from RCSI Bahrain, their perception could be that the inspection team were factoring the Ceartas Report into their assessment, rather than focussing on the World Federation of Medical Education guidelines. In summary, it was agreed, once again, that the documentation be circulated to the inspection team but that RCSI Bahrain would be notified of this fact, rather than invited to respond.

ETPDC - 19th February 2014

Item 6 - Basic Education and Training

Mr Kennedy joined the meeting for consideration of Item 6.2.

- 6.2 Ms Spillane updated the Committee on correspondence received from the Joint Committee on Education and Social Protection regarding the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain dated 20th December 2013, which is awaiting response. Mr Kennedy reiterated to the Committee that there was no statutory obligation on the Medical Council to inspect the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Bahrain: however, the RCSI now have a legitimate expectation that the Medical Council will visit due to indications that have been given by the Medical Council. Dr Hanley advised the Committee that he believes that the Medical Council were not in full possession of the facts (namely the Ceartas Report) when the decision was taken to visit RCSI Bahrain and proposed that the matter be brought to Council again for consideration. Mr Carey opposed the suggestion that the matter be considered again by Council and Ms Bulbulia supported the view that the RCSI Bahrain now has a reasonable expectation that the Medical Council will inspect and the matter should not be revisited. This was agreed.

It was noted that progressing the organisation and logistics for the visit would require the proposed competency framework process (recommended for approval as per paragraph 5.1) to have been implemented and the team finalised. It was noted that in the event of a date being scheduled, potential assessors would be given as much notice as possible, bearing expressions of interest and potential conflicts of interest in mind and the team would be made aware of all the issues, including the Ceartas Report.