Make Way for Lower Manhattan
Lower Manhattan boasts the greatest density of old and new tourist attractions of any area of New York City. In a half-mile radius from Fulton Center sit Federal Hall, the Stock Exchange, the Brooklyn Bridge, the 9/11 Memorial, the Oculus, Wall Street, Trinity Church, and the South Street Seaport as well as access points to Governors, Liberty and Ellis Islands. In no part of the island is tourism growing faster.

Yet the growth in visitation has resulted in a host of challenges to the public realm—and to the people who live and work there. Although there is only a limited amount of motor vehicle traffic in FiDi, the streets are designed to give cars priority. Bikers, pedestrians and even delivery vehicles struggle to find a place to maneuver along the street.

FiDi, New York’s most historic place, deserves better. The ideas on the pages that follow are a place to start.
The Challenges
Once a strictly commercial neighborhood, Lower Manhattan today is a growing mixed-use neighborhood. An estimated 75,000 New Yorkers reside downtown—where few have lived since the late 19th century, when transit facilitated “commuting” from uptown. They are joined daily by over 300,000 office workers, roughly the same number that worked here half a century ago. Another 14 million tourists (and 50% are international) visit Lower Manhattan each year, a volume that has grown sixfold in the last decade and a half.

Thanks to a proliferation of good schools in the neighborhood, downtown has attracted a large and growing number of families. Millennials priced out of increasingly expensive areas of Brooklyn have also discovered downtown. Both have helped to fuel the ongoing conversions of former office towers to residential buildings east of Broadway, and the growth of round-the-clock retail along streets once dark at night. On the commercial side, traditional financial service businesses now occupy smaller volumes of space and creative industries and non-profits are now responsible for the lion’s share of new tenancies downtown.

**New Residential Buildings 2003–2017**

Once an office neighborhood that turned dark and quiet at night, Lower Manhattan has grown from 20,000 residential units in 2000 to 32,000 residential units in 2017. This represents an estimated 75,000 residents.

**Tourism Growth 2000–2016**

Currently, 35 hotels are open in Lower Manhattan and eight more are scheduled to open. This represents six percent of all hotel rooms in NYC and nine percent of all hotel rooms under construction.

**Relocations to Lower Manhattan 2004–2014**

The nature of business downtown has changed. The predominance of financial, insurance and real estate industries is gone and new, “creative” industries have been flocking to the neighborhood—which remains more affordable than midtown or certain parts of Brooklyn.
Lower Manhattan has proven uniquely resilient over time. In the early 19th century, fire repeatedly ravaged Wall Street and the surrounding financial district; in the 20th, the demise of the port challenged the city and state to reimagine the area’s future. More recently, in the 21st century, severe flooding, deep recession and unimaginable acts of terrorism called into question the viability of downtown as a commercial hub.

While Lower Manhattan as a whole has recovered from the tragic events of 9/11, success has not been evenly dispersed. Billions of dollars in public investment has been made west of Broadway—in the 9/11 Memorial, in its adjacent park, in the new Calatrava-designed PATH transit hub and the retail mall that accompanies it, and in Manhattan’s tallest skyscraper among other projects. East of Broadway, no such transformative investments have been made; the security zone around the Stock Exchange implemented in the wake of the attack has instead impeded mobility and dotted the public realm with dysfunctional bits of infrastructure.
The problem of crowding in this area is not new. FiDi’s old narrow streets, many dating from the era of Dutch New Amsterdam, have long constrained the Financial District—like the small, valuable lots that gave rise to the city’s first skyscrapers. Downtown congestion was so bad in the late 19th century that support for a subway, to disperse population, was finally secured. Yet downtown density has only grown, and grown significantly, since that time.

FiDi’s sidewalks are a fraction of the width of their uptown counterparts. So too are its streets: they are narrow and wind in unpredictable ways, with far more intersections between pedestrians and cars than in the remainder of gridded New York. Long views for orientation are absent, as is the street numbering that facilitates navigation in most of Manhattan. FiDi streets are often dark, a function of the tall buildings that adorn their edges. This canyon-like effect makes both walking and driving in FiDi a challenge—for workers, for residents, and for tourists.
While the Financial District historically served a homogenous population of office workers, as far back as 1966 city planners recognized that the needs of a modern, mixed-use neighborhood could not be met on an unregulated colonial street grid. Young children and families demand playgrounds, parks, schools, and safe streets around-the-clock, workers require transit access and basic retail during the week, and tourists need wayfinding and places year-round to rest and take pictures.

Since the mid-60’s, there have been several attempts to study the crowding and conflicts that characterize FiDi streets. Each study has identified bold solutions that would allow different types of users to more adequately “share” scarce street and sidewalk real estate downtown. None, however, has been implemented—or even piloted. To this day, the rules that apply on FiDi’s streets—for vendors, deliveries, parking, and garbage collection—are those that apply on the wider streets of gridded Manhattan.

THE 1966 LOWER MANHATTAN PLAN

Fifty years ago, the Lower Manhattan Plan of 1966 recognized that a “live-work” neighborhood would require a new approach to managing streets and proposed a plan for segregating streets by users. It recommended “through-streets” for fast-moving traffic, service roads for deliveries and local traffic, and pedestrian streets to allow people to safely move east-west and north-south.

2010 NYC DOT SHARED STREETS STUDY

In 2010, the New York City DOT undertook a study of the area and recommended piloting a new “shared streets” approach to manage street space conflicts. It proposed designating a special district in which people and cars would share streets and sidewalks in a more fluid way, so as to improve safety without impeding vehicular access to homes and businesses.

2018 VISION STUDY FOR THE STOCK EXCHANGE DISTRICT

In 2018, the Downtown Alliance launched a vision plan for the area around the Stock Exchange along Broad and Wall Streets. The plan calls for enhancements to the pedestrianized security zone near the Stock Exchange. The work was well-received and members of the community have called for the plan to be extended beyond the security zone, in ways outlined in the Make Way for Lower Manhattan proposals that follow.
The problems of sidewalk congestion, vehicular mobility, garbage collection, and pedestrian and bike safety in FiDi are getting worse. Air quality is among the lowest, and noise levels are among the highest, in the city. These issues threaten to undermine both the quality of life in New York’s most historic district and its ability to grow.

The Financial District suffers from the implementation of city-wide rules about how we use our streets. Without the numerical cues of the street grid or the ample sidewalks of midtown, it is difficult for visitors and residents to navigate. Food carts and scaffolding consistently take up available room on heavily congested and narrow sidewalks. No area of the city has more placard parking, with city agencies monopolizing street edges with “official” cars. And nowhere else are developers converting such large office buildings to apartments, prompting a shift in garbage collection to the sidewalks from its former collection zone within the building.
The Financial District of Lower Manhattan is New York’s oldest and most historic place. Its street grid, dating from the 17th century, is itself on the National Register. Though few buildings from the 18th century remain, the area is a treasure-trove of 19th century landmarks. Churches, plazas, museums, office buildings, and the South Street Seaport conjure up an earlier era in New York’s storied history.

Yet the average pedestrian has hardly a moment to contemplate the history of the place as he or she navigates the congested streets east of Broadway. Scaffolding and vendors block access to its historic alleyways and are splayed across its historic plazas. Crowds push pedestrians along, leaving no time or ability to absorb the richness in plain view. Tourists congregate behind makeshift barriers in the middle of Broadway as it meets Bowling Green, yet plazas like those at Bowling Green or opposite Zuccotti Park remain underutilized and connections to the Battery and other public spaces illegible.
The buildings and spaces of the Financial District are singular, dramatic and varied—from the skyscrapers of the early 20th century to the sparkling façade of 80 Spruce Street. Styles and periods co-exist in ways that are remarkable and speak to the area’s ability to reinvent itself for every generation.

The district has many dramatic building vistas, but they are badly obstructed. The view of Trinity Church from Wall Street, for example, has been a classic for two-hundred years, but is today interrupted by broken security barriers, scaffolding, and food carts. The best view of the dramatic One World Trade Center tower is looking west from the middle of Fulton Street—but doing so requires the viewer to stand in the middle of an intersection. The newly renovated historic Beekman Hotel originally opened the same year as the Brooklyn Bridge only two blocks away (1883), but it is impossible to get from one to the other directly.

**TRINITY CHURCH**
**WORLD TRADE CENTER**
Lower Manhattan is home to some of the city’s most significant landmarks such as Trinity Church, which is almost 200 years old, and the One World Trade Center tower, which boasts an observatory at its apex and draws over 1.8 million visitors a year.

**WOOLWORTH BUILDING**
**BEEKMAN HOTEL**
Historic buildings are part of Lower Manhattan’s signature character. Designed in a neo-Gothic style, the Woolworth Building was nicknamed the “Cathedral of Commerce” when it was first built in 1913. After a devastating fire in the 1940s, the Beekman Hotel’s exquisite atrium interior was restored and it reopened in 2016.

**140 BROADWAY**
**8 SPRUCE STREET**
In addition to its historic gems, Lower Manhattan has been home to notable architectural innovation. 140 Broadway is an exemplar modernist tower and Frank Gehry’s rippling 8 Spruce Street tower demonstrates the cutting edge of modern architectural design.
The area is accessible to all, with public bus, ferry, and subway connections to more destinations than any other neighborhood in Manhattan. And most commuters and tourists rely on them almost exclusively: motor vehicle flows on FiDi streets are among the lowest anywhere in Manhattan. Deliveries and for-hire vehicles represent the majority of private vehicles circulating in the area.

Over the last two decades, new ferry services have connected Lower Manhattan to New Jersey and parts of New York City along the Brooklyn and Queens waterfronts. New York City and State have spent more than $5 billion on starchitect-designed transit hubs at Fulton Center and the World Trade Center. Underground connections between the many subways in the district and station passageways between the various lines are now legible, well-marked, and spacious. The streets and sidewalks of FiDi above them, in contrast, are impossible to navigate in a safe and purposeful way, and no money has been allocated to improve them.

THE OCUlus
Over four billion dollars was spent to complete a new PATH station and cover it in a sculptural form that anchors the area west of Broadway.

FULTON CENTER
A less dramatic design was chosen for the Fulton Center, a modest structure devoted primarily to providing interchange between a dozen subway lines and a link to the World Trade Center PATH train.

WHITEHALL TERMINAL
The new Staten Island Ferry Terminal is located at the tip of Manhattan. The #1 subway that serves it also received a major overhaul recently.
The Financial District has a street grid that lends itself beautifully to the world of the “flâneur,” or walker. Narrow cobblestone streets, laid out in the 17th century, wind in unpredictable ways—punctuated by landmark buildings, historic views, and colonial-era alleys. They are unlike anywhere else in New York City.

Only two sections of FiDi are now formally managed to pay homage to their historical pedigree—the area around the South Street Seaport and tiny Stone Street, the first paved road in the original colony. Yet streets like Nassau and Broad are dimensioned and curve, fall, and rise in ways that reflect their original topography and purpose—as canal and colonial paths. Small alleys between buildings connect streets somewhat randomly, much the way they do in the older capital cities of Europe, though they remain dark and underutilized at present.

**STONE STREET**
The pedestrianized zone with its cobblestones, historic buildings and line of pubs is a festive indoor-outdoor gathering place for visitors and locals alike.

**SOUTH STREET SEAPORT**
The designated historic district that was once the main port and commerce zone for Manhattan has undergone a transformation that celebrates its iconic maritime buildings and has brought new dining and shopping establishments.

**BROAD & NASSAU STREETS**
Once the primary canal of Lower Manhattan, Broad Street turns into Nassau Street at Wall Street and transitions into a narrow streetscape with small-scale shops and businesses. The slope of the corridor dramatically canters down from north to south providing dramatic views of the street’s bustling activity.
A huge opportunity exists to transform the public realm of this unique district into one of New York’s great places—on a par with Barcelona’s Gothic Quarter, the Marais in Paris, and Istanbul’s Golden Horn.

The historic district should be its own must-see destination—a place that New Yorkers, as well as tourists, want to visit for its slow pace, unique architecture, and historic gathering places. The South Street Seaport, Stone Street, and the pedestrian plaza in front of the Stock Exchange are already destinations where visitors can walk, sit, and absorb the history around them. But they are not well connected—tourists don’t know how close they are to each, or what lies east or west of Broad Street. Other iconic destinations are also poorly connected to one another. Our two oldest parks, for example, the Battery and Bowling Green, are all but invisible from one another despite their adjacency and crossing between the two can be hazardous.
A 21st century vision for Lower Manhattan would change the way that cars and people interact on city streets, making the lives of pedestrians safer and more pleasant in a “slow-street” district where the needs of residents, businesses, and tourists can all be met.

Slow zones involve more than changes to speed limits, such as those imposed under the city’s Vision Zero pledge to reduce traffic deaths in the city. Truly making streets safer will require the sharing of road space according to methods that many global competitors have adopted in the confined streets of their historic urban cores.

Interventions in Amsterdam, for example, have proven that the best way to slow drivers is to remove most of the tools that traffic engineers developed in the 20th century to make drivers feel comfortable driving quickly. The Dutch slow streets, comprising roughly 85 percent of the streets in central Amsterdam, are called “shared space,” and almost counterintuitively have no traffic lights, traffic signs, crosswalks, or painted road arrows. A pedestrian or cyclist may be anywhere in the street at any time. Many of these slow streets have no sidewalks, and none of them have bike lanes (those are reserved for faster streets).
Transformative Ideas

**SLOW-STREET DISTRICT**
A slow-street district could easily be implemented in FiDi, extending up to the Seaport and the Brooklyn Bridge. Within it, some streets would have short-term parking and others would not.

**NASSAU-BEEKMAN: BEFORE**
Once pedestrianized, Nassau Street today is unremarkable despite its historic buildings, like these at Nassau and Beekman Streets.

**NASSAU-BEEKMAN: AFTER**
Redefining the relationship between sidewalk and street in a slow-street district allows a more porous streetscape and takes advantage of Nassau Street’s gracious curves and unique sightlines.
The slow-street district could feature a historic walking trail at its core—improving the legibility of the area for tourists, supporting local retail along its edges, and providing a well-lit and safe travel route for residents in the evening.

The Freedom Trail in Boston offers one model of a way to help tourists navigate easily through a historic district with multiple destinations: they simply follow a line painted on the street. In London, movement between London Bridge Station and Tower Bridge/City Hall is facilitated by a ribbon of water that runs at grade through a private development. Barcelona and other cities rely on a main boulevard, such as La Rambla, to guide visitors through a tourist district and provide ready access to historic sites and other attractions.
HISTORIC WALKING TRAIL

A proposed historic walking trail, shown in dark and light purple below, would be easy for visitors to follow. A north-south “spine” along Nassau Street, running from City Hall and the Brooklyn Bridge to Bowling Green and the Staten Island Ferry, could be punctuated by east-west “ribs” allowing easy and legible routes to the World Trade Center, Trinity Church, and the South Street Seaport.

HISTORIC WALKING TRAIL BROAD-NASSAU CORRIDOR

The trail’s route, which could run down Nassau and Broad Streets, is home to many small-scale businesses. The street curves with a sloping topography, offering a variety of views down the corridor and side streets.

POTENTIAL TRAIL FEATURES

The spine of the historic walking trail could offer a water feature to remind visitors of the canal that once ran along Broad Street. Enhanced seating and paving treatments would create a pleasant and attractive walking experience for visitors and locals.

ART WALK

A sequence of public art landmarks are sited along Maiden Lane and form a “rib” of the historic walking trail.
Three major gathering places that celebrate FiDi’s history could anchor the slow-street district. One would serve as the gateway to Brooklyn at the foot of the Brooklyn Bridge, another defined by the Stock Exchange and Federal Hall at the center of the proposed historic walking trail, and a third would involve a transformation at Bowling Green, New York’s first park.

These gathering places can be easily created from the existing street and building fabric. In Paris, traffic directives halted passage around one side of the Place Des Vosges—attaching the park seamlessly to an existing building. Much the same was done at the famous Trafalgar Square in London, to recognize the desire for tourists to move seamlessly between the National Gallery and Nelson’s Column, which serves as the focal point for activities in Trafalgar Square.
BROOKLYN BRIDGE: BEFORE
The Brooklyn Bridge ramps, once intended to go under City Hall and emerge near Broadway, instead bifurcate the area to the east of City Hall and clog streets with cars—complicating mobility and severing the northern reaches of FiDi from nearby Chinatown.

BOWLING GREEN: BEFORE
The approach to historic Bowling Green is unremarkable. The park itself is not a destination for visitors, instead they congregate at its narrow northern end (to photograph sculptures placed awkwardly there), spilling out onto Broadway and complicating traffic.

BROOKLYN BRIDGE: AFTER
A reimagined Brooklyn Bridge-City Hall Plaza, focused around a new fountain or monument, could become one of NYC’s signature public spaces by ensuring that cars coming off the Brooklyn Bridge are not able to enter the city street grid at Chambers Street. Instead they would enter Lower Manhattan from streets north and south of the Bridge off of the FDR Drive.

BOWLING GREEN: AFTER
At Bowling Green, the eastern southbound lane of Broadway would be limited access or pedestrianized, creating a new, enlarged plaza and gathering place whose dimensions are largely defined by the historic buildings that encircle it on three sides and whose connection to the Battery would be legible.
Making It Happen
Reimagining FiDi as a special, historic district will take more than urban design interventions. It will require rules that help unclutter these singular streets and enforcement, to ensure that these new rules are followed.

We have the tools to fix this. In Times Square and Herald Square, new traffic patterns were piloted to manage the crowding and congestion—much of it tourist-induced. The result has been less conflict between cars and people, more time for tourists to enjoy a “public space” where once there was none, and less congestion on surrounding streets for vehicles passing through the district.

The FiDi garbage problem must be addressed. Continued conversion of FiDi’s old commercial skyscrapers into residential towers means that more and more garbage is placed on narrow sidewalks for municipal collection during the day.

There are simple solutions to the piles of residential garbage that regularly confront more vulnerable pedestrians—children en route to school, parents pushing strollers, and residents walking dogs. One is to collect it at night, just as commercial waste is collected. This special arrangement would recognize the unique limitations of FiDi’s sidewalks to handle the volumes produced by residential skyscrapers and ensure that streets are clear of garbage during the day.
Placard parking is another major problem. It is estimated that roughly half of the cars parked on FiDi’s narrow streets are those of government officials, who could park in allocated areas but instead take up spots that could be used for loading, temporary parking, or other purposes.

A recent survey of cars parked on Nassau Street found that approximately 48 percent of them were using government placards. Converting street real estate now monopolized by government cars into areas for vendors, pedestrians, or cyclists would be one way to free up much-needed street real estate. Ample local parking options can accommodate official vehicles.

Food and souvenir carts are another factor impeding mobility. Absent sensible regulation, vendors situate along some of the narrowest, most congested streets—including the intersection of Wall Street and Broadway, in front of historic Trinity Church.

Vendors receive licenses from the City’s Department of Consumer Affairs, not the Department of Transportation, so there is little relationship between their location and the room needed on sidewalks to accommodate pedestrian flows. They choose to locate in some of the busiest tourist areas—including those already compromised by narrow streets and security apparatus, resulting in walkers often being confined to single-file passage.
Lower Manhattan’s Financial District stands poised to be reimagined—much as it was following the decline of the docks a half century ago. But today’s reimagining need not involve the massive landbuilding interventions associated with the World Trade Center and Battery Park City. Instead, FiDi needs a simple vision that recognizes that people, not cars, now predominate on its historic streets—and that making movement safer, easier, and more enjoyable for them can transform the area into one of the world’s most attractive places to live, work, and visit.

Make Way for Lower Manhattan! With a few practical interventions, FiDi’s future as our city’s most celebrated historic destination can be secured.