# Editorial Board

**Editor-in-Chief**  
Dr. Hassen Zriba

**Managing Editor**  
Najoua Chalbi

| *Emeritus Professor Ralph Grillo*  
University of Sussex, UK | *Dr. Syed Zamanat Abbas*  
Salman Bin Abdulaziz University, Saudi Arabia |
|---|---|
| *Professor Mohammad Asif*  
Riphah International University, Pakistan | *Dr. Santosh Kumar Behera*  
Sidho-Khanho-Birsha University, India |
| *Professor Sadok Bouhlila*  
Northern Borders University, Saudi Arabia | *Dr. P. Prayer Elmo Raj*  
Pachaiyappa's College, India |
| *Professor Pacha Malyadri*  
Osmania University, Andhra Pradesh, India | *Omid Akhavan*  
Imam Ali University, Iran |
| *Professor Shormishtha Panja*  
University of Delhi, India | *Loredana Terec-Vlad*  
Ștefan cel Mare University, Romania |
| *Professor Jason L. Powell*  
University of Chester, UK | *Shama Adams*  
Curtin University, Australia |
| *Professor Ali H. Raddaoui*  
University of Wyoming, USA | *Mansour Amini*  
The Gulf College, Oman |
| *Dr. Mohamed El-Kamel Bakari*  
University of King Abdulaziz, Saudi Arabia | *Mohd AB Malek Bin MD Shah*  
Universiti Teknologi Mara, Malaysia |
| *Dr. Solange Barros*  
Federal University of Mato Grosso, Brazil | *Mark B. Ulla*  
Father Saturnino Urios University, Philippine |
| *Dr. Salah Belhassen*  
University of Gafsa, Tunisia | *Anouar Bennani*  
University of Sfax, Tunisia |
| *Dr. Nodhar Hammami Ben Fradj*  
University of Kairouan, Tunisia | *Shuv Raj Rana Bhat*  
Central Department of English Kirtipur, Kathmandu, Nepal |
| *Dr. Arbind Kumar Choudhary*  
Rangachahi College, Majuli, Assam, India | *Erika Ashley Couto*  
University of Concordia, Canada |
| *Dr. Amitabh Vikram Dwivedi*  
University of Shri Mata Vaishno Devi, India | *Md. Amir Hossain*  
IBAIS University, Bangladesh |
| *Dr. Baliram Namdev Gaikwad*  
University of Mumbai, India | *Elvan Mutlu*  
University of Kent, UK |
| *Dr. Abdullah Gharbavi*  
Payame Noor University, Iran | *Syed S. Uddin-Ahmed*  
St. John's University, USA |

http://ijhcschiefeditor.wix.com/ijhcs
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name 1</th>
<th>Name 2</th>
<th>Position 1</th>
<th>Position 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Dr. Al Sayed Mohamed Aly Ismail</em></td>
<td><em>Mansour Amini</em></td>
<td>Bin Abdualziz University, Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>The Gulf College, Oman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Dr. Nidhi Kesari</em></td>
<td><em>Nick J. Sciullo</em></td>
<td>University of Delhi, India</td>
<td>Georgia State University, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Dr. Raghvendra Kumar</em></td>
<td><em>Nizar Zouidi</em></td>
<td>LNCT Group of College Jabalpur, India</td>
<td>University of Mannouba, Tunisia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Dr. Salima Lejri</em></td>
<td><em>Logan Cochrane</em></td>
<td>University of Tunis, Tunisia</td>
<td>University of British Columbia, Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Dr. Chuka Fred Ononye</em></td>
<td><em>Shataw Naseri</em></td>
<td>Alvan Ikoku Federal College of Education, Nigeria</td>
<td>University of Shahid Beheshti in Iran</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Dr. Mohammed Salah Bouomrani</em></td>
<td><em>Manoj Kr. Mukherjee</em></td>
<td>University of Gafsa, Tunisia</td>
<td>Visva Bharati University, Santiniketan, West Bengal, India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Dr. Mahdi Zarai</em></td>
<td><em>Javed Akhter</em></td>
<td>University of Gafsa, Tunisia</td>
<td>University of Balochistan Quetta Balochistan, Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Dr. Anwar Tlili</em></td>
<td><em>Haron Bouras</em></td>
<td>King's College, London, UK</td>
<td>Mohamed Cherif Messadia University, Souk-Ahras Algeria</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

http://ijhcschiefeditor.wix.com/ijhcs
### Table of Contents

**Editorial**

1) "Secondary School Students’ Beliefs, Perceptions and Attitudes towards Communicative Language Learning (CLT) and Structural Approach (SA)"
   Hussein Islam Abdullah, Universiti Kebangsaan, Malaysia
   Parilah Mohd Shah, Universiti Kebangsaan, Malaysia
   .................................................................................................................... 8

2) "The Relevance of Traditional Belief System among the Fakkawa of Zuru Emirate"
   Yusuf Abdullahi, Federal University, Dutse-Ma, Katsina State, Nigeria
   .................................................................................................................... 9-28

3) "The Question of Intertextuality and the Perception of Muslims: The Case of the New York Times Op-Eds"
   Rachid Acim, University Sultan Moulay Slimane, Beni Mellal, Morocco
   .................................................................................................................... 29-37

4) "Dit-On Liberté En Traduction Littéraire? Un Aperçu Critique De La Traduction Française Des Romans De Fagunwa"
   Gbadegesin Olusegun Adegboye, Ekiti State University, Ado-Ekiti, Nigeria
   .................................................................................................................... 38-57

5) "Purging the Ghost of the Past"
   Musa Al-Halool, Effat University, Saudi Arabia
   .................................................................................................................... 58-64

6) "A Configuration of Socio-Political Dialectics in Nigerian Pidgin English: Trends in Peter Onwudijo’s Poetry"
   Sunday Joseph Ayodabo, Elizade University, Ilara-Mokin, Ondo State, Nigeria
   .................................................................................................................... 65-78

7) "Metaphorical Creativity in the Conceptualization of the Heart in Al-Ghazali’s *The Revival of the Religious Sciences* (Iḥyā’ ‘ulūm ad-dīn)"
   Afef Badri, University of Sfax, Tunisia
   .................................................................................................................... 79-93

8) "Mimetic Desire in Miguel Cervantes’ *Don Quixote* : an Anthropological Study"
   Farhat Ben Amor, University of Kairouan, Tunisia
   .................................................................................................................... 94-115

9) “American Multiculturalism vs. French Ethno-pluralism: The Debate over Arab and Muslim Assimilation”
   Lanouar Ben Hafsa, University of Tunis, Tunisia
   .................................................................................................................... 116-130

10) "Subjectivity and (non)belonging: Cormac McCarthy and the Psychotic Phenomenon in *Child of God*"
    Fadwa Ben Mohamed, University of Sousse, Tunisia
    .................................................................................................................... 131-146

11) "American Orientalism: How the Media Define What Average Americans Know about Islam and Muslims in the US"
    Hajer Ben Hadj Salem, University of Tunis, El-Manar, Tunisia
    .................................................................................................................... 147-155

http://ijhcschiefeditor.wix.com/ijhcs
12) ""Psychopathology" and "Crime" in Joyce Carol Oates’s (Rosamond Smith) novel *The Soul/Mate*

Dilek Çalişkan, Anadolu University, Turkey ................................................................. 173-188

13) "Cultural Diversity as a Safeguard against Static Identity in Mary Kingsley's *Travels in West Africa* and *West African Studies*"

Bechir Chaabane, Majmaah University, Saudi Arabia .................................................. 189-202

14) "De-colonising the British ex-colonies: The Demise of the British Empire through the subaltern voices in *Time For A Tiger* and *The Jewel in The Crown*"

Hayfa Cheneni, University of Tunis, Tunisia ................................................................. 203-212

15) "Trip in African Oral Literature as Quest for Human Essence: Kaïdara and *The Choice of Ori*"

Ndollane Dione, Université Gaston Berger, Saint-Louis, Sénégal .................................. 213-223

16) "Shari’aah Court in Thailand: Between Inspiration and Challenge"

Sulaiman Dorloh, Sultan Sharif Ali Islamic University, Brunei Darussalam .................... 224-242

17) "Cycles of Violence, Cycles of Trauma in Toni Morrison’s *Jazz*"

Olfa Drid, University of Manouba, Tunisia ................................................................. 243-254

18) "Disorder in Macbeth, or May We Call it ‘Entropy’?"

Inmen El-Khazri, University of Manouba, Tunisia ....................................................... 255-261

19) "Music & Social Criticism in Nigeria"

Thompson Olusegun Ewata, Federal University of Technology, Ondo State, Nigeria ........ 262-282

20) "Transitivity Analysis of « *The Crying lot of 49* » by Thomas Pynchon"

Rym Ezzina, University of Sfax, Tunisia ....................................................................... 283-292

21) "Humoring the Context, Contextualizing Humor in the Short Fiction of Lorrie Moore"

Nadia Boudidah Falfoul, University of Monastir, Tunisia ............................................ 293-304

22) "A Sociopragmatic Analysis of the Speech Act of Criticism by Persian Native Speakers"

Maryam Farnia, Payame Noor University, Iran

Hiba Qusay Abdul Sattar, Australian Technical Management College, Australia ........ 305-327

23) "Exposing traumas in Stephen King’s *The Shining and Doctor Sleep*"

Jessica Folio, University of Reunion Island, France ...................................................... 328-341

24) "Étalement urbain et disparité spatiale des modes d’accès à l’énergie électrique dans la ville de Ngaoundéré (Nord-Cameroun)"

Hervé Gondie, Université de Maroua, Cameroun

Basile Paul Eloundou Messi, Université de Maroua, Cameroun .................................. 342-353
25) "An Analysis of Vocabulary Learning Strategies of Adult English as a Foreign Language (EFL) Learners"
Prashneel Ravisan Goundar, Fiji National University, Fiji ........................................... 354-395

26) "Speech Acts in Selected Political Speeches"
Suhair Safwat M. Hashim, University of Sulaimani, Iraq ........................................... 396-406

27) "Violence et effets"
Sihem Hasni, University of Gafsa, Tunisia ................................................................. 407-416

28) "Feminist Criticism: A traceable premise in Welsh and Malaysian Short Stories"
Nor Hashimah Isa, Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris, Malaysia ................................ 417-422

29) "Speaking: A Review"
A. K. M. Mazharul Islam, King Khalid University, Abha, Saudi Arabia ..................... 423-435

30) "Literature Review and Use of Benjamin Bloom’s Taxonomy"
Matthew O. Iwuchukwu, University of Nigeria, Nsukka, Nigeria ............................... 436-444

31) "Discours romanesque épistolaire dans La voie de ma rue de Kean Zoh: situation, défis et devenir juridiques des enfants de la rue"
Matthew O. Iwuchukwu, University of Nigeria, Nsukka, Nigeria ............................... 445-453

32) "On the Bimoraicity of Tunisian Arabic Open Monosyllables: A Moraic Optimality-Theoretic Approach"
Mounir Jouini, University of Carthage, Tunisia ......................................................... 454-470

33) "A thorough analysis of ‘Bontsha the silent’ short story by Isaac Leib Peretz (1906)"
Fateme Moradian Fard Juneghani, University of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran ....................... 471-479

34) "The Artist as A Healer: A Glimpse of Satendra Nandan’s writing as a Healer"
Manpreet Kaur, The University of Fiji, Fiji
Prashneel Ravisan Goundar, Fiji National University, Fiji ........................................ 480-491

35) "Impact of the Tamar Communication Strategy on Sexual Gender-Based Violence in Eastern Africa"
Lillian K. Kaviti, University of Nairobi, Kenya ............................................................ 492-514

36) "When Caesars Dance, Masks Multiply: Celebrating the Soul’s Otherness and Dionysian Initiation in Carole Maso’s Ghost Dance"
Insaf Khémiri, University of Sousse, Tunisia ............................................................. 515-523

37) "The Disruption of Space and Identity in Schizophrenic Experience"
Amina Klibi, University of Carthage, Tunisia
Riadh Ben Rejeb, University of Tunis, Tunisia ......................................................... 524-540

http://ijhcschiefeditor.wix.com/ijhcs
38) "The Concepts Term and Terminology in the Modern Azerbaijan Language"  
Almammadova Sabina Mammad, ANAS, Baki, Azerbaijan………………………………………541-545

39) "Displaced’ Muslim Women In Monica Ali’s Brick Lane and Leila Aboulela’s Minaret"  
Sherine Fouad Mazloum, Ain Shams University, Cairo, Egypt………………………………………546-568

40) "The Qualities of a successful EFL teacher in the eyes of learners"  
Youssef Mezrigui, University of Jendouba, Tunisia……………………………………………………569-585

41) "Intersex condition and the construction of gender identity"  
Paola Miano, Università di Palermo, Italy…………………………………………………………………586-598

42) "Afro–American Autobiography as Ideological Documentation: A study of Richard Wright’s Black Boy"  
Nasir Umar Muhammad, Federal University Dutse, Jigawa State, Nigeria…………………………599-609

43) “Unbinding Prometheus”  
Imen Mzoughi, University of Jendouba, Tunisia…………………………………………………………610-616

44) "The mediation of cultural identities: texts and contexts in Ghanaian video-films"  
Vitus Nanbigne, University of Cape Coast, Cape Coast, Ghana……………………………………617-632

45) "La pluralité humaine comme essence du politique : Hobbes et Hannah Arendt"  
Guillaume Gaston Ngueamba, Université de Maroua, Cameroun……………………………………633-651

46) "A Lexico-Semantic Analysis of Military Language"  
Takim Ajom Okongor, Federal University Dutse, Nigeria………………………………………………652-664

47) "A Morpho-Semantic Analysis of Verbs as Lexical Categories"  
Eşoşe Mercy Ḟọmọgbẹ, University of Benin, Benin City, Nigeria  
William Ighasere Aigbedo, University of Benin, Benin City, Nigeria…………………………………665-675

48) "The Element of Symbolism in non-animals featured in the Yorùbá Health-related Genres"  
Ọlọdẹlé Caleb Orímọ̀gùnjẹ, University of Lagos, Nigeria………………………………………………676-685

49) "Federico Fellini: Between Myths and Realities"  
Feten Ridene Raissi, ESAC Gammarth, Carthage University, Tunisia…………………………………686-699

50) "Moral Condemnation of Partition Violence in Manto’s Toba Tek Singh"  
Dadhi Ram Pandhi, Multiple Campus, Tribhuvan University, Kathmandu, Nepal…………………700-708

51) "Salman Rushdie’s Midnight’s Children: Re-visiting India’s Past"  
Safia Sahli Rejeb, University of Jendouba, Tunisia………………………………………………………709-715

52) “Female Silence in William Faulkner’s The Sound and the Fury, As I Lay Dying and “A Rose for Emily”: Crossing the Borders of the Speakable”  
Mourad Romdhani, University of Sfax, Tunisia……………………………………………………………716-728
53) "The Discourse of Local Public Broadcasting Managers and Producers"
Gerry Schlenker, University of Sioux Falls, USA..........................................................729-765

54) "Men Who Hate Women’: Masculinities, Violence and the Gender Politics of Nordic Noir"
Katy Shaw, Leeds Beckett University, UK.................................................................766-774

55) "Impact of Application of Structural Linguistics and Communicative Theory on Public Senior Secondary Schools Students’ Performance in Content Generation and Expression Skills in Written English"
Lawan Shu’aibu, Federal University Dutse, Jigawa, Nigeria........................................775-791

56) "Discourse on linguistic diversity in Africa"
Sassongo Jacques Silue, Université F-Houphouët-Boigny de Cocody, Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire…792-807

57) "Economic Background of Dambadeniya, Yapahuva, Kurunegala, Gampola and Kotte that led to Social Changes in the Medieval Period of Sri Lanka"
N. A. Wimalasena, University of Peradeniya, Peradeniya, Sri Lanka.............................808-830

Mahayudin Hj Yahaya, Islamic University of Sultan Sharif Ali, Brunei Darussalam……831-842

59) "Dissociation of Women from Their Selves: Speech Designated as Sophrosyne"
Arsev Ayşen Arslanoğlu Yılırın, Artvin Çoruh University, Artvin, Turkey.........................843-850
Editorial

Dear Colleagues and Readers

I am so glad to present Volume 2, Issue 3 of the International Journal of Humanities and Cultural Studies (IJHCS). This seventh issue consolidates more the multidisciplinary scope of the journal as it includes different research articles on various topics in humanities, linguistics and cultural studies both in English and French languages. This new issue includes works of the research scholars from different countries such Australia, Azerbaijan, Brunei, Cameroun, Côte d'Ivoire, Egypt, Fiji, France, Ghana, Indonesia, Iran, Iraq, Italy, Kenya, Malaysia, Morocco, Nepal, Nigeria, Saudi Arabia, Senegal, Sri Lanka, Thailand, Tunisia, Turkey, UK and USA.

As usual, I sincerely thank our respected authors for selecting the IJHCS, our reviewers for reviewing the selected articles for this issue and the Administrative Board for its contribution to helping the IJHCS achieve this success. Next issue will be published in March 2016 and your valuable contributions are welcome till 20 Februarys 2016.

With Best Regards,

Dr. Hassen Zriba
Editor-in-Chief
The International Journal of Humanities and Cultural Studies (IJHCS)
Secondary School Students’ Beliefs, Perceptions and Attitudes towards Communicative Language Learning (CLT) and Structural Approach (SA)

Hussein Islam Abdullah
Universiti Kebangsaan, Malaysia

Parilah Mohd Shah
Universiti Kebangsaan, Malaysia

Abstract

In English language learning, there are mainly two instructions being used in the classroom teaching which are the Communicative Language Teaching and Structural Approach. Many studies have looked into on teachers’ perceptions in implementing both approaches in the classrooms; few have looked into students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes with respect to these English language instructions in classroom practices. This study investigates the students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes with regard to classroom practices focusing on the Communicative Language Teaching and Structural Approach. The objectives of the study were to investigate students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes towards English language instructions and the correlation between students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes of the students towards Communicative Language Teaching and Structural Approach. 134 Form 4 students from a selected secondary school in an urban area in Seremban was chosen in a cluster sampling for this study. A set of questionnaire using 5 point Likert scale was used as one of the instruments in gathering the data. Quantitative data were analysed using the descriptive and inferential statistics. Descriptive statistics such as mean and standard deviation were used to investigate the students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitude towards Communicative Language Teaching and Structural Approach. For inferential statistics, Pearson Correlation was used to analyse the correlations between the students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes towards Communicative Language Teaching and Structural Approach. The findings of the study showed positive students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitude towards Communicative Language Teaching as well as Structural Approach. However, the weight age inclined more towards Communicative Language Teaching. There is a significant correlation between the students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes towards Communicative Language Teaching and Structural Approach.

Keywords: Beliefs, Perceptions, Attitude, Communicative Language Learning (CLT), Structural Approach (SA), English Language Instructions.
Introduction

English is a very important language in the world. It has moved a step from being an international language to a global language. It is now a widely spoken language because of its status as a political and economical tool of communication of the world. Krishnan (2012) said that this is evident today when international business deals and political diplomacy are carried out in the language. In a globalised world, speaking English is a very important skill for those who aspire to be businessmen as well as diplomats. Razmjoo and Riazi (2006) stated three important reasons for learning English. Firstly the latest technological and scientific resources which are used in various sectors are written in English, secondly in the world of information technology it is important to know how to utilize the internet efficiently and lastly being proficient in the language improves cultural understanding between different nations.

Globalization has placed English to a very important position in Malaysia’s education. The Ministry of Education (MOE) of lately has put tremendous effort to revive the proficiency in English among the students. This is due to a consistent decrease over the years in the level of proficiency among the students especially in the skills of speaking as well as writing – two important output skills. As Bawani (2010) puts it – “In Malaysia, the two main concerns are the falling standard of English and the impact on the national language” (p57). A study by Noor Azina Ismail (2011) found that English language proficiency is a major factor which contributes to employability. She boldly stated that “Good grades did not guarantee employment for Malaysian graduates. They must have a good command of English and other soft skills”. (p97) CEO of Jobstreet.com, an Asia-Pacific leading Internet recruitment website, Mark Cheng attributed not being proficient in the language as the main factor why companies reluctant to hire fresh graduates. This was evident in a survey conducted from March 29 to 31, 2005. The latest survey carried in July 2013 still maintained that not being proficient in the language is still a key factor for not being employed. Language mastery contributed to 55% of the reason for why fresh graduates are not hired.

We can see continuous and positive efforts by the MOE to increase the level or standards of English among the teachers and students through various programmes. While these measures are applauded, we cannot deny the fact that these solutions will have an impact on the command of the English Language among the students but these are not enough because we have not identified the root problem. Based on these facts, focus should be aimed at the students for their low proficiency in the language - What has made majority of them not interested in learning the English language and applying it in their everyday lives. The beliefs, perspectives and attitudes of these students towards English language instructions should be studied to get a clearer picture of the situation. The reason could be due to the approaches in the methodology of teaching being employed by the teacher. If there is a mismatch between students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes and teachers’ pedagogical approach, there is a tendency for a failed lesson to take place which will not benefit either parties.
Problem Statement

As a result over the years, we have seen a decline in the command of the language especially in speaking and writing which was very eminent for the past few years. Krishnan (2012). It shows that the students’ needs in the forms of their beliefs, perceptions and attitudes are being ignored and they are being taught with different methodology over the years whether they like it or otherwise. For more than 100 years, SLA (Second language acquisition) experts have debated the best approach to teach English to non-native speakers or the L2 learners. Thus this study will try to look into students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes towards English language instructions which play a very important part in the classroom. The problem to be addressed in this research is the beliefs, perceptions and attitudes of the students towards two important English language instructions which are the communication or better known as Communicative Language Teaching (CLT) and grammar or also known as Structural Approach (SA).

Beliefs, perceptions and attitudes are important factors a student should have in order to learn. These factors shaped the way learners react to learning and they can be the deciding factors between success and failure. Positive factors contribute to success while negative factors contribute to failures. Positive factors can turn into negative and vice versa if there is a defect in the approaches used. Students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes towards English language instructions are important elements because they influence the students’ commitment and perseverance in learning the language in the classroom. Therefore, students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes needed to be understood in order to pinpoint the challenges, hindrances and obstructions that they faced while learning in a classroom. (Hiew, 2012) The effectiveness of any type of language learning is strongly related to the students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes. (Ganjabi, 2011). Since the students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes relate to their thinking and reactions towards English language instructions, research into these factors will yield some answers towards the relations between students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes towards CLT and SA respectively. Therefore, students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes can be attributed as important and determining factors in a successful language teaching process.

Literature Review

The Implementation of CLT in Malaysia

Malaysian education system has gone through many changes throughout the years since independence. Bawani (2010) divided the changes into 3 different stages. From 1957-1970, the grammar translation method, direct method and situational approach were used in Malaysian classrooms, from 1970 – 1990 the communicative approach was implemented and from 1990s onwards the English Language Teaching (ELT) curriculum in Malaysia was created to suit the changes that is taking place locally and globally. According to Su (2007) in Malaysia, the structural approach was used for Form 1, Form 2 and Form 3 in the 1970s. The CLT was introduced in 1975 and was used for Form 4 and Form 5 with the intention of using the language for various purposes.
The MOE has implemented the CLT for all its English subjects in the primary as well as the secondary schools under its KBSM (New Secondary School Syllabus) curriculum designed by the Curriculum Development Centre (CDC) in 1989. Malaysia is one of the earliest nations to implement CLT in the classroom. Teacher trainees have gone for practices at the teachers training colleges and universities in this new approach. Therefore, there is no conflict among the teachers to implement it although some of them went through the old school of thought when they were learning the language. The new syllabus put emphasis on the four main skills which are listening, speaking, reading and writing. Focus was also given on language contents like grammar, sound system and vocabulary by introducing CLT into English Language Teaching. Communicative approach with overt teaching of grammar is taught where it is deemed necessary. (Ministry of Education, 1989) This is known as the role of grammar through CLT or the Interaction Hypothesis introduced by Long in 1990s. According to Lee (2002), this communicative approach was introduced by the MOE because “…. of dissatisfaction with the old curriculum which was thought to be too subject content-biased, too much emphasis on rote-learning, too exam oriented and excessive dependence on textbooks”. (p12)

Support for CLT

When CLT gains popularity in Europe in the 60s, other countries started to take the initiative to study and implement them. From 70s onwards, CLT was used as the methodology in many Asian countries. Besides, many SLA scholars also advocate this methodology in classroom teaching. Although SA is used to teach grammatical form and known to be effective, there are shortcomings such as the students becoming passive learners and lack of exposure to communicative skills. (Dam 2001) Besides, students who have been exposed to the traditional approach like the SA – over the years are good in grammatical competence however they have difficulty conversing in the target language with native and nonnative speakers. (Rao 1996). In other words, SA did not achieve the function of teaching students to communicate well. For Xiao (2006), in order to teach a foreign language, CLT has been accepted as the best approach.

Furthermore, many materials in English such as textbooks, revision books and others have been written based on the approach of CLT. So it will be easy for teachers and students to utilize these materials in the learning process. Since the introduction of the CLT in Malaysian schools, most of the textbooks and authentic materials have been written to incorporate communicative activities. Chung (2005). So, teachers have abundant exercises and activities to conduct in the classrooms using this approach. Richards et al (1995) stressed that the CLT touches on real life situation like giving directions, conversation, problem solving, dialogues and etc which bring benefits to the learners. Furthermore, these activities will instill a sense of cooperation, togetherness and teamwork which indirectly create a sense of language being used naturally. (Brumfit, 1984) When learning process takes place especially during games, role-plays and drama, the language is being practised unconsciously. They communicate and converse freely among themselves without being tied to a certain rule or placed in a boundary. These exciting activities create an atmosphere where the students practise the focused language unconsciously. On top of that, they are playing and enjoying doing it.
Pawlak (2004) stated that majority of language experts preferred CLT to be used in acquiring the second language. This is because since 1970s, the linguist had some reservations about the old traditional method which in their perspective did not contribute to language learning and is against the natural processes of acquiring a language. On top of that, from the viewpoint of Krashen (1985), grammar has no significant part in learning a new language although he is not entirely objecting to the idea. Even if a learner has the knowledge of grammar rules, he may not be able to converse in the language overnight. Besides the knowledge of knowing grammar rules will not last long. In a research conducted by Babic (2010) on tertiary students, all of them connected grammar only to grammatical exercises done during their classes and 65 percent of them stated they thought that grammar was not important for knowing the language, because the only thing that was truly important was communication. The linguist Charles Filmore (1981) stressed that “the language of face to face conversation is the basic and primary use of language, all others being best described in terms of their manner of deviation from the base” (p.152)

Ineffectiveness of CLT

Other hurdles in carrying out the CLT in Malaysia include low students motivation and attitude, large class size, non-optionist teachers, not well-versed with CLT and etc. The environment where the students live especially in rural setting does not help the students to apply their new found skills outside of the classroom. There is no purpose for English to be used in this setting where their mother tongue took precedence. In Vietnam, clashes of cultures and values made the task of teachers even difficult in implementing CLT in the classroom. Ellis (1996) said that CLT should be adapted rather than adopted to the new setting. In his own words, Ellis simply stated that it should be “culturally attuned and culturally accepted”. (pg.1)

Another setback Wang (2009) pointed out is that teachers do not put emphasis on grammar accuracy during CLT classrooms. Researcher Gatbonton (2005) stated that although most teachers claimed that they prefer the CLT approach compared to other approaches, in real sense they do not apply the methodology in the classrooms. Karavas-Doukas (1996) made a summary of the situation in the following. The few small-scale classroom studies that have been carried out seem to suggest that communicative approach is not followed; in practice they are following more traditional approaches. (pg.187) One of the most popular criticisms towards CLT is that it leads to the production of fluent but inaccurate learners. Hughes (1983) stated that in CLT priority is given to fluency over accuracy. Thus, error correction has no significant place in the classroom. The teacher who acts as a facilitator will not stop the conversation to correct the students as it he or she wants the communication to go on smoothly and effortlessly. As a result, fossilization of errors occurred and may never be corrected.

There are other shortcomings with CLT which need to be addressed as found in numerous research. Some of the nonnative speakers find it unnatural to speak English to their friends with whom they have been using their L1 for a long time. It is also difficult for a single teacher to control a big class and to notice if they speak in the language. This is because they have never practiced speaking English in the classroom with their peers. There is always resistance from the peers not to use the
foreign language. They are not supportive of the approach which is practiced by some of their friends. The teachers are only interested in the old ways of translation and memorization when teaching English. Parental resistance is another factor. They want their children to pass the entrance exam. Therefore the schools focused on how to teach grammar and vocabulary for exams and many CLT activities don’t work in classroom. Sometimes, the textbooks used do not adhere to the CLT approach.

The Structural Approach (SA)

The SA approach is teaching the rules of grammar to the students as it is. It is a process of dividing the whole parts of speech into manageable bite size chunks and then introduces these to the students, one chunk per lesson, so that they gradually and systematically accumulate a complete picture of the language. The grammar rules are explained explicitly by the teacher when presenting it. There are two basic options when applying the SA in the classroom, which are the deductive approach and inductive approach which is also known as the discovery method. In the deductive approach, the teacher presents the rule/pattern/generalization and then goes to provide practice in the application of these rules. When a teacher is explaining rules of grammar to his students, this approach is popularly known as the top down approach. In this approach, the teacher explains the rules of grammar explicitly to the students.

On the contrary, the bottom up approach is when students are given a number of exercises and they try by themselves with the guidance of the teachers to find the connection or rule governing those particular parts of speech. For example exercises relating to subject verb agreement will enable the students to come to the conclusion and apply that conclusion to answer the following questions. This is because they have noticed the pattern. This is also known as the inductive approach. Beare (2013) In this approach, the teachers need a methodology that find ways to present small pieces of language that have previously been selected by the teacher to exemplify particular structures. Each new item will then be practised until the students are familiar with it, revised at future dates and eventually incorporated into the larger body of language that has previously been presented and practised. This is known as presentation, practice and production.

Preference for SA

Many scholars still believe in the SA because there are some studies which prove the effectiveness of this approach. Needless to say some teachers are still practising this approach in their classroom activities because it shows the desired results. No actual empirical studies have been conducted that prove that ‘communicative’ classrooms produce better language learners than the more traditional teacher dominated classrooms. In the beginning, a small number of evidence supports it because of its feel good features and promising results. However, the communicative approach has also shown strong evidence which shows that, it can also cause inability among the students to master the appropriate parts of the speech and this will lead to slowdown in progress in acquiring the second language.
Approaching grammar using the SA is a way to introduction of functional grammar because the conceptual framework on which it is based is a functional one rather than a formal one. It is functional in three distinct although closely related senses in its interpretation of text, system and elements of linguistics structures. Chung (2005) said that “Communication proficiency will become easier to achieve only when one has grasped the necessary knowledge of language such as grammar.”(p35) Mareva (2012) pointed out “that emphasis on linguistic competence and accuracy as production is expected to be error free if this approach is used.” (p105). Another researcher Pawlak (2004) wrote:

that with time, however, it turned out that the complete rejection of formal instruction (SA) might have been premature and in the 1990s grammar was rehabilitated and recognized once again as an essential component of language learning. (p271-272)

There is no doubt that there are cases where learners acquire the second language grammar on their own naturally. They picked it up easily by deliberately getting themselves close to the native speakers and communicating in the language. For example, people who migrated from Japan, China, Cambodia and other places to US are able to acquire the language on their own within certain period of time. This happens rather quickly with the young immigrants. However, the same cannot be said of other learners. If we study carefully, we will find out that there are groups who have achieved a certain competency in the language but their English is not accurate. Pienemann (1984) has shown effectively in his research that learners who are given grammar lesson achieved a certain degree of proficiency and progressed to the next level within two weeks compared to those without any exposure to grammar classes will normally take a few months. Pawlak (2004) stated that:

“one most compelling arguments against purely communicative approaches is that learners often fail to achieve high levels of grammatical competence even if they learn the language naturally or have plentiful in-class exposure to comprehensible input as well as opportunities for meaningful language use.” (p 272)

Ellis (2006) stated that “although there is no convincing direct and indirect evidence to support the teaching of grammar however, many studies... can be expected to favour grammar teaching.” (p86). He also mentioned that in order to reap the maximum benefit from the teaching of grammar, studies have shown that the effective grammar must be taught in line with the learners’ natural processes of acquisition. He also pointed out that grammar should be taught at a very young age to enable the learners to grasp the basic rules of grammar and build upon it subsequent understanding. Richards et.al. (2001) mention that although many stated they followed a communicative approach to teaching, “many of the respondents in a research still hold firmly to the belief that grammar is central to language learning and direct grammar teaching is needed by their ESL students.” (p54). Pica (2000) argues that communicative teaching with little focus on grammar is not enough for achieving good proficiency in the language. DeKeyser (1998) argues that

“grammar should be taught explicitly to achieve a maximum of understanding and then should be followed by some exercises to anchor it solidly in the students’
consciousness, in declarative form, so that it is easy to keep in mind during communicative exercises” (p58)

Research Questions

The study was guided by the following research questions:
1. What are the students’ beliefs towards CLT and SA?
2. What are the students’ perceptions towards CLT and SA?
3. What are the students’ attitudes toward CLT and SA?
4. Is there a significant correlation between beliefs, perceptions and attitudes of students towards English language learning based on SA?
5. Is there a significant correlation between beliefs, perceptions and attitudes of students towards English language learning based on CLT?

Research Methodology

This is a quantitative study. For the purpose of this study, it focuses on secondary school students. The study focuses on Form Four students of 16 years of age. 134 respondents are selected as participants in the study. The study employs questionnaire in order to gather the data. The items in the questionnaire are adopted and adapted from Savignon and Wang (2002). The questionnaire comprises four sections A, B, C and D. The items in Section A focuses on the background details of the respondents, Section B, C and D will be on the constructs of the students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes about CLT and SA in the classroom respectively. Analysis using Statistical Package Social Science (SPSS) version 18 involves descriptive analysis using the mean as well as employing the inferential statistics which used the Pearson Correlation.

Findings

Students’ Beliefs towards CLT and SA

Table 1 shows the descriptive analysis of the students’ beliefs towards CLT and SA based on items.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grammar Based (SA)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B1</td>
<td>Learning English is learning its grammar rules.</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>4.02</td>
<td>0.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B2</td>
<td>Learning English through sentence drilling is effective.</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>3.82</td>
<td>0.88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
B3  I believe Bahasa Melayu should be frequently used in my English class to translate sentences so that I can better understand the lessons. 134 3.02 1.20

B4  I believe the more grammar rules one memorizes, the better he/she is at using English. 134 3.91 0.93

B5  Speaking in English during lesson is not important for English learning. 134 1.85 0.86

B6  The formal study of grammar is essential to eventual mastery of English. 134 3.91 0.78

B7  I believe my English improves quickly if I study and practise grammar. 134 4.27 0.74

B8  There should be more formal lessons of grammar in English class. 134 3.58 0.82

B9  It is more important to study and practice grammatical rules than to practice English in a communicative way in the classroom. 134 3.02 0.92

B10 Grammar rules should be explicitly explained in class. 134 4.09 0.73

Communication (CLT)

B11 A language classroom should be communication-focused. 134 4.02 0.75

B12 It is important to practice English in real-life or real life like situations. 134 4.35 0.70

B13 Languages are learned mainly through communication with grammar rules explained when necessary. 134 4.26 0.70

B14 I believe making trial and error attempts to communicate in English helps me to learn the 134 4.30 0.73
B15 A teacher should create an atmosphere in the classroom to encourage interaction as a class or in groups.

B16 Learning English is learning to use the language.

B17 Learning English by practicing the language in communicative activities is important in mastering a foreign language.

B18 A communication-focused language program often meets the learner’s needs.

In analyzing the students’ beliefs towards English language instructions in detail based on items, item B7 “I believe my English improves quickly if I study and practise grammar” (mean = 4.27, SD = 0.74) under the construct grammar shows the respondents’ highest level of beliefs. Item B5 “Speaking in English during lesson is not important for English learning”, on other hand, shows lowest level of beliefs (mean = 1.85, SD = 0.86). Three items, B1, B7 and B10 which are “Learning English is learning its grammar rules”, “I believe my English improves quickly if I study and practise grammar” and “Grammar rules should be explicitly explained in class” respectively on grammar construct scored mean above 4.00. Most of the students believe that learning English is actually studying grammar and their English language improves if they study grammar. Besides, they also believed that grammar should be explained overtly. The students strongly disagree with item B5 which is practise speaking the language in the classroom is not important. For the communicative construct, item B17 “Learning English by practicing the language in communicative activities is important in mastering a foreign language” shows the highest beliefs (mean = 4.38, SD = 0.68), whereas item B18 “A communication-focused language program often meets the learner’s needs” is the lowest (mean=3.82, SD = 0.73).
Students’ Perceptions towards CLT and SA

Table 2 shows the Descriptive Analysis of the Students’ Perceptions towards CLT and SA based on the Items.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grammar-based (SA)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C1</td>
<td>English teaching in my school is grammar-focused.</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>3.66</td>
<td>0.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C2</td>
<td>My English teacher in school often asks us to repeat sentences after them.</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>2.65</td>
<td>0.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C3</td>
<td>My English teacher uses Malay to translate sentences during English lessons.</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>3.38</td>
<td>1.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C4</td>
<td>English teaching in my school is mainly about explaining and practicing grammar rules.</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>3.74</td>
<td>0.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C5</td>
<td>I seldom need to speak during my English lessons in the classroom.</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>3.04</td>
<td>1.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Communication (CLT)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C6</td>
<td>English teaching in my school is communication-based.</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>0.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C7</td>
<td>My teacher often designs activities to have us communicate in English with our classmates.</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>3.44</td>
<td>1.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C8</td>
<td>My focus in class is communication but the teacher would explain grammar when necessary.</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>3.71</td>
<td>0.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C9</td>
<td>My English teacher allows us trial and error attempt to communicate in English.</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>3.94</td>
<td>0.83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
My English teacher often creates an atmosphere for us to use English.

When analyzing the students’ perceptions towards CLT and SA in detail based on the items, item C4 “English teaching in my school is mainly about explaining and practising grammar rules” (mean = 3.74, SD = 0.97) under the grammar construct showed the highest level of perceptions among the respondents. The students spent most of their time on grammar in the classroom. Item C1 “English teaching in my school is grammar-focused” (mean = 3.66, SD=0.89) comes next. The students admit that the lessons are primarily grammar-focused English teaching. Item C2 “My English teachers in school often ask us to repeat sentences after them” on the contrary showed the lowest level of perceptions (mean = 2.65, SD = 0.94). The data shows that the teachers don’t carry out sentence drilling in the classroom. For the communication construct, item C9 and C8 which are “My English teacher allows us trial and error attempt to communicate in English” and “My focus in class is communication but the teacher would explain grammar when necessary” showed the highest level of perceptions (mean=3.94, SD = 0.83) and (mean=3.71, SD=0.92) respectively among the respondents. In this scenario, the teachers permit the students to speak even though they make mistakes when doing it. Item C7 “My teacher often designs activities to have us communicate in English with our classmates” is the lowest in the communicative construct under students’ perceptions (mean = 3.44, SD = 1.07). Activities in CLT are very few as this data suggests. Although there are mixed reactions towards both approaches, CLT still stands out based on overall mean of 3.65 compared to SA which is 3.30 as shown in table 4.2.

**Students’ Attitudes towards CLT and SA**

Table 3 shows the descriptive analysis of the students’ attitudes towards CLT and SA in detail based on the items of the research questions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Grammar (SA)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DI</td>
<td>I like grammar-focused English teaching in my school.</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>3.60</td>
<td>1.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D2</td>
<td>I like repeating sentences after my teacher during English lessons.</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>3.06</td>
<td>1.15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
D3  I like my English teacher to use Bahasa Melayu to translate sentences during English lessons.  
D4  I like much of the time in the classroom to be spent in explaining and practising grammar rules.  
D5  I like an English class in which I do not have to speak.

*Communication (CLT)*

D6  I like communication-based English teaching.  
D7  I like communicative activities so that we could communicate in English with our classmates.  
D8  I like my English class to be focused on communication with grammar explained when necessary.  
D9  I like English teacher in my school to allow us trial and error attempts to communicate in English.  
D10 I like my English teacher to create an atmosphere that encourages us to use English in class.

In analyzing the students’ attitudes towards CLT and SA in detail based on the items, item D1 (mean=3.60, SD = 1.06) under the grammar construct shows the highest level of attitude among the respondents. This is followed closely by D4 “I like much of the time in the classroom to be spent in explaining and practising grammar rules” (mean=3.58, SD=1.06). The students like grammar- focused English teaching and doing exercises based on grammar. Item D5 “I like an English class in which I do not have to speak” on the other hand shows the lowest level of attitude (mean= 2.20, SD = 1.11). The students do not like to be in a classroom where they are not able to speak. Under the communicative
construct, item D6, D8, D9 which are “I like communication-based English teaching”, “I like my English class to be focused on communication with grammar explained when necessary” and “I like English teacher in my school to allow us trial and error attempts to communicate in English” show high level of attitude (mean= 4.20, SD = 0.66, 0.70 and 0.71 respectively), while D7 and D10 “I like communicative activities so that we could communicate in English with our classmates” and “I like my English teacher to create an atmosphere that encourages us to use English in class” are the lowest (mean=4.17, SD = 0.79 and 0.80 respectively) although they are above the mean of 4.00. The data clearly shows the students’ preference towards communicative compared to grammar. Although they like communicative related activities, they do not forgo altogether the grammar rules as they know it is also important in acquiring a language.

Correlation between Beliefs, Perceptions and Attitude of Students towards English Language Instructions based on SA

This part reports the analysis of the relation between beliefs, perceptions and attitudes of the students towards English language learning based on grammar. Table 4 shows the result of the correlation analysis. It is shown that the relationship of the studied constructs shows a smaller significant value compared to the standard significant value of p < 0.05. This show that there is a positive significant relation between beliefs and perception of the students for the construct of grammar (r=0.369, p=0.000). This is the same for the construct of beliefs and attitudes (r=0.616, p=0.000). A positive significant correlation can be seen in the relation between perceptions and attitudes. (r=0.539, p=0.000)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructs</th>
<th>Beliefs Value of r</th>
<th>Perceptions Value of r</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions</td>
<td>.369**</td>
<td>.539**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Significant at confidence level 0.05

Correlation between Beliefs, Perceptions and Attitude of the Students towards English Language Instructions based on CLT

This part reports the analysis of the relation between beliefs, perceptions and attitudes of the students towards English language instructions based on CLT. Table 5 shows the result of the correlation analysis. It is shown that the relation of the studied constructs show a smaller significant
value compared to the standard significant value of $p < 0.05$. This shows that there is a positive significant relation between beliefs and perceptions of the students for the construct of communication ($r=0.171$, $p=0.049$). It is the same for the construct of beliefs and attitudes ($r=0.508$, $p=0.000$). A positive significant correlation can be seen in the relation between perception and attitude. ($r=0.279$, $p=0.000$)

Table 5 Correlation between Beliefs, Perceptions and Attitudes of the Students towards English Language Instructions based on CLT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructs</th>
<th>Beliefs</th>
<th>Perceptions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions</td>
<td>Value of r</td>
<td>0.171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>0.049</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude</td>
<td>Value of r</td>
<td>0.508**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Significant at confidence level 0.05

Discussions

Students’ Beliefs towards CLT and SA

Students do believe in communication but did not rule out grammar all together. They believe grammar has a place in language learning. The students have been involved in meaningful language production for such a long time. It shows that they are influenced by the current classroom practices. Over their 9 years in school – 6 years in primary and 3 years in lower secondary – the English teachers have used CLT in their teaching. This put their preference toward communicative above grammar. The study also determined that the students did experience some grammar lessons in their classroom probably when facing two important public examinations – UPSR and PMR which emphasize on grammar. Examinations have been a stumbling block in utilizing CLT fully in classroom. Without grammar, it would be difficult to answer the questions as written scripts emphasize on grammar rules. Regarding correction, it is believed that in CLT, students should not be corrected. This again goes against the spirit of examination. The teachers wanted to make sure that the students do not repeat the same mistakes in the exam hall. PMR which is replaced by PT3 in real sense does not change anything but put more burdens on the already exhausted teachers. PT3 is also an examination conducted like the previous one but the only difference is it is school-based.

Students’ Perceptions towards CLT and SA

As a whole, communication is accepted compared to grammar as more communication approach is experienced in the classroom as shown by the individual items. This is consistent with students’ beliefs towards communication compared to grammar. The students’ perceptions could have
been related to their strong beliefs and classroom situations that they have experienced. It should be stated here that attention and focus towards grammar is not neglected. Activities relating to grammar are taught to the students when the need arises. Trial and error is permitted in the classroom although at a very low level. This is also consistent with the students’ beliefs where making mistakes is permissible. Savignon (2002) is of the opinion that teachers should attend courses relating to CLT to enhance their skills in the approach.

**Students’ Attitudes towards CLT and SA**

The findings show that preference towards CLT is very profound in all the items. The students’ attitudes towards the classroom practices are very positive as the entire items show mean above 4.00 unlike the variables beliefs and perceptions. For the researcher, attitudes is a very important factor which depicts the students’ overall feelings towards communicative. The students’ attitudes are also consistent with the two previous variables – beliefs and perceptions but somewhat at a lower level.

**Correlation between Beliefs, Perceptions and Attitude of the Students towards English Language Instructions based on CLT and SA**

The result shows that students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitude are from weak to moderately positive towards grammar and communication. Basically, the students are for both constructs. This is amazing because it shows that they know the importance of both constructs in learning English. This research question supports the interactive theory created by Long in the 90s which supported both approaches in English language learning.

**Conclusion**

The results of this study suggest that it is essential to identify students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes towards English language learning based on the constructs particularly grammar and communication so that the teachers are aware of the students needs during the learning process in the classroom. There will be no mismatch between the teachers’ expectations and students’ needs in the classroom. The teachers can also take the opportunity to enhance students’ learning. The results of the study in general demonstrated high students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes towards English language learning specifically in terms of grammar and communication. Many studies have been carried out on students in foreign countries which show preference towards either grammar or communication. This study is unique because the students showed preference for both aspects of grammar and communication which cannot be denied as a very important element of learning a language from the perspectives of instructionalist. Therefore, the teachers should follow the syllabus set by the Curriculum Development Center which has actually incorporated the two elements in the syllabus.

The Ministry of Education should always have more workshops on how to train the teachers on how to apply these two constructs in the classrooms. As seen on mass media nowadays, speaking skill
among Malaysian has deteriorated immensely. Communication is one way of making them to speak and grammar will lead them to speak accurately although there are some SLA scholars who disagreed with the concept. However, since CLT and SA are two different teaching approaches, they have their own features. Therefore the teachers cannot expect the students to prefer these two approaches at the same time. Some may prefer the CLT more than the SA or vice versa (Feng, 2013). Utilizing these two approaches in the classroom should be a good teaching practice (Spada & Lightbrown, 2008). There are a lot of other contributing factors towards students learning in the classroom. Students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes are few factors that need to be considered when studying students’ language learning in the classroom. This study suggest that teachers should be made aware of students’ beliefs, perceptions and attitudes towards English language learning in the classroom, to make the teaching and learning process more effective. If there is a match between teachers’ beliefs and perceptions with the students, towards English language learning, then the objectives have been achieved.
References


- Krishnan, G. et.al. 2012. ICT and Teachers’ Attitude in English Language Teaching. *Asian Social Science* 8(11): 8-12


The Relevance of Traditional Belief System among the Fakkawa of Zuru Emirate

Yusuf Abdullahi
Federal University, Dutsin-Ma, Katsina State, Nigeria

Abstract

Fakai kingdom is located in the western part of Zuru Emirate in Nigeria. The peoples of the kingdom though historically varied, are collectively referred as Fakkawa and their language as Fakkanci. Before the 19th century, the predominant religion in the area of Fakai Kingdom was traditional in which people believed in what is called Magiro. This system of belief was said to have developed from the recognition and reverence given to the spirit of the ancestors. This explains the reason why Magiro is also addressed as Baba (Father). Although the adherents of Magiro belief do not invite people of other tribes to it, the belief was said to have spread to other areas because of peoples’ migration and intergroup relations. This paper therefore, examines the influence of traditional belief on the social, economic and political aspects of the society of Fakai kingdom. It was found that, the Magiro doctrine was not merely a belief system as some individuals come to believe, rather, it is also a political institution established for the maintenance of law and order in the society. The belief also influenced the social and economic undertakings of its adherents.

Keywords: Traditional belief, Magiro, Fakkawa.
Introduction

The earliest centre of Magiro rites was said to be in Kwatarkoshi (now in Zamfara State), from where it spread to other parts of Hausaland and then to communities of the middle Niger Region. This view however was contested as the belief was much more entrenched among the communities of the middle Niger such as the Dakarkari, Kambari, Achipawa, Gwari and Kamuku, among others found in the vicinity of the River ka and valley of the rivers; Niger and Benue. In fact, in these areas, belief in Magiro was more entrenched in their social, economic and political environment. Moreover, these communities perceived that, religion was hereditary and therefore Magiro doctrine was distinctively handed down to them from their ancestors. Consequently, to the followers of Magiro doctrine, there is peculiarity in religion and therefore each society should strictly adhere to what their ancestors handed down to them. The Magiro belief system was therefore not a universal religion and this explains the reason why its adherents do not invite people different from their tribesmen to participate in its convention.

Before the end of the 19th century, in Fakai Kingdom, each settlement had its shrine where Magiro rites were observed. In the hilltop settlements where the communities lived based on kinship, each clan maintained its shrine. In this case, it could be said that, the belief facilitated the bond of kinship among people who claim to have the same ancestor while alienating progeny of another ancestor. Magiro shrine served as an important centre for peoples’ gathering, receiving of counseling and adjudication of disputes. Therefore, the Magiro doctrine had impact on communal relations, played judicial roles and also influenced economic activities of its adherents. The focus of this paper is to explain the influence of Magiro traditional belief on the social, economic and political undertakings of its adherents in Fakai Kingdom.

The Belief and Political Functions

In most of African societies, traditional belief played political role as well. This was so because of the need for not only the reverence to the mode of the belief but also to obtain peoples’ loyalty to the throne. This relationship between belief and royal authority could be seen in the history of some empires in which some rulers brazenly claimed divinity so as to legitimize their authority. Traditional belief systems were consequently organized in such a way that rulers and cult leaders enjoyed some special privileges. This indicates the existence of relation between traditional belief and political authority. Therefore, in the Magiro belief, hierarchy existed among his followers. Magiro was assumed to be super natural. The Gumburkobo, also known as Sarkin Zaure serves as intermediary between Magiro and his followers. He was selected by council of elders who serve as next to Magiro in the hierarchy. The Gumburkobo was thus hold in high esteem for his role as the custodian of the shrine. The rites he fulfills before his selection also contributes to make him venerable; he had to be an elderly man, be able to confide secrets and should be free from immoral acts such as theft and adultery. The council, who were responsible for the appointment of Gumburkobo, comprises elders of high repute in
the community. They highly confide the secrets of the reality of the belief among themselves. Beside the role of selecting the Gumburkobo, the council of elders also serves as consultative body to Gumburkobo. They therefore constitute the major decision making body. Youth, in their dual roles, occupied central position in the sustenance of the belief. Some among the youth serve as spies within the community who confide the people’s daily affairs to Gumburkobo. It is through the activities of this group that Magiro would claim to have foreseen the people’s affairs which on their usual gathering which contributes in making him mythical. The other section consisted of strong and energetic youth who ensure compliance to religious credence and maintenance of law and order. They therefore formed an executive arm of the rite. Age grade was an important determinant of relations among such communal societies. This really represents a hierarchical order that facilitate the accomplishment of some of the tenets of the belief.

At the arrival of Magiro at his shrine, a particular sound is usually heard, an indication of his presence. As mark of reverence, people would be seen coming to the shrine, chanting and praising Magiro. Magiro would not appear as his adherents of the belief would be allowed to approach the entrance of the shrine. Also, he would not raise his voice to the public. Thereafter, through an interpreter who usually stood at the entrance, Magiro provides advice of various sorts to his audience. With the influence of spies who reported to him what happened within the community, Magiro would claim to have knowledge of what happened in his absence, which influenced people to assume that he was supernatural. Through an interpreter, cases were also adjudicated by him such as theft, murder, adultery and debts.

Magiro also served as medium for settling of marital conflicts and quarrels such as inter-communal arguments, land disputes and witchcraft among others. Those convicted were usually fined in various items particularly chicken, dogs, and kolanuts. With power to adjudicate dispute and impose fine on convicts, Magiro is not merely a mode of belief but also a political institution. The institution was highly confidential to women and this give explanation that, it was in order to keep women subservient to their husbands, and children to be obedient to their parents. The fact that Magiro was influential could be appreciated during colonial period in which people resented the exploitative colonial policies. The people of Birnin Tudu, a village in Fakai Kingdom, protested against the payment of colonial taxes which they found highly exploitative. The colonialists were unable to contain the protest unless they returned to Gumburkobo where they implored him to declare that such taxation was with the approval of the shrine. Only through such intervention that people subscribed to colonial taxation. This indicates that, colonial officials also realized the importance attached by adherents of Magiro to such a belief system. This belief, as we are going to see below, also influenced other societal traditions such as economy, burials, and festivals.
The Belief, the Economy and some forms of Social Values

Agriculture was of high importance in Fakai kingdom. In fact, it was the predominant occupation of the people of the area even in the period when most of the settlements were established on the hilltops. Consequently, among the festivities in the area, the most important-Uhola- is associated with agriculture. This is not surprising since agriculture has been the most important source of livelihood and significantly influenced migration, demographic changes and distribution of settlements in the region.

The essential purpose of Uhola was to show appreciation for successful agricultural season. Festivities then took place at the harvest period as it marks that people would relax to enjoy the fruit of their labour. The Uhola festival was normally organised by Gumbukobo in which he took the proposal to the Chief. The date is announced when the consensus is reached. Then people would start to prepare such as purchase of new clothes and goats to be slaughtered. Uhola was highly performed among the Dakarkari and it persists to present time, but among the Fakkkawa, it also marks an important event for celebration, though it is waning. The Uhola festival facilitates intergroup relations as people from various villages come together to witness the singing, dancing and wrestling competition. It was thus a period of delight and friendship.

Wrestling contest is a means of fascination and pride. Winners were awarded with goha, a Y shape piece of wood which a winner keeps at home and a bell which should be hold wherever he goes in order to testify to the people about his status. People regarded a champion wrestler as great man. Therefore, beside goha and bell, a famous wrestler could obtain any valuable item as gift for his bravery. This explain the reason why Mkak Fark, who ruled a chieftaincy of Birnin tudu in the early twentieth century, was given a wife at Rikoto, a village to the north of Zuru town. This was because during his youthful age, Mkak went to Rikoto and won a wrestling contest. The importance attached to wrestling endeared peoples of various backgrounds to its performance, irrespective of differences in occupation, wealth or traditional titles. Something impressive is that, the wrestling was usually organised as inter-village contests. This without doubt facilitated intergroup relations and also contributed in the integration of early Hausa migrants who also participated in the contest. On the death of a champion wrestler, his grave is decorated with the goha he won in the contest. Similarly, the burials of adherents of traditional belief were also attached to the traditional mode of belief and this also depends on the one’s pursuit of livelihood during his life time.

The Festivals and Funerals

The funerals of followers of traditional belief are conducted with the performance of several rites such as festivals, mainly Bikin Mutuwa and Makoki. But even among the followers, some are astonished and found it somehow mythical as to why funeral which is a cause of sorrow would also involve festivities; dancing and singing. Various drums were used in festivals but the most widely used is what is called kimba.
Funerals are of importance to the community of the kingdom. In fact some people tend to do certain things in life simply because they wanted to have a glorified funeral—such as to be a great wrestler, a brave hunter or a prosperous farmer. Therefore, courage and economic accomplishments are relevant not only during a person’s life time but also after it. The festival at death surpassed that of birth. It was thus not surprising to see how the people of the area generally were accustomed to agriculture. They were also hard working which was attested by migrants in the pre-colonial period and by colonialists during the colonial periods. There fond of hard work and courage undoubtedly influenced their ability to challenge colonial incursion and their participation in the World Wars and subsequent military engagement in the post independent Nigeria.

As indicated above, the funerals involved festivals in which the predominant drum used was kimba. However, ganga could be used but for wealthy individual who was able to conduct nomtusryab when he was alive. In nomtusryab, a wealthy individual organised a feast, where people, from various places would be invited. But cow had to be slaughtered in which dried beef would be shared among the community before, and during the festival. Drummers would come and the celebrant would have his special singing. Upon his death therefore, ganga could be used to celebrate his funeral.

Beside the use of ganga, a wealthy individual could also have kalangu in his funeral. The wealthy individual here refers to a person who could be able to engage in either trade or farming, or a person who possessed flock of animals. Then as proposal for kalangu, a person had to organize a feast during his life time in which kalangu could be used at the feast. But permission for it had to be obtained from a ruler and certain amount of money had to be presented, as custom demands. People would then be invited when the permission was granted. Goat would be slaughtered and distributed, while drumming and singing. The celebrant, in his new attire danced together with his friends. His relatives and other friends would then distribute money in the field.

Therefore, individual’s occupation which is an important factor for a person’s survival and to some extent, his identity, is relevant in funerals. This explains why a farmer had his drumming which is different from that of a hunter. But a farmer had to organize etkanga for such privilege. In etkanga, a farmer had to cultivate much Guinea corn, enough for him to feed his family and then would supply some portion to the king. Meanwhile, a farmer had to notify the king on his mission, so that granary would be prepared in the king’s house. The king normally granted permission for etkanga after winnowed grain was taken to his garnary. On the day of the festival, food would be prepared and then shared among friends and relatives, while dancing and singing continued from morning till night. Among the hunters too, there were differences in drumming, depending on the type of animals one hunted during his life time, as there was celebration in successful hunting expeditions whereby drums were also used. But drumbeat for success in hunting of, for instance, antelope was different from that of say, a buffalo.
The Decline of Magiro Doctrine

The traditional belief, though, contains certain rites that bind its adherents together, could not vigorously face the challenges of the late twentieth century. One of the internal problems faced by such institutions was that, youth became inquisitive of why the elders seriously confide the secret of the institutions to themselves? Who was this Magiro and from where he came from? The youth also resented pattern of verdict that was usually done in public which involved castigation, torture and sometimes, condemnation. The system was therefore perceived as autocratic and the elders as cultists. The fallacy of the belief became apparent when it was discovered that Magiro was not in any way a super natural, a rational behind the clandestine state of the system. Moreover, the institution, as it did not have established machineries for teaching and preaching, could thus not have sound base for survival especially as adherents of such belief do not invite other communities.

Migrations, particularly of Hausa community into our area of study and region of the middle Niger was the most important factor in the decline of traditions among the community of Fakai Kingdom. The arrival of Hausa migrants after the jihad was an important landmark in decline of traditions. A number of them were Muslim traders and scholars who came with the mission of, not only trade, but also preaching of Islamic religion. Many traditionalists thus accepted Islam. As Islam always goes with education, Islamic schools became abound in most of the villages where traditional belief was previously observed.

Colonialism also contributed in the decline of traditional belief. The colonial policies of encouraging resettlement of people from hilltops to plain settlements, where cash crops could be cultivated, facilitated interaction between adherents of traditional belief and other communities that include Muslims and Christians. Through interaction, most of the traditionalists accepted Islam. Also, it was among the traditionalists that United Missionary Society and Roman Catholic Mission obtained some converts who came to the area in the 1930s and 1940s respectively.

Conclusion

From the above discussion, we can understand that traditional mode of belief in Fakai Kingdom was organised in such a way that it guides other forms of societal traditions and values. The institution of Magiro serves as an avenue for settlement of disputes, maintenance of law and order and as a forum for discussion on matters of common interest. However, the traditional belief has been waning nowadays owing to the fact that most of its fallacies are becoming apparent that Magiro was not in any way a super natural. Also, the traditionalists do not invite others to their religion and as such could not obtain converts. The coming of Islam and spread of Islamic education serve as important developments in which people become much aware of what religion entails. Therefore, because of the influences of Islam, Christianity, urbanization, influx of migrant communities and inter marriages with its consequences of assimilation and integration, the traditional belief which emphasize on ethnic affiliation, reverence to ancestors and docility to traditions, could no longer be sustainable. This therefore was responsible for the fact that only very few shrines exist in few villages of Fakai Kingdom.
which are also patronized only by very few individuals of aged category, whereas most of the shrines have now turned to relics, useful in historical reconstructions.
Endnotes


4. Magiro was discovered to be a human being not a supernatural. He was selected by council of elders who confide the secret of the institution among themselves. See A. Bako, “Transition and Changes in Religions and Belief Systems in Zuru Emirate” in A.R Augie and S.U Lawal, (eds), *Studies in the History of the People of Zuru Emirate*, Enugu, Fourth Dimension, 1990, pp. 111-130


7. See S. P. Umaru, “Incorporation and Resistance…”

8. *Bikin Mutuwa* is a festivity conducted as part of funerals. It usually takes place on night of a person’s death. *Makoki* is also a funeral festivity. It is conducted usually a year after a person’s death. It is done particularly for old persons. There is more dancing and singing during *Makoki* than at Bikin Mutuwa, and more festivity upon the death of aged than that of youth. Usually for young, only Bikin Mutuwa takes place.

9. However, the pre-19th century migration of Hausa community into Fakai Kingdom and Zuru area generally did not significantly affect the *Magiro* traditions. This was because, in most of the pre-jihad migrants were assimilated into the community they found in the area, owing predominantly, to intermarriages. It was also because before the Jihad of 1804, some Hausa people also engage in syncretism. Consequently, they could easily be assimilated in the non-Hausa community.
References


The Question of Intertextuality and the Perception of Muslims: The Case of the New York Times Op-Eds

Rachid Acim
University Sultan Moulay Slimane, Beni Mellal, Morocco

“Texts are rarely completely original but borrow and quote from other texts. Reporting other people’s speech or thought is a form of intertextuality.”
(Fairclough, 1992)

Abstract

The main objective of this paper is to question intertextuality, as one literary discourse device, in the New York Times Op-Eds addressing Muslims inside and outside of the United States. The researcher argues that the New York Times employs a whole plethora of texts to disseminate specific arguments and assumptions about such people. The periodical use of poetry, for instance, enables reporters to trigger powerful emotions in their readers, and get them take sides as regards matters related to Muslims. Add to this, the continuous occurrence of different intertextual strategies such as quotations, allusions, translations, songs and so on, are fashioned to create fixed and unstable images about Muslims in the world of print media. It is thus claimed that the reporters of the New York Times take shelter in intertextuality with a view to producing a sense of intimacy with their readers and attract their full attention more easily. To approach the issue at hand more effectively, the researcher starts by introducing how some scholars have perceived intertextuality. Then, he shifts into demonstrating how intertextuality occurs and manifests itself in the overarching media as represented by the New York Times Op-Eds. Finally, he suggests some pedagogical implications to assist students (re)consider thoroughly the multiple voices spoken inside the New York Times Op-Eds.

Keywords: Intertextuality, The New York Times, Muslims, Op-Eds, Voices, Quotations.
Introduction

This paper aims at discussing the presence of intertextuality in the discourse of the New York Times (and henceforth, NYT) Op-Eds. It is founded on the premise that media discourse creates a new discourse out of fragments of quotations, proverbs, allusion, and the transformation of human discourses. This means, as Talbot (2007, p. 63) contends, “conceiving of a media text as a tissue of voices and traces of other texts”. Remarkably, when people engage with discourses, they customarily go into dialogue with them, but hardly do they excavate for the hidden and out of sight voice speaking throughout.

The concept of intertextuality, therefore, turns out to be “an important additional frame through which to view media texts” (Potter, 2012, p. 27). The reader (and also the viewer) ought to make meaning from the juxtaposition of excerpts and quotations of media texts, which are believed to be in dialogue with one another. In fact, that is what intertextuality is all about: the relationship between a text and (an)other text(s), between a text and its environment, as well as between segments of the same text and between the producers and consumers of media texts themselves. It is very important to note that the reporters of the NYT Op-Eds would love to share a story or a joke with their audience by making allusions to other media texts. They would likewise quote a number of authorities and figures to embellish their texts with credibility and authenticity. In doing so, they smartly engage an entire audience with their texts by allowing them to feel pleased that they have understood the allusion and become party to the cleverness of it.

The present paper sheds light on this phenomenon of intertextuality as a pervasive discursive device within the overarching media as represented by the discourse of the NYT Op-Eds. It shows how complex the notion of intertextuality is as it occurs on multiple levels and layers of discourse. These layers are themselves sometimes interwoven and hard to detect given their cryptic nature. In order to provide a comprehensive study of this multi-faceted concept, the researcher deploys Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) approach. Within CDA, intertextual analysis has two main functions: (1) it plays an important role in revealing speaker’s and writer’s strategies in reinforcing or re-formulating ideas and beliefs; and (2) it can reveal traces of the dominant ideology or evidence of ideological struggle (Bloor & Bloor, 2007, p. 54). The following queries will be considered:

a) What are the major intertextual devices which are used in the NYT Op-Eds dealing with Muslims?

b) Is the inclusion of such intertextual devices innocent or ideologically based?

c) How can students approach intertextuality with a critical lens?

Before answering the questions above, it is essential to provide a comprehensive synopsis of intertextuality and its development.

Literature Review

Intertextuality is one of the most commonly used and misused terms in contemporary critical vocabulary. ‘An intertextual Study of…’ or ‘Intertextuality and…’ are such commonplace constructions in the titles of critical works that one might be forgiven for assuming that intertextuality is a term that is generally understood and provides a stable set of critical procedures
for interpretation (Allen, 2000, p. 2). This term is arguably defined so variously because it has been used across different disciplines. As a result, it has taken on multiple meanings and applications. Consider the following definitions:

- Intertextuality is about how readers weave together new texts from innumerable other texts and thus rewrite every text (Litwak, 2005, p.49).
- Intertextuality insists that no work is ever truly free from dependence on other texts, both written and unwritten (Wakefield, 2003, p. 101).
- Intertextuality itself is a dialogue between one’s own text and other texts (Weigand, 2008, p. 278).
- As a critical term, intertextuality is generally dated from Julia Kristeva’s use of it in ‘Word, Dialogue, and Novel’. Published in 1966, the above essay is primarily a recapitulation of Bakhtin’s concept of the dialogic nature of the novel, and thereby, itself an illustration of intertextuality (Shastri, 2001, p. 5). In fact, the compound noun *intertextualité* was viewed as a neologism: it was coined by analogy with terms from the Latin prefix *inter* (“between, in, among, or shared”) that denote mutual dependence, complexity, connectedness, and relations between texts (juvan, 2008).

According to Bakhtin, any text is constructed as a mosaic of quotations; any text is the absorption and transformation of another. The notion of intertextuality replaces that of intersubjectivity, and poetic language is read as at least double (Worton & Still, 1990, p. 130). Barthes reiterates the same point even more comprehensively, and with more precision:

Every text is an intertext; other texts are present in it, at variable levels, in more or less recognizable forms: the text of the previous culture and those of the surrounding culture; every text is a new fabric woven out of bygone quotations. Scraps of code, formulas, rhythmic patterns, fragments of social idioms, etc. are absorbed into the text and redistributed in it, for there is always language prior to the text and language around it. A prerequisite for any text, intertextuality cannot be reduced to a problem of sources and influences; it is a general field of anonymous formulas whose origin is seldom identifiable, of unconscious or automatic quotations given without question marks (qtd in Krauth, 2003. p. 5).

In this fashion, it is believed that intertextuality is more capable of multiplying the potential meanings of the text; it enables one to go even beyond those meanings produced by the interrelationships of the text’s actual words and account for the meaning-making of a text. Fairclough (1992), building on Bakhtin (1981) and Kristeva (1986), introduces a systematic approach to intertextuality designed to allow for a systematic application of the concept. He points to a useful distinction between manifest intertextuality and constitutive intertextuality, or interdiscursivity. Manifest intertextuality occurs where a previous text has been brought and integrated structurally through a ‘rewording of the original.’ Manifest intertextuality refers to the presence of certain words of others such as quotation marks and insertions. Constitutive intertextuality, or interdiscursivity, concerns the relationships that the current texts have with conventions of text constitution, namely genre, discourse, and style which they ‘reaccentuate, rework and mix in various ways’ (Bullo, 2014, p. 28). It subsumes into its intestines the combination of multiple discourses and genres.
Fairclough (2003), hence, employs intertextuality to express the presence of different elements from different texts within a text—therefore the potential for the presence of different voices. Reported speech and quotes are examples of “intertextuality” (Reyes, 2011). At this juncture, it must be stressed that any text is not a static, independent entity with one inherent meaning. Rather, it should be conceived as a dynamic process, an intertextual space that is fraught with a wide range of voices that speak directly or indirectly to the reader.

Intertextuality becomes one of the most salient and pervasive features of discourse and it is closely tied to what has been called by Bakhtin (1981), heteroglossic and dialogic aspects of texts. For the present paper, the researcher adopts Fairclough’s (2003) definition of intertextuality (borrowed from Bakhtin, 1981):

The intertextuality of a text is the presence within it of elements of other texts (and therefore potentially other voices than the author’s own) which may be related to (dialogued with, assumed, rejected, etc.) in various ways[...] The most common and pervasive form of intertextuality is reported speech (including reported writing and thought), though there are others (including irony). Reported speech may or may not be attributed to specific voices, and speech (writing, thought) can be reported in various forms, including direct (reproduction of actual words used) and indirect report.

This definition lays much emphasis on reported speech because it is regarded as the most common form of intertextuality. Nevertheless, other forms and strategies of intertextuality ought not to be overlooked on the grounds of their pivotal role in and contribution to the intertextual nature of the NYT text that is characterized by much complexity and intricacy at the level of voices and ideas. Several strategies of the intertextual representation of Muslims in the NYT Op-Eds will be identified as the analysis unfolds. Poetry, multivocality, borrowings and proverbial language need to deserve the researcher’s attention because they are not introduced accidentally in the NYT Op-Eds. Moreover, direct or indirect quotations, alongside references to authorities from politics, religion, economics and so on, are (un)intentionally included to fulfill a particular objective, alternating between information and persuasion. The first subsection presents the usage of poetry, borrowings and proverbial language. The researcher is going to empirically question the presence of these intertextual genres because they are presumed to have a rhetorical power. Direct and indirect quotations are also considered so along as they tend to embellish the discourse of the NYT Op-Eds with the colour of impartiality and objectivity. Finally, historical and media records are likewise focalized in this paper since they project the reporter as a holder of truth and an authority that directs the public opinion as regards issues relative to Muslims.

Meinhof and Smith (2000) have approached various genres of media discourse from a variety of angles and laid much emphasis on the fuzzy yet powerful concept ‘intertextuality’. Different kinds of articles in newspapers and other print media such as radio and TV programmes (including news, drama, documentaries, game shows and music television), films and videos, advertisements in various media, computer games and so on were taken into consideration. In a similar vein, Hiramoto (2012) has also insightfully addressed the controversial term of intertextuality within various forms of media discourse. He discussed semiotic mediation through a variety of mediatized texts (i.e. newspaper articles, movies, reality TV shows, anime, comedy performance, and government campaigns), and he points out that any potential intertextual devices are not to be taken for granted because they are more likely to foster ideology. Following the same
track of thought, Kornetzki (2012) has studied cross-media and cross-cultural features of Russian and British/American media discourse from an intertextual perspective. His aim was to uncover both the similarities and differences of intertextuality across media, using a multi-dimensional model of analysis. By the same token, this paper attempts to deal with this textual and discursive phenomenon, but in relation to Muslims from the year 2005 to 2015. Its aim is to make all the voices speaking throughout the NYT Op-Eds more visible to the reader owing to their ideological implications and persuasive power.

Methodology

The Op-Eds (latterly known as opposite editorials or editorials with byline) that were chosen for this empirical analysis were gathered from the electronic database of the NYT opinion columns after three months of digital subscription. Various keyword searches were played in like “Islam”; “Muslim”; “ISIS”; “Al Qaeda”; “Taliban”; “Syria”; “Iran”; “Egypt”; “Libya”. These terminologies were chosen not because they continually reoccur in the NYT opinion columns, but simply because they are regarded as buzzwords, and presumably, epitomizing conflicts either between Islam and the Judeo-Christian West (like ISIS, Taliban, Al Qaeda and Iran) or between Muslims themselves (the case of Egypt, Libya, Syria). The final selection of Op-Eds was narrowed down through a careful reading and, hence, their number did not exceed 19 since many Op-Eds were either repeated or did not relate directly to the topic at hand. The choice of these Op-Eds followed the non-random sampling method. Bajpai (2011, p. 97) sets forth that “in non-random sampling, every unit of the population does not have the same chance of being selected in the sample. In non-random sampling, members of the sample are not selected by chance”. The researcher takes the Op-Eds as his his population, but to avoid potential bias, he needs to be more familiar with the subject discussed and knowledgeable of any other related areas to it.

The choice of the NYT as the major focus of this study could be ascribed to a wide range of reasons. Firstly, the NYT has a long history as one of America’s highly trusted and most reputable newspaper. The researcher focuses on it, particularly, because “it occupies such an exalted place in the political and moral imagination of influential Americans and others as the most authoritative source and guidance on issues of public policy” (Friel & Falk, 2004, p. 2). Secondly, the NYT is considered as a leading news outlet in its coverage of world events, wars and military conflicts. “It is on this basis that [it] has acquired its special status as the newspaper of record in the United States, a trusted media source that supposedly is dedicated to truthfulness and objectivity, regardless of political consequences” (ibid.).

Thirdly, the NYT has a strong national and international readership. Insofar as Ferrel & Hartline (2011, p. 512) are concerned, “its circulation is 1 million, while the website, www.nytimes.com, enjoys 1.3 million unique visitors per day and 10.8 million registered users. The newspaper’s target market is the intellectual elite. As explained in their press kit, “the New York Times – Influential people read it because influential people read it” (ibid.).

A period of 11 years from 2005 to 2015 was chosen for the present study. The reason behind this choice is that many crucial and critical events occurred in the house of Islam and the Judeo-Christian world yielding to a bad representation of Islam and Muslims and a total ‘other-izing’ of the latter. The declaration of the Pope Benedict XVI that Mohammed spread Islam by the sword,
the so called Arab Spring, the ongoing riots and revolutions taking place in Syria demanding the overthrow of Bashar al Assad and the production of an anti-Muslim video that vilifies the Prophet of Islam remarkably marked a fissure in the relationship between Islam and the Judeo-Christian West. The Muslim world has, accordingly, been portrayed as an enemy by the U.S. print media conglomerates and their counterparts in Europe. Subsequently, the American print media barons gave much importance to Islam and Muslims during this period of time for specific reasons. Muslims have not been mainly judged through the dusty clouds following the extermination of the twin towers of New York City and the simultaneous attacks targeting the Pentagon in Washington (Sept. 11, 2001), but mainly through the mass protests and military conflicts following the Arab Spring (Dec. 18, 2010), the killing of J. Christopher Stevens, the former U.S. ambassador to Libya, due to an amateurish anti-Islam film (Sept. 11, 2012), and the creation of ISIS (The Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant) in the subsequent years. The NYT Op-Eds have definitely found in these events and others a good opportunity to disseminate and propagate a wealth of hybrid representations and images about Muslims. The next subsection provides the empirical analysis and discussion of the Op-Eds chosen for the present study.

Analysis and Discussion

The NYT Op-Eds represent one of the most outstanding sources of intertextuality. In the Op-Eds, the reporters repeatedly evoke past events in order to contextualize ‘new’ ones and allow the readers to follow different episodes in the lives of Muslims inside and outside of the United States. Poetry is, for instance, chosen among other literary genres, given its rhetorical dimension and lasting emotional impact on the reader. Put differently, poetry has been a central concern of several reporters of the NYT in as much as it has helped them shape the meaning of the Op-Eds written on Muslims. The poem below, aside from communicating a human emotion vis-à-vis the enemy, serves as a medium through which al-Qaeda’s ideology is diagnosed. The inclusion of this poem is not coincidental merely because it fulfils some political goals. The poem represents al-Qaeda affiliates as bombers, hell-bent on taking revenge and causing destruction to the World Trade Center. This is facilitated by the dominance of numerous lexical items that suggest wars and a strong resentment for the United States. Consider words like “darkness”, “poisoned”, “blood”, “assailant,” “swords”, horses”, “fighter”, “striking”, “raids”, and so on. This vast repertoire of negative words borrowed from the lexicon of war definitely alludes to Islam’s long history of conflict with Christendom, from the Crusades to the war on terror.

Though the clothes of darkness enveloped us and the poisoned tooth bit us,  
Though our homes overflowed with blood and the assailant desecrated our land,  
Though from the squares the shining of swords and horses vanished,  
And the sound of drums was growing  
The fighters’ winds blew, striking their towers and telling them:  
We will not cease our raids until you leave our fields.


In more than one occasion, the Arab world is pigeonholed as being full of contradictions that result in the immiseration and afflictions of its people. It is a world that blocks human progress and hinders scientific development owing to the authority of religion, the despotic inclinations of Arab rulers, and eventually the subordination of women. The poem that follows is introduced into the
NYT Op-Eds to reflect these huge forms of ambivalence and discrepancies within the Arab world. The tone that is prevalent throughout is sarcastic of the Arab subjects who are overcome by panic and fear of their leaders. Of course, an Arab is not necessarily a Muslim, but most of Arabs are more likely to be so.

When you cannot find a single garden in your city, but there is a mosque on every corner -- you know that you are in an Arab country. When you see people living in the past with all the trappings of modernity -- do not be surprised, you are in an Arab country.

When religion has control over science -- you can be sure that you are in an Arab country. When clerics are referred to as “scholars” -- don’t be astonished, you are in an Arab country.

When you see the ruler transformed into a demigod who never dies or relinquishes his power, and nobody is permitted to criticize -- do not be too upset, you are in an Arab country.

When you find that the large majority of people oppose freedom and find joy in slavery -- do not be too distressed, you are in an Arab country.

When you hear the clerics saying that democracy is heresy, but seizing every opportunity provided by democracy to grab high positions -- do not be surprised, you are in an Arab country. ... When you discover that a woman is worth half of what a man is worth, or less -- do not be surprised, you are in an Arab country. ...

When land is more important than human beings -- you are in an Arab country. ...

In the pre-mentioned extract, the reporter has included a short translated poem about Arab countries to tease and mock the Arab subjects off. As has been shown, the poem is full of negative assumptions and specious contentions about the Arabs who are projected as aliens, exotic creatures totally different from the rest of humankind. They are chained and beguiled by their past. They are anti-modernists, prioritizing religion over science, relegating their rulers to the position of demi-gods, favoring slavery and fear over freedom, exerting too much authoritarianism over their women and giving more importance to their land than to human beings. It seems reasonable to say that poetry is a type of literature that is introduced in the NYT Op-Eds with a view to engaging the reader and stirring up his/her emotions as regards Muslims. It is an intertext that is rich in ambiguity, hence, leaving complex and multiple interpretations open to the reader. Dury (2006, p. 21) argues that:

In poetry, ambiguity can be like a ‘forking’ move in chess (so one piece, such as a knight, can threaten two or more enemy pieces at once). Ambiguous language can suggest doubleness, opposites merging, paths branching out. It can be a way of speaking with proverbial ‘forked tongue’ or with ‘tongue in cheek.’ It is also a way to compress the language of poetry, to make it richer, denser, more resonant.

In the discourse of the NYT Op-Eds, where poetry and ambiguity serve to provide freedom of interpretation by involving readers in examining and exploring the innumerable incidents that implicate Muslims, one can note that intertextual borrowings and proverbs are at stake. They are used in the NYT Op-Eds because they are semantically charged and more evocative than ordinary language. Borrowings, for example, have been naturalized, indigenized and accommodated in the NYT Op-Eds as they have far more reaching effects on the audience. Their use, undeniably, varies
greatly according to the topic, audience and even the context wherein they occurred. Yet, this can be justified by the inability of the target language (in this case, English) to proffer a more accurate alternative. Note, for example, the occurrence of the phrase “Wein Obama” (“where is Obama?”) that featured in an Op-Ed with the headline: “WHAT SYRIA’S REBELS NEED” by Bartle Breese Bull (The New York Times. Aug. 15, 2012. A23). Or, even the insertion of controversial expressions such as “Kafir” (an infidel) or the presence of the phrase “velayat-e-faqih” (a divine arbiter standing in for the occulted 12th Imam his expected reappearance) that was included in the Op-Ed: THE OTHER IRAN LETTER by Roger Cohen (The New York Times. Mar. 13, 2015).

Clearly, the reporter has dwelt on borrowing as another form of intertextuality to reach out to a large public. The word borrowed could yield to a different meaning and interpretation as is the case of the term “wallah” that was introduced in the Op-Ed: “THE PERSON BEHIND THE MUSLIM” by Anar Ali (The New York Times. Jun, 10, 2006. A13). At first glance, the term “Wallah” may sound as an oath or a sworn statement uttered by a Muslim. However, it comes to be allusive to any kind of profession within the Indian context. This term is arguably a bluster for the security of the Muslim traveling from and to different airports in the United States of America. One reporter reports the problem as follows:

After 9/11, I soon became used to the new rules: double-checking at borders, detentions at airports, suspicious glances on subways, especially if you are carrying a backpack. One memorable incident: I was detained for three hours en route from Calgary to Los Angeles when the South Asian Arts festival I was attending in 2004 was suspected of being a radical Muslim group. The festival’s name, Artwallah, is a play on words, a mix of the words “art” and “wallah.” Wallah is a Hindi-derived word that denotes a profession; examples include taxi-wallah and chai-wallah. The presence of (w)Allah in the festival name raised flags. “THE PERSON BEHIND THE MUSLIM” by Anar Ali. The New York Times (Jun, 10, 2006. A13).

Customarily, the reporter would even coin new terms to achieve his/her purpose in reporting about Muslims. Concepts such as “Bin Ladenism”, “Mubarakism” start to circulate widely amongst the reporters of the NYT. What is striking is that these neologisms are virtually a sign of the subtlety and flexibility of the English language that allows borrowing and adaptation and not an infringement upon it. The use of proverbial language in the NYT Op-Eds could be perceived as another powerful instrument of intertextuality. Proverbs themselves are appreciated by the average man for their common and popular wisdom. They are usually quoted to unveil some aspects about the Muslim culture, faith and civilization. Consider the following proverbs that were inserted in the NYT Op-Eds across different years:

- Haste, as we say in Iran, is the devil’s work. THE OTHER IRAN LETTER by Roger Cohen. The New York Times (Mar. 13, 2015).
- In War, it’s said, truth dies first. LIFE DURING WARTIME by Janine Di Giovanni. The New York Times (Jul. 22, 2012).
- If a girl is left unattended by her family, she will run away either to a drummer or a trumpeter. TURKISH MEN GET AWAY WITH MURDER by Christina Asquith. The New York Times (Feb. 24, 2015).
In all these proverbs, the reporters have tried to express some common truth and familiar experience to their readers. They might be teaching one morale about Muslims, warning against them, or tainting them with the brush of ridicule. The NYT reporters typically draw on direct quotations in their Op-Eds to let sources enrich as well as amplify their ideas about Muslims. Such (in)direct quotations are carefully chosen and ideologically driven. Kohn (2003) asserts that reporters in the NYT have developed a huge reservoir of people in politics, business, education and other circles that they count on for a quote reflecting their newspaper’s opinion on any subject. The kind of people whom these reporters can draw upon for just the right quote include (a) partisan politicians, (b) political pundists and other experts, and (c) common people. The list can be extended to include religious figures and authorities from the military. These sources of information will be investigated later.

The reporters of the NYT rarely have troubles finding someone ready to serve up a lively quote that is congruent with the editorial line of the newspaper and its opinions regarding Muslims. The next extract carries a colourful quote by the German anti-Nazi activist Martin Niemar, whose words should be celebrated in the Sunni Muslim world. He is portrayed as a victim of war, incapable of being represented. As a model of innocence, this pastor is introduced to prompt Sunni Muslims to take lessons from history about suicide bombing, and hence teach their progeny of the punishment that awaits those who engage in it. The image that is propagated about Muslims is still that of injustice, brutality and fierceness. The whole Muslim civilization is consequently criticized for maintaining silence towards suicide bombing. Consider the extract below:

The Sunni world would do well to reread the famous words by the Rev. Martin Niemar, a German pastor imprisoned in World War II: “First they came for the Communists, and I didn’t speak up because I wasn’t a Communist. Then they came for the Jews, and I didn’t speak up because I wasn’t a Jew. Then they came for the Catholics, and I didn’t speak up because I was a Protestant. Then they came for me, and by that time there was no one left to speak up for me.”

A civilization that does not delegitimize suicide bombing against any innocent civilian is itself committing suicide. And that is exactly what the Sunni Muslim world is doing when it does not consistently teach its children that suicide bombing against civilians is always wrong — and that all who engage in it do not go to heaven, but straight to hell. SUNNI ARABS ASK, ‘WHY US?’ THEY SHOULD ASK, ‘WHY ANYONE?’ by Thomas L. Friedman. The New York Times (Nov. 16, 2005).

In another situation, the reporter directly quotes common people to vehicle their attitudes about Muslims. The extract that follows demonstrates how Muslims are viewed and treated in India. They are depicted as strangers, with whom love affairs or even marriage proposals turn into something inconvenient and unfeasible. By quoting the father, the reporter provides the reader with an opportunity to see how the issue at hand is approached by the layman. There are millions of welfare fathers, union workers, students, and others who can easily be manipulated to advance the right quote for a slanted Op-Ed. Sita Iyer and Ayub Khan fell in love, but they were enforced to keep it secret lest their parents would know about it. This Romeo-and-Juliet-like story is dramatized
to suggest not only the seclusion but also the unsuitability of the Muslim subject in any marital proposition or whatsoever. Moreover, the quotes of the father, “he will have four wives”, “you will end up on the street,” are after all symptomatic of this phobia that Hindus inherently experience with respect to Muslims. The love story in question reads as follows:

In 1975, Sita Iyer was a 19-year-old college junior with a secret she was desperate to keep from her conservative, middle-class parents. Ms. Iyer, a Hindu, was in love with a Muslim. To avoid detection, she would meet her boyfriend, a dashing 23-year-old business student named Ayub Khan, in downtown Bombay, where she was sure no one would know her.

It was not quite 30 years after the Partition of India, a blood-soaked event that killed some million people. India’s Muslims had been steadily ghettoized.

When the truth came out, Ms. Iyer’s parents were furious. “He will have four wives,” her father warned. “You will end up on the street.”

After she married Mr. Khan -- and changed her given name to Salma -- her family disowned her.


Sometimes, the reporter is more likely to quote people whose opinion agrees with him/her and turn the back to the other side of the story. Using the terminology of news writing, the Who here below is Hamat Dorbet, the Where is Nuba (Sudan), the When is “Sunday”, and the What is the courage and grit of Nuba people. All of these Ws are included in the following abstract to illuminate the readers’ minds about the situation of Christians in Sudan. They are arrested and tortured for practicing their rituals. The reporter is not directly quoting the pastor, but instead, he has placed himself as his mouthpiece. Note the presence of the preposition “according” that tends to introduce the opinion of the pastor and his neighbours. The reporter is making himself invisible. Yet, he is injecting his own opinion into the story. He tells of the incident this manner:

Another contrast is between the timidity and fecklessness of world leaders, and the courage and grit of the Nuba people themselves. Take Hamat Dorbet, a 39-year-old evangelical Presbyterian pastor.

In an anti-Christian campaign a dozen years ago in this Muslim-dominated country, the authorities began arresting Hamat for ringing his church bell and preaching to his congregation. They would arrest him each Sunday, according to his account and that of neighbors, and then beat and torture him for a few days (…).

Hamat is not asking for help, and he’s not feeling sorry for himself. I’d like to explain to him why the world lets this happen without even speaking out strongly, and I just don’t know what to say. President Obama? IF ONLY OUR LEADERS HAD MARIAM’s GUTS by Nicholas Kristof. The New York Times (Jun. 7, 2012. A27).

The above extract shows that Pastor Hamat is being persecuted for giving church services; he is hampered from practicing his Christian faith in Sudan, wherein famine has been designed as a government strategy to command and subdue the Sudanese people. The problem with this extract is that it did not subsume other opposite views about Hamat. Objectivity entails that the reporter should question the police officers why they drag him out for more torture. In other words, there is probably an omission of the opposing opinion since it might take the whole Op-Ed to another direction. Also, courage and grit are here epithets that are directly attached only to Hamat and to the church institution as a whole. Muslims here are represented as violent and anti-Christ.
Probably it ought to go without saying that direct and indirect quotes are cognitively constructed to involve the reader and invite him/her to take sides concerning matters related to Muslims. In fact, both quotes are presumed to give power and authority to discourse. Direct quoting, for example, and insofar as Whitaker, Ramsey & Smith (2000, p. 149) are concerned, “accomplishes a great deal. It gives the flavor of someone’s else’s speech, lets them listen to more colourful language than the reporter’s.” It lends the news story an air of immediacy: Readers sense they are hearing the words directly from the source’s mouth. This feeling of immediacy enhances the story’s credibility and encourages readers to respond directly to the speaker and his or her ideas (ibid.).

These intertextual devices are often fused together with an identification of the sources the reporters hinge on for forging evidence and credibility. They are, therefore, more capable of livening up the reporter’s narrative about Muslims and according it much weight in terms of form and content. Nevertheless, their presence is questionable because they appear to be sharing an ideological loading. The next subsection examines other types of intertextuality that permeate the discourse of the NYT representing Muslims. As will be shown, media sources and historical records are introduced into the NYT Op-Eds not because they provide reporters with reliable information about Muslims, but mainly because they, seemingly, position the reporter in the realm of neutrality and objectivity. Media sources and historical records presuppose that the reporter is not writing out of vacuum but basing his/her argument about Muslims on a solid grounding.

Traditionally, the main sources of information for reporters have been centered on encyclopedias, textbooks and people. In recent times, the new technologies and social networks like Facebook, Twitter and other digital media have introduced an unparalleled diversity of alternative information and media sources that are readily accessible through the Internet. Each snippet of information source, ranging from the printed page through to interactive electronic media is presented from multiple viewpoints, in turn requiring the reader/user to apply sophisticated analytical and interpretive skills (Leaning, 2009, p. 103).

The NYT reporters, periodically, resort to media sources and historical records in their text and talk about Muslims. In May 2003, the NYT admitted in a front-page story that Times reporter Jayson Blair has fabricated comments, concocted scenes, stolen material from other news services and selected details from photos to create an impression he had been in certain places and interviewed people when he had not (Kohn, 2003, p. 89). Let us look at how the NYT reporters employ voices from the journalism industry to address the question of Muslims in the newspaper. Adam Taylor, a journalist working for the Washington Post, is quoted to provoke ISIS militants. Tweets about ISIS march unto Rome have been clustered and presented as key facts in the Op-Ed to make the information accredited and more convincing for the reader. Let us consider the extract below:

The Italians got this one right. Last week, The Washington Post’s Adam Taylor helpfully collected tweets that Italians put out after a murderous video issued by the Islamic State, or ISIS, warned: “Today we are south of Rome,” one militant said. “We will conquer Rome with Allah’s permission.”

As the hashtag #We_Are_Coming_O_Rome made the rounds in Italy, Rome residents rose to the challenge.

Their tweets, Taylor noted, included:

“#We_Are_Coming_O_Rome aahahah Be careful on the highway-Ring Road: there’s too much traffic, you would remain trapped!”
“#We_Are_Coming_O_Rome hey just a tip: don’t come in train, it’s every time late!”
“#We_Are_Coming_O_Rome You’re too late, Italy is already been destroyed by their governments.”
And “#We_Are_Coming_O_Rome We are ready to meet you! We have nice Colosseum plot for sale, Accept Credit Cards Securely, bargain price.”

The reliance of the NYT reporters upon accredited sources of information is important, then, because many of them do not report from zones of armed conflicts and wars. They, habitually, depend on local translators and other sources to fathom and approach events implicating Muslims from a distance. Attention to the choice of media sources need to be paid and continually questioned. Value judgments (e.g. the most respected and, in another context, famous) are accorded to these sources with a view to making the information more eye-catching and impactful. In the next extract, the reporter has quoted Abdul Rahman al-Rashed from Al-Sharq Al-Awsat newspaper.
S/He has slanted the entire Op-Ed so long as he has included an Arab voice that cast a whole responsibility on Muslims’ in what concerns extremism and terrorism; he is making use of a translation to urge Muslim communities to renounce extremism and take serious actions against it.

Abdul Rahman al-Rashed, one of the most respected Arab journalists, wrote Monday in his column in Al-Sharq Al-Awsat: “Protests against the recent terrorist attacks in France should have been held in Muslim capitals, rather than Paris, because, in this case, it is Muslims who are involved in this crisis and stand accused. ... The story of extremism begins in Muslim societies, and it is with their support and silence that extremism has grown into terrorism that is harming people. It is of no value that the French people, who are the victims here, take to the streets. ... What is required here is for Muslim communities to disown the Paris crime and Islamic extremism in general.” (Translation by Memri.org). WE NEED ANOTHER GIANT PROTEST by Thomas L. Friedman. The New York Times (Jan. 14, 2015. A25).

Another intertextual technique developed by the NYT reporters involves the use of historical documents and records to influence public opinion. It is no exaggeration to say that the NYT controls which questions to ask, how to ask them, and what types of answers to advance in the Op-Eds. Most of the time, these answers support the NYT editorial position and they go in tandem with the policies of the United States of America at home and abroad. The “paper of record” or the “Gray Lady” has been criticized for disseminating propaganda and hearsays about Muslims. As one begins to turn the pages, one is prone to notice that a great many of the stories have to do with Muslims. The reason Muslims get so much coverage nowadays is quite obvious. What is not apparent, however, is that there are in fact two kinds of stories. The first has to do with Muslims overseas, who mostly enter the American public’s imagination in the context of war and terror, or, to use the now-defunct official nomenclature, “the war on terror” (Bilici, 2012, p. 3).

For many years, this type of news dominated the pages of the NYT. Totally unknown places like Basra, Falluja, Kabul, and Kandahar become part of everyday American consciousness. In these stories Muslims appear as enemies, as troublemakers, or at best as friendly natives. (The recent Arab Spring has somewhat altered the character of stories about Muslims, though the elements of chaos, instability, and danger remain prominent.) These news stories deal with Muslims in their externality to American culture and geography and therefore appear under the rubric of foreign news. One is also more likely to encounter stories belonging to a new genre of news about
Muslims. These Op-Eds present stories about Muslims in America. The Muslims in these pieces appear either as suspects of terrorism or as victims of the violation of human rights. The members of this second group of Muslims are generally represented as next-door neighbours or decent Americans, people who are struggling for their civil rights and are in need of empathy, understanding, and respect. They are domestic Muslims (ibid).

In order to address the question of Muslims more effectively, the NYW reporters occasionally make use of historical records and chronicles to consolidate their claims and manufacture consent about them. As well as historical events, specific dates are included in the NYT Op-Eds to empower its discourse about Muslims and embellish it with integrity and trustiness. The following extract details on a historical analysis about Muslim slaves inside and outside America. They are not only viewed as hostile to European invasion and averse to colonialism, but also sometimes sympathetic to Christianity and its teachings.

In 1528, a Moroccan slave called Estevanico was shipwrecked along with a band of Spanish explorers near the future city of Galveston, Tex. The city of Azemmour, in which he was raised, had been a Muslim stronghold against European invasion until it fell during his youth. While given a Christian name after his enslavement, he eventually escaped his Christian captors and set off on his own through much of the Southwest. Two hundred years later, plantation owners in Louisiana made it a point to add enslaved Muslims to their labor force, relying on their experience with the cultivation of indigo and rice. Scholars have noted Muslim names and Islamic religious titles in the colony’s slave inventories and death records. The best known Muslim to pass through the port at New Orleans was Abdul-Rahman Ibrahim ibn Sori, a prince in his homeland whose plight drew wide attention. As one newspaper account noted, he had read the Bible and admired its precepts, but added, “His principal objections are that Christians do not follow them.”

The strong presence of Muslims in the NYT Op-Eds is not to be limited to curiosity or an attempt to discover and explore the Muslim self. Rather, this interest in Muslims is a farrago of fear and fascination. For a whole galaxy of reasons, the American audience would like to know what it is like to be a Muslim. Sure, the tragedy of the 9/11 had a tremendous impact on Americans and their perception of Muslims in America and elsewhere. Numerous questions kept nagging in the minds of Americans. Are they terrorists? Do they all take after Bin Laden, Ghaddafi, Saddam and al-Baghdadi? Why do they need to set up a mosque in ground zero? And, why do they bombard other mosques in Baghdad? Is Shariah or the Islamic law compatible with democracy and modernity? These questions were hardly answered, but they remarkably fueled this negative attitude towards Muslims and widened the gap between the three antique civilizations: Islam, Judaism and Christianity.

The NYT reporters play on this string of tension between Islam on the one hand and the Judeo-Christian West, on the other. The centralization of the last Charlie Hebdo shooting in Paris was meant to caution the NYT audience of this growing enemy very active in foreign soils. The inclusion of the year 2007, in the extract below, is intended to draw the reader’s attention to similar events that Muslims were to be held accountable of. Put otherwise, Muslims are thematized as a problem cherishing hatred, bigotry and intolerant dogmas. They are introduced as a monolith and
one bloc that does not espouse difference or even plurality. This leads us to observe the workings of intertextuality in the NYT Op-Eds: the reporter quotes another text, develops it, builds on it, and is transforming it to advance some assumptions about Muslims. Consider the use of quotes like: “100 lashes if you don’t die laughing”, “The prophet of Islam didn’t have to be asked twice”, “and we thank him for it” and “Love is stronger than hate.” In point of fact, these quotes are borrowed from a number of sources and are deeply rooted in history and religion.

Obviously, there are differences between all discourses in “what is quoted when, how and why.” The NYT reporters report other people’s ideas, thoughts and sayings, but they rely on different techniques in doing so. The scientific community in turn requires the practice of overt marking of intertextuality, and in this context, citations, quotes, and references relate to the recognition of intellectual property rights of other researchers and they add up to the reliability of a scientific paper (Dalton-Puffer, 2006, p. 123). In the case of the media discourse, and, more precisely in the NYT Op-Eds, intertextuality might be considered as a carrier of ideology in that it directs public opinion and crystallizes certain facts and assertions about Muslims in the minds of readers. The following extract is a case in point:

So earlier this month, when a Molotov cocktail landed in the offices of the French satirical magazine Charlie Hebdo — luckily no one was injured — I wanted to know more. It seems the bomb arrived the day after the publication chose the Prophet Muhammad as its guest editor in chief for that week’s issue, and in a reference to Islamic law, or Shariah, temporarily changed its name to “Charia Hebdo.” The issue also featured a cartoon image of the prophet on its cover and a caption that said “100 lashes if you don’t die laughing.”

An equal opportunity offender, the periodical, historically known for pillorying Catholic clericalism and Judaism, was heavily criticized by Muslims in 2007 after reprinting cartoons of Muhammad published by a Danish newspaper that caused outrage in much of the Islamic world.

The magazine’s editor, who goes by the name Charb, issued a statement saying “The prophet of Islam didn’t have to be asked twice” to be editor “and we thank him for it.” And the following issue featured a cartoon of Charlie Hebdo passionately kissing a Muslim man under the heading “Love is stronger than hate.”


As the researcher has already argued, the reporters of the NYT Op-Eds would dig up an old study, a fact, a quote from different media outlets or from historical records, assemble them, and then present them cogently in order to provide a specific knowledge to their audiences about Muslims. Alongside popular historians and biographers, the NYT reporters have established themselves up as scribes of the historical record and authoritative spokespersons for Muslims worldwide. By advancing several arguments from historical accounts, the NYT reporters would appear more knowledgeable and well-informed about the Muslim case in the world. They might not be eye-witnesses to the stories they write, but they are resolute enough to report, analyze and criticize the Muslim status quo. In the extract that follows suit, the reporter is taking shelter in the First Crusade to market the image of the holocaust. S/He is referring the reader to Hebrew and Christian chronicles to stay more neutral and impartial. Yet, it can be assumed that neutrality in the Op-Eds is seen as impossible to achieve because almost all reporters write and speak from a proper perspective exclusive to them. Thus, media references and historical records are but mere pretexts for reporters to hide and eclipse their ideology. By the same token, what is suggested is that the
confrontation, or say conflict between Muslims and Christians or even Jews, is not something new but dates back to 1096. This is what the following excerpt tries to disambiguate:

The first victims of the First Crusade, inspired in 1096 by the supposedly sacred mission of retaking Jerusalem from Muslims, were European Jews. Anyone who considers it religiously and politically transgressive to compare the behavior of medieval Christian soldiers to modern Islamic terrorism might find it enlightening to read this bloody story, as told in both Hebrew and Christian chronicles. The message from the medieval past is that religious violence seldom limits itself to one target and expands to reach the maximum number of available victims. Just as the Crusades were integrally linked to Roman Catholicism in the Middle Ages, terrorist movements today are immersed in a particular anti-modern interpretation of Islam. This does not imply that a majority of Muslims agree with violent religious ideology. It does mean that the terrorists’ brand of belief plays a critical role in their savage assault on human rights. THE FIRST VICTIMS OF THE FIRST CRUSADES by Susan Jacoby. The New York Times (Feb. 15, 2015. SR5).

In addition to media sources and historical records, the reporters of the NYT subsume into their Op-Eds polls, surveys and think tanks because they look convincing and completely worthwhile. They might be regarded as a valuable tactical resource deployed by the reporters, who stand out as if representing the active voices of the public. In an Op-Ed headlined: DON’T MUZZLE THE CLOWN by Timothy Egan, the findings of the Pew Research Center survey were foregrounded to showcase that most Muslims are in favor of executing apostates, that all of them disapprove of homosexuality and support honour killing. This representation is explicitly shown in the following excerpt:

Maher’s comments early this month drew on an exhaustive Pew Research Center survey last year of Muslim attitudes, based on 38,000 face-to-face interviews in 39 countries. The findings were fairly grim for fans of enlightenment. Most Muslims in at least six countries favored “executing those who leave Islam.” A majority also said homosexuality was morally wrong and that a wife should always obey her husband. Most troubling, the poll found high support in countries like Egypt and Iraq for “honor killings” — executing someone, usually a woman, for having sex out of wedlock. DON’T MUZZLE THE CLOWN by Timothy Egan. The New York Times (Oct. 30, 2014).

Although media sources and historical accounts have been a pervasive part of the NYT, an enormous numbers of surveys and polls were published in their Op-Eds whenever there is an indication or a reference to Muslims. To better understand how the NYT reach conclusions about Muslims, one must consider why the survey was introduced in the Op-Eds in the first place. The statistical figures and data are definitely a vehicle for the NYT to transmit its own doubts about Muslims. Owing to its tendency to frame the issue to be fully discussed by its readers, the NYT resorts to all these intertextual devices to thematize and diagnose the question of Muslims. The pedagogical implications of this are certainly far-reaching, for the discourse of the Op-Eds is no longer a hermitage at which the reader can worship to get information, but one site where many voices struggle for existence. Since these Op-Eds derive their meaning from other texts, it is recommended that students should use a variety of analytical tools in order not to be trapped inside the text. The claim that says that intertextuality allows reporters to achieve objectivity and balance proves erroneous because it was found that through intertextuality these reporters are able to gain
the reader’s confidence and position themselves as they report on Muslims. Students are, therefore, required to have a good grasp of the workings of intertextuality, the control of media and its promotion of ideology and subjectivity. CDA will be the right place for students to learn more all about these three.

Conclusion

This paper has raised many questions about the use of intertextuality in the discourse of the NYT Op-Eds dealing with Muslims inside and outside of the United States. There is no doubt that the concept of intertextuality has become an important frame through which one can view and approach media texts adequately. The reporter, and subsequently the reader, make sense from the juxtaposition of direct and reported statements, quotations, and translations that take place within several Op-Eds addressing Muslims. It is true that many voices fluctuate in the Op-Eds. Yet, the dominant voice of the reporter is there to control and guide the public opinion about matters related to Muslims. The paper has started with a short synopsis about intertextuality as a discursive structure prevalent in the NYT Op-Eds. Then, it has attempted to study some intertextual devices like poetry, borrowings and proverbial language, each of which has specific political and ideological ends. Afterwards, it has questioned the utilization of direct and indirect quotations because they tend to corroborate and fortify the reporters’ claims about Muslims. Finally, the paper has probed into the conventional use of media sources and historical records as they presumably grant much power and weight to the discourse of the NYT Op-Eds. Some recommendations for students have been meanwhile suggested. Briefly stated, in this kind of discourse, a wide range of texts are in dialogue with one another to enable the reader draw inferences as well as make deductions about Muslims. As they are carefully selected, these inter-texts ought to be read critically because they might harbour the newspaper’s ideology.
References


Dit-On Liberté En Traduction Littéraire? Un Aperçu Critique De La Traduction Française Des Romans De Fagunwa

Gbadegesin, Olusegun Adegboye
Ekiti State University, Ado-Ekiti, Nigeria

Résumé

La traduction littéraire est touchée par tant des soucis dont le transcodage culturel et les nuances nuances socio-culturelles et stylistiques. Pour s’en sortir, le traducteur recourt aux différentes approches. Il prend la liberté des mots et expressions pour re-expprimer le message de l’original comme il croit que cela le convient. Ce qui paraît convenable selon la compréhension du “traducteur” d’une œuvre littéraire surtout l’œuvre qui se dispose de tous les atouts stylo-culturels d’une langue d’une nation particulière peut ne pas être le sens voulu de l’original. C’est le cas de la traduction française de deux romans de D.O Fagunwa (Ogboju ode ninu igbo Irunmole/ Le preux chasseur dans la forêt infestée de démons et Ireke-onibudo/ La fortune sourit aux audacieux. La liberté en traduction peut elle être panacée aux nuances yoroubas difficilement traduisibles au français? Voilà champ que cultive cette communication.

Mots clés: liberté, limite de liberté, culture, langage yorouba.
Introduction
La remise en question de la liberté en traduction


Voyant la liberté en traduction comme liberté prise par rapport à la formulation du texte de départ, Lederer, M. dans son ouvrage _La traduction aujourd’hui_ (1994:85) remarque que la liberté du traducteur littéraire s’exerce par rapport à la forme du texte de départ, non pas par rapport à l’effet que produit cette forme. Cela veut dire que, le traducteur prend sa liberté du style du texte de départ pour avoir un produit semblable à l’original. Cette notion nie l’idée de servitude et apprécie la transgression des lettres.

Rochard, Michel dans _Liberté en Traduction_ (1990:65) est de l’opinion que quand on arrive à bien traduire, c’est qu’on a acquis sa propre liberté de style, sa propre maîtrise du sujet. Bien entendu, la liberté dans la traduction littéraire est un atout dont doit se disposer le traducteur au cours de son transcodage du message.

Fortunato, Israël (1990:69) déclare d’une manière frappante qu’au fond, l’objectif poursuivi par le traducteur littéraire est d’essayer de produire une autre œuvre littéraire. Cette déclaration ne veut pas dire que le traducteur achève sa tâche en donnant des interprétations hors de l’esprit de l’original. Mais il exige que le traducteur littéraire évite d’être esclave des mots, des phrases d’origine et de ne pas rester trop penché sur son travail. Ceci est possible seulement si le traducteur connaît admirablement les ressources de la langue d’arrivée et capable de pénétrer l’esprit et la sensibilité de l’auteur qu’il entreprend de traduire jusqu’à s’identifier à lui.

La liberté en traduction s’appuie sur les équivalences qui selon Lederer, M. (1994:86), sont la désignation de réalités actuelles, concrètes ou abstraites dont le caractère inédit est dû à la spécificité de cette réalité. Prendre la liberté en traduction pour liberté du style comme énonce Rochard est faire croire que le style du traducteur est une panacée au problème de la traduction littéraire. Mais nous avons établi que le style ne joue qu’un rôle secondaire dans la traduction littéraire. Encore, c’est une notion de traduction que le traducteur ne doit pas être esclave aux mots et aux phrases de l’original comme cela a été affirmé par Fortunato. Cette notion est dans l’esprit de l’équivalence dynamique que nous avons expérimenté dans cette thèse. Ces observations nous amènent à dire un mot par rapport à la liberté dans la traduction de deux œuvres de Fagunwa que nous étudions.

Nous reconnaissons la liberté d’Abioye dans la reformulation du récit de l’auteur là où celui-ci fait la distinction entre la hutte du chasseur dans la forêt et la forêt de chasse, le traducteur en remplace par l’acte de chasse. Il prend aussi la liberté de mettre les signes de ponctuation dans sa structure selon la règle grammaticale de la langue réceptrice. Voyons l’exemple qui suit:
Un jour, quand je faisais la chasse, je découvris un sentier qui me semblait bon pour rentrer chez moi. (*Le Preux chasseur…*p.71)

Juxtaposons cette traduction à l’original:

Ni ojo kan bi mo ti nlo si igbe lo se ode ni mo ri ona kekere kan mo si tele e mo nto o lo… (*Ogboju Ode…*p.45).

Le manque de signes de ponctuation dans l’original ne fait pas le lecteur lire la phrase en unité d’idées. Cette contrainte est capable de heurter la lecture du texte. La version compense cette perte. La virgule mise après chaque unité d’idées facilite la lecture et la compréhension du message de la version. Cette liberté du style du traducteur est un gain pour le lecteur de la traduction.

En outre, le segment de la phrase “lo sí ìgbé lo se ode” évoque quitter la demeure pour aller dans les bois pour faire la chasse. La version prend le point de la perspective que, puisque le chasseur est déjà dans la forêt pour faire la chasse malgré sa demeure dans la forêt, il n’est plus la peine de préciser la distinction entre la demeure dans la forêt de chasse et la forêt où l’on fait la chasse. Encore, le suspense que déploie le lecteur de l’original d’où menerait le sentier que suit le chasseur est trahi dès le début de la restitution de la traduction car dans la traduction, le sentier paraît assez bon à être suivi. Pour l’original, le héros suit le sentier sans avoir aucune destination en vue. Mais en fin du sentier, il rencontre son neveu et se rend chez lui. Cette tournure du style de l’auteur par le traducteur est une trahison de la plume de ce dernier. Lisant le récit tout entier, nous remarquons que cette liberté garde le sens du message malgré la reformulation.

Une autre évidence de la liberté d’Abioye dans la traduction littéraire de Fagunwa se trouve dans l’habitude de dire non ce que Fagunwa a dit mais ce qu’il aurait dû dire. A la page 15 de *la fortune sourit aux audacieux*, nous avons remarqué cette habitude dans la traduction du titre de chapitre 2. L’orginal intitule le chapitre comme “Alabapade Ireke-Onibudo” (*Ireke Onibudo…*p.15) alors que la version considère comme insuffisant le littéralisme de ce titre. La rencontre du narrateur avec Ireke-Onibudo est inattendue. L’auteur aurait dû démontrer cette idée dans le titre mais il décide de laisser le contenu faire ce devoir et de laisser le lecteur juger selon sa compréhension. Abioye reconnait l’implication de dire le vouloir-dire de l’auteur et donne pour le titre, “Rencontre inattendue avec Ireke-Onibudo”. Inutile de nous dire que l’équivalence dont nous venons de parler ici, est celle de l’équivalence de l’intention de l’auteur. C’est plutôt une remarque de contact avec l’auteur à travers la lecture détaillée du récit.

Une autre circonstance dans laquelle Abioye applique la stratégie de liberté en traduction est dans sa rupture de l’unité sens-son. Par exemple, dans la prière du narrateur dans *Ogboju Ode*..., le narrateur énonce…

“Ki ori yin gbayin lowo tuletule omo ki ile yin ma batu, ki orun yin gbayin lowo akotileta ki o a ma ba tayin tiletile…” (*Ogboju Ode* …p.81)

Il existe un rapport du sens et du son entre “túlétúlé” et “ilé tú” ainsi que “akótilétà” et “tàyìn tilétilé”. Le traducteur, pour éviter l’imposition de la resonance donne comme traduction:

_Que votre tête vous délivre d’un enfant qui est capable de nuire à votre foyer. Que votre cou vous délivre d’un enfant qui ne cherche qu’à pousser la maison à faire faillite, ainsi vous resterez le propriétaire de vos biens…* (Le Preux chasseur…p.133)

Nous avons déjà affirmé que la substitution du mot “tête” pour “orí” a une perte de sens sur le plan culturel. De la même manière, on se demande si le mot “orun” (le cou) dans l’original veut dire le cou physique et non pas la répétition du sens voulu d’“orí” (le destin). Encore, les termes “túlétúlé” et “akótilétà” veulent-ils dire “auteurs de l’effondrement d’une maison”? L’addition de la phrase “Vous resterez le propriétaire de vos biens” dans la version ne correspond guère à l’idée de l’original.

En outre, nous remarquons la confusion que peut provoquer la liberté en traduction. Quelle puissance a une tête de délivrer quelqu’un du danger ou à quel rapport de sens y a-t-il entre “pousser la maison à faire faillite” et “akótilétà ki ó má ba tàyìn tile tile”? Quel sens peut-on accorder à “vous resterez le propriétaire de vos biens” dans le récit de l’original? Ces questions nous amènent à revoir l’efficacité de la liberté en traduction littéraire.

Si le corollaire de la liberté en traduction est la fidélité au sens des mots en dehors du sens culturel de l’original, la liberté n’existe guère en traduction. Encore, si l’objectif de la liberté en traduction est de produire une autre œuvre (à partir de l’original), la version n’est qu’une paraphrase. Nous avons déjà dit que la théorie de l’équivalence dynamique s’oriente vers la culture réceptrice mais cette orientation a ses limites si elle ne veut pas effacer entièrement les traces de l’original. Une approche ou une technique de traduction prise isolément ne peut jamais conduire à une bonne traduction.

Il y a des cas, même dans les œuvres de Fagunwa où il est tout difficile de se servir de la liberté ou de la dynamique dans la restitution. Les œuvres de Fagunwa sont lourdes de bagages culturels yorouba. Et nous devons avouer que, pour les œuvres telles que les nôtres, adopter la liberté pour résoudre le problème du culturel est parfois difficile si non totalement impossible. Prenons le cas de l’incantation. Créer une incantation analogue en français est impossible alors que l’incantation fait partie de la culture yorouba. Nous pouvons examiner l’incantation suivante et sa traduction:

...nitori ori awuje ni awuje fi igbe ile jade,
La version retient l’original même en langue yorouba aux pages 8 et 9 de *La fortune sourit aux audacieux*. Cependant, Abioye explique dans les notes en bas de page que c’est une parole incantatoire devenue proverbiale. A quel point une incantation devient un proverbe dans une culture? Nous remarquons que la liberté en traduction ne peut pas uniquement résoudre le problème que créent les faits socio-culturels constatés dans les œuvres littéraires. Par exemple, Abioye est obligé de retenir dans la version “dandogo” et “arumate” (*Le preux chasseur*…p.77), les noms de certaines variétés de vêtements étant donné qu’il ne trouve pas de types de vêtements dans la culture réceptrice. De la même manière, la culture française ne connait pas “Osanyin”, le dieu qui, dans la culture yorouba, révèle l’identité de la personne qui commet un vol ou autres méfaits, donc il n’existe pas de mot(s) prévus pour ce dieu en français. Quelle liberté ou visée dynamique à prendre pour traduire “òsányìn”? (*Le preux chasseur* ..p.4) C’est pourquoi Abioye retient ce mot dans la version et décrit ce dieu dans les notes en bas de page comme “une des divinités au pays yorouba. Cette divinité est reconnue pour son pouvoir magique de révéler l’identité de la personne qui aurait commis un crime, vol ou autres méfaits”.

Nous notons également l’insuffisance de la liberté dans le traitement des noms de perles en yorouba: “segi”, “iyun”, “alaari”, “adire”, “kijipa” et de variétés de chapeaux traditionnels en yorouba: “okiribi” et “eletiaja” (*le preux chasseur*…p.40). Le traducteur, en ses notes en bas de page, explique tout simplement que ces perles (segi, iyun, etc), les textiles (alaari, adire, kijipa, etc) et les chapeaux (okiribi et eletiaja) dont les noms en yorouba sont conservés dans la traduction sont espèces de perles, textiles et chapeaux traditionnels qui portent les Yorouba (p.40).

A sa réponse à la question si Oui ou Non, le traducteur en face des traits de culture ou de civilisation qui pour un Français, n’ont pas de sens – des situations qui n’ont pas d’équivalent en français, l’on doit expliquer, Fortunato Israël déclare qu’“expliquer c’est risquer de casser le rythme du texte et de nuire à l’effet” (*Liberté en Traduction* 1990:39). Israël a donné cette réponse dans l’esprit de la liberté que doit prendre le traducteur littéraire. Mais comme nous avons vu dans les exemples cités ci-dessus, nier l’explication comme l’a fait Abioye, c’est nier au lecteur de la version l’accès au message de l’original.

Ce que nous proposons, ici, est capter le sens du message de l’original et laisser les mots de la langue réceptrice traduire les messages dans la langue courante de la version et retenir les termes dont les équivalents sont non-existants dans la culture réceptrice avec l’explication/description astucieuse dans les notes infrapaginales. Car maintenir l’ancrage initial du texte et son origine étrangère, c’est élargir l’horizon culturel du pays d’accueil des textes ce qui est la raison première de son transfert.

Pour clore cet aspect, il nous faut établir qu’il y a plusieurs facteurs qui participent à la traduction d’une œuvre littéraire: l’expérience bi-culturelle du traducteur, la compétence et la performance linguistiques du traducteur, la reconnaissance du destinataire, les niveaux de compréhension culturelle du lecteur, etc. Les critiques de la traduction littéraire parlent beaucoup de l’auteur et du traducteur mais disent peu de la nécessité de catégoriser les lecteurs du texte traduit. Pour
les œuvres de notre recherche, nous pouvons en identifier trois types. (i) le lecteur qui n’a aucune connaissance de la culture d’origine. C’est le cas des Français (ii) le lecteur qui partage la même culture que l’original mais qui a beaucoup plus d’attirance langagière à la langue réceptrice. C’est la cas des francophones au Bénin, au Togo et en Côte d’Ivoire d’origine yorouba (iii) le lecteur francisant. C’est le cas des professeurs et étudiants de français dans la culture de l’original qui ont lu et compris l’original et peuvent lire et comprendre la version et par là arrive à faire la comparaison des composantes culturelles et linguistiques des deux textes – l’original et la version. Le traducteur littéraire doit tenir compte de ces catégories des lecteurs au cours de ses efforts de donner dans une langue étrangère les messages de Fagunwa. Grâce à sa maîtrise de la culture yorouba et de la grammaire française, Abioye essaie de remplir les besoins de ces catégories des lecteurs.

Conclusion

Pour la plume d’un auteur au style distillé parfois au niveau soutenu du culturel yorouba comme celle de notre auteur, la traduction doit passer par deux immenses: une grande patience et une modestie qui ne gêne pas le génie du contenu de l’original. La liberté que prend le traducteur littéraire est toujours remarquée au niveau du style face à l’exigence du sens; ce qui engendre souvent une contrainte qui devient un devoir envers l’œuvre. Les problèmes du transcodage sont indéniables en traduction littéraire et prendre sa propre liberté de style pour démontrer sa propre maîtrise de la tâche de la part du traducteur est confronté par des pièges issus de la divergence d’idées et de tournures culturelles et linguistiques de deux langues impliquées dans la production du message aux lecteurs. Nous affirmons alors l’approche de l’équivalence dynamique pour rapprocher le message de la version à son original.
Références


Purging the Ghost of the Past

Musa Al-Halool
Effat University, Saudi Arabia

Abstract

Upon careful examination, Heart of Darkness reads like an interior monologue, with Marlow telling the whole story in practically one breath, while his foursome audience remains, for all practical purposes, entirely passive throughout Marlow's narration of his African jeremiad. Telling the story in retrospect has the quality of mediating the events of the past through the narrator's present frame of mind. In other words, the whole past is filtered through the prism of the present. This allows Marlow unlimited leverage to edit this past, modify it, alter it, reinvent it, comment on it, and interpret it to his own advantage.

Marlow's obsession with and apologetic attitude towards the evil Kurtz is another problematic issue in the novella. Since Kurtz is dead according to Marlow's own account and, therefore, belongs to the past, then Marlow's present justification is not so much slanted towards him who is long since dead as it is towards him who is still living. So, apparently Marlow has a vested interest that goes beyond the customary bond and sympathy between two company employees. Can it perhaps be that Kurtz, in the final analysis, is an alter ego of Marlow? Or an embodiment of a dark phase in Marlow's life in the Congo—a phase that he now prefers to suppress and deny? These questions, however unassumingly raised, tend to vitiate the realistic existence of a person named Kurtz. And indeed, there is in the novella enough textual evidence that lends reasonable credence to this argument.

Keywords: Heart of Darkness, the uncanny, alter ego, Marlow-Kurtz imbroglio, catharsis by narration
I

More than a century of diligent critical appraisal and reappraisal of *Heart of Darkness* has proved that Joseph Conrad's masterpiece is a hard nut to crack. On the surface of it, the novella leaves more questions unanswered than those it answers, and consequently a number of loose ends remain disturbingly untied by the novella's end. That is why any attempt to account for all these questions and loose ends will be beset by not a small number of false starts. But first to these nagging questions: 1) How is it that Marlow's companions aboard the Nellie, excepting the frame narrator, remain entirely silent throughout his narrative? 2) How is it realistically possible for Marlow to tell the whole story in a single night? 3) Is there any significance for telling a story of African horror belonging to the not-so-immediate past from the prism of the present and aboard a cruising yawl anchored at night in the Thames? 4) What is the bearing of Marlow's invocation of ancient Romans coming into the awful climate of England on his remembrance of his own journey to the heart of African darkness? 5) Why does Marlow unexpectedly change from a passionate defender of, and sympathizer with, the colonized Africans in Chapter I to a virulent racist by Chapter II? 6) Why does Marlow occasionally deny any interest in Kurtz precisely when these denials on such occasions seem at their most counterproductive? 7) How is it that Marlow, who of all company employees is presumably the least connected to Kurtz, becomes the most enthusiastic to want to rescue Kurtz out of the heart of darkness? 8) And how is it then that when he meets him face to face, his first impulse is to kill him? 9) Is it by coincidence that Marlow's journey to the Congo comes out in effect not as a business trip by a company employee but as that of a one-man fact-finding mission, while Kurtz stands out as the man of action par excellence? 10) Why, on his second visit to Brussels, does Marlow rule his dear aunt out of his schedule of visits in spite of her instrumental role in securing him his employment with the Belgian company?

Upon careful examination, however, *Heart of Darkness* reads like an interior monologue, with Marlow telling the whole story in practically one breath, while his foursome audience remains, for all practical purposes, entirely passive throughout Marlow's narration of his African jeremiad. After a mere five-page expository preface and a few scattered interludes later on by the frame narrator, Marlow tells the remaining one hundred and thirteen pages of the novella in a single night! Realistically, this seems an impossible job. So, it is legitimate to wonder whether Marlow's incredibly mesmerized listeners are mere figments of his own imagination.

Indeed, the frame narrator, a fellow sailor like Marlow, uses the first-person plural as if it were an undifferentiated singular voice. In his account, all five (sometimes four) companions are made to share not only the bond of the sea but even the same feelings and thoughts! For instance, while the frame narrator was silently musing on how "farther west on the upper reaches the place of the monstrous town was still marked ominously on the sky, a brooding gloom in sunshine, a lurid glare under the stars," Marlow's first utterance meshes perfectly well with these unarticulated musings, as if by a genius stroke of telepathy, "'And this also,' said Marlow suddenly, 'has been one of the dark places of the earth'" (emphasis added, 4). The striking use of the couplers (*and, also*) in Marlow's opening statement further suggests that Marlow and the frame narrator share the exact same train of thought, and that Marlow was simply articulating, verbally and aloud, what the frame narrator was thinking of.

In effect, such matters as have been discussed above tend to argue that the whole novella is nothing but a dream told by Marlow and that his companions have no existence in reality. In
addition, telling the story in retrospect has the quality of mediating the events of the past through the narrator's present frame of mind. In other words, the whole past is filtered through the prism of the present. This allows Marlow unlimited leverage to edit this past, modify it, alter it, reinvent it, comment on it, and interpret it to his own advantage.

Likewise, Marlow's retrospective narration of a story set almost entirely in the Congo while aboard a yacht anchored in the Thames is not without significance. In other words, the act of storytelling can be seen as a post factum attempt to redeem himself in his own eyes—thus making Heart of Darkness a record of Marlow's meanderings between slips of the tongue and afterthoughts, or between moral failures and masked attempts to cover them up. For example, his early invocation of a young Roman citizen coming to England some eighteen centuries ago "to mend his fortunes" (6) not only foreshadows his tale of his own experience in the Congo, but it also sums up its bitter harvest in an epigrammatic nutshell:

"Land in a swamp, march through the woods, and in some inland post feel the savagery, the utter savagery, had closed round him,—all that mysterious life of the wilderness that stirs in the forest, in the jungles, in the hearts of wild men. There's no initiation either into such mysteries. He has to live in the midst of the incomprehensible, which is also detestable. And it has a fascination, too, that goes to work upon him. The fascination of the abomination—you know, imagine the growing regrets, the longing to escape, the powerless disgust, the surrender, the hate."

He paused. (6)

Apparently, Marlow pauses here because he realizes that he inadvertently and vicariously spoke of his own personal experience, and, lest his present and future audiences might see through his pathetic mask, he attempts to dismiss such parallels as preposterously out of the question. Hence his hurried warning, "Mind, none of us would feel exactly like this" (6). But we know that that was exactly what Marlow felt after his blunder into the Congo. As it turns out, this is not the only time in which Marlow resorts to this familiar and convenient device of covering up past blunders.

II

Throughout Chapter I of the novella, Marlow poses as a detached but curious skeptic vis-à-vis Kurtz as well as an exceptional sympathizer with the colonized natives. But at the onset of Chapter II, we detect a marked shift of sympathy towards Kurtz, which amounts to total empathy by the end of the chapter. In his retrospective narrative, Marlow sees to it that the telling of an event is couched in a context of apologetics. Notice, for instance, how he tells his audience very curtly of the metamorphosis that Kurtz has undergone while in the Congo: "He had taken a high seat amongst the devils of the land—I mean literally" (72). In the very next breath, Marlow tells this selfsame audience in a rather reproaching tone how/why Kurtz has become more savage than the putative savages he came to civilize:

You can't understand. How could you?—with solid pavement under your feet, surrounded by kind neighbours ready to cheer you or to fall on you, stepping delicately between the butcher and the policeman, in the holy terror of scandal and gallows and lunatic asylum—how can you imagine what particular region of the first ages a man's untrammelled feet may take him into by the way of solitude—utter solitude without a policeman—by the way of silence—utter silence, where no warning voice of a kind neighbour can be heard whispering of public opinion? These little things make all the great difference. (72)
Any careful reader will readily notice the marked imbalance between Marlow's *laconic presentation* of the event of Kurtz's metamorphosis and his *garrulous rationalization* of this metamorphosis. Actually, Marlow's vehement defense of Kurtz goes on for another page or so. We are thus entitled to wonder why Marlow dwells so much on the extenuating circumstances that presumably led Kurtz to 'go native.' We need to emphasize at this point that Marlow narrates the events of the past *in retrospect*. According to Richard Ambrosini, "The telling, rather than the event itself, generates meaning" (90). This means that Marlow is more intensely involved in the present (to which the rationalization belongs) than in the past (in which the actual event took place). This is evident when he addresses his captive audience, "Mind, I am not trying to excuse or even explain—I am trying to account to myself for—Mr. Kurtz—for the shade of Mr. Kurtz" (73). Marlow's hesitation, typographically indicated by long dashes, is very suggestive here. It affirms precisely what he is trying to deny. The use of the present progressive tense also reveals that Marlow is still being haunted by Kurtz's ghost.

A reasonable conclusion to be reached here is: Since Kurtz is dead according to Marlow's own account and, therefore, belongs to the past, then Marlow's present justification is not so much slanted towards him who is long since dead as it is towards him who is still living. Ambrosini recognizes that "Marlow's urge to tell the story [is] in order to cope with the painful inheritance of his past" (110). So, apparently Marlow has a vested interest that goes beyond the customary bond and sympathy between two company employees. Is it perhaps that Kurtz, in the final analysis, is an alter ego of Marlow? Or an embodiment of a dark phase in Marlow's life in the Congo—a phase that he now prefers to suppress and deny? These questions, however unassumingly raised, tend to vitiate the realistic existence of a person named Kurtz. And indeed, there is in the novella enough textual evidence that lends reasonable credence to this argument.

**III**

But first let's review Marlow's presentation of Kurtz to his present listeners and future readers. In Chapter I, Marlow first hears from the Company's chief accountant in the Congo that Kurtz is "a first-class agent" and "a very remarkable person" who "[s]ends in as much ivory as the others put together" (25). Then, he learns from the manager of the Central Station, seen by Marlow as "a chattering idiot", that Mr. Kurtz, who is now rumored to be ill, was "the best agent he [the manager] had, an exceptional man, of the greatest importance to the Company" (31). The brick-maker of the Central Station further tells Marlow, "He is a prodigy…. He is an emissary of pity, and science, and progress, and devil knows what else" (35).

The manager's and the brick-maker's qualification of Kurtz as an exceptional asset to the company recalls how Marlow's own aunt represented her nephew to company officials in Brussels in a similar light:

... it became quite plain to me I had been represented to the wife of the high dignitary, and goodness knows to how many more people besides, as an exceptional and gifted creature—a piece of good fortune for the Company—a man you don't get hold of every day…. It appeared, however, I was also one of the Workers, with a capital—you know. Something like an emissary of light, something like a lower sort of apostle. (15)

Not coincidentally, just as Marlow's aunt's description of her nephew as an emissary of light was derived from the then current argot of the press (15), so is the brick-maker's description of Kurtz as an emissary of pity, science, and progress (35). Furthermore, the brick-maker notes an
obvious parallelism between Kurtz and Marlow when he addresses Marlow, "The same people who sent him specially also recommend you." Then, in the very next breath, the brick-maker, as if anticipating Marlow's objection to such a conclusion that might be reached by future readers, tells him, "Oh, don't say no. I've my own eyes to trust" (35). Not surprisingly, Marlow, who as a narrator is going through denial, dismisses the parallelism as preposterous.

When he defends Kurtz against the brick-maker's accusations, Marlow seems to make no distinction between Kurtz and himself in the same defense, even though he prefaces his defense of Kurtz with a typical avowal of feigned disinterestedness, "I would not have gone so far as to fight for Kurtz, but I went for him near enough to a lie" (38). But unless lying for Kurtz serves Marlow's own interests, why do it? Notice how a few lines down Marlow forgets that a moment ago he pretended to be defending Kurtz, "Well, I went near enough to it [lying] by letting the young fool [the brick-maker] there believe anything he liked to imagine as to my influence in Europe" (emphasis added, 38). Here, by a slip of the tongue Marlow confounds himself with Kurtz!

Marlow's narrative (with its gaps, striking parallelisms, statements, garrulous apologetics, denials) leaves enough clues that point a different reading than he wishes his audience to conclude. For instance, soon after he admits to his sleepy audience that once he lied in defense of Kurtz, he recognizes that his account of Kurtz is unconvincing:

This simply because I had a notion it [lying] somehow would be of help to that Kurtz whom at the time I did not see—you understand. He was just a word for me. I did not see the man in the name any more than you do. Do you see him? Do you see the story? It seems to me I am trying to tell you a dream—making a vain attempt, because no relation of a dream can convey the dream sensation.... (emphasis added, 38).

Marlow's ambivalence is evident in his recognition that his attempt at telling the dream-like story of Kurtz is vain precisely because of "the incredible which is of the very essence of dreams" (38). Then, after a short pause he tells his passive listeners in rather philosophical tones, "No, it is impossible; it is impossible to convey the life-sensation of any given epoch of one's existence—that which makes its truth, its meaning—its subtle and penetrating essence. It is impossible" (38). Seeing that his audience remains unmoved by his philosophizing, he pauses a while for further reflection. But when it dawns on him that his audience, except his accomplice co-narrator, have already gone to sleep, Marlow says, "Of course in this [story of Kurtz] you fellows see more than I could then" (39). This is a half-confession encouraged by the pitch dark night and by the fact that the majority of his listeners are asleep by now. Ambrosini comes close to admitting the cathartic effect narration has for Marlow, but he retracts by saying, "Marlow is confronting the actuality of the puzzling and painful feeling his own tale is evoking. One discovers, then, that what had begun as telling a dream has become experiencing a nightmare..." (110).

The pitch black night serves as another face-saving mask Marlow hides behind, a mask that completely depersonalizes him, an event that prompts Marlow's co-narrator to say, "For a long time already he, sitting apart, had been no more to us than a voice" so much so that even Marlow's awe-inspiring narrative "seemed to shape itself without human lips" (39). When he eventually relates his face-to-face encounter with Kurtz, Marlow tells us of that heated exchange he had with him in an illuminating way that shows his struggle with his alter ego called Kurtz:
I've been telling you what we said—repeating the phrases we pronounced—but what's the good? They were common everyday words—the familiar, vague sounds exchanged on every waking day of life. But what of that? They had behind them, to my mind, the terrific suggestiveness of words heard in dreams, of phrases spoken in nightmares. Soul! If anybody had ever struggled with a soul, I am the man. (Emphasis added, 100)

So, even Marlow wants us to read between the lines of his tale. Marlow's own co-narrator tells us that Marlow is not a typical yarn-spinner like other sailors in that his tales always have a double meaning: "... to him the meaning of an episode was not inside like a kernel but outside, enveloping the tale which brought it out only as a glow brings out a haze, in the likeness of one of these misty halos that sometimes are made visible by the spectral illumination of moonshine" (4). In light of this illuminating comment, it follows that Marlow's tale of Kurtz's life sheds light on his own. Daphna Erdinast-Vulcan argues that, "Not at the center, not at the heart of darkness will meaning be found, but outside the tale, in the act of the telling" (57). Ambrosini, on the other hand, says that, "The frame narrator is drawing the reader's attention to the duality of Marlow's story. He warns his readers that they must not concentrate on Marlow's account of the events in which he is protagonist, but rather on the distortions which the re-creation of his subjective experience produces on the narrative" (90). Ambrosini thus concludes that, "The only way of obtaining a 'meaning' would be to crack the tale's nutshell and thus extract the meaning one wants to find" (90).

In the interval between Marlow's philosophical reflection on ancient empires at the beginning of the novella and his embarking upon storytelling proper, the frame narrator butts in to warn us, "we knew we were fated, before the ebb began to turn, to hear about one of Marlow's inconclusive experiences" (7). In the very next breath, Marlow himself, who informs us that the story he is going to tell deals "with what happened to me personally" and "how I went up that river to the place where I first met that poor chap [Kurtz]" (7), concurs with the frame narrator: "It seemed somehow to throw a kind of light on everything about me—and into my thoughts. It was sombre enough, too—and pitiful—not extraordinary in any way—not very clear either. No, not very clear. And yet it seemed to throw a kind of light." (7).

On more than one occasion, especially soon before and soon after he meets Kurtz, Marlow expresses his desire to beat or even kill Kurtz for no obvious reason. Here are Marlow's two retrospective comments on that encounter:

a. "I fancy I had some vague notion of falling upon him and giving him a drubbing. I don't know. I had some imbecile thoughts." (98)

b. "This clearly was not a case for fisticuffs, even apart from the very natural aversion I had to beat that Shadow—this wandering and tormented thing." (99)

And here are the two 'real-time' statements he reportedly said to Kurtz in case the latter shouted to alert his native devotees to Marlow's attempt to take him away from them:

a. "but if you try to shout I'll smash your head with—" (99)

b. "I will throttle you for good." (99)

One cannot help noticing Marlow's apologetics not just in the content of the two retrospective comments on his previous threats of violence or denials thereof but also in the fact that rhetorically the comments are presented before, not after, the violent statements. Although one may be inclined to understand this in light of Watt's explanation of Conrad's narrative technique of delayed decoding (In Moore, 176), Ambrosini argues that, "The way Conrad chose to convey this effect was a
juxtaposition between a story of 'what happened' to Marlow and a tale of the effect that those events had on him” (85).

Apparantly now that he is back to his senses in the metropolis of civilized England, Marlow realizes what a shammed life, personified as Kurtz, he led in the Congo. Daphna Erdinast-Vulcan, the only critic to recognize Kurtz, a la Freud, as the uncanny double of Marlow, comments by saying that, "What is at stake for Marlow, then, is not his lack of knowledge, but his suppression of knowledge, his failure to respond and to testify to what he has known all along” (57). That is why she sees Heart of Darkness as a narrative of failure as well as a "belated testimony of a witness haunted by his own failure to testify. The truth toward which Marlow's narrative inches its way is the truth of his own lie, and his silent complicity in the atrocities he has witnessed. The return of the repressed becomes evident through a failure of language in Marlow's account” (56-57). Erdinast-Vulcan, however, stops short of taking her discussion of Kurtz as Marlow's uncanny double to its Freudian conclusion—a failure this paper hopes to redress.

IV

Marlow feels the need to purge the ghost of Kurtz out of his life once and for all. When he remembers how he lied in defense of Kurtz, he explains how lies stifle his life, "There is a taint of death, a flavour of mortality in lies—which is exactly what I hate and detest in the world—what I want to forget" (emphasis added, 38). The cathartic effect of storytelling is evident in his desire to forget this taste of death.

In a psychoanalytically illuminating passage, Marlow speaks of his final triumph of overpowering the physically emaciated and weakened Kurtz:

I kept my head pretty well; but when I had him at last stretched on the couch, I wiped my forehead, while my legs shook under me as though I had carried half a ton on my back down that hill. And yet I had only supported him, his bony arm clasp round my neck—and he was not much heavier than a child. (emphasis added, 101)

Here Marlow appears to us as both pre-Freudian psychiatrist (stretching Kurtz on the couch) and quasi-Promethean sufferer (carrying half a ton on his back). The contrast between Kurtz's physically insignificant weight (not heavier than a child) and Marlow's feeling him both as a heavy burden on his back and an albatross around his neck can only be appreciated and understood in psychoanalytical terms.

One year after the death of Kurtz, Marlow, who is now back in Brussels, reflects on the burdensome legacy the former bequeathed him:

All that had been Kurtz's had passed out of my hands: his soul, his body, his station, his plans, his ivory, his career. There remained only his memory and his Intended—and I wanted to give that up, too, to the past, in a way—to surrender personally all that remained of him with me to that oblivion which is the last word of our common fate. I don't defend myself. I had no clear perception of what it was I really wanted. (Emphasis added, 111)

With these vague ideas in his mind, Marlow decides to deliver in person to Kurtz's fiancée her photo and the letters Kurtz had entrusted him with. On his way to the headquarters of the company,
Marlow is visited by a frightening vision of Kurtz, a vision that threatens not just him but all humanity. Here Marlow realizes how wrong he was in believing that Kurtz is really dead, body and soul, and confined to the Congo. Marlow's lengthy reflections defy all summary here and are, therefore, worth quoting in full:

I thought his memory was like the other memories of the dead that accumulate in every man's life—a vague impress on the brain of shadows that had fallen on it in their swift and final passage; but before the high and ponderous door, between the tall houses of street as still and decorous as a well-kept alley in a cemetery, I had a vision of him on the stretcher, opening his mouth voraciously, as if to devour all the earth with all its mankind. He lived then before me; he lived as much as he had ever lived—a shadow insatiable of splendid appearances, of frightful realities; a shadow darker than the shadow of the night, and draped nobly in the folds of a gorgeous eloquence. The vision seemed to enter the house with me—the stretcher, the phantom bearers, the wild crowd of obedient worshippers, the gloom of the forests, the glitter of the reaach between the murky bends, the beat of the drum, regular and muffled like the beating of a heart—the heart of a conquering darkness. It was a moment of triumph for the wilderness, an invading and vengeful rush which, it seemed to me, I would have to keep back alone for the salvation of another soul. (111-12)

Marlow's vivid recollections continue for about another page or so, but when he reaches the door of the company headquarters, Kurtz's phantasmagoric image, which has been stalking him since he landed in Brussels, becomes even more vivid now so that it brings back with it the whole African experience of horror Marlow went through with Kurtz, "I rang the bell before a mahogany door on the first floor, and while I waited he seemed to stare at me out of the glassy panel—stare with that wide and immense stare embracing, condemning, loathing all the universe. I seemed to hear the whispered cry, 'The Horror! The horror!'" (112). Three issues warrant commentary here: First, Marlow's return to the headquarters of the company, where he had signed the contract about two years earlier, signifies that his experience in the heart of darkness has come full circle. Second, the mahogany door is presumably the same door through which Marlow had been summarily inducted to the company then shortly afterwards hurled thence to the African heart of darkness two years earlier. Third, the glassy panel on the mahogany door, which was not mentioned earlier by Marlow when he had signed the contract (see page 11), is perhaps more a mirror symbol of Marlow's own troubled soul than a factual detail of a door.

Marlow's troubles in dealing with Kurtz's heavy legacy are compounded by his encounter with the Intended. Her still undiminished sorrow for Kurtz's death more than a year after the fact as well as her unshakable faith in his so-called absolute benevolence play havoc with Marlow's faith in his ability to come to grips with his burdensome legacy in a practical fashion. "For her he had died only yesterday. And, by Jove! the impression was so powerful that for me, too, he seemed to have died only yesterday—nay, this very minute" (113).

Marlow's determination to surrender Kurtz's legacy of horror is shattered by the unshakable faith of the Intended. Robbed of his will to disambiguate her about the truth of her idol, Marlow feels compelled to acquiesce with her that they both share the same opinion about Kurtz, but he comments, "'Yes, I know,' I said with something like despair in my heart" (115). The "saving illusion" that she innocently lives in irreversibly convinces Marlow of his own vulnerability vis-à-vis "the triumphant darkness from which I could not have defended her—from which I could not even defend myself" (115). Her passionate effusions, which in effect convince Marlow that "I shall
see this eloquent phantom [Kurtz] as long as I live" (116), so unnerve Marlow that his only recourse is verbal irony, "His end," said I, with dull anger stirring in me, 'was in every way worthy of his life" (117). One notices in this comment how she has robbed Marlow even of his susceptibility to anger. And though he finally "felt a chill grip on my chest" and "heard his very last words" Marlow "stopped in a fright" and instead of telling her that Kurtz's final words were "The horror! The Horror", he found himself lying to her, "The last word he pronounced was—your name" (117). Marlow's lie is an indication that his moral defeat is final inasmuch as it is an expression of the irreversible triumph of evil. If verbal irony was the best defense he managed to marshal on behalf of truth in the past, then masking that now retold evil past behind a phantom he names Kurtz boils down to a half-confession of that truth.

V

Like the narrator in Tayeb Salih's Season of Migration to the North through whose eyes the story of Mustafa Said is narrated, Marlow in Heart of Darkness tells the story of Kurtz. The one narrates the reprehensible life of Said outside his native Sudan (in London); the other narrates the reprehensible life of Kurtz outside his native England (in the Congo). In my view, the narratees each represent a phase in the life of the narrator, but now, back in the comfort of their native civilized habitats, they frown upon their shameful pasts, but stop short of a candid confession. Hence, Erdinia-Vulcan argues that "Marlow's narrative should be read as performative speech act because it does not represent a given truth but generates its truth in the act of telling" (57).

It is instructive, therefore, to trace Marlow's changing attitudes towards Kurtz as they are expressed in his tale. He is first indifferent, then curious, then fascinated, then loyal, then disgusted, then horrified. But here we need to remember Ambrosini's distinction between the story of what really happened to Marlow and a tale of the effect that those events had on him. In other words, Marlow's tale of indifference, disgust, and horror are indeed post-historical European editorials that not only mask his original curiosity, fascination, and loyalty to Kurtz but also bracket them, and thus confuse readers. Ralph Maud recognizes the negative impact of Marlow's confusing editorials on his telling the story when he says, "If Marlow had told the story without his editorial 'incomprehensibles' it would have been too plain, too plain altogether" (209).

Here is a brief summary of Kurtz's career in Marlow's tale: as an illusion (37), a word (38), a subject for speculation (44), someone to covet an open conversation with, but it is soon decided that anything one says or does with Kurtz would be "a mere futility" (56), someone whose possible death would render him as "something altogether without a substance" (69), a man who presents himself "as a voice" (69, 91), a gifted creature endowed most preeminently with "the gift of expression" (69), a creature to covet listening to (70), an ivory-like creature of the wilderness (71), a shade (ghost), an "initiated wraith from the back of Nowhere" simply referred to as "it", an "it" that "vanished" rather than died (73), an "apparition" (90), a "nightmare of my choice" (97), and "a shadow insatiable of splendid appearances, of frightful realities; a shadow darker than the shadow of the night, and draped nobly in the folds of a gorgeous eloquence" (111-12).

When the above citations are coupled with the unmistakable parallels between Marlow and Kurtz, along with Marlow's repeated denials of being interested in Kurtz—against all appearances to the contrary—and his reluctance to share with anyone "the peculiar blackness of that experience" (98), one is compelled to conclude that Kurtz is quite simply the metonymic embodiment of a dark, shameful phase in Marlow's life in the Congo. This explains why, as Marlow's story inches towards
a tale, Kurtz is often represented as a shadow or ghost, a secret sharer who must be guarded from all prying eyes: "I was anxious to deal with this shadow by myself alone,—and to this day I don't know why I was so jealous of sharing with any one the peculiar blackness of that experience" (97-8).

One also must remember that on his second visit to Brussels, Marlow mentions no visit to his 'dear aunt' in spite of her instrumental role in securing him his appointment with the Belgian company, yet he mentions his visit to the Intended. Now, this might seem a glaring omission on Marlow's part, but if we accept the contention that Kurtz is Marlow's fictitious invention of himself, it follows then that the Intended is now Marlow's reinvention of his dear aunt who 'intended' him to be "an emissary of light" (15) rather than an apostle of darkness; and here we need to remember that Marlow's failure is not a failure of intentions but of methods—Kurtz too is criticized for his unsound methods (93). Thus, it is the encounter with the Aunt-cum-Intended that proves to be the turning point in Marlow's tale. If, in the final analysis, it is Marlow who "had taken a high seat amongst the devils of the land" (72)—thus failing to live up to his aunt's benevolent ideals of "weaning those ignorant millions from their horrid ways" (15)—then fails to tell her the truth of what he actually did in the Congo, the convenience of inventing a Kurtz looms as the only way out for cowardly Marlow.

If Kurtz, as John G. Peters argues, "represents good intentions gone terribly wrong" (60), then Marlow's invention of Kurtz—as a metonymic coat rack for his moral blunders—is motivated by his fear of repression. Regeling Farn explains Marlow's lie to the Intended (i.e., Aunt) in light of this fear of social repression:

It can be seen as a comment on human nature that after Marlow's destabilising experience, and after he has felt alienated from people in Europe for a while, his way back to normality is through self-deception that realigns him with society and helps him repress what he can't come to terms with—and what is systematically not permitted to be known in a world dominated by words like Kurtz's (or Leopold's). In this context, the irony and bitterness of his tale can be seen as signs of his acknowledged impotence in the face of a disturbing reality. (11)

It is here that Marlow decides to purge the ghost of Kurtz out of his memory and life, to lift himself out of the heart of darkness that still haunts him even in the heart of 'civilized' Europe. As the personification of a frightening phenomenon, Kurtz represents to Marlow what Freud calls the uncanny. A consideration of Freud's philological analysis of the uncanny is, therefore, warranted here, as it will shed light on how Kurtz is Marlow's double. Freud's term for what is known in English as the uncanny is Das Unheimliche. To reveal what Das Unheimliche is, Freud contrasts this term with the adjectives heimlich ('homely' or 'familiar') and heimisch ('native'), and concludes that "what is 'uncanny' is frightening precisely because it is not known and familiar" (220). However, Freud's detailed tracing of the etymology of the term leads him to the startling conclusion: "Thus heimlich is a word the meaning of which develops in the direction of ambivalence, until it finally coincides with its opposite, unwelchlich. Unheimlich is in some way or other a sub-species of heimlich" (226). He later ascribes this total reversal in the meaning of the uncanny to a process of repression: "for this uncanny is in reality nothing new or alien, but something which is familiar and old-established in the mind and which has become alienated from it only through the process of repression" (241).
Freud, however, argues on the authority of Otto Rank that at the narcissistic stage in the ego's development, the ego invents a double, someone or an object it can identify with. The invention of this double is originally a defense mechanism, "an insurance against the destruction of the ego" (235). Yet, as the ego passes the narcissistic stage, the double loses its original function: "But when this stage has been surmounted, the 'double' reverses its aspect. From having been an assurance of immortality, it becomes the uncanny harbinger of death" (235).

But why does the double become so frightening and uncanny that the ego needs to mobilize all its defenses against it? Why does the ego project that familiar double outward as something foreign to itself? Freud responds that:

> When all is said and done, the quality of uncanniness can only come from the fact of the 'double' being a creation dating back to a very early mental stage, long since surmounted—a stage, incidentally, at which it wore a more friendly aspect. The 'double' has become a thing of terror, just as, after the collapse of their religion, the gods turned into demons. (236)

Lastly, Freud adds that since there is in the unconscious mind a strong 'compulsion to repeat' proceeding from instinctual impulses, "whatever reminds us of this inner 'compulsion to repeat' is perceived as uncanny" (238). Likewise, Kurtz, who once "wore a more friendly aspect" is now projected as a stranger to Marlow, a threatening nuisance, a superannuated *pied noir* who served his term and is to be sent into retirement, someone who does not belong to the civilized European *Heimat* (homeland) but to the heart of African darkness. Now that he is safe and sound in Europe, Marlow is keen on purging the ghost of his shameful past, conveniently nicknamed Kurtz, out of his life.
Endnotes

1. On the protean appeal of *Heart of Darkness*, see for example Padmini Mongia (85), Ted Billy (77), Cedric Watts (45), Benita Parry (39), and Gene M. Moore (4).


3. There have been earlier studies that discussed the kinship between Kurtz and Marlow, but none too seriously. Most notable are those by Albert J. Guerard and Stewart C. Wilcox.
References


A Configuration of Socio-Political Dialectics in Nigerian Pidgin English: 
Trends in Peter Onwudijo’s Poetry

Sunday Joseph Ayodabo
Elizade University, Ilara-Mokin, Ondo State, Nigeria

Abstract

Peter Onwudijo’s poetry collection, De Wahala for Wazobia (2007), comments on the contemporary Nigeria’s pitiable social problems. The poet employs Nigerian Pidgin English, not only as a dialectal tool to examine the issue of Nigeria’s amalgamation, but also as a lingua franca, which aptly describes the polity of multilingual Nigeria. It addresses the myriad hydra-headed issues like corruption, educational decay, election malpractices, neocolonialism, and insecurity among other forms of vices plaguing the nation which continue to militate against her development. The poems were analysed using sociolinguistics and semiotic theories as frameworks. The result of the analyses showed that the poet’s ability to effectively use the Nigerian Pidgin English to address such important issues does not make the language inferior when compared to the other established languages of the world. Rather, it should be seen as a language (second) that reflects creativity, productivity, simplicity, acceptability and understanding among the Nigerians. Indeed, it makes for a wider understanding of the poet’s major concern, as the pidgin, in Nigeria, is often being described as “the language of the people”. The study appraised the collection as an attempt at demystifying the Nigerian Pidgin English as well as evaluating its relevance for modern Nigerian poetry in its quest to radicalize the political and economic situation in Nigeria.

Keywords: Pidgin, De Wahala for Wazobia, Sociopolitical challenges, lingua franca, acceptability.
Trends in Nigerian Pidgin English: an overview of concepts

The origin of Pidgin English in Nigeria has been stated in pioneering studies as essentially a product of the process of urbanisation, while its origins lie historically in the early contacts between Africans and Europeans. According to Illah, colonization is a key historical factor responsible for the emergence of Nigerian Pidgin English (Illah, 2001). He traces the origin of NPE to the trade contact between the British and local Africans in the seventeenth century. He is of the opinion that NPE developed from the negative attitude of the European colonialist who felt they could not allow the colonized (Nigerians) to speak the same language with them. In other words, NPE is a product of the inferiority attitude the colonizers had towards the colonized. Similarly, Elugbe and Omamor confirms that it:

arose from the urgent communication needs of the contact between the visiting Europeans (in the end the English) and their multi-lingual Nigerian hosts. Stabilisation of this contact led to the stabilisation and expansion of Nigerian Pidgin (NP) (Elugbe & Omamor, 2002).

Hence, the incursion of the visiting Europeans led to the Nigerian Amalgamation of the protectorates in 1914, a move which Fabiyi (2014) believe gave rise to the need for a simplified lingual Franca which encouraged the NPE to flourish. Hence, colonization is central to the foundation and development of NPE.

The origin of NPE is also traced to the communicative need arising from the linguistic ecology of Nigeria (Ayo Banjo, 1990; Jowitt, 1991; Akindele and Adegbite, 1999; Elugbe and Omamor, 2002; Ekpenyong, 2010; Akande and Salami, 2010). Nigeria is a highly multilingual and multi-ethnic setting with over 500 ancestral languages. As a result, there is a great need for a common form of communication across ethnic groups. First, only three out of these languages are recognized as major languages: Hausa, Igbo and Yoruba, while the rest are regarded as minor languages (for example, Igede, Egun, Angas, Kamuku, etc.). Also, the classification of Nigerian languages into major and minor is based on factors including, politics, geographical spread and numerical strength. On the basis of numerical strength and geographical spread, each of the major languages is spoken by well over 18 million people in the country and is spoken in at least five states of the federation (Akande and Salami, 2010). But for the minor languages, none has such numerical strength or has geographical spread. Therefore, the Nigerian linguistic reality is such that the majority of speakers of minor languages tend to learn one of the major languages (sometimes in addition to English), especially the language that is dominant in where they live or work. For majority of those who speak any (or all) of the major languages as their native language, they also acquire English, NPE or another language of the country (Akande and Salami, 2010). Therefore, the vast majority of Nigerians are bilingual (Akindele and Adegbite, 1999), and for many of these bilinguals, NPE is one of their languages. It is a language which cuts across different ethnic and regional boundaries; it is not native but a language that emerged as a consequence of the necessity of inter-intra ethnic and regional communications. However, despite the assumptions surrounding the origin of NPE, the above assertions emphasize the prevalent view
discernible in the definition of Pidgin as a “communication system that develops among people who do not share a common language” (Todd, 1984). Thus, it is a language of necessity.

Yet, despite the versatility and uniqueness of Pidgin English, it does not enjoy the social prestige enjoyed by the likes of British and American English and to some extent Nigerian English because it is believed to spoken by the uneducated and barely educated Nigerians. John Holm (1987) notes that, “this contempt often stemmed in part from the feeling that pidgins and Creoles were corruptions of higher, usually European languages, [by people] who were often perceived as semisavages whose partial acquisition of civilised habits was somehow an affront”. This feeling of contempt was originally informed by a false sense of racial superiority, which has now been replaced by a misdirected sense of elitist superiority. A position explained by Egbokhare, who believes that, “the fortunes of a language are inextricably tied to the fortunes of its speakers” (Egbokhare, 2001). He sees the low position given to Nigerian Pidgin as a consequence of the low position of the speakers who are considered the minority ethnic groups of Nigeria. He looks at its origin, its identity, spread and the changing profiles and summed it up in the context of the “dynamics of socio-political change” in the Nigerian state. Hence, he ascribes the negative attitude toward NPE to the weak power position of its native speakers. Consequently, Pidgin is not seen in tandem with other standard varieties of English language in the world.

However, over the years, Pidgin English in Nigeria has made a noticeable linguistic advancement in spite of the stigma that has often been attached to its use, especially in elitist world. For instance, in the media cycle, news broadcasts, current affairs, discussions, programmes, news bulletins are some of the programmes that tend to favour NPE as the language of the masses in certain states such as Rivers, Delta and Cross River etc. Gani-Ikhilama recognizes the fact that NPE has become so wide spread in Nigeria that it is practically the mother tongue or Lingua Franca of some Nigerians notably in the South-South geopolitical zone (Ikhilama, 1990). In addition, studies point out that advertising agencies use Nigerian Pidgin more than native or English language in advertisement (Omonzejele, 1998; Oribhabor, 2010; Mensah & Ndimele, 2013; Balogun, 2013). They are of the opinion that advertising in NPE commands enormous public appeal because of its spread, flexibility and the creative possibilities it allows. Advertising communication presents yet another platform to further deepen the social utility and functional relevance of NPE in the public space in spite of the widespread and age-long misconceptions and prejudices against it.

Similarly, the introduction of the first pidgin radio station (Wazobia FM) has been a success since 2011. The radio station DJ, Diplomatic OPJ during an interview with Shyamantha Asokan, reveals that, “Nigerians have found a station that goes down well with them ... in a language they understand,” (Asokan, 2011:1). He adds that the station now has regional wings in Abuja, Kano and Port Harcourt. He continues, “With pidgin, our listeners feel free. We can’t make mistakes when we talk pidgin, because it’s a language that has no dictionary...So we get everyone calling in; market traders, street hawkers, people who are illiterate.” (1) OPJ further restates that pidgin has catapulted his career to new heights. He spent 16 years speaking the Queen’s English at state-owned radio stations and gained
relatively little fame. He recalls that, “Every day at my old station, after my broadcast, they would play the tapes back and my boss would say: “You misused this adjective, your pronunciation was wrong. It was called ‘radio cleaning’... but, in just 18 months at Wazobia, I’ve become more popular and famous than during my 16 years elsewhere” (1).

In addition, Nigerian Pidgin has been popularized by its usage as a language of religion slogans, praise and worship as noted in the following excerpts:

If god be for mi...dis god na helele
Jesus na mai papa.
Na so so wonder Jesus dey do o.

In English translation:

A supporting God is a great God
Jesus is my father
Jesus does wonderful things

In the entertainment industry, pidgin also permeates the deeper feelings and emotions of fans when used for comedy, drama and films, music and concerts as sensitive issues of national and international interest are carefully and jocularly passed across to people using this medium. For instance, it is has been observed in the music of artists such as Peter Torsh, Bob Marley, Raskimono, Fela Anikulapo Kuti, Femi Kuti and contemporary musicians like D’banj, Tuface Idibia, Wizkid, Flavour, Wande Coal etc. Nigerian comedians such as I Go Die, Basketmouth, Gordons, and Julius Agwu etc. overtly use pidgin as the medium of their profession to satirize the social, political, economic and religious situation in the country. In Nigeria soap operas, Pidgin is also adopted to portray issues in the society. Notable among such operas are ‘Hotel de Jordan,’ ‘Village Headmaster,’ ‘Koko-Close,’ ‘Why Worry,’ ‘Inside Out,’ ‘Masquerade,’ ‘Papa Ajasco,’ and a host of others.

Hence, the existence and development of NPE are the result of its own internal dynamics which has also been aided by the production of works of literature in Pidgin and also by the arguments of critics who have found either merit in such works or possibilities in the language. Examples of such works are written entirely or to a great extent in Pidgin. They are Ken Saro-Wiwa's Sozaboy (1985), Segun Oyekunle's Katakata for Sufferhead (1983) and Tunde Fatunde's No Food No Country (1985), Water No Get Enemy (1989), and Oga na Tief-Man (1986). More recently, there has been production of literary works such as Edwin Eriata Oribhabor’s Abuja na Kpangba and Oda Puem-Dem (2011), Chidi Anthony Opara’s State of Di Nation and Other Poem Dem (2012), Fidelis Okoro’s Pimples and Dimples (2012) etc. These works portray the varied dimensions in the use of Pidgin to enhance Nigerian literature. However, it is in poetry that this language has been most effectively employed to create a bridge of orality, especially in the attempt to domesticate, develop, and exploit its artistic resources.
Demystification of Pidgin English in Nigerian Poetry

The development and utilization of Pidgin as a language medium in Nigerian poetry owes its manifestation to the production of works such as Frank Aig-Imokhuede’s *Pidgin stew and sufferhead* (1982), Mamman Vatsa’s *Tori for Geti Bowleg* (1998), Ezenwa-Ohaeto’s *I wan bi president* (1998), *If to say I be soja* (1998), Ken Saro Wiwa’s *Dis Nigeria self* (1985) etc. Recently, the New Nigerian writers such as Akachi Adimora, Ezigbo, Pita Okute, Ajakaiye, A. Ogunkwo, Erapi, Udenwa, Osita Ike, Chidi Anthony Opara, Fidelis Okoro and Peter Onwudinjo have contributed to its development through their creative works. In support of the decision of the writers to write in pidgin, Emeka Okeke-Ezigbo opines that Pidgin is a:

Practical, viable, flexible language distilled in the alembic of our native sensibility and human experience. This lusty language, which transcends our geographical and political boundaries grows daily before our eyes. It is our natural, unifying weapon against the divisive forces of English. (Okeke-Ezigbo, 1982)

He believes that, “the adoption of Pidgin will automatically make the writer national by domesticating his outlook and sensibility”, and concludes that, “On adopting Pidgin and becoming a real nationalist the Nigerian writer can now speak with the knowledge of an insider” (1982). Though, Osofisan (1982) takes exception to the generalization of Okeke-Ezigbo’s postulations when he argues that “the use of Pidgin cannot automatically make any writer patriotic or progressive that will depend finally on other factors, such as the consciousness and purpose of the particular artist”. However, he agrees that Pidgin is a viable language and capable of sustaining works of literature. Hence, writing in pidgin is an attempt to decolonize the Nigerian literature, by removing in them all the nuances of cultural imperialism and European influences, and it is expected that poets should embrace Africa and her true Africaness in their writings. Just the way our patriots strove to achieve independence for many African states so several critics believe we have to continually struggle to free our literature from the grasps of the Europeans that once colonized us and brought us literacy. This is the task before any African writer as Chinweizu et al opine:

In addition to capturing in the African the narrative devices of African languages, there is the task of appropriately employing the various types of English that are spoken by Africans e.g., pidgin, Creole, the English of secondary school leavers... the task of capturing the flavour of African life in the African life in the African would be sadly incomplete if these were left out and if the King’s and Queen’s English were insisted upon in all contexts (Chinweizu et al, 1980:263).

Therefore, just like the proverbial saying of using the firewood in the farmland to cook for the people that cultivate the farm, so should Africans writers and poets strive to feed the imaginative domains of the Africans with ideas and imageries easily appreciated and understood by them. With the use of the Pidgin language, our poets will create poetry very familiar to the woman in the market, a palm-wine tapper on a tree, a fisherman in a boat and a weary tout smoking under the mango tree on a
hot dizzy day. The Pidgin language speaks to their people and speaks for them too, since poet write for the people and their conditions. Peter Onwudinjo avers:

Pidgin springs from the template of the grammar, syntax, idioms and semantics of African languages, especially West African. As such, it is naturally suited to nourish and express the African thought patterns without adulteration. It is best suited to retain the open-mouthed laughter, the throbbing drums, the alluring dances, the proverbs, the ancestral spirits, the folktales, the smells of the urban poor, the boulevards of the urban rich, their fast cars, the rolling plains. Indeed all the natural and social forces that enabled Africa to survive the pressures under which some races crumbled and disappeared (Onwudinjo, 2007: vii).

It is clearly this capability of Pidgin to command enormous public appeal because of its spread, flexibility and the creative possibilities, which have made it to yield creative possibilities for the Nigerian poet. Hence, it is an idea that tends toward Nigeria national literature as explained by Onwudinjo during an interview with Gloria M.T. Emezue;

Nigerian national literature is that which articulates the state of the nation, is aware of the economic, political and psychological problems of the polity. And then, not only the problems, but also the prospects of nationhood. In fact all these put together form Nigeria’s national poetry and Nigeria’s national literature. It is similar to what W.B. Yeats did for the Irish people by creating, for the first time, what could be called Irish literature. (Emezue, 2009)

He states that De Wahala for Wazobia is an example of such works that reflects the Nigerian national spirit. From the foregoing it is obvious that a new era of poetry is at hand, something beautiful, so passionate, alluring and pleasurable to the minds of the Nigerian readers for whom the poetry are written for and that is the New Nigerian Voices or ‘Alter-native’ poets. It is in line with this call that some African critics clamour for the decolonization of several western influences in the poetry of African poets, thus informing the background of our study.

Peter Onwudinjo and the New Nigerian Voices

The emergence of a younger school of poetry with distinguishing temperaments from the new Nigerian counterparts was a welcome development for Nigerian writing G.M.T. Emezue (2009). These poets occupy the rank of the third generation poets. The more notable ones are, Niyi Osundare, Femi Fatoba, Tanure Ojaide, Osman Enekwe, Obiora Udechukwu, Odia Ofeimun, Harry Garuba, Funso Aiyejina, Ada Ugah, Catherine Acholonu, Chinweizu, Ezenwa-Ohaeto, Tess Onwueme, Kemi Alandade-Ilori, E. B Asibong, Silas Obidiah, Idi Bukan, Deanja Abdullahi, Uduma Kalu, Olu Obafemi, Nnimmo Bassey, Akachi Adimora Eziego, J. O. J. Nwachukwu Agbada, Fidelis Okoro, Chidi Opara, Peter Onwudinjo among others. They fall within the school of committed poets whose objective is to communicate directly with the common people using plain language, local expressions and settings and down to earth subjects. The philosophy of these poets aligns with that of William Wordsworth, who
puts it succinctly that poetry is man talking to men (Wordsworth, 1976:30). Dennis Brutus earlier projected the view of the Alter-native poets in an interview with Bernth Lindfors:

You ought to write for the ordinary person, for the man who drives the bus, or the man who carries the baggage at the airport, and the woman who clears the ashtrays in the restaurant. If you can write poetry, which makes sense to those people, then there is some justification for writing poetry. Otherwise, you have no business writing poetry. And therefore, there should be no ornament because ornament gets in the way (Lindfors, 1972:26).

Oswald Mtshali, the South African poet also concedes:

The English we use in our poetry is not the Queen’s language as written by say Wordsworth and Coleridge. It is the language of urgency which we use because we have got an urgent message to deliver to anyone who cares to listen to it. We have not got the time to embellish this urgent message with unnecessary and cumbersome ornaments like rhyme, iambic pentameter, abstract figures of speech, and an ornate and lofty style. We will indulge in these luxuries which we can ill-afford at the moment when we are free people. Not the harsh realities that in part and parcel of the black man’s life (Mtshali, 1976:35).

Apart from the need to decolonized Nigerian poetry, Emezue notes that the poets must also “come down among the spectators absorbed in the throwing of fists at the antics of those on the other side pushing to the front” (Emezue, 2000). This is the foundation of the New Nigerian poets, to create poetry that will achieve purposeful social changes; poetry gleaned from the day to day experiences of the Nigerian and African people; poetry that speaks to the common man and advocate his freedom and betterment in the oppressed world of wickedness, cultural imperialism, political instability, social decay, cultural dislocation and economic quagmire.

Interestingly, Peter Onwudinjo belongs to this younger school of poets that uses the medium of poetry to comment on the prevailing socio-economic and political situations in Nigeria. Onwudinjo treats thematic issues with an alluring difference. In some of his works, for example, Women of Biafra and Other Poems (2000), Songs of the Fireplace (2006), Because I’m Woman (2006), Songs of Wazobia (2006), De Wahala for Wazobia (2007), Camp Fire Songs (2007), etc., we see a true blend of poetry and the indigenous NPE, artistic style of proverbs and aphorisms, as well as thematic preoccupations with poverty, exploitation, and corruption as social concerns that affect people individually and collectively.

Theoretical framework

This section explores relevant theories that are critical to the major concerns of this study. One of the theoretical frameworks which underpin this paper is the sociolinguistics approach. Sociolinguistics can be defined as the study of the relationship between language and society (Hudson 1990, Holmes,
2001 Adeyanju, 2007). This implies that Sociolinguistics tries to answer the question that when two people from different societies meet and try to communicate, what should they do? (Stockwell, 2002) state that where two or more speech communities come in contact, a lingua franca or common language of communication emerges. The emergent language can serve as a substrate or an auxiliary to the main or superstrate one(s) or serve as just a means of business transaction or even rise to become an international language. This is the situation in the Nigerian linguistic cline where the English language (superstrate) which was introduced had been altered, while the original language (native language); (substrate) are still undergoing transformations /reconstructions. These reconstructions encourage the expansion of NPE which is widely used today in every sector in Nigeria. Nigerian pidgin language is thus a creative language of imminent needs.

Therefore, NPE is relevant as a language of literary ingenuity in Nigeria because a culture is better understood and promoted through its language since language serves as a mirror to a society and its cultural practices. Brooks (1964) observes that:

\[
\text{It is through the magic of language that man comes eventually to understand to an impressive degree the environment to which he lives and, still more surprising, gains an insight into his own nature and his own condition. (Brooks, 1964)}
\]

In addition, Muhlhausler argues that, “the principal criteria of whether a word (language) is good or bad are whether it contributes to social harmony and if it is understood by a reasonable proportion of the speech community” (Muhlhausler, 1997:173). Peter Onwudijo is aware of this position and he constantly makes reference to the significance of pidgin to his immediate environment in his poems. Saussure’s theory of semiology is also relevant to this paper. The questionable position of pidgin in Nigeria can be explained from Saussure’s idea of the signifiers and signified. While the signifier is more stable, the signified varies between people and contexts, an idea that suggests that signifying systems are socially or historically inconsistent. Therefore, no object, word or sound image (signifier) in English has a stable meaning (signified) attached to it. For instance the object ‘cup’ has varying names in different cultures. Also, the word ‘furar fila’ means ‘to jump the queue’ in Brazilian Portuguese while it means ‘to cut the line in’ in Portugal Portuguese. As a result, signifiers shift from position to position which encourages lack of fixation on English and this developed PE which leads to multiplicities of meanings bearing Nigerian cultural idiosyncrasies.

PETER ONWUDINJO’S DE WAHALA FOR WAZOBIA (2007)

Peter Onwudinjo’s De Wahala for Wazobia is a poetry collection which draws on the palatable and pitiable state of affairs in Nigeria. The title ‘De Wahala for Wazobia’ means “The Trouble with Nigeria” in Standard English and also equates Chinua Achebe’s similar title in English, The Trouble with Nigeria (1983) where he discussed several problems posing threats to the nation. The title “wazobia” is a tripodal name that reflects the tripodal structure of Nigeria created by the British colonialists. “Wazobia” is a coinage from three major indigenous languages for “come.” Yoruba say
“wa,” Hausa say “zo,” while Igbo say “bia”—“Wazobia.” This tripod structure which also connotes the country, Nigeria, is as a result of the amalgamation of Nigeria in 1914 by Lord Lugard which made possible a coagulation of people from various ethnic, social, languages, cultural and religious groups. Hence, the collection bothers on the issue of amalgamation and the socio-economic, political and religious problems facing Nigeria since then. Among those issues and problems are language and cultural clash, religious violence, ethnicity and nepotism, corruption, election malpractices, neocolonialism and insecurity etc. These among other forms of vices have eaten deep into the fabrics of the nation which continue to militate against the development of the country. The poet expresses that:

De Wahala for Wazobia is a sustained evocation of the landscape of dilemma in the socio-economic condition of the Nigerian nation. De Wahala sails close to facts, closely hugging the reefs of reality in Nigerian society (Onwudinjo, 2007: vii).

The collection opens with the assessment of the contrast between European and African languages and ethos. In his opinion, he believes that the African mentality and European mind set cannot be one and so is their languages and manner of expressions. In the title “Turn Water no De Full Pot” the poet sings:

... make I tell you/
de two no dey gree at all at all,
Afrikaman mind and oyibo mind dey/
different, different,
dem no dey rhyme at all;
I dey way wey Afrikaman de see im world
as e make sense make meaning to am/
no be so for Oyibo man-
o
de two no dey rhyme ... (lines 6-11)

It is in this use of contrasts, both in terms of “Afrikaman mind and oyibo mind” (line 8) and in terms of the familiarity of the Afrikaman world contrasted by the oddity of the other, that Onwudinjo stresses the importance of Pidgin, for it is described as “na we flesh and blood” (line 13). Here, the image of flesh and blood, body substances, becomes a metaphor for the value of Pidgin. He further personifies and humanizes pidgin as he avers;

she be our ara na oma,
she been grow up here/
she be one of us/
she understand our ways
na im make e no de make mistake/
wen she dey speak our tongue;
e no surprise me set/
how daughter no go fit speak/
im mother tongue?
If she no fit na who go? (3)
Na only pidgin be de lingo wey de fit/
carry Afrikanman thought reach Nglisi stand chim chim no shaking/
like concrete column, na im make I de sing my song/for pidgin (lines 14-26).

Historically, African prominent poets, such as Leopold Senghor and Birango Diop have ascribed feminist attributes to the decipherment and glorification of the continent by referring to her as ‘mother Africa’. The use of the pronoun ‘she’ in the above lines equally parallel the same adulation given to Africa. Hence, the same way that the Negritude poets appreciates Africa is similar to Onwudijo’s recognition of Pidgin English as our, “mother tongue” (line 22).

The poet moves on to appreciate pidgin’s ability to relate comfortably with the peasants, the downtrodden and the lower. For instance, in the poem “I Go De Sing my Song for Pidgin”, the poet defends the choice of pidgin language by recognizing his people’s inability to understand his previous poetry he had written in English language. He believes that by writing in Pidgin, his people will easily understand his message because English language cannot solve their problems:

… But wen I come yarn finish/
one woman wey dey my front there
whisper to her neighbour say/
_Nwoke ahu oshi ini?/_
Wetin de man talk?
Na dat one clear my eye well well say/
Oyibo gramatika no de work
for hungry wazobia/ (lines 5-12)

By writing in the pidgin language, Onwudijo is able to draw attention to his own conflicting circumstances and the plight of his people. In the poem, he gets taunted by his people for initially using “Oyibo gramatika” (line 11), when “one woman wey dey my front there whisper to her neighbour say…Wetin de man talk?” (Lines 6-7) The poet indicates that “De wretched of wazobia” (line 14) encounters enormous problems; they “no de hear oyibo gramatika” (line 15) because “de hand wey de rule wazobia no care wether wazobia children go school/or no go school” (lines 17-18). The aspect of this hopeless situation which the poet most detests is the government’s negligence to the plight of the masses. The poet therefore laments the effective use of “Oyibo gramatika” (line 11) to keep the “hungry wazobia” (line 12) in poverty. The emphatic note on which the poem ends reiterates in subsequent lines that the consequence:

_na im make ignorance full everywhere./
_na im make poverty full everywhere,
_na im make hunger full everywhere … (lines 19-21).

The issue of language development through the absorption of elements from other languages is also noticeable in the poem, with reference to words such as, _ara na oma, Nwoke ahu oshi ini_ and _umuahia_. This adds yet another dimension to Pidgin poetry, since his work is the product of cultural experience from the eastern region of Nigeria. From the poem, it is obvious that average members of the society
will find it hard to understand poetry communicated in condensed English which the poet says is the lingua franca of the country. Consequently, the inability to understand such poetry adversely negates any idea of revolution as citizens are unfamiliar with the messages in such poetry. The poet not only laments about his people’s inability to comprehend English-laden poetry, but he is disgruntled about their persistent pitiable conditions worsened by the insensitive attitude of the leaders. As a result, the poet resolves to educate his people through pidgin:

Na im make I come swear say/
I no go blow oyibo gramatika again,
from now de go/
I go begin de slaughter my ram/
for de other side of im throat where my dagger no go jam bone/
for dis time de go,
I go de sing my song for pidgin (lines 22-28).

The poet moves to unveil several vices and problems bedeviling the society in subsequent poems. First, in the poem “Things Wey Get K-Leg”, the poet addresses the issue of “head count” (line 2) which he argues, “na to get owonga subsidy/ for rogue politicians to share” (lines 3-4). The poet concern is not on the figure as he heartily expressed but on greediness and dishonesty of the politicians. He feels that the “rogue politicians” uses the counting exercise to, “get owonga subsidy” which is done by ridiculous and superfluous counting. He satirizes this excessive acquisitive mentality, as he admonishes politicians’ covetousness as they count “sand wey de Sahel” (line 6), “cassava stick” (line 7) and even “water hyacinth wey de float for water” (line 9) as part of the counting exercise. Thus the issue of corruption here is comprehensive, and it is explored with a peculiar wit associated with the language. The poet utilizes earthy imagery, the type that recalls to the mind familiar objects but in a manner that is both fresh and original. Consequently, he warns the leaders with a prophetic note on the calamity that awaits them:

As for corrupt politicians/
and de greedy wazobians wey de urge them on,
don’t worry/when time reach/
person wey take hunger swallow razor
go pay with a bloody nyash (lines 12-16).

Here, the issue becomes critical as the poet employs disarming humour and exaggerated imageries such as “razor” (line 15) and “bloody nyash” (16) in order to prod the reader into a realization of the enormity of the political abnormalities in the society. Still on the issue of abnormalities, the poet goes on to condemn the exponential rise in unemployment curve in Nigeria which he thinks is caused by nepotism and favoritism. In the poem “As Man Know Man”, he thinks nepotism and favoritism are killing the political and economic growth of the country because, “to get job, na as man know man; to get promotion/na as man know man/ to pass jamb/na as man know man, even to get chance for interview…na as man know man for wazo” (lines 3-6). The system hardly encourage merit and the
poet laments that such practices should not be allowed to germinate in a society that have potential visions and plans for a more befitting tomorrow.

In a generation where the reading culture is almost dead and where not many read for enjoyment and learning purpose, the poet in the poem “Dem sow Corruption like Mellon seeds” decries the country’s degenerating educational system. He is unhappy with students because “buy book na lie/borrow book for library na lie” (lines 4-5). The poet remembers with special fondness when academic still had some prestige. It was a period when books were available and when students were yearning to read and learn, but such era is long gone as, “de few books wey remain at all na de grandpapa books wey Lord Lugard/and Lander Brothers been read for school” (lines 7-9). The allusion to Lord Lugard and Landers Brothers evokes the days when education was bright in Nigeria and not now when “na just to come class come…de plan to do wayo for exam when time to write am reach na im some guys and babes sabi” (lines 11-13). Students of today are no more willing to read and academics is fast losing its taste. The situation is even worsened by institutions management who select student representative, an unethical manner that goes even to the level of national politics.

**Conclusion**

There is no doubt that this collection illustrates the blend of serious issues and language experimentation which contradicts some of the recent prevalent views that Pidgin is suited for only comic situations. The poems may appear humorous in some sections, but it captures with telling accuracy the post-colonial problems in Nigerian. The lyric quality of the poems and the use of pidgin, orality, metaphor, and allusions combine to produce an innovative critique of the country’s socio-political and economic problems. Hence, Onwudinjo and other Pidgin poets have established a viable poetic tradition, and in their achievement, they have bridged the gap between oral communication and the written medium. Therefore, Pidgin poetry is strongly becoming part of the poetic traditions that coalesce to make modern Nigerian poetry worthy of critical attention.
References


Metaphorical Creativity in the Conceptualization of the Heart in Al-Ghazali’s *The Revival of the Religious Sciences* (*Iḥyāʾ ʿulūm ad-dīn*)

Afeef Badri
University of Sfax, Tunisia

Abstract

Zoltán Kövecses introduced the notion of “context-induced creativity” that he argues that it “has not so far been systematically explored in the cognitive linguistic literature on metaphor”. Research on conceptual metaphor of the heart has lacked focus on exploring creativity in the metaphorical expressions utilized to conceptualize the heart. Also there is very limited research on the heart metaphor in religious and particularly Sufi discourse. To my knowledge only Nørager (2007) and Maalej (2008) have explored this area. The present paper applies a conceptual metaphor paradigm with special reference to Kövecses’ (2015) model of metaphorical creativity to study creativity in the conceptualization of the heart in Al-Ghazali’s *The Revival of the Religious Sciences*. Corpus analysis has indicated that the novelty and creativity of heart metaphors are induced by a range of contextual variables: (1) the immediate physical setting, (2) knowledge about the major participants in the discourse, (3) the immediate cultural context, (4) the immediate social setting, and (5) the immediate linguistic context and that creativity is dependent on available conventional conceptual resources.

Keywords: conceptual metaphor, Sufi discourse, context, metaphorical creativity
Introduction

The introduction includes three parts a background of the research, a review of the literature, and a methodology section.

Background

Early version of conceptual metaphor theory with (Johnson and Lakoff, 2003) has neglected context in the study of metaphor. Later development of the theory has oriented the focus towards studying metaphor in discourse. This tendency assigned much importance to the contextual dimension in the production and comprehension of metaphor that started to be viewed as “products of context” (Gibbs and Lonergan, 2009, p. 251). Not only does context attune conventional metaphors to the discursive situation but it also triggers the creation of entirely novel metaphors. This type of metaphorical creativity is labeled “context-induced creativity”. Kövecses (2015) suggests that the role of context in generating creative metaphors has not been systematically explored. Metaphorical creativity itself apart from Kövecses (2010 and 2015) has received little focus (brief discussion in Gibbs, 1994, Lakoff and Turner, 1989, and Lakoff and Johnson, 1999).

Works that studied the metaphorical conceptualization of the heart (Yu, 2009, Nørager, 2007, Blechman, 2005, Siahaan, 2008, Swan, 2009, and Gutiérrez Pérez, 2008) have not paid much attention to the context except for Blechman (2005) who studied the portrayal of the heart in Western culture and investigated the implications of its persistence in contemporary public discourse and media products. (Yu, 2009) also studied « the cultural conception of the mental heart » in a cultural and historical context of the ancient Chinese philosophy and medicine and modern Chinese language and discourse with a cross-cultural comparison of Chinese with western (English) conception of the heart focusing on uncovering cultural models underlying conceptualizations. And also Yu analyzed a Chinese essay entitled “On the ‘Heart’ for the New Year” Focusing on the conceptions of “heart” that make the Chinese cultural models for morality. He studied the role of underlying conceptual metaphors and metonymies in creating textual coherence.

Furthermore there is very limited research on the heart metaphor in religious and particularly Sufi discourse. Nørager (2007) studied the functions of particular religious metaphors in the religious experience from a psychological point of view and Maalej (2008) studied cultural embodiment in the conceptualization of heart metaphor in Tunisian Arabic culture comparing it with Western conceptualization of the mind. As for metaphorical creativity in the conceptualization of the heart and the role of immediate context in influencing this creativity, none of the above mentioned studies has explored the issue of creativity and to my knowledge no research has done this.

The present paper studies metaphorical conceptualization of the heart in Al-Ghazali’s *The Revival of the Sciences of Religious (Iḥyāʿ ʿulūm ad-dīn)* focusing on analyzing creative and novel instances. The major goal is to investigate the role of the immediate social, cultural, physical and linguistic context in the production of unique novel and creative heart metaphors and to study the role of established conventional metaphors in sustaining novel mappings.
Review of the literature

The literature review part presents conceptual metaphor theory, metaphorical creativity, and the contextual variables affecting creativity

Conceptual metaphor theory

Conceptual metaphor is defined as a set of fixed pattern of ontological correspondences across conceptual domains. Knowledge about conceptual domains and inferences are projected systematically from source to target. It consists in understanding and conceptualizing one domain of experience in terms of another domain of experience (Lakoff and Johnson, 2003, p. 6).

Contrary to traditional views where metaphor was assigned a peripheral status in the study of language and considered as ornamental linguistic device characterizing extraordinary aspects of language use such as poetic creativity and elevated styles, the cognitive approach advocates the centrality of metaphor to the process of meaning construction and understanding and to the conceptual system. Metaphorical reasoning pervades not just language (in ordinary as equal as in poetic language) but in thought and actions as well. “We have found that our ordinary conceptual system, in terms of which we both think and act, is fundamentally metaphorical in nature” (Lakoff and Johnson, 1980, p. 4).

The metaphor LOVE IS A JOURNEY disconfirms the claim that views metaphor as an aspect of language. The different expressions about love such as “our relationship has hit a dead-end street”, “our relationship is spinning its wheels”, “we’re going in different directions”, “our relationship is at a cross-road” do not represent different, distinct and unrelated metaphors. They are rather different instantiations of the same conceptual metaphor LOVE IS A JOURNEY. Thus linguistic realizations of metaphor are manifestations of and evidence for the existence of metaphorical reasoning. Cross-domains mappings support the primacy of metaphorical reasoning over the linguistic realization (Lakoff and Johnson, 1999, p. 116).

Metaphor and context

These studies advocate the centrality of context. Metaphors are not decontextualized by contrast they are “products of discourse” (Gibbs and Lonergan, 2009, p. 251) and tightly associated with it. As a supportive argument for the claim that context plays a crucial role in metaphorical conceptualization Kövecses (2015, p. 9) presented the following conversation illustrating contextualized metaphorical usage:

(1) “You seem much happier than the last time I saw you. You used to be discontented and easily distracted, but now you seem to be contented and at peace with yourself.”
“My wife is an anchor.”

(2) “You sound like you’ve become bored with life. You used to be so eager for new experiences, but now the old zest for life seems to have become dulled.”
“My wife is an anchor” (Kövecses, 2015, p. 7).

In conceptualizing his life, emotional state, and relationship with his wife the speaker employed a metaphorical expression “My wife is an anchor” that combines three metaphors: LIFE IS A JOURNEY (goal, directions, destination, progress, losing direction...), HUMAN RELATIONS ARE PHYSICAL CONNECTIONS (bond, attachment, breaking connection...) and EMOTIONAL STABILITY/STRENGTH IS PHYSICAL STABILITY/STRENGTH (support, depend on, rely on, sustain). The lexical term “anchor” matches LIFE IS A JOURNEY metaphor because an anchor is a device utilized in sea journeys, it also matches HUMAN RELATIONS ARE PHYSICAL CONNECTIONS metaphor as it is attached physically to ships and it corresponds to the metaphor EMOTIONAL STABILITY/STRENGTH IS PHYSICAL STABILITY/STRENGTH as it is a device prototypically employed to keep a ship from moving away from a safe location. In the second part of the conversations the speaker employs the same expression “my wife is an anchor” to conceptualize difficulties that emerged in his relationship with his wife particularly concerning achieving life goals. The metaphorical expression in this context keeps the two metaphors LIFE IS A JOURNEY and HUMAN RELATIONS ARE PHYSICAL CONNECTIONS but it replaces EMOTIONAL STABILITY/STRENGTH IS PHYSICAL STABILITY/STRENGTH metaphor by the metaphor LACK OF FREEDOM TO ACT IS LACK OF FREEDOM TO MOVE. This last metaphor still pertains to LIFE IS JOURNEY metaphors but it brings in focus a novel aspect of the speaker’s relationship with his wife namely his attitudes toward her as an impediment to motion and to attaining life goals. Thus the context generated two interpretations to the same metaphorical expression “anchor” emotional stability as opposed to lack of freedom of action.

Metaphorical creativity

(Lakoff and Turner, 1989 p. 70-71) studied creativity in poetic metaphor. They maintained that poetic language depends on the same metaphorical mechanism available for ordinary people. Creativity is attained via three processes of extension, elaboration and combination or questioning of the available conventional metaphorical mapping. They viewed innovative metaphors as supporting evidence for the existence of established conceptual mappings as creative metaphors depend on the extension of conventional metaphors. They argued that metaphorical mapping operates under strong constraints that permit only certain features of the source domain to be projected. The strength of human imagination and
creativity cannot override these constraints. It can only extend and elaborate existing mappings within established conventional metaphors in novel and infinite ways (Lakoff and Turner, 1989, p. 26). Gibbs (1994, p. 7) also views that poetic and creative metaphors represent innovative instantiations of conventional mappings. For example Horace's conceptualization of death as the "eternal exile of the raft" elaborates both the kind of journey and the way of travelling in THE DEATH AS A DEPARTURE metaphor. Raft is an unusual way of travelling that takes human despite their will the same way as exile is an undesired and forced state (Lakoff and Turner, 1989, p. 68-67).

The aforementioned literature has studied only limited decontextualized examples of metaphorical creativity. It did not investigate the phenomenon in a systematic way nor did it explore the role of context in generating innovative metaphors.

Context-Induced Creativity

Kövecses (2015 and 2010) elaborately studied what he calls “context-induced creativity” and “Context-induced metaphors” that are the products of the context. They do not emerge from any basic bodily experience or any correlation of experience (Kövecses, 2015, p. 116). Creativity consists in utilizing unused conceptual materials from the source to structure the target domain. A case in point is the metaphor EUROPE IS A BUILDING WITHOUT FIRE-EXIT where fire-exit is a conceptual element that pertains to the source domain of building and that has not been used previously (Kövecses, 2015, p. 99). Lakoff and Turner (1989, p. 64-65) suggested various ways that are utilized to generate creative metaphors among them are extending and elaborating. First, since metaphorical mapping is necessarily partial in the sense that it does not project every detail feature of the source domain, poets can search for unmapped details or slots to make novel inferences. This is called extending. The second process consists in the “nonconventional elaborating of schemas by filling in the slots in a creative and imaginative manner that adds new conceptual content.

Kövecses (2015, p. 102) classified the range of contextual variables that induce metaphorical creativity into 5 major factors (1) the effect of immediate physical setting, (2) the effect of knowledge about the major participants in the discourse, (3) the effect of the immediate cultural context, (4) the effect of the immediate social setting, and (5) the effect of the immediate linguistic context itself

The effect of knowledge about major entities in the discourse on metaphor use

The effect of knowledge about major entities participating in the discourse is related to knowledge about the discourse participants and the influence of personal concerns and interests in metaphorical choices.

The effect of the immediate cultural context on metaphor use

The salience of some concepts and values in a particular culture makes them more prominent than others in metaphorical conceptualization (Kövecses, 2015, p. 101).
The effect of the immediate social setting on metaphor use

Society may be characterized by certain traits and may have particular concerns and interests.

The effect of the linguistic context (co-text)

The effect of the surrounding discourse involves knowledge about the linguistic context (the cotext) of preceding discourse units. Previous discourse on the same topic may provide a source for creative metaphors. Former metaphors in previous discourse concerning the same topic may be exploited in a variety of ways; elaborating, extending, questioning; negating, reflecting on, ridiculing, and taking advantage of (Kövecses, 2015, p. 181). To illustrate the effect of this type of context Kövecses (2010, p. 293) cited the example of a headline from the Wall Street Journal Europe (January 6, 2003): “The Americanization of Japan’s car industry shifts into higher gear”. This headline exemplifies the effect of the linguistic context in producing novel metaphors. “Shift into higher gear” is driven from the domain of car industry to convey the increased speed characterizing the process of Americanizing Japan cars.

The Combined Effect of Factors on Metaphor Use

The aforementioned factors can be conjoined together and the conceptualizer seeks to be coherent with the multi-aspects of every communicative situation. This is called “the combined effect of factors” (Kövecses, 2015, p. 113).

Methodology

Relying on Kövecses’ (2015) model of context-induced metaphorical creativity this paper analyzes metaphorical conceptualization in Al-Ghazali’s The Revival of the Religious Sciences (Iḥyāʾ ʿulūm ad-dīn). The book was written by Al-Ghazali (1058-1111). It reflects on religion (faith, worship, religious knowledge, morality, etc) from a Sufi perspective. It has been considered amongst the most read and most influential works in the Islamic and particularly Sufi literature. Al-Zabidi (1311H) states: “were the books of Islam all to be lost, excepting only the Iḥyaa’, it would suffice to replace them all”. Imam Nawawi (606) stated that “Iḥyaa’ was about to be a Qur’an” (the most read work in the Muslim world, after the Qur’an). The choice of the book is completely random. I read the book a year ago (2014) and when I reviewed literature about conceptual metaphor of the heart and metaphorical creativity I retained that in the Iḥyaa’ there are a lot of metaphors of the heart among them many creative ones and I decided that it could be a topic of research. The paper analyzed the entire book available on Al-Ghazali’s website. Metaphors are compiled and displayed in a tabular format. Only metaphor deemed creative and innovative are analyzed. The analysis took into consideration the five major variables of metaphorical creativity notably; (1) the effect of immediate physical setting, (2) the effect of knowledge about the major participants in the
discourse, (3) the effect of the immediate cultural context, (4) the effect of the immediate social setting, and (5) the effect of the immediate linguistic context.

To guarantee accuracy and objectivity of analysis the study relied on MIP model of metaphor identification. It is based on four procedures. The first procedure consists in entire reading of the text and establishing an understanding of the meaning. The second procedure concerns the division of the text/discourse into lexical units. The third procedure requires: a) establishing the meaning of each lexical unit in context by taking into account preceding and following units, b) determining if the lexical unit has a basic current-contemporary sense other than the one utilized in the current context. Basic sense tends to be concrete (related to perception of the five senses), associated with the body actions, more precise (opposed to vague), and historically older. (c) If the lexical unit has a more basic sense different with its meaning in the current context, decision should be taken regarding whether the context meaning contrasts the basic meaning and whether it can be interpreted in the light of it. Finally, the fourth procedure consists in marking the lexical unit as metaphorical after comparing its meaning with the basic meaning (Erlbaum Associates (Pragglejaz Group), 2009, p. 3).

Corpus analysis

The analysis does not intend to be any kind of quantitative analysis. It is mainly qualitative. The purpose is not to count metaphors but it is to investigate originality and creativity in metaphorical usages and analyze contextual variables that facilitate the emergence of such metaphors. Krennmayr (2011, p. 175) suggests that some texts exhibit abundant presence of conventional metaphorical language common to most language use but they do not contain specially striking metaphorical instances. These texts are not experienced as distinctively metaphoric.

Heart is a key and central concept in the Sufi discourse and experience. Inayat Khan (1999) maintains that “if anyone asks what Sufism is, what kind of religion is it, the answer is that Sufism is the religion of heart, the religion in which the thing of primary importance is to seek God in the heart of mankind”. Frager explaining the significance of heart for Sufis, states that “The heart is a temple that has been placed by God in everyone, a temple that houses the Divine spark within us”. “The journey to God takes place within the heart, and for centuries Sufis have been traveling deep within themselves, into the secret chamber of the heart where lover and Beloved share the ecstasy of union” (Vaughan-Lee, 2006).

The Sufi is someone who approaches the Divine Reality through the heart. The heart is an intelligence beyond the intellect, a knowing that operates at a subconscious level, and the only human faculty expansive enough to embrace the infinite qualities of the universe (Helmsinki, 2000).

Al-Ghazali (1058-1111H) employed the term “qalb” to refer both to the flesh organ and to the “subtle tenuous substance” that he calls al-Latifah al-Ruhaniyah (spiritual subtlety). This subtle substance connected to the physical heart is spiritual in nature and it is the substance by which the real essence of man is defined. It represents the locus of knowledge
and intellelction. It pertains to the realm of the sciences of mystical unveiling (‘ulum al-mukaashafa) and it represents the central concern of this science. It is also viewed by Al-Ghazali as a Divine matter that transcends the capacity of intelligences (‘ukul) and understandings (afhem) to perceive and discern its nature and essence.

One of the key aspects characterizing the mystic experience is its “ineffability” and “incommunicableness” as it constitutes “a new awareness of other levels of reality that are not accessible to normal consciousness” (James, 1902). It is especially an experience of highly abstract, vague, and inaccessible to the domain of perception. The Sufi experience represents typical Target domains that are “abstract, diffuse and lack clear delineation; as a result, they “cry out” for metaphorical conceptualization” (Kövecses, 2002, p. 20).

Cacciri (1998, p. 121) suggests that the chief function of conceptual metaphor is to “bridge” from abstract domains to perceptual experiential domains and to describe abstract ideas that are inexpressible by literal language. Given that the heart is a spiritual subtle substance that pertains to the unseen universe of spirits (‘aalem al-malakut) Al-Ghazali utilized several tangible examples to explain what he calls “the marvels of the heart”. He relied on a variety of conceptual metaphors that range from entrenched metaphors to highly creative metaphors.

Kövecses’s (2015) study of metaphorical creativity suggested that there are various degrees of creativity from highly creative to partially creative to entrenched and conventionalized metaphors but it did not set a method to judge the degree of creativity of metaphors. The present study relied on three criteria to judge metaphorical creativity. First as suggested in (Kövecses, 2015, p. 99) creativity consists in utilizing unused conceptual materials from the source to structure the target domain. So metaphors that contain the mapping of novel source elements that are not mapped in conventional metaphors are considered innovative. The second criterion is to elaborate conventionally mapped elements in an innovative way. The third criterion is the novelty of the source domain for examples some sources have never been used before to conceptualize the concept of heart (koveceses, 2010 and 2015, Gibbs, 1994, and Lakoff and Turner, 1989). The verification of whether a source domain was utilized in the conceptualization of the heart or whether a source element is novel is done by considering (Lakoff, et al, 1992)’s master metaphor list and previous works cited in the introduction about the conceptualization of the heart.

Only conceptual metaphors that are deemed creative are compiled and analyzed but if all metaphors describing the heart are collected the number would be much bigger than what is found. Corpus analysis has yielded the following major conceptual metaphors:

THE HEART IS A MIRROR REFLECTING DIVINE KNOWLEDGE
THE HEART IS A CONTAINER
THE HEART IS A MATERIAL
THE HEART IS A RULING KING IN BODY KINGDOM
THE HEART IS A BUILDING
THE HEART IS A TRAVELER IN A SPIRITUAL JOURNEY
THE HEART IS THE LOCUS OF INTELLECTION
THE HEART IS A SOURCE OF LIGHT
THE HEART IS A FIELD FOR GROWING GOOD AND EVIL

This section presents an in-depth analysis of five conceptual metaphors. Each metaphor exemplifies a type of context-induced creativity. The analysis central focus is to explain the way context motivates metaphorical creativity by investigating the factors that primed, induced, prompted, and facilitated the choice of certain source domains and certain source elements to be mapped onto the target.

**The effect of the immediate physical setting on metaphor creativity**

The immediate physical context concerns physical events, properties of the physical environment, and perceptual aspects of the physical setting. The physical context may motivate the extension of an established conventional metaphor. This type of creativity is illustrated by the conceptual metaphor of **THE HEART IS A TRAVELER IN A SPIRITUAL JOURNEY** and **THE BODY IS A VEHICLE FOR THE HEART**

This tenuous subtlety is (part of the human being) that is in pursuit of attaining closeness to God because it is a Divine matter from which it originates and to which it returns. As for body, it is its vehicle (ride) that it mounts and through which it proceeds to its pursuit. The body for it is like a camel for a body in the path of pilgrimage and like a reservoir storing water needed for the body (my translation).

The conventional metaphor life is a journey discussed in (Johnson and Lakoff, 2003) is creatively elaborated by exploiting elements from the physical setting. The schema of a journey contains only a few components such as travelers, path, and initial and final locations. It can be elaborated by specifying which kind of a journey (land, sea, and air), types of vehicles, features of the trajectory, and other elements. Thus the schema provides a range of varied options for enriching the conceptualization and comprehension of the target domain. Schemas of journey can also be non-conventionally elaborated by filling in the slots in a creative and imaginative manner that adds new conceptual content (Lakoff and Turner, 1989, p. 64-65).

Arabs used to travel by camels and horses for different purposes (pilgrimage, trade, and war). Their journeys were long and take months and even more. In long travelling in desert they needed to carry with them provision (water and food supply). The journey in **THE HEART IS A TRAVELLER IN A SPIRITUAL JOURNEY** is an unconventional journey that contains unconventional elements and participants. The traveller is the heart (a spiritual subtlety). The vehicle is the body (a physical entity that has an intelligible existence) The provision is the body (as source of life that provides the heart with necessary conditions of existence).
The path is different stages of worship.
The destination is God and the hereafter.

What is considered as most innovative in this metaphor is the type of the traveller. In LIFE IS A JOURNEY, LOVE IS A JOURNEY, and ARGUMENT IS A JOURNEY metaphors the travellers are human beings that have tangible physical existence. But in THE HEART IS A TRAVELLER IN A SPIRITUAL JOURNEY metaphor the element of traveller is imaginatively and creatively elaborated. It is a spiritual, vague, and ineffable subtlety that pertains to a realm of existence inaccessible to human perception riding an intelligible vehicle.

The second innovative aspect is the nature of the relationship between the vehicle and the traveller in THE BODY AS A VEHICLE FOR THE HEART. As a traveller cannot travel without a vehicle and a provision in desert and as the heart cannot have a life and an existence independent of the body, the body is considered as a vehicle needed not only to carry it but also to provide it with indispensible food and water provision to remain alive and proceed in his journey. In a context different than desert a traveller may still continue to exist even without his vehicle, but in a long and tough journey in physical setting like desert the vehicle is crucial for a traveller to survive as it supplies him with vital provision. Thus it is the effect of the immediate physical context of travelling in desert that motivated the choice of the kind of journey and specified the type of relationship between the traveller and the vehicle.

The effect of knowledge about major entities in the discourse on metaphor use

The effect of knowledge about major entities participating in the discourse is related to the knowledge about the conceptualizer and the influence of personal concerns and interests in metaphorical choices.

HEARTS ARE CONTAINERS OF FLUIDS CAPABLE OF BEING MOVED/PROVOKED/AGITATED BY SUFI SMAA’

فان القلوب و السرائر خزائن الاسرار... فلا يظهر من القلب عند التحريك الا ما يحويه كما لا يرشح الايناء الا بما فيه فانسماح للقلب صائد و معيار ناطق فلا يصل نفس السماح الى اله الا و قد تحرك فيه ما هو الغالب عليه (66).

Hearts and internal secret substances are cupboards of secrets... when a heart is moved, only what is contained in it appears the same as a vessel reveals only what is inside it. Samaa’ is a truthful touchstone and a speaking criterion for the heart (to test the nature of the heart). When the breath of samaa’ reaches it, it provokes the thing most dominating in it.

HEARTS ARE CONTAINERS is a conventional metaphor that innovatively exploited the conventional CONTAINER metaphor to create a novel metaphor. When Containers of fluids (bottles, vessels) are agitated their contained substances are moved. The motion of substances cannot be achieved without an external provocative factor. The hidden essence and secrets preserved inside the hearts cannot be moved unless provoked by an external stimulus which is Sufi samaa’ that is equivalent to listening in Arabic (samaa’ is a kind of Sufi songs chanted with some kind of musical rhythm (encyclopedia of Britannica). The creativity of this metaphor is triggered by the personal concerns and interests of the conceptualizer. The
conceptualizer is a Sufi who performs dancing on the rhythms of samaa’. Samaa’ and dancing engender different states in the body and the soul. The body becomes agitated and manifests different kinds of involuntary motions. The physical experience of the dancing and the agitated body is recruited and mapped onto the abstract experience of the agitated essences and secrets of the heart. The state of the body reflects the state of the soul (the heart). When the heart as a container is touched and moved by samaa’ its contained substance also gets agitated and moved. The engendered state of the heart is determined by the nature of the contained substance so for example if the heart is filled with love for a human being samaa’ evokes passions and longing towards the beloved person and if the heart is filled only by love to God samaa’ evokes different emotions of yearning to God. Thus samaa’ is creatively conceptualized as a touchstone utilized to test the nature of the essence contained in the heart. This metaphor is also induced by the body experience as the body is also considered as a type of context triggering metaphorical creativity. What is most innovative is using the touchstone of samaa’ to test the essence contained in the heart by moving and agitating it. The agitation and movement are mapped from the state of the body although the state of the body is triggered by the state of the heart which is itself influenced and moved by Samaa’.

The effect of the immediate cultural context on metaphor use

The salience of some concepts and values in a particular culture makes them more prominent than other concepts and values in metaphorical conceptualization (Kövecses, 2015, p. 101).

HEARTS ARE METALS

The creativity of this metaphor is induced by cultural knowledge frames about materials (gold, silver, steel) and the use of fire to purify metals by removing unwanted impurities. HEARTS ARE METALS is a conventional conceptual metaphor but it is the projection of novel elements (not used before) from the source to structure the target that produces creativity. Hearts containing secrets and hidden essences are conceptualized as essences of materials hidden inside those materials. Essences of metals are obtained after being burned by fire to remove impurities. Fire is the touchstone to test the real essence of a metal. Similarly hearts are burned by the fire of samaa’ and the states resulting from samaa’ to reveal their true essences. So samaa’ is a touchstone for proving the essences of hearts. If the heart is attached to material and lustful pleasures the fire of samaa’ will reveal this lustful essence of the heart (for example samaa’ evokes memories of a love experience). And if the heart is attached to spiritual pleasures (prayer, God remembrance, pilgrimage) samaa’ cannot evoke
in it feelings other than the love of God and the desire to be with him the same as a piece of steel for example burned by fire cannot become another thing except a piece of steel.

The effect of the surrounding discourse and previous discourses on the same topic

Surrounding discourse involves knowledge about the linguistic context (the cotext) of preceding discourse units. Previous discourse on the same topic may provide a source for creative metaphors. Former metaphors in previous discourse concerning the same topic may be exploited in a variety of ways; elaborating, extending, questioning; negating, reflecting on, ridiculing, and taking advantage of (Kövecses, 2015, p. 181).

THE HEART IS A MIRROR FOR REFLECTING DIVINE KNOWLEDGE

(Al-Ghazali, vol 3, p. 8)

فَالْقُلْبُ مّثْلُ الْمَرآةِ وَالشَهْوَةُ مّثْلُ الصَّدْأَ وَمْعَانِي الْقُرآنِ مّثْلُ الصُّورِ تَتَرَاءَى فِي

المرأة

The heart is like a mirror and lust is like rust and the meanings of the Holy Qur’ān are like images that appear in the mirror (my translation).

This metaphor was utilized creatively by extending and elaborating it in different manners. It is divided into a number of sub-metaphors:

THE HEART IS A POLISHED MIRROR CAPABLE OF REFLECTING DIVINE KNOWLEDGE.

THE HEART IS A MIRROR TARNISHED BY LUST.

THE HEART IS A MIRROR THAT GETS TARNISHED BY THE ASCENDING SMOKE OF EVIL DEEDS.

SINFUL HEARTS ARE A MIRROR DARKENED BY BEING BREATHED UPON.

THE HEART IS A MIRROR COVERED BY A VEIL.

THE HEART IS A MIRROR REFLECTING THE IMAGE OF ANOTHER MIRROR.

THE HEART IS A MIRROR THAT REFLECTS KNOWLEDGE FROM THE PRESERVED TABLET.

The metaphor of the mirror is the most prominent conceptualization of the heart prevailing in the corpus. It is utilized to conceptualize the heart’s capacity to receive and reflect Divine knowledge concerning God, his attributes, and his deeds. The method of acquiring this type of knowledge is through direct revelation and mystical unveiling (kashf/mukaashafa) that is achieved by purification of the heart to receive Divine illumination. The heart capacity to know is assembled to a mirror in different states. The inability of the mirror to reflect images is caused by five factors: the imperfection of the mirror itself, the rust tarnishing the face of the mirror, the mis-orientation of the mirror (it is not directed towards the desired objects to be reflected), the existence of a veil interfering between the mirror and the image, and finally the ignorance about the right direction from which the image of the object can be viewed.

The five elements of the source domain are creatively exploited to conceptualize the heart as a mirror capable of revealing and reflecting Divine knowledge. Before the age of puberty the heart is incomplete and lacks maturity to receive and reflect knowledge like a
piece of material that is not polished. The dirt tarnishing the mirror is mapped onto passions and sins heaped up over the face of the heart. The misorientation of the mirror is mapped onto the heart wrong direction of being oriented towards following passions or worrying about peripheral life matters. The veil separating the mirror and the image is mapped onto dogmatic beliefs held by the heart (Blindly following dogmatic interpretations of theologians and fanatically following of schools (madhahib)). And finally the ignorance about the right direction is mapped onto the ignorance of the heart about the efficient methods of acquiring knowledge.

THE HEART IS A MIRROR metaphor employs the conventional metaphor KNOWLEDGE IS VISION in a very creative way to conceptualize the heart. Vision in this metaphor is not achieved directly. It is rather mediated by the mirror. The recruitment of the mirror as a medium for acquiring knowledge is triggered by states of cleanness and impurity of the heart resulting from sins and evil qualities and their opposites. These states match different conditions of the mirror (not polished, not cleansed, bright, and polished). The mirror is selected to serve the purpose of the target. It is a target-induced creativity. THE HEART IS A MIRROR METAPHOR is extended and elaborated by mapping each time novel elements from the source domain to create innovative conceptualizations. A tarnished mirror prevents the reflection of images in it is mapped to the rust of sins heaped up on the face of the heart preventing it from reflecting knowledge.

The mirror that is tarnished and then wiped off and tarnished and wiped off again has less clarity and brightness than an originally clear mirror that is polished to increase its shining and clarity. This element is utilized to describe varied levels and states of clarity of hearts. The heart that commits a sin and then follows the evil deed by a good deed has a far less clarity and brightness than a heart that did not have any rust of sins.

And that who follows an evil deed by a good deed and wipes out its trace his heart does not become dark but its shining is reduced the same as a mirror that is breathed upon and wiped out and breathed upon again and wiped out cannot be devoid from dimness (my translation).

The mirror that is tarnished and then wiped out by the polish is not like the mirror that is polished to increase its clarity without being previously tarnished (my translation).

To conceptualize the gradual heaping up of the rust of passions and sins upon the face of the heart Al-Ghazali creatively utilized an innovative element induced and prompted by the purpose of the target.
As for blameworthy effects, they resemble a dark smoke that rise to the mirror of the heart and it keeps heaping over the face of the heart from time to time until the heart becomes black, dim, and entirely veiled from God. And that is the seal and the rust (my translation).

THE HEART IS A MIRROR THAT GETS TARNISHED BY THE ASCENDING SMOKE OF EVIL DEEDS AND QUALITIES.

This type of creativity is called “target-induced creativity”. Darkening smoke gradually rises up over the mirror of the heart and is heaped up upon it time after time until it becomes black and clouded, and entirely veiled from Allah. The innovation of this metaphor is inspired by a previous discourse of the prophet about the gradual blackening of hearts by sins.

THE HEART IS A MIRROR REFLECTING IMAGES FROM ANOTHER MIRROR

Furthermore the above mentioned five hindrances are conceptualized as a veil placed between the mirror of heart and the mirror of the Preserved Tablet. The veil placed between a mirror and another mirror facing it is exploited creatively to describe the veil of the heart preventing it from receiving knowledge from the mirror of the Preserved Tablet. There are different ways of removing the veil between two mirrors; it can be drawn aside by man’s volition or by the blow of winds. These two ways are mapped to the veil of the heart. It can only be removed by purifying the heart from the stain and rust of sins and passions and then waiting for Divine winds of grace to lift it generating the direct unveiling.

The revelation of the truth of knowledge from the mirror of the Preserved Tablet in the mirror of the heart resembles the impression of an image from a mirror to a mirror that faces it. The veil between the two mirrors sometimes is removed by the hand and sometimes is removed by the blow of winds that move it. Similarly the winds of grace may blow causing veils to be removed from the eyes of hearts and then some of what is written down in the Preserved Tablet is revealed in the hearts (my translation).

The removing of the veil results from the blow of the “Divine winds of grace”. The divine winds of grace that draw aside the veil placed between the heart and the mirror of the Preserved Tablet is induced by previous discourse from the Prophetic tradition about the same topic that Al-Ghazali kept mentioning all over his book:
Your Lord, in the days of your time, has gusts. Expose yourselves to them. Shall a gust from them reach you then you will never be miserable after that (may translation).

The removing of the veil by the blowing of the divine winds of grace is further innovatively exploited to yield another creative metaphor.

Until the veil is lifted by a hidden grace from Allah and then something from the peculiarities of knowledge shines in the heart from behind the curtain of the veiled world (ghayb) sometimes like the flashing of lightning (my translation).

The blow and the motion of wind are normally known to be beyond the control of man unpredictable, and arbitrary. This piece of knowledge is employed to describe the way and the amount of time of mystic unveiling and direct divine revelation. This is compared to flashes of dazzling lightning that last only for very short moment. The winds suddenly blow removing the veil so that the image (revelations) flashes in the mirror (the heart), and then the veil returns when the wind stops. Whenever the wind blows the veil is removed and the image flashes in the mirror. The flashing may be very brief and rare and it may be continuous and lasting long in time depending on the strength and the continuation of the blowing of wind. This is like the mystic unveiling upon which Sufis have no control.

The effect of the immediate social context

Society may be characterized by certain traits and may have particular concerns and interests.

The number of knots of loving worldly life that are untangled from around the heart (my translation).

THE LOVE OF WORLDLY LIFE IS KNOTS TYING THE HEART (BOUND OF SLAVERY)

Love is a bond metaphor (“There is a close tie between them”) discussed in (Koveceses, 2000, p. 26) is deployed in an unconventional manner to describe the heart attachment to the worldly life. The creativity is motivated by the then prevailing social norms of slavery and chains and bonds of slavery. What is innovative in the metaphor is that it conceptualizes love for worldly life as tied knots that are untangled progressively and partially. Whenever a knot is untangled the heart attains a greater degree of freedom.

The aforementioned factors can be conjoined together and the conceptualizer seeks to be coherent with the multi-aspects of every context. This is called “the combined effect of factors” (Kövecses, 2015).
Discussion

Corpus analysis has yielded three significant results:

First it has revealed that metaphors are “products of context” par excellence. Metaphoric creativity is grounded in the multiple aspects of the immediate context. Discursive, physical, social, and cultural context motivated metaphorical creativity by introducing factors that primed, induced, prompted and facilitated the choice of certain conceptual metaphors (Kövecses, 2015, p. 99). This provides a piece of evidence supporting the centrality of context in determining metaphorical choices and especially in inducing creativity.

A considerable portion of novel and unconventional metaphorical language seems to derive from such contextual factors as the immediate linguistic context, knowledge about discourse participants, physical setting, and the like. It remains to be seen how robust the phenomenon is and whether it deserves serious further investigation. Many of these metaphors are clearly not, in Grady’s (1999) classification, either resemblance or correlation based cases. They seem to have a unique status, in that they are grounded in the context in which metaphorical conceptualization is taking place (Kövecses, 2015, p. 114).

The investigation of metaphorical creativity in the corpus has proved that context played a crucial role in the production of creative metaphors that are innovative elaboration of conventional metaphors. This proves that context-induced metaphorical creativity has indeed a significant presence in the corpus which deserves investigation in future research.

The second result is that the physiological aspect of embodiment has no primacy over cultural, social, and physical, and discursive aspects emerging from the immediate context as claimed in the early formulation of conceptual metaphor theory (Johnson and Lakoff, 2003). The metaphors analyzed in the corpus are products of the context (especially local context). They do not emerge from any basic bodily experience or any correlation of experience.

The third result concerns the instantiation of conventional metaphorical mappings in novel metaphors. Basic conventional metaphors such as LIFE IS A JOURNEY are considered as “conceptual resources” equally available for both poets and ordinary people to make sense of their experience. The strength of human imagination and creativity cannot override the constraints of the established metaphors, it can only extend and elaborate conventional mappings in novel and infinite ways (Gibbs, 1994, p. 7 and Lakoff and Turner, 1989, p. 26). Many creative metaphors in the corpus depended on conventional mappings such as LIFE IS A JOURNEY, KNOWLEDGE IS VISION, HEART IS A CONTAINER, and HEART IS A MATERIAL. These conventional mappings sustained novel mappings. The metaphors analyzed in the corpus even though innovative metaphors but they all depended on the instantiation and elaboration of conventional metaphorical mappings. The basic conceptual resources are limited but the ways of exploiting these resources are infinite. This is what Lakoff and Turner (1989, p. 65) called “the power of options” provided by conceptual metaphor. The extension of established metaphors to create novel ones is considered as a
piece of evidence that supports the existence of conceptual metaphors (metaphor is not a matter of language) and the vividness of conventional metaphorical mappings. This evidence refutes the traditional claim about the existence of a type of metaphors called “dead metaphors”. What make metaphorical mapping alive is its functioning in an effortless and unconscious manner. This contrasts what is traditionally claimed that the vividness of a metaphor is derived from its conscious conceptualization (mappings are instantiated unconsciously) (Lakoff and Turner, 1989, p. 129).

The revival of the sciences of religion is characterized by a significant amount of conceptual creativity that marks it as metaphorically powerful type of Sufi discourse. De Landtsheer’s (2009) model of metaphor power suggested that metaphor intensity (MI) is measured by the “score of originality” of each metaphor. Intensity is attained by the novelty and creativity of metaphorical expressions. Innovative metaphors are considered more intense than conventional metaphors.

**Implication of the study**

The findings of this research can be extended to investigate further aspects of the Sufi discourse as a discourse revolving around highly abstract and metaphysical issues. Future research may analyze larger corpora representing different works of various authors to see whether Sufis systematically utilize language and metaphors in an unconventional way, to what extent their creativity is constrained by conventional conceptual resources, and the degree of contextual influence in the creativity of their metaphors.

**Conclusion**

To conclude it could be said that the conceptualization of the heart in Al-Ghazali the revival of the sciences of religion is marked by an important portion of creative and innovative conceptual metaphors. The creativity of metaphors was induced and facilitated by a range of contextual variables namely:

Effect of the immediate linguistic context  
Effect of the immediate cultural context  
Effect of the immediate social context  
Effect of the immediate physical setting  
Effect of the personal concerns and interests of the conceptualizer

The findings proved that metaphorical creativity in the book is a significant phenomenon that context played a vital role in structuring this phenomenon, and that conventional mappings are vivid conceptual resources sustaining novel mappings.
Acknowledgment

All praise and thanks go to Allah the Almighty, the extremely Merciful for helping me to accomplish this work. I am also deeply indebted to my supervisor Professor Mounir Triki for his unlimited kindness and support.
References


Siahaan, P. (2008). Did he break your *heart* or your *liver*? A contrastive study on metaphorical concepts from the source domain ORGAN in English and in Indonesian. In Farzad Sharifian, René Dirven, Ning Yu and Susanne Niemeier (eds.), 133-170.


Mimetic Desire in Miguel Cervantes’ *Don Quixote* : an Anthropological Study

Farhat Ben Amor
University of Kairouan, Tunisia

**Abstract**

This paper sets out to unearth the underlying reasons behind the spectacular success that the seventeenth-century Spanish novelist, Cervantes, achieved in his humoristic work, *Don Quixote* which has been translated into many languages, including English. In this respect, I work to demonstrate the centrality of what the anthropologist René Girard called in his book *Deceit, Desire and the Novel* (1961) ‘mimetic desire’ in sustaining the lightness of the novel’s humor. A desire that is built on imitating others does, actually, define Don Quixote, the protagonist of the novel. Yet, what is special with him is that this desire leads him to generate a whole imagined narrative about knight errantry and, more importantly, to live it out in a time in which medieval chivalric codes of behaviour become outdated and just part of the fictional world. So, Don Quixote’s plight becomes comic, for he places what he read about the knight Amadis of Gaul and other stories of chivalry as models he irresistibly strives to cultivate and copy from. Certainly, the sharp chasm separating reality from fiction is enough to set the protagonist in a state of confusion whereby he is made to appear to other characters and even to the reader as veritably mad. Meanwhile, our laughable protagonist keeps clinging to such a desire that helps him considerably overcome the heavy hazardous adventures he comes across in his ludicrous and, at the same time, absurd journey of what we may call ‘search for knighthood.’ It is precisely the waxing and waning of this mimetic desire, galvanizing his courage, that this paper seeks to chart and examine anthropologically.

**Keywords**: anthropology, mimetic desire, humor, knight-errantry, mediation, parody, rivalry
Introduction

Miguel Cervantes’ publication of *Don Quixote* in 1605 achieved “immediate popularity” (Rutherfield 8) and has become subsequently a canonical masterpiece in the literature of humor worldwide. Its appeal to the audience seems to have encouraged the author to add a second part to it as to complete the whole work in 1615, one year before his death. The central role it plays in literature, as a whole, could be shown in René Girard’s contention that “all the ideas of the Western novel are present in germ in *Don Quixote.*” (63) Indeed, the novelistic aspect of Cervantes’ work could be evidenced, for example, in its well-delineated plot that never stops retrenching the elements of suspense and surprise despite its length. Schematically, the whole plot of *Don Quixote* traces the ridiculous adventures undertaken by its hero who acts seriously to retrieve in his own person the ideals of knighthood in a time when medieval “chivalric rhetoric” became “so hopelessly outdated that it can express itself merely as stories unconnected to everyday life, except as entertainment.” (Quint 234) It is suggested, then, that Don Quixote’s inability to detect the ‘rhetoricity’ of chivalry in his own time keeps nourishing the reader’s suspense and surprise and, also, cornering the hero to a set of repeated ironies levelled constantly at him, contributing thus to the air of humor suffusing the whole texture of the plot.

Another ‘germ’ that Cervantes’ work offers to the Western novel pertains to his elaboration of a well-drawn method of characterization. It is true that Don Quixote is a consistent character whose misplaced faith in the possibility of living out chivalric ideals remains strong and relentless despite the many failures he experiences across the narrative. To some extent, he can be grasped as a flat character who maintains just a one-faceted view of knightly life to which he clings fervently. Only in the conclusion is he pushed to renounce chivalry as to become, ultimately, a rounded character. Nevertheless, such a prevailing consistency and flatness mapping out most of Don Quixote’s characterization does not impede him from emerging as the sole agent who animates action and confers on it the lightness and vivacity which are certainly essential in making Cervantes’ work “the world’s most esteemed comic masterpiece.” (Montgomery 193-4) Besides, the author’s narrative techniques may help provide the burgeoning ‘germ’ of the Western novel. Chiefly, the alternation between first and third person point of view, omniscience and authorial intrusiveness, and narration and dramatization are markedly deployed in *Don Quixote*. All of these narrative forms are, equally, auxiliary in foregrounding the general effect of humor that is produced out of the hero’s uncurbed desire to be a knight who resembles (and even outweighs) the miraculous deeds of the legendary figure, Amadis of Gaul, of whom Don Quixote has read much.

Research Objectives

The aim of this paper is cover the following points:

- To study the specificities of Don Quixote’s desire to be a knight errant anthropologically, applying René Girard’s notion of ‘mimetic desire’ whose chief theoretical significances need to be elucidated in this process.

- To examine the manifestation of ‘mimetic desire’ in the text of *Don Quixote*. While citing examples proving how much such a desire overwhelms the whole being of Don Quixote, there needs to be highlighted the centrality of the chivalric discourse as a mine from which he imbibes both power and stoic endurance of the series of pains he comes across in his ‘knightly’ journey. Collateral with that aim is to underline the humoristic thrust Cervantes works to envisage.
To gauge the efficaciousness of such an all-encompassing ‘mimetic desire’ transporting Don Quixote from within in generating the identity he yearned to construct for himself as a knight-errant. In this respect, my basic purpose is to underline the pattern of duality that ironically keeps presenting Don Quixote’s identity to be enmeshed in a duel between his own subjective conception of himself as a knight ‘rivalling’ even with the best models of knights from whom he originally copies and his being designated as a sheer ‘mad’ person in the objective world he inhabits.

To explore the implications of Quixote’s ultimate renunciation of chivalry in the conclusion, in relation to both the fate of ‘mimetic desire’ and to the author’s verbalization of his own ‘desire’ to counteract his hero.

**Research Questions**

The study will concentrate on the following questions:

- How does Don Quixote exhibit his ‘mimetic desire’ to be a knight-errant?
- What are the causes and effects of such a ‘mimetic desire’ that Don Quixote holds towards knight-errantry and what are the anthropological implications of his eventual resignation from its practice in the concluding chapter?

**Research Methodology**

This study will make use of analysis and inference drawn from some scenes in *Don Quixote* that are taken from the first part of the work and the conclusion which seals the whole book. My choice of the first part, rather than the second one, is accounted for the marked presence of the hero’s manic desire of imitating what he has read about knight-errantry which pushes him to undergo several ridiculous adventures. The concluding scene is important in my study, as well, for it dramatizes Don Quixote’s eventual renouncement of chivalric ideals altogether in a highly-emotive context of confession which remains laden with humor despite its taking place in his death-bed scene. All the while, I am going to foreground the relevance of anthropological insights into the course of Don Quixote’s adventures, basing my arguments on such concepts René Girard propounds in his work *Deceit, Desire and the Novel* (1965) as ‘mimetic desire,’ ‘mediation’ and ‘rivalry.’ The list of cited sources is given under the heading of References at the end of this paper.

**Literature Review**

Much has been written on *Don Quixote* and different approaches have been employed in this critical process. Since 1981 there has been issued a biannual journal publishing articles both in Spanish and English on Cervantes, called *Bulletin of the Cervantes Society of America*. In the journal’s volume 34, No. 2, Fall 2014, there is a historicist reading of the book carried out by Alvar Ezquera (translated by Fabien Montcher) in his article “Miguel Cervantes and the Political Turn of History (c 1507 – 1615)” and a romantic interpretation of it by Perojo Arronte (translated by Maria Eugenia) in his article “Samuel Coleridge on *Don Quixote.*” Whereas, the journal’s volume 32, No. 2, Fall 2012 includes a nuanced reading of the book adopted by Jay John Allen in his article “Proscript to *Don Quixote*: Hero or Fool? Remixed.” There is equally a study of emotion in relation to the pathetic fallacy done by Steven Hutchinson in his article “Affective Dimension in *Don Quixote*” which emerged in the journal’s volume 24, No. 2, Fall 2004. The same issue involves a metafictional study of *Don Quixote* undertaken by Shannon M. Polchow’s “Authors and Readers in the 1605 *Don Quixote*” and James A. Parr’s “On Narration and Theory.”
Apart from these various approaches exhibited in this journal, there has been a sociological reading of *Don Quixote* in Steven Wagschal’s *The Literature of Jealousy in the Age of Cervantes* (2007) and a historiographic approach done by Susan Bryne’s *Law and History in Cervantes’ Don Quixote* (2012). In addition, there is a discourse analysis method adopted by Anthony J. Cascadi’s *Cervantes, Literature, and the Discourse of Politics* (2006). There is also an intertextual reading of *Don Quixote* in such works as Charles D. Presberg’s *Adventures in Paradox: Don Quixote and the Western Tradition* (2001) and Bruce R. Burningham’s *Tilting Cervantes: Baroque Reflections on Postmodern Culture* (2008). Last but not least, the attempt to provide a psychoanalytical study of *Don Quixote* could be touched in David R. Castillo’s *Awry View: Anamorphosis, Cervantes, and the Early Picaresque* (2001).

Certainly, all these approaches, in their variegated paths, are important in enhancing a fair apprehension of Cervantes’ *Don Quixote* both thematically and stylistically. Still, an anthropological study of *Don Quixote* could be very illuminating, given the nature of the discipline of anthropology as involving “the study of human societies from physical, cultural, and social perspectives.” (Quinn 19) An anthropological study of *Don Quixote* may best serve to highlight the fate of those who elaborate misplaced ‘physical, cultural, and social’ norms, whether spatially or temporally, in the way its hero actually does. Strangeness to the members of their societies and their being ridiculed and even taken as ‘mad’ may represent the governing ‘fate’ facing those who are stricken by such ‘misplacement.’ Therefore, the anthropologist Réné Girard cites in his book *Deceit, Desire, and the Novel* (1965) works done by, in addition to Cervantes, Sendhal, Flaubert, Proust and Dostoyevsky which, all, include laughable heroes resembling Don Quixote in his assumption of knight-errantry in a time that is no longer fit to it. In this paper, I am going to expound on the Girardian anthropological investigation of ‘mimetic desire,’ focusing on *Don Quixote*.

I. Method and Analysis
1- Mimetic Desire: a Theoretical study

While trying to trace the genealogy of ‘desire,’ Réné Girard maintains that “at the origin of a desire, there is always the spectacle of another real or illusory desire.” (116) Inferably, the structure of desire is suggested to constitute a palimpsest made up of several layers, with each new layer hiding the previous ones. As a result, the external shape of desire would remain incomplete unless it were considered as a continuum to other forms of desire that are often unpaid attention to, albeit their ‘real’ or ‘illusory’ aspect. A scrutiny into desire, in pathological terms, seems to lead Girard to attach to it specific qualifications, including mainly the imitative thrust of it: mimesis. In fact, ‘mimetic desire’ becomes a key concept in the Girardian anthropological enterprise as a whole and is coined specifically to highlight its emanation not from the ‘self’ but from the ‘other.’ Inevitably, the hierarchical pyramid this sort of desire is implied to construct in relation to its holder whereby the ‘other’ is made to control the ‘self’ and imprisons it in a whirl of emulations has to engender, sooner or later, an absentized ‘self’ based on “whimsical depictions of reality, rather than convincing background.” (De Armas 89)

What is at stake in relation to ‘mimetic desire’ is not so much the object of imitation as the imitator who is likely to be baffled by unintelligibility and even nonsense. In his book *The Girardian Origin of Generative Anthropology*, Eric Evans ascertains that “‘mimetic desire is mediated not simply by the mediator’s acquisitive behaviour but by his implicit or explicit representation of the object of his desire.” (38, italics mine) There comes to the forefront, then, both ‘mediation’ and
‘representation’ with respect to the operation of ‘mimetic desire.’ For Girard, the question of ‘mediation’ is connected to the process whereby the subject of desire takes what the ‘other’ desires as a reference from which to derive one’s own desire – a process which makes up ultimately the foundation of ‘mimetic desire.’ Actually, Girard elucidates ‘mediation’ while referring to Cervantes’ Don Quixote:

Quixote has surrendered to Amadis the individual’s fundamental prerogative. He no longer chooses, Amadis must choose for him. The disciple (Quixote) pursues objects which are determined for him, or at least seem to be determined for him, by the model of chivalry. We shall call this model ‘the mediator of desire.’ (12–13)

To set what Amadis (the ‘other’) desires as a parameter of what Quixote (the ‘self’) should desire defines the very locus of the mediating process which is once enshrined acquires a ‘deterministic’ quality. Ironically, this almost metaphysical determinism imposed on the ‘self’ is just, as Girard implies, a matter of ‘seeming’ and, therefore, is subjectively anchored in the ‘self’ which generates it, rather than imposed on it by the ‘other’ being imitated.

So, when it comes to the ‘representation’ of ‘mimetic desire,’ it is prone to be fallaciously constructed and elaborated, given its springing from a parochial subjective spectrum of desire. Even the ‘acquisitive behaviour’ developed by a Quixote-like ‘self’ that is animated by ‘mimetic desire’ to emulate an Amadis-like ‘other’ is suggested to be much colored by the confinements of such a self’s subjective methods of ‘representing’ this ‘other.’ As a matter of fact, the potential of misrepresentation helps, also, nourish the ironic impulse underlying those who are stricken by ‘mimetic desire.’ Just as it can be linked to spatial and temporal misplacement (in the way Quixote desires to live out the ideals of medieval knight-errantry in a time no longer suitable for it), this misrepresentation can be translated in the short-comings of results achieved by the ‘self’ while seeking to arrive at, and even to outweigh, the feats the emulated Amadis-like ‘other’ is said to reach. Disproportionality between the attempt and its result can provide enough space to humor done at the expense of a Quixote-like ‘self’ whose ‘mimetic desire’ of an Amadis-like ‘other’ leads it to be covered, ironically in a self-willed process, under the shades of abnormality within the established scales of appropriateness of its own society.

Girard’s qualification of holders of ‘mimetic desire’ per se is telling of that measure of disequilibrium which makes of them the object of humor and irony. He opts for the French word vaniteux, whom he defines as ‘a vain person who cannot draw his desires from his own resources; he must borrow them from others. A vaniteux will desire any object as long as he is convinced that it is already desired by another person whom he admires.’ (17) Being the monopoly of ‘another person,’ the mechanism underlying ‘mimetic desire’ is inferred to be built on projection of desire onto the ‘other,’ rather than the ‘self.’ The end result is to stress the illusion in which the ‘self’ is caught in this projective exercise, inasmuch as the ‘mimetic’ nature of the desire being held is not generated by it. In Girard’s terms, ‘there would be no illusion if Quixote were not imitating Amadis. Desire projects a dream universe around the hero.’ (29) Despite the illusory implications of that projective kind of desire and its relegation to providing its indwellers just ‘a dream universe,’ it is still very difficult for it to be corroded on confronting reality. This means that ‘mimetic desire’ possesses an estimable power allowing its holder to withstand, though for a while, what Eric Evans calls ‘antagonists’ (76) who represent but vain dissuading forces working to separate the ‘self’ from the ‘other’ being imitated. Therefore, the ‘self,’ the ‘other’ and ‘projection’
are suggested to found a trio delineating the structure of ‘mimetic desire,’ which leads Girard to derive “‘the triangular theory of mimetic desire.’” (19)

2- Mimetic Desire in Don Quixote

The marked presence of ‘mimetic desire’ in Don Quixote is so noticeable that the term ‘quixotic’ has been introduced to English language ever since Cervantes’ publication of the book as a key notion associated with humor. It is no surprise, accordingly, to find critics such as Trevor Gribben Merrill maintain that “‘desire is quixotic, that is to say, it leads to a wish-fulfilling transfiguration of the world, making things appear otherwise than they really are.’” (69) More than that, the same critic continues to read ‘quixoticism’ in conjunction with ‘mimetic desire’: “to designate desire as ‘quixotic’ is also to say that it is triangular, mediated, mimetic in the Girardian sense.” (70, italics mine) To substantiate our talk, we need to show what makes of the hero Don Quixote quixotic in Don Quixote. For this task to be done, there is certainly to be much focus on the operation of ‘mimetic desire’ – with all its components of ‘wish-fulfilling transfiguration of the world,’ ‘triangular projection,’ and ‘mediation’ – in relation to his actions as a character in the story.

Right form the opening pages of the novel, we begin to detect the numerous set of paradoxes besieging the hero from every corner. The latter is introduced as “a country gentleman in a village in La Mancha” who is “nearly fifty.” (Chapter 1. 29) Nevertheless, his gentlemanship can hardly be apprehended, for there soon comes to the forefront several indices telling how much the hitherto unnamed hero is far from it. The omniscient narrator, whose intrusiveness in his story-telling allows for the ironic impulse cast against his character, continues his presentation of the so-called ‘gentleman’ as follows:

During his idle moments (which accounted for most of the year), this gentleman took to reading books of chivalry with such relish and enthusiasm that he almost forgot about his hunting and even running his property. Everything he read in his books took possession of his imagination: enchantments, fights, battles, challenges, wounds, sweet nothings, love affairs, storms and impossible absurdities. (Chapter 1. 29-30)

Up to this stage, what is ironic and gentlemanly unconventional pertains mostly to the surfeit of ‘idleness’ whose temporal magnitude is emphasized by the narrator between brackets in the quote above. Besides, the hyperbolic thrust on the narrator’s part to instill his irony is envisaged in emphasizing his character’s avidity in ‘reading books of chivalry’ with such excess that leads to his forsaking of his ‘hunting’ and ‘property.’ Further irony could be derived from the narrator’s enumeration of the whole stuff these books include – an enumeration which bespeaks the narrator’s belittling of their importance. This belittling urge can be noticed in fronting the list of enumeration with ‘enchantment’ and rounding it off with ‘impossible absurdities.’ This causes the deeds placed within this list, including ‘fights,’ ‘challenges,’ ‘love affairs’ etc, to be relegated to a chimerical composite, implicilty understood not to be worth reading.

As we read on, we discover how that divergence between the narrator’s conviction of the unworthiness of ‘books of chivalry’ and his character’s ‘relish and enthusiasm’ while reading them keeps intensifying. Soon the culminating point is reached when the omniscient narrator announces the madness of his character:
And so, by now quite insane, he conceived the strangest notion that ever took shape in a madman’s head, considering it desirable and necessary, both for the increase of his honour and the common good, to become a knight errant, and to travel about the world with his armours and his arms and his horse in search of adventures, and to practise all those activities that he knew from his books were practised by knights errant, redressing all kinds of grievances, exposing himself to perils and dangers that he would overcome and thus gain eternal fame. The poor man could already see himself being crowned Emperor of Trebizond. (Chapter I. 30)

Now, the character’s ‘desire,’ though ironically presented, is deciphered in terms of its composition, thanks to the omniscient point of view the narrator adopts. His desire consists in ‘becoming a knight errant,’ with all that this entails of assuming such responsibilities as ‘redressing all kinds of grievances,’ brave facing of ‘perils and dangers’ etc. The mimetic inscription of that desire is explicitly indicated to be derived from the ‘knowledge’ he has gleaned ‘from his books’ about ‘knight errant.’ As M. Brett Gaffney puts it, then, “his simple story is an obsession with chivalric romances which spur him into the insane notion of sallying forth into the world as a practising knight.” (9)

In reality, the character’s ‘seeing himself being crowned Emperor of Trebizond’ sets him from the very onset in a subjective front which, though presaged to be decoded as a sign of ‘madness’ by the characters he is going to meet, is suggested to be immune enough to personal hesitation on his part. There exists a short-circuiting of the whole process of the wish-fulfilling dream, for the man starts to grasp the reward he desires to achieve as a ‘crowned emperor’ after serving as a knight-errant for a period which he has not embarked on yet. Certainly, this anachronism helps buttress his courage to disregard the difficulties he is going to face in his journey of knight-errantry. However, his short-circuiting of the process that leads him to become an ‘emperor’ does not impede him from following the knightly codes in its minutest details, including his being dubbed a knight, staying vigil for a night and exhibiting the knightly etiquettes with all their respects. Even, the naming process takes its time, for the man spends “eight days” searching for an appropriate name for himself as ‘Don Quixote’ and ‘Rocinante’ for his horse. (Chapter I. 31)

Again, the narrator’s omniscience helps decipher what is going on in Quixote’s mind during this naming process:

Remembering that brave Amadis had not been content to call himself ‘Amadis’ alone, but had added the name of his kingdom and homeland, to make it famous, and had styled himself Amadis of Gaul, so Don Quixote, as a worthy knight, decided to add his own country to his name and call himself Don Quixote de la Mancha. (Chapter I. 31)

In choosing to follow the same procedure done by Amadis of Gaul, the operation of ‘mimetic desire’ from within Don Quixote is instigated right from his search for ‘styling himself’ as a knight which is, ironically, but a conscious staging of himself as a mere copy of Amadis.

Interestingly, Amadis, who is self-willedly placed as the ‘mediator’ between Don Quixote and his desire to become a knight-errant, is but a part of the fictional background of medieval legends about chivalry. Actually, the ‘mediation’ which is built between Amadis and Quixote is indicated explicitly to be relegated to the connection that binds a character of a story to the reader – a connection that is, by its metaphysical nature, distant. Indeed, Girard refers to Amadis as “Quixote’s distant mediator who sheds a diffused light over a vast surface.” (95) Due to that ‘distant mediation,’ Girard adds that Amadis becomes “the solitary mediator of Don Quixote,
atemporal and legendary.’’ (103) Yet, this ‘vast surface,’ on which Amadis ‘sheds a diffused light’ over Quixote, in addition to its nourishment of Quixote’s ‘mimetic desire,’ ends up blurring the boundaries separating fiction from reality on the latter’s part. We are told by the omniscient narrator how ‘‘whatever our adventurer thought, saw, or imagined seemed to him to be as it was in the books he had read.’’ (Chapter II. 33) By implication, Quixote is made to subvert the ‘metaphysical distance’ that ought to exist between him, as a reader of medieval stories of chivalry, and Amadis, as a mere fictional product of these stories.

It is Quixote’s blind undoing of such a ‘metaphysical distance’ that engenders the knot of the plot of the story in this novel and accentuates the humoristic undertone surrounding all the scenes it dramatizes. His actual sallying forth into searching for ‘knightly’ adventures represents a key twist in the plot, for it marks his entry to a performative stage of his ‘mimetic desire.’ In the words of Charles Oriel, this zone of application indicates that now ‘‘Quixote performs as much as he constates.’’ (71) This means that Quixote’s ‘mimetic desire’ transports him to act it out in reality and to concoct around it his own ‘‘fictional excuses.’’ (Gaffney 11) Now, the turn the plot of the novel takes follows a series of scenographically rich rounds of adventures, linked commonly with a pattern of Quixote’s falsification of himself, whether in apprehending people, objects, or even the real course of events. Ironically and expectingly, too, this falsification pertains mostly to the confusion befallen on Quixote while tenaciously trying to connect what he apprehends in reality to what he read about in books. A leitmotif recurring in the plot, then, consists in Quixote’s frequent measuring of every course of event he undergoes in his ‘knightly adventures’ with stories stocked in his mind about other knights errant. As he rode out in the fields, we are told how ‘‘he decided to have himself knighted by the first person he chanced upon, in imitation of many others who had done the same, as he had read in the books.’’ (Chapter II. 32)

Besides, it is out of Quixote’s staunch faith in these ‘books’ that he transforms them into his sole guide in the labyrinthine journey he self-willedly undertakes. In this way, these books help buoying up his morale throughout the different hazards he comes across, as if they were the Gospel for him. Indeed, Quixote is presented as ‘‘wishing to imitate in every way he believed he could the passages of arms he had read in his books.’’ (Chapter IV. 42, italics mine) This sense of exhaustiveness of such an ‘imitative wish’ indicates the potency of the ‘mimetic desire’ transporting the whole being of Quixote so that he is made ultimately what we may call the ‘disciple of books.’’ Expounding on the Girardian implications of ‘mimetic desire,’ Eric Evans notices that ‘‘Girard’s most powerful conclusion concerning mimetic desire, that what we really desire is the Being of mediator, that we assimilate the latter to a falso God, are indications that we are reacting to our sense of having been deprived of being.’’ (38) This is very applicable to the case of Quixote. His ‘mimetic desire’ to strictly follow the etiquettes he acquires from books of chivalry leads him to such an extent that he develops that ‘sense of having been deprived of his own being’ in favour of ‘‘the Being of mediator,’’ translated in his deification of what these books contain.

Explaining to Sancho (an old man from de la Mancha who is duped into becoming Quixote’s squire) the relentless spirit he entertains, Quixote underlines such an almost sacred obligation he bears towards his minute conformity to the order of knighthood. Stoically he says, ‘‘I do not utter any complaint about the pain. It is because knights errant are not permitted to complain about wounds, even if their entrails are spilling out of them.’’ Meanwhile, he allows his squire Sancho to moan whenever he wants, simply because he ‘‘had not read anything to the contrary in the order of chivalry.’’ (Chapter VIII. 55) Quixote even would not sense any sort of danger if there
were not to be any correspondent to it in the stories of chivalry he knows about. Thus, he does not show any sign of fear of being captivated by the Basque as a retaliation of the latter’s defeat by him, during an adventure Quixote has with the Basque who is mistakenly accused of abducting a lady in the coach. As he and Sancho depart, Quixote turns a deaf ear to his companion’s fear of being sued, saying “‘not at all, Sancho, where have you ever seen or read of a knight errant standing trial, whatever outrages he is accused of?’” (Chapter XX. 63) Gradually, the religious fervor with which he is suggested to read the stories of knights seems to succeed considerably in turning Quixote into what we might call ‘a fanatic demagogue’ who is blindly devoted to causes solely intelligible to him.

This measure of fanaticism can be grasped in his eventual use of the pronoun ‘we,’ while speaking on behalf of all knights. Trying to highlight the eminent position of knights to two gentlemen who are bewildered by the strangeness of his habit as they come across him in a forest, , Quixote says: ‘‘monks, in peace and tranquility, pray to heaven for the well-being of the world; but we soldiers and knights put into practice what they pray for, defending the world with the prowess of our arms and the blades of our swords. So we are ministers of God on earth.’’ (Chapter XXIII. 75) Quixote’s ‘mimetic desire,’ then, is directed, ultimately, to become ‘a minister of God on earth.’ So, it is no surprise to find him eventually capable of developing an allegorical reading to the sequence of events, including even all sorts of mishap in his ‘lofty’ journey of knight errantry. As he enlists himself to knights, Quixote now attaches his desire solely to God and, therefore, carries out and ‘performs’ his own symbolic transformation into a ‘mediator’ between God and his fellow beings, no matter how much irony or violence that may be directed at him not only by other characters but also by his author Cervantes. The common denominator linking all of them together, in Quixote’s divinely inspired eyes, is their relegation to mere sources of ‘enchancements’ trying vainly to veil his sight from apprehending truths as they really are. It is true that the series of the remaining adventures which are, unlike the one undertaken against the Basque, fruitless and dismay ing, given their inclusion of much violence and damage to him and his squire, Sancho. Yet, Quixote keeps providing the latter with allegorical interpretations to them, which, ironically, escape Sancho’s limited perceptualization.

Pathetically sensing himself worn out with fatigue, Sancho’s proposition to give in is met with utter objection on Quixote’s part. While Sancho reduces these so-called ‘knightly adventures’ to be ‘‘nothing but beatings and more beatings, punches and more punches,’’ Quixote keeps holding that all their defeats have been due to ‘enchancements’ that need to be exorcized. (Chapter XXIII. 101) Thus, he quickly traverses his companion’s discouragement through revealing his total commitment to the project of possessing Amadis’ arms which, according to him, cannot be enchanted and, therefore, has to be searched in order to replace these defeats by gains. Enthusiastically, he shouts at Sancho, ‘‘it could even be that fortune brings my way the sword that belonged to Amadis, when he was known as ‘The Knight of the Burning Sword,’ which was one of the best that any knight ever possessed.’’ (Chapter XXIII. 101) Now, the import of Quixote’s ‘mimetic desire’ is suggested to center around sharing Amadis this ‘best’ sword, which includes within it even a vying undertone. Quixote has already exhibited to Sancho his penchant for being singularized as incomparable knight. Right after his defeat of the Basque (which is, ironically, the first and the only adventure in which he succeeds in gaining the battle), Quixote starts to implore Sancho in these terms: ‘‘tell me, pray, have you ever seen a knight more valiant than I on the face of earth? Have you ever read in histories of any knight who is or has been more spirited in the attack,
more preserving in the pursuit, more dexterious in the wounding and more skilful in the unhorsing.” (Chapter XX. 63)

In front of this untoward series of defeats he has undergone subsequently, reconnoitering Amadis’ ‘Burning Sword’ becomes an urgent need ‘mediating’ between him and his desire to become an exceptional knight. Underlying this context of search for distinctiveness, Quixote’s ‘mimetic desire’ is implied to develop into a latent desire to compete with his model, Amadis, because, now, he seeks to own Amadis’ mythologized ‘sword,’ not just to be like Amadis himself. In his seminar on René Girard, the Meaning of Life and the End of History, Dr. Scott Codwell tries to provide an anthropological explanation of the potential of ‘mimetic desire’ to be developed into rivalry with the model of mimesis who initiates such a form of desire within the subject. He notices how ‘unfocussed desire finds an object thanks to a model, who in circumstances of close proximity can become a rival. On the cusp of humanity’s evolutionary emergence, mimesis appeared as a valuable innovation, but so quickly did it lead to rivalry and violence.’ (2) The eventual dissipation of Quixote’s ‘mimetic desire’ into ‘rivalry’ with Amadis to possess his ‘Burning Sword’ is not spare of ‘violence.’ In his mistaken belief that any looked-for gain in any battle requires finding that sword which cannot be enchanted whatsoever, Quixote makes of it a symbolic holy mission resembling to a large extent the quest for the Holy Grail which is ‘the plate or cup used by Jesus Christ at the Last Supper, in which one of his followers is said to receive drops of his blood at the Crucifixion.’ (OALD) Indeed, Quixote never seems to read the big amount of ‘drops of blood’ he paid in his fights as acts of violence, but, rather, ‘holy’ rites for obtaining what he poignantly expresses it as ‘tomorrow, what I do desire shall be accomplished.’ (Chapter III. 36)

Results and Discussion

To his misfortunate luck, Quixote’s ‘desired tomorrow’ does not come. In the concluding chapter, he abruptly renounces knight errantry altogether, in a moment of surprise both to his own community and to his readers. He comes to acknowledge his previous ‘obsessive reading those detestable books of chivalry’ and, in a dramatically important moment of recognition, he says ‘now I can confirm their absurdity and their deceitfulness.’ (Chapter LXXIV. 636) With that sudden shift, Quixote’s ‘mimetic desire,’ which has so far provided him with the impetus to emulate and even vie with the knights errant he read about, is suggested to be thwarted and to be transformed even into a regret. Ironically, Quixote’s expression of his regret introduces him as still the slave of ‘mimetic desire,’ though in perverted terms. As he asserts, ‘my only regret is that this discovery has come so late that it leaves me no time to make amends by reading other books that might be a light for my soul.’ (Chapter LXXIV. 636) The terms of perversion of ‘mimetic desire’ consists in the way Quixote still presents himself in need for books as ‘a light to his soul.’ This entails that the function of books (other than those ‘of chivalry’) continues to entertain the same symbolic ‘mediating’ function as books of chivalry used to represent Quixote’s Gospel. By implication, Quixote’s regret is reduced to his sense of deprivation of further temporal scope to get acquainted with ‘reading other books,’ for he comes to discern the end of his life, which actually seals the novel.

The whole body of books other than those on chivalry are suggested, then, to stir Quixote’s desire and the mimetic thrust of that desire is implied from his wish to decipher them all in order to find ones that answer his need to ‘a light for his soul.’ Yet, the operation of ‘mimetic desire’ now is blocked inasmuch as the likelihood of its execution is made what we may call ‘a will-o’-the-wisp,’
given anthropologically physical facts related to tempo-spatial confinements imposed on him as a human being. Quixote seems to be well-aware of the impossibility of implementing such a novel ‘mimetic desire’ directed at other books. Symbolically, he acts out his mild subjection to these confinements before dying, through reasserting his true identity: ‘I am no longer Don Quixote de la Mancha but Alonso Quijano. I am now the enemy of Amadis of Gaul and the whole infinite horde of his descendants; now all those profane histories of knight errantry are odious to me.’ (Chapter LXXIV. 638) Ironically, through coupling his reassertion of his original identity with emphasizing again his disaffiliation from Amadis of Gaul and the whole ‘profane’ panoply of ‘knight errantry,’ Quixote’s whole life is implicitly being reduced to a bout of madness that is, now, on the verge of being calmed down forever and hushed.

Rather than allowing Quixote’s desire to be oriented to another source of mimesis, then, the narrator seems to opt for transforming his character’s whole life (animated by mimetic desire to be a knight errant) into a parable to his readers. As Eric Evans reads it in more generalized terms:

Understood in the framework of a common culture, the schematic desires of the characters in a novel reflects a moral purpose akin to that of religious parable. We are more open to moral lessons when we are able to identify with others’ lived experience, sharing their illusions before experiencing their liberation from them. (30)

When he asks the forgiveness of Sancho for duping him into becoming his squire, Quixote translates that sense of ‘religious parable’ through placing his friend as a victim of his evil company. Addressing him in a highly emotive diction, Quixote says: ‘Forgive me, friend, for making you seem mad, like me, and for making you fall into my own error of believing that knights errant ever have existed and do exist.’ (Chapter LXXIV. 638) If ever the narrator were to allow for ‘forgiveness’ to take place, he would suffuse it all the time with a high measure of humor underlying even the gloomy atmosphere surrounding his character’s death. The narrator derides the unknighthly death of Quixote which runs in sheer opposition to what the latter desires it to be throughout the novel; that is to die in a battle. In fact, the narrator puts to the forefront that contrast between dying in a battle and in bed: ‘the notary was present, and said that he had never read in any book of chivalry of any knight errant dying in his bed in such a calm and christian manner as Don Quixote, who amidst the tears and lamentations of every body present, gave up the ghost; by which I mean he died.’ (Chapter LXXIV. 639)

It is worth mentioning, here, that the very nature of humorism allows for the mingling of irony at and empathy with the character, which certainly offers space for forgiveness after all. As Adrienne Martin puts it:

While satirists refuse to forgive or to see in themselves the ‘vices’ they castigate and instead remain at a critical distance, humorists use ironical distance to allow them to include themselves in the collective object of their humor. This is one of Don Quixote’s most important lessons to the reader: the recognition that all of us are to an extent quixotic. (165)

By virtue of the humor maintained throughout the novel, Quixote’s ‘mimetic desire,’ then, is dealt with pathologically in relation to such an ‘error’ that human being may commit as that of Quixote’s ‘belief that knights errant have existed and do exist.’ In reality, the association of belief in myths of knight errantry with the perpetration of ‘errors’ pertains to what we might call the ‘authorial
subjectivity’ of the narrator himself. The intrusiveness the narrator allows himself to entertain in the corpus of the novel presents him to a large extent moved by the desire to counteract his character. The narrator sums up outright his desire, after, castigating his character to an unknighthly death, in the following terms: “My only desire has been to make men hate those false, absurd histories in books of chivalry, which thanks to the exploits of my real Don Quixote are even now tottering, and without any doubt will soon tumble to the ground.” (Chapter LXXIV. 639) Implicitly, the whole import of the novel is but to offer a parable to ‘men,’ in terms of which is to shun such an experience as that of his character’s ‘mimetic desire’ of becoming a knight errant which ferociously eats his life and shows its claws to him only in his death-bed.

In order to accentuate the effect of the parable he ‘desires’ to inculcate in men’s minds, the narrator is suggested to have been making use of parody throughout the novel. Parody, which consists in “the imitative use of the words, styles, attitude, tone and ideas of an author in such a way as to make them ridiculous” (Cuddon 531), is deployed by the narrator who lets his character ‘authorize’ his ‘mimetic desire’ through voicing it all the over the novel. Yet while symbolically granting his character the privilege of the author, the narrator’s explicitly stated desire to displace his character’s own ‘mimetic desire’ to become a knight errant and deracinate it from its roots remains lurking in the narrative. Ironically, both Quixote and the narrator share a common denominator of desire, which concerns the ‘mediating’ process: the story of Quixote for the narrator and the medieval discourse of chivalry for Quixote. However, the shape of the ‘triangular desire’ in both cases runs in inverted terms. While the imitative thrust of Quixote’s ‘mimetic desire’ leads him to commit himself wholeheartedly to following the ‘mediator’ (de Gaul, the imitating object), the narrator’s imitation of Quixote’s discourse which is carried out through parody is meant just to ridicule it and to make it but an object of humor. So, mimesis on the narrator’s part is a playful exercise he indulges into in order to convey ultimately his parable which aims at drawing a moral lesson derived from Quixote as being a ‘mediator’ of it. Nevertheless, the ‘mediation’ of Quixote in the process of sustaining the parable serves, ironically, to cast him as an anti-model to be copied from. Certainly, this moral lesson finds more stamina when Quixote discovers the ‘error’ he has been in throughout his life for desiring to emulate what he comes to grasp it as a chimerical discourse of chivalry.

When read in connection to the humoristic undertone of the novel, the use of parody is envisaged mostly in the clear-cut simplicistic nature of Quixote’s discourse (prior to his disillusionment) which lends itself to weak-groundedness even at the immediate perceptual level. In the words of David Quint, “Quixote mobilizes a frankly psychotic unconscious mechnanism called distortion, which involves grossly reshaping external reality in order to make it conform to inner reality.” (238) For example, Quixote names a peasant woman in a nearby village as his lady to whom he decides to dedicate all his victories and renames her Dulcinea del Toboso, rather than Aldonza Lorenzo. This comes out of his realization that “a knight errant without a lady is a tree without leaves or fruits, a body without soul.” (Chapter I. 31) When his journey of ‘knighthood’ takes him to an inn, Quixote holds that “he was indeed in some famous castle.” (Chapter II. 35) Equally, he believes the discourse of the priest and Quixote’s niece who invent the myth of the ‘enchanter’ who is behind burning his books and other misdeeds, while, in reality, they are the very ones who burn them. Even windmills are apt to be seen by him as giants with whom to fight. When he realizes in full eyes that these giants are but windmills, he still attributes it to the enchanter: “Freston who stole my library and my books has just turned these giants into windmills, to deprive me of the glory of my victory.” (Chapter VIII. 54)
Ironically, the myth of the ‘enchanter,’ which Quixote adopts to provide supernatural explanations for perceptually undeniable phenomena, finds its real counterpart in the ‘mimetic desire’ transporthing him from within. Even at the behaviouristic level, this sort of desire leads him to be the puppet of what he read about knights so that his daily routines become reduced to the simplistic formula of ‘copy and paste.’ Therefore, the reader has certainly to laugh on him on grasping the extent of artificiality Quixote reaches: “he did not sleep in all the night, thinking about his lady Dulcinea, to conform with what he had read in his books, where knights errant spent many sleepless nights in glades and deserts, engrossed in the recollection of their ladies.” (Chapter VIII. 55) Perhaps, Sancho – Quixote’s squire – does well in defining ‘knight errantry’ within its simplistic framework elaborated by his master’s ‘mimetic desire.’ When asked by the ladies at the inn what is meant by ‘knight errantry,’ Sancho says: “‘a knight adventurer, to cut a long story short, is someone who is being beaten up one moment and being crowned emperor the next. Today he is the unhappiest creature in the world, and the poorest, too; and tomorrow, he will have two or three kingdoms to hand over to his squire.’” (Chapter XVI. 92) Of course, Sancho says that out of his desperate situation not just of waiting the prize his master Quixote promises him, but also in the aftermath of several defeats, including that by the wicked men from Yanguas who cause them severe injuries the ladies, at the inn, are trying to heal.

Certainly, the stark illogicality that the reader can easily touch in Quixote’s discourse helps provide the narrator with enough space to launch his desire to elaborate a counter-discourse to his character. In this context, the narrator’s use of parody to flagrantely expose the subjection of Quixote’s discourse to inner-contradictions, in addition to enhancing the light atmosphere of the novel and furnish the grounds for humor in it, implements the desire the narrator states explicitly ‘to make men hate those false, absurd histories in books of chivalry’ and cause them ‘to totter’ and ‘tumble to the ground.’ In the words of Réné Girard, “Cervantes schematizes and magnifies the contrasts to create an extremely farcical effect.” (231) For sure, this ‘extremely farcical effect’ produced out of parodying his character’s so-far made effete discourse contributes a great deal in sustaining the element of humor delineating the whole texture of the novel. By virtue of that humor, the narrator succeeds in mating his declared ‘hatred of books of chivalry’ with an affable character whose ‘mimetic desire’ to conform to these books in his own person is introduced in such a simplistic context of mimicry that softens the rigidity of the authorial ‘hatred’ to such a desire. I recollect, here, Peter Childs’ comment on the specificity of ‘parody’ as an exercise of mimicry: “Although it is often deflationary and comic, the distinguishing characteristic of parody is not deflation, but analytic mimicry.” (167) For such an ‘analytic mimicry’ to take place, there must be a desire on the reader’s part to see what is behind the lines, that is to say, not to be contented with laughing at Quixote’s ‘mimetic desire’ but to stand on its nature, its course of development and its diverse implications.

Conclusion

The study geared towards analyzing ‘mimetic desire’ in Cervantes’ novel Don Quixote, applying Réné Girard’s anthropological views delineated in his book Deceit, Desire, and the Novel. A schematic presentation of the operation of ‘mimetic desire’ from within the novel’s hero was followed throughout this paper, after elucidating its workings and ramifications at the theoretical level. All the while, there was set a special focus on the importance of medieval knight errantry on shaping the hero’s desire and on determining his life as a whole. Equally, the hero’s ultimate renunciation of chivalric discourse altogether before his death was dealt with in relation to the
narrator’s voicing of his own desire as a substitutable counter-discourse aimed at displacing his character’s ‘mimetic desire.’ In this respect, this paper foregrounded the marked presence of parody in the novel and its vital role in enhancing the high measure of humor suffusing it.
References


American Multiculturalism vs. French Ethno-pluralism: The Debate over Arab and Muslim Assimilation

Lanouar Ben Hafsa
University of Tunis, Tunisia

Abstract

Although they have become more visible across the Western world, Arabs and Muslims remain inadequately described and poorly misunderstood. In the United States, inasmuch as in France, despite their expanding numbers and their growing involvement into the decision making process, both groups still suffer from widespread prejudice, especially the negative image conveyed about them in the media and within some political circles.

Until the 1970s, Arab and Muslim immigrants had been a neglected dimension in either American or French ethnic and religious history. But the rise in the number of such foreign-born residents in both countries added to the growing fear over the upsurge of Islamic fundamentalism, and generated considerable interest and public debate on how well these groups would assimilate into the mainstream culture of their host societies and fit within a pre-established order.

This paper not only aims to cast a fresh and objective look into how American and French citizens of Arab and Muslim descent adjust to their new environment, but also attempts to provide some insights into how the United States and France accommodate Islam, as both nations, because of their different immigration histories and their relatively diverging ideologies, do not have a communality of views on how society should be structured and organized.

Two elements have been decisive for such a study: first, my experience in France as a postgraduate student at Sorbonne University, second, the research I conducted in 2004 on Arab Americans as Senior Fulbright at the Center for Arab American Studies, at the University of Michigan-Dearborn. Both encounters not only helped me draw a number of conclusions regarding the respective experiences of two communities, united by common historical and cultural ties, but so different as to the way they adapt to their host societies. They especially enhanced my understanding of what it really means to be Arab or Muslim in France and in the United States.

To support the research’s central point, a number of questions will be addressed: Are Arab-Americans in general and American Muslims in particular unwilling to assimilate? Is Islam inherently incompatible with Western and Judeo-Christian values? Should policymakers see Islam as the enemy of the West? Should the prevalent anti-Americanism in the Arab and Muslim world be understood within the broader context of “clash of civilizations” or “war of religions”, as stressed...
by some scholars, or should it be considered as a “natural response” to a temporary conjuncture necessitating reconsideration and change? Finally, what role should Arab and Muslim leaders in both countries play to provide community stability and maintain their identity in an ever-changing world?

Keywords: Arab Americans, American Muslims, French Arabs and Muslims, American Muticulturalism, French Ethno-pluralism, Assimilation.
Background

The epithets “Arab” and “Muslim” are usually muddled up and in most French people’s minds – in as much as American people’s perceptions – both terms are interchangeable. In practice, they do not even overlap as Arabs can be Muslim, Christian or Jewish, etc. Worldwide, people of Arab descent constitute only a minority. Although Islam is often associated with the Arab world, fewer than fifteen percent of Muslims are Arab.1 If, however, most Arab residents in France are Muslim, making roughly ten percent of the overall population2, in the United States, contrary to popular assumptions, the majority of Arabs are Christian, with Muslims making one-third of the Arab population.3

It is onerous to accurately estimate the total number of Arabs or Muslims who live in France4 and the United States simply because both countries made it illegal to compile data based on religious or ethnic affiliation. The figures provided, therefore, are based rather on contrasted gauging published by non-governmental institutions. As of 2010, according to the French Ministry of Interior (in charge of religious affairs and which does not have the right to enquire straightforwardly about religion and applies criterion of people’s geographic origin as a basis for calculation)5, there are between five to six million Muslims in metropolitan France, the largest Muslim minority in Europe. Those of Maghreb origin represent eighty-two percent of the Muslim population (42.2% from Algeria, 27.5% from Morocco, and 11.4% from Tunisia).6

Across the Atlantic, 1,967,219 are of Arab descent, according to the 2010 Census.7 On the other hand, research by the Arab American Institute and Zogby International suggest that – without taking into consideration ancestry’s issue – the Census Bureau’s estimation is substantially lower than the actual number which they adjust at 3,665,789. To put it bluntly, that is roughly one percent of the American population. Most of Arab Americans are Christian (sixty-three percent), with Muslims counting merely twenty-four percent.8

Contrary to their French counterparts, most Arabs in America are highly educated and have better economic prospects. Whereas Muslims or Arabs in France either suffer from unemployment or typically hold low-paid manual jobs with little chance of upward socio-economic mobility. Arab Americans fare quite well compared even to the average American. With at least a high school, they

1 Nearly one-fourth of the world population today is Muslim and, contrary to widespread attitudes, most Muslims are concentrated in Southeast Asia. As to recent surveys, there are 203 million Muslims in Indonesia, 174 million in Pakistan, 161 million in India, 145 million in Bangladesh, 22 million in China, etc. (See: http://www.islam.about.com/od/muslimcountries/a/population).
3 The Arab American Institute. (See: http://www.aaiusa.org/pages/demographics/).
4 Due to a law dating back to 1872, the French Republic prohibits performing census by making distinction between its citizens regarding their race or their religion.
7 U.S. Census Bureau (2010). (See: http://www.census.gov/2010census/).
8 The Arab American Institute. (See: http://www.aaiusa.org/pages/demographics/).
number eighty-nine percent. More than forty-five percent have a Bachelor’s degree and eighteen percent a Post-graduate diploma, respectively twice the American average.\textsuperscript{9}

The higher rates of education translate into a pattern of prestigious and remunerative employment. Indeed, seventy-three percent of working Arab Americans are employed in managerial, professional, technical, sales or administrative fields. Most work in the private sector (eighty-eight percent), whereas a mere twelve percent hold governmental positions.\textsuperscript{10}

In contrast, French Arabs are doing less well and tend to be poorer, on average, than the nation as a whole. As in much of Europe and contrary to Arab Americans who have been settling since the 1880s, the French Arab community was established largely by waves of immigrant laborers in the 1960s through the mid-1970s, and had continued under family reunification provisions ever since. These populations have grown, but remained, by and large, below average in income and social status, as many of them are at best either semi-skilled or unskilled workers. Recent studies which focus on “immigrants” but refer to Muslim-related issues – describe the more than two million residents of increasingly “ghettoized” suburbs where unemployment and crime rates are disproportionately high – as forming a “culturally distinct, socially and economically ‘excluded’ population.”\textsuperscript{11} In an article about the 2005 civil unrest in France, Ralph Peters, a retired U.S. army lieutenant colonel and author, wrote that France’s “apartheid” has a distinctly racial aspect. In his view, “France’s 5 million brown and black residents (have) failed to appreciate discrimination, jobless rates of up to 50 percent, public humiliation, crime, bigotry and, of course, the glorious French culture that excluded them through an informal apartheid system.”\textsuperscript{12}

When it comes to political participation, the gap between the two communities widens further, even though both agree on the pressing need for more political clout and more involvement into the decision making process. Here, Arab Americans who, starting from the early 1980s, decided to take their own affairs in hand, seem more visible and better represented across the political spectrum. While in France, citizens of Arab heritage feel further marginalized by their exclusion from politics – despite their growing numbers – their American counterparts hold public office almost at all levels. To cite but a few examples, five Arab Americans served in the U.S. Senate and nine in the U.S. House of Representatives, three have been governors, and more than thirty have been mayors of U.S. cities.\textsuperscript{13} In contrast, there have been only one full minister of Arab descent in France (Rachida Dati, Minister of Justice in Nicolas Sarkozi’s first administration), and a handful of Cabinet members, but none among France’s 577 members of the National Assembly, and none among France’s 36,000 mayors.\textsuperscript{14}

Higher official positions are equally rarely occupied by French nationals of Arab or Muslim background. A case in point, when in January 2004, President Jacques Chirac declared Aïssa

\footnotesize{\textsuperscript{9} U.S. Census Bureau (2010). Op.cit.} 
\footnotesize{\textsuperscript{10} See: http://www.b.3cdn.net/aai/fcc68db3efdd45f613_vim6ii3a7.pdf.} 
\footnotesize{\textsuperscript{11} Economic data, such as employment and income, are central for studying both communities, yet they are poorly addressed as there are no official government statistics on religious affiliation in France and the United States.} 
\footnotesize{\textsuperscript{12} Ralph Peters. “France’s Intifada.” New York Post. Nov. 8, 2005.} 
\footnotesize{\textsuperscript{13} The Roster of Arab Americans in Public Service and Political Life (see: http://www.aaiusa.org/index_ee.php/pages/arab-american-roster).} 
\footnotesize{\textsuperscript{14} See: http://www.pbs.org/wnet/wideangle/shows/france/info4.html.}
Dermouche the new prefect (senior state representative) of the Jura region, a bomb destroyed his car just three weeks after his nomination. A few days later, another explosion damaged the front door and glass façade of Audencia, a leading French business school of which he was head, and on January 29, a third detonation caused minor damage to a letterbox at the school of one of Dermouche’s sons.15

On the whole, by many standards, Arab Americans seem to be offered worthier opportunities for assimilation, thanks notably to the American multicultural context as a whole, but also to the political activism of a socio-culturally integrated Christian Arab community. However, despite their economic and political achievements, and although the U.S. Census Bureau classifies Arabs as white alongside the European majority, a sizable number among them still believe they are not treated as whites, but more like such other minorities as Asian Americans or Hispanic Americans.16

The Debate over Assimilation: Are Arabs Unwilling to Assimilate?

Although they have become more visible over the last few decades, Arabs in France and the United States remain inadequately described and poorly misunderstood. Until the 1970s, Arab immigrants had been a neglected dimension in either French or American ethnic and religious history. But the rise in the number of such foreign-born residents, in both countries, added to the growing fear over the upsurge of Islamic fundamentalism, has generated considerable interest and public debate on how well these groups would assimilate into the mainstream of their host societies.

This is not a paper about Islam. Our endeavor is to scrutinize a modus operandi of thinking and of expression through the respective experiences of two communities, united by a common historical and cultural heritage, but remarkably disparate as to the fashion they adjust to their new environments and to the way they respond to the challenges in order to maintain their identity in an ever-changing world.

Perhaps the best way to tackle this controversial and polarizing issue would be first to raise the following questions: What place do Arab Americans and Arabs based in France hold in the social fabric of their host countries? In other words, do they fully make part of the social landscape, or are they simply considered as aliens pursuing a dream that is beyond their reach? What should they do to challenge and overcome the stereotype many of their fellow-citizens make of them as being eternally the members of a foreign creed that is fundamentally alien to the Western experience and history? Now that we unknowingly associate them with Islam, does their Islamic identity constitute an insurmountable hindrance on the path of assimilation? Is Islam incompatible with the Western and Judeo-Christian values? Should the prevalent anti-Americanism in the Arab and Muslim worlds be understood within the broader context of “clash of civilizations” or “war of

religions”, as stressed by some scholars\textsuperscript{17}, or should it be considered as a “natural” response to a temporary conjuncture necessitating reconsideration and change?

In effect, if the first wave of Arab immigrants to the United States who arrived in the 1880s from the province of Mount Lebanon, in Greater Syria, sought to assimilate and blend in what it was perceived as American mainstream culture, that was not the case for North African immigrants, namely Algerians who started to arrive in the early Twentieth Century. Up to 1959, this group constituted the largest non-European immigrant presence anywhere in Europe, and the great public controversy they aroused, generated perceptions of colonial “barbarians” invading the very heart of the empire.\textsuperscript{18}

Besides the depiction, some newspapers made of them as being “animals”, “primitive savages”, “rapists” and “transmitters of venereal diseases and tuberculosis”, and thus a threat to metropolitan society, it became a real challenge for the French officials to break down their resistance to integration into the French society. Because, contrary to most immigrant groups like Italians, Poles, and Spanish who gradually assimilated by participating into different working class organizations and associations (trade unions, sports clubs, the Communist Party), Algerians reconstituted in France small and “micro-ghettos”, impermeable to any outside influence. Their rationale down to the Algerian independence in 1962 was founded on a project to return to the homeland and a definite refusal to strike roots in France.\textsuperscript{19}

Up until the early 1980s, and even though they stood for the largest Muslim community in Europe, there was no or limited media focus on such a group named French Arabs or French Muslims.\textsuperscript{20} Furthermore, not only the government of Giscard d’Estaing (1974-1981) deepened its anti-immigrant stance by adopting a wide array of measures meant to severely reduce the flux of immigrants from North and sub-Saharan Africa, but Arabs, despite their increasing numbers, were still an invisible community and their prayer rooms were unrecognizable as they were improvised in basements, garages, and council flats (they had none of the external architectural symbolism of the traditional mosque with a minaret and a dome).

The Iranian Revolution of 1979 led to a conspicuous turning point. Both at governmental and public levels, there were no clear signs of a growing anxiety about Islamic fundamentalism beginning to penetrate mainland France. Immediately after a bomb exploded at St. Charles station in Marseilles, in December 1983, The French officials began to apprehend the threat from within, a menace better articulated by Gaston Deferre, Interior Minister and mayor of Marseille who, in 1984, told the press that religious practice until then had been apolitical, “an excellent thing… But, step by step, the fundamentalists got a foothold in the mosques, became the managers or the leaders,  


and began to make propaganda and to proselytize. This is dangerous because they can act as intermediaries when bombings are perpetrated.”

Interestingly, casting a penetrating glance into Deferre’s political discourse reveals a second but equally important anti-Muslim theme, the Arab or Muslim unwillingness to integrate or to assimilate. For across the media and within political and academic circles, the pivotal question was no longer one of controlling the immigration flow from Arab and Muslim countries, but has shifted to a profound disquiet toward those considered as the “inassimilable stock” and the “racially different other”. According to Deferre, contrary to other immigrants (namely Italians and Spanish) who had assimilated, become naturalized and now “occupy important position, almost everywhere”, “Arabs” and Algerians, more specifically, reconstituted large extended family networks, “groupings after the several dozen people who, in addition, wear traditional clothing and live according to the customs of their country. They roast in the yard, etc.”

Articulating a shift toward widespread and overt forms of racism, he added that the laws of Islam in the sphere of marriage, divorce, gender roles, and family life “are in contradiction with the rules of the French Law.”

The new visibility of Muslims, fostered by the construction of purposely built mosques of which the most controversial was inaugurated at Montes-la-Jolie in 1981, was perceived by almost all major political parties and the general public as an “invasion” and an “aggressive” assertion of the Muslim faith, even though there was no significant change in the number of Muslim immigrants. The worst case scenario of a takeover by radical Islamists and which presented all Muslims as potential terrorists, would not only tighten control around the Arab community, but would further legitimize racist and xenophobic sentiments, a new mobilizing issue of which the still uninspiring National Front would emerge as the uncontested champion. As a consequence, because of the growing homogeneity in the political discourse around the use of anti-immigrant rhetoric as a key electoral card, the National Front, which astutely knew how to substitute a traditional biological racism with one based on cultural differences, moved, within a few years only, from an insignificant party into a central player on the national scene.

Today, the situation of Arabs and Muslims on the other side of the Atlantic is not substantially different. Even though it is the fastest-growing faith in the United States, Islam remains either widely misunderstood or simply viewed as foreign, mysterious, and even threatening to the nation’s “Judeo-Christian heritage.” In fact, attempts to target Islam as an alien creed and portray Muslims as the members of a cult based on hatred of the American society and associated with terrorist activity abroad and inside the United States, did not emerge after the 9/11 attacks on the World Trade Centre and the Pentagon. Years before the shock, scholars such as Samuel Huntington of Harvard and Bernard Lewis of Princeton, and publicists like Daniel Pipes and Steven Emerson were envisaging the likelihood of clashes between Islam and the West.

Said Karina Rollins, editor of The American Enterprise, a neoconservative public policy

---

22 Muslim immigrants were called « Arabs », a stereotype that bore Orientalist assumptions, when in reality many originated in non-Arab societies such as Turks, Kabyles or Berbers, Pakistanis, etc.
23 Les Temps Modernes, op.cit.
24 Ibid.
magazine:

“The Cold War is over, but the battle of good vs. evil rages stronger than ever. At some point in the future, the human thirst for liberty and self-determination may sweep even the Islamic world. But today, a fresh enemy is at civilization’s gate, and it’s time we recognized him.”

Since 1994 and the airing by Public Broadcasting Service (PBS) of Steven Emerson’s documentary, *Jihad in America*, Arab and Muslim Americans have been looked at as suspects. In his article “America’s Muslims Against America Jews,” Daniel Pipes, director of the neoconservative think tank, Middle East Forum, and Bush’s nominee, in 2003, to the U.S. Institute of Peace, went so far as to suggest that Muslims constituted a monolithic bloc, intrinsically anti-Semitic and driven by hatred.

Criticizing American Muslim groups for not distancing themselves from terrorism and anti-American sentiments in their countries of origin, Pipes pointed out Islam’s universalizing and missionary impulse and the threat this might represent to religious pluralism in America. “The ambition to take over the United states is not new,” he argued, “(t)he first missionaries for militant Islam, or Islamism, who arrived here from abroad in the 1920s, unblushingly declared, ‘Our plan is we are going to conquer America.” To him converting Americans has always been the central purpose of Muslim existence in the United States, the only possible justification for Muslims to live in an “infidel land.”

Assaults on Islam and attempts to reinvent a “religious” Cold War dubbed as the “Green Scare”; and Muslims targeted as the enemies of the West were not the declared targets of neoconservative ideologies alone. They made also part of a huge campaign launched by Islamophobic leaders of the New Christian Right who never miss an opportunity to question the compatibility of the Islamic faith with the American values. Even though implicitly denounced on several occasions by President Bush to whom “Islam, as practiced by the vast majority of people, is a peaceful religion, a religion that respects others,” and later by President Obama in his outreach address to the Muslim World, when he declared: “I consider it part of my responsibility as President of the United States to fight against negative stereotypes of Islam whenever they appear,” their much-publicized remarks not only revived tensions in the Arab and Muslim worlds, but also fuelled an already growing anti-American sentiment. Remarks such as the one made by Franklin Graham, son of televangelist Rev. Billy Graham, who called Islam “an evil religion” inherently at odds with American values, or that made by Rev. Jerry Vines who called the prophet “a demon-possessed paedophile,” to cite but a few, are illustrative of the radical Religious Right view of Islam, fundamentally based on the rejection of the “other.”

27 Ibid.
To Daniel Pipes, finally, the real danger to the American democracy and to the American religious pluralism did not emanate from the pro-Israel Christian Right. More specifically, American Jewish organizations should not devote considerable resources and energy targeting the New Religious Right while virtually ignoring the rise of “Islamist fascism”. He warned:

“The real and present danger is by no means the pro-Israel Christian Coalition but the rapidly anti-Semitic Muslim Arab Youth Association; not Jerry Falwell but Sheikh Omar Abdel Rahman31; not those who wish, at the very worst, to convert Jews but those who, with every means at their disposal, intend to do them harm, who have already acted on those violent intentions, and who if unchecked will surely do so again.”32

American Multiculturalism vs. French Ethno-pluralism

“Unlike any other country, America is defined by its spirit and human values, not by its ethnic background. We are the only truly secular country in the world,”33 wrote once Anne Wortham, one of the most perceptive American sociologists. Such claim may be legitimate in so far that, besides the presence of a socio-culturally integrated and a politically active Christian Arab community, the American multicultural context appears exceptionally convenient for Muslims. To some extent their status is better than their European counterparts as they enjoy the constitutional advantages offered by the “land of the free”, especially wider political freedoms, greater economic rewards, and the protection of their worship by the federal and state constitutions.

France-based Muslims, by contrast, are still laying claim to legitimacy alongside the Catholic, Protestant, and Jewish communities. In effect, the debate over how France and the United States accommodate Islam or how Muslims adapt to life in a secular society seems to have deeper implications as perceptions on both sides are grounded at the core of a long history of confrontational but also peaceful existence. Because of their different immigration histories, and, to a certain extent, diverging ideologies, France and the United States do not have a communality of views on how society should be structured and organized.

This is mirrored in the way both countries deal with their Arab and Muslim communities and the place they have reserved for them within the fabric of their respective societies. On April 2003, the French government created the French Council for the Muslim Religion (Conseil Français du Culte Musulman) -- a body that represents all Muslims in negotiating on practical problems of their religion with the French State.34 By and large, the council is part of the

31 In 1993, Sheikh Abderraehman masterminded the bombing of the World Trade Center in New York which resulted in the killing of six persons and the injuring of more than a thousand.
32 D. Pipes, “American Muslims against American Jews,” op. cit. Noting that the Christian Right have been staunch supporters of Israel. This commitment stems not from guilt over past Christian sins against Jews but from a theological doctrine widely shared in fundamentalist and Pentecostal circles known as “Dispensationalist Premillennialism.” In this view, a complete restoration of the nation of Israel, including the rebuilding of the Temple in Jerusalem, is a prerequisite to the Second Coming of Christ and the establishment of his millennial reign.
34 The CFCM was set up by Nicolas Sarkozy, minister of interior at the time, which the state now officially recognizes as a discussion partner for religious issues. The council, however, is merely a private non-profit association and has no special legal standing, nor is it universally accepted as being representative of the opinions of Muslims residing in France.
government’s project to mainstream Muslims in the French culture and to give them “a place at the table.” Likewise, it has been quite recently (September, 2003) that the first Muslim high school, the Lycée Averroes, opened in the city of Lille. The school, which would uphold the strict French rule on “secular” teaching and follow the national curriculum, is intended to provide Muslim youth with the same core education that celebrates the republic’s values as public schools.

Undoubtedly, with more than six million people making roughly ten per cent of the French population, the community’s religious needs could not be under-estimated. Yet, the simple idea of building a mosque, somewhere, inflames passions among the public and drives local and national political leaders into a collective hysteria. This is despite the fact that there are more than 1,500 mosques and Muslim prayer rooms in France, compared to 40,000 Catholic buildings, 957 temples and 82 synagogues, with only a handful which have domes and minarets. The case of the Cergy mosque which, while still in construction, had already galvanized passions and led one local opposition politician to warn that its minarets might rise higher than the town’s church steeples.

On the whole, the feeling that the French integration model does not work quickly or as well for Arabs and Muslims as it did once for other waves of immigrants represents a profound challenge for France’s long inherited ideology of Republican citizenship. Deeply hostile, as it might seem, to the kind of multiculturalism and recognition of ethnic minority rights found in the United States or in Great Britain, French republicanism is based on the Jacobin tradition of France “one and indivisible” (La République une et indivisible) which had been constructed mainly under the First Republic (1792-1804). According to this universal ideology which emphasized the equality of all citizens within the state, there could be no intermediate bodies or poles of allegiance that might detract from the uniform relationship between each individual citizen and the state. So any articulation of group interests should be discouraged.

In such scheme of things, and in the name of the so-called French ethno-pluralism, some French thinkers like Alain de Benoist, reject the view that Europe can come closer to the United States in order to strengthen Western civilization. Rather, they call for France to defend its civilization from multicultural meltdown and the homogenizing forces of global American media, or what they call the “Coca-Colonizing” and “McDonaldizing” effects of the United States popular culture.

Interestingly enough, France and the United States do not share the same views on the dynamics of civil society only. They also seem to diverge as to the type of relationship that should exist between Church and State. For, unlike the United States where in terms of Alexis de

---

35 Consisting of three classrooms and a science laboratory on the third floor of a mosque, the goal of the school is to provide Muslims with an alternative to public education, like those that French Catholics, Protestants and Jews have long enjoyed. Courses are taught in Arabic, Islamic culture and history are offered as electives and Quranic studies are assured for only one hour a week. There is no requirement that the students be Muslim, though all of them are, or that the girls go to school veiled. Like other private schools, if it meets all these requirements, it is eligible for state aid after five years.


Tocqueville, “… from the beginning politics and religion were in accord, and they have not ceased to be so since,” 39 France, no doubt as a result long history of religious violence (including the Religious Wars, 1562-1598), favours strict separation between the two as a way to guarantee that religious competition and religious proselytizing do not spawn ataxia in the public sphere.

Notwithstanding, if the purpose of separating Church and State in the United States was principally meant to avoid interference of the government in church matters and to protect, ultimately religion from the state, in France, it was exactly the reverse. The purpose of separating Church and State was to protect the new French democracy from the Catholic Church, at the time socially and politically dominant, and staunchly opposed to the establishment of a secular democracy. To Gilles Kepel, no doubt the most prominent specialist in France of the question and who regards Islamic revivalism as an extremely grave threat to Republican assimilation, strict separation of Church and State has been part of the French Constitution since 1905. In his well-known book, Allah in the West: Islamic Movements in America and Europe (Cambridge: Polity, 1997), he asserted: “French political tradition actively combated any form of regional, ethnic or religious identity which could weaken the link between the individual and the state.” 40

But nothing better than the so-called “headscarf affair” 41 could further showcase the debate over Muslims’ integration and the way they cope with their new secular environment. The event started in 1989, after three schoolgirls of North African descent were expelled from their high school, Gabriel-Havez in Creil (north of Paris), on the grounds that the veil or hijab was a provocative religious symbol in breach of the 1905 “laïcité” law protecting the secular, non-religious nature of state education. So what started as a local row snowballed into a nationwide debate as the “affair” gave way to a whole complex of issues confirming French Muslims as perpetual outsiders in French society. For many commentators in the media and across the political spectrum, the young girls were steadfastly being manipulated by invisible forces or forces acting behind-the-scenes to challenge and subvert the foundations of the Republic, namely the principle of separation of church and state. 42

On March 15, 2004, after a protracted and gruelling debate and to settle down the question once and forever, President Jacques Chirac, based upon the recommendations of the “Stasi Commission,” 43 signed what came to be called as the “French law on secularity and conspicuous religious symbols in schools.” 44 It forbids pupils from wearing “conspicuous” signs of belonging to a religion, wearing any visible symbol meant to be seen. Prohibited items would include

40 Ibid., p. 236.
43 An investigation commission which Chirac set up in July 2003 to examine how the principle of laïcité should apply in practice and which, on December 11, 2003, published its report ruling that ostentatious displays of religion violated the secular rules of the French school system.
44 « Loi encadrant, en application du principe de laïcité, le port de signes ou de tenues manifestant une appartenance religieuse dans les écoles, collèges et lycées publics ». (Translated: « By virtue of the law applying the principle of secularism, the wearing of signs or uniforms showing any religious affiliation at public primary and secondary school »).
headscarves for Muslim girls, yarmulkes for Jewish boys, turbans for Sikh boys and large Christian crosses. It allows, however, the wearing of discreet symbols of faith such as small crosses, Stars of David or Fatima’s hands. The law concerns only public primary and secondary schools. It does not concern other public spaces, nor does it concern public universities or other establishments of higher education.

According to those who approved the ban, besides the fact that the headscarf stood for female subjugation, wearing such a symbol outrageously violated the secular principle outlined by the 1905 law on “laïcité”, and ran counter the goal of schools to function as places of neutrality and critical awareness. They also saw the law as, first and foremost, a protection against oppressive patriarchal authority of radical fathers and brothers. Suffice to read Samira Bellil’s book, Dans l’Enfer des Tourmentes (Paris: Gallimard, 2003), (In Gang Rape Hell), proponents of the ban said, to discover the harsh reality of those Muslim girls who, because they refused to wear the headscarf and adopt a dress code in the poor suburbs, were regarded as “prostitutes” and subjected to gang rape.

The “headscarf affair” was a critical juncture in the unfolding of France’s relationship with its Muslim minority. Not only it shook the very bedrock of the French society, but it also served – according to some French Muslims who refuted any allegation accusing them of plotting to thwart the nation’s secular heritage – to promote the image of France that restricts personal freedom. A tendency broadly shared across the American public opinion which could not understand how the wearing of such personal symbols in public schools could violate the principles of religious freedom. This is echoed in the diverging perceptions – in both countries – of the kind of relationship likely to exist between Church and State. For the Bush administration which publicly criticized France for practicing a too rigorous separation of church and state, the law was simply inappropriate as

“all persons should be able to practice their religion and their beliefs peacefully, without government interference, as long as they are doing so without provocation and intimidation on others in society.”

But according to French officials and many supporters of the ban, public schools were plainly the bulkiest remaining but most robust institutions for the systematic moulding of all children, regardless of their ethnic origin, into the universal values of the Republic. French public schools, they argued, have long been areas where a new civic identity could be nurtured, free from any anti-democratic influence of any religion, in other words, veritable “mills of citizenship” and “Frenchness”.

45 According to a February 2004 survey by CSA for the daily, Le Parisien, 69% of the population favored the ban, against 29% who were opposed to it. For Muslims living in France, the same survey showed 42% for and 53% against, and among Muslim women, 49% approved the proposed law, and 43% approved it. (See: http://www.economist.com/world/europe/displayStory.cfm?story-id=2404691). More significantly, a January 2004 survey for Agence France Presse showed overwhelming support among the teachers with 78% in favour of the ban. (See: http://www.laic.info/Members/webmstre/Revue_de_presse.2004-0204.2241/view).

46 This is, among others, the daily combat of a recently founded feminist organization, “Ni Putes, Ni Soumises” (Neither Whores, Nor Submissives) which was supportive of the law and which rallied in Paris, on March 8, 2003, more than 30,000 people for “The March of Women from the Projects Against Ghettos and for Equality” (La marche des femmes des quartiers contre les ghettos et pour l’égalité).

In \textit{toto}, while it is intricate to predict what kind of relationship that might exist between Islam and the West in the near and farther future, both French and American Arab and Muslim communities seem today decided to react to the clouds of suspicion hanging over them, as they realized that they had little influence on the policies of their host countries. But they need, first, to voice their concerns through the mainstream political organizations, if they want to gain national visibility and recognition.

This seems fairly achievable for Arab Americans and American Muslims as they now have become aware that they could exert greater political pressure if they invest in building grass-roots political structures and, most of all, overcome their ethnic, religious, and cultural differences which, so far, have complicated their ability to reach political cohesiveness. Notwithstanding their small numbers (representing less than three per cent of the American population) Arab and Muslim activists are convinced that if they vote as a bloc, they could make the difference in key electoral swing states where they are concentrated, such as Michigan, Pennsylvania, Ohio, New Mexico, Florida and Wisconsin.\footnote{This is at least what they think they did in Florida, in 2000, claiming that their support for George W. Bush made the difference in favor of the Republican candidate who, thanks in part to the 40,000 Arab and Muslim voters, ended up winning the state by slightly more than 500 votes in the final recount.}

Another reason for persuasive political participation and adequate contribution to organized fund-raising groups, known as Political Action Committees (PACs), is their perception that the Patriot Act, passed in 2001, hinders their civil liberties and allows their communities to be unfairly targeted by law enforcement. Their disappointment with Bush’s handling of the national security affairs after the shock of 9/11, not only buttressed the \textit{desideratum} for a power transmission from elite to grass-roots organizations, but also produced a major shift in strategy. Now convinced that no candidate will be likely to change the American Middle East policy and Washington’s full and uncontested support for Israel, fighting against rejection and negative stereotyping has become a rallying cry for the disparate Arab and Muslim communities, and the single most important issue for every single Arab and every single Muslim who directly or indirectly experienced discrimination.

On their part, despite the existence of a web of strong historical bonds that links France and North Africa, French Arabs and Muslims still find it difficult to break the vicious circle around them and get acceptance in the country they now call home. Less organized as they obviously lack the political experience and maturity of their American counterparts, they have no choice but to struggle to legalize and protect their status alongside similar lines to the country’s Jewish and Protestant minorities.

Paradoxical, as it might seem, the lack of recognition and the widespread anti-Arab and anti-Muslim prejudice are further nurtured by a steadfast refusal, on the part of policymakers, to recognize and seriously tackle the real needs of such “ghettoized” communities and especially the disaffected youth among them, commonly referred to as \textit{Beurs} (Arabs). For, the real problems are not religious or simply related to security matters, as many might allegedly suppose, they are rather social and economic and the row over the “headscarf affair” was but an outright distraction from the integration process. Added to that, the adverse role endorsed by the French media in the dissemination of anti-Muslim stereotypes\footnote{Noting that France’s Islamophobia is just a more subtle form of racism. Overt anti-Arab prejudice is no longer} served only to fuel an already heated context and
exacerbated tensions by creating an atmosphere of exaggerated feeling of insecurity. The contention over the wearing of the *niqab* (full head covering) in public places, and its banning in 2011, is another case in point.\(^50\)

**Conclusion**

To conclude, it seems fair to ascertain that while they utterly consider the founding of Arab and Muslim advocacy organizations as a giant step on the path of interfaith dialogue and a major vestige in the course of integration, France’s and America’s Arabs and Muslims yearn for more than acceptance. They aspire for respect, respect for their culture, respect for their faith, and respect for them as human beings. In such a case only, could they develop sincere relationships based on mutual respect, act as bridge communities, help boost understanding between the different cultures, and why not serve as the moving force behind the wind of change in their home and host societies.

Over it all, as the nomenclature “global village” has become more supportive of democratic changes in government, time has become ripe for Muslims finally to attain what centuries of internal oppression and subsequent colonialism have prevented them from accomplishing. So far, Muslim policymakers in the Arab World have hidden behind religion to justify oppressive cultural choices. But Islam does not belong to any one country or region. It is committed to diversity.

References


http://ijhcschiefeditor.wix.com/ijhcs
Subjectivity and (non)belonging: Cormac McCarthy and the Psychotic Phenomenon in Child of God

Fadwa Ben Mohamed
University of Sousse, Tunisia

Abstract

The aim of this paper is to challenge and to rethink the concept of belonging in terms of the subject’s relation to language and body. Child of God is Cormac McCarthy’s celebrated book which has attracted a critical attention since its publication in 1973. The novel is about Lester Ballard’s growing madness which frustrates any attempt at defining subjectivity within the boundaries of language and body. Relying on the Lacanian theory of the Real and the Derridean notion of cryptonomy, this paper explores the psychotic phenomenon in Child of God, a phenomenon that deconstructs the concept of belonging. In this novel, McCarthy’s main character is remarkable in the sense that he undermines the logocentric assumptions in the authority of the concept of belonging. Ballard embodies the failure to become a subject, leading to psychosis. Thus, this paper tackles two major aspects of the psychotic phenomenon. A first part deals with Ballard’s psychotic discourse which is outside language, outside the Symbolic, belonging to the order of hallucinations and delusions. Ballard is someone who is inhabited, traumatized and invaded by language. His speech does not belong to him because it is the speech of all those voices incorporated within him. It is precisely this idea which lays the ground to the second part of this paper. Ballard’s body corresponds to the Derridean crypt, a body which is totally foreign to him and, thus, it is understood in terms of the Lacanian Real. At the root of this paper is the objective of undermining the idea of the subject’s linguistic and corporeal belonging long-held by the Western metaphysics by arguing that Ballard’s subjectivity is ultimately spectral and consequently, it exceeds the dialectics of body and language.

Keywords: Belonging - subjectivity - body - language - psychosis - the Real - the Symbolic - deconstruction
Introduction:

The Platonic Agathon, the Cartesian Cogito, the Hegelian Aufhebung, the Heideggerian Dasein and even the Saussurean Structuralism have maintained throughout history the subject’s corporeal sovereignty and linguistic mastery. Under these pronouncements, the subject is certain and in full control of his body and of the linguistic tool he uses to express himself. Certain phenomena like sexuality, madness, dreams, and hallucination have been repressed and excluded as savagery or a mere superstition that do not belong to the realm of Logos. The world has to wait decades for certain thinkers whose sweeping discoveries deconstruct and problematize the naïve understanding of the subject. Against the guardians of transcendentality and logocentrism, thinkers grouped under the umbrella term “post-structuralism” raise the old vexed questions about the issue of corporeal and linguistic belonging. Such problematic issues that beset the contemporary subject are echoed in the literary space in which writers become a rich source for these theoretical groundings.

My effort in this paper is to consider the question most neglected, that of the psychotic phenomenon and its undermining of the corporeal and linguistic belonging of the subject. In drawing on Jacques Derrida and Jacques Lacan’s rich legacies, I attempt to elucidate Cormac McCarthy’s dramatization of the phenomenon of the psychosis as embodied by his (anti)protagonist Lester Ballard in Child of God. McCarthy emerges as Derrida and Lacan’s literary analog, bringing to the fore the excluded and the outcast in his dark narratives which elucidate as much as they obscure. In what follows, I attempt to understand the psychotic’s discourse in terms of Lacan’s the Real, a discourse that bears no grounding in the symbolic order. In a similar vein, I draw upon Derrida’s cryptonomy to rethink the question of corporeal belonging. This paper, in no way, claims to give a comprehensive account of the problem of the psychosis, yet my hope is to cancel the logocentric assumptions of the subject’s linguistic and corporeal belonging through the conjunction of literature and theory.

Derrida vis-à-vis Lacan: Deconstruction Meets Psychoanalysis:

There are moments in Lacan’s body of works which correspond to the Derridean logic of deconstruction. Thus, a study interweaving both thinkers holds promise. It is to be noted that Lacan’s thinking about the subject and language is embraced by Derrida and Derrideans as well. Even though Derrida and Lacan are brought together under the term “poststructuralism”, a Lacanian/Derridean interchange is very scarce. This scarcity is explained mainly by a misunderstanding of Deconstruction as a mere textual analysis, a mere interest in the anarchic play of signifiers.

Lacan and Derrida meet in their understanding of the subject against the assumptions of the Western metaphysics. Lacan’s logic is not transcendent or logocentric, but rather a logic that exceeds the limits and confinement of any system or structure. On the definition of the structure, lacan argues against the totalizing impulse that it is a “set” and not “a totality”. He adds that this set may “have an open relation, which we call a relation of supplementarity” (183). In a similar gesture as Derrida’s attack on the “structurality of the structure,” Lacan argues that “…the signifier is a sign which refers to another sign, which is as such structured to signify the absence of another sign…” (167). In the same seminar, Lacan adds elsewhere that “…the relationship between the signifier and the signified is far from being, as they say in set theory, one-to-one” (119). The Real is Lacan’s
conceptualization of a realm that is not confined to the determinations of being versus non-being, but rather to that which is “unrealizable” (qtd. in Hurst 6). The Lacanian Real and the Derridean notion of “différance” which is the cornerstone of his theory of cryptonomy embody the discourses of rupture and inconsistencies, paradox, the play of signifiers and both think of the subject not as a unity, a Cartesian Ego, but as a split subject made up of irreconcilable differences. Andrea Hurst comments on this idea pointing out that both thinkers “make way for a third style of thinking supported by another ‘logic’ that exceeds the binary” (12). It is to be noted that both discourses are far from being nihilistic or anarchic. Both thinkers do not annihilate the system or structure of the subject but rather suspend them. This resistance to close up the question of the subject turns up to be the very condition of the survival of any system.

Eventhough both thinkers acknowledge their indebtedness to the Hegelian dialectical thinking, both reject his synthesizing tendencies of all differences under the order of the same which, for both of them, constitutes an act of violence and injustice. Both maintain the impossibility of any system to encompass the All (Hurst 323). The Lacanian Real is thought of as the impossible and the unrealizable. The Derridean crypt signals both presence and absence. Against the dialectical logic, both aim at preserving “an irremediable excess, remainder, or supplement in any system” (Hurst 323). Thus, Derrida and Lacan open the order of the same to that irreducible other which destabilizes and contaminates the subject.

Another common point bringing both thinkers is that they both operate within the same framework, that of the Freudian revolutionary psychoanalytic discoveries about the unconscious. In Beyond the Pleasure Principle, Freud paves the way to the Derridean aporetic logic of hauntology, explaining the disturbing effect of the return of the dead which corresponds to Derrida’s ghost theory (Davis 15). Freudian psychoanalysis recognizes the contaminating work of the ghost figure which resides in the unconscious and shakes, therefore, the very foundations of the master of Logos. Lacan, on the other hand, rescues the Freudian originality from the distortions of the ego psychology by laying down the contradictions inherent in his writings. Lacan’s return to Freud brings psychoanalysis closer to philosophy and linguistics. On the legacy of Freud, Hurst argues that “[t]he brothers [Lacan and Derrida] both kill and rescue father Freud by reinventing him” (373).

• **Child of God and Psychosis:**

• **The psychotic: Who is s/he?**

The psychotic is an extreme case of melancholia. s/he is a traumatic subject who suffers a lack of reconciliation with a lost object/ person and this loss gets stronger that it takes hold of her/his life which becomes “centred around compensation for the injury suffered and the claim it entails” (Lacan 12). Lacan describes him/ her as a “nasty person, an intolerable one, a bad-humored type, proud, mistrustful, irritable, and who over-estimated him/ herself” (4). The psychotic goes beyond the limits of order and law, falls into unbounded and irrational transgressions. A general portrait locates the psychotic as someone whose father figure is absent (dead) or problematic (bad relation). His/ her relation with the mother is an extreme one: either the mother is absent or s/he develops a strong unnatural relation with her. In both cases, s/he develops in his/ her own unconscious a sadistic attitude towards women including sexual abuse and torture. Surprisingly enough, the psychotic has the ability to integrate within the society and conceals the psychotic
structure lurking beneath his psyche. According to Lacan, psychosis is triggered by internal or external causes (8). Once s/he goes through a traumatic event or a crisis, the psychotic comes to confront his/ her state as a psychotic and thus the psychotic structure surfaces. This self-recognition engenders a loss of control over his psyche manifested in an uncontrollable destruction and self-destruction.

- **Lester Ballard and the Psychotic Question:**

  *Child of God* is McCarthy’s disturbing work about Ballard’s growing madness and regression to a nomadic and finally psychotic state. Ballard embodies the Lacanian outline of the psychotic phenomenon and the failure of subjectivity. Ballard is outside the realm of morality and law, beyond the standards of sanity and normalcy. His shocking characterization frustrates any attempt to define him within the norms of subjectivity. Bereft of his parents and his land, excluded by and from his community, he regresses to the mountains, the woods and the caves to degenerate in a life of animality and criminality. Throughout the novel, the reader encounters multiple passages figuring Ballard’s random and irrational violence towards people, animals and objects alike. A growing hatred and sadism lead to the breakdown of any possible communication with almost every one he encounters. His behavior is irrational and inexplicable. For instance, he runs the risk of escaping from the police officers only to show up later and surrenders to the local authorities. The first part of the novel confirms his ability to hide his psychotic structure. We learn that he goes to visit a friend (the dumpkeeper); he goes to shop and even to the church. Eric Hage argues that at the beginning, Ballard is not presented as a psychotic, but rather as “a hopeless outcast and weirdo” (57). McCarthy himself writes that he is “[a] child of God much like yourself perhaps” (6) confirming his disguising competence.

  Loss is very strong to trigger the psychotic structure to surface, especially that Ballard lacks the means (psychological and cultural) to make reconciliation with any form of loss. Ballard’s loss of his land and his house exacerbates his outcast state (McCarthy 10). With the loss of his properties, a part of his soul and his reason comes to be lost which could not be brought back again. Later as the story unfolds, we learn that he is an orphan. His mother is absent which leaves him in a continuous yearning for love and recognition (McCarthy 23). Without the mother figure to ground his psyche, Ballard develops a sadistic feeling and a desire to avenge all women. He would insult any woman he encounters, abusing his victim women, pouring in their ears a hell of curses and insults. His undecidability on the subject of women, both desiring and grudging them, killing them only to have a sexual intercourse with them, is symptomatic of his psychotic perplexity. Another and even more crucial event that sends Ballard into the abyss of psychosis is the suicide of his father and his witnessing of his corpse being hung. The narrator comments that Ballard “never was right after his daddy killed himself” (22). McCarthy provides an uncanny, shocking and disgusting image of the father’s corpse which Ballard comes to confront. The degree of Ballard’s shock relegates him to a silence typical of the silence of the disaster, as he witnesses but “never said nothing” (22). It is to be noted that Ballard’s symptomatic fixation on certain objects (guns, corpses, pictures) is explained by his primordial fixation on his father’s corpse which is frozen and incorporated in his unconscious.
• Child of God and the (non)belonging to the Symbolic:

• Psychosis and the Foreclosure of the-Name-of-the-Father:

The-Name-of-the-Father is essential to understand the phenomenon of psychosis. The-name-of-the-Father stands metaphorically to the primordial signifier which anchors the chain of signifiers and regulates the structure of the symbolic order. The psychotic is someone who has never experienced castration due to the absence of the father figure and hence he never enters successfully the symbolic. Lacan describes this (non)relation with castration in terms of “an abyss,” “a temporal subversion,” “a rupture in experience,” and argues that the psychotic is that who “has rejected all means of access to castration...all access to the register of the symbolic function” (131). Foreclosure of the-Name-of-the-Father in the case of the psychosis means that this primordial signifier, responsible for neutralizing and regulating the signifiers of the symbolic is barred and crossed out. Without the castration agent as the key signifier in the symbolic universe, which is here not a mere reference to a person, but rather has a cultural and a religious significance (Grubrich-Smitis 9), the child is unanchored in language and in reality, experiencing the world around him as an excess of ever-fleeting signifiers.

• The Real: The Order of Hallucination:

Lacan thinks of the Real as a realm of undifferentiated signifiers, cut loose from any symbolic anchor, that which cannot be apprehended, assimilated or grasped. “Indeed, the Real exists and resists, but is not a totality” (Ragland-Sullivan 190). In this case, the Real is what challenges and deconstructs the totality and the authority of the symbolic order by opening it to that wholly other (the unconscious). Therefore, the psychotic, being on the side of the Real is lost in an oceanic wholeness of signifiers which bear no grammatical structures in so far as they lack the key signifier (the-Name-of-the-Father). Whereas the symbolic is understood as made up of differentiation, elements gaining value (meaning) by “being opposed to another,” the Real is a realm of continuity and undifferentiation (Lacan 9). The psychotic’s relation to the world is characterized by “a hole, a rupture, a rent, a gap, with respect to external reality.” (Lacan 45). Since signifiers are not reduced to any signified, meaning for the psychotic remains enigmatic, undecipherable and never present. In this sense, the psychotic’s discourse does not relate to any meaning. He experiences the signifier as an excess of meaning and thus no meaning at all.

Ballard’s discourse does not belong to the symbolic; rather it belongs to another realm, the order of hallucination, both verbal and auditory. Ballard is basically a delusional, an unworlly being who constructs a world around him and gets even certain of its reality. “[H]is whole world has been transformed into a phantasmagoria of shadows of fleeting-impoveryished men” (Lacan 79). Hallucination is a manifestation of the Real, of a perverted relation with the world and its signifiers. Lorenzo Chiesa embarks on this idea arguing that due to the foreclosure of the-Name-of-the-Father, the perception of every day reality is replaced by auditory hallucinations (109).

McCarthy’s style is characterized by accumulating sentences and phrases linking them with the conjunction “and”, though no relation is felt, echoes Ballard’s verbatim. Ballard fails to get the meaning of the world around him. At times, he comes to see the world without being able to decipher it. He sees without seeing, gazing at people and objects as though they belong to a realm
unknown to him. In an interesting scene, Ballard goes to the smith to fix his axe and after watching the procedures, the smith asks him whether he “could do it now from watching?” to which Ballard answers “do what” (71). Elsewhere, he goes to the church but the priest’s words are “a biblical babbling to him” and he turns instead to gaze at “the notices on the board at the back of the church” (31). His unworldly being is also manifested through his lack of any sense of the real time. He lives in a time cut loose from any chronological reference: a creature outside time and thus outside the world.

Lacan points out that common symptoms include “insomnia, a flight of ideas, the appearance of more and more disturbing themes in his thoughts” (25). Ballard’s sleeping moments are interrupted each time by states of insomnia that McCarthy calls “some premonition of ill fate” (98). This restless insomnia is symptomatic of his delusional state, of being confused between reality and dreams. He would imagine people coming and going in search of him. He is taken by an overwhelming feeling of being spied upon or watched over: “Once he heard voices somewhere behind him and once he thought he saw a light” (178). Excluded from his community, Ballard plays a God-like role, making up his own community of the dead bodies of his victims, arranging them in his cave and talking to them as though they were alive. His speech is an endless repetition of curses and slang phrases, excluded from the norms and standards of the symbolic. Curses are not only geared towards others but towards himself as well which unveils his schizophrenic and masochistic attitudes. At times, his discourse sinks into an irrational hysterical laughter, an absurd laughter at the face of non-meaning, an unexplainable laughter at the petrifying face of the medusa.

• Cryptonomy and the Corporeal (non)belonging:

In his seminar on the psychoses, Lacan points out to the theme of the double already stated in Freud’s writings. Since the psychotic suffers an irredeemable fragmentation of identity, he comes to see himself as another. He would, for instance, talk of himself in terms of a totally foreign other. He would as well talk of the dead as though they were alive (Lacan 97). This split in his psyche is fostered by absorbing (but not assimilating) the infinite images of everything around him. These images maintain their autonomy within him and thus “continue to harm him” (Lacan 98). The “I” becomes a signifier infinitely divided, supplemented, deferred and ultimately lost in the oceanic invasion of the Real. This failure to see the body as a separate entity from others makes the body a tomb where everything and every one are incorporated. Lacan refers to this maddening state of drifting from the real world to the delusional world of ghostly others as “the twilight of the world” (107). It is this thinking of the psychotic body as a tomb which corresponds to Derrida’s concept of the crypt, the body inhabited by the irreducible wholly other.

Relying on the works of Nicholas Abraham and Maria Torok in the field of psychoanalysis, Derrida develops his notion of the crypt which is related to his interest in the ghost figure and its haunting effects. The crypt is the body becoming a shell in which the dead survives in the unconscious of the living. The return of the dead due to the work of incorporation turns the subject into a bearer of the other, a lodging of the other at the very heart of the subject (Davis 78). O’connor describes the cryptic place as “a sepulcher in which the self houses its dead as dead, a thing kept alive, that goes on living as dead” (np). Despite the crypt’s lack of substance and its residence beyond language or presence, Derrida tries to articulate a definition of the crypt as the All and the Nothing, typical to all Deconstruction’s concepts. The crypt in the Derridean sense is:
an artificial unconscious in the self, an interior enclave, partitions, hidden passages, zigzags, occult and difficult traffic, two closed doors, an internal labyrinth endlessly echoing, a singular discourse crossing so many languages and yet somewhere inside all that noise, a deadly silence, a blackout” (Derrida XLIV).

The psychotic speaks in terms of cryptonyms which correspond to lacan’s speech of hallucination. Cryptophoria is a speech not symbolized, bereft of meaning or any function. Derrida describes cryptonyms as “a collection of words, a verbarium, with no apparent aim to carry any form of knowledge or conviction” (VIII).

McCarthy’s novel is narrated from a third person point of view which testifies to the main character’s barred subjectivity, his inability to call the self in terms of the “I”. This barred subjectivity results from incorporating the dead others within his psyche. Long after his father’s suicide, Ballard would imagine “his father on the road coming home whistling” (162). This instance proves that his father is kept alive in Ballard’s unconscious. Incorporation is not only of his father’s ghost. He also populates his internal world with his female victims to a point of blurring gender distinctions. As his crimes escalate, Ballard’s body becomes a grotesque one due to wearing the clothes of his female victims. McCarthy writes: “He’d long been wearing the underclothes of his female victims…” (132). This obliteration of a clear-cut gender distinctions is further indicated by Ballard’s denial of his own name (108). His name, just like all other signifiers, does not refer or mean anything to him. McCarthy’s description of his main character is remarkable as it points out to the corpse-like and grotesque figure with “eyeballs moving” just like “[a] gothic doll” (132). Many characters in the novel would refer to him as “it” or “a thing”. The dumpkeeper’s daughter insults him saying “you ain’t a man, you’re just a crazy thing” (111).

Child of God is a text about a haunted subject and it tries to articulate the theme of doubling and hauntology through style. Ballard’s story is narrated from different perspectives, echoing the voices that haunt him. His schizophrenic state sends him to a hell of a myriad of voices talking to him at the same time and yet without saying anything. McCarthy describes this ghostly delusion as “a ghost chorus among old ruins” (7). An interesting passage at the beginning of the novel shows Ballard “lay[ing] there listening” (17) though it was dark and no voice or sound to listen to. This is a manifestation of him talking to himself: “…Ballard would wonder about aimlessly in the woods talking to himself” (132). His torturing state of being torn in the cacophony of voices becomes more and more unbearable to the point of “[l]aying with his fingers plugged in the bores of his ears” in order to shut those voices (24).

The psychotic is divided against the world and against himself, sees himself as many and thus as none, living in the middle of nowhere and no one. His speech does not belong to him but to all those voices speaking within and through him as though psychotics were “speaking machines” (Lacan 41). The psychotic’s discourse bears witness to the trauma of his own unconscious. Freud reminds us that what is spoken through the psychotic is the unconscious. Lacan confirms “…the unconscious is something that speaks within the subject, beyond the subject, and even when the subject doesn’t know it, and that says more about him than he believes” (41). Since the psychotic’s discourse is empty, beyond meaning, his testimony is “an open testimony” (Lacan 132), a speech that says everything and yet nothing.
Conclusion:

This study calls the concept of belonging in order to challenge it and not to endorse it. Indeed, no study could tell everything about the polyvalent phenomenon of the psychosis or its modus operandi. The McCarthian universe is populated by subjects who claim no mastery either on their bodies or on their speeches. For them, there is no heaven or earth, but an underground journey into the dark recesses of the human psyche. *Child of God* is a novel in which the main character escapes the dialectics of body and language and hence it lends itself to a psychoanalytical interrogation under the Lacanian insights and the Derridean tenets. Against the philosophical assertions of telos, logos, cogito and ousia, the crypt and the Real mark an impossibility of being as a unity or a coherent structure. Both concepts mark an irredeemable paradox, an alterity that is kept in its otherness, a state that Derrida calls “an undecidable irresolution” (xxii) which prevents the other from being reduced in the order of the same. Ballard’s subjectivity is ultimately spectral and consequently, it exceeds any dialectical attempt. Belonging to either body or language is a claim that has to be reconsidered under Lacan’s the Real, Derrida’s the crypt and McCarthy’s underground man.
References

Primary Source:


Secondary Sources:


American Orientalism: How the Media Define What Average Americans Know about Islam and Muslims in the US

Hajer Ben Hadj Salem
University of Tunis, El-Manar

Abstract

On September 11, 2001, Americans awoke to the nightmare of a well-coordinated and devastating terrorist attack conducted on their soil. Given the unprecedented magnitude of the event, there was an especially strong need among average Americans for information to know about the identity of the perpetrator(s) of the attacks and the reasons behind them. They relied heavily on the media, mainly TV and the press, for information. Unprepared for such a public information crisis, the media had to rush to the American Muslim communities to get much needed answers to pressing questions about the teachings of Islam and Muslims. For the first time in American history American Muslims were given the opportunity to speak directly to Americans nationwide about themselves and their religion. This paper studies the extent to which increased media reporting on Islam and Muslims in the US after 9/11 represents a step forward in combating century-long Orientalist stereotypes and segmented narratives about this world religion and its followers by analyzing the news and newspaper transcripts of Fox News, CNN, the New York Times, the San Francisco Chronicle and the Chicago Sun-Times covering Islam and American Muslims during the first two years of America’s war on terrorism.

Keywords: American Muslims, Orientalism, US media, September 11, war on terrorism, stereotypes.
Introduction

On September 11, 2001, Americans awoke to the nightmare of a well-coordinated and devastating terrorist attack conducted on their soil. The loss of life that resulted from the 9/11 attacks was a severe jolt to all Americans, who were mesmerized in front of their TV sets to understand the causes of the attacks and the identity of the perpetrators. As bin Laden emerged as the primary suspect, the shadow of the Middle East fell once again on the 9/11 atrocities, reviving century-long stereotypical images of Arabs and Muslims as perpetrators of terrorism and violence. The identity of the perpetrators and the scales of the attacks forced the media’s hand to rush to the Muslim communities for information about Islam and the Muslim world to help Americans find a way out of their information maze. For the first time in American history, American Muslims were given the opportunity to speak directly to the American people and served as sources of information about Islam, Muslims and the Muslim world in the mainstream media.

This paper studies how the American Muslim communities faced this challenge during the first two years of the war on terrorism by tracing patterns of change and continuity in the mass-mediated image of Islam in America before and after 9/11. First, relying on the literature on Arab and Muslim stereotyping in the media (the works of J. Shaheen and E. Said), it traces major stages in the development of “American Orientalism,” a discourse premised on the silence of the native in the news and film industry. Second, it presents the findings of the content analysis of the news and newspaper transcripts of Fox News, CNN, the New York Times, the San Francisco Chronicle and the Chicago Sun-Times during the two years that followed 9/11. The transcripts were gathered through the Nexis-lexis academic electronic data base.

What is American Orientalism?

In looking back at the intellectual history of the last quarter of the twentieth century, Edward Said`s Orientalism will certainly be identified as very influential. According to many scholars it revolutionized the study of the Middle East. It also influenced disciplines as diverse as cultural studies, history, and anthropology. My interest in Orientalism in studying the perception of Islam and Muslims in the US after 9/11 stems from the fact that some of the tenets on which the book was founded in 1978 still apply today.

Said`s contribution to how we can understand the process of stereotyping is immense. Orientalism (1978) tries to show the reasons why when a Westerner, who might have never been to the Middle East, thinks about that area and its people, he/she already has a preconceived image of what they look like, how they behave, and what they believe. Said accounts for this by arguing that there is a lens through which the West looks at the Orient. This lens distorts the reality of that place and its people. It is neither neutral nor innocent, and serves certain interests. He calls that lens “Orientalism.”

Said`s Orientalism is not just an intellectual endeavor to examine the content of Orientalism; it also offers an analysis of the historical, cultural and institutional context in which it was constructed.
Said locates Orientalism, as a discourse, within the general history of imperialism. As leading imperial powers, mainly the French and the British, spread throughout the globe, Orientalism provided the ideological arsenal of conquest. It made it easier to subdue "the other" by fixing him in abstract categories. In the light of these ideas, one may wonder what the USA had to do with all this. It had almost no direct experience of occupation in the Orient. Is it groundless from this perspective to speak about “American Orientalism”?

Even though Said’s first book cannot be of much help in tracing the historical origins of “American Orientalism,” his book Covering Islam (1981) seems to offer a tenable account of how “American Orientalism” operates. Orientalism was conceived after the 1973 Arab-Israeli War that was preceded by a media campaign portraying the Arabs as unable to fight and not modern (1). Covering Islam, however, was born in the throes of the Iranian Revolution, where America’s involvement with the barbarian "other" was direct. The book can be considered in many respects as Orientalism applied to the study of the coverage of Islam in the popular media. The overall image is that of Islam embodied in the frightening and mysterious leaders of the Islamic Revolution, and of Muslims plotting to kill Americans. It is almost the same arsenal that has for long furnished the armory of Orientalism.

In a new introduction to the second edition of Covering Islam, written in 1996, Said did not see any change in the coverage of Islam and the Orient in the American media. As he puts it most constructively:

In the fifteen years since Covering Islam appeared there has been an intense focus on Muslims and Islam in the American and Western media, most of it characterized by a more highly exaggerated stereotyping and belligerent hostility than what I had previously described in my book. Indeed, Islam’s role in hijackings and terrorism, descriptions of the role in which overtly Muslim countries like Iran threaten “us” and our way of life, and speculations about the latest conspiracy to blow up buildings, sabotage commercial airliners, and poison water supplies seem to play increasingly on Western consciousness. A corps of “experts” on the Islamic world has grown to prominence, and during a crisis they are brought out to pontificate on formulaic ideas about Islam on news programs or talk shows .... Malicious generalizations about Islam have become the last acceptable form of denigration of foreign culture in the West; what is said about the Muslim mind, or character, or religion, or culture as a whole cannot now be said in mainstream discussion about Africans, Jews, other Orientals, or Asians. (2)

One could argue that the many changes that have taken place in the region since he published Covering Islam might have occasioned a change in the perception of “the other.” Yet as shown in the foregoing quotation, the image got even worse. A much more threatening image came to the surface. In this phase of the coverage, the mysterious “terrorist other” was no longer in the mysterious Orient; he was in America. This deictic proximity was occasioned by developments that took place in the early 1990’s, when terrorist attacks were perpetrated on American soil. The actors of the 1993 bombings of the World Trade Center were Muslims.
The concept of "holy war" was frequently used to identify this invasion by “the other” in his attempt to strike back. This mood was captured in Steven Emerson’s *Jihad in America*. Emerson defines Jihad as "a holy war, an armed struggle to defeat nonbelievers or infidels." The ultimate goal of Islamic militants, according to Emerson, is to establish an Islamic Empire. He goes on to assert to his viewers that the gatherings of Islamic militants filmed in his documentary did not happen in the Middle East but in America, and that his conclusions were based on a close investigation of Islamic networks in the US. As Said succinctly put it in *Covering Islam*

Although *Jihad in America* makes a gesture toward responsibility and careful discrimination in talk about Islam, and despite a few explicit statements in the film that most Muslims are peace-loving and “like us,” the purport of the film is to agitate against Islam as a sinister breed of cruel, insensate killers, plotters and lustfully violent men. In scene after scene— all of them isolated from any real context—we are regaled with fulminating, bearded imams, raging against the West and Jews most especially, threatening genocide and unending warfare against the West. By the film’s end the viewer is convinced that the United States contains a vast, intricate web of secret bases, conspiratorial plotting centers, and bomb factories, all of them intended for use against innocent, unsuspecting citizens. 

So powerful was Emerson’s documentary, that after the Oklahoma City bombings media networks relied heavily on his expertise and that of likeminded experts on the middle East to speculate about the perpetrators of the act. Though the perpetrator of the attack was not a Muslim, the media attributed it to the Middle East and Islam. This was not surprising as by then it had become an axiomatic fact that the teaching of Islam was synonymous with terrorism.

The coverage of the Oklahoma City bombing proved that media reporting was irresponsible. It was not based on investigation but on allegations. Said’s study of the media coverage of the 1995 bombings shows that media outlets were, rather, repeating the line of the government and the law enforcement agencies.

When the media and American society came to realize that the perpetrator of the bombing was an American Christian, there were no generalizations made about Christianity and its teachings as being synonymous with terrorism. Even worse, the 1995 fiasco, did not deter the media from repeating their allegations, albeit on a smaller scale, after the TWA Flight 800 disaster in July 1996. So pervasive had the image of the Muslim threat become after the above mentioned news media events that it set the tone for an adjunct elaborate campaign in the commercial film Industry.

**Islam in the Commercial Film Industry: The Construction of the Terrorist Threat at Home**

Even though the image of Arabs/Muslims in the American cinema did not escape Said’s meticulous analysis of the image of Arabs (almost always Muslims) in the US media, when it comes to the study of the representation of Islam and Muslims in the American movie industry, the name of Professor Jack G. Shaheen figures prominently as perhaps the world’s foremost authority on the subject. In his book *Reel Bad Arabs* (2001), based on a comprehensive study of nearly one thousand films, Shaheen dissects the slanderous history of Hollywood’s ongoing egregious smearing of Arabs.
The author’s introduction to the book, which precedes the film reviews, is in my opinion, a frightening testimony to what might be lurking in the minds of filmmakers, and to what deleterious effects they consciously or unconsciously really incur. As Shaheen puts it,

For more than a century Hollywood ... has used repetition as a teaching tool, tutoring movie audiences by repeating over and over, in film after film, insidious images of the Arab people. I ask the reader to study in these pages the persistence of this defamation, from earlier times to the present day, and to consider how these slanderous stereotypes have affected honest discourse and public policy .... From 1896 until today, filmmakers have collectively indicted all Arabs as Public Enemy #1 - brutal, heartless, uncivilized religious fanatics and money-mad cultural “others” bent on terrorizing civilized Westerners, especially Christians and Jews .... What is an Arab? In countless films, Hollywood alleges the answer: Arabs are brutal murderers, sleazy rapists, religious fanatics, oil-rich dimwits, and abusers of women .... Decades later, nothing had changed. Quips the US Ambassador in Hostage (1986), “I can’t tell one [Arab] from another. Wrapped in those bed sheets they all look the same to me.” In Hollywood’s films, they certainly do. (6)

There is no doubt that the stereotypes attributed to Arabs/Muslims remained stagnant throughout the period covered by Shaheen’s study in the sense that insidious images persisted. (7) Yet within this perennial virulence a pattern of change can be traced. If we focus on the identity of the villain, in general, and person deixis, in particular, the way we did earlier with US news media, we can identify a parallel pattern of change in the commercial film industry that is at the core of “American Orientalism.” As we have seen earlier, Americans inherited Europe’s pre-existing stereotypes. Prior to the Iranian Revolution, “the other” was, as had been the case in the European tradition, “Arab” (“the other” was perceived in racial terms). With the Iranian Revolution, “the other” became “Muslim” (the other was perceived in religious terms). At both stages, he was far in the distant Orient. Since, the bombing of the World Trade Center in 1993, however, “the other” has also been identified within the precincts of the US as an “Islamic terrorist” posing a serious security threat to the US and its allies.

If we reshuffle the films reviewed by Shaheen and study them chronologically, (8) we can delineate a similar pattern. For almost a century American cinema’s relationship to the Orient has reflected an ever-changing evolution. It has adopted the narrative and visual conventions, as well as the cultural assumptions, on which Orientalism was founded. At an early stage (from early 1900 to the mid-20th century) the Orient was seen as mysteriously mythical. Films embellished on the images of Arab caricatures written about by Europeans. In mythic Arabia, bearded sheikhs rode camels in the desert, waved swords, killed each other and coveted Western heroines. Women were kept in harems and belly danced in revealing clothes. These were recurring images in such films as Barbary Sheep (1917), Bound in Morocco (1918), A Daughter of the Gods (1916), The Barbarian (1933), The Crusades (1935), Algiers (1938), Thief of Damascus (1952), and Abdullah the Great (1956). Setting these tell-tale signs of backwardness against the values of the civilized West becomes an allegory for the Western requirement to civilize the barbarian Orient. This made it dramatically legitimate to end up the film with a huge number of Arab bodies. The morale is clear: Arabs are a lesser breed and need Western knowledge and domination; the only language they understand is that of force. In Bound in
Morocco (1918), for example, the American protagonist escapes, “scattering Arabs all over the sandy soil,” and frees the US heroines from the ruler’s harem; and in Abdullah the Great (1956), a European model brings down an Arab monarch. (9)

After WWII, these old stereotypes were gradually replaced with new ones. The sheiks and lusty despots slowly disappeared, leaving room for hijackers, kidnappers and terrorists. Muslim women disappeared behind the chador and burka. The image of the Arab as a dangerous threat to the Western world has been accentuated by recent US involvement in conflicts with the (Islamic) Middle East, such as the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, the Suez Crisis, the 1973 energy crisis, the Iranian hostage crisis, and the Gulf War.

At this stage, the “Arab,” was countlessly depicted as a murderer, rapist, religious fanatic, oil-rich and ignorant, and abuser of women. This stage was also marked by a semiotic change. Such labels as “Arab,” “Egyptian,” “Palestinian,” “Iranian,” and “Muslim” became used interchangeably to refer to the “other”. Produced after US involvement in the Middle East during WWII, Action in Arabia (1944), equated Muslims with Nazis, the then Western world’s enemy. In one of the scenes, Damascus was described by the narrator as a breeding place for espionage and intrigue. Yvonne, the Western heroine tells Gordon, an American journalist, “I’d give anything to be out of the Middle East, anything.” Sighs Gordon, “Damascus is certainly mysterious and intriguing.” Fearing Germany has placed undercover agents in Syria, he quips: “The new saviors of Islam – the Nazis.” Gordon Says, “the Arabs could play devil with the Allied armies.” He tags an Arab, “You murderous little snake.” (10)

After the Iranian hostage crisis, the Arab Israeli-Conflict provided a major theme for the commercial film industry. Of the three national identities, Egyptian, Iranian, and Palestinian, that “the other” took in the post-world war phase, the Palestinian was the most recurring villain in American films. Since 1948, Israel has been portrayed in the US media as a helpless victim surrounded by barbarian regimes. This prelapsarian image was shaken after the Israeli invasion of Southern Lebanon in 1982. Israel was portrayed for the first time in the US media as an aggressor. The Sabra and Chatila massacres of 1982 could have exacerbated the image of Israel in the US had they been covered accurately.

To maintain American “passionate attachment” to Israel, it was necessary for the supporters of Israel to preserve Israel’s image as a victim in the wilderness of the Middle East, and that of the US as its only savior. (11) The film industry was one of the avenues that was exploited to influence American public opinion and achieve this end. The mid-1980s saw a remarkable and sudden increase in the number of movies filmed in Israel and/or financed by Israeli governments. The films are meant to convey the “reality” of developments in the Arab-Israeli conflict to the average viewer in the West/US. These include, to mention a few, Iron Eagle (1986), (12) Iron Eagle II (1988), (13) The Ambassador (1984), Deadline (1986), The Delta Force (1986), and Hostage (1986). Film after film, especially the Golan-Globus films of the 1980s and 1990s, were made in Israel and featured Israeli performers as Palestinian terrorists.
Events where Islamic extremists were involved and where Israeli and/or US interests were targeted stoke the anti-Palestinian, increasingly anti-Muslim world fires in the US. The June 1985 hijacking of the TWA 847 airplane, the first Gulf War, which rejuvenated the image of Israel as a helpless victim of Saddam Hussein’s missiles, the 1993 World Trade Center bombing, the 1995 Oklahoma City bombing, the bombing of US embassies in 1998, and many other events helped open another phase in Arab and Muslim stereotyping in the US/Western media (14). In this phase “the other” became a “Muslim fanatic” waging a war without end on the West. What is interesting at this stage is that the war territory is no longer the far distant Middle East; Islamic warriors had made their incisive entry into the West and formed strongholds in the US. In many of these films the message is clear: Western/Christian powers (led by the US) should stand with the Jews in a war against the infidel Muslim fanatics.


However, in the rare instances where Muslims step outside their conventional roles as terrorists, they are either educated in a Western country or influenced by Western morality. One of these figures can be found in the movie Three Kings. The one Arab Muslim who is the leader of the rebels, and whose wife is executed for speaking out to Americans for help, helps the American soldiers. We learn in the movie that he was educated at Bowling Green in America. In The Siege, a positive portrayal of Muslims is found in the character of the Americanized Muslim Frank Haddad. We learn that Frank is a Shi’ite Muslim from Lebanon, but he has also been an American citizen for 20 years and a member of the FBI for 10 years.

Why Did the Stereotype Persist?

The culmination of the stereotype of Islam as the embodiment of evil, tyranny and oppression, in comparison to the good, righteous, and democratic United States (West) was made possible by three main factors: First, as was the case with European orientalism, American “Orientalism”/ Orientalist research has served, consciously or unconsciously, the aim of domination of the Arab world and has provided the ideological arsenal of conquest. With the dismemberment of the Soviet Union, the foreign evil # 1 of the US following WWII through 1990, the emerging new world order was founded on a tendency to consider the whole world as one country’s imperium led by the US, the “last remaining superpower.” A corps of geopolitical strategists and liberal intellectuals has been bent on delineating the outlines of the post-red menace world order. Filling a supposed intellectual vacuum, the theories they proffered revived prevalent age-old views of Islam as an acceptable competitor to the Christian West. Bernard Lewis (“the Roots of Muslim Rage” (1990)), Judith Miller, Samuel Huntington (The
Clash of Civilizations (1993)), Francis Fukuyama (The End of History and the Last Man (1992)) Daniel Pipes, Fouad Ajami, Martin Kramer, and other Orientalists were fully accredited consultants for a gigantic military establishment badly in need of a new enemy to maintain its might. They reduced the complexity and diversity of the Muslim world to political Islam.

Second, the absence of a countervailing system of knowledge emanating from the Orient to help mount a critique of Orientalism. Distortions and misrepresentations committed in the portrayal of Islam are demonstrated by facts. Orientalist scholars (Israeli and Western) are well-informed about the Arab world, at least factually. On the other hand, an almost complete ignorance about Israel and to a lesser extent the West prevails in the 22 Arab countries (no serious and comprehensive survey of Western media (16) nor of the Hebrew Press in the Arab world).

That this should be so is hardly surprising since Arabs have participated in and continue to allow themselves to be represented in an Orientalist way. In the 22 Arab countries there is no information policy that tries to give a different picture of what the Arab world is like, as Arab countries have not chosen to engage in dialogue with the US. They thereby unwittingly keep themselves inferior to the West, which fulfills the kind of representation Westerners have about the Arabs.

Third, I believe that much the same might be said about the Muslim communities in the US. Despite the institutional advances that the Muslim communities have made since the mid-1990s, they have not succeeded, in my opinion, in addressing the issue of the degrading and misleading general knowledge about Islam and the Muslim world. Despite the fact that combating stereotypes has been set as one of the priorities of some renowned national Muslim organizations such as CAIR and MPAC, there has not been any nationwide attempt to coordinate a campaign addressed to the average American to educate him/her about Islam and the Muslim world. This is due mainly to the fact that most Muslim organizations in the US are ideologically diverse and have different loyalties to and affinities with foreign countries (“the abode of Islam”) and consider the US/West “the abode of war” since it is not ruled according to Shari’a law. This resulted in a self-inflicted ostracism.

Unlike Jewish Americans, Catholic Americans, African Americans, and Asian Americans, who acted relentlessly to hunt down stereotypes, Muslims in the US were very slow to mobilize. Arab American organizations’ occasional protests were rarely heard, and even when heard, they were heard too faintly to lead their offenders to revise their attitudes. The Internet has not been effective in providing a powerful counternarrative to the impressive Orientalist discourse. This is due mainly to the fact that the many sites one can visit to learn about Islam are for and by Muslims; are not sites that attempt to introduce, explain, or interpret Islam to non-Muslims. Most of them are not dialogue sites and are in Arabic. The same applies to magazines and newspapers. Most newspapers which are sold in the Muslim communities’ neighborhoods either come from Muslim countries or are written in Arabic, Urdu or other national languages.

What makes the situation even worse is the absence of a public information policy on Islam and Muslims sponsored by the estimated 6 million Muslims in America despite the intricate network of
community development organizations and multi-million dollar mosques they have constructed around the US. As was confirmed by Diana Eck’s *A New Religious America*, prior to 9/11, there had been little publicly available information in America about Muslims and their communities in the US. The American Muslim communities’ remarkable organizational growth did not go beyond the ethno-religious cocoon to reach the society at large. However, on September 11, 2001, many Americans, who had hardly invested in outreach to their Muslim neighbors, were violently awakened to the fact that they had Muslim citizens in their neighborhoods with whom they shared a common destiny. On the same day, American Muslims were alarmingly awakened to a sheer failure in public relations due to the absence of nationwide Muslim-owned TV networks and a well-developed communication strategy. Their messages had to go through the distorting filters of the mainstream media.

**Recovering Islam in the Wake of 9/11**

Like many major news events which took place in the US in the last decade of the twentieth century, and by which the Muslim communities were directly affected, mainly the 1993 World Trade Center bombing and the Oklahoma City bombing, the 9/11 attacks of 2001 received wide media coverage. In the preceding events, the villain was captured and the coverage lessened. Yet 9/11 was as different as it was long-lasting. Given the unprecedented magnitude of the event, there was an especially strong need among Americans for information. The perceived public information crisis on Islam and Muslims in the wake of 9/11 forced the mainstream media’s hand to rush to the American Muslim communities for information. For the first time in American history, American Muslims were given the opportunity to speak directly to the American public nationwide. For these reasons I tried to analyze the content of the news transcripts of mainstream news and newspaper channels: CNN, Fox News, the *New York Times*, the *San Francisco Chronicle*, and the *Chicago Sun-Times* (17) during the two years that followed 9/11.

One motive in doing this study is to provide a chronicle of media coverage of responses to a unique and horrible event. Based on previous studies, content analyses of news events would be more meaningful if they spanned a longer time period. Two years of coverage will be studied. The coverage will be divided into two stages related to two major phases in the war on terrorism. The first phase covers the first 12 months after 9/11, it was marked by the military campaign in Afghanistan and a national concern about the possibilities of recurring terrorism. News announcements from President Bush, Vice-President Cheney, and the head of homeland security kept warning Americans that thinking the attack would remain unique in U.S. history would be a serious mistake. Worry indices kept increasing with each new colored alert or alarm. Even though the horror attribute continues to ring true, such concerns declined sharply after the first anniversary of 9/11 as no actual terrorist attack took place. After all, a nation cannot maintain an emotional state of emergency for a period of months. The corporate scandals (fall 2002), eclipsed the attacks of 9/11 for a while. Yet, the Iraqi war campaign that gained momentum during the summer of 2002 contributed to maintain tension and increasingly led the American public into a situation where the lines are blurred between patriotism and war propaganda.
By merging qualitative and quantitative approaches to study media coverage during these two major stages of the war on terrorism, it is possible to develop a richer understanding of both the meaning of media messages and their effects. A total of 846 stories were identified from the first 12 month coverage of the networks and newspapers, including 131 stories from CNN, 100 stories from Fox News, 334 stories from the New York Times, 142 stories from the San Francisco Chronicle and 139 stories from the Chicago Sun-Times. As for the second stage, 426 stories were identified, including 65 stories from CNN, and 46 stories from Fox News, 167 stories from the New York Times, 76 stories from the San Francisco Chronicle and 72 stories from the Chicago Sun-Times.

The study aims to answer two central research questions. First, did the media provide a forum for debate that introduced Americans to Islam and Muslims or did it lead them to generalize from the villain to a minority religion? Second, to what extent did the newly included Muslims manage to acquire equal opportunity to share in the exercise of cultural authority and provide average American citizens with an alternative (to “American Orientalism”) balanced discourse on Islam and the Muslim world?

The content analysis of the New York Times, the San Francisco Chronicle, the Chicago Sun-Times, Fox News, and CNN, in light of previous studies of media coverage of Islam, Muslims/Arabs, and American Muslims/Arabs prior to 9/11, shows clearly a marked increase in media reporting interest on the Arab American and American Muslim communities after 9/11. This surge was the natural result of unprecedented attacks that killed more than 3,000 civilians on American soil and perpetrated by Arabs and Muslims who share with the American Muslim communities and part of the Arab American communities the same religion. It was also meant to answer a public information need and to help the American public make sense of these attacks and understand a religion in the name of which mass-killing of innocent civilians can be justified. This interest was not peculiar to Muslims and news sources in the New York area (despite the fact that the New York Times published the largest number of stories of our corpus) but was shared across the country, as reflected in the other two newspapers, representing distant geographic areas.

As had been the case with anti-American acts of terror, including the Iranian Hostage Crisis (1979-81), the first World Trade Center bombing in 1993, and the bombing of US embassies in 1998, the 9/11 events triggered interest in Islam and Muslims. But as none of these events came close to the 9/11 attacks, the latter required reliance on more sources that are familiar with the world from which the terrorists came and about which the media and the public knew little. General context and analysis were required to help news consumers get more comprehensive information and make their judgments on a more educated basis. To meet this sheer public information crisis and to overcome gaps in previous coverage of Islam and the Muslim world, the media reached out to leaders of Muslim organizations and scholars of Islam, visited mosques, and provided American Muslims and Arabs with unprecedented and perhaps unexpected opportunities to 'speak their minds.'

This marked presence of Arab and Muslim sources occasioned measurable changes in media reporting about Islam and Muslims. Not only were news consumers introduced to religious
communities that had for long been part of the American pluralistic landscape, but apart from the American public communal parameters, they were also provided with a clearer, and more humane picture about many aspects of their lives and their religion than those cliches bandied about by orientalist media experts during previous crises.

Taken as a whole, media sources reported on the ordinary life of American Muslims to their American neighbors. They portrayed their identity dilemmas, presented the viewer/reader with facts about hate crime incidents and the erosion of the civil liberties of American Muslims, and opened debates reflecting concern over and sympathy with them. Most of the newspapers and news networks analysed in this study featured special stories about Ramadan, Prophet Mohammad, and the history of Islam, its tenets and teaching, were highly professional, analytical and informative. This trend is to be commended, and probably has done much to dispel stereotypes, lies, slander, and misunderstanding about Islam and Muslims after 9/11. Yet it is problematic in the context of international news reporting. The apologetic discourse on Islam fostered by the new spokespersons of Islam provided the American viewer/reader with a monolithic, idyllic, ahistorical image of Islam, detached from the current history of and diversity within the modern Islamic world. They did not provide him/her with a deep analysis of the roots of extremism in some parts of the Muslim world. This gap was filled by the traditional battery of Orientalist scholars and journalists, such as Lewis, Emerson and Pipes, who featured out prominently on TV channels, mainly Fox news and to provide their audience with a more elaborate discourse on Muslim actions, beliefs and present concerns (half-truths).

Known for being apologetic for Israel within American Muslim circles, Fox News, which was one of the mostly sought after channels to answer American public viewers’ need for information, followed a purely Orientalist approach to Muslim presence in the US, perpetuating the perception that American Muslims represent a threat to national security. These messages created a discrepancy in media reporting about Islam and American Muslims, which was problematic and added to the confusion of the average American, who was looking for black and white answers to his questions.

As the war on terrorism took a wider scope with America’s tilt towards Israel during the Israeli-Palestinian crisis in April 2002 and with the Iraqi war propaganda which gained momentum since summer 2002, the American media adopted special contextualization of their narratives, one where Arab and Muslim actions were interpreted within a rather general and sweeping overview of Islam as a world religion followed by faceless and timeless masses. Attempts to place Arab and Muslim actions, beliefs, concerns and goals in specific historical, political and moral context were not very common because they would require deeper critical analysis of US political history since WWII, and US foreign policy, how it is shaped and executed, and its repercussions. Such critical and thoughtful analysis was not encouraged after 9/11; such attempts were considered lacking in patriotism.

The media’s focus on American war propaganda influenced their reporting on American Muslims and Arabs both in terms of frequency and themes. The marked drop in news stories about American Muslims and Arabs, media focus on the Iraqi American communities and their support for the Bush administration campaign “to liberate Iraq,” and their intensive reporting on sleeper cells...
uncovered by American law-enforcement officials, which served to manipulate the American public into supporting the Bush administration counterterrorism campaign abroad by reporting on its seeming success stories on the domestic front, clearly show that the mass-mediated image of the American Muslim communities, despite its stark improvement in the aftermath of 9/11, remains fragile and deeply influenced by oscillations in American foreign policy in the Middle East and changing American national interests. This is best reflected in media justification of the government curtailment of the civil liberties of American Muslims in the name of national security prior to the Iraqi war and its adoption of a counterterrorism policy based on preemptive strikes against foreign (mainly Muslim) countries, turning the Middle East into its battleground.

What made the situation worse is Hollywood`s Hollywood`s renewal of its ties with the American military establishment since the beginning of the Iraqi war campaign through a series of action and war movies, excoriating Islam for its violence, despotism and terror. Jack, J. Shaheen`s recent book *Guilty? Hollywood’s Verdict on Arabs after 9/11*, which studies the image of Arabs and Muslims in about one hundred films produced by Hollywood after 9/11, shows compellingly that despite stark improvements in some recent hits, such as *Syriana* and *Babel*, Hollywood has perpetuated its timeline of Arab/Muslim villainy and that television – with popular shows such as *24* and *Sleeper Cell*. Shaheen`s findings are summarized in the following passage from his book`s Prologue:

In my detailed review of post-9/11 films I found that 22 movies (1 in 4) that otherwise have nothing whatsoever to do with Arabs or the Middle East contain gratuitous slurs and scenes that demean Arabs. Arab villains do dastardly things in 37 films (mostly gunning down and blowing up innocent people; ugly Sheiks pop up as dense, evil, over-sexed caricatures in 12 films; 3 of 5 films display unsavory Egyptian characters, 6 of 15 films project not-so-respectable images of maidens; and 6 out of 11 movies offer stereotypical portraits of Palestinians ... Refreshingly, about a third of the post-9/11 films discussed here, a total of 29, projected worthy Arabs and decent Arab Americans: Arab champions-men and women-are displayed in 19 movies; Arab Americans appear as decent folks in 10 of 11 films ... Disturbingly, I found new vicious, violent stereotypes polluting TV screens. I came across more than 50 post-9/11 TV shows that vilify Arab Americans and Muslim Americans.(18)

That this should be so is hardly surprising since the American Muslim communities and the 22 Arab countries, most of whom maintained sound diplomatic ties with the US in its war on terrorism, failed to develop an independent Arab/Muslim information policy that tried to provide average American citizens with an alternative balanced discourse on Islam and the Muslim world. This was the case because they had not developed their own nationwide media channels prior to 9/11 (despite their organizational growth) through which they could have diffused their views to the larger American audience without having to go through the distorting filter of mainstream media channels.

This situation was compounded by ambivalent messages sent by the Bush administration through a domestic counter-terrorism policy based on Arab and Muslim profiling. This left the American Muslim communities in no doubt that the few positive portrayals of Islam and Muslims in the media after 9/11 could not provide a balanced and humane image to that of the villain and
homegrown terrorists, and that such a balance could not be reached by advocating a politically correct scrubbing of all portrayals of Arab Americans and American Muslims, even as terrorists. It could be approximated by channeling an equally powerful public information campaign to educate Americans about the realities of wars in Middle East, the Arab-Israeli conflict, and the cultural richness and diversity of the Muslim world and Muslim communities.

Conclusion

In this paper I tried to study patterns of change and continuity in the perceptions of Islam and Muslims in the US before and after 9/11. I focused on the construction of Islam and Muslims as categories in the American media and tried to dig into their ideological underpinnings through a review of the post-colonial literature on Arab and Muslim stereotyping in the American media prior to 9/11, and through the analysis of the content of news transcripts and newspaper articles covering Islam and Muslims during the first two years of America’s war on terrorism from 9/11, 2001 to 9/11, 2003.

This study has shown that even though 9/11 gave American Muslims the opportunity to speak directly to the American people and educate them about Islam and Muslims through the mainstream media, their messages had to go through the distorting filter of these mass-mediated forums of debate. The latter, swimming with the tide of the government sent to the poorly-educated Americans mixed messages about Islam and the Muslim world. The American Muslim frustration as to their inability to make themselves heard pushed them seek alternative non-mediated communication channels to take part in an on-going educational engagement at the grassroots level. Moving from the macro-perspective of the nationwide media and government policy to the micro-perspective of the grass-roots responses on the interfaith forum and the grassroots civic public forum, there is much to inspire a new birth of pluralism and the opening up of new vistas of ongoing educational engagement between American Muslims and their fellow Americans, which will shape the future of Islam and Muslims in the US.
End Notes

1-The second impetus that made Said write *Orientalism* was another discrepancy between his experience as an Arab and the representations of Arabs by great artists and novelists such as Flaubert and Gerard de Nerval.


5-Jack G. Shaheen, Professor Emeritus of Mass Communications at Southern Illinois University, is a former CBS News consultant on Middle East affairs, and perhaps the world’s foremost authority on media images of Arabs. He is the author of *Reel Bad Arabs, The TV Arab, Nuclear War Films, and Arab and Muslim Stereotyping in American Popular Culture*.


7- Out of more than 900 films examined by Jack Shaheen, only 5% of all the movies (approximately 50 movies) debunked the barbaric image of Islam. The most famous Arabs to be depicted were characters that tried to help the oppressed: Aladdin, Ali Baba and Sinbad.

8- In Shaheen’s book the film reviews were presented to the reader in alphabetical order.

9- In *Algiers* (1938) Algeria’s French police tells the newly arrived inspector from Paris: ‘The reality of the Casbah is something stranger than anything you could’ve dreamed.” It’s like “entering another world, melting pot for the sins of the earth.” (Shaheen: 58)


11-It goes without saying that the scars of the Iranian Revolution and the subsequent hostage crisis were still itching in US society. It reinforced the repeated mantra that the US and Israel are facing common enemies and share common interests.

12-Filmed in Israel in cooperation with the Israeli government and the Israeli military.
13-This film was “financed by Israeli producers and shot on location in Israel with the cooperation of the Israeli minister of defense.

14-During the last two decades there have been many provocations by Muslims and such Islamic countries as Iran, Sudan, Iraq, Afghanistan, and Libya. In 1983 about 240 United States Marines were killed in Lebanon by a bomb that was taken credit for by a Muslim group, and the United States embassy in Beirut was blown up by Muslim suicide bombers with considerable loss of life. In the 1980s many American hostages were taken by Shi’a groups in Lebanon and held for long periods of time. The 1980s also witnessed a number of plane hijackings, the most notorious of which was the TWA flight that was held in Beirut between the 14th and 30th of June, 1985, and was claimed by Muslim groups. The 1988 explosion of Pan Am flight 109 over Lockerbie, Scotland, was carried out by Islamic terrorists.

15-These films were widely screened and earned their companies millions of dollars. Consider this abbreviated list. Navy SEALS, directed by Lewis Teague, made $24.8 million at the box office; Air Force One, directed by Wolfgang Peterson, made over $172 million; True Lies, directed by James Cameron, made over $146 million at the box office in the United States; Executive Decision, directed by Stuart Baird, earned more than $56.6 million dollars at the box office in the United States; Rules of Engagement, directed by William Friedkin, made over $61 million at the box office in the United States; and The Siege, directed by Edward Zwick, earned over $40 million dollars at the box office.

16-Attempts to study stereotypes in US films, for example, have been made by Western scholars. Much as some of them denounced stereotyping of minorities in the US, they ignored Arab stereotyping. A case in point was Andrew Dowdy’s The Films of the Fifties: The American State of Mind. According to Shaheen,


17-The key words that were used for the search were “Arab Americans” and “American Muslims,” where a Muslim or an Arab American voice is more likely to be found. 1272 stories were analyzed.

References


“Psychopathology” and “Crime” in Joyce Carol Oates’s (Rosamond Smith) novel The Soul/Mate

Dilek Çalışkan
Anadolu University, Turkey

Abstract

Soul/Mate written in 1989 by Joyce Carol Oates under the pseudonym Rosamond Smith, centers on a 28-year-old murderous psychopath Colin Asch and his obsession with a double, an alter ego—a beautiful “pure” 39 year-old widow named Dorethea Deverell. When Colin meets her unexpectedly at a dinner party, he becomes obsessed with Dorethea “as given by God” and considers her his soul mate, “lacking a soul” he dedicates his life to her welfare whereby he wishes to complete himself. Ironically, Dorethea has to be awakened to her own condition as she is reluctant to take responsibility both as a woman and as an art historian in the capitalist society that is symbolized by the psychopath Colin and Dorethea his double. In this novel Oates uses psychopathology as a metaphor for the invisible harm that the society and the individual is subjected to as the term itself is problematic. Invisible crimes are committed in the society by respectable members whereas psychopaths are easy suspects. Ironically, psychopaths are not always criminals. The idea of “success” and the “American Dream” make competition a necessity such it becomes impossible to recognize psychopathic doctors, lawyers, respectable fathers or bosses, who have position and power in the society. This article will explore the relation between psychopathology and crime in the light of R.D. Laing’s view of society and madness and Cleckley’s and Hare’s view of psychopathology.

Keywords: Double, Psychopath, Crime, R.D: Laing, Cleckley, Hare.
Introduction

Soul/Mate written in 1989 by Joyce Carol Oates under the pseudonym Rosamond Smith, centers on a 28-year-old murderous psychopath Colin Asch and his obsession with a double, an alter ego—a beautiful “pure” 39 year-old widow named Dorethea Deverell. When Colin meets her unexpectedly at a dinner party, he becomes obsessed with Dorethea “as given by God” and considers her his soul mate, “lacking a soul” he dedicates his life to her welfare whereby he wishes to complete himself. On the other hand, symbolically, Dorethea accepts this soul coming to the “riverbank” or “fertile upland region” in the form of the “sacred” bird the “Bobwhite, the Quail or the Partridge” and is fascinated and hypnotized.

Hence the male and the female is to unite intellectually. Unfortunately, the art historian Dorethea Deverell will come short in answering the intellectual needs of Colin. Colin’s subjects are the question of art, the role of the artist, history and existential philosophies. His quest is for knowledge and intellectual accomplishment. The poet P. B. Shelley, the artist Michelangelo, John Marin, Paul Bowles, Marco Polo, Caligula and the biblical figure David are among some of the significant names Colin mentions. His examples of poetry and paintings are all related to righteousness, power, individual significance, success and spatial relationships. He is fascinated by landscapes and watercolour paintings that emphasize the beauty and importance of space that the soul is to occupy. Colin travelled all around the world and America. As suggested by the pun on his name; the Bobwhite, the Quail and the Patridge, these species occupying a large place in nature, are to be extinct in near future when there is nothing serious done. So, in the novel Colin takes on the role of the storyteller, telling about “life.” As stated by Greg Johnson, Oates’s attempt is to get the whole world into a book (13). Colin is representing the capitalist system whose harms and violence remain invisible. His murders committed in an artistic way make these harm visible. So this paper will explore psychopathology and crime in the light of R.D. Laing’s view of society and madness in Oates’s novel The Soul/Mate.

Ironically, Colin as an intellectual but not well educated psychopathic character suits to Coleman’s definition (1972) and when looked from this perspective he seems to be a threat to the society. He violently kills people without any reason. He is unable to love others and does not fear law and punishment. He wants to destroy the whole world including himself and does not want to live over thirty. He rejects guilt and pity because of his insufficient superego.

He wants to get immediate satisfaction as he is selfish and wants to satisfy his instinctive drives without considering the consequences. He can impress others and can make profit out of them, but he is unable to have any genuine relationships with others, symbolically, by presenting Colin and his murders Oates shows the condition of the individual in capitalist society and reflects the view of the anti-psychiatrist R. D. Laing:

We must know about relations and communications. But these disturbed and disturbing patterns of communication reflect the disarray of personal worlds of experience whose repression, denial, splitting, introjection, projection, etc.—whose general desecration and profanation—our civilization is based upon. When or personal worlds are rediscovered and allowed to reconstitute themselves, we first a shambles.
Bodies half-dead; genitals dissociated from heart; heart severed from head; head dissociated from genitals. Without inner unity, with just enough sense of continuity to clutch at identity—the current idolatry. Torn-body, mind and spirit—by inner contradictions, pulled in different directions. Man cut off equally from his own body—a half crazed creature in a mad world. We are all implicated in this state of affairs of alienation. This context is decisive for the whole practice of psychotherapy. (55)

Colin commits his murders in the name of Love, which suits Laing’s description. Colin is obsessed with Dorethea as a long desired mother figure and he commits murder to protect Dorethea in expectation of a motherly love in the hope of a supporting family. Again as mentioned by Laing:

The economic metaphor is employed. The mother “invests” in her child. What is most revealing is the husband’s function. The provision of economic support, status and protection, in that order. There is the frequent reference to security, the esteem of others. What one is supposed to want, to live for, is “gaining pleasure from the esteem and affection of others” if not, one is a psychopath. Such statements are in a sense true. They describe the frightened, cowed, abject creature that we are admonished to be, if we are to be normal—offering each other mutual protection from our own violence, the family as a “protection racket”…. The family’s function is to repress Eros; to induce a false consciousness of security; to deny death by avoiding life; to cut of transcendence; to believe in go, not to experience the Void; to create, in short, one dimensional man; to promote respect, conformity, obedience; to con children out of play; to induce a fear of failure; to promote a respect for work; to promote a respect for respectability.” (64-65)

R.D. Laing: Love and Violence

Unfortunately, the most violent crimes are committed in the family in the name of love. For Laing (1967), love and violence are polar opposites, whereas love lets the other be with affection and concern, violence attempts to constrain the other’s freedom, to force him act with ultimate lack of concern and with indifference to the other’s own existence or destiny in the way one desires. The human beings destroy themselves by violence masquerading as love (58), like Colin who wants to destroy the whole world. Colin rejects to adapt into his environment, ironically, adaptation is the requirement of the contemporary world. For Laing, this kind of adaptation is absurd, human beings require to “utilize intellect” and also require “an intellectual equilibrium that permits a person malleable, to adjust himself to others without fear of loss of identity with change, it requires a basic trust in others, and a confidence in the integrity of the self.” So, Laing too, rejects adaptation, he says “adaptation to what, to society or to a world gone mad?... For him, the human being “is a victim burning at the stake” in the world (64).

Colin appears to be clinging in vegetarianism, as he does not want animals to be exploited, but ironically he exploits everybody and anything that comes on his way. Colin also fits Gençan’s (1988) description of a psychopath, as he tells lies and feels unconnected because of his psychopathic ego, which does not accept love. He is egocentric and thinks that others control him which causes his rage and enmity (210-212). His only goal in life becomes having control, because control is essential for living. He has also narcissistic qualities, he admires himself and his abilities and feels himself godlike. Therefore, he is hard to be recognized and categorized, psychopathology is a long debated subject and the term psychopath is a problematic term. The Psychopath and the criminal is another subject of scientific study as suggested by Hare & Babiak:

http://ijhcsciefeditor.wix.com/ijhcs
Given the psychopaths’ personality features, and their inclination for breaking the rules and pushing the envelope of acceptable human behavior, there is some merit to this argument. Still, just having a psychopathic personality disorder does not make one a criminal. Some psychopaths live in society and do not technically break the law—although they may come close, with behavior that usually is very unpleasant for those around them. Some may lead seemingly normal lives, not hurting people in ways that attract attention, but causing problems nonetheless in hidden economic, psychological, and emotionally abusive ways. They do not make warm and loving parents, children, or family members. They do not make reliable friends or coworkers. Many psychopaths adopt a parasitic existence, living off the generosity or gullibility of others by taking advantage of and often abusing the trust and support of friends and family. They may move from place to place and from one source of support to another. You probably know one. You could work for, work with, or be married to someone with a psychopathic personality and not know that there is a formal psychological term for the individual who causes you so much pain and distress. He or she can be a neighbor, friend, or family member whose behavior you may find fascinating, confusing, and repelling (20-21).

So, Colin remains unrecognized in his environment and especially by Dorethea. Dorethea’s lawyer lover identifies Colin as a psychopath, but he cannot prevent his crimes. Colin has a traumatic childhood and he loses his parents at the age of twelve in a car accident, in which he tries to save them in vain. After this defeat he wants to take the control in his hands by making others pity him and taking people’s lives. As a psychopathic quality Colin is obsessed with the idea of control. The psychopath’s pretense to emotional sensitivity is really part of his control function: the higher the level of belief in the psychopath that can be induced in his victim through his drama, the more "control" the psychopath believes he has. This, too, is true for Colin. He has control when others believe his lies. On the other hand, the "submission" to this control produces so much pain when the truth is glimpsed by the victim, but the victim prefers to continue in the lie than to face the fact that he has been duped. Dorethea and his other victims in The Soul/Mate do not want to accept that Colin is a psychopath and Colin counts on this. This gives him a feeling of power and the will to rule as Colin states: “It’s power – doing things the way you want them done, becoming the agent of your own life. And death “ (299).

The lesson he learns after the suicide of his teacher Mr. Kreuzer is another strengthening factor for his viewpoint. For Colin, only one-tenth of one percent of human beings has the superior will to rule the world. Colin feels among one of those privileged few who can willfully control fate (Creighton 87). He thinks that he is “the Agent Of Death.”

Like, after all, there’re so few times in your life you really know you’re standing in exactly the right place at the right time. Like you’re not even yourself any longer. But an agent of history. Of Death (298).

He believes he has an outstanding talent. His ability is to kill people and cover his murders. He wants to be good by destroying the world for recreation. As Creighton (1992) affirms, Colin is a very attractive young man and charms people easily (7). Colin’s charming nature disguises his brutality and nobody suspects him of murder, until he reveals them and confesses to Dorethea. On the other hand, he is the outcome of his gothic environment. As Johnson (1987) suggests, the American reality stupefies, sickens, infuriates, and embarrasses to one’s own meager imagination (12). The absence of positive
authority figures adds to the development of his insufficient superego and prevents personal relationships, which is for the existentialist psychiatrists R. D. Laing (1967) no longer possible in the present situation. As for Laing, the human beings are as driven to kill and be killed as they are to let live and live. The human beings seem to seek destruction as much as life and happiness. (76)

Colin looses his chance of being good at the age of twelve, at the moment of his parent’s death due to the lack of positive parental role models. His substitute mother, aunt Ginny, is too weak to mother him and her husband is not able to father him. His rage toward his absent mother never fades, as she left him alone and helpless. Blaming others is another feature of the psychopath. Because of his feelings for his mother, Colin cannot have healthy relationships with women. He exploits them both physically and materialistically. Aunt Ginny babies and pitties him, although being aware of the wounds on his hands she does not do anything to stop him. Aunt Ginny creates an illusion about Colin and becomes his blind admirer.

As stated by Cleckley in The Mask of Sanity, psychopaths are not “fragile individuals, what they think and do is produced from a “rock solid personality structure that is extremely resistant to outside influences.” Many of them are protected for years from the consequences of their behavior by well-meaning family and friends and as long as their behavior remains unchecked or unpunished, they continue to go through life without too much inconvenience. Aunt Ginny and her husband Martin cannot deal with Colin, nor the psychiatric institutions, where he is constantly treated. Colin was sent to the house of corrections and received several treatments in past, but locking him up brought him nowhere. As suggested by Kiehl and Buckholtz, when locked up psychopaths learn to be better psychopaths. Psychopaths typically get worse, not better, after standard treatments like group therapy and they get insights into others’ vulnerabilities which become opportunities to hone their manipulation skills. (http://cicn.vanderbilt.edu/images/news/psycho.pdf).

**Soul/Mate & Psycopath**

Only when Colin meets Dorethea, his soul mate, he has the possibility to replace the absent mother figure and satisfy his longing for a mother. He does not want Hartley to resemble Dorethea to his real mother (he hates). His mother did not have the right to die. The inspirational poet Shelley’s death, like his mother’s death, was too early. Colin does not kill Charles, because he is the perfect father figure he desires. He kills Charles’s former wife Agnes, an alcoholic, in order to unite his substitute “parents” to find the long lost familial unity again. Dorethea is sacred for him, as suggested by her name she is “God given.” Actually, Dorethea is a fixated idea, as her name is also an allusion to Dorothea Dix, who was a Mental Health Reformer and a Civil War Nurse (1802-1887) (http://siarchives.si.edu/).

Dorethea Deverell, on the other hand, is fascinated by him. When he forces her to go away with him, she becomes intensely interested in him as by awe or terror. Thus being captivated and enchanted. She is utterly charmed by his sight. Although being an art historian, Dorethea is unable to analyze and evaluate her own life. Her husband Michel died at an accident, when she was newly married, and after
this traumatic event she lost her baby. She has no sense for future. She hopes for a promotion, but she
is not sure about her qualifications. She thinks that she is not good enough to be promoted. When it
comes to her lover Charles, she is desperate. There is a suffocating silence between them. Lacking self-
confidence she accepts being Charles mistress (being in a secondary position) she also adopts a minor
and insignificant role in her work. She cannot speak out her ideas and has no urge to make her voice
heard.

At this point Colin appears in Dorethea’s life calling for action and change. He fulfills his
mission by killing Roger Krauss, her “enemy,” an unsympathetic and critical board member at the
institute, and thereby helps Dorethea’s being selected as the director of the institute. He kills Agnes,
Dorethea’s lover’s ex-wife, to make the long delayed marriage possible. All of these actions emanate
from his soul as evident in his words written in the blue ledger with capital letters “ANYTHING
DONE HENCEFORTH IS BLESSED BECAUSE IT EMANATES FROM THE SOUL.” The blue
room is the only private place where he is free to create. There nobody interferes. When he suspects
Aunt Ginny’s entering this prohibited territory he immediately wants to punish her without thinking
about the care she provides. His blue room is symbolizing distance, love, spirituality, peace, and
happiness. It is his sacred place. There his mind is relaxed, he overcomes inhibitions, and is encouraged
to communicate where he can fulfill himself and find answers to his questions related to his existence.
He also does not want the room cleaned by a black maid, loathing segregation and discrimination. His
blue room is a place of meaning-making and creation. In there he takes his decisions to carry out his
mission to destroy the whole world which is unfair and his obsession with Dorethea becomes his only
instrument.

Productive Obsession & Karma

His obsession is a productive one. It is a pressing idea that serves for meaning-making needs. In
In Praise of Positive Obsessions Eric Maisel states that positive obsession is a response to the desire to
live fully and an answer to the question, related to real concern in life. It is the fruit of mental energy: it
bubbles to the surface because of the necessary curiosity, enthusiasm, and passion. Ironically, Colin’s
metaphoric murders generates out of his mind as his productive obsession with Dorethea generates
mental energy: he is obsessed with the idea of satisfying Dorethea that energizes him and makes him
research options and make plans to act according to them. When he captures Dorethea, he states that
she can never know what is to kill a human being. By kidnapping her, he calls her for action and
cooperation. He warns Dorethea not to commit any kind of error, because by this way he will be
forced both to kill her and himself, for which he is not ready yet. He believes each of his actions need
careful planning. There is always a pressing idea in his mind that explains his constant exhaustion.

Ironically, his obsession turns out to be constructive. Colin believes in Karma. In Karmic
Religions science and philosophic vision should be considered complementary to each other for
ensuring the welfare of mankind as mentioned by Satva in Indian Philosophy (15). In Karma, action
means the moral law of cause. Bad actions and effect are governing the future. Good behavior leads to
rebirth in the higher orders. There are various beliefs in Darshana, for example, the body endowed with
intelligence or consciousness is alone called the self or the soul. The body itself lead to rebirth. In the lower orders of being is the self or the soul (21). Therefore as regards the world, there is no ‘Supreme God’ who is the Controller, the Creator, the Sustainer, and the Destroyer who grants re-birth. The Ruler of the Land alone is ‘Ishvara.’ Ishvara has no role or influence in the life of a sentient being. Hence, only sentient beings have independent lives. Each sentient being gets a life once only. The body is created out of the four truths (fundamental elements) and the power of intelligence or consciousness. (21) Arises therein. So long as the power of consciousness exists in the body, it has life. No sooner the power or force of consciousness ends, the body is destroyed. Therefore, the body (life) has no link or connection with the past. Keeping this principle in mind, Chârvak says “borrow if need be to consume ghee”. This implies that if you don’t have funds or good things of life with you, you should borrow from others to ensure a happy life of enjoyment. This is because after death, consciousness has no existence. In that case, the question of repayment of debts does not arise (21). Chârvak Darshana is rooted in materialism. It accepts the direct evidence of the senses as the only valid source of knowledge. In this world, whatever we experience with our sense organs is deemed as direct perception. Therefore, basic matter is regarded as the only philosophical truth in the Chârvak Darshana. Ishvara, soul, heaven, hell, eternal life as also ‘mâyâ’ or ‘cosmic illusion or nescience’ etc are directly imperceptible. Consequently Chârvaks do not accept such concepts as valid (22). “Putting faith in intangible or invisible things, men strive to attain the invisible or illusory happiness of heaven which they will never secure. Nor will they experience the perceivable happiness of the present world. These are the unhappy people. They will remain servants all their lives. The emergence of any Darshana takes place only when there is adverse mismatch or imbalance between materialism and spirituality. When a path in which faith, devotion, trust has been transformed into blind faith, that path (doctrine) is refuted or challenged by the emergence of a new Darshana (24). People may have started portraying common problems, (Indian Philosophy 25) well within the scope of normal human intellect and reasoning, as something very big and serious. As a result of this, Society may have become totally dependent or enslaved. It may have become crippled. Under these circumstances, the life of human beings may have become neither spiritual nor materialistic. Life may have become insipid. It may have become a life only in name. Under similar conditions, the Chârvak Darshana emerged. In order to protect people from blind spiritual dogmas, the material path was clearly enunciated by this doctrine giving prominence to material values (25). The state of society may have become just like “the blind leading the blind.” Ironically, like the American society, which is luled by the American Dream and “the blind are leading the blind.”

Colin identifies himself with Marco Polo, as a reincarnated person he considers himself as a great story teller (another pschopathic quality) and he wants to be “good.” In Indian philosophy there are also the five vows Ahimsâ (The Vow of Non-Violence) – Not causing sorrow to any human being, animal, bird, leaf, tree or any form of life whatsoever is termed Ahimsâ. (The Vow of Truthfulness) – A vow taken to utter speech which is dear, agreeable, proper, and which conforms to the truth, is termed or ‘the vow of truthfulness’. That speech though truthful is yet deemed untrue if it is not dear and not conducive to the good. (Satva 51). Asteyavrat (The Vow of Non-Stealing) – Not taking any article belonging to anyone unless given by that person which implies not stealing anything is defined as the ‘Asteyavrat’. (The Vow of Celibacy/Celstity) – To vow to sacrifice all heavenly and
greedy/lustful desires enjoyable by the three means namely ‘Krut, Anumat, and Karit’ (Mind, Speech, and Action) is the “Brahmāchāryavrat’. Aparigrahavrat (The Vow of Non-Attachment or Non-Possession) – The vow to sacrifice of the desire to possess anything at all is the ‘Aparigrahavrat’. The observances of these five vows are considered wholly and completely necessary (Satva 51). Ironically, Colin is committing the crimes in the name of the vows, thinking he is reincarnated and he is Marco Polo the great traveller. Colin also believes that evil begins with stopping, with enthrophy, therefore he wants his counter “progress.”

By choosing Dorethea as his soulmate he hopes for change. He wants to change Dorethea’s holy life. Colin functions as a catalyst by orienting himself toward other people, eventually toward another single person, Dorethea as the person having the next most important Karma with his soul. He is just a person helping - usually helping the weaker one - out of the present situation to master the change of life and to help to reorient in life after having gained the new freedom from the previous partners. He appeared suddenly in the life of a person, and is to do his "job" and to disappear. He would be either to remain just a very good friend or totally disappear out of sight for the remainder of this incarnation. As Colin cannot establish personal relationship, he is to disappear. Therefore, he commits suicide as Dorethea refuses to die with him. He is someone just coming into her life, getting her out of her apparent death-end road and once she is safe again, saying "good bye" and vanishing without living a hint. Dorethea hardly remembers anything of her captor, and for her, Colin was like an innocent school boy who had to be violent. For her, what she experienced was like a dream. By captivating her he gives her a life lesson transmitting the knowledge of life.

We are a grotesque parody or domesticity, Dorethea thought, but of what sort of domesticity is the parody? She seemed to know that, if she survived, she would remember this interlude for the remainder of her life: not the episodes of confusing action and violence (for she understood that violence was unavoidable)…her young blond captor Colin Asch sat brooding over his notebook like an unusually intense schoolboy immersed in his lesson (295).

Dorethea is attracted by Colin because she has a similar Karma. As Colin perceives the world full of pain and suffering which foreshadows his suicide he wants to destroy the whole world. He works for the media as a photomodel, but he does not want his body to be used. His job is the outcome of the capitalistic system. He rejects to be a commodity:

No, I never liked it, Dorethea: I loathed it. Peddling my flesh like I was some kind of Meat, or a prostitute, or something (276)

In this capitalist system media directs people and produces mass. Colin does not want to be a part. The pun on his name indicates a need for change. He is not to be satisfied as repesenting the individual in the man dominated capitalist society.

Therefore, Colin is after immediate satisfaction. He feels all people must provide satisfaction. He steals Aunt Ginny’s money easily. Ironically, he has all the right to take things from people; life,
money sex and love without paying the price. He even thinks of killing Hartley, because she speaks against Dorethea. For this reason he imagines a violent death for her. Colin is so diseased that he can be pitted. On the other hand, he rejects guilt and pity, because it is the most destructive and the most useless of all human instincts, and ironically, he feels pity for Hartley although he imagines her dead. He also thinks of murdering Charles, but he feels pity. His unexpected death would upset Dorethea. This too is paradoxical, because the psychopaths are incapable of feeling concern or remorse for the consequences of their actions. They can calmly rationalize their insensitive and bizarre behavior all the while attributing malice to everyone but themselves. When caught in a lie, they will manipulate others or stories to their own advantage without any fear of being found out - even if it is obvious to everyone around them that they will be found out. Psychopaths cannot feel fear for themselves, much less empathy for others. Most normal people, when they are about to do something dangerous, illegal, or immoral, feel a rush of worry, nervousness, or fear. Guilt may overwhelm them and prevent them from even committing the deed. Dorethea is full of feelings of guilt whereas Colin rejects guilt. As defined by Cleckley:

> The psychopath feels little, if any, guilt. He can commit the most appalling acts, yet view them without remorse. The psychopath has a warped capacity for love. His emotional relationships, when they exist, are meager, fleeting, and designed to satisfy his own desires. These last two traits, guiltlessness and lovelessness, conspicuously mark the psychopath as different from other men. (426)

Colin feels empathy for Dorethea. As he himself and his environment is violent, his death must be violent. He wants justice and immediate punishment. The meaning of life fades at the moment when Dorethea refuses his death offer. He decides to cut his own throat in front of her. Dorethea, too, feels empathy for Colin. During this captivation period, Dorethea comes to an understanding that violence is necessary to cope with life. Only when violence is made visible it can be grasped fully. His killing of Block was a requirement. Although, Block seemed to be a protector of the animals he was hypocritical and deserved death. The murder had to be brutal since he himself was brutal. The signal while driving was a sign suggesting that he should be punished. Colin felt blocked by him. As a seemingly and a hypocritical intellectual he deserved this brutality.

Colin’s superiority complex makes him fearless about law and punishment. He believes the police is too stupid to trace him. He records his murders carefully in his blue ledger. The codes he uses have to be read and identified like all the invisible deficiencies. He despises homosexuality and does not want anyone to touch him. When his aunt’s husband puts his hands on his shoulder he becomes mad and thinks he is queer. He had traumatic sexual experiences. He was used and abused in his childhood. He not only despises homosexuality, which metaphorically, stands for the love for the patriarchal system, but also he despises heterosexual love which stands for the lack of love and communication between the men and women in the materialistic man dominated society. When women make love to him, he feels they violate him by sucking his life from him. Actually, he exploits women and shows no sense for love and justice. He thinks that women adore his penis and he feels superior to them because of his sexual power. This hints at his distorted viewpoint related to sexuality and the
lack of authentic relationships in society. His symbolic connection to Dorethea is an exception. When Dorethea asks what he wants of her, he expresses his wish for appreciation, guidance and love.

**Psychopathology & Crime**

Colin, the psychopathic serial killer is symbolic for the individual, who is the outcome of the capitalistic society. What he calls for in life is too much in a selfish and profit oriented society. He is feelingless, brutal and merciless like the society in which he lives. Joyce Carol Oates by presenting Colin criticizes the cruelty of this society by making the invisible psychopath and violence visible. As affirmed by Cleckley, psychopathy is quite common in the community at large, since businessman, doctors, and even psychiatrist function as normal and is referred to as antisocial personality disorder-as an extreme of a “normal” personality dimension. Although, they occasionally appear on casual inspection as successful members of the community, as able lawyers, executives, or physicians, they do not, it seems, succeed in the sense of finding satisfaction or fulfillment in their accomplishments. Nor do they, when the full story is known, appear to find this in any other ordinary activity. By ordinary activity we do not need to postulate what is considered moral or decent by the average man but may include any type of asocial, or even criminal, activity so long as its motivation can be translated into terms of ordinary human striving, selfish or unselfish (Cleckley 191). Whereas they are considered successful and are respected, the criminal psychopath is considered unsuccessful. All psychopaths are not criminal. Having a psychopathic personality disorder does not make one a criminal. Some psychopaths live in society and do not technically break the law—although they may come close, with behavior that usually is very unpleasant for those around them. Some may lead seemingly normal lives, not hurting people in ways that attract attention, but causing problems nonetheless in hidden economic, psychological, and emotionally abusive ways. They do not make warm and loving parents, children, or family members. They do not make reliable friends or coworkers. Many psychopaths adopt a parasitic existence, living off the generosity or gullibility of others by taking advantage of and often abusing the trust and support of friends and family. They may move from place to place and from one source of support to another. You probably know one. You could work for, work with, or be married to someone with a psychopathic personality and not know that there is a formal psychological term for the individual who causes you so much pain and distress. He or she can be a neighbor, friend, or family member whose behavior you may find fascinating, confusing, and repelling. (Hare, Babiak 20)

Ironically, Colin, as an unsuccessful psychopath does not fear law, because Oates challenges the system of law and the institutions that are not reliable and cause crimes and injustice. Colin commits his murders without being prevented as the system of law comes short in dealing with crime in any form. Psychopathology, as a metaphor, is a form of crime which is made visible in the violent murders and suicide of Colin. Since the “hidden life” as one of the most important aspect of the psychopath is sometimes not well hidden but not preferred to be seen. It is difficult even for psychologists and psychiatrists to accurately decide whether someone has a psychopathic personality or not. Even Cleckley who had the chance to observe the persons closely realized that many of them did not display the usual symptoms of mental illness, but instead seemed “normal” under most conditions. He watched
them charm, manipulate, and take advantage of other patients, family members, and even hospital staff (Hare, Babiak 20), so did Colin.

He as an intelligent and intellectual serial killer functions as a tool to show the deformity of the law system as an important mechanism of the capitalistic system as represented by Charles Carpenter, who is as cruel as Colin. He as a married husband has an illegal relationship with another woman and does not put an end to this marriage, although he promises Dorethea a future. He does not have children suggesting that he is unable to father any children. Therefore, Colin considers this a blessing. He hopes to be closer to Charles because the law has to identify him. So, in the novel the only person identifying Colin as a psychopath is Charles. But when Colin captivates Dorethea, she hopes to be rescued by Charles in times of threat and danger, but Charles is absent. Her survival depends on Colin’s decision to vanish. Charles labels him as a brutal criminal, which suggests his short sighted view. His ignorance and blindness enables him to tell the difference between a dangerous criminal and the psychopath as defined by Cleckley:

1. The criminal usually works consistently and with what abilities are at his command toward obtaining his own ends. He sometimes succeeds in amassing a large fortune and may manage successfully and to his own profit a racket as complicated as a big business. The psychopath very seldom takes much advantage of what he gains and almost never works consistently toward a goal in crime or anything else, seemingly lacking purpose. Colin met Dorthea and defined his goal in life.

2. The criminal ends, though condemned, can usually be understood by the average man. The impulse to take money, even unlawfully, in order to have luxuries or power otherwise unobtainable, is not hard to grasp. The criminal, in short, is usually trying to get something we all want, although he uses methods we shun. On the other hand, the psychopath, if he steals or defrauds, seems to do so for a much more obscure purpose. He will repeatedly jeopardize and sometimes even deliberately throw away so much in order to seek what is very trivial (by his own evaluation as well as by ours) and very ephemeral. He does not utilize his gains as the criminal does. Sometimes his antisocial acts are quite incomprehensible and are not done for any material gain at all.

3. The criminal usually spares himself as much as possible and harms others. The psychopath, though he heedlessly causes sorrow and trouble for others, usually puts himself also in a position that would be shameful and most uncomfortable for the ordinary man or for the typical criminal. In fact, his most serious damage to others is often largely through their concern for him and their efforts to help him.

4. The typical psychopath, as I have seen him, usually does not commit murder or other offenses that promptly lead to major prison sentences...A large part of his antisocial activity might be interpreted as purposively designed to harm himself if one notices the painful results that so quickly overtake him... Psychopaths who commit physically brutal acts upon others often seem to ignore the consequences. Unlike the ordinary shrewd criminal, they carry out an antisocial act and even repeat it many times, although it may be plainly apparent that they will be discovered and that they must suffer the consequences. (Cleckley 261-263).

Joyce Carol Oates uses psychopathology in order to show the degenerating and dehumanizing force of the capitalistic society. Because psychopathy is almost required to survive in the competitive and capitalistic America and seems to be on the rise.
It is the very nature of American capitalist society. The great hustlers, charmers, and self-promoters in the sales fields are perfect examples of where the psychopath can thrive. The entertainment industry, the sports industry, the corporate world in a capitalistic system, are all areas where psychopaths naturally rise to the top. Some observers believe that there is a psychological continuum between psychopaths (who tend to be professionally unsuccessful) and narcissistic entrepreneurs (who are successful), because these two groups share the highly developed skill of manipulating others for their own gain. It is now being thought that they are actually the "same." It is hard to define. Although Charles labels him a psychopath he does nothing to protect Dorethea and Dorethea prefers to reject. Colin also can be falsely recognized as a narcissist rather than a psychopath. On the other hand narcissism is only a lighter form of psychopathy. Through Charles Oates hints at self-realization and respect for other creatures.

As it is all too easy to fall under the spell of the charismatic psychopath. The characters in the novel are manipulated by Colin. Many do his bidding without realizing that they have been subtly and cleverly controlled. The symbolic white outfit given to Dorethea by Colin as a Christmas gift suggests her unquestioning belief in Colin and the start of a new beginning. People in the psychopaths environment can even be manipulated to perform criminal acts, or acts of sabotage against another - innocent - person on behalf of the psychopath like Dorethea and when they realize having caused suffering in innocent people at the behest of a liar, again they prefer to deny this. Dorethea becomes the only witness of Colin’s murders.

Innocence is another issue that is repeatedly emphasized and controversial in the novel. For Dorethea, Colin and Colin’s victims are innocent. Dorethea is unable to identify Colin because she is the double as implicated by the several times mentioned mirror imagery, which brings self-realization not only for Dorethea but also for Colin:

Regarding Dorethea Deverell intently yet calmly, as if he were staring into a mirror at his own reflection, Colin Asch brought the end of the blade against his throat, against an artery he’d groped with seemingly practiced fingers (305).

Dorethea as representing the stereotypical intellectual woman in the novel, is unaware of her own needs and fears. She does not have an idea about her womanhood. Her ideas about her own past, present and future are vague. Dorethea seems to love Charles Carpenter, but is unable to talk about her true feelings and waits from him to court her and does not ask for more. She is too patient and too understanding. Ironically, as an art historian she is unable to analyze her own past. Her past and present are confused. Her ex-husband Michel’s death and Colin’s death are much the same.

Since the psychopath is particularly unable to make decisions based on future consequences, and is able only to focus attention on immediate gratification - short term goals - it is possible that such individuals can be dealt with by establishing a history of dealing out swift social retaliation (http://www.cassiopea.org/cass/official_culture.htm). Unlike this stereotypical psychopathic behavior, Colin, the double of Dorethea wishes to control life and restore the lost balance and shape the future.
That is, he calls for immediate identifying and punishing liars and cheaters. People should predict, notice and prevent his deeds and reveal the causes of his murders, since nothing happens without a cause. And he reflects the idea of the necessity for identifying the psychopaths, ceasing the interaction with them, cutting them off from the society, making the individual unavailable to them as "food" or objects to be conned and used as psychopaths to view others as objects or pawns to be moved around at will. Psychopaths are better at understanding the intellectual or cognitive lives of others than they are at understanding their emotional life. As a consequence, people have value only for what they can provide. Once used, they are discarded (Hare, Babiak 53-54).

Ironically, the case is different with Colin. His only wish is to be appreciated by Dorethea. He wants to be praised. With his slogan “I WANT TO BE GOOD” he sends his plea to the indifferent world. His previous life has brought him nowhere, locking him up had no effect on him in terms of modifying his life strategies. In fact, it made him worse. Since when locked up, he like many other psychopaths just simply learned how to be a better psychopath. This should be changed.

A change in the individual is required. The individual should feel guilt and blame himself, and to work to change things in himself that may need changing to reduce the possibility to encounter the psychopath or the narcissist. Yet, it is known and proven that if a psychopath/disordered narcissist targets no one is immune as affirmed by Robert Hare. The social system should cease to produce them as made evident by Dorethea’s ironical speech saying that such a thing cannot happen to people like her. But when it happened once, it could happen again, even after knowing what there is to know, if one remains uneducated about psychopathy/narcissism like most of the population. Susannah, Hartley, Krauss, Kreuzer, Martin, Charles, Ginny and Dorethea symbolize such individuals.

In the society many people are used to abusive relationships, from childhood, so they may tolerate the abuse of a psychopath and may become an "easy" target. It is their strengths that attracts the psychopath/N, who usually love a challenge. As people are accustomed to hear what is wrong with them rather than right they may be ignorant of these strengths. Oates characters are unaware of their own strengths and these various types of strengths attracts Colin: the power and money of Agnes, Hartley’s position at work, Susannah’s manipulating power on men and Krauss’s campaign against feminism. When Dorethea looks at Colin she recalls the sight of the paralyzed grandfather, Colin is the reincarnated grandfather, so Colin represents the man dominated capitalistic system that finds blind followers. Dorethea’s memories related to her husband’s grandfather reflects this idea. Michel Deverell’s (Longbridge Deverill is a village in England) with a background going back deep into the 13th century (http://history.wiltshire.gov.uk). The only thing she recalls about her husband is his name she still carries and the attitude of his grandfather. The ongoing patriarchal line of abuse will last in future as embodied by her present lover Charles. His invisible abuse has to be made visual.

As psychopaths recognize eachother anywhere, Charles recognizes Colin. Dorethea is unaware although there is a telepathy between Colin and her. As societies can be considered as "players" in the psychopath's game model. The past behavior of a society will be used by the psychopath to predict the future behavior of that society. Dorethea stands for the blind society. As suggested by Hare,
psychopaths are very effective at masking their true selves from those they wish to manipulate and con. Merely having a mental checklist of the traits that define psychopathy does not guarantee success in spotting the psychopath even the well-trained researchers may be fooled and manipulated by known psychopaths (67).

As Oates maintains, human salvation lies in recognizing the psychic interconnectedness of the species. The “hell” of selfishness must be cleansed from both the individual and the culture. By presenting a “Death Agent” an “Angel Boy” blonde, handsome and shiny with his imaginative and original murder styles as an artist, and a writer recording carefully each detail as if God looks down shows this necessity.

Conclusion

So it is both ironic and appropriate that Oates often uses artist (usually writer) characters to illustrate the “dying” philosophy of egoism. Oates believes an artist may be truly egoless, even personless. In “Notes on Failure” Oates proclaims that a writer, while writing, “Is not an entity at all, let alone a person, but a curious mélange of wildly varying states of mind, clustered toward what might be called the darker end of the spectrum: indecision, frustration, pain, dismay, despair, remorse, impatience, outright failure of which Colin Andrew Asch becomes the embodiment. As his name willfully suggests, the Bobwhite, Quail and Partridge, species widely occupying the earth, a man and a warrior, his remains are of fire, the enlightenment and belief. As he brings gladioli (sword-lily) in each drop in, he tells Dorethea with the flower language, his wish for fighting and ability to be mindful of danger and knowing when to go safely and not to hesitate in time of danger. He calls for action regeneration, awakening and courage in interpretation of life issues that Dorethea as an art historian lacks. Through his artistic murders he wants to redirect the flow of life and history. By getting rid of the rotten in the Nietzschean sense he paves the way to a new beginning through a symbolic union between Charles and Dorethea (law and art). It is now up to both sexes what meaning and role to attribute on their lives as species and to prevent any forms of crime. The newly married young girl Dorethea as she feels herself, while awaiting her husband Charles “the free man” seems to have freed herself from all kinds of restrictions in the mirrorless walls and with the help of Colin she now has a new opportunity to start life over again:

There were no mirrors remaining on any of the walls and no casual reflecting surfaces.
What pleasure, Dorethea thought, to be so totally alone: not even one’s own face to intrude (311).
References


-Kallman, F. J. Heredity in Health and Mental Disorders. New York: Norton.Laing, R. D.


Cultural Diversity as a Safeguard against Static Identity in Mary Kingsley's *Travels in West Africa and West African Studies*

Bechir Chaabane  
Majmaah University, Saudi Arabia

Abstract

Travel is not unsusceptible to the ideology in force since its journey and focal incidents are shaped by the spirit of the era. During the Victorian age, travel writing sponsored the imperial expansion by providing new markets for the British products especially in sub-Saharan Africa. In this aura, Africans are often presented as primitive, lacking history and culture. Unconventionally, Mary Kingsley gives the lie to this representation by exposing Africa as a land of cultural diversity and Africans as heterogeneous people with cultural specificities. The eminence of the cultural difference in the African society is strategically placed by Kingsley to point at the static and second-class identity imposed on Victorian women in 19th century. Approaching the native African culture differently can be read as a hedge against the static identity imposed on Victorian women at home.

Keywords: travel writing, Africa, Victorian age, cultural diversity, religion, spirituality, identity
Travel writing partly involves a translation of a highly subjective attitude towards the object of encounters: the other with all its configurations, namely, rendering the personal experience of travel. It traces the movement of the traveler across geographical, cultural, political and linguistic spaces. Beyond self-discovery, the traveler brings back stories for their readers, giving room for the culture of the other to voice itself. Andrew Hadfield states that the venture of travel “involves a series of reflections on one’s own identity and culture, which will inevitably transform the writer and will call into question received assumptions, including a sense of wonder at the magnificence of the other, or reaffirming deeply felt differences with a vengeance”.

Possibly, the un reciprocated and inequitable interaction patterns between the self and the other is ideology-free. Travel writing is not immune from ideological forces and the spirit of its age. In the course of the 19th century, expansion became a major aspiration for the European countries. Travel writing endeavours to adhere to a convention of some sort. In line with Tzvetan Todorov’s statement, “the form of disclosure is connected to the ideologies in force”. Peter Hulme also points to this ideological touch in travel writing by reminding readers that “the word adventure originally unified two areas of activity—economic acquisition and heroic action”. Unexpectedly, as a Victorian travel writer, Mary Kingsley through her Travels in West Africa 1897 and West African Studies 1899 is unconventional, since she encounters and portrays black Africa differently from the preceding travel writers. She dissociates herself emphatically from the general trend of nineteenth century travel writing by avoiding the systematic stereotyping of Africa as a land of oddity and Africans as aberrant people, lacking spiritual and moral refinement. In fact, the popular attitude towards Africa is presented in Joseph Conrad, Rider Haggard, Henry Morton Stanley, David Livingstone and many others as the Dark Continent and its people as primitive and barbaric.

More often than not, Heart of Darkness inscribes the natives as beast people capable of animalistic behaviour: “A continuous noise of the rapids above hovered over this scene of inhabited devastation. A lot of people, mostly black and naked, moved about like ants”. The text also maintains:

Black shapes crouched, lay, sat between the trees, leaning against the trunks, clinging to the earth, half coming out, half effaced within the dim light, in all the attitudes of pain, abandonment, and despair. Another mine on the cliff went off, followed by a slight shudder of the soil under my feet. The work was going on. The work! And this was the place where some of the helpers had withdrawn to die. They were dying slowly—it was very clear. They were not enemies, they were not criminals, they were nothing earthly now,—nothing but black shadows of disease and starvation, lying confusedly in the greenish gloom.

---

5 Ibid., p. 24.
To put his psychological trauma into action, Marlow turns "Africa and Africans" into a big circus marked by a sinister performance and textual violence. Doing so, he dehumanizes Africa and Africans. Native people are presented as slaves forced to work till extreme tiredness and death. The myth of the "Dark Continent is established during the transition from the main British campaign against the slave trade….. to the imperialist partitioning of Africa which dominated the final quarter of the nineteenth century". Edward Said considers the substantiation of the myth of the Dark Continent as a discourse of cultural hegemony involving strategies of power and subjection, inclusion and exclusion to validate the enlightenment of mission civilisatrice. At home, culture might often seem endangered by anarchy: through Chartism, trade unionism, socialism and feminism. Abroad, the British culture is safeguarded by silencing the conquered race. White women are themselves excluded and marginalized in the process of the cultural dominion.

Mary Kingsley sounds aware of white women's exclusion in the Western cultural exchange. She is against the preaching of the current novelists and missionaries stating that Africans are childlike, inferior, secular and non-religious. Once, she mentions: "nothing strikes one so much, in studying the degeneration of these natives, as the direct effect that civilization and reformation has in hastening it". Instead of justifying the subordination of Africans, she sustains their equality in terms of spirituality and religiosity: "the African treats his religion much as other men do: when he gets slightly educated, a little scientific one might say, he removes from his religion all the disagreeable parts". She differs from many late Victorians believed in the omnipotence of the Christian way as the only civilising course as Christianity breeds sexual inequality. Deconstructing the binarism of the West versus all aims at overturning the hierarchy in order to find new ways of thinking is no longer monitored by previous gendered classifications.

The long-standing confrontation between men and women over self-materialization engineers the defamation and the degradation of women with regards to religious aspects, leaving them always in the background. In terms of the Christian belief, "God the Father’ has been a dominant concept . . . ; the masculine has associations of strength, power and dominance". Allyson Julé goes so far to argue:

Christianity has been using patriarchal language for centuries. On the surface, language, pictorial representations and iconography have been male dominated. Arguments have been put forward suggesting that ‘the fatherhood of God is and must remain the predominant Christian symbol; it is not a closed or exclusive symbol but is open to its own correction, enrichment, and completion from other symbols such as mother’. Elizabeth Johnson sees this as improving the father symbol, but there is no female equivalent. She says ‘the feminine is there for the enhancement of the male, but not vice-versa: there is no mutual gain’. It is only recently that the Church has allowed women into the senior ranks but language has changed very little. ‘The new priestesses have to deconstruct the old hierarchy and system of communication if they want a more

---

7 Ibid., p. 167
9 Ibid., p. 158-9
holistic gendered God, though to some 'deconstruction within theology writes the epitaph for the dead God'.

The French feminist Simone de Beauvoir confirms this view when she asserts that in Genesis, Eve is depicted as made from what Bossuet called “a supernumerary bone” of Adam. Religious segregation is also attached to biological foundations. Menstruation, for instance, dictates a ritual treatment of women as it is evoked by Niza Yanay and Tamar Rapoport:

In Judaism, the ancient laws of impurity in regard to menstruation are known as the laws of niddah, and their ritualized form as the ritual of conditions, to enlist the meaning of niddah to their moral interests. In times of old, it was forbidden for women in a state of niddah to enter the site of the holy Temple or to eat meat from holy offerings, just as men suffering from various skin diseases or secretions were banned from the Temple. Yet, even after the destruction of the Second Temple by the Roman emperor Titus in 70 B.C., the laws of niddah retained their power, with a shift in meaning from a state of impurity related to sacrifices to a state of impurity related to sexual prohibitions in the private family sphere. Today, the laws of niddah are known as the laws of ‘Family Purity.’ When a woman is called a niddah, it practically denotes, in the language of the rabbis, that ‘she is forbidden to her husband’ and must avoid any sexual contact with him, including affectionate behavior. Jewish men and women alike are called upon to strictly adhere to the practice of separation, abiding by the detailed instructions and regulations, to ensure that the laws of niddah are applied with rigor by every woman. In this schema, patriarchal oppression is inscribed within religion which helps to make woman innately a subordinate being.

In this schema, “the laws of niddah” in Judaism with respect to menstruation bolster the patriarchal oppression on the basis of a religious back up to make woman inherently a subsidiary being.

Inconsiderate of this religious-based sexism, Western travellers and early missionaries, most often used to be men, magnified the African barbarism so as to justify its strong evil effect. Samuel Baker, for instance, degrades the African spiritual life to a sheer ludicrous paganism: "without exception, they are without a belief in a Supreme Being, neither have they any form of worship or idolatry; nor is the darkness of their minds enlightened even by a ray of superstition. The mind is as stagnant as the morass which forms its puny world". More significantly, a host number of anthropologists such as Charles de Brosses, Edward Tylor, and James Frazer virtually rejected the African religion in its entirety. Early missionaries themselves were serving the colonial government and worked their best to put into effect the governmental policy. They anchored on the burden of Christian men to help the aboriginal people to secure God's salvation. James Henderson, principal of the Scottish educational institution at Lovedale, claims that "missions must embrace 'world utility,' that is, the economic and social well-being of Africans and of South Africa as a whole. They must strive to Christianize all of African culture, and the African personality as well".

11 Ibid., p. 12.
1890's, Rudyard Kipling gave the imperial challenge its own "evangelical turn" as he instructed young Britons to take up the "White Man's Burden". According to this humanitarian attitude, tropical countries are not adequate for settled habitation by whites. Europeans cannot survive their climate or breed their children there.

Mary Kingsley sounds less devoted to the promises of the missionary work as well as the White Man's Burden. The work of missionaries exceeds simply the spreading of a religion to an utter transformation of lifestyle, some sort of Westernization. The self-centred and dogmatic attitude of the missionaries prevents them from a wholesale assimilation of the native Africans' customs and manners, leading them to distort their lifestyle instead. Rejecting the Eurocentric theories available to her, Kingsley believes in the appropriateness of African systems of religion and law to the African setting. She never hesitates to divulge the harshness of the imposed Christian belief on these rustic and simple-minded people; "in places on the coast where there is, or has been, much missionary influence, the trouble is greatest, for in the first case the natives carefully conceal things they fear will bring them into derision and contempt, although they still keep them in their innermost hearts".17 Africans give reverence to objects that they have come to admire as having particular qualities, binding the physical world to the spiritual one. The missionaries fail to fathom the communicative aspect of these fetish objects in African mindset. The African fetish objects spring from their eternal quest to comprehend the universe and to come to terms with the forces that control their inner life. Kingsley, herself, often articulates her quest as a search for the hidden truth, often slippery but by all means existent. By overlooking the European preconceptions, "at first you see nothing but a confused stupidity and crime, but when you get to see - well! . . . you see things worth seeing",18 she attempts from her reading and her travels to understand the African society and its frame of reference from within, to rectify the inaccurate views held about Africa and Africans at the Victorian time.

In this light, she takes polygamy, for instance, as a cultural dictate rather than a repressive institution. The demonization of polygamy proceeds from the catering to natural male desires to exercise boundless power over women symbolized by the East, Africa and colonial spaces overall. Much like colonial spaces, women are represented as spectacle body to be looked at, place of sexuality and object of desire. Some cultural critics, including Edward Said, have argued, the institution of the harem, more fantastic than real, is a source of relentless voyeuristic interest in the East that treats its women as eroticized "houris".19 Similar to Africa, the Orient is connected to a "mother, evil seducer, licentious aberration, life-giver".20 Jules Michelet, for instance, figures the orient as the 'womb of the world'.21 In the 19th century, oriental women were seen as powerful seductresses. When he refers to "the womb", Michelet probably thinks of Genesis with Eve, the temptress. By analogy, Africa is likened to a blank space as a the female womb. It is an evil

17 Mary Kingsley, Travels in West Africa, op., cit., p. 161
18 Ibid., p. 103
21 Cited in McClintock, op. cit., p. 124.
seducer, “smiling, frowning, inviting, grand, mean, insipid, or savage…with an air of come and find out”.  

Unlike this imperial analogy, polygamy proved to be feasible in Kingsley’s frame of mind:

> Polygamy enabled a man to get enough to eat. . . . there are other reasons which lead to the prevalence of this custom beside the cooking. One is that it is totally impossible for one woman to do the whole of housework—look after the children, prepare and cook the food, prepare the rubber, fetch the daily supply of water from the stream, cultivate the plantation. The more wives, the less work, say the African lady, and I have known men who would rather have had one wife and spent the rest of the money on themselves.  

Kingsley thinks polygamy is a healthy symptom in the African society in so far as it promotes their lifestyle and not an evidence of moral decadence. McEwan judges the missionary trial to eradicate polygamy as a distressing act, as it is endorsed by McEwan who thinks “that polygamy was a fundamental aspect of the structure of West African societies and that the attempts by missionaries to eradicate the custom were causing distress and disruption within these societies”.  

Accordingly, unlike the missionaries who consider polygamy a slavery institution or a form of cohabitation, Kingsley takes polygamy as a cultural artifact dictated by the nature of the African society in itself as well as its socioeconomic factors.

Not less importantly, polygamy is presented as a preventive safeguard or a safety measure for traders since it ensures their security. As the most prevalent way to get rid of enemies is the cooking pot and what goes into it, the trader needs to have a wife in each village to look after his safety. The text of Kingsley reads:

> But trader is not yet safe. There is still a hole in his armour, and this is only to be stopped up in one way, namely, by wives. . . . Now the most prevalent disease in the African bush comes out of the cooking pot, and so to make what goes into the cooking pot . . . . safe and wholesome, you have got to have someone who is devoted to your health to attend to the cooking affairs and who can do this like a wife? So you have a wife— one in each village up to your route. I know myself one gentleman whose wives stretch over 300 miles of country, with a good wife base in a coast town as well.

She goes on to ascertain that the African woman is the temple of security for the African man and a barometer that gives his life a sense of stability and a certain balance. She states: “security can lie in women, especially so many women, the so called civilized man may ironically doubt, but the security is there, and there only, on a sound basis, for remember the position of a travelling trader’s wife in a village is a position that gives the lady the prestige”.  

Kingsley’s assertion that “the security is there” is very telling. It is intended to men, at large, and to the Victorian men, in particular, who suspect the whole process, namely that polygamy exists to satisfy male sexual

---

24 McEwan, op. cit., p. 160.  
26 Ibid., p. 137.
appetites. By analogy, it is a yelling cry from Kingsley to speak out the repressed stories of Victorian women, to bespeak a new image of women throughout as a stronghold of security, deserving more appreciation.

Much distinct from Conrad, Haggard and many others, Mary Kingsley treats the African people as subjects with historical and cultural heritage. Though the exchange with the black men such as her close identification with the Fans may harm her reputation as a woman, she dares to interact with them without a lot of precautions. From the outset, Kingsley gives the lie to the preconceptions already compiled from men travel texts. She states: “one by one I took my old ideas and weighed them against the real life around me, and found them either worthless or wanting”.27 She goes on to absolve herself from falsification and imagination: “I have written only on things that I know from personal experience and very careful observation and stressing my own extensive experience of West coast”.28 With a shrewd eye for details, she attempts to keep faith to her promise: “now I am ambitious to make a picture, if I make one at all, that people who do know the original can believe in- even if they criticize its points and so I give you details a more showy artist would omit”.29 In this vein, Catherine Barnes Stevenson puts: “with a keen eye for detail, Mary Kingsley recorded the dress, food, culture, architecture, and religion of various Africans she encountered and with sympathetic understanding she tried to penetrate ‘the dark forest’ of the African mind”.30 Time and again, Kingsley testifies to Catherine Barnes’ thought: “but before I enter into a detailed description of this wonderful bit of West Africa, I must give you a brief notice of the manners, habits and customs of West Coast Rivers in general, to make the thing more intelligible”.31 Thus, in her representation of the African people and space, she attempts to exempt herself from racial prejudices of the cultural representation of the nineteenth century.

To bypass racial prejudices, Kingsley suggests a conduct to do justice to Africans. Again, she claims:

As it is with the forest, so it is with the minds of the natives. Unless you live alone among the natives, you never get to know them; if you do this, you gradually get a light into the true state of their mind-forest. At first you see nothing but a confused stupidity and crime; but you get to see well as in the other forest-you see things worth seeing. But it is beyond me to describe the process. 32

She goes on admitting:

I confess that the more I know of the West coast Africans, the more I like them. I own I think them fools of the first water for being the process of being; but I fancy I have

27 Ibid., p. 15.
28 Ibid., p. 80.
29 Ibid., p. 17.
30 Ibid., p. 103.
31 Ibid., p. 23.
32 Ibid., p. 34.
analogous feelings towards even my fellow countrymen when they go and violently believe in something that I cannot quite swallow. 33

Though Alice Blunt and McEwan charge her with an essentialist racial approach while referring to the African character, 34 the texts of Kingsley revoke such a contention throughout as it is marked in the last quotation. Kingsley studies the African on the ground of social differences rather than on a biological ground for the manners, conventions and stories are part and parcel socially constructed. In a reply to the Spectator 1885, she writes: “I do not like to think that I have done anything to bring the African into further disrepute”. 35 Undoubtedly, overgeneralization is a colonial stereotype as it is connected with freezing the natives in time and space, denying them any cultural specificity, which has nothing to do with Kingsley’s attitude. To the credit of Cheryl McEwan, “the very notion of the ‘African’ in travel narratives testifies to a cultural bias that blinded the reader to ethnic and individual character. The construction of a mythical ‘African’ meant the denial of any diversity of individualities within this category”. 36 Kingsley’s notion of “Africans” is an all-encompassing category, involving men and women. In the preface to Travels in West Africa, she admits: “I have great reason to be grateful to the Africans themselves- to cultured men and women among them”. 37 At times, she employs the adjective, “African”, to designate the African man: “the African treats his religion as much as other men do”. 38 Even in this case, the term African is not used pejoratively to degrade the African man, but to project his cultural specificities as an individual subject.

Religion and spiritualism are signposts for the cultural specificities of the sub-Saharan Africans. In an article entitled, "Histories of Religion in Africa", Louis Brenner defines religion "as the field of cultural expression that focuses specifically on communication and relationship between human beings and those (usually) unseen spiritual entities and/or forces that they believe affect their lives". 39 Religion, in this case, is not a self-contained system, but it reflects the pluralism and heterogeneity of the African society. "Spirituality" as defined by Carlyle Fielding Stewart "represents the full matrix of beliefs, power, values, and behaviours that shape people's consciousness, understanding, and capacity of themselves in relation to divine reality" 40 and this spirituality has induced the survival of African customs. The Christian missionaries paly a significant role in destabilising the pluralistic identity of Africans by imposing christianity on them. The British historian Terence Ranger’s more general discussion on religion, development and identity in Africa, strongly defies the organic model of society and religion. Before the advent of modern colonialism, there was not, in his view, an organic collectivity but a creative and resilient pluralism. Commenting on the current situation, he argues that ‘the real identity crisis in Africa is not found in changes from a single traditional ‘frozen’ identity to a bewildering pluralism. The real identity crisis

33 Ibid., p. 96.
34 Cheryl McEwan, Gender, Geography and Empire: Victorian Women Travelers to West Africa, Aldershot, Ashgate, 2000, p. 96.
36 McEwan, op. cit., p. 94.
38 Ibid., p. 158.
39 David Westerlund, African Indigenous Religion and Disease Causation, Boston, Brill, 2006, p. 2
is exactly the other way round. It is produced by the change from a creative pluralism to single frozen identities.\textsuperscript{41}

In this line of thought, Christianity is intended by white regimes to give credence to the ostensible aim of bringing civilisation, justifying the oppression of black people. However, social and cultural changes should be taken place in order that Africans would be disposed to adopt Christianity.

Kingsley differs from many late Victorians who staunchly believed in the supremacy of the Christian way as the only civilising course along with a supposedly more tolerant attitude to other religions. Her tolerance for differences across several groups is revealing. It validates her knowledge about the religious diversity and the contests it presents to the stance of some writers on Victorian religion who claim that, "the religious diversity that Victorians knew, however, was almost exclusively the 'internal pluralism' within institutionalized British Christianity".\textsuperscript{42} Likewise, "many Victorians would have been puzzled by references to 'other religions' within the context of British society apart from the presence of Judaism".\textsuperscript{43} From this promontory position in late Victorian context, Mary Kingsley was an unwelcome rebellious voice. Significantly, she would have been vexing to many of her British audience with respect to the way in which her autonomous travelling as a single woman in Africa would also work against the grain of the governing ideologies about the Victorian woman's morality. By studying the African moral institutions, something very unfeminine, which directly goes against the established male dominance at that time, Kingsley revolts against the systematic stereotyping of the Victorian society in terms of relegating women and the natives to the bottom of the scale.

Fetishism is one of the Victorian stereotypes, downgrading the Africans as spiritually inferior to Europeans. The study of fish and fetishism is one of Kingsley’s primordial objectives to set out for West Africa. Once her text reads, "my main aim in going to Congo Français was to get up above the tide line of the Ogwe River and there collect fishes; for my object on this voyage was to collect fish from a river north of the Congo".\textsuperscript{44} She methodically adds:

The religious ideas of the Negroes, i.e. the West Africans in the district from the Gambia to the Cameroon region, say roughly to the Rio del Rey (for the Bakwiri appear to have more of the Bantu form of an idea than the Negro, although physically they seem nearer the latter), differ very considerably from the religious ideas of the Bantu South–West Coast tribes. The Bantu is vague on religious subjects; he gives one accustomed to the Negro the impression that he once had the same set of ideas, but has forgotten half of them, and those that he possesses have not got that hold on him that the corresponding or super–imposed Christian ideas have over the true Negro; although he is quite as keen on the subject of witchcraft, and his witchcraft differs far less from the witchcraft of the Negro than his religious ideas do. The god, in the sense we use the word, is in essence the same in all of the Bantu tribes I have met with on the Coast: a

\textsuperscript{41} Ibid., p. 193-194
\textsuperscript{43} Ibid., p. 223
\textsuperscript{44} Kingsley, Travels in West Africa, op. cit., p. 23.
non–interfering and therefore a negligible quantity. He varies his name: Anzambi, Anyambi, Nyambi, Nzambi, Anzam, Nyam, Ukuku, Suku, and Nzam, but a better investigation shows that Nzam of the Fans is practically identical with Suku south of the Congo in the Bihe country, and so on. They regard their god as the creator of man, plants, animals, and the earth, and they hold that having made them, he takes no further interest in the affair. But not so the crowd of spirits with which the universe is peopled, they take only too much interest and the Bantu wishes they would not and is perpetually saying so in his prayers, a large percentage whereof amounts to 'Go away, we don't want you.' 'Come not into this house, this village, or its plantations.' He knows from experience that the spirits pay little heed to these objurgations, and as they are the people who must be attended to, he develops a cult whereby they may be managed, used, and understood. This cult is what we call witchcraft.  

While the collection of rare species of fish is a basic objective of her journey, the study of the tribes within Africa in terms of their customs and practices, what she herself labels “fetish” is no less important. James. W. Fernandez claims that, “whilst the primary rationale of Mary Kingsley's expedition was the collection and preservation of new species of fish, she often extended the taxonomy metaphor to the African people and African life; he and it were of different species and entitled to description and preservation”. Indeed, the religious practice is central to the African life and although there are no inscribed codes, its practiced morals exert community control and tribal solidarity. Ethnic groups wrestled and subjugated each other but their traditional religious beliefs led them to overstep conflicts and cultural differences. The African world is overwhelmingly religious. In virtually most activities, there is a religious touch such as in marriages, funerals and childbirth, especially the case of twins. The African culture underlines and voices the depth of the African emotional life and its spirituality. Fetishism implies a universal tendency or an assimilation of inanimate stuff used by savages believing that these objects have magical or supernatural powers.

Anne McClintock gives her word on the notion of fetish as it is indicated in the following passage:

If the medieval discourse on the feitiço was associated with a discipline of the body and denunciation of illicit popular rites, by the fifteenth century the term had entered the realm of empire. Portuguese explorers trading along the West Coast of Africa used the term feitiço to describe the mysterious amulets and ritual objects favored by the African peoples they encountered on their voyages.

By spotlighting the African religion, Kingsley gives the matter its due reverence, distinguishing herself from Victorian men travel writers who degrade the African religion as a stretch of witchcraft and attribute salvation exclusively to Christianity. Thereof, Katherine Frank in her biography of Mary Kingsley considers that the study of the fetish by Mary Kingsley within Travels in West Africa and the later West African Studies verges on being a “spiritual

47 McClintock, op. cit., p. 186.
autobiography”. 48 Kingsley expresses "her deep respect to all forms of religion in West Africa” 49 while calling for a substitute for the denigrating term fetish: "I sincerely wish there were another name than fetish which we could use for it, but the natives have different names for their own religion in different districts and I do not know what other general name I could suggest”. 50 Her respect for the African forms of religion emanates from her understanding of the distinctive role of the religious spirituality in the African's casual life. Her understanding of the role of the religion in the African life is partly illustrated in A. B. Ellis' frame of mind:

With most races which are still relatively low in the scale of civilisation, it is found that their religion... is frequently the main-spring of their actions. Religion is not with them, as with civilised peoples, a matter outside one's daily life; it is a subject which affects and influences in some degree almost every action of their daily life, and which is closely interwoven with all their habits, customs and modes of thought.

Ellis calcifies the differences between the two cultures in terms of religion, for where Europeans consider religion out of touch with their daily life; to the African it shapes "almost every action of their daily life". However, he denies the spiritual meaning of religion in African life. Africans are concerned with the surface, not the substance of things, he believes. Otherwise, Kingsley voices the significance of religion in the casual and spiritual life of the Africans: "the life in Africa means a spirit". 52 African religious belief systems affect all aspects of the African community life as well as their spiritual upliftment. Doing so, Kingsley brings an aspect of the African cultural practice to history after it has been distorted by the colonial intrigue.

Kingsley’s manoeuvre may be read as “a cultural resistance to imperialism” and patriarchy in Said’s words, which is defined as a form of “nativism used as a private refuge... to fight against the distortions inflicted on the [native’s] identity... to return to a pre-imperial period to locate a ‘pure’ native culture”. 53 Hence, native cultural practices, whose destruction the imperialistic enterprise is consciously keen on, are revived in Kingsley’s texts to provide a new perspective of approaching the native culture. The same subversive practices are well developed in native African writers such as Chinua Achebe, Ngugi wa Thiongo, Bessie Head, Amos Tutuola and many others, inscribing their fascination with their native culture with its wealth of cultural artifacts. Kingsley comes close to intersect with native African writers in the same postcolonial axes of resistance to the imperialistic project since they are oppressed by the same subjugating hand. Likewise, they struggle to break free from the coercion and tyranny of the colonial machine by fashioning new identities for themselves as free subjects rather than colonized and subordinate denizens.

The scramble for Africa for Victorian women overall and Mary Kingsley in particular may be considered as a quest for new identities away from the Victorian social and sexual fetters and

49 Mary Kingsley, West African Studies, London, Macmillan and CO, 1899, p. 113
50 Ibid, p. 114
52 Kingsley, Travels in West Africa, op., cit., p. 171
shackles, an identity forged through a narrative tension, translating an embodied experience of encounter. The textual representation of these new identities caters for distinct forces such as the audience expectation, the imperialistic context and the feminine question which are carried by short stories that challenge the official historical record. For instance, Kingsley considers "Trade English. . . exceedingly charming" as it "employs no genders". Therefore, it is claimed through a process of disclosing the cultural hegemony of the white people in the colonial setting of Africa and this equips Victorian women travel writers with a worthwhile moment to claim agency at home after demonstrating their aptitude to manage with what Achebe calls the “crossroads of culture”. Doing so, they point at the patriarchal colonial scheme behind the imperialistic mission in Africa, which, per se, subjects them to the same trial of oppression at home. In a word, Mary Kingsley's admission of the cultural pluralism of the sub-Saharan African societies can be read as a vindication against the patriarchal imperial strategy imposing on the natives and women at large static identities and freezing them in the course of history.

54 Kingsley, *Travels in West Africa*, op., cit., p. 163
55 Ibid., p. 162
56 Crossroad of culture implies transitional period that manifests . . . the great creative potential. It’s an area of tension and conflict . . . of power and possibility. In Bernth Lindfors, ed., *Conversations with Chinua Achebe*, Jackson, University Press of Mississippi, 1997, p. 80.
References

Primary Sources:

Secondary Sources:


De-colonising the British ex-colonies: The Demise of the British Empire through the subaltern voices in *Time For A Tiger* and *The Jewel in The Crown*

Hayfa Cheneni
University of Tunis, Tunisia

Abstract

The demise of the British Empire led many novelists and critics to try to dig deep into the stories of the unheard voices of the ex-colonized countries so as to trigger the truth about colonization and more importantly (de)colonization as being put into question. In fact, British withdrawal from India and later on from Malaya and Pakistan formed a radical change in the world map and led to a sense of nostalgia for the loss of power. Fiction played a substantial role in unveiling the truth about the dark sides of the (de)colonized nations. Furthermore, novelists tried to shed light on the subaltern and give them space to speak about their stories; the stories that could not find a place in the official history. Indeed, post-colonial novelists tried to narrate the nation through the voices of ordinary people in order to elucidate their suffering and their struggle whether physical, mental or emotional.

Keywords: decolonization, British colonies, empire, post colonial, subaltern, Literature, history, mise en intrigue, metaphor
Introduction

The end of the British Empire led many novelists and critics to try to dig deep down the stories of the unheard voices of the ex-colonized countries in order to trigger the truth about colonization and more importantly (de)colonization as being put into question. In fact, British withdrawal from India and later from Malaya and Pakistan formed a turning point in the world map and led to a sense of nostalgia for the loss of power. Fiction played a crucial role in unveiling the truth about the dark sides of the (de)colonized nations. Furthermore, novelists tried to shed light on the subaltern and give them space to speak about their stories; the stories that could not find a place in the official history. Indeed, post-colonial novelists tried to narrate the nation through the voices of ordinary people in order to elucidate their suffering and their struggle whether physical, mental or emotional.

Hence, this paper will tackle mainly the issue of rewriting history through the unheard voices of the (de)colonized. It will deal with two major works of fiction, which treated the issue of the British Empire in two different ways but similar goals: *The Jewel in the Crown* by Paul Scott and *Time for a Tiger* by Anthony Burgess. The two novels are a good incarnation of the British awkward retreat from India and Malaya as they give the reader a new view of the end of the British Empire through the serious representation of the British Raj in India in Scott’s *The Jewel in the Crown* and the comic and sarcastic representation of the social decay and loss of dignity and morality in Burgess’s *Time For a Tiger*. Although they used different tones in their writings, Scott and Burgess had common motives. In other words, their endeavor was to criticize the British withdrawal from India and Malaya and its effects on people and wanted to convey the true story that lies beneath the surface of the official writings of history. They did not deal with numbers and dates or with great names, they dealt with ordinary people, ordinary names but great events. Their motives lie in their interest in the British Empire, use of English language and more importantly use of metaphors. Yet, this does not deny the fact that they used different genres of writing and attempted to convey the embeddedness of the decolonization experience in a different way.

Therefore, this paper will first deal with the role played by literature in interrogating history. Then, it will shed light on the common motives of Paul Scott and Anthony Burgess in writing these works of fiction and finally it will differentiate *The Jewel in the Crown* from *Time for A Tiger* in terms of Genre.

Literature interrogating history

1. Gap filling:

When a civilization does not have writing, when it has only an oral memory, there is also no History. Hegel equates the birth of history with the birth of a will for “duration in memory.” Thus, writing fixes and preserves the past. When fiction writes history, it reveals beneath History a whole mosaic of stories. In the novel, history does not appear as something which is complete, but as an open space that draws man towards his future, towards new possibilities of being including the very possibility of existing.
Poets and especially novelists felt the urge to narrate “true” and to write down historical reality as it is. At the same time, historians felt obliged to satisfy the expectations of the contemporary reading public. Yet, as the two groups of writers started mixing facts and fictions and kept on claiming that they both were telling “true stories,” it was no longer possible to tell factual (historiographic) from fictional (literary) narration. By this means, a reciprocal relationship between the two forms of writing was achieved so that fictional and factual writing could now be identified “relatively” to one another, as “factual” or “fictional” or as “true” or “false.”

Works of fiction unquestionably possess a referential level (that of “events”), even though it may not be in the form of a given factual reality, but rather in the mode of a fictional reality, itself implicated in the narrative of the fictional work. As far as The Jewel in The Crown and Time for A Tiger are concerned, they both handle the last days of the colonial era, legacies of colonisation and decolonization. They explore the hidden realities of the post-colonial countries. Hence, unlike the official writing of history, these novels explore the unexplored areas and trigger a whole mosaic of stories from people like Daphne, Kumar and Victor Crabbe. In fact, the focus is not on the whole; it’s rather on the particular, they link those voices that haven’t been recorded in official history. “Les petites histoires” are more important than the official historical writing because they display the effect of the colonial experience on their little lives. As Paul De Mann argues in Blindness and Insight:

“The theme of the novel is thus necessarily limited to the individual and to this individual’s frustrating experience of his own inability to acquire universal dimensions”

Henceforth, the historical novels work as gap filling for the official history and this is the meeting spot between post-modernism, which focuses on the rewriting of the official history, and post-colonialism where “les petites histoires” are favoured upon the big narratives. These novels are not like the official historiography of decolonization as they do not represent a unique set of events from a single perspective. Yet, they do not work as separate from the official history but as complementary to them through interrogation and questioning.

2. Mise en intrigue:

To talk about “la mise en intrigue” one needs to talk about the “continuum” first. In fact, the “continuum” is associated with history as a discipline and has to do with events that are unified. According to Karl Löwith it’s:

“A systematic interpretation of universal history in accordance with a principle by which historical events and successions are unified and directed toward an ultimate meaning”

Writing a historical account in a fictional form needs a lot of work and a collection of information. This act is a hard task to do as it needs selection, arrangement and outlook. Actually, to write such an account, one needs to have a certain ideology, to make a personal stance in order to see things from a different perspective, an angle that differs from that of the official historical writings. This seems to be objectivity but in reality it is not, because selection, arrangement and outlook kill
objectivity. The writer is involved in a way or another. The fact of selecting and arranging the data
with an outlook is subjective in itself. One can’t speak about unconscious writing, there’s always a
deliberate will in the part of the author to retrieve stories. As states Paul Scott in The Jewel in the
Crown:

“To make the preparation of any account a reasonable task he would have to adopt an
attitude towards the available material. The action of such an attitude is rather like that
of a sieve. Only what is relevant to the attitude gets through. The rest gets thrown away.
The real relevance and truth of what gets through the mesh then depends on the
relevance and truth of the attitude...” (357)

Undeniably, in reproducing history, narration is inescapable. Explaining this further, it is
worthy to mention the “Alienated Gaze”3 of Balzac. That is, according to John Riguall
“narration seems to be simply a matter of observation,” and as for Balzac:

“It is observation that he singles out as one of the two essential powers of the writer,
that sagacious and curious genius who sees and registers everything”4

That is, for Balzac, the writer has a divine nature, which enables him to see everything and
to see the truth everywhere. According to him, the poet or philosopher is endowed with:

“A sort of a second sight which allows them to divine the truth in all possible situations;
or, better still, some power, which takes them where they ought and want to be”5

In this respect, the truth is told through narration and history must be a narrative rather
than a mere event because if it can’t be narrated, it can’t be called an event. Furthermore,
history is related to a series of stories, the author has a collection of scattered events, a lot
of documented materials, scripts for testimonies that he ought to gather together and unify
them to form a well established story with a beginning, middle and end and make it
accessible and understandable. Stating as an example the question told by Sister Ludmila
in The Jewel in the Crown into which she questions the intelligibility of a historical event:

“…there is also in you an understanding that a specific historical event has no definite
beginning, no satisfactory end? It is as if time were telescoped? Is that the right word?
As if time were telescoped and space dovetailed?”6 (133)

This means that generally, history can never be precise and limited to a certain account and a certain
perspective for there are various accounts that cannot be ended and that can, in themselves, be a
beginning. Therefore, arrangement of such events is a hard task, yet it gives the reader a glimpse
about the silenced voices and the dim areas denied in the official historical writings.
Common motives of Paul Scott and Anthony Burgess

1. The British Empire:

*The Jewel in the Crown* and *Time for a Tiger* are two historical novels that share multiple characteristics. In fact, while handling these two novels, there’s a clear interrelatedness between them that lies in the heart of the British Empire. Theoretically speaking what connects them is not the influence of one writer over another, it’s rather a historical event, the colonisation experience. At the heart of any approach of the aftermath it has to be the notion of Empire and Imperialism, legacy of colonisation. In fact, the British Empire is one of the motives that led to these writings. Furthermore, the end of the British Empire and its clumsy withdrawal was put into question by many historians and novelists. Was it the end of the British Empire? Was it a transfer of power? Was it a simple withdrawal? Or a war of Independence? All these questions splashed out in order to understand the truth about this ending, the last days of Empire and its effects on people.

2. English language:

“The text does not tell the story in language but transforms the story into language. Language becomes the condition of story.” Language plays a crucial role in narration, the way language is used, how it is used, in what context and what language used can make a great difference in conveying a particular message. According to Lacan “It is a world of words, which creates the world of things,” with words one can create a whole community, characters, people, animals, and an entire life just with words. Furthermore, for Bakhtin “the significance of language lies in the perception that it exists neither before the fact nor after the fact but in the fact” In *The Jewel in the Crown* and *Time for a Tiger*, there are different approaches to language; English language in particular, the uses, misuses or abuses of the English language.

As a matter of fact, the reasons behind the use of English language and not another language are widely debated among historians. Chinua Achebe argues “we are going to do the unheard of things in English” that is, language is going to be problematized, he is going to twist the English language for his own purposes. The question that imposes itself here is why? Well, English language is the language of the coloniser. Hence, the writers like Scott, Burgess and Achebe want to make their message to the colonizer clear, they want to speak the language of the enemy in order to make intelligible to the British. In fact, if they chose to write in another language, the enemy won’t bother himself and translate the work into his language and thus the message won’t be articulated. This idea of writing in English language came from the Irish writer James Joyce who speaks about hating the language and appropriating it. That is, to use it, doesn’t necessarily mean to love it but just use it to serve your own interest and appropriate it to your own needs.

On the flip side, Ngugi Wa thiong’o has another view about the English language, he believes that one should write in his own language (kikouyou in his case) in order to revive the old lost traditions and prevent it from disappearance. He believes that if he will write in English language
his mother tongue will disappear and thus his identity as he considers language as a source of identity. Moreover, Burgess makes the issue of language clear in Time for a Tiger as follows:

“One minute it’s all about being a farmer’s boy in Northamptonshire and the next you’re on about the old days in Calcutta and what the British have done to Mother India and the snake-charmers and the bloody temple-bells. Ah, wake up for God’s sake. You’re English right enough but you’re forgetting how to speak the bloody language…”  

Thus, Scott along with Burgess used English language as a way to make their novels intelligible for the British.

3. Metaphor:

Throughout history many historical accounts and narratives tended to use images to transmit their messages and ideas. In fact, metaphor is a commonly used device to describe the Imperial experience through the novels. Metaphor is no longer what Aristotle viewed as a mere ornament; it’s rather a whole meaning holder. Furthermore, in The Jewel in the Crown and Time for a Tiger the use of metaphor is omnipresent throughout the novels. Hence the dialogue between the metaphorical and the literal dominates them. Explaining this further, a metaphor can be on the level of a sentence but goes on to a whole discourse and here what is most obvious is the metaphor of the titles, the extended metaphor at the level of discourse.

Both Burgess and Scott used metaphors in their titles. The Jewel in the Crown is highly symbolic; it holds a whole story behind it. In fact, India is the “jewel” and England is the “crown”. This metaphor goes to cover the whole atmosphere of the novel through the character of Daphne and Kumar and the group of Indian cops; going further to the rape scene, which is the most powerful passage for it displays a sexual humiliation articulated for domination and shows the inversion of roles. That is, normally England is the man and India is the raped woman; yet in the case of Daphne Manners, the raped is England and the man is India.

Another important metaphor is “the weary titan,” which was used by Joseph Chamberlin in 1902. In fact, the Malayan Trilogy used to be “the Long day wanes” but Burgess changed it. This metaphor suggests that the downfall of the day is the downfall of the British Empire and was originally taken from Tennyson’s poem “Ulysses”:

The lights begin to twinkle from the rocks  
The long day wanes: the slow moon climbs: the deep  
Moans round with many voices

In these lines, he is speaking about himself as a sailor and yearns to go back home and here it’s as if England speaking. Moreover, the title Time for a Tiger is indeed a metaphor for “tiger” is a kind of beer, which suggests “let’s have a drink.” In this respect, Anthony’s novel is more comical and funnier than Scott’s one. He is doing a different manner of critique to the British Empire, like Victor Crabbe (he is victorious but at the end he is defeated.) here, the British Empire is like the Crabbe, which moves in the four ways. Hence, Scott along with Burgess used the device of
metaphor not as an ornament but as a whole meaning holder to better display their sarcastic and interrogating attitude.

Generic studies

Genre:

“The process of assimilating real historical time and space in literature has a complicated and erratic history, as does the articulation of actual historical persons in such a time and space. Isolated aspects of time and space, however, those available in a given historical stage of human development, have been assimilated, and corresponding generic techniques have been devised for reflecting and artistically processing such appropriated aspects of reality.” (M. M. Bakhtin, 85)

Genre is a highly debated issue by theorists and novelists because it exists in every text; it’s unavoidable, as E. D. Hirsch argues about genre that one cannot understand any text without thinking of its generic origins. Furthermore, we can’t speak about genre without mentioning Derrida and his argument that: “(E)very text participates in one or several genres, there is no genreless text; there is always genre and genres, yet such participation never amounts to belonging.” Henceforth, genre is inevitable and genre according to Derrida and Hirsch is boundless. We can’t define one single genre in a narrative account, which leads us to the impurity of genre. That is, not impurity as opposed to purity but impurity as the mixing of genres in the same account. This can be further demonstrated through the words of Bakhtin as he argues that: “genre is an unceasing process of becoming, there is no singular Great tradition, no Ideal Form, no Definitive Shape.”

On the flip side, Frye has another view of genre. He claims that “expanding images into conventional archetypes of literature is a process that takes place unconsciously in all our reading.” In fact, Bakhtin draws a parallel between genre and the chronotope in the novel. He argues that:

“It can even be said that it is precisely the chronotope that defines genre and generic distinctions, for in literature the primary category in the chronotope is time. The chronotope as formally constitutive category determines to a significant degree the image of man in literature as well. The image of man is always intrinsically chronotopic.”

As far as the novels are concerned, they open with showing a unified world where everything is in order and both the controlled and the controller know their limits. They unveil the truth about the period that precedes the British withdrawal whether from Malaya or India: the stage of transfer of power. For instance, Paul Scott in The Jewel in the Crown exposed two outstanding events: the death of the Indian teacher and the rape of Daphne Manners upon which the rest of the novel is based and the rest of events are directly or indirectly connected to the effects of these two events on the community. Thus, in the post-colonial novels, there is a sense of resistance and struggle that lies within the lines of the narrative, a rebellion against the coloniser and a will to uncover the reality of the colonizer. Moreover, in The Jewel in the Crown and Time for a Tiger there is a dialogue between the narrators. Furthermore, the structure of the novels is dialogic: one type of discourse against another discourse,
one opinion against another opinion. It is a matter of voices shouting over one another and that is the reason behind its dialogic \(^1\) system. There is an exchange of ideas as Barthes states in his S/Z:

“One narrates in order to obtain by exchanging; and it is this exchange that is represented in the narrative itself: narrative is both product and production, merchandise and commerce, a stake and the bearer of that stake.”

Added to that Derrida’s concept of language not as a speech but as writing:

“Of course speech acts are involved every time characters in a novel enter into a dialogic situation (whether they actually converse or interact in other ways), but the important consideration is that the narrative as a whole may itself be read as an extension and complication of such acts in its constantly shifting position somewhere between the narrator and the reader.”

Therefore, the concept of genre is widely debated whether it is fixed or not fixed. In the case of *The Jewel in The Crown* and *Time for a Tiger* one finds it more appropriate to agree with Derrida’s impure genre for the mixing of different genres in the novels waving from dialogues to letters.

**Conclusion**

To conclude, the previous sections dealt with three major aspects. The first section shed light on the importance of the subaltern voices and how *The Jewel in the Crown* and *Time for a Tiger* talked about the dark side of the pre-decolonising period and the passage of power. Indeed, the first section included the gap filling aspect of a decolonising novel, which contains a whole mosaic of “les petites histoires” not as opposing the official historical accounts but as a supplement to it. Then, the “mise en intrigue” aspect, which implicates the gathering of the pieces of the true historical puzzle, compressing them and constituting a whole direction of event marked with intelligibility. After that, the second section handled the issue of common points between *The Jewel in the Crown* and *Time for a Tiger* in terms of the British Empire, English language and Metaphor. More precisely, the British as being the target of novelists and historians in the aftermath; the English language as being the common tool used to express different views and the Metaphor device used not as a mere ornament but as a whole message carrier. Finally, the third section treated the aspect of genre; how it is viewed by Derrida, Hirsch, Frye and of course Bakhtin and how it is articulated in the novels.
Endnotes:

1 Paul De Mann. “Lukacs’s Theory of the Novel.” *Blindness and Insight.* 1983


3 I used this term “The alienated gaze” after Balzac who uses it to display the power of the writer to see everything because of his divinity and his ability to see the truth wherever it lies.

4 John Riguall. *BALZAC the alienated gaze.*

5 John Riguall *BALZAC the alienated gaze.*


10 Chinua Achebe


12 I used this expression after Joseph Chamberlin who used it in 1902.

13 M. MBakhtin. « Forms of the time and of the chronotope in the novel. » *The Dialogic Imagination by M.M.Bakhtin.*


15 Frye , Anatomy of Criticism

16 Bakhtin, M.M. « Forms of the time and of the chronotope in the novel. » *The Dialogic Imagination by M.M.Bakhtin.*

17 I used this term after Bakhtin’s dialogism, which consists of a dialogue between the characters and between the characters and the reader and the reader and the author.

References


-Bakhtin, Mikhail. (1981.) « Forms of the time and of the chronotope in the novel » *The Dialogic Imagination* University of Texas Press.


Trip in African Oral Literature as Quest for Human Essence: Kaïdara and The Choice of Ori

Ndollane Dione
Université Gaston Berger, Saint-Louis, Sénégal

Abstract

The way towards self and communal achievement is generally viewed as a wilderness path paved away in African oral literature through legendary figures moving across complex realities. Appearing first as a response to an internal imbalance or spiritual need, the desire of completeness extends in a physical world where its impatient imperialism is subdued by time and hindered by antinomic forces. From this antinomy springs the quest which is valued with reference to difficulties characters are expected to come across. There lays the terrible battle ground, the theatre of merciless internal and external confrontation, marked of sacrifices and formulas that empower the tragic self. This severe hardship experience stands as a non-stop initiation process that moves progressively until the whole discovery and achievement of the questing being preceded by self-annihilation. In that beyond the abstract speculation about education and society, it becomes praxis practical action for metamorphosis. This step corresponds to an enlightenment situation that engenders a remapping of the environment around, which is very often gifted by triumph over inimical forces. Soyinka presents this process in Yoruba mythology through what he terms as the “the passage-rites of hero-gods, a projection of man’s conflict with forces which challenge his efforts to harmonize with his environment, physical, social and psychic.” From this achievement occurs in traditional African society the canonization of heroes, as the embodiment of core values shaped and assessed in oral genres through the travelling protagonist, on the road of deadly obstacles, often under the appearance of strange forms, including supernatural and fantastic manifestations.

Accordingly, the value of trip stands in the significance of self-achievement as an existential experience set within and between cosmic powers painted through a world of symbols out of the ordinary and yet highly vivid. Trip becomes the human essence moving throughout cosmic forces that stand as a way for self-accomplishment, which is the major meaning of life. Both Kaidara and The Choice of a Ori are stories of African oral heritage presenting heroes who are expected to explore humanity through the gates of physic and metaphysic arena. They respectively belong to Peulh and Yoruba cultures, stand as some oral art material transmitted through generations and are told by literary figures. Centered on this varied material, this paper aims at examining the similarities and differences of trip resonances in these stories, through characterization, time and space, in a perspective of reviewing the rich parallelism of art forms from different cultures.

1 The expression belongs to Wole Soyinka.
major task of this work is to locate the accomplishment of human being, society and Africa in general within the symbolism of trip as quest in oral art’s creative impulse.

Key words: Ori, Kaidara, trip, self-accomplishment, creative impulse
Introduction

The major characteristic of oral art is its vital and analogical link with life, spirit and soul, through the flow of emotion. There is a wide symbolism in the aesthetic of legends, tales and myth related to human essence in continuous interaction with cosmic forces. This interaction is an expression of deficiency that calls for satisfaction. Thus, trip in African oral heritage expresses the movement and the effort towards fulfillment in the cauldron of existence under pressure of a specific need or dream. Arguing in this perspective and specifically in the art of storytelling, Denise Paulme points out a significant structure of several African stories which basically are narratives developing from an initial situation of incompleteness or suffering towards a better world. Though there are other structures or possibilities of combination, the causality in the example above fits better the different plots of Kaidara and The Choice of Ori. Heroes in these stories express a thirst which will lead them to a quest marked of unaccustomed realities. They undergo various tests that challenge the different components of human being including the body, the spirit and the soul. Similarities between them are of paramount importance. Furthermore, they are all constituted of three main protagonists who will face quit similar obstacles they must overcome through abidance and sacrifice. At the denouement of the two stories, only one in each will be triumphant and experience the satisfaction of the thirst which however is everlasting. Though specific to different cultures, they belong to the common thread of African oral literature, our subject matter.

I. Commonalities in Kaidara and The Choice of Ori:

In Kaidara and the Choice of Ori, one can find a network of similarities in the intrigues and the role played by characters. They are all stories that tell about two groups of three protagonists respectively coming from the same cultural background and almost sharing the same values and opportunities, facing the same hindrances. They also belong to that continuum of oral art flowing through the genius of artists into the ears of a participative audience which create a response for live performance. Though not in that specific occasion we will try to point out the center where converge both stories and the different trails leading to it.

1.1 At the genesis of the quest:

Kaidara unfolds a scene of initiation belonging to traditional Peuhl societies of the Ferlo that extends over the Senegal River coast and Macina, a Malian region. Its characters are involved in an adventure to discover inner knowledge that highlights cosmic realities and lead to wisdom. In that perspective an author observes:

4 The intrinsic meaning and value of ori (head) among the Yoruba people have been unlocked. Its position as man’s personality soul, his guardian angel and personal deity, which ranks it to the level of divinity, has also been revealed. Traditions also present ori as the spiritual accomplice of a man who kneels to choose the man’s ayanmo (destiny), which it is equally entrusted to protect and to help fulfill. Babasehinde Ademuleya. The Concept of Ori in the Traditional Yoruba Visual Representation of Human Figures. Nigeria: Obafemi Awolowo University, Nordic Journal of African Studies 16(2): 212–220 P.6. (2007)
Traditional African artists, as prominent members of their communities interpret their people’s thoughts and conventions through their expressive forms: hence their interpretations of nature rather than its imitation in their works.\(^6\) The major characteristic of African aesthetics of verbal art comes out of its multi-level didactic, hilarious, spiritual and mundane nature. Through the questing heroes of these stories appear these dimensions, as Hampaté Ba develops at the very beginning of Kaidara\(^7\).

The depthness of the precious thing they long for will lead them to under streams, channeling a variety of settings that contribute to the richness of the symbolism along the quest. In this story the protagonists are undoubtedly attracted by Kaidara which refers etymologically to a god of the Peulh pantheon ruled by Gueno.

At the starting point of Kaidara and the Choice of Ori exists a spiritual power or voice that paves the way towards adventure. One can find determination in the move of the different characters, as that spiritual power echoes in their being and appears to stimulate the conquering will. It emerges explicitly after the enchantment of Dembourou, Hamtoudo and Hammadi which figures preparation to a deeper level of existence apprehension in Kaidara and in The choice of Ori as well. This mysterious presence is pictured through the voice of elders and through the divination that is performed for Afuwapé, Oriseeku and Orilemere. Such a spiritual performance finds its corollary in sacrifice, in the same perspective, as characters in Kaidara are invited to offer the first game in the first village, an ant-eater. Though in the first case of Kaidara, the ground of the trip is not accurately identified, contrarily to The Choice of Ori where happiness and profit on earth are the targets, there is no doubt that this trio is picturing a strong desire of knowledge and wisdom. In leaving the restraint and shady world of their homes to face the sunlight, while dawn is breaking, they embark on peregrination, leaving the portion for the whole. The imagery of the multicolored clouds operates in an aesthetic perception of the fascinating, rich, metaphysical and yet out of touch nature of existence at that very moment, while the big crossroads offers suggestively a picture of interacting differences, whether physical or metaphysical. The sum of all these dimensions is set as a prefiguration of what Soyinka calls a cosmic totality. That totality is the synthesis of man existence and the picture of his physical home he must build through activity within his environment. This validates the sereer proverb: “gu rokna no mbin tafil a xatu” which literally means all that is in a house comes from the outside. As time rings for our protagonists to pursue the task of building effectively their “houses”, let us follow their steps towards those challenging territories of selection and witness their battle as conflicts may burst out.

### 1.2 Conflicting powers of the road

An important task at this point will be to highlight the nature of what we call conflicting powers. It may be impossible to set a clear line of identification between their operation-systems, in consideration of the complex web they generate. Recalling the inseparable characteristic of the spiritual and material reign in oral tradition as a whole, Amadou Hampaté Bâ quoted by Oyèronké Oyéwùmi states:

---

Oral tradition is the great school of life, all aspects of which are covered and affected by it. It may seem chaos to those who do not penetrate its secret; it may baffle the Cartesian mind accustomed to dividing everything into clear-cut categories. In oral tradition, in fact, spiritual and material are not dissociated.

However, one can at least say that the conflicting forces in question are more of spiritual concern than of material one. This is far from being fortuitous when attention is given to the terminology of *Kaidara* and *Ori*. Kaidara is a noun that designates the god of iron and knowledge in Peulh traditional society while Ori refers respectively to the physical and spiritual head (the center of knowledge), standing as the god of fate in Yoruba traditional society. Symmetry or correspondence between these two deities is striking. Iron and Knowledge in Kaidara converge with the targeted knowledge and welfare in *The choice of Ori*. And as the discovery of these riches cannot be a result of material dominion, by analogy to the accomplished horizon of humanity, the obstacles which are of a creative consciousness intended for that accomplishment cannot but follow that scheme.

Following the two stories, the conflicting powers start operating as testing means to certify the sense of obedience and patience through enigmas. The trio in Kaidara will first have to obey a solemn voice it cannot locate. In a quest of such a high value one may rationally need to have a clear view of everything. This is mainly what explains the question of Hamtoudou about the identity of that unknown Character who stands as the well of science and mountain of wisdom. But the promptness of reason is dominated by the need of confidence, obedience and patience, as no answer will be given to him except this maxim: “You will know when you will understand that you don’t and will wait to.” The focus is in the act of waiting. Following that recommendation, the audience or the participating reader may be struck by the anguish of the aborting intellect before the forbidden birth of inner light at that particular span of time. But the significance of this statement is found in its centeredness within a vision or pedagogy of constructive deconstruction of the self that will go through the quest. There is no anachronism at this specific level in asking a questioner to first take awareness of his ignorance as one may conclude, considering the case of Hamtoudou. What should be noted is rather the unveiling of an arrogant imperialist intellect dispossessed of appropriateness before inner knowledge of high value compared to iron and belonging to Kaidara. Hamtoudo in so doing stands as the embodiment of the arrogant discursive reason that focuses on deduction rather than in participation as Senghor argues:

Discursive reason merely stops at the surface of things; it does not penetrate their hidden resorts, which escape the lucid consciousness. Intuitive reason is alone capable of an understanding that goes beyond appearances, of taking in total reality.

Hamtoudo is then invited to a live performance in connivance and embrace that achieve essential enlightenment. His question is deprived of the enthusiasm of cosmic totally, hence his

---

11 *Kaidara*, p.22.
12 Translated by us from french « Tu sauras quand tu sauras que tu ne sais pas et que tu attendras de savoir », *Kaidara* p.22
13 *African Philosophy Reader*, p.54.
disappointment. Among other obstacles, it can be noted thirst; poisonous reptiles guardians of the mysterious river and the vulnerability of the trio in front of these deadly barriers. Patience and moderation of the desire of piercing the mystery become then a necessary pedagogy for an effective and helpful initiation. Because knowledge is one thing and it’s practical use another. In the same perspective, one can identify a certain number of enigmas in the Choice of Ori that require hardship perseverence and sacrifice on the part of the travelling heroes as unveiled in the text below:

After working for some distance,
They got to He-Who-pounds-yams-with-a-needle.
They said “Father, we greet you.”
The old man replied, “Thank you.”
They pleaded, “Please, sir,
We are going to the house of Ajala.”
He who pounds yam with a needle said that he must first finish pounding his yams
Before he showed them the way

The chain of enigmas representing the symbolism of typical conflicting powers as in Kaidara will follow Afuape, Oriseeku and Orilemere all along their journey. This typology of impediments which target the spirit and the soul for purification will end its cycle with the entrance and sojourn in the realm of Kaidara and in the house of Ajala. It appears as the preparation step of the meeting between human and supernatural beings intended for the attainment of a paramount gift in the quest. After reception of it, the first trio in kaidara will mysteriously be led homeward, while the other in The Choice of Ori will pursue its objective of settling on earth for better profit. To this second stage of the trip corresponds another cycle of conflicting powers which are far more of destructive agency than the former. These powers are identified through rain15, storm, wind, and thunder in the two stories and more dramatically through the causality of their killing activity in the deadly attack the avenging wild animal gives to Dembourou in Kaidara16. In this specific context the conflict becomes a test that only the abiding hero will overcome triumphantly. An important thing is to remind that before any battle, there is always a series of maxims and instructions to be followed and some magic formula proportional to the level of the obstacles to the quest. The major solution to all these obstacles is continual sacrifice as painted through the examples of Afuwape and Hammadi in the respective stories. However, these measures are absurd without docility and obedience to cosmic forces that participate in building a better world. The offenders to those forces namely Dembourou and Hamtoudo in the one hand and Orilemere and Oriseeku in the other will be fragmented before understanding how they must behave. Contrarily to them Afuwape and Hammadi will overcome the inimical forces and experience the happiness that provides wisdom and knowledge. Concerned with it above all, these triumphant heroes will pay the cost and in so doing, recapture their expenses, achieving the totality of the material and the spiritual.

The temptation of iron: material and spiritual agencies

Iron is within the context of this analysis the supreme manifestation of knowledge in an abstract and concrete sense at the same time. The value of that precious metal that covers a world of

15 Idem,p.16.
16 Kaidara, pp.60-63.
symbols in the effort of the quest is quiet striking. In the different plots, it is painted as a divine property which humans can win through a particular devotion which includes hardship and vital nexus with light. Its dualism is highly demanding for concrete welfare, hence the methodic devotion. Iron is defined in this section not only through its material quality as the sum of riches but also and almost through its spiritual dimension as an ecstatic vision or wedding between being and being which is life in the very meaning of the term. As such, it is delivered by Kaidara in the first story and by Ajala in the second, conveniently from spiritual to material dominance. Accordingly, any practical discovery of its essential mode of operation cannot but spring from correspondence of vision and methods. The contrary is undoubtedly a negation of the self in the process of the quest.

Hamtoudo, Dembouro and Hammadi are on a move towards an esoteric figure considered as the embodiment of knowledge. In the world of our heroes, only Kaidara is the master, the light that shines over all kinds of enigmas. This features the exclusivity of the source no one else can behold without the inner light sawn through battle and sealed by that god. Two notions are of particular interest in this point including the role of the deity and the duty of the individual on the way to success. The way that leads to that kingdom is marked by considerable ambiguous reality just like mining is difficult and risky. Consequently, only the enduring will succeed in that adventure which is however a necessity to self- accomplishment. At the early moment of day birth when the sun spread its empire, three characters meet. They are so fascinated by that rising charm that attention around them is devoted to contemplation. It might be said that the glittering attractiveness of the sun is the communicative expression of Kaidara it symbolizes through the disc it forms and the color it bears.

The extraordinary invisible character painted through a voice calling into the forest and requiring sacrifice will solemnly launch the quest by a bewitching appeal to the trio constituted of Hammadi, Hamtoudo and Dembourou. It is then the starting point of enigmas and battles toward the mysterious Kaidara. The trip will be made of three main parts which are the efforts to meet the god of knowledge, the live experience with him and the accession to knowledge, all of them colored of a series of difficulties that appear to be its symbolic price. In all those sequences, the world of symbols offers diverse courses full of knowledge but always hidden somewhere and not accessible at first sight or easily. Form and content constitute a whole of esthetic agency acting on soul and spirit at the same time. They cannot be separated. A dangerous approach would be to make confusion by paying attention only to the brightness of the sun which refers to iron. The beauty of the landscape at the beginning of the quest, the loads of iron and the glittering oris in the house of Ajala cannot be taken as an end. The aesthetic totality in African oral tradition is the consistent and logical blending of form and content. Unfortunately some, unwary will knock against the iron rock and be split in tragedy, confirming thus the vital nexus approach hypothesis. The reader as a character of the stories participating in the events they explore can be submitted to the same power of attraction located in emotive and intelligible aesthetic value.

However the most important aspect of the efforts which support the move of the three characters heading towards the mysterious kingdom of Kaidara is not the immediate enrichment or materialism, but rather the flux of light and delight proportional to the need of their growth. This is mainly the essence of oral art flowing through the genres of storytelling myth…and broadly shared by all traditional African societies. The richness of the oral traditions akin to ethnic groups of the African continent lays on that oral art relational nature, which is at the same time a dam and a
hyphen, a converging and diverging point that expresses the inner self, the dualism and interdependency in the movement for self-accomplishment between the biological and the spiritual, symbolic of all quest of the African personality.

In the legendary story of The Choice Of Ori, the three protagonists are of divine origin. They lived in the world of gods and yet did not meet the accomplishment of their dreams. The thirst for a better condition led them to take the decision of travelling to the earth where they would settle and experience a peaceful and happy life. The spiritual realm of gods needs through them the blending with earthly existence. Analogically apprehended, this blending is at the same time the confrontation between subject and matter as conscience, the intense union between rain and earth that purifies atmosphere. From that interaction sprouts the seeds of life, wealth and welfare which are the secret projects of humans. But as pointed out, it is all about confrontation between spiritual and material culture, between flesh and spirit, from the atomic referring element in the proscenium to the very manifestation of that productive and necessary battle. As in Kaidara, the life of the different characters is the center of plotting viewed in the axis of duality, the pure expression of the above mentioned confrontation. This duality is strengthened through time and space that shift from stillness to agitation.

The symbolism of that hardness is depicted in the story first through the advice of elders not to stop even if summoned at home, no matter what the duty might be. Warned of the required sacrifice, our three heroes Oriseeku, son of Ogun, Afuwape son of Orunmila and Orilemere son of Ija went for a conquest. One of the first obstacles on their way is the contradictory piece of advice forbidding the return to home that elders gave them, knowing that the voice of the elder is also in Africa the voice of wisdom and knowledge. However, the plot of the story at the end will show that a successful trip is grounded on a clear knowledge of the realities and circumstances around it.

Like the mysterious voice in Kaidara, each one of them will hear his father’s tempting appeal that summons him. But the word of the elders will be the hindrance to answer it. While Oriseeku and Orilemere will be continuing their trip, Afuwape will choose to go back home and meet his father to know about the reasons of the call. There, divination will be performed for him and all the solutions to enigmas and obstacles to the choice of a good Ori highlighted. In Yoruba world view related to the context of this story, the choice of an ori is also the choice of destiny. If Kaidara is regarded as the god of knowledge, the unique source of inner light for accomplishment in the Peulh legend, Ifa is in the Yoruba world the god of divination that brings light in gloomy days of life projects and complex realities. In both stories, the key to success is kept by a divinity one should consult on behalf of a spiritual medium.

What’s more, there is a proper set of values the individual must have to successfully cope with obstacles including, patience, humbleness, consideration and endurance. This means that destiny is not only a divine program but also a collaborative network or enterprise that involves human participation. It is worth mentioning that this participation is carried on the basis of knowledge and accomplishment quest rather than in cornering and absence of discernment. Both Oriseeku and Orilemere did wrong in not consulting Ifa and being out of patience in the one hand and in forgetting that their quest is not only material but also spiritual in the other. The consequence is that they arrive first in Ajala’s house where Oris are made and stored, but unfortunately their choices
will not be good. Consequently, their settlement on earth will be the rhythm of deception and cries of sorrow.

**Beyond success, Continuity:**

The significance of hindrances on the way of the questing protagonists lays on the metamorphosis of the inner self which is the first and basic condition to success. Afuwape will experience a very good fate by combining the solutions given through divination and the use of his own qualities. He will overcome all the obstacles by appropriate behavior and sacrifice. Thus, he arrives on earth with a good ori which will lead him to happiness and welfare, whereas his two friends will be plagued by misfortune. At the end of the story Afuwape will not only be overwhelmed with joy because of his wives and his richness, but also because he will be awarded a particular status. “He had many wives and he had many children as well after some time and in due course, he was honored with the title of Orisanmi.” Comparing Hammadi and Afuwape, one can say that both figures embody success and wisdom which go together. They stand as heroes and examples of human achievement. To this extent, they become honorable ancestors whose deeds are sealed for generation to come for the cultural identity and realization of the communal vision of societies they belong to. Because each society has a prototype of its vision of humanity, these two heroes can be considered as the rising human essence of their societies.

The importance of trip viewed analogically with destiny or life comes from the fact that it knows a departure point and has a particular horizon. Even if in the beginning everything is not clear as no one knows what might be met, there is for those two African societies a unique vision of what that end is likely to become. It is with reference to this vision and to the character in action that the road is drawn and the obstacle settled to wash away the unfitted features and components of the individual for better life. However, that severance is so difficult and often violent that only very few persons can bear it. That is why Oriseeku and Orelemere in the *Choice of Ori* as well as Hamtoudou and Dembourou in *Kaidara* failed in their quest. That failure is in oral tradition as useful as success, to the extent that it serves as a warning against misbehavior, intended for successful heroes and for everybody. One might believe that after triumph heroes don’t need any further teaching and orientation. Indeed they are in a constant need of teaching and of renewal to manage their richness and keep their honor. That is why in both stories the fundamental vision of the triumphant heroes is not material. It is rather a continuum of the quest which is basically spiritual leading step by step to different areas of happiness. This is symbolic of the endless nature of wisdom and knowledge, following the vast unknown aspects life covers. Oral art depicts an ambivalence of heroism located between heroes and anti-heroes. That seeming contradiction is the expression of dualism proper to the individual no one can tame, a dualism in which both sides are important and inextricably linked, though different.

The way human condition in perpetual quest is pictured through the metaphor of the trip in these stories puts into evidence the dual and contradictory nature of being. The battle of the spirit is located in that continual confrontation that requires sacrifice for the achievement of the self. Of the two stories, it can be said that only the consciousness of the need for sacrifice and the joint efforts fashion a typical individual that fits a social vision of humanity.

---

Conclusion

Oral art in Africa is in its imaginative form an aesthetic rewriting of social ideas, feelings, values and beliefs, the work of the author consisting of making it more attractive in a different perspective that calls for insight. The metaphor of trip in the stories of Kaidara and the Choice of Ori puts into evidence the different sequences of life, to lift up the standards which are pillars of cultural identity and socio-economic development as well. Human destiny pictured through the interaction between natural and supernatural forces, human and divine essence in life expresses the complexity of human being and the different elements it is linked with in the quest. Yet, the possibility to come through is always offered through a method the individual is expected to perform. A methodic openness towards unknown spheres and horizons is therefore not only profitable but also necessary to discovery and reunion.
References


Shari’ah Court in Thailand: Between Inspiration and Challenge

Sulaiman Dorloh
Sultan Sharif Ali Islamic University, Brunei Darussalam

Abstract

Thailand is a multicultural society, blending Chinese, Indian and Malay cultures into a single state structure. Within it, however, there are stark contrasts as to what role religion, especially Islam, should play in identity formation and its articulation at different levels and different planes of live. This paper shall discuss the background of Shari’ah court in Thailand and the problems that has encountered through the years. Shari’ah court in the Thailand commonly exists inside the ambit of the Thai judicial court system. In fact, the Shari’ah court in Thailand is an ideal Islamic court which explicitly displays the difference between state courts. The establishment of Shari’ah court was intended to provide an alternative platform for the Muslims people in Thailand in the field of adjudication. In this paper the author seeks to highlight the position of Shari’ah court in the south from the point of view of the Thai judicial system and the decision of Dato’ Yuthitham (Muslim judges). This paper will also explore recent developments in Shari’ah court which is applicable in the Malay-Muslim speaking provinces namely, Patani, Narathiwat, Yala and Satul provinces with reference to cases decided by the Dato’ Yuthitham, and its jurisdiction in matter of matrimonial disputes for the Malay Muslims.

Keywords: Shari’ah court, Dato’ Yuthitham, Thai court jurisdiction, Islamic family law.
Introduction

Although Thailand is a Buddhist country, the Shari’ah court was introduced since Ayuthaya Dynasty, but its roles was limited. The Shari’ah Court in Thailand is the symbol of the position of Islamic law and the power of the Muslims in Thailand. It has a long history in the Thai legal system. Talking about Shari’ah Court in Thailand one must trace it back to the position of the first Muslim arbitration in the Court of the Department of the Right Harbour during the reign of the Pracau Songtham (1602-1627). There are 3 courts namely; Court of Krom Tha Klang, court of Krom Tha Sai and Court of Krom Tha Kwa. As for Court of Krom Tha Kwa is owned by “Shaykh al-Islam.” Whenever there arose a dispute amongst the Muslims, the case would be entrusted to the person who has had a special knowledge on Islamic law.

The first Muslim arbitrator of Court of Krom Tha Kwa was Chao Phraya Sheikh Ahmad Rattana Rajesti, a Persian decent. When there was a dispute amongst the Muslims, Shaykh Ahmad, acted on behalf of the king, became an Islamic arbitrator in the Court of Krom Tha Kwa. Another important area of arbitration was marriage. It was reported that when a Muslim trader intended to marry with a local girl, the latter had to convert to Islam. Thus the marriage would then be conducted in accordance with the Islamic law. The products of such union became part of the new and expanding Muslim communities in Thailand. From these examples, it can be inferred that the Islamic law existed independently as a regulating force within the Muslim Community. It grew and developed side by side with the culture of the Thai Buddhist people who lived in the city of Ayuthaya. This development was considered as a new development in the history of the Siamese Legal System whereby the Siamese kings recognized and allowed the Islamic law to be applied and implemented freely in the capital within the small department. Furthermore, it shows that Siamese kings at that time were very concerned about the Islamic personal law for Muslims who lived in and around the Ayuthaya.

The Position of the Shari’ah Court and Islamic law in Thailand

Kingdom of Thailand is, unlike any other Asian countries has never been colonized by western powers. Malay states such as Kelantan, Kedah and Perak which are neighbouring states of Narathiwat, Yala and Satul provinces at that time were colonized by British. This colonization was undoubtedly affected indirectly towards the application of Islamic law in the four southern provinces of Thailand. Moreover, the position of the religious court in those regions depended greatly upon the policy and the administrative system of the Thai government. With regard to the position of the Islamic law in Thailand especially in those four provinces of the Kingdom, it could be divided into three separate dynasties namely; (a) Sukhothai Dynasty, (b) Ayutthaya Dynasty and earlier period of Rattanakosin Dynasty.

---

1 This is based on Thai history which is normally traced back to Sukhothai period (1238-1378), Ayutthaya period (1350-1767), Thonburi period (1767-1782) and Rattanakosin period 1782 till present day.
3 Ayutthaya was considered as the second capital of Thailand after Sukhothai, started from 1350 until 1767. See ibid.,
4 At present Bangkok is the capital.
A. The Position of the Shari’ah Court and Islamic Law during the Sukhothai Dynasty (1238-1378)\textsuperscript{5}

The Siamese Kingdom of Sukhothai claimed that the Kingdom of Patani was considered as a vassal state to the Sukhothai Kingdom.\textsuperscript{6} The Siamese king did not ever interfere over the Administration of Islamic Law in the south. Therefore, the rulers of Patani at that time could freely implement Islamic law on their subjects by establishing the Islamic religious institutions with a view to apply Islamic law in its totality. Freedom was given to those principalities to administer their own affairs. Moreover, there were several contributing factors that enabled the Islamic law to be implemented smoothly in the Kingdom of Patani. Firstly, the Kingdom of Patani was considered as a part and parcel of the Malay Peninsula which fell to the Islamic influence brought by the Muslim traders who came from India and Arabia.\textsuperscript{7} Therefore, it can be inferred that, the Patani Kingdom was influenced by Islam like other Malay states in the peninsula, such as Malacca, Pahang, Kedah, Kelantan, Terengganu and Johor.

The second factor was contributed to a hierarchy of the religious authority that played a significant role in preserving Islam. The Sultan of Patani Kingdom, as ecclesiastical head would then appoint a muftï (jurist consult) as his religious counselors. Under the muftï there was a qEÎÈ who acts as an Islamic judge of the district. At the same time, the qEÎÈ will act as religious adviser to the district head. At the district level, there were imÉém, khÉÈtib and biEÎÈ of the various mosques in the district.\textsuperscript{8} All of them were responsible for enforcing Islamic law and settling marriage, divorce and inheritance disputes. This classification indicated the difference in the responsibilities and functions of the sullÉÈn, muftï, qEÎÈ, imÉém, khÉÈtib, and biEÎÈ in the implementation of the Islamic Law in the Kingdom of Patani. This religious hierarchy shows that a Sultan was the highest state official in the Kingdom. Nevertheless, he could not overrule fatwÈ or religious ruling issued by a muftï.\textsuperscript{9} In this period the Islamic law was regarded as the law of the Kingdom while the Siamese Kings in the Sukhothai recognized the law that was implemented by the Muslim rulers in the respective localities and it shows that Islamic law had become law of the land for the Kingdom of Patani.

\textsuperscript{5}Sukhothai dynasty is lasted about 140 years. There were 6 kings ruled the dynasty. The famous king in this period was King Khunsi Inthrathit who managed to overthrow the Khmer power and established the first Thai Kingdom by the name of Sukhothai to the north of Chiangmai and King Khun Ram Khamhaeng who introduced the Theravada school of Buddhism to his country. See Piyaparn, B. 1995. Prawasart Thai (Thai History), Bangkok: O.S. Printing House, pp. 59-62; and War Shaw, S. 1973. Southeast Asia Emerges. California: A Diablo Press, pp. 29-30.


\textsuperscript{9}Ibid.
B. The Position of the Shari’ah Court and Islamic Law during the Ayutthaya Dynasty (1350-1767)\textsuperscript{10}

The status of being a vassal state to the Siamese king continued until the reign of Ayutthaya Dynasty. According to Surin Pitsuwan the Kingdom of Patani was considered a vassal state to Bangkok since 1782. However, neither the King nor the Governor had ever tried to interfere with the region’s matters.\textsuperscript{11} This includes matters relating to religion and customs of the Muslims in the south. In other words, during the period of Sukhothai and Ayutthaya, there was no interference by the Siamese King to introduce Siamese Legal System into Patani legal administration. However, during the reign of Ayutthaya dynasty, the position of Shari’ah Court and Islamic law was further divided into two stages firstly, the position of Islamic law in the Kingdom of Patani and secondly the position of the Shari’ah Court and Islamic law in the city of Ayutthaya itself.

(i) The Position of Shari’ah Court and Islamic Law in the Kingdom of Patani \textsuperscript{12}

There was evidence showing that Islamic Criminal Law was also implemented besides the Islamic Family Law. Shaykh Muhammad Zayn al-Falâ‘nî\textsuperscript{13} who died in 1905, was asked to issue a fatwa\textsuperscript{14} concerning a husband who was accused of committing zina\textsuperscript{15}. The problem relating to the above-mentioned issue reads as follows:

There was a wife who makes a claim before a judge that she wishes to divorce her husband by faskh,\textsuperscript{16} because her husband was accused of committing zina. The judge thereupon, summoned the husband to appear before the court. After the husband had appeared before the court, the judge made an investigation and asked the husband

\textsuperscript{10}The Ayutthaya dynasty lasted about 400 years. This dynasty was cantered on an island in the Chao Phraya River. There were 34 kings ruled the dynasty. See War Shaw, S. 1973. Southeast Asia Emerges, California: A Diablo Press. pp. 30-31.
\textsuperscript{12}It is believed that the kingdom of Patani was officially declared as an Islamic state in 1457; Che Man, W.K .1990. Muslims Separatism, ibid., pp. 32-33.
\textsuperscript{13}His full name is Shaykh Wan A’mad bin Wan Muhammad Zayn bin Wan Mustafâ al-Malîyîwâ al-Falînî. It was believed that his ancestor was a famous preacher who had came from xalramaat, Yemen. He was a student of Shaykh Dawêd al-Falînî. See al-Falînî, A.F. 2001. .isNull{N}lamÊN Besar dari Patani, Bangi: Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia. p. 55.
\textsuperscript{14}It is to be noted that fatwa can be loosely translated as a religious ruling. Fatwa in Thailand previously issued by the Islamic Religious Committee Council and tok gurus. However, at the present fatwa can only be issued by Shaykh al-Islâm which is commonly known by the Thai people as Chula Rajmontri. The position of fatwa in Thailand is not a statutorily regulated like in Malaysia, where the feature and status of fatwa are statutorily regulated. Thus the meaning and status of fatwa have to take into account provisions of governing statutes. See Shuaib, F.S. 2003. Powers and Jurisdiction of Shariah Court in Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur: Malayan Law Journal Bhd., p.44.
\textsuperscript{15}Zinê means sexual intercourse between a man and a woman not married to each other. It is immaterial whether it is adultery (where the participants are married people) or fornication (when they are unmarried). Islam regards in any case as a great sin. See I. Doi, A.R. 2002. Woman in Shari’ah (Islamic Law), UK. Úeha Publishers Ltd., p.117.
\textsuperscript{16}It is a kind of dissolution of marriage which is usually instituted by the wife. However, under the Principle of Islamic Family law and law of inheritance code 1941(it will be cited as the code) provides that either the husband or wife may institute a judicial decree by faskh. See the code article 110.
to pronounce ِّإلف. The husband declined to pronounce an ِّإلف as requested by the wife. 17

The wife then asked Shaykh AÍmad the following questions:

17 May I divorce my husband by faskh? The wife further asked the judge. “Was there any strong opinion of نلومن and to support my question?” The wife continued by saying that if there was no strong opinions of نلومن. “Could you inform me the weaker one?” Shaykh AÍmad kept silent. The wife then informed Shaykh AÍmad that when a man who has already married and committed زينة his blood will not be protected, therefore the ruler must order to stone him to death. After hearing the complaints made by the wife, Shaykh AÍmad told the woman that “I am not so sure whether Muslim rulers could implement such punishments. Owing to the fact that the infidel kings had ruled the country. Whereas the Muslim rulers were weak and they were unable to fight the infidel kings. Moreover, the Siamese Kings were stronger than Muslim rulers.” 18

From the above-mentioned incident, it can be inferred that both the Islamic Family Law and the Islamic Criminal law were implemented in this kingdom, because the above-mentioned legal ruling was concerned with the punishments for adultery committed by a married man which fall under the ambit of the Islamic Criminal law.

(ii) The Position of the Shari’ah Court and Islamic Law in the city of Ayutthaya

With regard to the application of the Islamic Law around the city of Ayutthaya, it was reported that the Muslim traders who came from Persia, India and Malay Peninsula were allowed to practice the Islamic personal law on marriage, divorce and inheritance. During this period the Islamic personal law on marriage, divorce and inheritance were officially recognized and introduced by the Siamese King in the court of كروم tha kwa 19 of Ayutthaya. The rationale behind allowing the Islamic Family Law to be implemented there was due to the fact that this department was solely dealing with the Muslim traders who had made initial trading contacts with the Ayutthaya and most of them were Muslims who came from Persia, India and Arabia. Thus, to administer the Islamic personal law case more effectively within the Department, a Muslim named Shaykh Ahmad Qomi (1543-1631) 20 from Persia was officially appointed by King Songtham

17 In Islamic law the husband may release marriage tie by two ways a) the pronouncing the word ِّإلف and b) by delegating his power to his wife. This kind of dissolution of marriage is called tafswي إلف al-ِّإلف.
19 It is a Thai word; it means a Court of the Right Harbour Department. It can try and hear case involving the family law and its related issues.
20 He was later appointed by King Phra Chao Songatham of Ayutthaya Dynasty until the reign of King Phra Chao Prasat Thong of Ayutthaya Dynasty (1602 - 1655 A.D.) to become the first Chula Rajmontri of Thailand which is equivalent to Shaykh al-Islam, carries a title of Chula Rajmontri. They were considered as the highest leaders of Muslims in Thailand having its responsibilities to liaise between the government officials and Muslim Communities. The current Chularajmontri is a locally educated Muslim scholar, Sawad Sumalayasak. Formerly Democrat PM for a Bangkok constituency, he was elected on 16 October 1997 and confirmed in office by King Bhumibol Adulyadej on 5 November 1997. See Yusuf, M. 1998. “Islam and Democracy in Thailand: Reforming the office of Chularajmontri/Shaikh al-Islam”, Journal of Islamic Studies 9: 2, p. 286; Vilaiwan, S. 2001. Chularajmontri, Bangkok: Chareun Phon. pp. 28-29; Raman, B.1978.
(1602-1627) of Ayutthaya Dynasty to serve as the King’s adviser and Islamic arbitrator in the department.\textsuperscript{21} As for other two courts, court of \textit{krom tha klang} and \textit{krom tha saaq}\textsuperscript{22} the Thai law would be applied. This development was considered by the Thai historians as a new development in the history of the Siamese Legal System whereby the Siamese Kings recognized the Shari’ah Court and allowed the Islamic Family Law to be applied and implemented freely in the capital within the small department.

C. The Position of the Shari’ah Court and Islamic Law during the Rattanakosin Dynasty, 1782 until present day

In this period, the position of the Shari’ah Court and Islamic Law have undergone into 2 stages. Firstly, the position of the Shari’ah Court and Islamic Law in Thailand during the reign of King Chulalongkorn (Rama V) (1868-1910), Chakri Dynasty\textsuperscript{23} and secondly, the position of the Shari’ah Court and Islamic Law after the abolishment of the application of the Islamic family law and Islamic law of inheritance in the four southern provinces.

(i) The Position of the Shari’ah Court and Islamic Law in Thailand during the reign of King Chulalongkorn (Rama V) (1868-1910) Dynasty

In this period, the King Chulalongkorn (Rama V) (1868-1910) of Bangkok had taken many measures to ensure that the Patani Kingdom would be annexed into the Siamese state. This was achieved when the Anglo-Siamese Treaty was signed in 1909.\textsuperscript{24} By virtue of this treaty, the Siamese Administration was gradually introduced in the Kingdom of Patani which caused the application of the Islamic Criminal Law ceased to be applied. In return the king allowed the Islamic family law to be implemented with the supervision of the central government. This treaty eventually made the Kingdom of Patani became part and parcel of Siamese's state. This interference over the Legal Administration of the Kingdom of Patani could clearly be seen when the Bangkok government issued the Royal Decree (1902) which \textit{inter alia}, provides:

\begin{quote}
Khambanyai Krabuan Wicha Kotmai Islam (Series of Lectures on IslÊemic Law), Bangkok: Ramkhamhaeng University Press. p. 56;
\end{quote}


\textsuperscript{22} Both of them are Thai words, the former means the Department of Middle Harbour and the latter means the Department of Left Harbour.


\textsuperscript{24} Among the contents of this treaty was the transfer of the Siamese suzerainty over Kedah, Kelantan, Trengganu, Perlis, and the islands of Langkawi from Siam to Great Britain. The British, in return, recognized extraterritorial rights in Siam and acknowledged Siamese sovereignty over the Malay provinces of Patani, Bangnara (Narathiwat), Saiburi, Yala, and Satul. See W.K. Che Man. 1985. “Patani: From Sovereign Sultanate to Subnation (private)”, \textit{Journal of Institute of Muslim Minority Affairs}. Vol.6. January. p. 123.
…no law shall be passed unless by specific royal consent.  

According to Surin Pitsuwan, the intention of the King Chulalongkorn (Rama V) (1868-1910) was to enact a single legal system applicable to the whole country. Thus, it can be inferred that the implication of the Royal Decree (1902) would apparently affect the application of the Islamic Law in the former provinces of Patani kingdom in the future. In order to maintain a good relationship between the Muslims in the south and the government, King Chulalongkorn (Rama V) has promulgated the Rule of the Administration in the Seven Principalities B.E. 2444 (1902). The most important provision of the rule was section 32 which inter alia provides:

The Criminal Code and Civil Code shall be applied to Thai citizens except in civil cases concerning husbands and wives, and inheritance cases in which both parties are Muslims or a Muslim is a defendant, in such cases, the Islamic law shall be applied.

There are a few points that should be remembered with reference to the position of the Islamic family law in Thailand. Firstly, subject to this rule, the application of the Islamic Law was applicable only within those seven areas in the south. There were Patani, Nongchik, Yaring, Saiburi, Yala, Raman and Ra’ngae. These Seven Principalities were later abolished and combined into four provinces. However, the Islamic Law is still applicable in those four provinces. Secondly, the Islamic family law under this rule referred only to Islamic Law on marriage, divorce and inheritance only. With respect to other branches of the Islamic Law, for instance the Islamic Criminal Law and the Islamic Law of Transaction were not covered by this rule. Thirdly, under this act the litigant is given right to appeal if they were dissatisfied with the decision of the Provincial courts.

(ii) The position of the Shari’ah Court and Islamic Law in Thailand after the Abolishment of the Rule of the Administration in the Seven Principalities B.E. 2444 (1902)

In 1938 when the Field Marshall Phibul Songkhram (hereinafter referred to as P. Songkhram) an ultra-nationalist became the Prime Minister, the Islamic Family Law as well as the position of Dato’ Yuthitham (Muslim Judges) in the Religious Court in those four regions were abolished altogether and were replaced with the “Emergency Decree Amending the Act Promulgating the Provisions of Book V and VI of the Civil and Commercial Code of 1943.” This Emergency Decree provides inter alia, all citizens are subject to the Thai Law irrespective of their origins and beliefs. As a result, the Muslim litigants have lost their venue to take their cases for the trial. As A. Forbes rightly pointed out that:

…Shari'a (Shari'ah) law was set aside in favour of the Thai Buddhist law of marriage and inheritance.

---

26 Ibid., p. 28.
Because of that situation the Muslims in the south were deprived of their rights to practice their religion under the Thai Constitution. Nevertheless, the religious leaders in the village for instance imam and religious teachers still carried out their responsibilities in enforcing the Islamic law privately such as conducting marriage, divorce and settling inheritance disputes in their respective villages. It appears that this decree apparently contradicts to the basic concept of the freedom of religion as guaranteed by the Thai Constitution, 1997, article 38 of the said constitution provides:

A person shall enjoy full liberty to profess a religion, a religious sect or creed, and observe religious precepts or exercise a form of worship in accordance with his or her belief provided that it is not contrary to his or her civic duties, public order or good morals.

Besides that it would tarnish the position of the Majesty the King where His Majesty, the King is the upholder and the patron of all religions. Moreover, His Majesty the King always takes part actively in promoting the understanding between the majority of Thais and minority groups especially peoples in those regions.  

The abolishment of the application of the Islamic Law in those regions is no doubt would create a confrontation between the government and the local Muslim leaders. Thus, to appease the feelings of the Muslim in the south, the government reintroduced a new act namely the “Act on the application of the Islamic Law in Patani, Narathiwat, Yala and Satul, Act of B.E. 2489 (1946).” This Act is very concise and brief because it only consists of six sections. By virtue of this Act, the Muslims who are living in those four regions are again allowed to apply the Islamic Law on marriage, divorce and inheritance. In other words, they were exempted from the Thai Civil and Commercial Law Code, 1935 book V. Section 3 of the Act 1946 provides to the effect that:

Islamic Family Law and Inheritance shall be applied instead of the provisions of the Civil and Commercial Code, 1935 in the case where the plaintiff and defendant are Muslims.

However, in criminal cases they are still subject to the Thai Criminal Code (TCC)

The Hierarchy of the Courts in Thailand and the proposed SharÊÑah Court

According to the Law of Organization of Court of Justice, 1934, the Thai courts are divided into the Court of First Instance, the Court of Appeal and the Supreme Court. At present there are about 140 Courts of First Instance throughout the Kingdom. In Bangkok Metropolis, they are, for example, the Civil Court, the Criminal Court, the Juvenile and Family Court, the Central Labour Court and the Central Tax Court, including Kwaeng Courts which have jurisdiction over minor civil cases and criminal cases with maximum punishment of imprisonment not exceeding 3 years or fine not exceeding 60,000 Baht.

32 It is to be noted that this act was issued on 3rd December, B.E. 2498 (1946).
33 See Section 3 (1) of the Application of Islamic Law in Patani, Narathiwat, Yala, and Satul of 1946.
34 See Government and Politics-Judiciary and Justice Administration, http: sunsite.au.ac.th/thailand/government/judi.html. Baht is Thai currency 20 Baht is currently equal to 1 Dollar Singapore dollar.
Cases on family issues and inheritance of Muslims in the four southern border provinces of Thailand are tried by the Provincial Courts (PC) which is under the Jurisdiction of the Court of First Instance. The Jurisdiction of the Provincial Courts of Pattani, Narathiwat, Yala and Satul are extended to hear and try Islamic Law cases. The law provides that the Provincial Court must decide cases by two judges. However, in the Islamic Law they are assisted by two Dato’ Yuthithams.

According to what has been mentioned above, it becomes clear that the SharÊÑah court, as understood by many people in the south is non-existent. Because the Dato Yuthitham has no liberty to decide the Muslims’ cases. Moreover, it is not proper to establish SharÊÑah court under the Provincial courts since it will effect the present hierarchy of the court. As a matter of fact, in the Provincial Courts there are two more important courts, the Juvenile and Family Court as well as the Specialized Courts. There are four specialized courts in Thailand, namely the Labour Court, the Tax Court, the Intellectual Property and International Trade Court, and the Bankruptcy Court. A judge in the specialized courts is appointed from the judges who possess competent knowledge in their respective matters.

Since the government has recognized the special courts under the Provincial Courts, the SharÊÑah Court for Muslims in Thailand can also be categorized as a special court in order to open a room for a person who possesses a competent knowledge in the Islamic law to become a judge. More importantly, since Thailand is a Democratic Country, the establishment of the SharÊÑah Court is deemed necessary for the Muslims in this country.

---

**Jurisdiction of the Provincial Courts with reference to Shari’ah Court**
Shari’ah Court was annexed to the Provincial Courts. With regard to the jurisdiction of the Provincial Courts in the four southern border provinces of Thailand with respect to the application of the Islamic Family Law and Law of Inheritance is stated in the Act of Promulgating the Application of the Islamic Law in Patani, Narathiwat, Yala and Satul B.E. 2489 (1946). Section 3 of the act provides to the effect that:

Islamic Law on Family and Inheritance shall apply to the cases in the court of first instance in Patani, Narathiwat, Yala and Satul where Muslims are both plaintiffs and defendants filing the request in non-contentious case.

From the above quoted article shows that the Court of First Instance, namely the Provincial Courts in those four provinces has limited jurisdictions to hear and try all actions and proceedings concerning marriage, divorce and inheritance in which the parties are Muslims living in those four southern provinces only.

With regard to the Muslims who live outside those four Southern Provinces they are exempted from this Act. This practice somehow may cause injustice towards the Muslims who live in other provinces of Thailand since the Muslims in Thailand by virtue of article 38 of Constitution of the Kingdom of Thailand, 1997 may live and stay throughout the Kingdom. In other words, this Act tends to limit or restrict the place for the Muslims to live in the Kingdom whereas Muslims who reside outside the Southern Four Provinces of Thailand are deprived of these privileges. An example can be seen in the Narathiwat Provincial court case of Santiphap Sing Haad v. Jamilah Sing Haad. The applicant was born in Songkhla Province. He was a police officer at Klong-ngae Police Station in Sadao District, Songkhla Province. After serving several years at Klong-nghi Police Station, he was transferred to the Narathiwat Police Station.

35 It is to be noted that the word Jurisdiction in legal context means the power and authority of a court to hear, try and decide a case as contrary to the location, which is the place where the action must be instituted and tried. Generally, it is conferred by law and cannot be conferred by the consent of the parties or by their failure to object to the lack of it. However, according to Thai Civil Procedure Code, article 2 (2) states to the effect that the action is not allowed to be instituted unless it is proven that the action was under the jurisdiction of that court. See Constitution of Justice Court Act, article 14 (2) provides the Provincial Courts have its jurisdiction according to the Act on establishing the Provincial Courts. Generally speaking, the Provincial Courts have the authority to hear and try cases throughout the province.

36 It is significant to be noted here that according to the hierarchy of the Thai Courts of Justice they are classified into 3 levels; a) Sarn Chan Tun (the Court of First Instance), b) Sarn Uthon (the Court of Appeal) and c) Sarn Dika (the Supreme Court). With respect to the Court of First instance, it is categorized as a provincial court. Every province has one Provincial Court.

37 Somswasdi, V. 1997. Family Law, Bangkok: Kobfai Publishing Work, p. 20; Southeast, A. 1987. ShariÑah and Codification, ibid., p. 144; the decision of the Thai Supreme Court No: 102 / B.E. 2517 (1974). In this decision the court held that though the parties were Muslims and they were disputed over inheritance but the case was occurred outside the four border provinces. Thus, Islamic Law can not be applied because it was contrary to the article 3 of the act.

38 Ibid.

39 Narathiwat Provincial Court, Civil Suit No: 5 / B.E. 2539 (1996). There are some applicants whose permanent residence in the four border provinces of southern Thailand but they are reluctant to be abiding by Islamic law. They simply ask the court to apply Thai Civil and Commercial Law Code in stead of Islamic Law; see a decided case of Masare Waemada v. Prasit Waemada, Patani Provincial Court, Civil Suit No: 390 / B.E. 2534 (2000).
In Narathiwat, the applicant married to Miss Jamilah according to Islamic Law and registered his marriage according to the Thai Civil and Commercial law Code, 1935 at the office of registrar in the Narathiwat District Office (NDO). The parties later decided to live together as a husband and wife in the District of Tanjongmas, Ra'ngae, and Narathiwat province. On 1st November, 1992, they had a baby. In 1996 the husband had pronounced a *talaq* against her wife and registered his *talāq* at the Office of Registrar in the NDOO.

In 1999, the applicant had filed a suit against her wife and claimed custody over his daughter. During the trial the question of court's jurisdiction was raised, whether the Narathiwat provincial court had jurisdiction to hear and try the applicant’s case, owing to the fact that the applicant had lived outside the four southern provinces of Thailand. The learned *Dato’ Yuthitham* of the Narathiwat Provincial Court was in the opinion that since the applicant was born in Songkhla province, therefore he cannot hear and try the case. Thus the Thai Civil and Commercial Law Code, 1935 shall be applied. In this case *Dato’ Yuthitham* relied on section 3 and 4 of the Act Promulgating the Application of Islamic Law in Patani, Narathiwat, Yala and Satul B.E. 2489 (1946) which states the Islamic Personal law shall be applied in the court of first instance in the four provinces where the parties are Muslims or a Muslim files the request in non-contentious cases. In addition, *Dato’ Yuthitham* relied on section 4 of the Act, 1946 that provides *inter alia* that in deciding the marital disputes as stated in section 3, *Dato’ Yuthitham* shall sit on the bench to form a quorum with the Thai Civil judge. Thus, from the court's judgment it is observed that the Provincial courts in the Southern Four Border Provinces of Thailand is very concerned with the residence of the parties before deciding cases. Moreover, the parties shall be a permanent resident in the four border provinces.

If the parties cease to be a Muslim or becomes murtad or apostate, they shall also be deprived of their rights to apply Islamic law under the Act, 1946. To illustrate the point above, there was a court judgment of the Yala Provincial court. In case of Abd. Hamid Chema v. Saibua @ Khobusoh khamsouki. The plaintiff was married in 1978. Before getting married, the plaintiff had asked the defendant to embrace Islam. The defendant later decided to convert to Islam in front of the *imām* in the village. After they got married the parties opened a hair saloon in Yala.

In December, 1994 the plaintiff found that the defendant was having an affair with a man. Knowing the facts, the plaintiff advised the defendant to stop the relationship but the defendant ignored the plaintiff’s advice. On the contrary, the defendant asked the plaintiff to divide a jointly acquired property according to the Thai Civil and Commercial Law Code, 1935 by claiming that she was no longer faithful to Islam. The defendant insisted in front of the plaintiff that she swears an oath before Lord Buddha’s statute. The issue in this case was whether the defendant still remained a Muslim when it was proven that she taken an oath before Lord Buddha’s statute. She made a confession before the court that “*if I am a liar, may my Lord Buddha curse me within three or seven days.*”

Upon hearing the defendant's confession, the learned *Dato’ Yuthitham* of the Yala Provincial Court was in the opinion that the defendant’s action demonstrated that she was no longer a Muslim

---

41 Yala Provincial Court, Civil Suit No: 302 / B.E. 2529 (1986).
and therefore, the parties were not allowed to apply the Islamic Law. The same principle was applied in the case of Chavivan To’Dir v. Abdullateh To’ Dir. The parties were married according to the Islamic law. The marriage took place in front of two witnesses, Niyada Samaya and Deurashi Sama-ae. The parties had registered the marriage according to the Thai Civil and Commercial Law Code, 1935 on 18 August, 1989 at the office of the registrar in the Yala District Office. In December, 1989 the defendant pronounced a triple divorce against his wife and left his wife. The wife later filed a suit against her husband claiming that her husband has deserted her for more than one year without giving any maintenance. At the trial, the wife told the court that she had taken an oath before Buddha's statute by admitting that she was no longer a Muslim. After hearing the defendant’s confession, the court ruled that this case no longer fall under the ambit of the Islamic family law. Hence, Dato’ Yuthitham shall not sit on the bench to form a quorum in order to hear and try the case with the Thai civil judge.

Looking at the court's judgment in both cases, it may be concluded that the court will strictly interpret and apply the Act, 1946 without looking at the effects of the judgment towards the interest of the disputed parties. It might be noted that since the code recognizes the dissolution of marriage by the operation of law on the ground of apostasy as the code stipulates inter alia, that:

…where either parties, husband or wife becomes apostate, the marriage shall be dissolved immediately.

The effect of dissolution on the ground of apostasy is irrevocable and the parties can not remarry forever. It is a Dato’ Yuthitham’s duty to hear and try the case and order the marriage to be dissolved by the order of the court rather than to dismiss the applicant’s case without resorting to the provisions in the code.

The decision of Dato’ Yuthitham (Muslim judges)

As far as Dato’ Yuthitham's decision is concerned, his decision is final and no appeals are allowed as it was stated in the Act on the application of the Islamic Law in Patani, Narathiwat, Yala and Satul, Act of B.E. 2489 (1946). Most of the local academicians considered this act as an unusual act where its provision gives an absolute power in the hand of Dato’ Yuthithams. This means that the disputed parties are deprived of their fundamental rights under the Thai constitution to make an appeal to the higher court.

Yala Provincial Court, Civil Suit No: 271 / B.E. 2540 (1997). It is interesting to mention here that the numbers of murtad case in the four southern provinces is increasing day by day compared with other provinces of Thailand. This is due to the fact that the new converts were not well prepared to embrace Islam. Some of them embraced Islam because they just want to get married and when conflicts occurred in the family, some of them declared in the public that he or she was no longer a Muslim. After that they will ask the civil court to divide his or her joint acquired property. Friday Talk delivered by Ahmad Abdullah, on 13th December, 2002 at al-Masjid al-Jami’ Li al-Falah, Cherang Nibung, District of Pekara, Patani Province, Thailand.

The Code, article 126.

Section 4 clause 3 of the Act. It is interesting to note here that under this Act the Dato’ Yuthitham is not in position to give judgment but his real function is to advise and assist Thai judge in deciding Islamic Law. In practice in order to honour the position of the Dato’ Yuthitham, he will be sitting together with the Thai civil judge and the decision would be delivered by the Thai civil Judge based on the Dato’ Yuthithams’ advice.
The Act 1946 has caused many Muslims in the south to express their dissatisfaction since before this act came into effect, they were given the right to make an appeal if they are dissatisfied with Dato' Yuthitham’s decision.\textsuperscript{46} However, after the 1946 Act is being implemented a few appeal cases are allowed to be heard on the procedural law but not on the substantive law namely the Islamic Law.\textsuperscript{47} This is because according to this Act Dato’ Yuthitham has an absolute power to apply only the Islamic Law.\textsuperscript{48} As for the procedural law, it is under the discretion of the Thai Civil Judge. In case the appeals are allowed, the normal practice is that the Court of Appeal will reaffirm Dato’ Yuthitham’s decision or order Dato’ Yuthitham to review his decision. The rationale behind this practice was to maintain and to preserve the harmony among Muslim society in the south.\textsuperscript{49}

The second reason was that most of the Islamic Law cases involved very small claims.\textsuperscript{50} As a result, the appeals are not entertained and the appeal that involves Islamic family cases depends entirely on the political consideration than the interest of the applicants. Act on the application of the Islamic Law in Patani, Narathiwat, Yala and Satul, Act of B.E. 2489 (1946), prevents the Muslim litigants to appeal to a higher court. Article 4 clause 3 of the act provides, \textit{inter alia}:

The decision of Dato’ Yuthitham to Islamic law is final.\textsuperscript{51}

The legal effect of this is that the Muslims in the south are deprived of their rights to appeal to the higher court until today. Even though, there are several criticisms made by the Muslims in Thailand nothing could change the decision on the implementation of the act. In this connection, the secretary of the Central Islamic Committee of Thailand has observed that:

\begin{quote}
\ldots in fact, a person who has been appointed to be a Dato’ Yuthitham is only an ordinary person. Thus, in carrying out his duty as a judge there shall be a mistake. If he makes a wrong decision, the defendant would be responsible and he will never be given the right to defend his right. However, if this case is tried in the Court of Justice, the Thai Civil judge will allow the defendant to make an appeal. If that happens I think in future the right to appeal shall be given to the defendant, if it is proven that the decision of Dato’ Yuthitham in the Islamic family law is wrongly given so that the justice would be upheld.
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{46} Siripachana, N. 1975. \textit{Kwam Pen Ma}, ibid., pp. 84-85.
\textsuperscript{47} The Ministry of Justice Order No: 30 / 4353 dated on 24 September, 1917; see also Khrua-Klin, P.R.1995. \textit{Yoo Lak Kotmai Phra Thammanoon Sarn Yuthitham} (The concise on the Principle of Constitutional law of Justice Court), Bangkok: Nithitam Press. p. 31.
\textsuperscript{48} The Act Promulgating the Application of the Islamic Law in Patani, Narathiwat, Yala, and Satul B.E. 2489 (1946) Section 3 and 4; see also appeal cases and the decision of the Thai Supreme Court No: 1442 / B.E. 2541 (1998) of Mr. Haji Makta bin Haji Che Wua v. Mr. Che Sama-ae Che Mama’ and the decision of the Thai Supreme court No: 4807 / B.E. 2540 (1997) of Mdm. Haji Chew Ma’a’suka @ Hamasuka v. Mdm. Che Song Beraheng’s case.
\textsuperscript{49} See decided cases of Ha’ma’ Molo v. Pisoh Molo, Patani Provincial Court case, Civil Suit No: 510 / B.E.2536 (1993); Phitakbancha @ Semarnwong @ Abdullah v. Yuadee, Provincial Court case, Civil Suit No : 544 / B.E. 2540 (1997) and the decision of Thai Supreme Court No: 4807 / B.E. 2540 (1997) in case of Mdm Haji Che Wo Ma’a’suka @ Hama’ Suka v. Mdm. Che Song Beraheng and the decision of the Thai Supreme Court No: 1442 / B.E. 2541( 1998 ) in case of Mr. Haji Makta bin Haji Che Wua v. Mr. Che Sama-ae Che Mama.
\textsuperscript{50} Interview with the Honourable Chief Judge of the Patani Provincial Court, Mr. Anusorn Sri-Meandt on 24th September, 2001 at the Patani Provincial Court.
\textsuperscript{51} The correct English translation is the decision of the Dato’ Yuthitham in Islamic law shall be final.
Despite the fact that Dato’ Yuthitham is given privilege to apply the Islamic Law in the Provincial Courts, the Muslim litigants are prevented to appeal the decision of Dato’ Yuthitham and this problem makes the applicants feel dissatisfied when their cases are tried and heard at the Shariah court.

Conclusion

From the discussion, we can conclude that during the reigns of Sukhothai and Ayutthaya dynasties the position of Islamic law and the attitude of the Siamese Kings towards Islamic law were flexible in the sense that the Siamese king will not interfere with all matters concerning religious affairs of the Muslims in the Muslim areas. In these two dynasties, it could be said that Islamic law namely; Islamic Family Law, Islamic Criminal Law and Islamic Law of Transaction were administered throughout the Patani kingdom. However, the application of the Islamic law in the Kingdom of Patani was interfered when the Siamese administration has tightened its grip in the Patani Kingdom in 1902. Consequently, the Muslim kingdom of Patani was governed by the Thai authority. This can be seen from the implication of the Royal proclamation of Bangkok’s government administration in the southern provinces.

By these administrative regulations, it signaled the imposition of the Bangkok’s rules over the Muslims' kingdom. It also provided for the appointment of a Siamese governor from Bangkok to the Muslims’ area in place of Sultan’s power. It resulted that traditional Islamic society, Islamic laws and Muslim's customary laws were to be replaced by the Thai civil law through this administrative regulation. At the same time, the Bangkok administration seemed to obstruct the implementation of Islamic law in the Muslim areas. Moreover, they were trying to narrow down the scope of the Islamic law and its application that has been accepted and recognized as a law for the Muslims in those four provinces.

This reception is eventually started with the promulgation of the act on the Application of the Islamic law in Patani, Narathiwat, Yala and Satul, 1946. By virtue of this act, Dato’ Yuthitham was appointed as an advisor to the Thai civil judge in the Provincial courts in those four provinces. The unusual features of this act rested on the power of Dato’ Yuthithams viz, their decisions became absolute, and no appeal is allowed. To give an advice to the Thai civil judge, Dato’ Yuthithams consulted classical Islamic law textbooks. The Muslims are generally felt dissatisfied with the roles played by Dato’ Yuthitham in the Provincial court whose function is an adviser to the Thai civil judge but not a full-fledged judge as required by Islam as they are also still suspicious about whether Dato’ Yuthitham can effectively solve their disputes. Moreover, the lawyers who give advice to the applicants do not have adequate understandings about Islamic law.
References

A. Monographs


**B. Articles/Journals / Internet**


-Raymond Scupian, Popular in Thailand, edited by Andrew D.W. Forbes Centre for South East Asia Studies, India.


B. Unpublished Thesis/Dissertations


D. Ministerial Order

-The Ministry of Justice Order No: 30 / 4353 dated on 24 September, 1917.
E. Report


F. List of Statutes
-Application of the Islamic Law in Patani, Narathiwat, Yala and Satul B.E. 2489 (1946).

-Constiitution of the Kingdom of Thailand 1997.


-Thai Civil and Commercial Law Code 1935 book V

G. Decided Cases


-Ha’ma’ Molo v. Pisoh Molo, Patani Provincial Court case, Civil Suit No: 510 / B.E.2536 (1993);

-Phitakbancha @ Semarnwong @ Abdullah v. Yuadee, Provincial Court case, Civil Suit No: 544 / B.E. 2540 (1997)

-Madam Haji Che Wo Ma’suka @ Hama’ Suka v. Mdm. Che Song Beraheng, Thai Supreme court No: 4807 / B.E. 2540 (1997)

-Haji Makta bin Haji Che Wuo v. Mr. Che Sama-ae Che Mama, Thai Supreme court No: 4807 / B.E. 2540 (1997)

-Chavivan To’Dir v. Abdullateh To’ Dir, Yala Provincial Court, Civil Suit No: 271 / B.E. 2540 (1997).

-Mariyea Tayi’@ Menea @ Hama Tayi’, Yala Provincial Court Case, Civil Suit No: 215 / B.E. 2544 (2001).


List of Interviewees

-Mr. Apirat Mad Sa-id, the Dato’ Yuthitham of the Patani Provincial Court on 18th July, 1999.

-Mr. Anusorn Sri-Meandt, the Honourable Chief Judge of the Patani Provincial Court, on 24th September, 2001 at the Patani Provincial Court.
-Mr. Qayyām, the owner of the bookshop Muḥammad al-Afghāni, Patani on 19th October, 2000.
Cycles of Violence, Cycles of Trauma in Toni Morrison’s *Jazz*

Olfa Drid
University of Manouba, Tunisia

Abstract

By excavating the psyches and violent behaviors of Joe and Violet in *Jazz*, this article aims at unveiling the danger of silencing past traumas—instead of healing them—which may entail a chain of connected traumas and even unexpected aberrations that can culminate in violence and murder. Besides, this study ascribes the violence of the African American community to the transgenerational trauma of slavery, which caused the pain of Blacks and the shame of Whites. This paper is therefore a psychoanalytic reading of the novel based on the trauma theories of Cathy Caruth, Sigmund Freud, Dominick LaCapra as well as on Nicolas Abraham and Maria Torok’s theories of “the crypt” and “the phantom”.

Keywords: trauma, belatedness, incubation period, transference, crypt.
The temporal liaison between the present and past in Morrison’s *Jazz* is dangerous because of the characters’ traumatic memories and their inability to beat back the past, and free themselves from the haunting legacy of slavery as a national trauma, whether experienced by the characters themselves or transmitted to them unconsciously by previous generations. In fact and as Nancy Peterson states in her book *Against Amnesia*, “some things are unspoken because reigning ideologies do not consider them worthy of notice. Other things are unspeakable because they are too traumatic to be remembered” or articulated even (4). In light of this, I will examine in this paper the very reasons of these traumatic memories haunting the main characters in *Jazz*. Yet before that I shall give an overview of the trauma theory in order to illuminate this study and give further insight into the dangerous impact of these intrusive memories on the individuals’ psyches.

**Trauma Theory**

In recent years, psychiatry, psychoanalysis, and neurobiology have increasingly insisted on the direct effects of external violence in psychic disorders. This trend has culminated in the study of post-traumatic stress disorder, or PTSD, which describes in Cathy Caruth’s words “an overwhelming experience of sudden or catastrophic events in which the response to the event occurs in the often uncontrolled, repetitive appearance of hallucinations and other intrusive phenomena” (Caruth 57). Indeed in her book *Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative and History*, Caruth elucidates her theory of trauma which coincides in many aspects with Sigmund Freud’s theory since both of them agree on the main symptoms of trauma as residing in the belatedness of the traumatic event and its haunting aspect as well as on the life-death oscillation of the trauma survivors.

For Caruth, trauma as it first occurs is incomprehensible. It is only later, after a period of latency, that it can be placed in a narrative. To elucidate her theory, Caruth quotes Freud’s theory of trauma which converges with hers. Indeed, in Freud’s book, *Beyond the Pleasure Principle*, trauma is depicted as a wound inflicted not upon the body but upon the mind. Unlike the wound of the body, which is a simple and healable event, the wound of the mind is “experienced too soon, too unexpectedly, to be fully known and is therefore not available to consciousness until it imposes itself again, repeatedly, in the nightmares and repetitive actions of the survivor” (Caruth 4). Thus, trauma in his credo resides in that very unmasterable traumatic past events which return to haunt the survivor later on. To exemplify his point, Freud invokes the story told by Tasso in his romantic epic *Gerusalemme Liberata*:

> Its hero, Tancred, unwittingly kills his beloved Clorinda in a duel while she is disguised in the armor of an enemy knight. After her burial he makes his way into a strange magic forest which strikes the Crusaders’ army with terror. He slashes with his sword at a tall tree; but blood streams from the cut and the voice of Clorinda, whose soul is imprisoned in the tree, is heard complaining that he has wounded his beloved once again. (Caruth 2)

Thus, this story of Tancred, unwittingly wounding his beloved in a battle and then, unconsciously wounding her again by chance elucidates how the experience of trauma repeats itself through the intentional acts of the survivor and against his very will. Notably, what is striking in this story is the sorrowful voice that cries out, a voice that is paradoxically released through the
wound. For Tancred does not only repeat his act but, in repeating it, “he for the first time hears a voice that cries out to him to see what he has done. The voice of his beloved addresses him and, in this address, bears witness to the past he has unwittingly repeated” (Caruth 3). Hence, Tancred’s story “represents traumatic experience not only as the enigma of a human agent’s repeated and unknowing acts”, as Caruth puts it, “but also as the enigma of the otherness of a human voice that cries out from the wound, a voice that witnesses a truth that Tancred himself cannot fully know” (Caruth 3).

It follows that trauma for both Freud and Caruth seems to be much more than a pathology or the simple illness of a wounded psyche: it is always the story of a wound that cries out, a wound given voice in order to reveal or unveil a reality or a truth that is not otherwise available. Indeed, this unwitting reenactment of an event that one cannot simply leave behind is what Freud terms “traumatic neurosis” as he explains below:

It may happen that someone gets away, apparently unharmed, from the spot where he has suffered a shocking accident, for instance a train collision. In the course of the following weeks, however, he develops a series of grave psychical and motor symptoms, which can be ascribed only to his shock or whatever else happened at the time of the accident. He has developed a “traumatic neurosis.” This appears quite incomprehensible and is therefore a novel fact. The time that elapsed between the accident and the first appearance of the symptoms is called the “incubation period”. (Caruth 70)

Indeed this “incubation period” - during which the effects of the shocking experience are not apparent - is what Freud calls “latency” which is inherent in the very experience of trauma. Caruth’s synonym to Freud’s “latency” is “belatedness” as she emphasizes the essential belatedness of trauma, how it is by definition not experienced at the moment of the traumatic event as she explains in the quote below:

In its general definition, trauma is described as the response to an unexpected or overwhelming violent event or events that are not fully grasped as they occur, but return later in repeated flashbacks, nightmares, and other repetitive phenomena. Traumatic experience, beyond the psychological dimension of suffering it involves, suggests a certain paradox: that the most direct seeing of a violent event may occur as an absolute inability to know it; that immediacy, paradoxically, may take the form of belatedness. The repetitions of the traumatic event—which remain unavailable to consciousness but intrude repeatedly on sight— thus suggest a larger relation to the event that extends beyond what can simply be seen or what can be known, and is inextricably tied up with the belatedness and incomprehensibility that remain at the heart of this repetitive seeing. (Caruth 91-92)

Elsewhere, Caruth asserts that the historical power of the trauma is “not just that the experience is repeated after its forgetting, but that it is only in and through its inherent forgetting that it is first experienced at all” (Caruth 17).

Thus trauma for both Caruth and Freud is “the literal return of the event against the will of the one it inhabits”. That is “the outside has gone inside without any mediation”(Caruth 4). Unlike Freud and Caruth, Dominick LaCapra - as James Berger argues in his article “Trauma and Literary Theory” - focuses on three psychoanalytic topics: the return of the repressed; acting out
versus working through; and the dynamics of transference. A traumatic historical event, LaCapra argues, tends first to be repressed and then to return in forms of compulsive repetition. LaCapra is concerned primarily with the return of the repressed as discourse. He outlines two symptomatic possibilities for the return of historical trauma as discourse. There is, on the one hand, the "redemptive, fetishistic narrative that excludes or marginalizes trauma through a teleological story that projectively presents values and wishes as viably realized" as Berger writes, and on the other hand, LaCapra points to the "construction of all history ...as trauma and an insistence that there is no alternative to symptomatic acting-out and the repetition compulsion other than an imaginary ...hope for totalization, full closure, and redemptive meaning" (LaCapra qtd.in Berger 575).

Thus LaCapra wants to create a position that avoids both redemptive narrative and sublime acting out. He sets out to describe a way to work through trauma that does not "deny the irreducibility of loss or the role of paradox and aporia" but avoids becoming "compulsively fixated" (LaCapra qtd. in Berger 579). For LaCapra acknowledges a certain value in acting out. If there is no acting out at all, no repetition of the traumatic disruption, “the resulting account of the historical trauma will be that teleological, redemptive fetishizing that denies the trauma's reality: it happened, but it had no lasting effects; look, we're all better now, even better than before”, to borrow Berger’s words (576).

The third and most pervasive of LaCapra's concerns is transference. The failure to come to terms with the discursive returns of some traumatic event usually signals the failure to recognize one's own emotional and ideological investments in the event and its representation. Transference in psychoanalysis is itself a return of the repressed, or rather a more conscious summoning of the repressed. That is an attempt to repeat or act out a past traumatic event in a new therapeutic setting that allows for critical evaluation and change. Transference is the occasion for working through the traumatic symptom. Hence being conscious of one’s trauma is the first condition to reach this stage.

Side by side with the abovementioned theories and approaches of trauma as an individual experience, I find it also crucial to invoke the trauma of slavery as a transgenerational legacy. Indeed and as Gabriele Schwab points out in her book Haunting Legacies: Violent Histories and Transgenerational Trauma, it may be true that many African American people seem to be “disassociated” from the traumatic legacy of slavery, have no more connection with their distant history and no longer define their identities accordingly, yet this continual attempt of rewriting the history of slavery is nothing but an attempt to work through this collective trauma, which is transmitted from one generation to another despite and also because of this very attempt to mute it. In other words, “the collective or communal silencing of violent histories leads to a transgenerational transmission of trauma and the specter of an involuntary repetition of cycles of violence” (46) as Schwab puts it. So what Schwab calls “haunting legacies” are things and events which are hard to remember. The outcomes of a violence that holds “an unrelenting grip on memory yet is deemed unspeakable”. “The psychic core of violent histories”, she adds, “includes what has been repressed or buried in unreachable psychic recesses”(1). Thus the legacies of violence not only haunt the actual victims but are also passed on through the generations. It follows that these damages of violent histories, whether of slavery, genocide, wars or dehumanizing effects of atrocities, generate psychic deformations and “can hibernate in the unconscious, only to be transmitted to the next generation like an undetected disease” (3).
Moreover Nicolas Abraham and Maria Torok’s theories of “the crypt” and “the phantom” serve also to back up this view and highlight the danger of stifling and silencing past traumas. For both of them in their book *The Shell and The Kernel: Renewals of Psychoanalysis* develop “a theory of cryptonymy that traces different ways and forms of hiding in language. ‘Cryptonymy’ refers to operations in language that emerge as manifestations of a psychic crypt, often in form of fragmentations, distortions, gaps, or ellipses” (Schwab 45). This crypt is indeed similar to a psychic tomb in which people bury their unspeakable and unbearable pains, losses, guilts and traumas that is a harbor for a living corpse. The formation of the crypt, in Abraham’s view, is due to a failed mourning and to the tendency of people to silence violent histories as Schwab describes it in the quote below:

People tend to bury violent or shameful histories. They create psychic crypts meant to stay sealed off from the self, interior tombs haunted by the ghosts of the past. Crypts engender silence. However, untold or unspeakable secrets, unfelt or denied pain, concealed shame, covered-up crimes, or violent histories continue to affect and disrupt the lives of those involved in them and often their descendants as well. Silencing these violent and shameful histories casts them outside the continuity of psychic life but, unintegrated and unassimilated, they eat away at this continuity from within. (49)

It follows, once silenced these traumatic memories or living corpses are likely to return as ghosts, phantoms or revenants in order to haunt the survivors or even their descendants. For cryptographic writing, in Abraham’s credo, can bear the traces of the trangenerational memory of something never experienced firsthand by the one carrying the secret. “It is the children or descendants,” as Abraham emphasizes, “who will be haunted by what is buried in this tomb even if they do not know of its existence or contents and even if the history that produced the ghost is shrouded in silence” (Schwab 4). It follows, not only the trauma is transmitted from one generation to another but violence itself is unconsciously transmitted and re-enacted.

**Traumatic memories in Jazz**

*Traumatized people often come to feel that they have lost an important measure of control over the circumstances of their own lives and are thus very vulnerable.* (Caruth, 99)

Starting with Caruth’s quote above, we can detect the vulnerability of the trauma survivors in *Jazz*. The main characters in *Jazz* are traumatized because of their abandonment by their parents or spouses or haunted by their own acts of violence. Joe is a trauma survivor because he is an orphan abandoned by his parents and also because he killed his eighteen-year-old mistress and is unable to pardon himself for this horrible act. Violet on the other hand is traumatized because of her parents’ abandonment of her as a child as well as her husband’s betrayal of her with a light-skinned young girl. Both characters are haunted by these memories against their own will. Thus being both motherless figures with psychic wounds, they are unable to maintain their romantic love. The cracks in their own selves were transmitted into cracks in their own liaison as a couple, which broke out for long years before being healed towards the end of the novel after confronting their own traumas, working through it by resorting to a collective memory in order to “keep the past at bay” and look for a better future.
As in Morrison’s other historical novels, Jazz is also structured recursively; that is, the narration of present events is interrupted by the telling of “background” stories and by the unearthing of the unspoken events silenced by the mainstream history. For most of the characters are struggling with the intrusive memories of the past.

Indeed Joe and Violet in Jazz have no other choice but to dig deep into their past stories and memories in order to comprehend their present situation. The problem for them is that they have spent most of their lives forgetting and “beating back the past” instead of facing it. After leaving Vesper County, Virginia, in 1906 aboard a train heading North, Joe and Violet wished to leave behind their past wounds and disappointments and start a new page in their life. So they arrive in Harlem- the Promised Land - among “the wave of black people,” like them, “running from want and violence” (33). By 1926, when the novel opens, Harlem seems to be the site of a new historical era. As the narrator describes it: “Here comes the new. Look out. There goes the sad stuff. The bad stuff. The things nobody –could- help- stuff. The way everybody was then and there. Forget that. History is over, you all, and everything’s ahead at last” (7). In fact, “the bad stuff” alluded to in this passage refers to the unspeakable history and the repressed memories happening in the South; like slavery and all its inhuman crimes, which is a transgenerational trauma transmitted to them unwittingly by their ancestors. For this legacy is supposed to be forgotten and left behind literally in the Great Migration. Yet and “despite the promise of Harlem, to be post historical,” as Nancy Peterson puts it, “Joe and Violet find that the past comes along to haunt them, that they have to reckon with ‘the sad stuff’, ‘the bad stuff’ in order to resuscitate themselves as individuals and as a couple” (Peterson 73). This idea indeed echoes Freud’s view about trauma survivors who appear to get away, apparently unharmed, from the spot where they have suffered a shocking accident whereas they are unconsciously developing “a trauma neurosis”. For the shocking “accident”, Joe and Violet thought to have left behind and forgotten after migrating to the City is their childhood wounds as abandoned and orphaned children, which represent their silenced or repressed individual traumas.

Indeed both Joe and Violet yearn for some kind of connection with their previous selves in order to deal with their cycles of traumas. For Joe cannot find a confidant in Harlem similar to his childhood friend Victory to whom he used to unveil his unspeakable secrets. He admits, “I changed once too often. Made myself new one time too many. You could say, I’ve been a new Negro all my life” (129). This continual newness and self-renewal proves later to be problematic and painful. Having lost touch with Victory and all other friends in the South, Joe urgently needs someone to listen to his crying wounds and traumatic memories and mainly that of his mother who abandoned him.

For having a memory marked by a house “full of motherlessness” for months with no sign or sound of his mother (167), he traveled with an inside nothing”, which was the very proof of his trauma and one of the incentives of his later betrayal of his wife. Being told by Hunters Hunter that his mother is a crazy woman who “disappeared without a trace”, he resolved to name himself Joe Trace, a name reminiscent of Derrida’s trace, which conveys both the absence and presence of his mother. Being himself her son, that is a trace of her, he was convinced of her presence and decided to find her despite his feeling of shame:

From then on he wrestled with the notion of a wild woman for a mother. Sometimes it
shamed him to tears. Other times his anger messed up his aim and he shot wild or hit game in
messy inefficient places. A lot of his time was spent denying it, convincing himself he
misread Hunter’s words and most of all his look. Nevertheless, Wild was always on his mind,
and he wasn’t going to leave for Palestine without trying to find her one more time. (176)

Thus his determination to find her and silence his crying wound of abandonment made him
take three journeys to find her as the novel tells us:

All in all, he made three solitary journeys to find her. In Vienna he had lived first with
the fear of her, then the joke of her, finally the obsession, followed by rejection of her.
Nobody told Joe she was his mother. Not outright; but Hunters Hunter looked right in
his eyes one evening and said, “She got reasons. Even if she crazy. Crazy people got
reasons”. (175)

Yet being disappointed to find a crazy and dirty mother “who orphaned her baby rather
than nurse him or coddle him or stay in the house with him. A woman who frightened children”
(178), he decided to give up and started blaming and insulting her instead for abandoning her
children and implicitly for refusing to be the anchor he is looking for to solve his identity crisis and
to work through the trauma he has been suffering from for years:

But now they were full of her, a simple-minded woman too silly to beg for a living. Too
brain-blasted to do what the meanest sow managed: nurse what she birthed. The small
children believed she was a witch, but they were wrong. This creature hadn’t the intelligence
to be a witch. She was powerless, invisible, wastefully daft. Everywhere and nowhere.

There are boys who have whores for mothers and don’t get over it. There are boys
whose mothers stagger through town roads when the juke joint slams its door. Mothers who
throw their children away or trade them for folding money. He would have chosen any one of
them over this indecent speechless lurking in
sanity. The blast he aimed at the white
oak limbs disturbed nothing, for the shells were in his pocket. The trigger clicked harmlessly. Yelling,
sliding, falling, he raced back down the incline and followed the riverbank out of there. (179)

Indeed, his hope was just to be given a sign of recognition as the narrative tells us: “All she
had to do was give him a sign, her hand thrust through the leaves, the white flowers, would be
enough to say that she knew him to be the one, the son she had fourteen years ago, and ran away
from, but not too far” (37). Yet, after losing hope in his mother, hence failing to heal his first
trauma, he decides to find someone to fill in “the inside nothing” he traveled with from then on, the
“wound of the mind” lodging inside as Freud terms it. However, having a wife who suffers from her
own psychic traumas and busy with her own wounds and “her private cracks” (22), Joe stumbles
upon an eighteen-year-old young woman who happens to fill in his emptiness as the narrative tells
us:

Maybe he missed the sign that would have been some combination of shame and
pleasure, at least, and not the inside nothing he traveled with from then on, except for
the fall of 1925 when he had somebody to tell it to. Somebody called Dorcas with
hooves tracing her cheekbones and who knew better than people his own age what
that inside nothing was like. And who filled it for him, just as he filled it for her,
because she had it too. (37)
Thus finding in Dorcas the person to listen to his crying wounds and to whom he could unveil his repressed traumatic memories and unfold his pain, seems to be the main reason of his betrayal and the only way to heal his wounds of the mind as well as of the heart. “I couldn’t talk to anybody but Dorcas and I told her things I hadn’t told myself. With her I was fresh, new again” (123). Thus it is worthwhile to assert that his desire for Dorcas involves “not only sex or beauty or youth” as Peterson puts it, but also “the desire to articulate, to narrate memories and stories that might connect the past to the present in a meaningful way” (Peterson 77). In other words, Dorcas is the one who enabled him to overcome his first trauma of being orphaned and gave him a certain psychological balance.

Nevertheless, when Dorcas leaves him for Acton, a young man of her age, this was another shock for him and a new trauma reminding him of the previous ones. This cycle of traumas - being abandoned by his mother, then neglected by his wife who sleeps with a doll and in love with birds, then rejected again by the young lover who happened to listen to his “crying wounds”- made him resort to violence and to the power of the gun in order to put an end to the pain consuming both his mind and heart:

In this world, the only thing is to find the trail and stick to it. I tracked my mother in Virginia and it led me right to her, and I tracked Dorcas from Borough to Borough...something else takes over when the track begins to talk to you, give you its signs but if the trail speaks, no matter what’s the way, you can find yourself in a crowded room aiming a bullet at her heart, never mind, it’s the heart you can’t live without. (130)

Yet being shocked by his own violence to hurt the person he loves most “I had the gun but it was not the gun—it was my hand I wanted to touch you with” (130), is the beginning of another shock, hence another traumatic memory to haunt him later and make him lose direction and fall in despair and self-blame for killing the object of his love and burying the traits he cherished in her:

He remembers his memories of her; how thinking about her as he lay in bed next to Violet was the way he entered sleep. He minds her death, is so sorry about it, but minded more the possibility of his memory failing to conjure up the dearness. And he knows it will continue to fade because it was already beginning to the afternoon he hunted Dorcas down. After she said she wanted Coney Island and rent parties and more of Mexico. Even then he was clinging to the quality of her sugar-flawed skin, the high wild bush the bed pillows made of her hair, her bitten nails, the heart- breaking way she stood, toes pointed in. Even then, listening to her talk, to the terrible things she said, he felt he was losing the timbre of her voice and what happened to her eyelids when they made love. (28)

It follows, being haunted by traumatic memories of this murdered love made him “all broke up. Cried all day and all night. Left his job and wasn’t good for a thing” (204) as the text tells us. Thus returning to his wife’s lap to open together past wounds, to work through their traumas and heal each other has become a must for both Joe and Violet in order to escape from the grip of the past and repair what remains to be repairable.
As far as Violet is concerned, her traumatic memories pertain first to her being an orphan which made her reject motherhood and refuse to birth a baby at first then crave a baby when it has become too late for her to conceive. Her second shock is her husband’s betrayal of her. Two traumatic shocks as such made Violet suffer “public craziness” and “private cracks” in Harlem (22) – fissures in her own self-concept that the novel highlights with names signifying her split self: “violent” and “that violet”.

In fact, Violet’s first shock is due to her mother’s suicide. For after being deserted by her husband, Violet’s mother Rose Dear committed suicide by jumping into a well leaving behind five daughters. Thus being raised by her grandmother True Belle and being unable to grasp this loss and lack of motherlove, which is incomprehensible to her as a child as Caruth contends, Violet decides not to have children on her own. “Her mother. She didn’t want to be like that. Oh never like that” (97).

Indeed Violet’s initial trauma of being deprived of her motherlove did not show up when she was a child. It is only when she got married and became entitled to be a mother that this trauma resurfaced. The time that elapsed between “the accident” and the first appearance of the symptoms is what Freud calls the “incubation period” (Caruth 70). A period during which Violet was not conscious of the wound implanted in her mind and the effects of the shocking experience are not apparent yet - is what Freud calls “latency” and Caruth calls “belatedness”, which is inherent in the very experience of trauma. For as Caruth points out, the belatedness of trauma is by definition not experienced at the moment of the traumatic event or events “that are not fully grasped as they occur, but return later in repeated flashbacks, nightmares, and other repetitive phenomena”. The repetitions of the traumatic event, she adds, - “which remain unavailable to consciousness but intrude repeatedly on sight - thus suggest a larger relation to the event that extends beyond what can simply be seen or what can be known, and is inextricably tied up with the belatedness and incomprehensibility that remain at the heart of this repetitive seeing” (Caruth 91).

Hence the belatedness of trauma is embodied in Violet’s decision not to have children of her own in order not to look like her mother or be like her mother. “The important thing, the biggest thing”, to her mind, “was to never never have children. Whatever happened, no small dark foot would rest on another while a hungry mouth said, Mama?” (102). Thus her decision is due to her trauma and to her inability to grasp the traumatic event when it occurs- as a child- but returns later-as an adult- in a shape of a repetitive phenomenon. This belated trauma is the very reason behind her repeated miscarriages or rather her abortions induced by her “mammy-made poison” of “soap, salt and castor oil” (109).

Yet, when she reached the forties, “mother-hunger had hit her like a hammer. Knocked her down and out” (108) and she started craving for a baby when it has become too late for her to conceive. This craving is sublimated into a doll:

By and by longing became heavier than sex: a panting, unmanageable craving. She was limp in its thrall or rigid in an effort to dismiss it. That was when she bought herself a present; hid it under the bed to take out in secret when it couldn’t be helped. She began to imagine how old that last miscarried child would be now. A girl, probably. Certainly a girl. Who would she favor? What would her speaking voice sound like? (108)
Still her trauma is aggravated later by her husband’s betrayal with a girl young enough to be his daughter. Her ‘exchange’ of her with a young light-skinned girl made her realize that she prepared the ground for this betrayal by her refusal to bring him children, by distancing herself from him, by her interest in birds and the doll she chose to sleep with. That is when her trauma escalated into violence and she went to the funeral with a knife in order to cut the face of her rival’s corpse.

Indeed her trauma resulting from the shock of being betrayed made her revise herself and become eager to know her enemy in order to figure out the woman her husband wants her to be: “But I wanted to see what kind of girl he’d rather me be” (82) as she told Alice. Hence, she started her investigations about Dorcas in order to compare herself to her and in a way to be Dorcas so as to gain her husband back:

She questioned everybody, starting with Malvonne, an upstairs neighbor—the one who told her about Joe’s dirt in the first place and whose apartment he and the girl used as a love nest. From Malvonne she learned the girl’s address and whose child she was. From the legally licensed beauticians she found out what kind of lip rouge the girl wore; the marcelling iron they used on her (though I suspect that girl didn’t need to straighten her hair); the band the girl liked best (Slim Bates’ Ebony Keys which is pretty good except for his vocalist who must be his woman since why else would he let her insult his band). And when she was shown how, Violet did the dance steps the dead girl used to do. (5)

In fact, one more detail that bears witness to her trauma is the picture of her rival she unexpectedly took from her aunt and placed on the mantel in her own house. For the picture of Dorcas “not smiling, but alive at least and very bold. Violet had the nerve to put it on the fireplace mantel in her own parlor and both she and Joe looked at it in bewilderment” (6). Indeed this picture is meant to keep haunting her memory as well as that of her husband, to keep deliberately torturing herself as well as her husband and reminding him of his guilts- betrayal and murder- which caused their insomnia as the text tells us: “The mantel over the fireplace used to have shells and pretty-colored stones, but all of that is gone now and only the picture of Dorcas Manfred sits there in a silver frame waking them up all night long (13).

Besides, the haunting memory of Dorcas is best illustrated in her omnipresence and absence as the text tells us, “the girl’s memory is a sickness in the house—everywhere and nowhere” (28). For in Derridean terms, her trace is that of an absent presence, not there in the house but always-already there in their psyches. That is a buried trauma or a living corpse in Abraham’s theory. Furthermore her trauma and painful shock of being betrayed escalated to the extent of being obsessed with her rival’s physical traits and even falling in love with her. She is so hurt that she yearns to be the woman favored by her husband:

Violet agrees that it must be so; not only is she losing Joe to a dead girl, but she wonders if she isn’t falling in love with her too. When she isn’t trying to humiliate Joe, she is admiring the dead girl’s hair; when she isn’t cursing Joe with brand- new cuss words, she is having whispered conversations with the corpse in her head; when she isn’t worrying about his loss of appetite, his insomnia, she wonders what color were Dorcas’ eyes. Her aunt had said brown; the beauticians said black but Violet had never
seen a light-skinned person with coal-black eyes. One thing, for sure, she needed her ends cut. In the photograph and from what Violet could remember from the coffin, the girl needed her ends cut. Hair that long gets frugally easy. Just a quarter-inch trim would do wonders, Dorcas. Dorcas. (15)

To sum up, we can conclude that Violet was subject to a chain of traumas. The trauma of being deliberately orphaned by her mother entailed her deliberate trauma to be childless, which in turn entailed her unconsciously deliberate encouragement of her husband to couple elsewhere with a woman young enough to be his daughter. Likewise, Joe was subject to a chain of traumas. The trauma of being abandoned and rejected by his dirty and crazy mother Wild, which led him to search for a caring and attentive woman to perform both roles that of the wife and the mother, something Violet failed to do. Hence he found himself looking for a young woman to fill in the empty spaces left by his mother and his wife and overwhelm him with the love and attention he badly needs as a trauma victim. Yet being rejected again by his young mistress triggered in him the memory of his first rejection by his mother, something that made him act abruptly and gun down his mistress without any premeditation or maybe that was his way to claim her as his own and to prove how much he loves her and desires her for himself only. For his reply to Felice’s question about the reason of shooting her - “Scared. Didn’t know how to love anybody.” “You know now?” “No. Do you, Felice?” (213)- bears witness to his trauma, that is to that incurable wound of the mind for not being loved hence not knowing how to love.

To conclude, both Joe’s and Violet’s common trauma as abandoned, orphaned, unmothered and unlovable children - which entailed their later traumas and their violent acts - are insidiously linked to the collective trauma of slavery, which is transmitted to them trangenerationally and continues to haunt them unwittingly. As Schwab points out, “the collective or communal silencing of violent histories leads to a transgenerational transmission of trauma and the specter of an involuntary repetition of cycles of violence” (46). In other words, the damages of violent histories –slavery in our case- are liable to generate psychic deformations and “can hibernate in the unconscious, only to be transmitted to the next generation like an undetected disease” (Schwab 3). Thus both Joe’s and Violet’s chains of traumas are due to the “crypt”, as Abraham words it, that is the psychic tomb in which they -as well as their forefathers - buried their unspeakable and unbearable pains and traumas instead of healing them. The result of this silencing and of the trauma victims’ failure to mourn their losses is “the phantom”, according to Abraham, which is embodied in their violent behaviors and aberrations emerging in their lives later as adults. Thus, being subject to violence in the past, and being unable to work through their past traumas, Joe and Violet - and by extension the African American community as a whole - cannot act otherwise but in the same violent way as their white oppressors. Hence the Blacks’ violence is nothing but the trace of the Whites’ violence in the Derridean sense and their cycles of trauma are deeply rooted in the unforgivable and unforgettable trauma of slavery.
References


Disorder in *Macbeth*, or May We Call it ‘Entropy’?

Imen El-Khazri
University of Manouba, Tunisia

Abstract

With universalist or globalizing tendencies of thought, order is preferred while disorder is sought to be avoided at any price; the latter might generally be linked in politics to any kind of political dissidence, wars, conflicts, riots, etc. In psychology, everyone fears mental disorders. In ethics and theology, it is linked to the cursed notions of immorality and sin. However, with the emergence of postmodern pessimist science of chaos, the word becomes much admired. In science as in art and the humanities, disorder is inevitable; it is rather a universal feature.

Order and disorder are often important issues in the Shakespearean tragedy of Macbeth (and in fact, in all Shakespearean plays). The scientific concept of ‘entropy’ which carries the meanings of disorder and uncertainty will be discovered on a metaphorical level. Hence, it will be relevant to represent the entropic historical context of the play, the entropic world of Scotland after the murder of King Duncan, the entropic characters of Macbeth and Lady Macbeth after committing the crime and the entropic language that characterizes the play.

Keywords: disorder, entropy, pessimist, metaphorical level, entropic historical context, entropic world of Scotland, entropic characters, entropic language.
Introduction:

It is enticing to begin with “beauty”; it can be seen and felt by the optimist eye and if ever its existence is denied by the pessimist, it is still sought. This notion does not contradict art; it is rather the implied condition of its being; its essence. In his *Aesthetics*¹, Baumgarten talked about “perfectible beauty” that according to which, the beauty of an artwork corresponds to the degree of its organization and order.

It is worth saying that any work of art can be seen as a sum of codes or messages communicated to a wide range of readers and to be deciphered, these codes or messages necessitate order in the syntactic form as in the semantic content for the sake of the work’s readability and comprehensibility. It is also not a new tradition that from the times of Greek philosophy, there was an association of the arts with the notion of order since the word ‘composition’ itself literally means ‘to put things in order’. This association, however, does not deny the fact that disorder may exist. It is “opined that ideally art must contain both the ordered and the disordered”² since “[w]hat is totally ordered can be perceived as static and boring…Yet what is totally disordered is incomprehensible”³.

In due course, if it is argued that “[t]he comprehensibility of literary texts may be associated with low entropy⁴, it is not odd to argue that the incomprehensibility of them may be associated with high entropy, the question then arises: what is ENTROPY?

1- Definition of Entropy:

Because many have borrowed the notion of entropy into practically every area of intellectual debate, it is relevant to give some definitions of the term presented by the wide variety of authors who “range widely from apocalypticists to mathematicians, physicists and physicians, to information theorists, to musicians and filmmakers, [and] to art and literary critics…”⁵

First, it should be affirmed that it is derived from the Greek ‘*entropia*’ that is ‘transformation’, ‘*trope*’ that is ‘turning’⁶. The term was initially discovered in the field of physics by the German physicist Rudolph Clausius in 1850. With his Second Law of Thermodynamics or what is called ‘the pessimist/hopeless option’, the universe is considered as a closed system in which there is a continuous loss or dissipation of energy making this system move from a higher level of order to a more disordered state. The universe then reaches equilibrium or ‘heat death’. This tragic ending to nothingness is irreversible and as such,

---

¹ See “Kant’s Critique of Baumgarten’s Aesthetics”, J. Colin McQuillan. St. Mary’s University
³ Ibid.
⁴ Ibid.(p.5)
⁵ Ibid.(p.3)
entropy is destined to govern humans’ and all living creatures’ future. Being so, “[i]f we turn now to […] tragedy, the applicability of the concept of entropy becomes readily apparent”\(^7\) since the archetypal tragic situation as defined by Geoffrey Brereton is “that of the individual or the community going down a slope which leads to destruction”\(^8\).

The meaning of entropy in this case is mainly metaphorical since “the concept is used more or less as a metaphor or synonym for chaos, disorder, breakdown, dysfunctions…”\(^9\). Then, no wonder that “there have been alluded to or defined implicitly psychological, social, [linguistic and] literary entropies”\(^10\).

I will deal with entropy metaphorically while considering briefly the historical context of Macbeth, the setting of the play, the major characters (Macbeth and Lady Macbeth) and the play’s linguistic complexity.

2- The Interplay Between the Historical Context and the Fictional Text:

Understanding entropy metaphorically, one can talk about social entropy (italics mine). For instance, “in the social sphere, it (i.e. entropy) has been characterized as […] disorder, disorganization… and incoherence”\(^11\). While having information about the historical context of Macbeth, understanding the play will be more probable. It is worth saying that Shakespeare had most likely written it in 1606 after receiving an ‘amicable letter’ from his patron, King James I. The play, it is clear, was directly under the royal censorship and from this fact, its focal interest in the theme of good or bad kingship is justified.

Its diabolizing representation of witches is also justified since the King himself was known by his rigid persecution of them. Macbeth’s treason of King Duncan is furthermore, an obvious reference to the Gunpowder Plot of 1605, also called The Jesuit Treason in which an attempt to assassinate King James I by a Henry Garnett, failed.

The misogynistic tone in the play best seen in Lady Macbeth, I venture to say, ‘the fourth witch’ along with the Three Witches is understood by the absence of a Queen of England to flatter, and the possible ‘homosexual’ orientation of Shakespeare. It is not shocking that the disordered, disruptive context of early seventeenth-century Jacobean England that was in a transitional period from female less rigid monarchy to male more rigid monarchy based on absolutism, had its impact on the playwright and as such on the composition of the play itself. The rigidity of the context might be a framing to the artistic imagination and that is why, among all the plays that were written during king James I’s reign, Macbeth is considered as the one most clearly reflecting Shakespeare’s relationship with the sovereign. His tragedy, with an implied menacing tone, might have been


\(^{8}\) Ibid.(p.267)

\(^{9}\) Davis, Philip J. “Entropy and Society: Can the Physical/ Mathematical Notions of Entropy be Usefully Imported into the Social Sphere?” (p. 6) http://www.dam.brown.edu/documents/Entropy.pdf (consulted on 11 March, 2015)

\(^{10}\) Ibid.

\(^{11}\) Ibid.(p.3)
written to remind the audience about the possibility of a terrifying chaotic and rotten state like Scotland in case of a ‘cursed’ assassination of its ‘Representative of God on Earth’ like King Duncan.

The play, as it is stated by many scholars, was also entitled in the backstage world of theatre as ‘MacBee the Scottish King’ or ‘the Scottish Play’ since some believed that it was cursed and thus would not mention its title aloud. So, let us consider now the entropic setting of Macbeth.

3- The Entropic Setting of Macbeth:

In Macbeth, there is a “re-enactment of the “heat-death” of [...] cities”\(^{12}\). Scotland, after the murder of King Duncan that goes “[a]gainst the use of nature” (Act I, scene 3), becomes a disordered kingdom moving quickly towards entropy or its catastrophic/ apocalyptic end. The inseparability between the king and the land (or nature) is much noticed since the fate of the latter was connected to the fate of the former and thus the criminal act resulted in the breakdown of the natural world: “And his gash’d stabs looked like a breach in nature (Act 3, scene 1).

From the beginning of Act I, scene 1, this disruptive process was led by the Three Witches whose very appearance was accompanied by thunder, lightning and fog. It was then led by Lady Macbeth who incited her husband to kill Duncan while challenging his sense of manhood and it was finally led by Macbeth himself. This chaotic world was sinking into a bath of blood after the murder not only of King Duncan but also of his chamberlains, Banquo, whose own descendents according to the Witches’ prophecy would inherit the throne as well as Macduff’s wife and children. It is not surprising that in such a hellish world, children who usually stand for innocence, regeneration and hope cannot survive. It is not surprising also “that darkness does the face of earth entomb” (Act V, scene 1) and “night encroaches on the province of day”.

In such a disordered world, entropy does not only characterize the landscape but also the characters.

4- Macbeth and Lady Macbeth and Psychological Entropy:

In Macbeth, there is also a “re-enactment of the heat-death of individuals”\(^{13}\) themselves. As a matter of fact, the entropic environment surrounding them affects them both physically and psychologically; they can be both considered as victims of entropy who are in “a gradual collapsing toward inertia or death”\(^{14}\). Being so, the physical deterioration can be seen in the symbolic emasculation of the ‘fatherless’ Macbeth who wears “a fruitless crown” and carries a “barren sceptre” and in the possible sterility of Lady Macbeth who seems to convey an unconscious rancor when wanting her milk to be changed into gall. Her verbal violence goes against the conventional, stereotypical image of femininity that is also tightly linked to motherhood. Furthermore, the external physical deterioration is nothing else but a reflection of the inner decadence of Macbeth.


\(^{13}\) Ibid.

and Lady Macbeth. It is evident here that “in the play the outlines of [a] frightful psychic cloud”\textsuperscript{15} is perceived. In a world moving towards its irreversible tragic end, both characters’ *psychological entropy* (italics mine) “increases until […] a catastrophe (which takes the form of mental debilitation or even death or suicide)”\textsuperscript{16} occurs. The reason behind such a spiritual disorder of the two characters is an immense sense of guilt following the commitment of the crime. It was Macbeth who was at first subject to a “fatal vision” of an imagined dagger that was “proceeding from the heat-oppressed mind” (Act II, scene 1). Just after the act of murder, his paranoid restlessness seemed obvious from his repetitive short and rapid questions: “who’s there, what, ho?”, “didst thou not hear a noise?”, “Hark”, “Whence is that knocking?” (Act II, scene 2).

Unexpectedly, Lady Macbeth also, who seemed impatient with her husband’s psychological disturbance and the one who finished the murder of King’s guards and placed the bloody dagger with them, succumbed herself to mental tortures. In Act V, scene 1, the latter’s “eyes are open”\textsuperscript{17} “but their sense is shut”; she clearly suffered from hysterical somnambulism and her disordered language was a reflection of her disordered psyche: “Out, damned spot! Out, I say! One: two: why, then, ‘tis time to do’t. Hell is murky”.

But, to what extent is the language of *Macbeth* is disordered and complex?

5- **Linguistic Entropy in Macbeth**:  

It is worth noting that *linguistic entropy* resides in the complexity of language; a complexity on terms of structure and meaning. For instance, the art theorist and psychologist Rudolf Arnheim stated that “the highly complex […] works of Shakespeare [are] not easily grasped”\textsuperscript{17}. Somewhere else, it is also emphasized that “Shakespeare seems hard to read.”\textsuperscript{18}

The tragedy of *Macbeth*, for instance, is a “tragedy of language” and “communication death”. The play abounds with entropic language that is characterized by ambiguity, irrelevancy and redundancy. It is true that Macbeth and Lady Macbeth’s language is imperfect being a reflection of their mental disorder, but the Witches, the “imperfect speakers” as Macbeth once referred to, are the best distorting manipulators of it; they play with language that instead of communicating truth, it hides it. What they say is said in the midst of thunder and lightning, when earth has bubbles and the cauldron is boiling; that is in the midst of noise and ‘hurlyburly’, the ‘truth’ is distorted through inversions or the unusual word order: “Her husband’s to Aleppo gone (Act I, scene 3), chiasmus (i.e. two corresponding pairs arranged in a parallel inverse order: “Fair is foul, and foul is fair” (Act I, scene 1), redundancy of irrelevant information best seen in unnecessary repetitions: “And munch’d, and munch’d, and munch’d”/ “I’ll do, I’ll do, and I’ll do”/ “show me, show me”/ “A

\begin{thebibliography}{99}


\bibitem{16} Deskin, Sean. “Entropy in Two American Road Narratives” (p.3)


\bibitem{18} “Reading Shakespeare’s Language » « http://web.calstatela.edu/faculty/jgarret/417/Reading-Shakespeare.pdf” (consulted on 17 March, 2015)

\end{thebibliography}
drum, a drum” (Act I, scene 3). There is also equivocation or literary quibble in which something is said to mean another; here Macbeth is played on him, he is victim of his own verbal idealism: when in Act IV, scene 1, the witches warned him: “Macbeth! Macbeth! beware Macduff” and when they insured him that “none of woman born/ Shall harm” him and that he “shall never vanquish’d be until/ Great Birnam wood to Dunsinane hill/ Shall come against him”; he felt secure since all men are “of woman born” and forests can never move. He was disillusioned later on when he learnt in Act V, scene 8 that the English army was advancing on Dunsinane shielded with boughs cut from Birnam wood (i.e. the forest was indeed coming to Dunsinane). Macduff, Macbeth also learnt, was not “of woman born” but was “untimely ripped” from his mother’s womb. Macbeth approached his irreversible tragic end. His murder and Lady Macbeth suicide meant a reestablishment of order in Scotland promised by Malcolm, the new king. Now, “that unnatural night, by reinversion, becomes day again with [his] help”\(^{19}\).

**Conclusion:**

The inclusion of the notion of entropy in literature is still debated. Some see it as a good example of interdisciplinarity blurring the dividing line between it and science. Others think that with this very inclusion, the gap between the two fields of knowledge becomes even wider; for example, they consider that the applicability of entropy as an index to measure the syntactic and semantic complexity of a literary work is still very relative, which means that science can never be on equal terms with literature. On a metaphorical level, the utility of entropy has always been acknowledged; some goes further to say: “Art, Therefore Entropy”\(^{20}\).

---


References


-Davis, Philip J. “Entropy and Society: Can the Physical/ Mathematical Notions of Entropy be Usefully Imported into the Social Sphere?”. Division of Applied Mathematics. Providence, RI: Brown University.

-Deskin, Sean. “Entropy in Two American Road Narratives” (p.3) “http://scholarworks.uno.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2226&context=td”


-« Reading Shakespeare’s Language » « http://web.calstatela.edu/faculty/jgarret/417/Reading-Shakespeare.pdf”

Music & Social Criticism in Nigeria

Thompson Olusegun Ewata
Federal University of Technology, Akure, Ondo State, Nigeria

Abstract

Fela Anikulapo-Kuti used Yabis, his style of music and the Pidgin English to address the political, economic, and social conditions of the common man, the black race and the world. To him, music serves the multidimensional purposes of entertaining as well as educating the masses on the shortcomings in the society; and healing the state – ultimately, the world. The song, Beast of no nation (Anikulapo-Kuti, 1989), analysed in the paper, describes a state of betrayal of the innocent citizens by officers of the state and government of the day. It also takes a swipe at the United Nations. As a social commentator, Fela employed the medium of satire through the means of parody to ridicule the Nigerian judicial system; the government and comment on the vanity of the United Nations. Using the discourse analytical tool of conversation analysis, the paper adopted the concepts of adjacency pairs, turn taking and turn switch in analysing the sequencing of turns in the Beast of no nation as an interaction and as a real language element that communicates meaning to the intended audience. The paper discovered the song used different interaction devices, among which are: discourse markers (46, of 5 types, 2 universal and 3 localised), silence or short pauses (10), turns (150), adjacency pairs (54) as well as turn switches other transitional devices. The most significant finding of the paper is the extent to which Fela has used the Pidgin English to effectively communicate his message to his audience using the discourse elements of the pidgin.

Keywords: conversation analysis, Fela Anikulapo, yabis, Pidgin, social commentary
1. Introduction

Nigerian Pidgin English (henceforth pidgin) plays a prominent role in communication in Nigeria, at the level of interpersonal, intrapersonal, formal, informal, social, intimacy, events and programmes on radio, television, adverts, entertainment, social media, etc. as everyone, in every socioeconomic group within the country understands and/or communicates in pidgin (Akande, 2008; Farclas, 1996; Osoba, 2015). Pidgin is spoken by every Nigerian, and some non-Nigerians. Apart from pidgin been a lingua franca and/or a home language, in homes where the parents are from different ethnic groups or where parents live a multi-ethnic group environment (Balogun, 2013), in Nigeria, it has now become the language of solidarity as exemplified by the Afrobeat legend, Fela Anikulapo (1938–1997) in his life time. Take any two Nigerians from different socio-cultural backgrounds, or any two Nigerian students (undergraduates or postgraduate), pidgin is their language of communication. As a matter of fact, any two Nigerians from different regions or states, outside the shores of the country communicate in pidgin than any other language (Onyeche, 2004). The prevalence of different local languages that would not yield their pride of places to other languages; the historical antecedent of pidgin in the country and a Nigerian government that was not ready to bear “unwarranted financial and material cost” (Awung, 2013) on any indigenous language has made the pidgin a popular language in the country. Thus, among Nigerians – within and without, pidgin is the mark of their “Nigerianess” (Onyeche, 2004) compared to Tolais who addressed strangers in pidgin and see it as an offence to address fellow Tolais in pidgin (Mosel, 1979, p. 163). Even among educated Nigerians, when they speak the English language among themselves, they create a distance between them; to bridge this gap, pidgin comes to the rescue (Osa, 1986; Osoba, 2015). To modern Nigerians too, Pidgin is the language of oneness, equality and comradeship. It is not a surprise therefore that the late Afrobeat legend, Fela Anikulapo used pidgin as the medium of expression of his music as it reflects “productivity, simplicity, acceptability and understanding” (Balogun, 2013) above all, creativity. The language has since graduated from the incidental contact language situation in a multilingual setting (Bellama, Nkele & Yudom, 2006, p. 6; Edwards, 1994; Mosel, 1979) brought about by the English imperialists’ commercial, bureaucratic, and missionarv activities (Edwards, 2013) in the Nigerian territory to a mother tongue/home language, second language and a lingua franca in the multilingual Nigerian society. Pidgin has since become not only a means of communication for Nigerians, it now provides psychological, sociological, social and political reliefs to them (Edwards, 2013).

It might be difficult to give a definite timeframe of the origin of the pidgin in Nigeria, as there is no fossilized evidence to tell us this. However, one form of pidgin or the other has always been on the Nigerian environment because of the nation’s multilingual characteristics – “In fact, pidginized Hausa is still spoken by non-native speakers of Hausa in the markets around Lake Chad while a pidginized form of Igbo is used at present in some Niger Delta markets” (Farclas, 1996, p. 2). The English-lexifier Pidgin version arose in the Nigerian context (as in other parts of the world, Papua New Guinea, Solomon Islands, Vanuatu, Ghana, Sierra Leone, Gambia, Cameroon etc.) because the British colonialists needed catechists to teach the converted southern natives Christianity tenets as well as clerks, messengers, cooks, and stewards to help the colonialists with domestic and administrative duties (Osa, 1986). At the same time, the different nationalities that
made up the Nigerian nation have no shared language among them, but need to communicate regularly, at least for the purpose of trade and they do not want to learn each other’s’ languages (Thomason, 2008, p. 243). Most importantly, the colonialists – Portuguese and British did not want to learn the language(s) of the natives (Faraclas, 1996). The different nationalities that came together did not require fluent speakers of the different languages, but a passable language to transact their business in (Thomason, 2001, p. 1). The lexicon of the pidgin is drawn from the diverse indigenous languages and English (cf Versteegh, 1984, p. 1). In terms of structure – grammar, morphology and phonology, pidgin combines the elements of English and the indigenous languages and “is typically simpler than those native languages in so far as it has fewer words, less morphology, and a more restricted range of phonological and syntactic options” (Rickford, 1978). With time, pidgin has developed its own structures and is the most widely used language in Nigeria. There are more speakers of pidgin than the official (English) language and the other indigenous languages put together (Osoba, 2015) and it is gradually becoming, that is, if it has become, the most widely spoken language on the African continent (Faraclas, 1996, p. 1).

Pidgin in Nigeria, like in other parts of the world is a rarely written, but widely spoken medium of communication (Holm, 2004, p. 4; Swaan, 2010, p. 72) as there was no need to write it down because it was a language of necessity. It was not taught in any school and was not used till now in any formal or official form of communication. However, that has changed as the Nigerian pidgin is now written though the standard orthography has not yet been agreed on. This may be due to the fact that no recognised authority is responsible for its orthography. At the same time, the orthography would hardly be uniform because of the multilingual nature of Nigeria. Take for example, the Yoruba pidgin speaker says “pele” to mean sorry or take care while the Igbo speaker says the same thing, but spells it differently “kpele”. More so, it is still not in the curriculum of the educational system of the country. However, the language is enjoying a lot of academic activities in the country’s intellectual circle as it is now studied in its various forms and uses which will help in the standardisation process. Already, studies have been conducted in the various forms and uses of the language. This includes: Onyeche, 2004 - that studies its role in the Nigerian community in Sweden, Aziza, 2015 studies aspects of its syntax, Mowarin, 2014 - its bilingual verbs, Balogun, 2013 - its defence, Faraclas, 1996 - its existence, Zabus, 2006, its use in poetry, Osoba, 2014 & 2015 – its use in in media adverts & analysis of its discourse, Mensah & Ndimele, 2014 - its linguistic creativity in advertising, among others.

The specific objective of this study, therefore, is to show that pidgin like any other language is a language that is used in communicating meaning, exhibiting the users’ worldview and that it can function in any human activity

2. Methodology

Because a song is a speech (talk or interaction), it is apt to say conversational interactions happen in it. A song is taken as a speech before consideration is given to its written form, which happens in the course of its composition. The lyrics of Beast of no nation (Anikulapo-Kuti, 1989) was copied from the online edition, which is similar to the one on the sleeve of the album, from:
The lyrics transcripts formed the core data of the analysis for this paper. The transcript of the song was taken as a discourse element as it is seen as a text. It was then subjected to textual analysis taken as a dialogue between two interlocutors: Fela, the speaker, and his band members, his audience or his receiver in line with the theory of conversation analysis.

3. Theoretical Framework: Conversation Analysis as a Tool in Social Interaction

Everything humans do starts with language. It is language that separates us from other animals on the planet. Our language is what we use with ourselves and others in talking about our fears, aspirations, frustrations, joys etc. Therefore to understand humans, it is important to understand the minute details of their being – which could best be done when we analyse their use of language from the basic level, the talk– social interaction, with fellow men, “to explicate processes of inference upon which the everyday social order is based” (Peräkylä, Antaki, Vehviläinen & Leudar, 2008, p. 12) “in constructing shared and specific understandings of 'where they are' within a social interaction” (Heritage, 1998, p. 3).

Conversation analysis (hence CA), a distinctively sociological discourse analytical tool is related to ethnomethodology in its concern for details (Heritage; Peräkylä, Antaki, Vehviläinen & Leudar). CA is the systematic analysis of real-life 'recorded, naturally occurring talk-in-interaction’ as a social activity so as to understand how human produce and interpret their tightly organised and coherent interactions in actual contexts. Like other discourse analytical tools, CA focuses on understanding how conversation is organized and structured (Person, 1996, p. 16).

Human conversation or talk is a collaborative effort that each participant works towards making a successful venture out of. CA is therefore concerned with understating the constituent and organizing features – “characterised as locally mangled, party-administered, interactionally controlled, and sensitive to recipient design – of these collaborative efforts (Sacks, Schegloff & Jefferson, 1974). This is working on the assumption that every human interaction is a very ordered, structurally organised activity in which (i) the goals of the participants are more limited and institution-specific, (ii) restrictions on the nature of interactional contributions are often in force, and (iii) institution- and activity-specific inferential frameworks are common (Drew & Heritage, 1992 cited in Heritage, 1998; Hutchby & Wooffitt, 1998; Thornbury & Slade, 2006). CA relies on real-life (naturally occurring data) rather than the 1) interview-data as expressions of opinions and attitudes or descriptions of scenes not witnessed by the researcher, 2) observational studies relying on field notes or coding procedures, 3) idealized or invented examples based on the researcher's own native intuitions, and 4) experimental methodologies… All of these kinds of data are seen as too much a product of the researcher's or informant's manipulation, selection, or reconstruction, based on preconceived notions of what is probable or important (Heritage & Atkinson, 1984: 2-3, cited in (Have, 1986)

The rejection of these data sources by CA makes it unique as the end product it produces with the original naturally occurring data makes its findings the most sophisticated and robust.
account of language in action (Wooffitt, 2005, p. 10) as such findings could not have been produced by any researcher’s imagination. The cohesive relation that exists in the conversation/text is what is important to the analysts in the study of human conversations (Thornbury & Slade, p. 108). Cohesion in conversation is achieved through grammatical and lexical cohesive devices (partly through the grammar and partly through the vocabulary (Halliday & Hasan, 1976, p. 6). The cohesion is brought about by the sequences of the actions. According to Heritage, the underlining theory of CA is that whatever meaning that is derived from any action is as a result of the preceding actions and that sequences of action are pivotal social context of any human action. The CA theory encompasses three interrelated claims:

1. In constructing their talk, participants normally address themselves to preceding talk and, most commonly, the immediately preceding talk (Sacks 1987 [1973], 1992 [1964-72]; Schegloff and Sacks 1973; Schegloff 1984). In this simple and direct sense, their talk is context-shaped.

2. In doing some current action, participants normally project (empirically) and require (normatively) that some 'next action' (or one of a range of possible 'next actions') should be done by a subsequent participant (Schegloff 1972). They thus create (or maintain or renew) a context for the next person's talk.

3. By producing their next actions, participants show an understanding of a prior action and do so at a multiplicity of levels - for example, by an 'acceptance', someone can show an understanding that the prior turn was complete, it was addressed to them, it was an action of a particular type (e.g., an invitation), and so on. These understandings are (tacitly) confirmed or can become the objects of repair at any third turn in an on-going sequence (Schegloff 1992). Through this process they become 'mutual understandings' created through a sequential 'architecture of intersubjectivity' (Heritage, 1984 cited in Heritage, 1998).

Categorising Beast of no nation as a conversation/dialogue

Because the song, Beast of no nation, and in fact most Fela’s songs have interactional elements (dialogue), we shall view it as a conversation or talk-in-interaction. Using the parameters of Thornbury & Slade, the song may be considered a conversation because:

i. Conversation is spoken
ii. Conversation happens in real time
iii. Conversation takes place in a shared context
iv. Conversation is interactive
v. Conversation is interpersonal
vi. Conversation is informal
vii. Conversation is expressive of identity
viii. Conversation in other modes – conversation could come in different modes apart from the face to face usual person to person interaction we know. A typical case in point is the dramatic conversation where characters address other characters not present if they were present, for dramatic effect created by the dramatist or the case of Fela’s music, where he talks to members of the group as if talking to the audiences. This is a common literary device in African story telling as
the audience is expected to partake in the plot development of the story as they are expect to act as backup singers to the story teller(s) (Thornbury & Slade, 2006, p. 8 – 23)

Characteristics of different communicative events

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>spoken</th>
<th>unscripted, spontaneous</th>
<th>dialogic / multilogic</th>
<th>synchronic (vs transactional) function</th>
<th>interpersonal (vs transactional) function</th>
<th>symmetric relation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>email exchange</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>news broadcast</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>×</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>interview</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>×</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>service</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>×</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>encounter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>classroom talk</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>×</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>chat room exchange</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>×</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>conversation</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Song?</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Thornbury & Slade, 2006, p. 26)

The last element (song), carries a question mark because if we are to add it to this table, since it is the focus of this paper what would it yield in the categorisation of Thornbury & Slade. For the purpose of this study it will yield the marked fields. A song is spoken, it is scripted (before been spontaneous), it is dialogic, synchronous, it performs interpesonal function and its symmetrical.

4. The Concept of Adjacency Pairs and Turn Taking

As mentioned earlier, sequencing plays a prominent role in meaning making of human actions, as exemplified through human interaction. Humans depend on the sequence of preceding actions, which in turn becomes a norm, in making meaning. We shall apply the concept of adjacency pairs to our understanding of conversation analysis so to have a clearer picture of the organisation of turn-taking in conversation.

According to Schegloff & Sacks (1973, cited in (Tsui, 1989), a class of sequences which they called adjacency pairs exists in conversation which is widely operative. Adjacency pairs are sequences of moves in turn-taking in interaction in which the second part of which is functionally dependent on the first (Thornbury & Slade, p. 29). They are pairs of ordered utterances with identifiable difference between the first and the second parts of the pairs; it also requires that once the first part is given, the particular second or range of second parts is required. For example, a greeting in the first part, will require another form of greeting as the reply, an invitation will require a response (acceptance or declination), a question will produce an answer or a clarifying question (Hutchby & Wooffitt, p. 39) –to the question and clarification sequence, this caveat is added:
The simple production of the first part of an adjacency pair does not necessarily legislate that the second part will follow immediately. Before the provision of the expected second part there may be insertion sequences … often composed of embedded and nested question–answer adjacency pairs, during which matters relevant to the first part are addressed before the second part is produced.

Gene: Is Maggie there. Q1
Lana: ·hh Uh who is calling. Q2
Gene: Uh, this’s Genc:. Novaki. A2
Lana: Uh just a mom’nt A1

(Taken from Sacks, 1992, Vol II: 546–7; start of telephone conversation, cited in (Wooffitt, p. 175))

We see in question 1 that Gene (the caller) wanted to know if Maggie was there but Lana did not answer right. He asked another question, seeking clarification to know who the caller was In turn 4 when Gene identified who the caller was and Lana was ready to divulge the whereabouts of Maggie. This is the “embedded and nested question” that is been talked about above. This tells us the whole concept of adjacency pairs does not mean that it should be strictly adhere to. It only shows that there are some utterances that conventionally paired such that “on the production of a first pair part, the second part becomes relevant and remains so even if it is not produced in the next serial turn. The concept of adjacency pairs show that interlocutors and the analysts their “ongoing understanding and sense-making of one another's talk” (Hutchby & Wooffitt, p. 40 - 1).

Turns-Taking: This is the ordering of the right to speak in interactions. Interlocutors do not jump into conversation without giving room for the other(s) to talk. Human conversation is orderly and systematically arraigned such that the one talking gives room for the other to finish speaking before the other takes over so that “no one participant holding the floor for more time than it is considered appropriate” (Thornbury & Slade, p. 15). If there is need to cut in by another person, there are mechanisms for doing that, such that the person talking does not feel insulted or the one intending to cut in does not appear uncultured. This is the concept of face. There two types of face, positive and negative face. The positive face is "the positive consistent self-image or 'personality' (crucially including the desire that this self-image be appreciated and approved of) claimed by interactants" (Brown & Levinson, 1987, p. 61). According to Sacks, Schegloff& Jefferson (p. 696), turn presupposes economy which in turn affects how they are been distributed the relative value associated with it. It is this orderly manner that the “turns” shifts from one person to another it is this order form that is of importance to use in the analysis of this paper.

5. The use of pidgin in Nigeria

For wider coverage, accessibility and acceptability of programmes and policies, that affect or pertain to the masses, in the country, the language of expression is pidgin. In Nigeria, when the governments (local, state or federal), organisation (either for profit or non-profit) or world agencies want their policies or the impact of the efforts taken to the grassroots, they resolved to the use of pidgin. In Nigeria, and other West African countries where pidgin is used, important information now comes in Pidgin English. It is not surprising to see in pidgin, the United Nations “The Millennium Development Goals Reports 2005” (https://unic.un.org/aroundworld/unics/common/documents/publications/mdg/lagos_mdg_pidgin_english.pdf; the United nations’ “Universal Declaration of Human Rights”

http://ijhcschiefeditor.wix.com/ijhcs
http://www.ohchr.org/EN/UDHR/Pages/Language.aspx?LangID=pcm), recently, a Christian organisation has an ongoing project of translating the bible into pidgin. To this, the organisation adds: “Praise the Lord! God is finally using Nigerian Pidgin Language Bible to bring His Word to the level and language which ordinary Nigerians can understand clearly!” – (http://www.mercy-christian-ministry.org/nigerian-pidgin-language-bible.html). Before the current attention on the language, it has played a significant role in the shaping of Nigerian literary works. Literary icons like Ken Saro Wiwa, Wole Soyinka, Chinua Achebe, Festus Iyayi, Buchi Emechita, Ben Okri, and the other Nigerian writers have all used pidgin one time or the other in their works to show the social class or educational status, relation of the characters (tenor of discourse) or for comic effects, in contributing to the overall 'meaning' of the communication (Osoba, 2015, p. 139) and as representations of speeches of real Nigerian people (Kersten, 2006). Apart from literary usages, pidgin has been used in other field in Nigeria. As mentioned earlier, it used in advertisements and other jingles on radio, television, billboard, newspapers and on the internet. It is even the main medium of expression in a radio station, Radio Nigeria 3 (Osoba, 2014). Other stations in most, if not all the states, in the country have air time dedicated to the use of pidgin in their programming slots. In the entertainment industry it is the language of choice of the Nigerian stand-up comedy, internet chatrooms, discussion boards and SMS exchanges (Mensah & Ndimele, 2013) it is used in films and television soaps, in music by no less a musical icons than Fela Anikulapo, Lugbaja, Femi Kuti, Tufac and the rest of them. It is used in some churches particularly in the south-south geopolitical zone of the country. Though not an official language, it is used in the propagation of government policies and programmes. Particularly in states like Edo, Delta, Rivers, Bayelsa and Cross River (Ugot & Ogundipe, 2011). It is the lingua franca of the military (army, navy and the air force) the paramilitary (police, customs, immigration etc.) barracks. In fact, it is the unofficial “official” language of the police stations (force) in the country. We have mention from inception of the paper that the pidgin is the language of communication for mutual intelligibility among Nigerians irrespective of age, creed, gender or status. It is the language of commerce which was the main reason that resulted in its existence in the first place. These and several other functions are performed by the pidgin in Nigeria.

6. Fela Anikulapo Kuti and Yabis Music

Born Olufela Olusegun Oludotun Ransome-Kuti (1938-97). Fela was the most popular, most controversial and the most followed African musician outside the shores of Africa (Olaniyan, 2001). His followership include: “the radical Nigerian intelligentsia, the street-smart youths of Lagos, members of the urban working class, and, in Europe and the U.S., a concatenation of black nationalists and white college students …” He was not only a musician, but a composer, and bandleader, ideological bricoleur, political gadfly, child of colonialism and father of Afro-beat (syncopated fusion of jazz, funk, and African beats (Shonekan, 2009); a mixture of American jazz and Yoruba folk music (Olatunji, 2009)), a trenchant social critic among others. Throughout his life time, “he spent a good deal of his creative energy mocking the elite African culture that birthed him and, in some important respects, laid the foundations for his art” (Waterman, 1998). Apart from being an accomplished musician, he was synonymous with protest. Though there are claims and counter-claims that his music not his pan-Africanist beliefs gave Fela fame (Osha, 2013). This
paper does not side any of the views, but dwells on the language of both Fela passions (music and pan-Africanist beliefs). Fela switched from English and Yoruba languages to Pidgin English, so as to reach a wider audience in Nigeria and abroad (Waterman, 1998). The choice of pidgin as the language of his political consciousness and music was borne out of consciousness and creativity (Labinjoh, 1982). Consciousness because he saw the happenings in his society and realised that the people of his newly independent nation have not woken up to the stark reality of being blacks, but see themselves as whites – “the African colonial mentality whereby alien cultural products and artefacts are uncritically acquired, becoming dominant over locally produced ones” (Labinjoh, p. 124) and thus took it upon himself to free the black man of his nation and the African continent of this mentality so that they can be proud of being blacks and their cultural heritage. The messages he needed to send in his music was meant for the ordinary Nigerians and Africans who he intended to awaken to the stark reality on the ground. Deviating from singing, the mundane issues of love, men, women, money and life in a music that is a fusion of different genres and cultures he needed to break it down to the people to make it understandable to them. Thus, pidgin came to the rescue. Pidgin therefore helped him sell his message and music to Nigerians who are multicultural and multilingual. With pidgin, his music is not domiciled in any region or tribe and this would make it appealing to the ordinary man on the street. At the same time, it will transcend national frontiers as pidgin is present in most (West) African countries. Through pidgin, Fela introduces a measure of freshness, originality and liveliness (Jesse, 2001) to his music (afrobeat - yabis) and the message of pan-Africanism he needed to propagate in it. The pidgin he used was not, under academic constraint, but out of choice (Ezenwa-Ohaeto cited in (Zabus, 2006)); it goes well with everyone (as the spoken to and the spoken about) amuses themselves in the simplicity of the language (Jesse, 2001). The use of pidgin by Fela also brings up a very important function of the language as it has from the eve of independence been conceived as a language of defiance of the literary establishment. At the same time, pidgin is seen as a language of stage performance or entertainment (Zabus, p. 119). Thus, through Afrobeat - the music and the message and yabis, his style of music narrative: … the songs do not exist only for their entertainment value, but develop story, mood, theme, communicating arts through music (Oikelome, 2013). Fela invented yabis (idiomatically, “abuse,” but more appropriately, “roasting” (Olaniyan, 2004, p. 51) taking from the verb form of the pidgin word yab – which literally means to make fun of or ridicule someone). Yabis is a style of dialogic communication done virtually in pidgin that served dual purposes for Fela as it afforded him the opportunity to air his criticism of the status quo in terms of the Nigerian government and its officials, African society and the world and for him to get feedbacks where he gauged the reactions of his audience (Oikelome, 2010). Yabis became Fela's satiric tool. As a tool, it gave him the chance to criticise the corruption in the nation, an individual or the world. On yabis nights, Fela sang satirical songs "deliberately composed with the aim of correcting an atrocity, a misdemeanour or sacrilege committed by either an individual or a corporate body within a particular society" (Olatunji, 2009) in the process making his audience, listeners or fans generate towards his objects of criticism “attitudes of amusement, contempt, scorn, or indignation” (Abrams, 1999, p. 275). Without being serious, Fela uses the medium of yabis to x-ray the Nigerian political, social and economy scenes for his audience. Fela’s objects of criticism are germane to the very existence of the country people and the black race. To get the message across to them, he required a medium that would not be too serious and that would require the least effort. He must have known that if he did
this through literary creativity of writing, like his cousin, Wole Soyinka, the audience he would reach would be limited and the effort be wasted as most Nigerians have no time or desire to read because of their economic situation. It is also important to state here that Soyinka used pidgin to pass his message to the Nigerian populace in his record, “etikarevolution”? If he used theatrical means of drama cum comedy too it would not have the desired effect he wanted “in that comedy evokes laughter mainly as an end in itself” thus satire suited his purpose in that “it uses laughter as a weapon, and against a butt that exists outside the work itself (Abrams, 1999). At the same time, the language of choice must not be too serious or difficult to understand in a multilingual and multicultural setting like Nigeria. In this regard, pidgin suits the situation perfectly as it understood by every Nigerian and (West) African, irrespective of class or status most importantly the masses – the oppressed and underprivileged – who are Fela’s main target.

This effort by Fela made his music become more acceptable by the masses and, eventually, by the children of the elite in Nigeria, who could not help but sing along with him at his concerts; in Pidgin English. So, unconsciously, pidgin crept in and maneuvered its way into the domains of the elite (Olatunji, 2009).

Since the introduction of the pidgin through yabis into Fela’s music, Olatunji claims it stimulates or motivates the people (the masses and down trodden – this includes the labour force, artisans, students and most times too, even professionals) to action against oppression and bad governance. Thus, through yabis music, Fela informed his audience who could be the students, professions, artisans, market men and women, members of the intellectual and all others of their roles as members of the vanguard against oppression and tyranny, reminding them of their cultural heritage and dignity of human existence, among other things.

7. Presentation of Data

Having thoroughly considered the data, the following findings were discovered, as making the song Beast of no nation as an interaction:

i. Discourse or interactional markers 46 (made up of 2 universal and 3 localised)
ii. Turns used in the song 150
iii. Adjacency pair 55
iv. Silence or pause for yield of turn or topic 10
v. Stylistic device: repetition, duplication, reduplication, elongation, gap fillers

8. Data Analysis

Music may be synonymous to drama in the sense that the interactions between the singers – the lead singer and chorus, accounts for how the plot unfolds just as the interactions of the characters helps in unravelling the plots in drama. In music, like in drama, the singer could sing alone without a backup or chorus as in the characters in drama talking to themselves (monologue) or they could talk to other characters (dialogue). In the Beast of no nation, Fela created a dramatic dialogue in which the lead singer talks to the chorus, invariably, the audience. He raises a
proposition which is replied to by the chorus. So in looking at the sequences of talks (interactions) in the song, we shall begin by paying attention to the notion of dramatic dialogue. Dialogic interaction does only involve characters using language to portray their world (views), it also encompasses extra-linguistics co-ordinates such as the spatio-temporal setting, the different roles and status of participants, the norms for speaking and the multi-layered speech itself (Ekram, n.d.). The dramatic dialogue in the song brings to light the issue of oral poetry or narration in the Nigerian (African) context as their thoughts, the actions and deeds are orally captured, in their poetry. Fela recreates this mode of discourse in his music by bring dialogue into the music thus involving the audience, and it became one of his selling points. The presence of dialogue in Fela’s music entails that there is turns and turn switches.

1. Ah- Let’s get now into another, underground spiritual game
2. Just go to help me the answer, go to say, “Aiya-kata”- Oh ya
3. O'feshe-Lu
4. AIYA-KATA *(after each line)
5. O'feshe- g'Ba

In the first two turns, Fela, as the lead singer, prepares the ground for the tone of the whole song. He starts by making the audience realise it is a joint effort or something that does not revolve around him alone. The conversational nature of the first turn sets the whole game rolling as he begins with a discourse marker or what conversation analysts refer to as “interactional signal”. They elements are “are used to mark shifts in the direction of the talk, and to manage the interaction”. They are elements like yes, yeah, yes all right, no, oh, well, so, but, etc. (Thornbury & Slade, p. 16; Schiffrin, 2001, p. 54). The interactional signal of the turn 1, “Ah” tells us the song is a spoken discourse. “ah” is a discourse signal of preparedness. it is replicated at the end of turn 2, with “oh ya” which is also a discourse transitional device that indicates to the pidgin discourse marker. The “Oh ya” in turn 2 is a transitional device indicating to the next speaker that the initial speaker has yielded the floor to them. Turn-yielding in human interactions may be done through “syntax, acoustics and prosody” (Gravano & Hirschberg, 2011). Here, Fela first uses an interactional device to take turn at speaking and uses another interactional device to yield the floor to the next speaker. While the first interactional device is universal in nature, the second is localised as it is a pidgin interactional device with Yoruba substrate. This confirm the notion that pidgin combines the elements of English and the indigenous languages (Rickford, 1978). This further supports the view that pidgin is a language on its own rights that is used for communication by a group of people and this is what the users use in portraying their worldviews. Having prepared the ground in turns 1, 2 & 3 that the others are expected to participate in the whole scenario of the song, we see this displayed in turn 4 when they replied to the proposition of turn 3 - “O'feshe-Lu”. “AIYA-KATA” becomes their reply to turn 3. The interjection of the chorus helps in no small ways in the plot development of the story of the song. This continues till Fela interjected with another interactional signal in turn 16.

At the same time, the first part of a functionally dependent second part has been set in motion in turn 2. Fela tells the chorus the format of the reply to his call. This is in conformity to the concept of the adjacency pairs in which the first part requires a complementary second part that is
functionally dependent on the first part. Thus in 3 when Fela says “O'feshe-Lu” turn 4 produces the “functionally dependent second part” – “AIYA-KATA” of the call which is the answer to it. Here again, the song answers to been an interaction that interlocutors have to give corresponding second parts to an initial second parts. This is part of what makes the discourse (song) coherent as a unified whole not something that analysts created or imaged and concocted together.

In the song, there are 54 adjacency pairs usage. This further qualifies the song in the realm of interactional/spoken discourse.

16. Oh...

This another universal interactional signal to signal that the floor about to yield or be taken by another speaker. In all 46 (made up of: “ah” 1, “ee-oh” 18, “oh” 25, “oh ya” 1, “eh ji keke 1) interactional/discourse markers are used in the song. Of the 5 markers used 46 instances in the song, 2 are universal (ah, oh) while the rest 3 (ee-oh, oh-ya and eh ji keke) are localised.

17. Basket mouth wan start to leak again, oh-
18. BASKET MOUTH WAN OPEN MOUTH AGAIN, OH
19. Abi** you don forget I say I sing, ee-oh **(is it not)
20. BASKET MOUTH WAN OPEN MOUTH AGAIN, OH
21. Oh, I sing, I say, I go my mouth like basket, ee-oh, Malanu Bia-gbe-re

(2x)

Having indicated the turn-taking signal in 16, Fela continues in 17 and the chorus replies in 18. This is done till 21. Both Fela and the chorus play with discourse marker “oh” as they turned it into a structural component of the song. However, in turn 21, to 23, another interactional signal into the structure of the song “ee-oh” then he code mixes pidgin and Yoruba which is the interpretation of “I go my mouth like basket”. On the literary level too, this utterance, which is a simile, means he (Fela) will say everything without necessarily covering or without holding anything. In the African worldview, the basket has no cover, it cannot hide anything - whatever is in it is for public consumption. The adjacency pairs concept continues in this discourse as “BASKET MOUTH WAN OPEN MOUTH AGAIN, OH” is the complementary functional part of the first part in 17. The last element in 23 apart from it being a structural part of the song, is also an interactional (transitional) device signifying a turn switch.

24. Fela, wetin you go sing about?
25. DEM GO WORRY ME... *(after each line) (3x)
26. Dem go worry me, worry me-- worry, worry, worry, worry
27. DEM GO WORRY ME *(After each line)
28. Dey wan to make us sing about prison
29. Dem go worry me, worry me-- worry, worry all over da town
30. Dey wan to know about prison life
31. Dem go worry me, worry me-- worry, worry all over da town *(repeat stanza)
32. Fela, wetin you go sing about?
33. DEM GO WORRY ME
34. Dem go worry me, worry me-- worry, worry, worry, worry
35. The time weh I dey, for prison, I call am "inside world"
36. The time weh I dey outside prison, I call am "outside world"
37. Na craze world, na be outside world
38. CRAZE** WORLD *(after each line) / **(crazy)
39. Na be outside- da police-i dey
40. Na be outside- da soldier dey …

In 24, he begins another discourse – that of people asking him what he was going to sing about after his release from prison. In 25, the chorus echoes the argument that people wanted to know his next line of action. This continues from 24 to 67, then he introduces the message he has to pass to his audience – the difference between the prison yard and the free world.

Also, in turn switch, apart from the syntax, acoustics and prosody, interactant also signify turn switch through silence. When the person speaking keeps quiet – waiting for a silence longer than a pre-specified threshold, typically ranging from 0.5 to 1s (Ferrer et al), it signifies the current speaker has yielded the floor. If however, the next speaker does not take over and the current speaker still has something to say or has not finished the thought they were pursing, the speaker can resume speaking because there is something to be said to complete the thought process. This is what happens in 16, 23, 67, 85, 90, 105, 111, 134, 140 & 146. It is this usage that accounts for the 10 instances the interaction transitional device was used.

In 67, after the initial silence, Fela resumes his argument about the madness outside the prison yard which is supposed to be the sane world. He calls everyone’s attention to the stance of the regime that sent him to prison how they have no value of respect for the people or country they govern. This argument is not out of place here because the regime of General Muhamadu Buhari and his second in command, major General Tunde Idiagbon came to power through a coup d’etat as such do not hold the governed any apologies for their statement of derogating the entire people of the country.

72. "My people are us-e-less, My people are sens-i-less, My people are indiscipline"

We still notice the use of discourse interactional markers “ee-oh and oh“too as they appear prominently in 68,70,71,73,76,77, 79,81 - 84 & 88. The turn switch mechanism of a momentary pause was employed in this aspect of the song as there was a momentary pause indicating turn switch as Fela paused and the chorus takes over. The pause switch/yield device is applied again as Fela takes over the floor to make his next statements as he transits from commenting on the Nigerian government to the world stage. Fela then takes a swap at the world organisation, United Nations to comment on the abnormality of the organisation. In doing this, he moved away from his local, Nigerian and African audience to talk to the world.

Apart from the above devices, Fela also employed duplication of words to drive home his point. We see this prominently used in the song. For example: 3, - 15 and the rest of the places. At the same time, the song contains repetition. This is a musical and discourse device that creates musicality for the discourse being pursed and for emphasis. This is used in 4, 7, 14, 21, 25, 31, 90, 92, 104, 105, 111, 124, 131, 133, 140, 146, & 149 (17 instances) in the song. The song also employed elongation, reduplication and gap filler. All this interactional devices further drive home the point that Beast of no nation is an interactional piece and should be considered a discourse or text.
9. Conclusions

From the analysis of the song, *Beast of no nation*, we may conclude based on the discourse pattern, the concept of adjacency pairs, the interaction(al) devices of turn taking and switch, tone and tenor of discourse and other discourse and conversational devices in the song that it conforms to the conversational or interactional convention and as such can be classed as a conversation/interaction as the song is interactive – there is active turn taking and turn switch between the characters (Fela and the chorus) of the song “in that it is jointly constructed and multi-authored”. More so, the song is interpersonal in that it is done through the medium of speech (spoken), the tenor is informal that is, interaction between familiars. Above all, the song is informative as it calls the attention of the audience to the happening in the society (Nigeria), the continent of Africa and the world in general. It is expressive of the identity of the participants and the audience. The use of pidgin put them in one frame, the oppressed of the world – Fela was sent to prison by a judge who is supposed to unbiasedly interpret and uphold the law, the government of the country has no regard for the dignity of the governed and the world state is no better as the leaders do their own things without consideration for the rest of the world – the head of the apartheid regime in South Africa, Botha is friend to the supposed defenders of the world, Reagan and Thatcher, Iran fight Iraq, Britain went to war with Argentina, there is polarisation of the world in West bloc and East bloc etc. The use of the pidgin socially places Fela and the rest of his audience in the same social class – the oppressed of the world. The song also uses several instances of transitional devices to show it conversational nature, that the *Beast of no nation* is a song qualifies and that it is conversation in other mode.
References


Appendix


1. Ah- Let's get now into another, underground spiritual game
2. Just go to help me the answer, go to say, "Aiya-kata"- Oh ya
3. O'feshe-Lu
4. AIYA-KATA *(after each line)*
5. O'feshe- g'Ba
6. O'feshe-Woh3
7. AIYA-KATA *(after each line)*
8. O'feshe-Weng
9. Aiyà kata
10. Aiyà Koto
11. Aiyà Kiti
12. Aiyà Kutu
13. O'feshe-Lu
14. AIYA-KATA *(after each line)*
15. O'feshe- g'Ba
16. Oh-------.... (transitional device)
17. Basket mouth wan start to leak again, oh-
18. BASKET MOUTH WAN OPEN MOUTH AGAIN, OH
19. Abi** you don forget I say I sing, ee-oh **(is it not)
20. BASKET MOUTH WAN OPEN MOUTH AGAIN, OH
21. Oh, I sing, I say, I go my mouth like basket, ee-oh, Malan Bia-gbe-re13 (2x)
22. Basket mouth wan start to leak again, oh-14
23. BASKET MOUTH WAN OPEN MOUTH AGAIN, OH
24. Fela, wetin you go sing about?15
25. DEM GO WORRY ME... *(after each line)*
26. Dem go worry me, worry me-- worry, worry, worry
27. DEM GO WORRY ME *(After each line)*
28. Dey wan to make us sing about prison
29. Dem go worry me, worry me-- worry, worry all over da town
30. Dey wan to know about prison life
31. Dem go worry me, worry me-- worry, worry all over da town
32. Fela, wetin you go sing about?
33. DEM GO WORRY ME
34. Dem go worry me, worry me-- worry, worry, worry
35. The time weh I dey, for prison, I call am "inside world"
36. The time weh I dey outside prison, I call am "outside world"
37. Na craze world, na be outside world
38. CRAZE** WORLD *(after each line) / **(crazy)*
39. Na be outside- da police-i dey
40. Na be outside- da soldier dey
41. Na be outside- da court dem dey
42. Na be outside- da magistrate dey
43. Na be outside- da judge dem dey
44. Na craze world be dat
45. Na be outside- Buhari dey
46. Na craze man be dat
47. Animal in craze-man skin-I
48. Na craze world be dat
49. Na be outside- Idia-gbon dey
50. Na craze man be dat- oh
51. Animal in craze-man skin-i
52. Na craze world be dat
53. Na be outside- dem find me guilty
54. Na be outside- dem jail me five years
55. ------------------I no do nothing
56. Na be outside- dem judge dey beg ee
57. Na craze world be dat
58. Na be outside- dem kill dem students
59. Soweto, Zaria, and Ife
60. Na craze world be dat, ee-oh
61. Na craze world be dat,
62. Na be outside- all dis dey happen
63. Na craze world be dat, ee-oh
64. Na craze world be dat, ee-oh
65. Na craze world be dat, ee-oh
66. Na craze world be dat, ee-oh
67. Na craze world be dat, ee-oh.....

68. Make you hear this one
69. War against indiscipline, ee-oh
70. Na Nigerian government, ee-oh
71. Dem dey talk ee-oh
72. "My people are us-e-less, My people are sens-i-less, My people are indiscipline"
73. Na Nigerian government, ee-oh
74. Dem dey talk be dat
75. "My people are us-e-less, My people are sens-i-less, My people are indiscipline"
76. I never hear dat before- oh
77. Make Government talk, ee-oh
78. "My people are us-e-less, My people are sens-i-less, My people are indiscipline"
79. Na Nigerian government, ee-oh
80. Dem dey talk be dat
81. Which kind talk be dat- oh?
82. Craze talk be dat ee-oh
83. Na animal talk be dat – oh
84. Na animal talk be dat – oh

85. MANY LEADERS AS YOU SEE DEM
86. NA DIFFERENT DISGUISE DEM DEY-OH
87. ANIMALS IN HUMAN SKIN
88. ANIMAL-I PUT-U TIE-OH
89. ANIMAL-I WEAR AGBADA
90. ANIMAL-I PUT-U SUIT-U
91. These disguising leaders ee-oh, na wah for dem [sax responses after each]
92. Dem-o hold meeting everywhere, dem reach America (2x stanza)
93. Dem call the place, the "United Nations" [sax responses after each]
94. Hear-oh another animal talk
95. Wetin united inside "United Nations"?
96. Who & who unite, for "United Nations"?
97. No be there Thatcher & Argentina dey
98. No be there Reagan & Libya dey
99. Is-i-rael versus Lebanon
100. Iran-i-oh versus Iraq-i
101. East West Block versus West Block East
102. No be there dem dey oh- United Nations
103. Dis "united" United Nations
104. One veto vote is equal to 92 [...OR MORE, OR MORE]
105. What kind sense be dat, na animal sense (2x)
106. MANY LEADERS AS YOU SEE DEM
107. NA DIFFERENT DISGUISE DEM DEY-OH
108. ANIMALS IN HUMAN SKIN
109. ANIMAL-I PUT-U TIE-OH
110. ANIMAL-I WEAR AGBADA
111. ANIMAL-I PUT-U SUIT-U
112. Dem go hold meeting, oh, Dem go start yab human beings
113. Animal talk don start again
114. Dash dem, human rights
115. Dem go hold meeting, oh, Dem go start yab human beings
116. Animal talk don start again
117. Dash dem human rights
*(repeat stanza)
118. How animal go know-say dem no born me as slave?
119. How animal go know say slave trade don pass?
120. And, dey wan dash us human rights
121. Animal must talk to human beings
122. Give dem human rights
123. I beg-I, oh, make you hear me well-u well
124. I beg-I, oh, make you hear me very well
125. Human rights na my property
126. So therefore, you can't dash me my property
127. Human rights na my property
128. Dey wan dash us human rights
129. Some people say, "Why I dey talk like dis,
130. No be talk like dis, dem take to carry me go prison ee-oh"
131. No be me dey talk, na Prime Minister Botha dey talk, ee-oh (2x)
132. Him say, "this uprising will bring out the beast in us"
133. THIS UPRISING WILL BRING OUT THE BEAST IN US
   (repeat stanza 3x)
134. Eh Ji Keke- my argument
135. Botha na friend to Thatcher & Reagan
136. Botha na friend to some other leaders too
137. And together dem wan dash us human rights
138. Animals wan dash us human rights
139. Animal can't dash me human rights
140. Animal can't dash us human rights
141. MANY LEADERS AS YOU SEE DEM
142. NA DIFFERENT DISGUISE DEM DEY-OH
143. ANIMALS IN HUMAN SKIN
144. ANIMAL-1 PUT-U TIE-OH
145. ANIMAL-1 WEAR AGBADA
146. ANIMAL-1 PUT-U SUIT-U *(2x- 2nd time with lead voc)
147. Beasts of no nation- Egbe Ke Gbe na bad society
148. BEASTS OF NO NATION, EGBE KE GBE
149. BEASTS OF NO NATION, OTURU GBE KE
   (repeat stanza many x, lead vamp)
150. Easy... easy
Transitivity Analysis of «The Crying lot of 49» by Thomas Pynchon

Rym Ezzina
University of Sfax, Tunisia

Abstract

Systemic Functional Grammar is a model developed by Michael Halliday in which language is seen from a functional perspective. Language is “a network of systems or interrelated sets of options for making meaning” (Halliday 1994, p. 15). Transitivity is an important notion of Systemic Functional Grammar which is widely used as a tool for Discourse Analysis. “Transitivity is a system of the clause, affecting not only the verb serving as Process but also participants and circumstances.” (Halliday & Mathiessen, 2004, p. 181)

This paper investigates the relationship between linguistic structures and meanings in a literary text. By applying Halliday's transitivity framework, the paper attempts to reveal how the use of some linguistic cues can unveil the characteristics and techniques employed by Pynchon as a post modernist writer. In particular, the paper focused on the analysis of the verbs according to the different process types in the experiential metafunction. The processes are material processes, mental processes, relational processes, verbal processes, behavioral processes, and existential processes. In addition, the paper seeks to uncover power relations by analyzing participants’ roles involved in each process.

Keywords: Systemic Functional Grammar, Transitivity, Process Types, Post modernism, Crying Lot of 49.
1. Introduction

This study is carried out to explore first the transitivity choices in a literary text, and second to study power relations in this type of discourse. The first objective is achieved by classifying the verbs into six process types: material, mental, behavioural, relational, and existential. The second objective is realized by the study of participants’ roles in a literary text. Thus, this study, located within the Systemic Functional approach developed by Michael Halliday, is interested in knowing how Pynchon projects his views of the post modernism area.

1.1 Objectives

According to Fulton (1999), to study style is to study meaning. Style is a mean to make meaning and literature is a mode of meaning. Through studying how language functions in a literary text, one can understand how a text means, what it does and why it is valued as it is, and how its language relates to the context in which it was written.

Hence, by employing Halliday's transitivity framework, this study tries to bring to light what motivated Pynchon to choose certain syntactic structures rather than others and to show the significance of this choice to a more complete understanding of the work.

2. The Crying of Lot 49

The Crying of Lot 49 is Thomas Pynchon’s second novel published in 1966. This novel is classified as a postmodern novel. Pynchon was born in 1937. He published his first novel V in 1963 and he won the National Book Award by his long novel Gravity’s Rainbow.

2.1. The novel presentation

Almost all works by Pynchon are complex. The plots are often difficult to follow and Pynchon’s characters can be hard to relate to. Indeed, Pynchon has a tendency to fill his novels not with real characters but rather with characters that exist in the novel for a specific purpose.

2.2. The summary of the novel

Oedipa Maas, a young wife who lives in California. One day, she receives a letter telling her that her ex-boyfriend Pierce Inverarity named her the executor of his estate. So, she travels to San Narcisco where she meets the layer, Metzger, assigned to help her and with whom she begins an affair. Oedipa quickly learns that Pierce’s estate is very complex; she and Metzger have a difficult job ahead of them.

3. The methodology

This section describes the corpus of this paper as well as states the framework of analysis.
3.1. The corpus

The corpus of this study is composed of the first two paragraphs of the openings of the six chapters of the novel.

3.1.1. Instrument

This study relies on the UAM Corpus Tool version 3.8. The UAM Corpus Tool aims at the annotation of text corpora. This software is retrieved for free and is available at http://www.wagsoft.com/CorpusTool/. It makes it possible for the user “to annotate a corpus of text files at a number of linguistic layers, which are defined by the user” (O’Donnell, 2008). These texts can be annotated at many levels: document level, semantic-pragmatic level and syntactic level (e.g., clauses, phrases, etc.).

3.2. The framework of analysis

This paper relies on Michael Halliday’s notion of transitivity which is a core basis in the theory of SFG. Through this theory, Halliday has developed a view of language as “a meaning-making system with an emphasis on choice.” (Neale, 2002:44). Halliday notes that transitivity belongs to the experiential metafunction and hence is “a resource for construing our experience in terms of configurations of a process, participants and circumstances.” (Martin et.al, 1997). In other words, by the transitivity system, Halliday introduced all “the features of the clause which contribute to the linguistic representation of the speaker’s experience.” (Halliday, 1969 cited in Neale, 2002: 49).

3.2.1 Systemic Functional Grammar

With the appearance of Functional Grammar, Halliday approaches language from a different perspective with a focus on functions rather than structures. For Halliday, “language is a network of systems or interrelated sets of options for making meaning”.

3.2.1.1 Metafuncions of language

In his functional theory, Halliday (2004) states that “experience and interpersonal relationships are transformed into meanings and the meaning is transformed into wording” (p. 25). Thus, according to Halliday (2004), the clause consists of three distinct yet interrelated metafunctions (the ideational, the interpersonal, and the textual). Each metafunction is concerned with a meaning, and each meaning “forms part of a different functional configuration, making up a separate stand in the overall meaning of the clause (Halliday, 2004, p. 34). Halliday (2004) states that “the term metafunction was adopted to suggest that function was an integral component within the overall theory” (p. 31).

---

1 SFG refers to Systematic Functional Grammar, a theory developed by Halliday over more than 50 years.
3.2.1.1. The textual metafunction (clause as Message)

This metafunction is concerned with clause as message and which deals with the organization of information within separate clauses and with the text as a whole. The part of the clause which carries out this line of meaning is known as thematic structures. Hence, the clause is divided into Theme and Rheme. As defined by Halliday (2004), the theme is the element which serves as the point of departure of the message; it is that which locates and orient the clause within its context. The remainder of the message, the part in which the theme is developed, is called in Prague school terminology the Rheme (p. 64). The clause as message is thus organized into Theme+ Rheme.

3.2.1.2. The interpersonal metafunction (clause as Exchange)

This metafunction is concerned with clause as exchange and the relationship between speakers in a given discourse. When analyzing a clause in the interpersonal metafunction, the clause is composed of two main parts: the Mood and the Residue. The mood is also divided into two parts: the Subject which is a nominal group, and the Finite operator which is part of a verbal group. The residue consists of functional elements which are Predicator, Complement, and Adjunct.

3.2.1.3. The ideational metafunction (clause as Representation)

Through this function, “language provides a theory of human experience” (Halliday, 2004, p. 29). The ideational function allows language users to present their world experience through the lexico-grammatical choices they make, which are part of the transitivity system.

3.2.1.3.1. Transitivity

According to Halliday (1994, p. 106): “reality is made up of processes of going on, happening, doing, sensing, meaning, being and becoming.” Transitivity focuses on each clause in the text, “asking who are the actors, who are the acted upon, and what processes are involved in that action”, (Matheson, 2005, p. 66)

The transitivity system proposed by Halliday is composed of three main types of processes: material, mental, and relational. There are also three minor types which are: behavioral, verbal, and existential processes.

According to Halliday (1994, p. 107), each situation type is made up of three components: “the process itself, participants in the process, and the circumstances associated with the process.” The process is realized by a verb and it is the central part of the situation. Participants are realized by a nominal group and circumstances are realized by adverbial groups or prepositional phrases.

- Process types

The presence and type of processes depend mainly on the participants involved, their number and type, as well as on the process itself. Halliday distinguishes six different types of processes.
The Material process
This type of processes includes clauses of doing and happening. The two main participants associated with this process are: the Actor (the doer of the process) and the Goal (the entity affected by the process).

Example: the lion caught the tourist
Actor process: material Goal

The mental process
Mental processes are grouped into four subtypes which are perception (see, hear, feel), cognition (know, understand, believe), affection (like, love), and desire (hope, want, wish).

Within this process, there is always a conscious participant known as the sensor: the one who perceives, knows, likes, etc. in addition to the sensor, there is another participant involved in the mental processes which is the phenomenon which is felt, perceived, known, thought, or wanted.

The relational process
The process type occurs outside and inside human being. Relational processes are typically realized by the verb ‘be’ or some verbs of the same class (known as copular verbs); for examples, seem, become, appear, etc, or sometime by verbs such as have, own, possess. Halliday (1994:119) states that relational process is divided into two modes: identifying relational process and attributive relational process.

In the identifying mode, something has an identity assigned to it. It means that one entity is being used to identify another: ‘X is identified by A ’, or ‘A serves to define the identity of X’ (Halliday, 1994: 122). The X-element is labeled as identified, which is to be identified, and the A element is labeled as identifier, which serves an identity. This mode is realized by the verbs: ‘be’ (is, am, are, was, were…), become, etc.

Attributive relational processes are the processes which assign a quality. ‘A is an attribute of X’. In other words, in this mode an entity has some quality ascribed or attributed to it (Halliday, 1994:120). This type is realized by the verbs: sound, look, play, cost, have, get, seem, etc.

The behavioral process
The behavioural process lies between the material and mental processes. It characterizes the outer expression of inner working and reflects physiological and psychological behaviours. This type of process usually has one participant who is typically a conscious one, called the Behaver.

The verbal process
Between Mental and Relational processes are Verbal processes, which represent the act of saying. Usually three participants are involved in Verbal processes: the Sayer is responsible for verbal process; the Receiver is the person at whom the verbal process is directed; and the Verbiage is the nominalised statement of the verbal process.
The existential process

Between Relational and Material processes are Existential processes which prove states of being, existing, and happening. Existential processes typically employ the verb be or its synonyms such as exist, arise, occur. The only participant in this process is Existent which follows the there is /are sequences.

The following table provides an example of each process type in the novel.

Table 1: examples of each process type from the novel

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The process</th>
<th>example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>material</td>
<td>The clerk took her.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actor</td>
<td>material                   goal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mental</td>
<td>She thought of Muchoo.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senser mental</td>
<td>phenomenon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavioral</td>
<td>She wondered</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behaver</td>
<td>behavioral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relational</td>
<td>Muchoo was sad carrier relational attribute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>attributive</td>
<td>It was less an identifiable city token relational value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>identifying</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>verbal</td>
<td>‘I heard that,’ Pierce said. Verbiage Sayer verbal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>existential</td>
<td>There were no revelations Existent Existent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Results and findings

The following figure sums up the results related to the use of the six process types in the novel.
As stated by this figure, the writer tends to use the material process type more than the other process types (45.89%). The relational process ranks second with 18.15% and then the verbal process type with 17.12%. The three other types are: mental with 11.3%, behavioral 5.47% and the existential with 2.05%.

The material process is classified into action (58.95) and events (41.04) as shown by the following figure.

Concerning the participants’ role, it is shown by the following table.
Table 1. The participants’ role

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actor (79)</th>
<th>Sense (52)</th>
<th>Behaver (16)</th>
<th>Say er (50)</th>
<th>Carri er (23)</th>
<th>Token (30)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As it is stated by this table, the main character of the novel performs the main roles in each process type more than other characters. In fact, Oedipa Maas is the actor 51 times out of 79 processes. This can reveal the fact that she is acting but a detailed analysis shows that the verbs associated with the protagonist are intransitive verbs. Hence, Oedipa acts but does not affect others. While verbs associated with male characters are transitive verbs. Relating to the mental process, she is the senser 33 times out of 52 processes. Pynchon tries to concentrate on the psychological status of his protagonist and this may help readers to recognize and understand the character of Oedipa. This focus on the emotional state of Oedipa is meant to show her psychological disorder. From the first chapter, Oedipa thinks, knows, remember looking for a truth about the meaning of the Trystero System.

5. Conclusion

Transitivity is an important semantic concept in the analysis of representation of reality, in that transitivity enables us to analyze and represent the same event and situation in different ways. Relying on the transitivity analysis, the reader can uncover the thoughts of characters and sorting out ‘who does what to whom’ can help them understand the novel. The imbalance in agency between characters reflects the alienation of the female character Oedipa and her detachment of the real world.
References


Humoring the Context, Contextualizing Humor in the Short Fiction of Lorrie Moore

Nadia Boudidah Falfoul
University of Monastir, Tunisia

Abstract

Talking about the revolutionary power of women’s laughter, Jo Anna Isaak affirms that “the crisis of authority and value,” that is symptomatic of postmodernism, has been “instigated largely by a feminist deployment of laughter.” Since the 1980s, women’s humor discourse has become part of a rapidly growing corpus of works by contemporary writers who engage a wide variety of comic techniques in order to explore alternative forms of resistance to mechanisms of control and containment.

The argument behind this paper is to show how the American short story writer, Lorrie Moore (b-1957) uses humor as a subversive tool, a way of confronting tragedy and a vehicle to critique various psychological, social, and political issues about women’s lives. Her collections of short stories, namely Self-Help (1985), Like-Life (1990), Birds of America (1998), and The Collected Stories (2008), provide alternate ways of thinking about the humorous texts by examining their contexts—not just their contents. Analysed contextually, Moore’s “comic” stories emerge as forms of human communication whose con/textual implications are startling, engaging, and profound.

Keywords: postmodern short story, women's humor, comic narrative, subversive humor, contextualized humor, female identity.
“We are losing our sense of humor…the last thing to be lost, after hope.”
Luisa Valenzuala

In her introduction to *The Signet Book of American Humor*, Regina Barreca, a leading theorist in the field of humor, argues that “women’s comic stories subvert the condition traditionally regarded as a prerequisite for humorous narrative: the assumption of a consensus-opinion or shared values.” According to Barreca, the word “humor” as distinguished from “comedy,” applies to “those specific textual strategies where the refusal to take serious matters seriously is rendered explicit” (2). The best American humor that women can produce, Barreca explains “isn’t about jokes, it’s about stories.” Women’s humor is about “our vision of life, loss, refusal, and recovery” (xxi).

Like all forms of communication, humor requires a context: Almost every detail of our lives affects the way we create and respond to humor. Indeed, out of all the textual territories explored, comedy, as Barreca claims in her book *Untamed and Unabashed*, is “the least universal” because it is “rigidly mapped and marked by subjectivity.” It is most liable to be “filtered” by history, social class, age, race, ethnicity, and of course gender (12). Women have a tradition of using humor to survive what is often a hostile environment. In most cultures, women were outside the locus of power and authority; they were not allowed the capacity of humor, with its implications of superiority and its fundamental critique of social, political, and cultural reality.

Recently, however, feminist critics have evolved more complex ways of analyzing the relationship between women and laughter. In its most radical function, women’s laughter attempts destruction, as Hélène Cixous describes in “The Laugh of the Medusa”: “A feminine text cannot fail to be more than subversive. It is volcanic.” In fact, many women writers use humor to disrupt, unsettle, and rebel against patriarchal and cultural constrictions on women’s lives. By using the medium of the humorous discourse, many contemporary American women writers of fiction present their perceptions of and commentary on contemporary culture. Their humor functions both as a technique for questioning basic assumptions, and a tactic of cultural as well as textual resistance. “It’s in order to smash everything, to shatter the framework of institutions, to blow up the ‘truth’ with laughter” (Cixoux 258). Thus, humor, for these writers, contains a diversity of elements and calls for a complex response.

Women writers of humor subvert the authoritative discourse by presenting a multiplicity of ways that humor can mean. Their wit has always been a carefully executed writing strategy used to shape and control their fiction. Refusal is at the heart of such works, which carry powerful messages of dissent. In their narratives, the main character often learns to distrust and to refuse to participate in the system of shared values. This process, as feminist writers and critics maintain, disrupts and rebuilds, destroys and creates simultaneously. Hence, women’s humor is often elusive, evasive, and subversive. It focuses mainly on the female experience, and centers round such themes as feeling trapped, anger as projected outward and inward, and the quest for freedom, identity, power, and self-expression.

In her fiction, American short story writer, Lorrie Moore (b-1957) offers her readers a comic and decidedly dark catharsis. Her books unfold a startlingly brilliant series of portraits of the
unhinged, the lost, and the unsettled of American society. They tell varied stories about sadness, crisis and death. Lorrie Moore, considered by many critics as the best voice of her generation, is admired for her biting glances at American culture as she seems to be almost exclusively fascinated with broken, suffering and depressed people. Accordingly, her adroit portraits of places and people reflect her overarching artistic purpose, which she had described as “trying to register the way we, here in America, live” (2008). In fact, her characters’ personal dramas are enacted against a recognizably American backdrop made up of a multitude of details, allusions, and conversations (Vietnam War, Gulf War, 9/11 attack, etc). Throughout her work, it is apparent that her dark humor, and the pain it masks, is part of her intense contemplation of contemporary existence. Besides, her characters and narrators use comic expressions, jokes, and an entire collection of humorous effects to amplify, underline, and sharpen the points they make.

Writing humorously can be an act of survival and self-empowerment, a new power for women through their manipulation of literary language. Employing insights from psychoanalysis, deconstruction, and cultural criticism, Moore’s short fiction can be analyzed as a “comic” examination of futility and desperation, where humor operates largely to contextualize the issues and emotions that are explored in each story without the mawkishness that frequently pervades “problem” fiction.

In her first collection, *Self-Help*, published in 1985, Moore probes the pleasures and pains of modern relationships, offering poignant yet wickedly funny advice on how to survive several psychological crises of loss and love. In nine captivating stories, the author presents characters that will become typical in her work: individuals, usually women, who are sarcastic, witty, and secretly vulnerable. The title of the collection—“Self-Help” reflects the idea behind it: to adapt the prolific American self-help literature designed “to coach readers in self-fulfillment and good management of careers, love affairs, marriages, and family relationships” (Alison Kelly *Understanding Lorrie Moore* 21). All the stories in this collection offer sarcastic commentaries on the 1980s trend of books on self-improvement, sexual guidance, and popular psychology. Moore’s reworking of the genre is, of course, ironic and parodic, and much of the “putative advice dispensed by her narrators is highly subversive” (Kelly 21).

Thus, various female characters in this collection mimic certain cultural scripts that have confined them: horoscopes, advice columns, advertisement, and recipes. Their voice mocks the clichés of the cultural script even while it repeats it, thus generating a kind of “hysteria of resistance”. In these stories oppressive contexts and restrictive values would be ridiculed, rather than the characters who are struggling against such restrictions. In this collection Moore advises on “How to Be an Other Woman,” “How to Talk to Your Mother,” “How to Become a Writer,” and even simply “How,” a title that leaves the focus of its advice open. Irony pervades the narrator’s tone and story line: the narrators are supposed to be addressing themselves, but after a while it’s hard not to feel that it is the reader who is being hectored.

In “How to Be an Other Woman,” Moore’s first story in *Self-Help*, the style is modeled on an instruction manual, filled with lists and witty snatches of dialogue. The protagonist, a smart, single woman is “technically... still a secretary for Karma-Kola,” but she wonders repeatedly who she is as she becomes enmeshed in an affair with a married man who seems to be completely ignorant or unaware of the complexity of emotions that a woman might experience in such a frail
relationship. The story is written in the imperative: “Meet in expensive beige raincoats, on a peasoupy night… Draw a peace sign. You are waiting for a bus.” Later, in her description of a love encounter between the protagonist and her married lover, the narrator uses a language brimming with irony and sarcastic humor:

He tells you his wife's name. It is Patricia. She is an intellectual property lawyer. He tells you he likes you a lot. You lie on your stomach, naked and still too warm. When he says, “How do you feel about that?” don't say “Ridiculous” or “Get the hell out of my apartment.” Prop your head up with one hand and say: “It depends. What is intellectual property law?” (4)

The same style is employed in several other scenes in the story, displaying a distanced, ironic narration in sharp contrast with the emotional upheaval of the events being narrated. Moore’s characters are often at odds with the roles in which they find themselves and with the expectations of families and spouse; they are uncomfortable even with their names, the most obvious marker of their identities. In “Community Life,” a story in Birds of America (1998), one protagonist, Olena, resists the efforts of her Romanian parents to Americanize her name to “Nell,” but it is only after her parents have died that she realizes that her legal name “Olena” is an anagram of the word “alone,” emblazoning the role of outcast that her ethnic heritage creates for her. This story is illustrative of most of Moore’s work: it is the narrative of a woman ill-at-ease in her world, “searching for a place in a ‘community’ from which she feels physically, emotionally, or creatively exiled” (Karen Weekes 118). Olena’s crisis of identity acquires ridiculous proportions when she becomes paranoid, a recluse “afraid of going out…the fear gripping her face when she were there, as if people knew she was a foreigner and a fool” (69). What’s even more disturbing is the protagonist’s awareness of the community’s hypocrisy. The narrator makes use of a surprising and incongruous mixture of statements that create a sense of comic relief amid this bleak image of social inadequacy:

This lunge at moral fastidiousness was something she’d noticed a lot in people around here. They were not good people. They were not kind. They played around and lied to their spouses. But they recycled their newspapers! (“Community Life,” 73)

In fact, Moore’s women are haunted by an incessant dread of failure or, worse, a sense of guilt. This “fear of misspent life” (98) causes a perpetual pain for Moore’s main characters. They all undergo very hard moments of self-judgment or self-evaluation, which all lead to an obscure sense of guilt, despondency, and defeat. “It is like having a degree in failure,” one character says. In a particularly gloomy scene of “Community Life,” Olena is seized by a despicable sense of grief and fragmentation rendered in a playful, obscure, but accurate metaphor: “Olena! Alone! It was a body walled in the cellar of her, a whiff and forecast of doom like an early, rotten spring” (74). In such stories, the language of epiphany is less telling than the language of the labyrinth. “What has happened to me?” the protagonist of “How To Be an Other Woman” asks herself in shock. In store windows as she catches a glimpse of her face, she is caught with a disturbing sense of estrangement: “You don’t recognize yourself, you are another woman, some crazy interior display lady in glasses…Wonder who you are?” (5-8).

In several of Moore’s stories, emotion is expressed by inadequate words and inadequate gestures. What is important in Moore’s fiction is psychological states, the individual’s response to
events and other persons. Wordplay, redundancy, and aesthetic punning act as running commentaries on her text—to her readers and to the whole culture she addresses. Being a mistress is “like constantly having a book out from a library,” (5) the narrator ironically says on behalf of Charlene, the female protagonist of “How to Be an Other Woman,” (6), a story that illustrates this sense of discrepancy between women’s dreams and ambitions in life and their distressed reality. When she discovers that she is not her lover’s only mistress, Charlene realizes that a man will not be her salvation. “When you were six you thought mistress meant to put your shoes on the wrong feet,” the narrator sarcastically addresses the protagonist (and the reader); “Now you are older and know it can mean many things, but essentially it means to put your shoes on the wrong feet....” (5). The shoe image is very effective in transmitting a sense of unexpectedness and incongruity, especially, in conveying the protagonist’s sense of disillusionment and disenchantment with love. Moore’s immediate attention to “the wrong shoes put on the wrong feet,” a material emblem of a specific time and place, also serves to set the ironic tone of absurd tragedy and painful humor in the piece.

Moore’s characters suffer from “the wrenching incompatibility of [a woman’s] professional and artistic expression with the familial commitments” (Moore, 2004, 16). There is, indeed, a direct correlation between the theme of the frustrated quest for self-creation and the narrative form employed to convey that theme. In “How to Become a Writer,” another story in Self-Help, Moore advises: “First, try to do something, anything else” (emphasis added). Later, she addresses the frustrations of pursuing this vocation. Again, the style is instructive, and the protagonist seems reluctantly propelled into creative writing and arrives at realizations such as “Writers are merely open, helpless texts with no real understanding of what they have written and therefore must half-believe anything and everything that is said of them” (124). Moore’s lovely sentences, ludicrous puns and wisecracks stick to the memory like song lyrics. Her prose is “fancy without being schmancy,” to borrow one of her lines. Furthermore, “How to Become a Writer” examines the incompatibility of the public and the private, the artistic and the personal, and the contradictions that are part of the paradox. In The Atlantic Monthly Moore asserts that “the artistic self—devious, ironic, and isolated—resides at odds with the tender lover self in the same finely driven person”. Moore is hardly the first writer to worry about this conflict and the ensuing incongruity in women’s lives, but she is one of the most explicit in noting its obscenity, as well as its almost “comedic insolvability” (Moore 31).

In Moore’s stories, there is always that quickness of movement and slightly skewed narrative perspective that keeps the reader alert and a little uneasy. In other words, we can join Suzanne Juhasz’s contention that “in their form, women's lives tend to be like the stories that they tell: they show less a pattern of linear development towards some clear goal than one of repetitive, cumulative, cyclical structure” (241). As a narrative device, humor has enabled the writer to challenge the limits of realism by using irony, satire, and the grotesque to mock traditional notions of linear plot, closure, narrative omniscience, and reliable interpretation. In fact, the chronology of the structure of a Moore story is nonlinear and sometimes, cyclic, and therefore flexible. The lack of conclusion in most of her short stories is allied to a lack of exciting intrigues, a refusal to write of the great themes of man’s destiny. Some of her stories are grotesque as she blends humor and horror and writes about the dissolution of familial order, the complications and contradictions of contemporary women’s lives, and people’s multiple physical and psychological afflictions.
In her second short-story collection, *Like Life* (1991), Moore presents a broader range and more complex emotions than *Self-Help*, and the narratives are more self-reflexive, probing deeper into the condition of life. Moore’s objects of study range from a woman having affairs with two men (“Two Boys”) to an examination of a pestilential urban hell (“Like Life”). Yet the work continues to reflect the author’s focus on women’s experiences and dark humor. John Casey described it as a mix of “comedy and sadness, wisecracks and poignancy” (3). The people in *Like Life* share disbelief in what their lives have become and a terror of how they have lost control of their fate. A cheese store manager, whose only companion is her cat says, “You could look at your life and no longer recognize it” (“Joy” 50). A young woman torn between two boyfriends has a “subtle” nervous collapse and cannot comprehend how she ended up in this place in her life. “How did one’s eye-patched rot-toothed life,” she wonders, “lead one along so cruelly, like a trick, to the middle of the sea?” (“Two Boys” 18). Mary, the female protagonist of “Like Life,” reaches a state of terrible desperation as “she felt a distrust of her own life,” and explodes: “This is not life. This is something else” (157-58).

With Moore, the comic—one might recall John Lowe’s words—“walks a narrow line between pleasurable surprise and uncomfortable shocks.” Indeed, surprise is one of the fundamental and most charmingly effective characteristics of Moore’s humor. Indeed, “if a short story does not contain some element of surprise,” Moore states in *The Booklist Interview*, “then it won’t contain life” (403). Surprise is entwined in expectations and misdirection, and Moore’s interweaving of biting humor with serious appraisals of relationships or even lives coming apart distinguishes her as an innovative and experimental short story writer. A pervasive irony runs through most of her stories, which manage to be both heartfelt and humorous at the same time. The techniques of colloquial dialogue, repetition, wordplay, and attention to tiny details are used in her stories to cover the same themes: the constant search for love and the impossibility of communication and hope.

“Paper Losses,” the first story in *The Collected Stories* (2008) opens in an unexpected way: “Although Kit and Rafe had met in the peace movement, marching, organizing, making no-nukes signs, now they wanted to kill each other” (3). Here, Moore addresses one of her most insistent and recurrent themes: divorce. She sarcastically leads the reader to the bitter realization that human relationships are, ultimately, nothing but painfully fragile and forever flickering. She offers a striking picture of how divorce can have destructive repercussions on a woman’s life. Kit, the female protagonist of “Paper Losses” receives the divorce papers sent by her husband “suggested their spring wedding anniversary as the final divorce date” (6). Surprisingly, Kit’s inner turmoil and intense anger are imparted in a mordant and comic language that testifies to the incongruity and the absurdity of her situation: “The papers referred to Kit and Rafe by their legal names, Katherine and Raphael,” the narrator sarcastically comments, “as if the more formal versions of them were divorcing—their birth certificates were divorcing!” (6).

Alternately hilarious and distressing, Moore’s world, with its small, obscure, and sometimes violent corners, is a revelation of a specific element of human experience: the impossibility of life without pressure, tedium, surprise, paradox, and humor. Even more interesting is that the anguish Moore’s characters feel and seek to overcome is comic because it is expressed in terms of the insignificant. Yet the emotional impact of their inner desolation is expressed in very profound humor. “You read Lorrie Moore and it’s like, joke, joke, joke,” humorist David Sedaris says, “but
by the time you get to the end, you are devastated." Moore writes with extraordinary perception, wit, and exceptionally original language. No single emotion is spared, and yet all is funny as well:

They [Kit and Rafe] spawned and raised their hate together, cardiovascularly, spiritually, organically. In tandem, as a system, as a dance team of bad feeling, they had shoved their hate center stage and shone a spotlight down for it to seize. Do your stuff, baby! Who is the best? Who's the man? ("Paper Losses," 3)

Moore excels at painting the “white space” between characters. Her talent for delineating and amplifying gaps — accenting the isolation not only between people, but also between a character and her own emotions — makes her characters orphaned observers of their own painful experiences. But there is something sadder and wearier about these characters, a realization, as they drift toward middle-age, that “every arrangement in life” carries with it the shadow "of its not being something else” (93). Moore’s storytelling recalls American humorist Dorothy Parker: there’s a loneliness that sometimes collapses inward in complete breakdown, and occasionally culminates in a moment of epiphany. Moore stated in an interview that gaps between people, and not loneliness, are particular qualities of her stories: “The attempts to bridge those gaps or the attempts to acknowledge them, I think, are often the interesting aspects of a character’s life” (Nourok 9).

Moore’s formal experiments are daring and successful. She’s sometimes against the boundaries of the form and the tradition. Her stories evoke a sense of challenge to the traditional and conventional forms of the short story. Her narrative refuses to offer the platitudes of beginning, middle and end; it spins reflexively, implying that fiction can cure us, that it is a miracle — a moment of pleasure in a conventional, dreary commonplace world. The jokes give her writing a brilliant surface over the stories’ dark content — the shaky, flickery nature of love, and the uncertainty and instability of existence. In an article written for Ploughshares, (Fall 1998), Lorrie Moore explains that these narrative strategies are intentionally designed as she “aimed for a kind of ragged emotional arc: from adventure/misadventure, through catastrophe and reminiscence, toward grief and finally to love. It is a trajectory that lands on the only note worth landing on.”

In Birds of America, (1998) Moore takes unprecedented stylistic and formal risks, most notably in “People Like That Are the Only People Here.” In this story, a baby is diagnosed with kidney cancer and his mother strives to cope with the perplexing life she has to endure in the hospital. Moore shows the obscure ghostly new life of parents and children caught in the trauma of pain and suffering, and confined within the closed walls of the hospital: “A whole place has been designed and decorated for your nightmare,” the desperate mother-narrator says. She feels so shocked and baffled, incapable of comprehending such “inconceivable fate”. In Moore’s fiction words combine in a surreal chaos where all juxtapositions are paradoxical and laughable. “When your child has cancer,” the mother sadly relates, “you are instantly whisked away to another planet: one of bald-headed little boys”. However, flashes of humor lighten the increasingly dark world that she portrays. Here, the narrator—a writer and a mother— manipulates various narrative and metanarrative elements to create a thrilling world of pain, suffering, horror, and dark humor. With her child in the hospital and his fate in doubt, a surgeon takes the mother aside, intensely serious. “‘There is a particular thing I need from you,’ he says. ‘Yes?’ she says, her tension is mounting and her heart is pounding, not prepared for any more bad news. ‘Will you sign my copy of your novel?’” (241). Later, the mother’s description of the surgeon, the anesthesiologists, and the nurses
who surround her baby evokes a sense of comic absurdity. In their “blue caps and scrubs,” the mother bitterly and playfully comments, “they look like a clutch of forget-me-nots, and forget them, who could?” (233). Thus, laughter seems to alleviate fear and bring both joy and relief to those who have deep-seated worries about death, disability, isolation, violence, and incapacity.

Moore’s fondness for word games may serve as an index of insecurity. Pure wordplay may also indicate a divorce from the real world, a plight that touches many of Moore’s characters, particularly middle-aged women. In “Terrific Mother,” Adrienne, the depressive female protagonist, begins to babble nervously when patronized by a pompous academic at a lavish symposium dinner. Then she smiles at him and replies: “Jetty-laggy. Baby talk. We love it” (275). Moore’s style demonstrates that to compose effective language of humor, the writer often relies on getting a particular play with words or on the overturning of a particular rule. Much of the humorous use of language is reflected in such devices as puns, understatements, anti-climax, exaggeration and what Walter Blair calls “incongruous mixture”. These lead to a language full of surprise and lively turn of phrase. The use of misspelling and distorted syntax in Moore’s fiction “spices” her short stories and makes them attractive. Imagery and originality of expression abound in her writings. She creates a humor “of phraseology rather than of character”, to quote again Blair (121).

In a remarkable scene in “Willing,” the first story in Birds of America, the female protagonist, Sidra, a depressive former Hollywood actress trapped with a love affair with a mechanic, is involved in a harsh argument with her unfaithful boyfriend. The narrator’s use of eccentric and original language adds to the incongruous and absurd nature of their relationship: “A bone in her opened up, gleaming and pale, and she held it to the light and spoke from it.” (23). Moore’s writing strikes the reader with acute statements that capture the essence of this woman’s self-destructive tendencies as she tells the reader: “There were small dark pits of annihilation she discovered in her heart, in the loosening fist of it, and she threw herself into them, falling” (13).

The appearance of language itself can be funny and even shocking. In her story “Real Estate”, for instance, Moore fills an entire two-page spread with laughter as her protagonist, a cancerous middle-age woman, reflects upon her husband’s infidelities. These words seem to be an expression of the character’s nervous breakdown. “There had been a parade of flings—in the end they made her laugh:

Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!” Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!” Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!” Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!”
Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!” Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!” Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!”
Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!” Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!” Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!”
Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!” Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!” Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!”
Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!” Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!” Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha! Ha!”

Laughter, in this case, is not an indication of moral superiority; it may well be an “index of moral failure” or rather psychic distortion on the part of the fictional female the writer creates. In this story, Moore examines the precariousness and instability of marriage when this unhappy married woman buys a new place, only to discover that “[e]very house is a grave.” and that “the key to marriage”, as she concludes “was just not to take the thing too personally”. It is in this reliance on the small detail, on how things look and feel, that Moore’s writing often seems particularly
feminine, attuned to a vision of the world in which there are no heroes, no great actions to be undertaken, but some little incidents to be contemplated and one’s own heart to be listened to.

Awareness of the impossibility of communication between people is crucial in understanding Moore’s characters and their motivations. Their perceptions of one another are always far from the indefinable reality. These characters often seem as a roughly sketched form, a crude diagram, and a robot-portrait. The human personality, normally constructed according to social roles, is fragile and can crumble with terrifying results: depression, separation, rejection, suffering, isolation, desperation, and death. Wordplay is how Moore’s characters protect themselves in uncomfortable situations but it isolates them even more, just as Moore's flippancy risks alienating readers while conveying her characters' desperation in a way no other style would. The anguish that her characters strive to convey is finally tragic, as it reveals the instability of all human projects. “When tenderness ended,” the narrator in “Two Boys” says, “there was a lull before the hate, and things could spill out into it. There was always so much to keep back, so much scratching behind the face” (15). Indeed, Moore’s characters, mostly women, seem stranded and self-mockingly insecure in an isolated, unheroic age. Acknowledging the horror of modern life, Moore makes it endurable by naming it and by demonstrating its inextricable connection with the comic.

Humor is fundamental in Moore’s characters’ lives. It upholds them morally and psychologically because, as Moore herself asserts in an interview, “humor is really part of the fabric of human discourse—it may be deflective or knee-jerk, intimate or distance-making, organizing or derailing, and may arise from hostility, generosity, boredom, anxiety, existential fatigue, or good drugs. (The Paris Review). There's a moment in “Agnes of Iowa,” another story from Birds of America, when the title character recalls the good humor that prevailed during her years in Manhattan. This character seems to articulate Moore’s firm and outstanding belief in the urgent need for humor. “Telling a joke,” Agnes remembers,

[H]ad made any given day seem bearable, that impulse towards a joke. It had been a determined sort of humor, an intensity mirroring the intensity of the city, and it seemed to embrace and alleviate the hard sadness of people having used one another and marred the earth the way they had. It was like brains having sex. (94)

Finally, there is in the work of Moore the subtle suggestion that discord prevails in her world, not just in human nature, but in the very scheme of things. Disorder is preferred over an order that subordinates and objectifies women. Indeed, like most women writers of postmodern comic fiction, Moore believes that “disorder is hope” especially in the comic cosmos. Undoubtedly, Moore suggests that disharmony is the condition of existence and that such dysfunction can be tolerated only by a humorous observer. By sharing her own helplessness in the face of chaos, she invites her readers to laugh at their own inadequacy and to recognize that vulnerability can be a form of strength.

Thus, in Moore’s view, one should approach life with a highly detached and comically ironic vision. This constant is a quality of strength and detachment, which John Hawkes describes as “ruthless determination to face up to the enormities of ugliness and potential violence” within ourselves and in the world around us. The obvious strain and tension under the surface of comedy might suggest an affinity with the tragic as well as the comic. Moore’s fiction is an artistic attempt
to meet the terrors, the inflictions and the absurdities of the world with “savage or saving comic spirit” (Hawkes). Ultimately, this “comic spirit” constitutes an effort to defend and celebrate those permanent human values or “ancient aspirations”: love, peace, goodness, compassion, intelligence, and the value of life itself.
References


.......................... “Leave Them and Love Them: In Alice Munro’s Fiction, Memory and Passion


A Sociopragmatic Analysis of the Speech Act of Criticism by Persian Native Speakers

Maryam Farnia
Payame Noor University, Iran

Hiba Qusay Abdul Sattar
Australian Technical Management College, Australia

Abstract

This paper examines the speech act of criticism among Iranian native speakers of Persian. Making and taking criticism can be difficult since no one would like to be told that he or she is wrong. In fact, criticism is a very important speech act in people's daily life. More and more people view criticism as a panel from where they can improve their performance or how to do things better. It is commonly used by people in almost all cultures. However, this speech act is very situation-dependent in that speakers should know how to perform the speech act considering such aspects as the hearer, the relationship with the hearer, the topic, the purpose of the speech, and the appropriate linguistic forms for the speech act. Empirical studies on speech acts show that the same speech act is very likely to be realized quite differently across different cultures. Accordingly, the primary objectives of this study are to examine Iranians' perception and production of the speech act of criticism. Data are based on the distribution of a Discourse Evaluation Test (DET) and a structured interview. It consisted of four situations given to 100 Iranian native speakers of Persian at Payame Noor University, Iran. The corpus was then analyzed and categorized based on Nguyen's (2005) coding scheme, in which criticisms are coded according to their realization strategies and external modifiers. The overall findings showed that the use of direct strategies outnumbered that of indirect strategies and mitigating devices. However, one distinctive feature of the present data was that politeness is achieved through the use of mitigating devices.

Keywords: Pragmalinguistics, sociopragmatics, speech act, criticisms, Persians
1. Introduction

The study of speech acts has been a central concern of pragmatics, especially in cross-cultural pragmatics (Blum-Kulka, House & Kasper, 1989, p.2). The present study examines the meaning of utterances that carry the speech act of criticism in different situations. Pragmatics, thus, “is the study of acting by means of language, of doing things with words” (e.g., persuading, refusing, apologising) (Kasper, 1989, p.39). Through the pragmatics of language use, one could better understand how language is used and how it is interpreted in a given context. Accordingly, to be pragmatically competent, a speaker needs to have the ability to “understand and produce socio-pragmatic meanings with pragmalinguistic conventions” (Kasper & Röver, 2005, p.318). In other words, the speaker needs to have “the ability to act and interact by means of language” (Kasper & Röver, 2005, p.317).

The present study focuses on Iranians’ perception and production of speech act of criticism. The pragmalinguistic conventions of the speech act of criticism cover three important dimensions: choice of strategy and directness level, choice of internal modification through the addition of mitigating or aggravating modality markers, and choice of external modification by means of supportive moves, introductory or subsequent to the head act. At a sociopragmatic level, the way in which speakers choose to formulate a criticism and, more specifically, the amount and type of modification chosen, has been found to be affected by a number of social and situational/contextual variables. The most widely discussed and tested variables are social variables like the social distance, social power and imposition of the requested act, having been proposed by Brown and Levinson’s (1987, 1978) influential model of politeness. The present study focuses on the choice of strategy and directness level and the mitigating function of the dimensions of external modification. Accordingly, the study provides a valuable insight into the Iranian culture. It is believed that this culture has its own unique set of conventions, rules and patterns of communication when performing the speech act of criticism. These reflect the structure of the Iranian society as well as its values.

1.1. Literature review / Theoretical background

1.1.1. The speech act of criticism

The notion of speech acts originates from Austin's (1962) claim that an utterance encodes a specific "act" or function that the speaker wants to achieve by producing the utterance. Min (2008) indicated that based on Austin's analysis of speech act, the performative verb “criticize” denotes the speech act of criticism. However, the utterances were later classified according to a particular categorization as developed by Searle (1979). According to the classification system brought forward by Searle, there are five types of general functions performed by speech acts: declarations, representatives, expressives, directives and commissives. As far as criticism is concerned, it contains the types of declarations, representatives and expressives, excluding directives and commissives”. The speech act research over the last two decades has encompassed an increasingly broad range of types of speech acts. From an initial focus on directives (e.g. Ervin-Tripp, 1976; Brown and Levinson, 1978; Bellinger and Gleason, 1982), researchers proceeded to examine positively affective speech acts, such as compliments and apologies (e.g. Olshtain and Cohen, 1983; Holmes,
1986; Herbert, 1989), as well as more negatively affective acts, such as disagreements (Blum-Kulka et al., 1989; Georgakopoulou, 2001; Scott, 2002).

For this study, the speech act of criticism is selected as a unit of analysis. Min (2008) indicated that criticism is an important and indispensable speech act in our daily communication, which is just as important as the compliment, apology, and request. The study is motivated by the fact that there is a need to explore more about the cultural values and norms in non-Western cultures such as the Iranian one. The study contributes to the field of cross-cultural pragmatics in that it discerns the importance of pragmatics in strategies of Iranians as they perceive and produce the speech act of criticism.

1.1.2. Defining a criticism

Tracy, Van Dusen and Robinson (1987, p. 56) define criticism as the act of “finding fault” which involves giving “a negative evaluation of a person or an act for which he or she is deemed responsible”. Nguyen (2005) defined criticizing as “an illocutionary act whose illocutionary point is to give negative evaluation of the hearer’s (H) actions, choice, words, and products for which he or she may be held responsible” (p.7). This act is performed in the hope of influencing H’s future actions for H’s betterment as viewed by the speaker (S) or to communicate S’s dissatisfaction with or dislike regarding what H has done but without the implicature that what H has done brings undesirable consequences to S (Wierzbicka, 1987). Criticism is similarly defined as “an expression of dissatisfaction or negative comment” (Hyland, 2000, p. 44).

1.1.3. Direct/Indirect Criticisms

As cited earlier, the choice of strategy and directness level is an important dimension of pragmalinguistic conventions of the speech act production. It should be noted that speakers can vary how direct their speech acts are and in so doing communicate less than the literal meaning of what they say and yet still perform the act. The speech act theory makes a distinction between direct and indirect speech acts. Searle (1975, 1979) states that any speech act can be performed indirectly. As Searle states (1975), “The simplest cases of meaning are those in which the speaker utters a sentence and means exactly and literally (my italics) what he says.” In these cases, there is a direct correlation between the utterance type and its function and giving a direct speech act. Therefore, the utterance ‘I criticize’ would be a direct speech act because the type and function are related. In that sense, a direct criticism is the direct expression of negative evaluation without reservation. It means that the interlocutor directly points out the hearer’s mistakes and demands correction directly instead of beating around the bush, including insulting, threatening, and so on.

In indirect speech acts, the form differs from the function. An indirect speech act, says Searle, is the one that is performed “by means of another” (1979, p.60). Usually, in these cases, the indirect speech act carries meaning in the utterance, but the intended force in the speech act has a secondary meaning as well. As Searle (1975) stated, when a speaker utters a sentence, he does not only mean what he says, but he also means something more. Indirect criticism, in other words, means that the illocutionary force of criticism is uttered by means of
the performance of other speech acts, so the interlocutor’s real intention can be partially concealed. This is always thought of as an effective and acceptable means with positive results.

It should be noted that a number of studies discussed the notion of direct and indirect speech acts in relation to politeness and directness and analyzed why speakers choose direct versus indirect speech acts. For example, investigations on the directness in speech act realisations have been closely tied to politeness, and studies on politeness often delve into appropriateness of speech act forms (Blum-Kulka et al., 1989). For example, Brown and Levinson (1987), as cited in Marti (2006), claimed that there is an intrinsic ranking of politeness strategies in terms of indirectness. Referring to Goffman’s (1967) notion of face, as the public self-image, reputation, or self-esteem of a person, they argued that since it is in the mutual interest of interlocutors to save, maintain, or support each other’s face, the so-called Face Threatening Acts are either avoided (if possible), or different strategies are employed to counteract or soften them. In the Iranian culture, face constitutes two main components, i.e. šaxsiat and ehteram. The first one deals with the character, honor, personality and self-respect. In this sense, “a person’s šaxsiat is mainly dependent on the way s/he behaves and his/her educational background and is often perceived as related to the socialisation and upbringing she has received” (Koutlaki, 2002, p.1742). On the other hand,

“Ehteram (near equivalents ‘honor’, ‘respect’, ‘esteem’, ‘dignity’) establishes the positions and statuses of the interactants with respect to one another and is shown through the adherence to the established norms of behavior according to the addressee’s position, age, status and interlocutors’ relationship. Ehteram is shown among others through the use of appropriate address terms, conformity to the rules of ritual politeness (ta’arof) and other conventions” (Koutlaki, 2002, p.1742).

Accordingly, politeness strategies are based on the interpretation of šaxsiat and ehteram and they are employed according to the degree of face threat that a person might encounter or estimate for an act. The assessment of the amount of face threat, according to Brown and Levinson (1987), depends predominantly on the relative power of the speaker, the social distance between interlocutors, and rank (the degree of imposition). According to them, by adding these values, we could calculate the weight of a face threatening act. The assessment of these social and situational/contextual variables covers the social perceptions that underlie the use of a speech act, i.e. sociopragmatics. Min (2008, p.74) states that,

“Criticism is an intrinsically face-threatening act in Brown and Levinson’s terms. It belongs to the group of speech acts that threatens the hearer’s positive face. In order to make the criticism more acceptable to the hearer, the speaker tends to reduce the imposition of criticism, which means the increase of degree of politeness”.

This is accomplished through the use of strategies or semantic formulas as well as mitigation devices. The choice of actual wordings as conventions of forms that they produced in realizing this speech act fall under the pragmalinguistic aspect. Likewise, decisions made about whether to modify criticisms and criticism responses are also related to sociopragmatics, as they more or less reflect the speaker’s social perceptions of politeness. However, the choice of external and internal modifiers is more concerned with pragmalinguistics since it involves choosing linguistic structures and assigning politeness values to such structures.
1.1.4. Criticism Mitigation

Criticisms usually consist of semantic formulas varying in content, order and frequency, depending on the eliciting speech act and they are sensitive to social variables like gender and the social status of both the speaker and addressee. Therefore, criticisms can involve a great deal of mitigation, i.e. strategies employed in order to smooth interactional management by reducing risks for participants at various levels, e.g. conflict, face. In the literature on pragmatics, mitigation strategies can take the form of external or internal modification. External modification does not affect the utterance used for realizing a speech act (head act), but rather the context in which the act occurs. It is affected through supportive moves (Blum-Kulka et al., 1989), i.e. various devices that may precede or follow the head act (e.g. reasons or justifications for the act), thus modifying indirectly its illocutionary force.

It should be noted that while the softening of negative effects and the smoothening of social interaction during the negotiation of a face threatening act is considered to be the primary function of mitigation (Fraser, 1990; Caffi, 1999), the precise nature and politeness functions of both external and internal modifiers are context-specific, i.e. these devices are not inherently polite, but they may derive their politeness value when employed in certain situations (Bella, 2011).

2. The Present Study

The present study investigates two aspects of the speech act of criticism in Persian, i.e. pragmalinguistics, as the linguistic end of pragmatics, “the particular resources that a given language provides for conveying particular intentions” (Leech, 1983, p. 11), such as lexical devices and the syntactic structures, and sociopragmatics, as the sociological interface of pragmatics, which studies the ways in which pragmatic performance is subjected to specific social conditions, such as power, social status, etc. The main focus in this study is on Iranian native speakers of Persian’s performance of the speech act of criticism, i.e. how do they linguistically realize it in terms of strategies used and mitigation devices, and comprehend it.

3. Methodology

3.1. Subjects

The researchers used a random sampling method to select 100 respondents. The subjects were first given a background questionnaire. This instrument was addressed to all participants and the purpose was to record data about their personal information like gender, age, etc. The participants of this study were 100 females. The participants were residents of Esfahan, Iran with the age range of 18 to 45. They all speak Persian as their native mother tongue.

3.2. Instruments

Following previous researchers such as Hudson et al. (1995), Fouser’s (1997) and Safont Jorda (2003), a Discourse Evaluation Test (DET) was used as the main method of data collection for measuring the pragmatic awareness (see Table 2). Participates were asked to write situations where they received criticism. The questionnaire was developed based on the experiences by the researchers and then piloted to ensure the reliability of the instrument.
The prompts suggested equal or unequal power in the relationships of the speakers; situations involved the subject and a friend, the subject and a boss, the subject and a teacher, the subject and a classmate. In each situation, the subject is familiar with the interlocutor. Each prompt simulated a situation that occurred in different setting such as a workplace, a university or at home.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Situations</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Situation 1:</td>
<td>The subject - a boss, Criticism of job performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Situation 2:</td>
<td>The subject - a friend, Criticism of food</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Situation 3:</td>
<td>The subject - a professor, Criticism of homework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Situation 4:</td>
<td>The subject - a classmate, Criticism of a paper</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Furthermore, to help the researchers achieve a better understanding of the subjects’ performance in the present study and to provide a clear interpretation of the collected data, structured interviews were used as well.

### 3.3. Data Analysis

Following Nguyen’s (2005) coding scheme of speech act of criticism, the responses coded according to their realization strategies and external modifiers (see Appendix A).

### 4. Results

The results are discussed in the four following sections: an analysis of strategies across the situations, an analysis of the strategies for each situation, an analysis of external modifiers and an analysis of the structured interview.

#### 4.1. Criticisms across all Situations

The participants were asked to evaluate the appropriateness of the criticisms based on the Iranian culture. The appropriateness of language use can be recognized by acknowledging the social identity of the listener in terms of the relative social status and the degree of
acquaintance between participants. Also, the appropriateness can be given within specific situations and contents (Bardovi-Harlig and Dornyei, 1998; Laver, 1981). Accordingly, scenarios were assessed according to their cultural appropriateness. The respondents were asked if they found the criticism appropriate, and if not, they write down what they would say if they were the boss.

In Situations#1, a boss expressed his criticism to his employee. The social relationship between the participants is that of high social status and low social distance. The respondents were asked to produce their own criticism in case they found the expressions of criticism inappropriate.

It should be noted that this situation involves an unequal relationship in terms of status. This means that a direct criticism is permitted and even supported by the entitlement and expectations given to the speaker, i.e. a professor and boss. However, it was evaluated as inappropriate by Iranians because they believed that there is still a need to soften the words used when pointing out a negative act related to the hearer. 56% of the respondents reported the criticism expression in appropriate. The strategy type used in the scenario was that of a “negative evaluation”. Respondents reported that this strategy was inappropriate since it threatened the interlocutor’s face and the boss should have started with some introduction to the interlocutors’ failure at work before expressing his negative evaluation. The other 44% who reported this was a boss’s right to express his opinion about his staff productivity at work. In terms of the boss’s right to make criticism in this situation, 46% of the respondents reported that the boss had a right to do so.

In Situation #2, the respondents receive a criticism about food by a friend. The social relationship between the participants was that of equal power and low social distance. It has been indicated that “when the speech act involves a low-degree of imposition and is produced for a person in equal relationship, the degree of required indirectness is smaller” (Taguchi, 2006, p.515). In response to the question of appropriateness of the types of criticism expressions used in the situations, 52% of the respondents reported the use of negative evaluation strategy was quite appropriate in such situations. They explained that a friend had a good intention to improve his or her friends’ action and thus his criticism was tolerated. 48% of the respondents thought reported this criticism as inappropriate. They reported that they usually opted out criticizing their friends in such situations since by doing so they might damage all favors the hosts had undertaken to receive their guests. They suggested a more indirect criticism in similar situations. 41% of the respondents also believed that the friend had the right to make criticism.

In Situation #3, the respondents received a criticism about homework essay by a professor. The social relationship between the participants was that of high social status and low social distance. The findings showed that 66% of the respondents reported the use of negative evaluation inappropriate in this situation. 37%, however, agreed that the professor had a right to make criticism about the student. The respondents believed that in such situations, encouragements or at least less direct criticism from the professor were more appreciated by the students.

In Situation #4, the respondents received a criticism about their paper by a classmate. The social relationship between the participants was that of equal power and low social distance. The respondents found the criticism 78% appropriate and reported their friend had 43% the right to express their criticism in that situation. The justification of negative
evaluation in this situation was that the friend had the intention to improve and help his or her friend’s assignment, and they themselves asked him to provide comments on their paper.

4.2. Direct/Indirect Strategies

In terms of strategies and the directness level, the findings showed that the respondents used a variety of direct and indirect strategies when expressing criticism. The respondents used direct strategies in the form of negative evaluation (32.60%), identification of problem (12.10%), consequence (9.90%) and disapproval (5.95%). The overall indirect strategies used by the respondents ranged from the most to the least frequent strategies including request for change (11.20%), suggestion for change (14.10%), demand for change (3.30%), asking/presupposing (2.40%), other hints (6.15%), indicating standard, preaching, advice for change, and expressing uncertainty (0.25%). What follows is an analysis of the data for each individual situation:

4.2.1. Situation #1

As presented in Table 2, consequence (35.15%) was the most frequently used strategy among direct criticism strategies. Other direct criticism strategies from the highest to the lowest strategies include disapproval (12.5%), identification of the problem (7.80%), and negative evaluation (3.15%). Results showed that request for change (16.40%) has been the most frequently used strategies among indirect criticism strategies. Other strategies from the highest to the lowest were suggestion for change (13.30%), demand for change (4.70%), asking/presupposing (3.90%) and other hints (3.10%). Overall, consequences were the most frequently used strategies in situation #1.

### Table 2: A summary of the strategies used in situation #1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Direct criticism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Negative evaluation</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Disapproval</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Expression of disagreement</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Identification of problem</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Statement of difficulties</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Consequences</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>35.15%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 2. Indirect criticisms        |           |            |
| a. Correction                | 0         | 0%         |
| b. Indicating standard       | 0         | 0%         |
| c. Preaching                 | 0         | 0%         |
| d. Demand for change         | 6         | 4.70%      |
| e. Request for change        | 21        | 16.40%     |
| f. Advice about change       | 0         | 0%         |
| g. Suggestion for change     | 17        | 13.30%     |
| h. Expression of uncertainty | 0         | 0%         |
| i. Asking/presupposing       | 5         | 3.90%      |
4.2.2. Situation #2

The findings show that negative evaluations were the most frequently used strategy in direct criticism strategies. Other strategies from the highest to the lowest were identification of problem (3.15%) and disapproval (1.10%). The findings showed that the use of other hints (26.30%) was the most frequent used indirect criticism strategies by the respondents. Other elicited indirect strategies were suggestion for change (8.45%), request for change (4.20%), asking/presupposing (3.10%) and preaching (1.10%). In general, negative evaluation has been the most frequent criticism strategy in Situation #2. See Table 3 below:

Table 3: Frequency of the strategies in situation 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Direct criticism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Negative evaluation</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>52.60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Disapproval</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Expression of disagreement</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Identification of problem</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Statement of difficulties</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Consequences</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Indirect criticisms:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Correction</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Indicating standard</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Preaching</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Demand for change</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Request for change</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4.20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Advice about change</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g. Suggestion for change</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8.45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h. Expression of uncertainty</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i. Asking/presupposing</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>j. Other hints</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>26.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.2.3. Situation #3

The findings showed that identification of problem was the most frequently used direct strategy. Other elicited direct strategies from highest to lowest were negative evaluation (20.65%) and disapproval (7.45%). See Table 4 below:
Table 4: Frequency of the strategies in situation 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Direct criticism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Negative evaluation</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>20.65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Disapproval</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7.45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Expression of disagreement</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Identification of problem</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>23.20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Statement of difficulties</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Consequences</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Indirect criticisms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Correction</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Indicating standard</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Preaching</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Demand for change</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4.95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Request for change</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>14.90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Advice about change</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g. Suggestion for change</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>24.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h. Expression of uncertainty</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i. Asking/presupposing</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>j. Other hints</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results also showed that suggestion for change was the most frequent indirect strategy in situation #3. Other elicited indirect strategies were request for change (14.90%), demand for change (4.95%), and advice about change (0.80%). Overall, suggestion for change was the most frequently used criticism strategy in situation #3. In this situation, people’s desire for others to evaluate them positively is evident in the use of the strategy. Since the speaker giving the criticism was acknowledging their negative abilities in writing a homework essay, the speaker did have the social rights and obligations to give a feedback to a student. The use of indirect strategies such as suggestion for change supported the hearer by giving him face and be acknowledged (implicitly) for his positive qualities.

4.2.4. Situation #4

Results showed that negative evaluation was the most frequent direct strategy in this situation. Other direct strategies from the highest to the lowest were identification of problem (13.45%), and disapproval (0.95%). The findings showed that suggestion for change was the most frequently used indirect criticism strategy. Negative evaluation and identification of problem were the most frequently used direct strategies in this situation. The justification for the use of such an explicit format of criticism is due to the influence of high familiarity between the interlocutors. However, subjects also preferred to maintain the face through the use of other
semantic components that mitigated the force of this direct criticism. For example, subjects
tried to compensate for their criticism by reaffirming the good points of their friend's essay.
Other indirect strategies were other hints (3.85%), demand for change (2.90%), expressions of
uncertainty and asking/presupposing (0.95%). See Table 5 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Direct criticism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Negative evaluation</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>66.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Disapproval</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Expression of disagreement</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Identification of problem</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13.45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Statement of difficulties</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Consequences</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Indirect criticisms:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Correction</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Indicating standard</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Preaching</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Demand for change</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Request for change</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Advice about change</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g. Suggestion for change</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8.65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h. Expression of uncertainty</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i. Asking/presupposing</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>j. Other hints</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.3. Criticism Mitigation

The responses were also analyzed based on the use of mitigating devices across the situations.
The findings showed that the most frequently used mitigating devices from the highest to
lowest across the situations are sweeteners (53.35%), thanking (15%), grounders (10.40%),
alerters (9.15%), opt-out (7.10%), steers (2.10%), apology (2.10%) and disarmers (0.80%). It
should be noted that one of the most obvious features of the data of this study was the use of
compliment, thanking, grounders and alerters when mitigating a criticism comment. Subjects
tended to mitigate their criticisms externally using ‘sweeteners’. Bella (2011, p. 1734) stated
that, “A speaker in such a condition seems to invest in pragmatic routines whose formulaic
nature can guarantee a politeness effect.” The subjects’ choice of how to modify their
criticisms appeared to be influenced by the sociopragmatic judgments of the situational
factors. What follows is an analysis of the data for each individual situation.
4.3.1. Situation #1

The findings showed that sweeteners (34.90%) were the most frequently used strategy in situation #1. Sweeteners used to express positive remarks toward the interlocutor either before or after expressing criticism. The purpose was to alleviate the offensive act (Nguyen, 2005). Table 6 shows that grounders are most frequent mitigators used by the respondents. In a grounder, the speaker gives reasons, explanations, or justifications for his or her criticism, either before or after the main criticism. The reason for using a grounder might probably be viewed in a way that the speaker has been trying his best to achieve a smooth interaction with an expectation that this reason would have an impact on the address to be more co-operative and understanding to his situation. This is in line with Faerch and Kasper (1989) who pointed out that grounders are effective mitigating strategies because they can open up “… an emphatic attitude on the part of the interlocutor in giving his or her insight into the actor’s underlying motive(s)”.

A summary of the mitigating devices used in situation 1 is reported in Table 6.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>External modifiers</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Steers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Sweeteners</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>34.90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Disarmers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Grounders</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>30.25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Alerter</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>18.60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Thanking</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g. Apology</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The respondents used sweeteners and grounders as to compensate the offensive act of criticism. Other strategies from the highest to the lowest frequency are alerters (18.60%), thanking (7%), apology (4.65%), steers (2.30%) and disarmers (2.30%). Some elicitations of the responses in Situation 1 are as follows:

- Please pay more attention to tasks assigned to you, because you may lose your position and make mine risky (consequence).

لطفا بیشتر در مورد کارهایی که به شما محول شده دقت فنی دهید، چون هم ممکن است موقعیت خود را از دست بدهید و هم موقعیت من را به خطر بیندازید.

- I’m happy with you. Just fix these problems and take a bit of creativity and innovation (request for change).

ما از شما راضی هستیم. فقط این اشکالات را رفع کن و کنی خلاقیت و نوآوری داشته باش.

The example above displays the realization of the direct criticism in the form of a request asking the respondent to pay more attention to his or her duties followed by the consequences that he may face in case he does not. By doing so, the speaker states clearly the reason. The use of direct criticism is justifiable by the impact of the social power. There is no doubt that the boss’s obligations and rights of his or her job and gives him more space to
initiate a direct realization. However, the direct criticism is mitigated by the use of a request
“Please pay more attention to the responsibilities assigned to you” as recorded in the data. Or
the criticism is accompanied with an explanation that helps soften the situation and the
negative impact of the criticism. This helps the boss to save the face of his employee and gain
a successful interaction. The use of mitigates thus is appreciated.

4.3.2. Situation #2

The findings showed that sweeteners (44.25%) were the most frequently used mitigating
devices in this situation. According to Brown and Levinson (1987), compliments are
inherently face threatening acts; however, they can also be regarded as face-enhancing speech
acts, in that they are usually intended to have a positive effect on interpersonal relations.
Personal compliments typically enhance people's face by conveying support for, or approval
of, some of their positive attributes. Thus the use of such act helps in managing the face threat
as it serves to create a more balanced comment and slightly softening the negativity of the
overall criticism.

The respondents attempted to compensate for the act of criticism by appreciating the food
(27.45%). Other mitigating devices from the highest to lowest were grounders (5.30%),
apology (1.75%) and disarmers (0.90%). A summary of mitigating devices used in this
situation are tabulated below (see Table 7).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 7: Frequency of mitigating devices in situation 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Modifiers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Steers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Sweeteners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Disarmers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Grounders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Alerter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Thanking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g. Apology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h. opt out</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Some samples elicitations in situation 2 are as follows:
- Your food has always tasted great (sweeteners). Thank you (thanking). But I guess
  you’ve a bit tired (grounder) because your food has been a bit salty (negative
  evaluation). Did you realize it [that it was salty] (asking/presupposing)?
  - غدات شور شده بود ولی فکر کنم امروز خیلی خسته شدی چون کمی غدای شور شده‌اید. خودت متوجه شدی؟

- I don’t use that much salt in my food. That’s why I notice your food is salty
  (identification of problem).
  - من عادت به استفاده زیاد نمک در غذام ندارم، به همین دلیل غدای شما به نظرم شور رسید

- Thank you (thanking). You did a great job (sweetener). But I make my food with little
  salt (other hints). I guess our taste is different.
  - ممنون. خیلی زحمت کشیده بودی. اما من غذا را کم نمک تر می‌خورم. ذائقه هامون با هم متفاوته.
4.3.3. Situation #3

The findings, in Table 8, show that sweeteners were the most frequently used strategy in Situation 3. Other mitigating devices from the highest to lowest were grounders (9.10%), alerters (5.45%), steers (3.65%), thanking (1.90%) and apology (1.80%). The use of sweeteners supports the speaker by acknowledging the positive abilities of the student effort in writing.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Modifiers</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Steers</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Sweeteners</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>78.20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Disarmers</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Grounders</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Alerter</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5.45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Thanking</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g. Apology</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>55</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Some elicitations are as follows:
- You’d better try to do something with few problems (suggestion for change)

بعتر است سعی کنی کاری انجامدهی که کمتراشکال داشته باشد

- It’s obvious you spent lots of time on this paper, but your article does not have reached the goal I had in my mind (disapproval)

از مقاله شما مشخص است که خیلی وقت گذاشتید، اما هدفی که من برای این مقاله داشتم درمقاله شما محقق نشده است.

- Thanks for spending time on the article (thanking). There are some trivial problems in it (identification of problem). You must correct them and return it to me (demand for change).

از اینکه روز مقاله وقت گذاشته ممنون. ولی جند جای اون اشکالاتی پیش یا افتاده بود. باید درسشون کنی و به من تحول بدی.

4.3.4. Situation #4

The findings showed that *sweeteners* (68.95%) were the most frequently used mitigating devices in this situation (see Table 9).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Modifiers</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Steers</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Sweeteners</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>68.95%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Other mitigating devices from the highest to lowest frequency were alerters (13.80%), steers (6.90%), grounders (3.45%), and thanking (3.45%). A respondent reported that she would refuse to express criticism in such situations. Some elicited samples are as follows:

- I think it’s not bad but you need to you’d better try more (suggestion for change).

به نظر بیشتر نیست. ولی بهتر است بیشتر تلاش کنی.

- That’s very good. It is obvious you spent lots of time (sweetener). But I think that will improve your work if you write this part that way (suggestion for change).

خیلی خوبه، معلومه خیلی زحمت کشیدی اما به نظر من اگر اینجا رالینج را راه اندازی نمی کنی بهتر بود.

5. Structured Interview

An analysis of the structured interview showed that all respondents believed criticism is necessary and could lead into future success and progress. In response to the question if they favored criticism, the respondents welcomed any criticism which is “constructive” and which expressed with appropriate discourse.

To the majority of respondents, criticizing people requires some conditions such as whether the hearer could take a criticism, and if s/he appreciated being criticized at all. Criticism should be expressed at the right time, to the right person, in the right context. The person who criticizes should be fair and should avoid being extremist or biased against something. Criticizing a friend should be acted elegantly in order not to offend or threaten their face. Receiving criticism from the speakers who got a social role or are in higher status is more justified. However, the way the criticism is expressed, especially the speakers’ intonation, intention, manner of saying and politeness are very important.

The respondents also reported that though criticism is very common in Iranian culture, it is not that much appreciated. The respondents suggested the use of mitigating devices such as grounders and compliments as acts to compensate for the possible act of offensiveness.

6. Discussion

As mentioned before, the choice of a strategy and the directness level are closely linked to the notion of politeness. For example, linguists such as Leech (1983) or Brown and Levinson (1978, 1987) believed that, there is a strong relationship between politeness and indirectness. For example, Leech (1983) claimed that "the more indirect an illocution is, the more diminished and tentative its force tends to be" (Leech; 1983, p.108). In other words, the
Illocution I want you to answer the phone, verbalized by a speaker is perceived to be less polite than Would you mind answering the phone? Because it is more direct. In that sense, a direct criticism with a negative evaluation would probably not be welcomed because it would be perceived as an impolite act for it threatens both šaxsiat and ehteram of Iranian Face. As Brown and Levinson (1987) pointed out, face needs to be continually attended to in the process of communication and face-threatening speech acts; therefore, it is needed to be softened so that politeness is achieved.

Results of this study indicated that the choice of a criticism strategy and the directness level are highly influenced by the relative power of the speaker, social distance between interlocutors, and rank (degree of imposition). The findings suggested that Persian respondents favored direct criticism strategies more than indirect criticism strategies in the situation of high social status and high social distance relative to the interlocutor. Accordingly, situations which involved interaction between friends with equal statuses, direct criticisms were accepted since friends can criticize friends easier when they are asked to do so. The findings of this study showed that direct criticism strategies were the most frequent ones in such situations. In other words, interlocutors felt more comfortable to express a direct negative evaluation to an interlocutor of equal status and low social distance. This is in line with Salmani Nodushan (2008) who found that Persian native speakers use more direct strategies when the social distance is low.

Moreover, results of the interview also supported this argument since the respondents believed that a friend has the right to criticize, but their criticism is more appreciated when they are asked to do so (situation #4) for which their criticism is considered what is referred to as “constructive” criticism. Despite the fact that the food situation involved an interaction between two friends some respondents yet reported that they would opt out providing any negative comments on the food since they believed the friend took the burden of preparing food and that they had been guests and it was not worth threatening their face and damage the friend’s favor. Their friend might feel embarrassed so this might be the reason behind opting out.

The analysis demonstrated that there was a relatively low preference for indirect strategies, when criticism were directed towards juniors, instead there were many direct criticisms employed by the participants who hold higher power status than the addressees such as the boss and the professor situations. The respondents reported that a professor has the right to criticize the students because he has the status to do so. Thus, not only is the directness level supported by higher power, but it is also the social expectations or entitlements that a person in such a position effectively claims for himself in his interactions with others. In other words, people within the Iranian society regard themselves as having a range of rights and obligations in relation to other people and they typically base these on different factors such as agreements and requirement, roles and positions, behavioral conventions, style and protocols. The essence of rights (and obligations) is that people expect that others should do or not do certain things in certain contexts. The basis of these expectations could be semi-legal, associated with a particular role, or simply just a social convention that has developed on the basis of what normally happens (Spencer-Oatey 2008, p.15). However, a professor’s criticism should be in a way not to disregard students’ efforts in preparing materials. Similarly, they reported that a boss has the right to criticize an employee using direct criticism strategies since his or her intention is to improve the function of the company. This perception is in line with the findings of the production questionnaire where
the respondents used identifications of problem, disapproval and consequence are more frequent than other direct strategies.

The findings also showed that the respondents were bounded by their culture and tried to save the face of their interlocutors by using words that increase the degree of politeness through the use of mitigation. The overall findings showed that the use of direct strategies outnumbered that of indirect strategies and mitigating devices. However, the use of mitigating devices was more frequent than indirect strategies. This is in line with Farnia, Sohrabi, and Abdul Sattar’s (2014) study of Persian native speakers of speech act of suggestion in which Persians used more directive strategies than conventionalized form and indirect strategies to offer suggestions. Moreover, in their study, the use of mitigating devices outnumbered that of direct and indirect strategies.

7. Conclusion

The present paper was an examination of the speech act of criticism among Iranian native speakers of Persian. The speech act of criticism needs to be handled appropriately if harmonious relations are to be created and/or face to be maintained. There is no doubt that losing face is a painful experience and for this reason every participant in a Face Threatening Act(FTA) situation tries his/her best to maintain each other’s face. Within the context of Iranian society, face is connected with people’s sense of value, dignity and identity. This study showed that there are indeed different trends in choosing criticism strategies and the directness level in relation to social variables of power and distance. Alongside these variables, politeness strategies are affected by the fact that within Iranian society people regard themselves as having a range of rights and obligations in relation to other people; therefore, a criticism posed by a boss or a professor is part of the expectations and obligations of that role or position. This is also a part of the social norms in this society, i.e. “a standard of behavior shared by a social group, commonly understood by its members as authoritative or obligatory for them” (Anderson, 2000, p.17). The overall findings showed that the use of direct strategies outnumbered that of indirect strategies and mitigating devices. However, one distinctive feature of the present data was that politeness is achieved through the use of mitigating devices. In other words, the purpose of the use of mitigating devices is to maintain their face, i.e. šaxsiat and ehteram in social interactions when a criticism is made.

Acknowledgement

"The research reported in this paper was supported in part by a grant from Payame Noor University, Iran, for which I am grateful."
References


Appendix A: Coding Scheme

Nguyen’s (2005) coding scheme of the speech act of criticism

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Direct criticism</td>
<td>Explicitly pointing out the problem with H’s choice/ actions/ work/ products, etc.</td>
<td>“I think ah it’s not a good way to support to one’s idea” (L).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Negative evaluation</td>
<td>Usually expressed via evaluative adjectives with negative meaning or evaluative adjective with positive meaning plus negation.</td>
<td>“Umm that’s not really a good sentence” (NE).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Disapproval</td>
<td>Describing S’s attitude towards H’s choice, etc.</td>
<td>“I don’t like the way you write that ah &quot;I’m convinced about the idea&quot; or &quot;in my opinion&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Expression of disagreement</td>
<td>Usually realized by means of negation word &quot;No&quot; or performatives &quot;I don’t agree&quot; or &quot;I disagree&quot; (with or without modal) or via arguments against H.</td>
<td>“I don’t quite agree with you with some points (.) about the conclusion” (L), “I don’t really agree with you &lt;as strongly as&gt; you put it here” (NE).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Identification of problem</td>
<td>Stating errors or problems found with H’s choice, etc.</td>
<td>“And there are some incorrect words, for example &quot;nowadays” (L), “You had a few spelling mistakes” (NE).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Statement of difficulties</td>
<td>Usually expressed by means of such structures as “I find it difficult to understand…”, “It’s difficult to understand…”</td>
<td>“I can’t understand” (L), “I find it difficult to understand your idea” (L).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Consequences</td>
<td>Warning about negative consequences or negative effects of H’s choice, etc for H himself or herself or for the public.</td>
<td>“Someone who don’t – doesn’t agree with you (.) would straight away read that and...”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Indirect criticisms:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>a. Correction</th>
<th>Including all utterances which have the purpose of fixing errors by asserting specific alternatives to H’s choice, etc.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>b. Indicating standard</td>
<td>Usually stated as a collective obligation rather than an obligation for H personally or as a rule which S thinks is commonly agreed upon and applied to all.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Preaching</td>
<td>Usually stated as guidelines to H, with an implicature that H is incapable of making correct choices otherwise.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Demand for change</td>
<td>Usually expressed via such structures as &quot;you have to&quot;, &quot;you must&quot;, &quot;it is obligatory that&quot; or &quot;you are required&quot; or &quot;you need&quot;, &quot;it is necessary&quot;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Request for change</td>
<td>Usually expressed via such structures as &quot;will you ...?&quot;, &quot;can you ...?&quot;, &quot;would you ...?&quot; or imperatives (with or without politeness markers), or want statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f. Advice about change</td>
<td>Usually expressed via the performative &quot;I advise you ...&quot;, or structures with &quot;should&quot; with or without modality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>g. Suggestion for change</td>
<td>Usually expressed via the performative &quot;I suggest that ...&quot;, or such structures as &quot;you can&quot;, &quot;you could&quot;, &quot;it would be better if&quot; or &quot;why don't you&quot; etc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

"safer" not “safe”, comparison” (L), “And you put “their” I think t-h-e-r-e” (NE).
h. Expression of uncertainty
Utterances expressing S’s uncertainty to raise H’s awareness of the inappropriateness of H’s choice, etc.

i. Asking/presupposing
Rhetorical questions to raise H’s awareness of the inappropriateness of H’s choice, etc.

j. Other hints
Including other kinds of hints that did not belong to (h) and (i). May include sarcasm.

3. External Modifiers
1. Steer
Utterances that S used to lead H onto the issue he or she was going to raise

2. Sweeteners
Compliments or positive remarks paid to H either before or after a criticism to compensate for the offensive act.

3. Disarmers
Utterances that S used to show his or her awareness of the potential offence that his or her speech might cause H.

4. Grounders
The reasons given by S to justify his or her intent

---

have been better to put a comma
(·) so ah ((laugh))”,
“Are there several paragraphs
ah not sure about the paragraphs”.
“Did you read your writing
again after you finish it?”.
“Did you read your writing again after you finish it?”.  
“I prefer a writing style which
are not too personal”.

“I read your essay and here are
some my own ideas of this”,
“Ah I have some comments about your writing” ( 
“There are quite good relevant ideas that you presented (. ) ah but . . . ”.

“You had a few spelling mistakes
(· ) but I think that’s because you’re writing too quickly, (. ) nothing too major.”.

“I think “is” is better than “are”
there because traffic (.2) ah single?” .
Exposing traumas in Stephen King’s *The Shining* and *Doctor Sleep*

Jessica Folio
University of Reunion Island, France

Abstract

This article aims at casting an innovative light on Stephen King’s *The Shining* (1977) and its sequel, *Doctor Sleep* (2013) by showing how theories of trauma are applicable to the mainstream American writer’s work. On the stage set up for his readers, King unveils a journey of traumas but he also lifts up the curtain on the ways to cope with the consequences of these traumas. Both narratives follow the flawed hero, Danny Torrance, reveal the shattering experiences lived by the latter as a five-year-old child in *The Shining* and the ensuing post traumatic disorders in *Doctor Sleep*. The texts not only offer a coalescence of traumas, representing a journey of repression and haunting but they equally open the way on the possibility of healing.

Keywords: trauma, repression, regression, disorders, repetition compulsion, healing.
“The tears that heal are also the tears that scald and scourge”.¹ This quotation from King’s *The Shining* (1977) encompasses the themes of the monstration of physical and psychological suffering, the repression but equally the resurgence of traumatic events or the quest for redemption. On the stage set up by the mainstream American writer in *The Shining* and its sequel, *Doctor Sleep* (2013), King unveils a journey of traumas but also lifts up the veil on the consequences of these traumas and on the ways to roam the path of healing. Both narratives follow the flawed hero, Danny Torrance, who goes through shattering experiences as a five year-old child in *The Shining* and is then confronted with post traumatic disorders in *Doctor Sleep*. This article attempts at presenting the multi-shaped traumas gone through by Danny by keeping in the background of our analysis Laurie Vickroy’s explicitation of trauma as “a response to events so overwhelmingly intense that they impair normal emotional or cognitive response and bring lasting psychological disruption” (Vickroy, p. ix). In order to account for Danny’s shattering of identity and self-destructive behaviour as an adult, the stress will be laid on the supernatural aspect permeating the narratives while also keeping in mind the rational context these narratives are inserted in. The dysfunctionalities pregnant in the Torrance family’s history and Danny’s feeling of guilt once an adult following a consciously perpetrated immoral act will be brought to the fore. The texts offer a coalescence of traumas, a journey of repression and haunting.

1. Unveiling a kaleidoscope of traumas

Studying psychological trauma signifies “bearing witness to horrible events” (Herman, p. 7); “at the moment of trauma, the victim is rendered helpless by overwhelming force” (Herman, p. 33). Dramatic events are indeed at the core of King’s *The Shining* and, in the malevolent world of the Overlook hotel, physical and psychological traumas are conjoined. The light has to be cast on those horrible events which harmed the characters and triggered a sense of helplessness. In *The Shining*, King explores the traumatic past of the parents, Jack and Wendy, and unveils the shattering experiences lived by their son, Danny. *The Shining* is mainly set at the Overlook Hotel, a modernized Gothic castle isolated in the Colorado Mountains; locus of a horrible past, it is haunted by malevolent ghosts which come back to life and cause the fall into irrationality and monstrosity for the villain patriarch. Hired as the caretaker of the hotel for a winter, Jack Torrance takes Wendy and Danny in this retreat supposed to give him the opportunity to pick up on his writing career. The family quickly becomes entrapped in this Piranesian setting, not only by the snow but also by the resurgence of a traumatic past engrained in the hotel. Although the confrontation with the supernatural undoubtedly accounts for the traumatic events haunting Danny in his adult life, signs of deviance are presented well before the family’s arrival at the Overlook. Consequently, the analysis has first to put into the foreground the parents’ own repressed traumas.

1.a. Deviant parental figures

Jack Torrance is first and foremost depicted as a deviant father: the stress is laid on his alcohol addiction and violent temper. The narrative returns on the history of his uncurbed drinking problem, from the beers drunk during discussions with his fellow students to the celebration of his

first story or the faculty parties “hitting the bars until they closed” (King 1977, p. 41) to dropping baby Danny on the floor to the denial of his alcoholism and his failure at teaching and at his career as a writer. His violent temper causes him to beat a student up, consequently losing his job as a teacher. Turning his violence against Danny when the latter pours beer over the manuscript of one of his plays, Jack breaks his son’s arm. His awareness of failing as a father is concomitant with feelings of shame, guilt, self hatred and suicidal thoughts: “shame ...revulsion... the sense of having no worth at all” (King 1977, p. 19). His unresolved addiction foreshadows his failure to be an efficient caretaker at the Overlook: “Dear God, he could use a drink. Or a thousand of them” (King 1977, p. 27). Jack’s thoughts revolve around failure, abandonment -“they would be better off if he left” - hurt and need: “his daddy hurt almost all the time, mostly about the Bad Thing. […] a constant craving to go into a dark place” (King 1977, p. 30). Alcohol becomes his way out to forget his failures and feeling of hopelessness. The need for alcohol is conjoined with aggressive impulses:

The wanting, the needing to get drunk had never been so bad. His hands shook. He knocked things over. And he kept wanting to take it out on Wendy and Danny. His temper was like a vicious animal on a frayed leash. He had left the house in terror that he might strike them” (King 1977, p. 40).

Jack is totally aware of the danger he constitutes for his family but he is too weak to overcome his addiction and his feeling of helplessness.

Jack actually reproduces the pattern of violence and alcoholism he was raised in throughout his childhood. He witnessed his father almost beating his mother to death with a cane. His mother’s total submission to his father and the lie she chose to speak out to protect her husband left anger and incomprehension for Jack. The latter’s own relationship with his dad was an intermingling of love and violence: “until he had been seven he had loved the tall, big-bellied man uncritically and strongly in spite of the spankings, the black-and-blues, the occasional black eye” (King 1977, 244). The text highlights the cruelty and affection of the father figure as well as the spiral of love and violence repeating itself. Jack’s and Danny’s bond appears as an echo of that deviant relationship. Despite the fact that Jack breaks Danny’s arm, the latter’s love for his father is unconditional: “he buried his face in Daddy’s sheepskin-lined denim jacket and hugged him tight tight tight” (King 1977, 37). He waits unwaveringly for hours for Jack to return from his interview at the Overlook. Reciprocally, Jack’s love for his son is undeniable though his addiction is a source of destruction for his marriage.

As the story progresses and Jack becomes possessed by the evil spirit haunting the Overlook, he rejects any identification with his father whose voice he hears through a radio entices him to follow the path of violence and murder: “you’re not in me at all!” (King 1977, 250) This circle of rejection will also be visible at the end of The Shining when Danny rejects the monstrous creature Jack has been transformed into and it will find an echo in Danny’s willingness, as an adult, to repress his traumatic past memories. Thus, Jack’s childhood is marked by his father’s aggressive behaviour. If Jack is not physically violent to Wendy, the couple’s relationship is nonetheless ingrained with tension, domination, even haughtiness. The evil spirit haunting the Overlook feeds from Jack’s desire for recognition and offers a macabre alternative to compensate for his failure in his career and his marriage.
The mother figure also appears to be in the loop of traumatic memories that would have more to do about entrapment in her mother’s claws. She lives a conflictual relationship with her mother who questions Wendy’s ability to be a good maternal figure for Danny. She is judged to be “an inadequate mother” (King 1977, 51). Her mother’s hate for Jack dates from the beginning of their relationship; Wendy was chased from the familial house, her mother blaming her for her divorce:

She wants to keep bearing you, Jack had said. The more times you phone her, the more times you crawl back begging forgiveness, the more she can beat you with your father [...] she can go on making believe it was your fault” (King 1977, p.49-50).

This explains her absence at her own daughter’s wedding. Ironically, Wendy’s mother is depicted as being as controlling as Jack. The resentment and anger Wendy feels towards her mother lead to her categorization as “such a grade A bitch” (King 1977, 42).

If Jack’s mother accepted her husband’s lies and violence out of religious righteousness, Wendy accepts to push backward the idea of divorce -although she accepts that her marriage is a “lopsided defeat” (54)- because of the infallible bond between Danny and his father and her own awe for her son: “she was in awe of her child -awe in the strict meaning of that word: a kind of undefined superstitious dread” (King 1977, p. 56). Her attitude towards her child is of devotion rather than protection. Wendy’s feelings are of complete hopelessness, failure and guilt explaining the fact that

She had never dreamed there could be so much pain in life when there was nothing physically wrong. She hurt all the time. How much of it was her fault? The question haunted her” (King 1977, p. 54).

As a consequence, Wendy feels unhappy and unstable: “she leaned into the fragrant, curling stream of the tea and wept. In grief and loss for the past, and terror of the future” (King 1977, p. 16). She cries on her unfulfilled life and on the awareness of her lost dreams.

Both the paternal and the maternal figures seem helpless in coming to terms with their own personal tearing apart originating from their past. The repeated patterns of failure, of physical and moral abuse, account for the fact that the process of containment depicted by Rick Curnow in his lecture Trauma: a Psychoanalytic Perspective is doomed to fail for the mother:

Containment is fundamental in the relationship between parent and infant. It means that the mother can grasp and take into herself, as a container, something of the baby’s earliest anxieties. We conceptualise these early anxieties as being a fear about such terrors as being dropped, or falling forever, of annihilation, of ceasing to exist, of death (Curnow 2007).

The pattern of abuse ingrained in her marriage and her endlessly conflictual relationship with her own mother prefigure Wendy’s inability to bring any reassurance or protection for Danny as regards the violence and deviance consuming the paternal figure or later on against the evil forces of the Overlook. Rick Curnow shows the consequences of “a traumatic dysfunctional family situation” on a child. Trauma already runs through the veins of the familial history and is enhanced
once the family is in the Overlook where it correlates with the omnipresence of supernatural phenomena.

1.b. Danny and the Overlook

Danny’s different experiences at the Overlook hotel give life to Vickroy’s definition of trauma and to the declared importance of exposing “events [so] overwhelmingly intense that they impair normal emotional or cognitive response”. Danny’s traumatic experiences appear to be in link with his gift of the shining which gives him precognitive visions of the future, helps him sense his parents’ thoughts and communicate with Tony, his invisible friend, who turns out to be an older version of himself. His gift makes him sense the destructive force haunting the Overlook but also expands his visions brought about by the supernatural, vampiric force of the hotel.

The first traumatic event occurs in chapter 25 untitled “Inside 217”. In this revisited Bluebeard chamber, Danny trespasses the frontier of the Symbolic; he scorns away the paternal interdiction of entering the room. Danny sees the living corpse of a former host, Mrs Massey, who committed suicide in the bathtub. She is described in a grotesque hypermonstration of bodily putrefaction:

She was bloated and purple, her gas-filled belly rising out of the cold, ice-rimmed water like some fleshy island. Her eyes were fixed on Danny’s, glassy and huge, like marbles. She was grinning, her purple lips pulled back in a grimace. Her breasts lolled. Her pubic hair floated” (King 1977, p. 239).

The traumatic experience holds to the monstrous, otherized feminine, the decayed and naked body which embody Freud’s notion of the uncanny, the ultimate return of the repressed in the presence of death. Danny’s ultimate confrontation with Mrs Massey is left in the blank of the text when “the years-damp, bloat, fish-smelling hands closed softly around his throat and he was turned into that dead and purple face” (King 1977, p. 240). Danny and the readers plunge their gaze into nothingness, into a coming to life of their most nightmarish fantasies. Moreover, the confrontation with Mrs Massey’s living corpse confines Danny within the walls of silence. He confronts the Real which is left blank precisely because of its ungraspability by the Logos. The readers’ imagination is left to run at high speed for they only see, like Wendy and Jack, the immediate effects of trauma.

The narrative unveils another traumatic experience in chapter 34 untitled “the hedges”. Playing outside with his snow shoes, Danny is chased by three hedge lions, a dog and a rabbit. Trauma holds again to the confrontation with the impossible which shatters normal cognitive responses. It is also marked by the paradoxical feeling of imprisonment in an open snowy space: “the world closed down to the dazzling snow, the green hedged, and the whispery sound of his snowshoes and something else” (King 1977, p. 319). Danny is prisoner of his utter panic magnified by the angry roar he hears, a smell of blood and hedges and the claw-like hedges scratching his calf. Facing this “something” which is not depicted, this stain of the Real, Danny’s legs give way.

Lacan tried to uncover the processes of the unconscious through language and its associations. The Imaginary is related to identifications; the Symbolic is marked by language and is in link with the Law of the Father. The Real corresponds to what cannot be grasped by the Logos.
These two traumatic experiences leave first and foremost physical marks. Following the episode with Mrs Massey, Danny’s neck is puffy with bruises. He is cut out from the order of language. There is an impossibility to vocalise his terror: “Danny shrieked. But the sound never escaped his lips; turning inward and inward, it fell down in his darkness like a stone in a well” (King 1977, p. 239). The repetition of “inward” and the imagery of a descent into nothingness prefigure the spiral-like and self-consuming pattern of trauma. The confrontation with Mrs Massey left as a void in the text parallels the radical sense of disconnection and isolation gone through by Danny.

Not only is Danny soundless but his eyes start from their sockets and his urine breaks. The absence of language and of control over his body reflects a process of regression. Danny’s lack of action -“still and silent, his unfocused eyes directed out into indifferent space” (King 1977, p. 251)- constitutes his body’s reaction to seeing the ungraspable. The process of regression affecting language and bodily reaction highlight the fact that “trauma imposes itself outside the grasp of cognition” (Baer 2002, p.10). The absence of movement -he is catatonic- goes along a bodily dissociation. Danny has the “zombielike face of a stranger, the eyes dull and opaque, the mouth pursued babyishly around his thumb” (King 1977, p. 264). The stress laid on the sucking of his thumb recalls Freud’s oral stage in which the mouth is conceived as the primary erogenous zone; this confirms Danny’s regression to the pre-oedipal stage. The sucking of his thumb echoes the oral gratification searched by the infant, though this gesture is for Danny not so much a gratification as a means of soothing or an attempt at oblivion. The feeling of dissociation corresponds to Baer’s presentation of “the shattering force of trauma result[ing] from precisely that brutal expropriation of the victim’s self” (Baer 2002, p. 20).

Danny’s return to the order of language is later on characterized by sounds: “he suddenly began to shriek, mad sounds that escaped his straining throat in bolt after crazy, echoing bolt” (King 1977, p. 265). The numerous suspension points suffusing page 273 reinforce Danny’s psychological disruption, his shattered sense of self. These elements are enlightened by the fact that “trauma is dispossession and radical self estrangement, it defines the traumatized individual through something that he or she does not own” (Baer 2002, p. 20). Danny loses the ability to verbalise and the blanks left in the text convey the sense that, at the image of Danny bordering on insanity, even the linguistic rendering of trauma is tottering on the brink of nothingness. The suspension points and the insertion of blanks are combined with the use of terms emphasizing the idea of a lack: “blank, paralysis, only, indifferent blankness” (King 1977, p. 255); “slack, empty expression” (King 1977, p. 265). The use of repetitions and negative forms -“the door would not open, would not, would not, would not” (King 1977, 240); “Nothing there nothing there not there at all NOTHING THERE THERE IS NOTHING!” (King 1977, p. 240)- reinforce Danny’s confinement in the spiral of void left by the traumatic experiences. They appear to leave the body caught into a state of stasis. The term “regression” (King 1977, p. 323) is used in the text itself.

The confrontation between Danny and the monstrosized father is the final traumatic experience for Danny in The Shining. The outcome is however different from the previous experiences. When Jack eventually hunts Danny with a mallet, the son is ready for the confrontation, recognizes his father is possessed and is verbally able to reject, abject the father figure: “‘you’re not my daddy’” (King 1977, p. 475). King reworks Julia Kristeva’s analysis in The...
Powers of Horror of the necessary abjection of the mother by the child to establish the boundary between the self and the other, to leave the semiotic stage (union with the mother) and enter the symbolic stage. In *The Shining*, the possessed father becomes the Other whose rejection by Danny is necessary to obtain victory over the evil spirit haunting the Overlook.

The traumatic experiences endured by Danny combine the experiences which according to Judith Herman in *Trauma and Recovery* increase the likelihood of harm: entrapment, exhaustion and being the witness of grotesque deaths. Curnow stresses the fact that trauma occurs when “there is a sense that death is imminent, or that one is threatened by total annihilation of the self”. In those moments of direct confrontation to death at the Overlook, Danny is made aware of the possible negation of both his body and the other’s body. His difficulty to find words to depict the moment of trauma conjoins Cathy Caruth’s insistence on the unspeakability of trauma. The ending of *The Shining* shows the impossibility for Danny to attain the necessary transformation of the traumatic events into memories due to the survivor guilt: “sometimes I wish it had been me. It was my fault. All my fault” (King 1977, p. 495). This guilt feeling corresponds to what Rick Curnow describes as one of post traumatic signs.

It can be said that the hotel also contains its own trauma represented by the evil force accumulated throughout the years. As the boiler eventually explodes causing the fall of the Overlook and Jack’s death, a shape emerges: “a huge dark shape … for a moment it assumed the shape of a huge, obscene manta, and then the wind seemed to catch it, to tear it and shred it like old dark paper” (King 1977, 486). This shape -which is a manifestation of the Real and on which any macabre fantasies can be projected- echoes the various shapes taken by the traumatic memories the hotel was permeated with as well as the paradoxical destructive and hypnotising force haunting the hotel. This hypnotising force certainly accounts for the shattering impact on Danny as a kid and the persistence of the post traumatic signs in his adult life.

2. A life overwhelmed by trauma

King hints at the immediate aftermath of trauma at the end of *The Shining* before exploring it on a larger scale in *Doctor Sleep*. The ending of *The Shining* hints at Danny’s survivor guilt feeling and at his reliving of the traumatic experience in recurrent nightmares. This re-enactment of the past can be explained by the impossible categorisation of this traumatic past into consciousness, confirming Kardiner’s and Spiegel’s statement that unless the traumatic memories are integrated into consciousness, the improvement would not last. The first chapter of *Dr Sleep* presents in a more detailed manner the traumatic past as a haunting force relentlessly pursuing Danny. In a movement of repetition compulsion, the text comes back on the aftermath of the hotel explosion. If Wendy and Dick Halloran (who was a cook at the hotel and helped rescue Danny and his mother) bear the physical marks of the experience, the effect is clearly psychological on Danny: “only the child was unhurt. Physically, at least” King 2013, p. 3). The judiciary measures taken to help the mother and her son come to terms with their traumatic experiences by providing a financial help for three years hardly hide the scars of trauma. In his lecture, Curnow highlights the dual effect of trauma on personality development, engendering either a complete shattering of the personality or allowing to attain the path of resilience. A close reading of *Doctor Sleep* situates Danny on both of these axes.
The beginning of the narrative illustrates Curnow’s viewpoint that

There is an initial breakdown when the protective shield is breached by trauma, and there may be a catastrophic disruption of functioning.’ The victim ‘may be silent or withdrawn … Sometimes we describe people in this state as ‘dissociated’ (Curnow 2007).

The process of dissociation already visible when Danny was a child reappears two years following the burning of the Overlook. Danny’s loss of speech and dissociation mark the “apparent collision of two temporalities, the incomplete past of the trauma and the presence of the symptom in catalepsy” (Baer 2002, 51). Aged eight, Danny is visited by Mrs Massey. The traumatic past resurges into the present and shatters any rational explanation: “the rational part of his mind told him she was just a fragment of unremembered bad dream that had followed him out of sleep and across the hall to the bathroom” (King 2013, 5). The sight of Mrs Massey and most importantly of the abject fluids left on the toilet seat once more open a fissure in the symbolic world. The fluids are a stain of the traumatic Real which pursues Danny and prevents a total resolution of trauma. Danny perfectly stresses the repetition compulsion lying at the heart of trauma: “she’ll come back, don’t you get it? She’ll come back and come back and come back” (King 2013, 10). The ternary rhythm highlighted by the italics marks the inexorable return of trauma. Nevertheless, Danny does not seek to re-enact “a previous circumstance in which the infantile self was overwhelmed by a feeling that the very survival of the self was threatened” (Curnow 2007) but he appears to be pursued by a past which threatens his sense of self. The repetition compulsion at the heart of trauma “blocks routine mental processes from converting an experience into memory or forgetting it” (Baer 2002, p. 9). It explains Danny’s impossibility of coming to terms with trauma, all the more so as the event is in link with the supernatural.

Mrs Massey appears as a reminder of unresolved trauma, of lost childhood innocence and of the loss of the adored paternal figure. Addressing the issue of trauma brings to the fore the question of memories deriving from the disruptive experience as well as the ways to contain these memories. In this matter, Target equals childhood with dissociation rather than with repression; repression is thought to be a more mature defensive process. Dissociation is the immediate post traumatic disorder for Danny and is included in Judith Herman’s reference to constriction or numbing to designate how a person alters her/his state of consciousness in the face of trauma. Further ahead in the narrative, Dick nevertheless teaches Danny the process of repression in order to solve his trauma, contradicting in that sense Target’s viewpoint. In an analeptic movement, the narrative returns on the sexual harassment Dick endured from his grandfather when he was a child. The failure of containment by Dick’s parents left him in a state of omnipresent panic, hopelessness and silence. Following his grandfather’s death, Dick had to confront the return of his trauma through the presence of his ghost. Dick’s grandmother taught him the art of repression to prevent the return of the traumatic corpse. This process of repression implies imagining mental boxes and confining the ghosts into them although the process itself is left to the reader’s imagination with the insertion of a blank in the text.

Repression in mental boxes however only silences trauma but does not provide with a definite resolution:
Whether or not they were alive (in their undead fashion) no longer mattered. What mattered was they were never getting out. He was safe. That was what he thought then. […] Sometimes we just get it wrong” (King 2013, pp. 18-19).

Indeed, Doctor Sleep depicts the re-emergence of those traumatic memories when he is an adult through the form of nightmarish visions, disconnection and constriction.

Among the corrosive effects of trauma on personality development, Curnow mentions “disordered behaviours such as suicidality, drug abuse and self mutilation” (Curnow 2007); likewise, the Trauma Theory Abbreviated mentions that traumatized people feel more and more alienated from everything that gives our lives meaning - themselves, other people, a sense of direction and purpose … It is not surprising, then, that slow self destruction through addictions, or fast self destruction through suicide, is often the final outcome of these syndromes” (Bloom 1999, p. 8).

Judith Herman perceives drugs or alcohol as another form of constriction because of their numbing effects. Danny’s post traumatic disorders as an adult appear to correspond to these patterns of destruction.

He is shown to be recurrently engaging into repetitive self destructive behaviours; alcohol, drugs and sex are his common routine: “the basic scenario never changed. He got drunk, someone said the wrong thing, chaos and bar-carnage followed. There was a dangerous dog inside his head. Sober, he could keep it on a leash” (King 2013, p. 33). The first epitaphs of Doctor Sleep, being quotes from the Big Book of Alcoholic Anonymous, confirm the role played by alcohol as a way to tackle his unresolved trauma issues. His slow self destruction is confirmed by his enunciated desire to die: “I wish I were dead” (King 2013, p. 33). This quote confirms Bloom’s assertion of the death drive as one constituting element of post traumatic disorders. Danny’s life epitomizes emptiness and instability: he moves from city to city, lives day by day, has no stable place of living. He has no attachment, no relation to others.

In the vein of these patterns of disruption and alienation, Danny experiences a different traumatic event in his adult life. Though not related to the supernatural, this event epitomizes his absence of empathy and his feeling of distanciation. One morning, he wakes up, still drunk, next to a young woman, whose name first eludes him. His throbbing face, clogged-shut nostrils and the lurches from his belly bring back the resurfacing of the memories from the previous night filled with alcohol, drug, verbal and physical violence. The young woman named Deenie has an eighteen month-old baby, Tommie, whom she evidently abandoned during the night to go out with Danny. She left cocaine at hand’s reach of her son. Danny decides to steal the only 70$ she has in compensation for his 500 $ lost on drugs, justifying his act by the fact that Deenie feeds her baby with food stamps. He purposely brushes the voice of consciousness away -“she might need that 70 bucks for groceries’ (King 2013, p. 40)- or that of his mother’s and leaves Deenie and her child in a state of wretchedness even though his shining helps him perceive that they are mistreated by Deenie’s older brother.
This memory of abandonment, his denial of and flight from his responsibilities (looking for Deenie’s brother and prevent the sure death of the mother and her child) and the guilt ensuing from these facts constitute another trauma he will bear up to the end of the narrative as a burden. This echoes Dominick LaCapra’s statement of “the hauntingly possessive ghosts of traumatic events” (LaCapra 2001, p. xi). This wound, always opened considering its resurgence in Danny’s daily life and nightmares, has no supernatural connection but adds up to the past traumatic events of the Overlook and increases Danny’s feelings of disconnection and his damaged self.

Danny’s attitude of neglect as regards Deenie and her child illustrates another statement from Rick Curnow:

> The child becomes an adult who may learn to ‘evacuate’ his painful feeling in action and one way of doing this is to re-enact on his or her own children, or towards other people, the same abuse that he or she suffered in childhood (Curnow 2007).

Danny’s attitude of abandonment, self hatred and guilt mirror the feelings of remorse and emotional emptiness deriving from his childhood. His instability indicates a desire for oblivion, magnified by alcohol used as an auxiliary to erase his traumatic guilt. Danny’s constant moving away reinforces his difficulty in establishing and retaining connections and his sense of disrupted attachment. The text itself is marked by this traumatic act. The chapter untitled “Mama” is replete with hyphens, suspension points, italic sentences, segments of sentences in capital letters; the word “canny” is repeated six times; sentences become shorter and shorter until only one word remains on the page as though the text itself is in the throes of the spiral of trauma.

*Doctor Sleep* nonetheless progressively hints at the positive side of the gift of the shining which Danny uses to help people die peacefully. Moving two years after Deenie’s incident, the chapter “Welcome to Teenytown” marks the beginning of Danny’s path towards redemption.

### 3. On the path of healing

Laurie Vickroy points out that “trauma cannot be faced alone and [...] recovery is possible only within the context of relationships” (Vickroy 2002, p. 22). In Danny’s case, at his arrival in the town of Frazier, a bond is first established with Billy Freeman who works for the town maintenance crew. A relation of trust emerges right from their first encounter. Additionally, Casey Kingsley, a former alcoholic himself, offers Danny a job and helps him get over his addiction, offering a sense of safety and protection.

The reader recognizes in Danny’s return of his invisible friend, Tony, the necessary confrontation with the past and the reopening of his mental closets for the healing process to be engaged. Danny hears Tony speak after many years of absence and he sees Tony waving in the window of a hospice. The return of his shine and Tony’s presence reopen the doors of the past and the need for the acceptation of his gift.

The repetition compulsion appears as a key element both of trauma and of the healing process. According to Vickroy, “random exposure to anything remotely associated with a trauma
could return the victims to that experience” (Vickroy 2002, p. 31). The views of the mountains from his rented room in Frazier remind Danny of the coming of the snow at the Overlook:

His recollections of the Overlook had faded to hazy gray over the years, but as he unpacked his few things, a memory surfaced... and it was a kind of surfacing, like some nasty organic artefact (the decayed body of a small animal, say) floating to the surface of a deep lake (King 2013, p. 65).

The macabre repressed elements are on the verge of resurfacing. The repetition compulsion revealing the inevitability of its resurgence is lexically marked in such expressions as: “it will never stop” (King 2013, p. 75). “It will be back” (King 2013, p. 76). It is magnified in the following quote: “the world was the Overlook Hotel, where the party never ended. Where the dead were alive forever” (King 2013, p. 77). The force of trauma may be as endless as the haunting memories. The return to the past is necessary but with a distanciation from the original event. Danny and his father share for instance the same thought during their respective job interview (Jack to be a caretaker at the Overlook and Danny to be employed at the town common). Nevertheless Danny is able to suppress this thought -“officious prick” (King 2013, p. 62)- whereas his father had not.

The re-enactment of the past tainted with the process of distanciation is found in Danny’s nightmarish visions. In one of these visions, two temporalities converge: the traumatic occurrences in the Overlook as well as his guilt feeling concerning Deenie. First seeing Deenie’s ghost, Danny’s body is once more that of a five-year-old: “he was 5 again, Danny was 5, the Overlook was ashes and bones, but here was a dead woman, one he had stolen from” (King 2013, p. 67). Danny’s voice regresses to that of a child: “it was Danny’s voice, the high, frail, chanting voice of a child. ‘False face, not there, not real’” (King 2013, p. 67). Not only is he submitted to body regression but his mind returns to a five-year-old stage in its mode of functioning, hence the repetition of the formula he used as a child to make the ghosts of the Overlook vanish. Danny situates himself in what Judith Herman calls the process of intrusion. As a PTSD, it designates how the traumatic event recurs in the present, encoded in the form of vivid sensations and images, resembling the memories of young children. The traumatic scenes are reenacted in a disguised manner:

He turned on his side and something rolled against his back when he did. No, not something. Someone. Someone had gotten into bed with him. Deenie had gotten into bed with him. Only it felt too small to be Deenie. It felt more like a – He scrambled out of bed, landed awkwardly on the floor, and looked over his shoulder. It was Deenie’s little boy, Tommy. The right side of his skull was caved in. Bone splinters protruded through bloodstained fair hair. Gravy scaly muck-brains- was drying on one cheek” (King 2013, pp. 68-9).

The mention of the damaged skull, the bone splinters and the blood irremediably returns the reader to Danny’s possessed father smashing his own head with a mallet at the end of The Shining. Danny seems to relive the overwhelming feeling of horror he had had as a child but this feeling is displaced on baby Tommy. The biting imprint of the event returns when he wakes up: he vainlessly searches for physical remnants of his dream on his sheet just as the unresolved traumatic events leave stigmas on his psyche.
The gift of the shining contributes to bringing back to the surface his traumatic experiences, getting him close to insanity. Danny closes his eyes for his maddening visions to disappear as though the scopic denial could block the resurgence of the traumatic elements. Haunted by proleptic or nightmarish dreams, alcohol seems the only salvation: “the mind was a blackboard. Booze was the eraser” (King 2013, p. 76). Alcohol is thus at the same time a marker of his trauma but also a means of survival facing this trauma.

On his path of healing, Danny meets the young Abra Rafaela Stone (later on revealed to be his niece). Abra also possesses the gift of the shining. Her power is nevertheless much stronger than Danny’s. Contacting Danny through words written on a blackboard, a strong bond is created helping Danny rebuild a positive sense of self. In the course of the narrative, they dismantle the True Knot, a group of modern vampires who live on steam -the essence of a person- contained in canisters and which makes its members younger.

In order to dismantle the True Knot, Danny is forced to face the nightmares of his past and open the mental boxes he has kept locked in his mind for thirty-two years. On his path of healing, Danny is assisted by living friends, Abra’s doctor, Billy or Abra’s parents. He also receives help from the deceased Dick, who talks to him through a patient’s dead body.

To fight The True Knot, Abra uses astral projection, enabling Danny and her to exchange bodies temporarily. The repetition process is once more at play in the confrontation with the True Knot: its members reside where the Overlook used to stand. On his way to the final confrontation, Danny sees places of his childhood; once at Roof O’ the World, he recreates the room he had as a child: “a room now made only of memory” (King 2013, p. 444). The process of healing is entirely linked with the acceptance of the return of the repressed and a revisiting of the past.

Danny uses the pains of the past (the ghost of Horace Derwent, the owner of the Overlook in 1945) and those of the present (Abra’s grandmother’s cancer stored in a leaking mental box) to kill the remaining members of The True Knot. He is helped by his father’s ghost who intervenes to help kill the chief, Rose the Hat, and the ultimate goodbye marks the return of Danny’s unconditional love for his father and the acceptance of the latter’s past flaws.

Danny’s path of redemption eventually brings back order in his life: he has a stable job (he works as a janitor at Helen Rivington House) and a stable life (he has his driver’s license back, goes to AA meetings and is successful at resisting temptations) which contribute to establish safety and reconnect with ordinary life.

The ending of the novel is marked by two elements: after a 15 year-old sobriety, Danny eventually confesses his traumatic guilt about abandoning Deenie and her son. He situates himself in one of the key elements of healing for Herman: “the role of the community”. Danny is able to share the traumatic experience and the members of the AA club de-dramatize his act: “what he’d done didn’t revolt them. It didn’t even surprise them. They had heard worse. Some had done worse” (King 2013, p. 472). Once his guilt is publicly recognized, Danny can move forward. He is, through his confession, the author of his own recovery. This corresponds to Herman’s notion of “commonality”: Danny discovers that others have had similar experiences and can understand him.
His verbalisation echoes Abra’s confession of her first drink and of her anger issue. At that moment, Danny is able to establish a passage from an overpowering narrative “where one can describe past events but continue to feel buried in that original experience” to a “witnessed narrative” “wherein an observant distance and perspective is maintained in the narrative even when describing overpowering events” (Vickroy 2002, p. 29). Danny accomplishes the “witnessed narrative” when he narrates the history of violence in their family and he is able to integrate the traumatic memory into his life story. He is able to set a distanciation between the sins of his forefathers and his resolved violence. The repetitive pattern is as necessary as the shining and the haunting past and both cannot be dissociated from Danny’s identity; they are needed for him to obtain reconciliation with himself to become the person he wants to be, to be more forgiving of himself.

King’s narratives are suffused with the notion of trauma affecting the different characters at various levels in The Shining and Doctor Sleep. This article primarily kept in view Danny Torrance’s path of degeneration and redemption roamed throughout his adult life and deriving for the most part from his childhood. The narratives unveil the traumatic residues at the origin of an identity crisis leaving physical and psychological traces, thus highlighting Laplanche’s and Pontalis’s emphasis on “the subjects’ incapacity to respond adequately to [trauma] and the upheaval and long lasting effects that it brings about in the psychical organisation” (Laplanche 1974, p. 465). Marked by the supernatural events that took place at the Overlook, Danny has to face post traumatic disorders which intermingle with an act he commits as an adult and that he considers as immoral. His guilt superimposes on past traumas he thought he had carefully repressed in mental boxes, remaining an everlasting open wound. King exemplifies the image Cathy Caruth offers of the voice of trauma emerging from the wound itself. The path of redemption necessitates the acceptance of the resurgence of the past to recognize and complete the void left by trauma; for Danny, it equals verbalizing the absence left by trauma. The narratives are a journey for Danny’s reconstruction of a coherent system of meaning to counteract the dispossession and loss marked in the body of the texts themselves. The narratives are about surviving trauma and undoubtedly about surviving the father’s absence through a repossession of the past and its memories, a restoration of important relationships and self-esteem. The gift of the shining captures the essence of trauma: it is a source of deconstruction and reconstruction, blinding with its love and destabilising force; it is a clairvoyance which conveys the necessity of opening up to one’s memories but also conveying a sense of the individual always under the process of construction.
References


Étalement urbain et disparité spatiale des modes d’accès à l’énergie électrique dans la ville de Ngaoundéré (Nord-Cameroun)

Hervé Gondie
Université de Maroua, Cameroun

Basile Paul Eloundou Messi
Université de Maroua, Cameroun

Résumé


Mots clés : Urbanisation non planifiée, étalement urbain, analyse spatiale, énergie électrique, Ngaoundéré Cameroun.
Abstract

In Africa South of the Sahara, urbanization either follows a plan (planned urbanization) or occurs in an anarchical way (without a preliminary Plan). Electricity is a significant resource for the sustainable development of cities. Its distribution in a city or country requires the setting-up of any equipment which together form a network. Ngaoundéré located in Northern Cameroon, like many other towns of developing countries in Africa, is confronted with several problems. This article relates to a spatial analysis of access modes to electric power relative to the occupation of space. It is based on the exploitation of spatial data base of the electricity company in Cameroon (AES-SONEL), the spatial distribution of the population, observations on the field and investigations from local populations. This made it possible to show that spatial disparity of access modes to electric power results from the combined effect of the anarchical urbanization of the city and the financial capacities of inhabitants to subscribed to the network.

Keywords: Non planned urbanization, urban sprawl out, spatial analysis, electric power, Ngaoundéré Cameroon
Introduction

La notion de développement durable est rentrée dans le langage courant au milieu des années 1980. Les promoteurs de ce concept le considèrent comme un développement qui assure les besoins des générations présentes sans compromettre celle des générations futures. La notion développement s'applique aussi bien en économie, en politique et plus encore en ce qui concerne la protection de l’environnement. La ville est un espace qui intègre l’ensemble des conceptions de la notion de développement durable, car elle est le lieu d’interaction entre la politique, l’économie et les problèmes d’environnement. D’après Pierre George et al. (2006), la ville est « un groupement de population agglomérée défini par un effectif de population et par une forme d’organisation économique et sociale. L’urbanisation est au sens stricte « le processus de développement des villes en taille et en nombre d’habitants, en extension territoriale, en terme aussi de mode de vie ». C’est un phénomène qui a pris de l’ampleur au siècle dernier avec la constitution aux quatre coins du monde de métropoles millionnaires en nombre d’habitants. Toutefois, c’est le mode de développement des villes qui diffèrent en fonction des pays et des sociétés. L’étallement est le mode de croissance qui caractérise particulièrement les villes d’Afrique subsaharienne. En effet, les villes camerounaises sont confrontées depuis quelques années aux extensions spatiales. La croissance urbaine échappe donc au contrôle des autorités. Ce phénomène de croissance spectaculaire des villes vers les périphéries entrainent de multiples problèmes d’aménagement. Ces derniers affectent la santé de l’environnement urbain et rendent difficiles les conditions de vies dans certains quartiers. La ville durable intègre donc à la protection de l'environnement les exigences sociales essentielles de la population ainsi que les programmes d'action sanitaire, de l'emploi et du logement, qui améliore "la qualité de vie des citoyens plutôt que de simplement optimiser la consommation.


1. État de la question

Toutes les formes d’énergies (que quel soit le mode de production) sont importantes pour le développement des activités humaines depuis le début du XXᵉ siècle et en ce XXIᵉ siècle. Dans les villes en général, plusieurs formes d’énergies sont utilisées à l’instar du Gaz, du pétrole, l’électricité (Beaujeu-Garnier, 1995). Ces formes d’énergies pour être distribuées doivent s’adapter au mode de croissance des villes et leur configuration forme un réseau dans l’espace urbain. Pour ce qui est de l’énergie électrique, il ne se limite pas aux lignes de transport et de distribution, il inclut aussi les barrages, les centrales thermiques ou hydrauliques, les transformateurs (Dupuy, 1991). L’implantation des équipements électriques en milieu urbain devrait être faite dans le cadre des politiques d’aménagement urbain, ce qui implique l’intervention de plusieurs acteurs (Harter et al., 1982). La distribution de l’énergie électrique fait donc appel à une maîtrise de l’aménagement de l’espace urbain.
Cependant, l’étalement urbain qui caractérise la croissance de certains quartiers et l’échec de l’exécution des plans d’urbanisation seraient à l’origine des inadéquations des infrastructures en milieu urbain. C’est le but de cette démonstration dans les différents quartiers malfamés de la ville de Ngaoundéré.

De nos jours, des outils sont de plus en plus mis en œuvre dans le but de permettre un meilleur contrôle de l’occupation et de l’utilisation de l’espace en général et de l’espace urbain en particulier. Selon Rouet (1991) les SIG sont un outil qui permet de constituer une base de données à partir de laquelle on peut cartographier toute sorte d’objet à la surface de la terre (bâtiment, parcelles, lampadaires, lignes électriques). Depuis le début des années 1990, la cartographie numérique est donc de plus en plus à l’ordre du jour dans plusieurs projets d’aménagement urbain (Tadonki, 1995). En outre, l’importance de l’utilité de la Géomatique et des SIG pour le suivi et l’entretien du réseau vinaire de la ville de Ngaoundéré a été montrée par Tchotsoua (2001). Il revient donc de savoir si ces outils d’aide à la décision peuvent permettre d’améliorer la qualité de la distribution de l’énergie électrique dans un contexte d’urbanisation marquée par l’étalement spatial de la ville de Ngaoundéré (Fig 1).

**Figure 1. Localisation et présentation de l’espace urbain de Ngaoundéré**

2. La notion d’étalement urbain

Rien ne semble pouvoir endiguer le développement vertigineux des villes au Cameroun en général et celle de la partie septentrionale en particulier. L’étalement urbain est le mode de croissance de l’ensemble de ces villes y compris celle de Ngaoundéré. La notion d’étalement urbain, (ou urban sprawl en anglais), désigne le phénomène d’extension de plus en plus vaste et discontinue de l’urbanisation, entraînant de profondes modifications des structures urbaines et des déséquilibres sociaux et environnementaux. C’est une extension de l’urbanisation pouvant se manifester sous la forme d’un mitage, d’un développement linéaire de l’urbanisation le long des infrastructures de
transport, occasionnant une consommation d’espace importante (Lanneaux et al. 2007). Selon Pascal Baud et al. (1997), elle se manifeste par l’extension des banlieues et des espaces périurbains. Toutefois, le terme suburbain désigne une zone périphérique très densément peuplé et proche de la ville centre. Un essor de la population entraîne des difficultés à maîtriser l’extension dans l’espace et la multiplication des bidonvilles qui s’accroissent à une vitesse au moins deux fois supérieure à celle de l’urbanisation. La persistance de ce phénomène dans les villes est surtout due à une croissance démographique qui entraîne une pression importante sur l’espace. Le désir d’être propriétaire d’une parcelle de terrain est la cause majeure du morcellement et la vente de terrains (surtout dans les zones non aedificandi) par les particuliers.

3. Approche méthodologique adoptée

Plusieurs sources d’informations ont été utilisées pour étoffer les différentes articules de cette recherche.

D’abord, les données de la littérature ont été exploitées dans le but de comprendre le processus de croissance urbaine en général et celle des villes du Cameroun septentrional en particulier. La notion d’étalement urbain a aussi été analysée sur la base des travaux d’autres auteurs. Ceci a permis de ressortir la particularité de ce phénomène dans la ville de Ngaoundéré. Une analyse des documents cartographiques a donné ainsi, les différentes étapes de croissance de la ville avec les restructurations qui ont été effectuées dans certains quartiers. Une deuxième phase a consisté à exploiter et analyser la base de données SIG de la Société de distribution de l’énergie électrique (AES-SONEL) de la ville de Ngaoundéré. Ce document comporte des données sur la configuration des équipements de distribution de l’énergie sur l’ensemble de la ville. Cette recherche s’est intéressée principalement aux données de la configuration des lignes Moyennes et Basses tensions. Par les différentes méthodes de calcul et d’analyse spatiale qu’offre nous offre le logiciel SIG MapInfo, des calculs ont été effectués pour estimer des superficies des quartiers et croiser avec la longueur des lignes électriques, ce qui a permis d’obtenir en quelque sorte les densités de couverture spatiale du réseau mesuré ici et kilomètre par hectare. Le calcul des densités des réseaux a été effectué principalement sur les lignes « Basses tensions qui sont celles qui alimentent directement les ménages.

Des entretiens avec les agents techniques et commerciaux de cette entreprise à Ngaoundéré ont permis de connaître les techniques de découpages de la ville pour la maîtrise du réseau. Sur cette même base des informations sur le nombre d’abonné par zones et îlots couverts ont été obtenues dans ces services. Une analyse de la distribution spatiale de la population a été faite pour compléter celle relative aux équipements de distribution dont nous avons fait allusion plus haut. Ajouter aux données de la répartition spatiale des abonnés au réseau formel de distribution de l’énergie ceci a permis d’identifier les inadéquations et les insuffisances de la fourniture de l’énergie électrique dans la ville.

Une enquête auprès de 127 ménages dans trois quartiers de la ville afin, d’avoir un aperçu sur les branchements informels dans la ville de Ngaoundéré. 33 ménages ont été enquêtés à Baladji I, 44 à Onaref et 50 à Gadamabanga. Des observations directes ont permis de compléter l’ensemble de ces données.
3. L’étalement urbain à Ngaoundéré, une marque dans le processus d’urbanisation

Comme l’ensemble des villes du Nord-Cameroun, la ville de Ngaoundéré a eu un processus de développement triparti contrairement aux villes de la partie méridionale qui n’ont eu que deux périodes d’évolution (Simeu Kamdem, 2008). Ainsi, successivement on a la ville précoloniale, la coloniale et la ville coloniale. Le site de ces cités a été mis en place bien avant l’arrivée des puissances coloniales.

La ville ancienne (précolonial) s’est mise en place dans les années 1830. Les quartiers qui se sont créés autour du Lamidat de Ngaoundéré forment ce que l’on appelle aujourd’hui la vieille ville. La forme circulaire de cette partie de la ville a aussi donné un réseau viaire assez densifié et de forme variée sous forme de labyrinthe (Simeu Kamdem, 2008). Ces multiples voies de communication ont été créées dans le but de relier les différents quartiers avec le siège du pouvoir politique, religieux et traditionnel qu’est le Lamidat. Ce secteur de Ngaoundéré épouse donc les caractéristiques d’une ville musulmane dans laquelle l’ensemble des activités est concentré autour d’une place centrale (la mosquée, le palais du roi ou le Lamidat).

L’époque coloniale qu’a connue les grandes villes du Cameroun et Ngaoundéré en particulier viendra créer une ville de type européen hors de la ville précoloniale. Cette ville coloniale constitue aujourd’hui les quartiers Camp Fonctionnaire, Administratif, Centre commercial et Résidentiel. Ce sont des secteurs de la ville qui ont été construits entre 1940 et 1960 (Tchotsoua, 2001). Cette partie de la ville a d’abord été occupée par les colons européens. Il est aujourd’hui le siège des services administratifs et abrite aussi les résidences de certains cadres de l’administration et le centre commercial.


L’urbanisation de la ville est caractérisée aussi par une densification de l’habitat doublée de l’extension spatiale. Ainsi, dans l’ensemble des quartiers non structurés, les habitations s’étendent sur des centaines de mètres, L’obstacle majeur ici est l’inaccessibilité et l’insuffisance de rues. Au stade actuel de la croissance de la ville de Ngaoundéré, les quartiers périphériques sont sujets au phénomène d’étalement urbain. En effet, avec une population en augmentation continue, la demande en logement s’accroît. Il y’a donc une forte pression sur l’espace constructible. Les bas fonds, les flancs de collines
et les zones périphériques (figure 2) sont les sites les plus exposés. Les terrains y sont très accessibles financièrement à cause des prix bas qui y sont pratiqués.

Source : Carte administrative du Cameroun, image Google Earth, 2012

Figure 2. Les principaux fronts d’étalement urbain à Ngaoundéré

Certains quartiers périphériques de la ville répondent à cette définition de l’étalement urbain. Il s’agit notamment de Gadamabanga au Nord, du quartier Onaref à l’Ouest, le secteur Sud et Sud-est (Bamyanga, Pétit séminaire et Burkina) et Baladji I à l’Ouest de la ville. Toutes ces zones se sont étendues de façon spontanées, de 1940 à 1960 Baladji I et de 1971 à 2001 pour les autres cités plus haut (Tchotsoua 2008). Certains de ces quartiers ont empiété sur des secteurs non aédificandi. Il s’agit notamment de Socarec et Onaref à l’Ouest et de Burkina au front Sud-Est. A Baladji I, on remarque aussi des extensions dans les bas fonds. Ici, les habitations longent le cours d’eau qui traverse le quartier. L’étalement urbain apparaît de plus en plus comme un des impacts négatifs du développement des villes et du renforcement de leur polarité en raison des conséquences qu’il peut induire (consommation d’espace, etc.) (Lanneaux et al. 2007). Il renchérit ainsi considérablement le fonctionnement de l’agglomération pour la collectivité, par les coûts d'investissement et de gestion des réseaux qu’il implique ; il crée des vulnérabilités dangereuses non seulement pour la santé publique (la pollution est proportionnelle aux distances parcourues), mais aussi à plus long terme pour l’économie générale de l’agglomération (énergie et transports). En effet, une extension spatiale incontrôlée de l’espace urbain nécessite aux décideurs et aux aménageurs beaucoup d’effort dans l’extension des infrastructures.
5. Étalement urbain et branchements électriques

La ville de Ngaoundéré (district 200 selon le découpage AES-SONEL) est constituée de 35 zones de distribution, lesquelles sont divisées en 467 îlots. 13864 abonnés sont répartis sur l’ensemble des zones et îlots que compte la ville. Techniquement, chaque transformateur de courant électrique dessert un nombre d’abonnés en fonction de sa puissance exprimée en kilovolt ampère (KVA). Les postes de transformation utilisés par l’entreprise de distribution de l’énergie électrique sont de deux types : les transformateurs posés sur un poteau électrique (H61) et ceux installés dans les cabines. Les poteaux électriques supportant les postes sont soit en bois, soit en béton armé. La fiche de distribution des factures a permis d’obtenir le nombre d’abonnés de chaque zone. Le nombre d’abonnés varie entre 200 et 1000 par zones. Pour obtenir le nombre d’abonnés au réseau électrique dans un quartier, il faut alors dénombrer les postes qui alimentent le quartier et additionner le nombre d’abonnés pour connaître l’ensemble d’abonnés par quartier. Les puissances des postes varient entre 25 et 1250 KVA. Les postes de puissances 25, 50, 100 et 250 KVA sont ceux qu’on retrouve le plus sur le réseau. La ville dispose donc d’un peu plus de 67 transformateurs qui couvrent les 13864 abonnés au réseau formel de distribution de l’énergie.

La mise en relation de la densité de population et le nombre d’abonnés actuel des postes de transformation MT-BT a permis de calculer le ratio nombre d’habitants pour un abonnement d’abord pour l’ensemble de la ville de Ngaoundéré et ensuite par zone de regroupement des postes en fonction de leur lieu de desserte. Nous avons alors un ratio global de 28 habitants pour un abonnement pour l’ensemble de la ville de Ngaoundéré. A l’échelle locale c’est à dire des quartiers, ce rapport se situe entre 3 et 126 habitants pour un abonnement respectivement pour le quartier haut plateau et le quartier Baladj I. On enregistre des chiffres intermédiaires de 80, 60, 40, 13 à 6 habitants pour un branchement électrique. Ainsi, les connexions informelles au réseau électrique sont les conséquences directes de l’étalement urbain sur l’implantation des infrastructures urbaines à Ngaoundéré. Le figure 2 suivant présente les modes d’accès à l’énergie dans 127 ménages que nous avons enquêtés dans trois quartiers de la ville. Sur 33 ménages enquêtés à Baladj I, 25 utilisent les branchements informels comme mode d’accès à l’énergie électrique. Nous avons aussi 30 sur 44 ménages enquêtés à Onaref et 36 sur 50 ménages enquêtés à Gadamabanga. La même situation s’observe ailleurs dans la ville.
Ces efforts sont encore insuffisants, c’est une situation qui n’est unique en son genre de l’entreprise de distribution de l’énergie électrique. Les branchements informels que certains qualifient de « toiles d’araignées » se développent toujours dans la ville. Les quartiers de la ville dont l’extension spatiale s’est effectuée de façon incontrôlée sont les plus exposés à ces types de connexions électriques informels. Il s’agit notamment de Baladji I, Onaref, Socarec, Burkina, Gadamabanga. L’expression « toile d’araignée » vient du fait que les câbles utilisés pour les interconnexions entre les ménages s’entrecroisent sous la forme d’une toile d’araignée. Dans ces quartiers, les raisons sont différentes pour ce qui est du recours à des branchements informels. La disposition des habitations surtout dans les Bas fonds crée ainsi un éloignement et même une dénivellation avec le réseau principal de distribution. Pour ce qui est de l’éloignement aux lignes principales, la situation est très critique au quartier Gadamabanga. En effet, avec les nouvelles constructions qui permettent au quartier de s’étendre et de gagner en espace vers le nord, le recours à ce mode de branchement est le seul moyen d’avoir accès au courant électrique. Il faut mentionner pour le cas de ce quartier le problème d’accessibilité, malgré l’aménagement d’un ponceau qui traverse la voie ferrée.

Le recours aux branchements informels est une solution pour les populations qui ont des difficultés d’accès au réseau formel de fourniture du courant électrique (plaque 2). Les causes de cette situation dépendent des sites d’implantation des habitations, de l’éloignement par rapport au réseau principal. En plus la pauvreté et le manque de moyens financiers ne permettent pas toujours à certains ménages de souscrire directement au réseau de distribution.

Source : Enquête de terrain, 2010

Figure 2. Répartition des modes d’accès à l’énergie électrique dans trois quartiers de Ngaoundéré
Cliché Gondié, 2009

Planch 2. Disposition des branchements informels dans les quartiers Gadamabanga et Baladji à Ngaoundéré

6. Discussion

La situation actuelle de la distribution de l’énergie électrique dans la ville de Ngaoundéré s’explique par plusieurs facteurs qui entraînent la durabilité de la ville et de ses équipements. Les disparités spatiales observées dans la distribution de l’énergie électrique sont nombreuses. Les densités de population et les ratios abonnement/population sont dans certains quartiers populaires très déséquilibrés. Pour comprendre la situation actuelle de la distribution de l’énergie, nous avons fait des analyses statistiques basées sur les calculs des densités de réseau. Le calcul des densités de réseau nous a permis de mesurer le nombre de km de ligne basse tension disponible actuellement dans la ville de Ngaoundéré et cela a permis de montrer la capacité actuelle des équipements de distribution à couvrir l’ensemble des zones qu’ils desservent. La ville de Ngaoundéré a au total 225 km de ligne basse tension couvrant une superficie de 31,769 km² pour une densité globale de 7,08 km/km². Au niveau des quartiers, le réseau est plus dense dans certains quartiers que dans d’autres. La densité la plus forte est celle de Mboumdjéré avec 16,35 km/km². Certains quartiers comme Bamyanga, Joli Soir ont des densités variant entre 9 et 12 km/km² les zones de Burkina ont les densités les plus faibles de la ville.

La configuration des rues dans une ville est un élément important auquel viennent se greffer les autres types de réseaux en milieu urbain. Du fait donc d’une urbanisation anarchique caractérisant les quartiers populaires de la ville, l’insuffisance des voies de communications est un facteur non négligeable qui explique les problèmes de couverture spatiale de la distribution du réseau électrique. La configuration des rues influence donc la forme du réseau dans l’espace urbain. Dans certains cas, les lignes BT et MT ne peuvent s’implanter que par rapport à la présence d’une voie de desserte, ce qui facilite les dépannages et la connexion des autres abonnés.

L’implantation des équipements de distribution de l’énergie électrique ne tient pas compte des conditions du milieu. Elle s’adapte tant bien que mal au rythme de croissance de la ville. Ainsi, ce sont les flancs de colline et les bas fonds inondables pourtant non favorables à l’urbanisation, qui sont les plus occupés par les constructions. C’est le cas des pieds du mont Ngaoundéré autour duquel des lignes électriques sont édifiées. Cette zone est pourtant sujette à des éboulements de blocs rocheux qui
surplombent les versants et les sommets du mont Ngaoundéré. Les bas fonds de joli soir, d’Onaref, de Baladji I et Baladji II qui sont des vallées inondables sont desservis par des lignes électriques. A l’opposé, le quartier Gadamabanga qui est une zone très favorable à l’urbanisation brille par l’insuffisance des branchements électriques. Avec l’extension des habitations dont le quartier fait l’objet, ils se développent des branchements informels qui constituent une solution aux difficultés d’accès au réseau formel de distribution de l’énergie.

Les inadéquations actuelles de la fourniture de l’énergie électrique à Ngaoundéré sont de ce fait des obstacles à l’édification d’une ville durable, c'est-à-dire une ville qui assure un équilibre entre la distribution spatiale de la population, les équipements et les infrastructures socio-collectives. Selon le Services d’exploitation et de maintenance de l’Adamaoua, les branchements informels au réseau de distribution entraînent des pertes techniques sur la consommation d’énergie, ce qui représente un manque à gagner considérable pour l’entreprise. La mauvaise qualité du courant issu de ce type de réseau se traduit par d’énormes chutes de tension qui occasionnent des pannes fréquentes des appareils électroniques et parfois d’incendies. En plus, ces réseaux pirates ne respectent pas les normes de sécurité et présentent des risques d’accident mortel.

Conclusion

Il était question dans notre travail de montrer l’impact de l’étalement urbain sur la distribution de l’énergie électrique dans la ville de Ngaoundéré. Nous avons ainsi procédé par l’exploitation de la base de données AES-SONEL de la ville compléter des observations et enquêtes de terrain. En définitive donc l’étalement est un aspect de la croissance qui entrave l’implantation des infrastructures urbaines en général et du réseau de distribution de l’énergie électrique en particulier. Ceci conduit les populations à faire recours aux branchements informels qui rendent difficile l’édification d’une ville durable. Les politiques de facilitation de l’accès au branchement électrique que la société de distribution de l’énergie essaie de déployer depuis quelques années dans les villes camerounaises est déjà une solution à ce problème. L’intensification de cette politique à Ngaoundéré en particulier permettrait de réduire considérablement les problèmes que rencontre la fourniture du courant électrique. En plus la coordination des activités des différents acteurs du développement urbain à travers l’utilisation d’une base de données SIG est une voie idéale pour une gestion et un développement rationnel et durable de la ville de Ngaoundéré. La ville durable ne peut donc pas se réduire à un nouveau standing de vie, mais doit embrasser l’ensemble des niveaux de réalité qui déterminent le développement urbain.
Références


-Dupuy G., 1991. L’urbanisme des réseaux, théories et méthodes, 198p, Paris, Armand colin,

-Harter G. et Manchotte M.T., 1982. Manuel d’urbanisme pour les pays en voie de développement, tom 5, les infrastructures, 400p, Paris, Ministère des relations extérieurs, de la coopération et du développement,


-Simeu Kamdem M., 2008, « Garoua : entre praxis et nostalgie, l’urbanisation d’une métropole sahélienne », In Nguendo Yongsi et Christopher Bryant (Eds), Visages et défis des principales villes camerounaises, Laboratoire développement durable et dynamique territoriale, Géographie, Université de Montréal, juin 2008


-Tchotsoua M., 2008. « Mutations et Reconversion des espaces urbains et périurbains à Ngaoundéré ». In Nguendo Yongsi et Christopher Bryant (Eds). Visages et défis des principales villes camerounaises, Laboratoire développement durable et dynamique territoriale, Géographie, Université de Montréal, juin 2008
An Analysis of Vocabulary Learning Strategies of Adult English as a Foreign Language (EFL) Learners

Prashneel Ravisran Goundar
Fiji National University, Fiji

Abstract

Vocabulary learning is one of the major challenges foreign language learners face during the process of learning a language (Ghazal, 2007). One way to ally the problem is to assist students in becoming independent learners during the course of L2 vocabulary learning. Furthermore, Ghazal (2007) explains that this could be achieved through instructing learners to apply vocabulary learning strategies as efficiently as possible.

This study has reviewed significant literature and the importance of reviewing the literature in the field was to realize the implications of our understanding of this relevant literature for the study referred to in this paper. The definitions, taxonomies and factors which pertain to language learning strategies and which are present in the literature have clarified the concepts and helped in the data analysis, i.e. in the identification and coding of the strategies reported by the respondents and later in the interpretation of the findings (Cusen & Buja, 2009).

Furthermore, this research brings to light the common strategies that learners use in vocabulary learning. It also discusses the different strategies at length and suggests valuable recommendations and concludes with further research implications.

Keywords: Language Learning Strategies, Second Language Acquisition, Vocabulary Learning Beliefs, Vocabulary Learning Strategies, English as a foreign language (EFL).
1.1 Introduction

English as a foreign language (EFL) is an enormous field which is made up of various areas for example lexical components, phonetics, morphology, writing, speaking, and listening. Also, all the fields have been well researched to focus on different strategies which can suit the learners. Folse (2004), an assistant professor and expert in the TESOL field provides further insights on which component is most important and notes; learning a language entails learning numerous aspects about that language, including its pronunciation, writing system, syntax, pragmatics, rhetorical modes for reading and composition, culture, and spelling, but the most important aspect is vocabulary. However, even though there has been a lot of research in the past, as early as the 1970’s on vocabulary learning strategies, it has been challenging to conclude which strategy is the best to use. As Wilkins (1972) puts it “without grammar, very little can be conveyed, without vocabulary, nothing can be conveyed”, this simply shows the importance of having adequate vocabulary nevertheless acquiring it can be very challenging; therefore learners need to be equipped with strategies in-order to confront this major component.

Vocabulary learning strategy is considered as a tool that learners use to acquire vocabulary which is one of the most important elements of English as a Foreign Language (EFL) learning. Learners may employ different learning strategies that they assume to be an effective way of vocabulary acquisition. As Ellis (1997) states that successful learners use more strategies than unsuccessful learners. Ellis (1997) also maintains that the right and dynamic strategies the learners employ influence their satisfactory academic performance. Huckin and Bloch (1993) have pointed out that “research has shown that second-language readers rely heavily on vocabulary knowledge and that a lack of vocabulary knowledge is the largest obstacle for second language readers to overcome” (p.154). Haynes and Baker (1993) found the main obstacle for L2 readers not to be a lack of reading strategies but rather insufficient vocabulary knowledge in English.

Acquiring a second language, involves different areas such as motivation, learners’ needs, learning environment, learning strategies and language awareness (Asgari and Mustapha, 2011). In any event, learning strategies are, defined by Chamot and Kupper (1989) as “techniques which students use to comprehend, store, and remember information and skills” (p.9). However, learning strategies have been used for thousands of years as Oxford (1990) mentioned that mnemonic or memory tools used in ancient times to facilitate narrators remember their lines. However, Oxford (2003) defined language learning strategies as “specific actions taken by the learners to make learning easier, faster, more enjoyable, more self-directed, more effective and more transferable to new situations” (p.8).

Vocabulary learning strategies are one part of language learning strategies which in turn are part of general learning strategies (Nation, 2001). According to Nation, it is essential that a strategy must:

1. Involve choice, that is, there are several strategies to choose from
2. Be complex, that is, there are several steps to learn
3. Require knowledge and benefit from training

Language learning strategies encourage greater overall self-direction for learners. Oxford (1990), elaborates on this point better and states; self-directed learners are independent learners who are capable of assuming responsibility for their own learning and gradually gaining confidence, involvement and proficiency. Research has shown that many learners do use more strategies to learn vocabulary especially when compared to such integrated tasks such as listening and speaking. But they are mostly inclined to use basic vocabulary learning strategies (Schmitt, 1997). This in turn makes strategy instruction an essential part of any foreign or second language program (Ghazal, 2007).

While particular strategies are used by second language learners for the acquisition of new words in the second language are called ‘vocabulary learning strategies’ (Gu, 1994). Whereas, Language Learning Strategies (LLSs) are sub category of general learning strategies and Vocabulary Learning Strategies (VLSs) are considered as a part of language learning strategies (Nation, 2001). The recognition of the role of vocabulary in language learning has continued to grow in recent years. This area of learning was previously neglected due to certain dominant teaching approaches in the 1940’s until the 1960’s (Noor and Amir, 2009). The theories underlying these approaches such as structural linguistics (Fries, 1945) and generative transformational linguistics (Chomsky, 1957) focused on teaching grammatical and phonological structures as well as emphasized on grammatical rules respectively. Learners were assumed that once they have learned the structural frames and the grammatical rules, they will then be able to fill in the lexical items as needed (Noor and Amir, 2009).

In addition, previous studies (Nation, 1990; Levine et al, 1992; Anderson, 1999) have reported students meticulously referring to a bilingual dictionary for every word that they do not understand. In other contexts, students might give up trying to understand the meaning of the text if sentences or an entire paragraph contain a small number of unknown words (Huckinet al, 1993). These encounters suggest that some learners might not have the knowledge to handle words they do not understand (Noor and Amir, 2009). This brings to light the seriousness of lack of vocabulary learning skills or strategies and how important it is for learners to be equipped with Vocabulary Learning Strategies. According to Nation (1990), from the late 1980s, vocabulary was an area that had drawn researchers’ interest within the mainstream of second language (L2) acquisition. Researchers realized that many learners' difficulties, both receptive and productive, result from an inadequate vocabulary, and even when they are at higher levels of language competence and performance, they still feel in need of learning vocabulary (Riankamol, 2008).

Gu and Johnson (1996), point out that most research on vocabulary learning strategies has focused on various methods of vocabulary presentation, and their effects on retention. Hatch & Brown (1995), however, discover that vocabulary is central to language and is of great significance to language learners. Words are the building blocks of a language since they label objects, actions, ideas without which people cannot convey the intended meaning (Riankamol, 2008). A simple example of this point on the importance of vocabulary is, when someone is thirsty in a foreign country and needs to
drink water, one just has to ask someone or gesture to someone the way to drink water and just say ‘water’. The receiver would immediately understand and interpret that one is thirsty. Thus, there is not an essential need for a complete sentence to be said but just one vocabulary which in this example is ‘water’.

Accordingly, numerous types of approaches, techniques, exercises and practice have been introduced into the field to teach vocabulary. Furthermore, research has shown that many learners do use more strategies to learn vocabulary, especially when compared to such integrated tasks such as listening and speaking. Yet Schmitt (1997) claims that they are mostly inclined to use basic vocabulary learning strategies. This in turn makes strategy instruction an essential part of any foreign or second language program. However, a greater knowledge of vocabulary learning strategies could be very useful in supporting teachers to plan their lessons more effectively and give guidance to students in adopting successful strategies (Riankamol, 2008).

The research available shows that there is no absolute advantage in using a strategy, that not all strategies have the same effect on all learners, and that choice of strategies is related to factors like attitude (Naiman et al, 1986). Thus, there is a need for research which seeks answers to questions of such nature that relate to what strategies can prove to be helpful to learn vocabulary of English as a foreign language.

1.2 Background and Context of the study

Teaching English as a foreign/second language (TEFL/TESL) has been a field which has existed for decades. However, this field has been new to Fiji and it was not known until a language institute in Nadi began operations in 2006, which teaches students from Asian countries as well as another UK based organization, Projects Abroad Fiji which teaches students from Europe. The opening of these two English language institutes has seen more English teachers becoming interested in this field. The TEFL field has various components which need to be understood not only by learners of English as a foreign language but also the teachers in order to provide comprehensive learning. Nielsen (2002) states; second language vocabulary acquisition is a field of investigation that has seen an explosion of experimental research in the past 25 years. This statement made by Nielsen is vital to gather how much interest has been shown to this field of study. On the contrary, XHAFERI B. and XHAFERI G. (2010) argue that learning vocabulary is a neglected area in literature and there is a need for more research in this field, learning vocabulary is a very complex issue.

In fact, it is true that learning vocabulary is one of the most challenging tasks of any language which is why there is a need to equip learners with the strategies which can tackle this issue. Nation (2001:9) emphasizes that "second language learners need to know very large numbers of words. While this may be useful in the long-term, it is not an essential short-term goal". A similar point of view has been expressed by Li (2010) who states; traditionally, vocabulary is viewed as a complex of form and meaning. Thus, vocabulary learning is intended to memorize the form-meaning association (Gu, 2005). The limitations of such a construct of vocabulary have become apparent in the past few decades (Carter, 1998; Richards, 1976). It has been proposed that vocabulary is a dynamic complex of both
knowledge of a word and the skill of using it and vocabulary cannot be separated from discourse (McCarthy, 1984; Nation, 2001; Robinson, 1989).

"No matter how well the student learns grammar, no matter how successfully the sounds of L2 are mastered, without words to express a wider range of meanings, communication in an L2 just cannot happen in any meaningful way" (McCarthy 1990:viii). This comment by McCarthy raises consciousness of the need to acquire vocabulary in order to communicate in everyday situations either through speaking or writing in all aspects it is paramount.

Thus, it is advantageous to explore deeper the difficulties encountered by learners and offer some innovative ideas in order to facilitate learning and teaching of vocabulary. It is through the learners’ perspective that the problem and process of acquiring vocabulary can be interpreted better. XHAFERI B. and XHAFERI G. (2010) suggest that the first goal is to look at the strategies that the students use to learn new English words and make them aware that there are many vocabulary learning strategies that they could use in learning new words. Through research, it has been found that Language Learning Strategies (VLSs) are defined differently by various scholars. Strategies have been defined as ways and techniques that learners use to learn new information in English.

It has been suggested by XHAFERI B. and XHAFERI G. (2010) that language teachers use the information they find more useful and use appropriate approaches in teaching vocabulary and preferably start a strategy training program which could be in-cooperated in their classes in order to enhance vocabulary acquisition. These strategies are lacking in most EFL/ESL classes in Fiji who are virtually unaware of the existing strategies and also the need of using these strategies to improve the vocabulary acquiring skills of learners.

Though vocabulary is the center of a language (Richards, 2000), the efficacy of vocabulary learning is often far from satisfactory (Meara, 1984). Therefore, in order to facilitate L2 vocabulary learning, vocabulary learning strategy (VLS), which is a task-specific strategy, has drawn researchers’ on-going attention over the last two decades Li (2010). Recurrent themes in research in English L2 vocabulary learning include the efficacy of particular strategies (Boers, Dememecheleer & Eckmans, 2004), VLS patterns among learners (Sanaoui, 1995), VLS’ relationship with learning context (Kojic-Sabo & Lightbown, 1999) and with other learner’s variables such as gender (Nemati, 2008), age (Shmitt, 1997), and L2 proficiency (Moir& Nation, 2002). This indeed is true as in various studies; it has been observed that factors such as, age, gender, purpose, motivation, nationality, cultural background, intellectuality contributes towards vocabulary learning.

Further, Li (2010) highlights that vocabulary learning beliefs (VLBs), another learner variable that influences vocabulary learning (Moir& Nation, 2002; Gu, 2005), is an under-researched area.

In addition, the studies highlighted above about Vocabulary Learning Strategies (VLS) were conducted mainly in English as a second language (ESL) context. As LLB can be shaped by culture and context (Horwitz, 1999), and LLS choice is influenced by factors such as beliefs, cultural background and types of task (Oxford, 1994), the VLS and VLB may also differ among learners in different learning cultures and contexts. This in turn, generates a greater need for further research in
this field to address this phenomenon. The research aims at providing new strategies of learning vocabulary which can be used by learners and it will be a great asset to teachers in designing appropriate materials for EFL/ESL classrooms in Fiji. Furthermore, since it is a study of Vocabulary Learning Strategies (VLSs) for English as a foreign/second language, the findings of this research can be easily adopted in international classrooms or by foreign learners and it is not limited to Fiji specifically.

1.3 Aim of the Study

The principal aims and objectives of the present study are to:
1. Investigate the usage of different vocabulary learning strategies among adult English as a foreign language learners.
2. Explore the various vocabulary learning strategies and find the benefits and drawbacks associated with each strategy
3. Find the most frequently and least frequently used vocabulary learning strategies (VLSs) by learners who have completed the language program and those who are continuing the course
4. Effective strategies that could be used in teaching vocabulary to students
5. Improve the difficulties encountered in learning vocabulary

Vocabulary learning is considered by many teachers and students as an important and challenging factor in learning a foreign language. Therefore, it is crucial to find effective ways of teaching vocabulary to students in order to reduce the challenges that they face. Research of this nature will help students' to choose the strategies that suit their learning styles and personalities and also offer a wide range of strategies to enhance vocabulary acquisition. In addition, it will help teachers to focus their instruction on the lexis more and also design more effective vocabulary learning activities (XHAFERI B. and XHAFERI G., 2010).

Further, the study will elicit some data for teachers in order to design appropriate vocabulary learning activities for successful teaching. It also aims to highlight to the students that there are many other vocabulary learning strategies which are unknown to many students. Kafipour (2010), in his PhD thesis pointed to this factor as one of the main reasons why the respondents in his study did not report some strategies in interview and journal writing. He stated that some of the respondents of his study felt shy to report some strategies as they thought those methods are incorrect ways to practice vocabularies (Kafipour, Yazdi, Soori, and Shokrpour, 2011). Therefore, although learners use strategies consciously or unconsciously, all of these need to be properly analyzed and brought forward so that improvements can be made in learning vocabulary.

1.4 Research Questions

This study sets out to seek answers to the following research questions:

1. What are the various Vocabulary Learning Strategies which are being used by adult EFL learners?
2. What are the strategies that are used the most by English as a Foreign Language learners (EFL)?
3. What are the strategies that are used the least by English as a Foreign Language learners (EFL)?
4. What are the vocabulary learning strategies employed by the successful and less successful learners of English as a Foreign Language students (EFL)?
5. How important are Vocabulary Learning Strategies (VLSs) in language learning?

1.5 Key Abbreviations:

ESL/EFL - Learners of English as a Second/Foreign language
L1 - Native Language
L2 - Second Language
LLS - Language Learning Strategies
SLA - Second Language Acquisition
VLB - Vocabulary Learning Beliefs
VLS - Vocabulary Learning Strategies

1.6 Significance of the Study

The purpose of this research is to provide a platform of benefit to a number of people, findings of which will not only assist learners but also teachers alike of English as a foreign language. The significance of this study is as follows but is not limited to only these:

1. The study will expose the most and least frequently used vocabulary learning strategies employed by English as a foreign language (EFL) students.
2. It will highlight the various vocabulary learning strategies used by learners today, which have yet to be written about or analyzed in depth.
3. It will provide strategies which learners can use in vocabulary learning which in turn will ease the difficulties that learners face in language learning.
4. The teachers can implement the findings of this study to support high proficient students and encourage weak students.
5. The findings of the study will be beneficial to teachers, in designing appropriate materials for classroom purposes and getting positive feedback in their teaching, as it will directly benefit their students.

1.8 Limitations of the Study

This research is on **Vocabulary Learning Strategies of Adult EFL Learners** and here are some of the limitations that were encountered in the study:
• This study included a small number of participants of English as a Foreign Language. A larger sample from different institutions would definitely produce more generalizable findings;
• The data was collected by using only two instruments which might not reflect a reality because students could have not read the questionnaire but only marked “x” on whichever statement they felt comfortable with. On the one hand, items prescribed in the questionnaire by the researcher may have been misunderstood by the participants (Barcelos, 2003);
• This study is not the only one in this field which would affect usage of the research findings;
• Time limitations; the combination of field work and the write-up were time consuming. Also, some questionnaires were not handed in on time therefore, meeting deadlines was an issue. Thus, analyzing the data was also affected.

1.8 Delimitations of the study

Apart from all the challenges highlighted in 1.8, here are some delimitations:
• An Improved research design would be able to address the issue of data collection to keep it more credible;
• Highlighting the difference in this study from the previous ones will make it clearer for the audience to understand the points elaborated;
• Encourage participation from the subjects by emphasizing on the need for this study;
• Ensure time management so that all the questionnaire, interviews are completed on time. Thus, enough time would be allocated for the write up of the research.

2.0 Literature Review

2.1 Introduction

This section examines the literature and research relevant to Vocabulary Learning Strategies, current research done in the area of vocabulary learning strategies for English as a Foreign Language.

2.2 Vocabulary Learning Strategies

Language learning strategies are methods that students employ to enhance their own learning. Strategies are important for language learning because they are a device for active, self-responsible learning. Learners who use appropriate language learning strategies yielded greater proficiency and self-confidence (Oxford, 1990). Most of the literature which has been studied provides a similar point of view and highlights the importance of having vocabulary learning strategies. Having knowledge about the different types of choices in vocabulary learning strategies will help teachers, researchers and curriculum developers to design appropriate materials for classroom purposes.
2.3 Summary of Major Studies on Vocabulary Learning Strategies


These studies have provided insights into the process of vocabulary learning and the strategies which have been used by individuals. These are as follows:

Sanaoui (1995) identified two distinctive approaches to vocabulary learning of adult learners: those who structured their vocabulary learning and those who did not. Structured learners engaged in independent study, did self-initiated learning activities and recorded the lexical items they were learning, reviewed such records, and practiced using vocabulary items outside the classroom (Bastanfar & Hashemi, 2010). Sanaoui’s research showed that structured learners Furthermore, Gu and Johnson (1996) identified six types of strategy - guessing, dictionary, note-taking, rehearsal, encoding, and activation - together with two other factors: beliefs about vocabulary learning and metacognitive regulation. Metacognitive regulation consists of strategies for selective attention and self-initiation. The latter make the meaning of vocabulary items clear through the use of a variety of means. Guessing strategies, skillful use of dictionaries and note-taking strategies are labeled as cognitive strategies. Rehearsal and encoding categories are classified under memory strategies. Word lists and repetition are instances of rehearsal strategies. Encoding strategies include strategies such as association, imagery, visual, auditory, semantic, and contextual encoding as well as word-structure. Activation strategies include those strategies through which learners actually use new words in different contexts (Bastanfar & Hashemi, 2010).

In addition, Lawson and Hogben (1996), in a classification which is more a reflection of the strategies, categorized the four strategies as: repetition, word feature analysis, simple elaboration and complex elaboration. The strategy “repetition” includes reading of related words, simple rehearsal, writing of word and meaning, cumulative rehearsal and testing. The “word feature analysis” contains spelling, word classification and suffix. Simple elaboration consists of sentence translation, simple use of context, appearance similarity, sound link and complex elaboration includes complex use of context, paraphrase and mnemonic. Hence the researchers concluded that there is a need to present strategies more directly during language teaching since students are not aware of the advantages of these procedures (Bastanfar & Hashemi, 2010).

Schmitt (1997) devised his taxonomy, self-reportedly, in response to the lack of a comprehensive list of vocabulary learning strategies. He organized 58 strategies under five types: determination, social, memory, cognitive and metacognitive. His categories were inspired by Oxford's (1990) inventory of general language learning strategies but included some modifications. Thus, social, memory, cognitive and metacognitive strategies have been adopted from Oxford (1990). The
modification was that he made a distinction between discovery and consolidation strategies. Determination strategies are used when "learners are faced with discovering a new word's meaning without recourse to another person's experience" (Schmitt, 1997). For example, learners try to discover the meaning of a new word by guessing it with the help of context, structural knowledge of language, and reference materials. It is also possible to discover the meaning of a word through asking someone for help (Bastanfar & Hashemi, 2010).

Finally, Nation's (2001) theoretically-oriented taxonomy makes a basic distinction between the aspects of vocabulary knowledge from the sources of vocabulary knowledge and from learning processes; hence, three general classes: planning, sources, and processes, each covering a subset of key strategies. 'Planning' involves choosing where and how to focus attention on a particular vocabulary item and contains strategies for choosing words, choosing aspects of word knowledge and choosing strategies as well as planning repetition. Process means establishing word knowledge through noticing, retrieving and generating strategies (Bastanfar & Hashemi, 2010).

2.4 Categorization of the Strategies

In all research conducted on vocabulary learning strategies, four important categories are highlighted which are metacognitive strategies, cognitive, memory and activation strategies. It is very important to understand these concepts as it forms the basis of the any study being conducted in this field.

Gu and Johnson (1996) list second language (L2) vocabulary learning strategies as metacognitive, cognitive, memory and activation strategies. The metacognitive strategies comprises of selective attention and self-initiation strategies. First language learners and Second language learners who employ selective attention strategies know which words are important for them to learn and are essential for adequate comprehension of a passage.

Cognitive strategies in Gu and Johnson’s taxonomy consists of guessing strategies, skillful use of dictionaries and note-taking strategies. It was found that learners using guessing strategies draw upon their background knowledge and use linguistic clues like grammatical structures of a sentence to guess the meaning of a word. Memory strategies are classified into two distinct categories; rehearsal and encoding categories. Word lists and repetition are instances of rehearsal strategies. Encoding strategies encompass such strategies as association, imagery, visual, auditory, semantic, and contextual encoding as well as word structure which includes; analyzing a word in terms of prefixes, stems, and suffixes.

Finally, the activation strategies include those strategies through which the learners actually use new words in different contexts. For instance, learners may set sentences using the words they have just learned (Ghazal, 2007).
The definitions of the above concepts are simplified in the following illustration:

Apart from discovering new words, Ghazal (2007) states that learners need to employ a variety of strategies to practice and retain vocabulary. In order to accommodate this, learners thus, use a variety of social, memory, cognitive and metacognitive strategies to consolidate their vocabulary knowledge.

2.5 Concept of Good and Poor Learners

Each learner employs different strategies to assist in learning new vocabulary. A learning strategy is a series of actions a learner takes to facilitate the completion of a learning task. The most widely reported learner factors include age, sex, language aptitude, intelligence, prior knowledge, motivation, self-concept/image, personality, and cognitive and learning style (Peter, 2003). This brings forth the concept of good learners and poor learners; those learners who are highly motivated feel a genuine need to practice the vocabulary and use this strategy to maintain the vocabulary. Good learners not only use more strategies, but they also rely more heavily on different strategies than the ones poor learners use (Scafaru and Tofan, 2006). In a study carried out by Ahmed (1989) it was found that good learners were more aware of what they could learn about words, they paid more attention to collation and spelling and at the same time they were more conscious of contextual learning. Learners are able to comprehend more new vocabulary once they use a number of strategies and do not simply stick to one which is the case for poor learners who concentrate on one method simply. On the contrary, the article
by Scafaru and Tofan (2006) is very contradictory of this statement as it further mentions that statements like “the good learners practice” are not really helpful. What we need are more specific findings which tell us what the learner actually does when he practices”. In fact, it is through practice that learners commit words to memory and thus use it as confirmed by Peter (2003).

2.6 Common Strategies Learners Apply

In the research conducted by Scafaru and Tofan (2006), there was use of over seven different strategies which include micro-strategies, macro-strategies, dictionary use, memorization, practice, preferred source of information and note taking. Note taking is a strategy which a lot of learners use and it has been proved to be effective as some learners prefer to work on visual memory, which means since they have written a new vocabulary they are able to create an image in their mind about the word. Both the papers (Scafaru and Tofan (2006) and Peter (2003)) confirm that there is a similar pattern in note taking. Learners took notes in the margin, used vocabulary books, organized words by meaning, spelling formation, word derivation, grammatical information, or vocabulary cards.

Research from the studies has also proven that dictionaries have a great impact in learning and one of the most common things that learners buy first is a dictionary. Like it or not, a dictionary is amongst the first things a foreign language student purchases (Baxter, 1980; Luppescu & Day, 1993), and learners carry their dictionaries around, not grammar books (Krashen, 1989). It has been argued whether a monolingual dictionary is better than a bilingual one. Further, research has shown how the dictionaries have been used by learners. Laufer and Hadar (1997), for example, compared monolingual, bilingual, and bilingualised dictionaries among 123 EFL learners in Israel. Through their study, it was found that, regardless of the learners’ proficiency level, the bilingualised version was rather significantly better than, or as good as, the other two types in both comprehension and production tasks.

An important finding which was revealed in the paper by Peter (2003) was the use of repeating aloud strategy. Empirical results on this issue are also relatively unanimous, that repeating words aloud helps retention far better than silent repetition Peter (2003). A similar study was carried out by Seibert (1927) who found that if learners studied aloud, studied aloud with written and studied silently, the result showed that the first condition always produced better when compared with the other two. He then followed up further, if the relearning was effective even after 42 days and found that again learning aloud was significantly efficient than the other two conditions.

Furthermore, the guessing strategy principally applies to reading text as confirmed in the study completed by Day, Komura and Hamamatsu (1991). The study was conducted in Japan with 181 high school and 397 university students whereby they had to read a short story for approximately 30 minutes and soon after reading the text they had to do a multiple choice test and it was found that both the high school and university groups performed well.
2.7 Conclusion

In conclusion, this section has presented the main findings of various areas of vocabulary learning strategy research. These findings reveal the importance of exposing learners to various methods. The concept on good learners is very clear that those learners who are able to employ various strategies are more successful in acquiring vocabulary than those who choose to use fewer strategies. Language teachers need to make learners conscious of the need to develop an independent and structured approach to language learning, which has been shown to be mostly associated with vocabulary learning success.

3.0 Research Methodology

3.1 Introduction

A number of studies were resorted to before choosing the appropriate method for this research. Different methods are appropriate for different situations (Patton, 1990, p. 39). Therefore, the methodological design should be based on the purpose of the study, the research questions, and the resources and time available (Li, 2010). Moreover, “social phenomena are so complex and social problems are so intractable, all of our methodological tools are needed for understanding and for action” (Greene, 2001, p. 252). Thus, raises the issue: to what extent the research design can freely combine elements of different approaches (Seliger & Shohamy, 1989). Mixed-method design arguably functions to overcome the deficiencies of a single method, while capitalizing on the strengths of each (Johnson & Christensen, 2004). Therefore, due to the complexity of Second Language learning and the strengths and limitations of each method, a mixed method design is adopted to strengthen the quality of this study.

Qualitative research is based on interpretivist epistemology assuming “that social reality is constructed by participants in it” and “is continuously constructed in local situations” (Gall, Gall & Borg, 2005, p. 15). By comparison, quantitative research is based on positivist epistemology assuming an objective social reality that is “relatively constant across time and setting” (Gall et al., 2005, p. 15). Thus, qualitative research in Second Language Acquisition (SLA) functions to discover phenomena that have not been described and to understand these phenomena from the participants’ perspective (Seliger & Shohamy, 1989), while quantitative research is strong in description of the SLA behaviors of a population as “quantification represents a reality for that group” (p. 115). Research has shown that, studies on Vocabulary Learning Beliefs (VLB) and Vocabulary Learning Strategies (VLS) have been dominated by questionnaires (a quantitative method), and have generated somewhat diversified profiles of VLB and VLS as well as mixed results on the correlations between VLB/ VLS and learning outcomes. However, as discussed in the review of these studies, the reliability and validity of these surveys may have been improved if they had been triangulated with qualitative methods such as interviews, given that questionnaire items may be misunderstood by the participants (Barcelos, 2003). Furthermore, Seliger and Shohamy (1989) state that checking the consistency in the participants’ responses, triangulation of questionnaire survey with qualitative methods could help our understanding...
of VLB and VLS of the participants, and discover new patterns not described previously, for qualitative research examines the phenomena and presents data from the perspective of the participants.

According to Greene (2001), mixed methodologies can serve for triangulation, complementarities, development, expansion, and initiation. In the present study, mixed methodology is adopted for the purposes of triangulation. Triangulation refers to the adoption of mixed methods to seek convergence, corroboration and correspondence of results across different methods (Greene, 2001). It can be achieved from three aspects: source of data, data collection and analysis method (Freeman, 1998). In this study, all three kinds of triangulation are adopted. The data collection method in the present study is achieved by the adoption of both quantitative methods (the questionnaire survey) and the qualitative method (interview) which will be discussed at length in the research instrument section.

In spite of its advantages, mixed-method research has been criticized for violating the different and incommensurate paradigmatic assumptions of both quantitative and qualitative approaches (Sale & Brazil, 2006). Moreover, bias of the approaches occurs in the reports of mixed-method research as qualitative evidence is often omitted from the synthesis in mixed-method research (Dixon-Woods, Agarwal, Jones, Young & Sutton, 2006). Li (2010) explains this better and states that, to avoid possible problems relating to the combination of quantitative and qualitative approaches in the research design, a coordinated mixed-method design is applied in the present study. That is, different methods are designed and implemented discretely, and the interactions between the methods and findings come at the stage where the overall inferences are drawn instead of at earlier stages such as data processing or data analysis (Greene, 2001). As a result, the coordinated mixed-method design should avoid the possible danger of exclusive reliance on a single method (Bryman, 1992) and potential problems in the integration of different methods (Sale & Brazil, 2006), thus improving the quality of the present study.

The process of integrating methodologies and methods is conducted with reference to the following two factors.

- One is the function and importance of each approach in the present study. The quantitative approach (the questionnaire survey) is triangulated by the qualitative approach (interviews), and the results of the survey inform the implementation of the interviews (Li, 2010).
- This raises the other factor—time order, i.e., the extent to which the methods can be carried out simultaneously (Brannen, 1992). Among the two data collection methods, the vocabulary questionnaire survey is conducted first, while interviews will be conducted later. Considering the time restriction in the data collection process, the mixed method design is considered as the most appropriate for the present study, because it:
  - Allows the researcher to approach and analyze the phenomena from different perspectives, and
  - Fills the gaps in the research on VLB and VLS (i.e., lack of observation and investigation from the participants’ perspective), which were identified in previous studies (Gu & Johnson, 1996; Lou14, 2006; Yang2, 2006).
This is the overview of the mixed methodological design which has been adopted for this study on Vocabulary Learning Strategies.

3.2 Research Design Justification

The research design of the present study is that of a mixed method approach. By using both qualitative and quantitative methods researchers are often able to better address the research questions (Creswell and Clark, 2007). Further, Creswell and Clark (2007) have defined the mixed method in a simple way and state; the basic premise of the definition is that the combination of quantitative and qualitative approaches provides a better understanding of research problems than either approach alone…mixed methods research provides strengths that offset the weaknesses of both quantitative and qualitative research.

Two main concepts/methods used from the approaches are the questionnaire survey taken from the quantitative approach and individual participants interviews taken from the qualitative approach. The interviews were unstructured so that it could be a direct interaction between the researcher and the respondent. The questionnaire was based on the Likert scale which involves, marking of words (ranking) for statements whereby respondents denote which they agree the most with and those that they disagree with. This will be discussed in later sections; method justification and instrument justification in detail.

Research has shown that, studies on Vocabulary Learning Beliefs (VLB) and Vocabulary Learning Strategies (VLS) have been dominated by questionnaires (a quantitative method), and have generated somewhat diversified profiles of VLB and VLS as well as mixed results on the correlations between VLB/ VLS and learning outcomes. Therefore, it is only appropriate to keep a quantitative method approach as well as a qualitative approach.
The conceptual framework on the following page outlines the research design used in this study of Vocabulary Learning Strategies.

**The Conceptual Framework**

**Theme:**
- Amis
- Vocabulary Learning Strategies (VLSs)
- Research Questions

**Theories used in this research:**
- Cognitive language learning theory
- Behaviourist language learning theory

**“The Vocabulary Learning Strategies of Adult English as a Foreign Language Learners”**

**Significance of this study:**
- will highlight the various vocabulary learning strategies used by learners today, which have yet to be written about or analyzed in depth
- will be beneficial to teachers in designing appropriate materials for classroom purposes
- expose the most and least frequently used vocabulary learning strategies employed by EFL students
- will ease the difficulties that learners face in language learning

**Stakeholders:**
- Students
- Teachers of English as a foreign language
- Learners of foreign languages

**3.3 Research Instruments/tools Justification**

The data collection instruments’ in this study is comprised of a vocabulary learning questionnaire, classroom observations and a semi structured interview.

Merriam (1988) explained that interview utilization is one of the major sources to obtain qualitative data from subjects. The system of conducting an interview is one of the most common
means to investigate, research and to inquire data from the one phenomenon. Interviews are adequate to investigate phenomena which are not directly observable. Further, interviews are interactive, thus the researcher can elicit additional data when the initial answer is off-topic or not clear enough. Both the researcher and the interviewees can make clarifications. This removes the concern of misunderstanding. Moreover, the semi-structured interviews were individual interviews, for they ensure a high level of confidentiality, thus is more likely to generate truth from the interviewees (Brown, 2001).

As highlighted in 3.3, fifteen students were interviewed; these fifteen have been broken into:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Number of Interviewees</th>
<th>Number of Interviewees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students from Projects Abroad (Nadi) Fiji</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students Who Completed the English from the above Institute</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Each interview lasted 15 to 20 minutes approximately.

Questionnaires are adequate for quantifying data (Victori, 1999b). Hence, the questionnaire is appropriate for data collection as the present study focuses on the Vocabulary Learning Strategies of 53 EFL students. Moreover, the questionnaire is a predominant instrument in previous Vocabulary Learning Strategies research. The questionnaire has been written in English which comprises of one major component; it consists of 48 statements grouped under 9 different categories, these are:

1. Beliefs about vocabulary learning
2. Metacognitive regulation
3. Guessing Strategies
4. Dictionary Strategies
5. Note-taking Strategies
6. Memory Strategies
7. Activation strategies
8. Sources
9. Anxiety and Motivation

The subjects responded using a 3-point Likert scale to indicate the frequency of the usage of each strategy, ranging from Agree (1) to disagree (3).

3.4 Research Population and Sample for the Study

The sample of this study has been divided into various areas but following a simple random sampling method in order to have equal participation from the subjects. The first 25 questionnaires were given to students doing the EFL course at Projects Abroad (Nadi) Fiji; here classes range from beginner level to business class. The questionnaires were given to the head of school, of the institute who distributed it according to every fifth person on the attendance list in each class. Finally, 28 questionnaires were distributed to those students who have completed the English course at the
institute. Furthermore, the 28 learners received this questionnaire without any preferences to level of English ability to keep into account all levels regardless of their individual intellectual ability.

The table below shows the concept of distributing questionnaire:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Distribution of Questionnaire</th>
<th>Total Number of Questionnaire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students from Projects Abroad (Nadi) Fiji</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students Who Completed the English from the above Institute</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The interview was of a semi-structured method conducted with 15 students. Five students were from Projects Abroad (Nadi) Fiji. The remaining 10 students were from the institute who had already completed the EFL course.

The table below shows the concept of interviews conducted:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Number of Interviewees</th>
<th>Number of Interviewees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students from Projects Abroad (Nadi) Fiji</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students Who Completed the English from the above Institutes</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As the study is on Vocabulary Learning Strategies (VLSs), the focus of attention is the learners from Projects Abroad (Nadi), Fiji. The reason being is that the institute has a mixture of students from Europe and Asia which are countries where Teaching English as a foreign language (TEFL) is high. Many researchers have conducted their research specifically in these regions for example Li (2010) conducted her research on Chinese EFL learners. Learners from these regions face difficulty in acquiring English and one of the larger components of that is vocabulary. Therefore, having these learners in the sample of this study gives credibility to this study. Furthermore, it would give better insights to this research, as various nationalities of sample have been chosen along with the different level of the learners.

### 3.5 Recording and Data Analysis

The data of this study will be analyzed using descriptive statistics where frequency counts would be tabulated and converted to percentages.

- **Qualitative:** the interview method which has been employed in this study is that of a semi-structured style. In the semi-structured interviews, a list of questions prepared in advance guides the interviewees to address the issues in the questionnaire (Asgari & Mustapha,
2011). Each interview lasted about 15 to 20 minutes and simultaneously, the researcher took notes during the interviews.

- **Quantitative:** The second method of carrying out the study, was adopted from quantitative approach, is the questionnaire. Questionnaires are considered to be relatively easy to construct and administer to a large number of participants (Dornyei, 2003). Questionnaires thus are commonly used for investigating the current use of Vocabulary Learning Strategies. Given the limitations of questionnaires, many researchers (e.g. Dornyei, 2007; Gu, 2003a; Takeuchi, 2003a) advocate for the mixed use of quantitative and qualitative research methods (Li, 2010). Therefore, this study will use an adapted version of the vocabulary strategy questionnaire proposed by Gu & Johnson (1996) and similar to the study conducted by Noor & Amir (2009).

The data is recorded accordingly in descriptive statistics format which forms the basis of the thesis and is highlighted in the conclusion of the research.

### 3.6 Permission to Proceed

Prior to the commencement of this research project, permission was received from individual participants and the institute highlighted in section 3.4 of this paper.

The permission to proceed was achieved through the letter of consent and sample letter of approval for interviews which have been placed in the Appendix section of this project.

### 3.7 Ethical Consideration

Resnik (2007) define ethics as a method, procedure, or perspective for deciding how to act and for analyzing complex problems and issues. Several reasons have been given by Resnik why ethics are important:

1. Promotes the aims of the research
2. Researchers can be held accountable to the public
3. Ethical standards promote the values that are essential in collaborative work these include; trust, mutual respect, and fairness
4. It helps to build public support for research
5. It also promotes a variety of other important moral values, such as social responsibility, human rights.

In this study of Vocabulary Learning Strategies (VLSs), the following ethics have been followed during this write up:

1. Consent letter was given to the institute in order to receive permission before conducting the research.
2. Participants were informed about the purpose of this study.
3. Participants will also be kept anonymous.
4. Honesty and openness is the relationship between the researcher and participants
5. The researcher has avoided fabrication, falsification, or misrepresentation of
evidence, data, findings or conclusions.

Finally, during this research topic write up a Plagiarism Checker was used to ensure that no part
of the work was in any form copied/plagiarized. The website is;
http://www.dustball.com/cs/plagiarism.checker/

3.8 Theoretical Perspective

This research is based on two influential theories of language learning:
1. Cognitive language learning theory
2. Behaviourist language learning theory

The cognitive orientation describes second language learning as a complex cognitive skill
which, similar to other such skills, engages cognitive systems (such as perception, and information
processing) to overcome limitations in human mental capacity which may inhibit performance (Ellis,
2000). One of the important concepts of cognitive theory which has a lot of influence on the vocabulary
learning strategies is learning strategies. This study is conducted to examine the vocabulary learning
strategies which provide understandings of what vocabulary learning strategies are all about (Asgari
and Mustapha, 2011).

Furthermore, the cognitive learning theory focuses on people’s thinking abilities, their ability to
reason in the learning process (Stern, 1983).
- It emphasizes the meaning of the language being learned
- It recognizes that thinking and learning require problem solving and that
  problem solving takes in both the first language (L1) and second language (L2)
- It also empathizes that language learning requires mastering the rules of the
  language

The next theory is the behaviourist theory which is concerned with how children learn in their
early language development. Traditional behaviourism hypothesized that when children imitated
the language produced by those around them, their attempts to reproduce what they heard received
“positive reinforcement” (Lightbown and Spada, 2006:11). Children would continue to imitate and
practice these sounds and patterns until they formed a habit of correct language use. According to this
view, the quality and quantity of the language the child hears, as well as the consistency of the
reinforcement offered by others in the environment, would shape the child’s language behaviour
(Lightbown & Spada, 2006:11).

This theory had a powerful influence on second and foreign language teaching between the
1940s and the 1970s (Lightbown and Spada, 2006:34). Researchers can get inspiration from this in
second language acquisition. The behaviourists viewed imitation and practice as the primary processes
in language development. The behaviourist theory explained learning in terms of imitation, practice,
reinforcement, and habit formation (Bei, 2011). This theory highlights that the four aspects play an important role in second language learning. The process of imitation and practice is that when a learner hears a new word, he should imitate the pronunciation of the word and says it repeatedly; thus forming a habit of learning.

Thus, the cognitive language learning theory and the behavioural language learning theory have been employed in this study of vocabulary learning strategies for English as a foreign language (EFL) learners.

3.9 Conclusion

The purpose of the present study is to examine the use of Vocabulary Learning Strategies (VLS) by adult English as a Foreign Language students to better interpret the methods that learners apply to learn new words in English. Thus, it was decided that the best method for this study is a mixed method approach, whereby both qualitative research design as well as quantitative research design be chosen. Furthermore, a qualitative research design is the best method for this investigation as it is better to understand the use of vocabulary learning strategies by the adult EFL students. Creswell (2008) identified qualitative research as an investigative method for understanding a phenomenon based on separate methodological traditions of inquiry that elicit human conditions or social problem. In addition, the researcher is the main instrument of analyzing the data (Asgari & Mustapha, 2011).

As Merriam (1988) has explained, interview utilization is one of the major sources to obtain qualitative data from subjects. Hence, the method of conducting an interview is one of the most popular means to investigate, research and to inquire data from the one phenomenon (Asgari & Mustapha, 2011). The interviews were conducted individually with fifteen students who were randomly selected between August 5th and September 6th, 2013. The students were from Projects Abroad (Nadi) Fiji, in order to gain a deep understanding of the subjects’ varied backgrounds in vocabulary learning, the strategies that they used to learn new words in English.

In addition, the interview method which was employed in this study is that of a semi-structured style. In the semi-structured interviews, a list of questions prepared in advance guides the interviewees to address the issues in the questionnaire (Asgari & Mustapha, 2011). The main objective of this is that it allows the researcher to compare the students’ responses in different settings. Due to this, the consistency in the students’ responses can be checked. On the other hand, the researcher still has “the freedom to digress and probe for more information” (Mackey & Gass, 2005, p. 173) for clarification and understanding of the VLB/VLS held by a particular student. Moreover, the semi-structured interviews are individual interviews, for they ensure a high level of confidentiality, thus is more likely to generate truth from the interviewees (Brown, 2001). Each interview lasted about 15 to 20 minutes and simultaneously, the researcher took notes during the interviews.

The second method of carrying out the study, adopted from quantitative approach, is the questionnaire. Questionnaires are considered to be relatively easy to construct and administer to a large
number of participants (Dornyei, 2003). Questionnaires thus are commonly used for investigating the current use of Vocabulary Learning Strategies. Given the limitations of questionnaires, many researchers (e.g. Dornyei, 2007; Gu, 2003a; Takeuchi, 2003a) advocate for the mixed use of quantitative and qualitative research methods (Li, 2010). Therefore, this study used an adapted version of the vocabulary strategy questionnaire proposed by Gu & Johnson (1996) and similar to the study conducted by Noor & Amir (2009). The questionnaire was distributed to 53 students randomly selected between August 1st and August 16th, 2013 and collected until August 23rd. The students were from Projects Abroad (Nadi) Fiji, and those who had completed the English language studies from the institution.

To sum this section, this diagram will show a clear representation of the above:

![Research Method: Mixed Method Approach Diagram](image)

**4.1 Research Finding and Analysis**

This study used an adapted version of the Vocabulary Strategy questionnaire proposed by Gu & Johnson (1996) and similar to the study conducted by Noor & Amir (2009). The data is recorded accordingly in descriptive statistics format where frequency counts were tabulated and converted to percentages.

**Beliefs about Vocabulary Learning**

**Table 1 A: Words should be memorized**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The best way to remember words is to memorize word lists</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repetition is the best way to remember words</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is only necessary to remember one dictionary definition</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can acquire a large vocabulary by memory of individual words</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The data revealed that 89% of learners believed that repetition was the best way to remember words. On the other hand, only 21% of learners agreed that memorization of words lists were the best way to remember words. Furthermore, it was highlighted that 68% of the respondents did not agree that it was only necessary to remember one dictionary definition.

Table 1B: Words should be acquired in context (bottom-up)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I can identify the meaning of most words through reading</td>
<td>3 (43%)</td>
<td>20 (38%)</td>
<td>1 (19%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can expand my vocabulary through reading a lot</td>
<td>4 (91%)</td>
<td>5 (9%)</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guessing words in context is one of the best ways to learn vocabulary</td>
<td>8 (72%)</td>
<td>11 (20%)</td>
<td>4 (8%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The research revealed that 91% of the learners stated that through reading they were able to expand their vocabulary. Moreover, 72% of the participants highlighted that “guessing words in context” was one of the best strategies to use in learning vocabulary. Also, 43% showed that they could identify most words through reading.

Table 1C: Words should be studied and put to use (top down)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I revise the new words I have learned</td>
<td>36 (68%)</td>
<td>13 (24%)</td>
<td>4 (8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I use the words that I have learned</td>
<td>47 (89%)</td>
<td>6 (11%)</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When I learned the word I pay close attention to its new usage and new meaning</td>
<td>35 (66%)</td>
<td>14 (26%)</td>
<td>4 (8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When I have learned the word, I will recall the meaning to help me understand the context</td>
<td>43 (81%)</td>
<td>7 (13%)</td>
<td>3 (6%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the study, 89% of the subjects stated that they used the words they learnt. In addition, 81% stated that once they had learnt the words, they recall the meaning in order to help in understanding the context. Also, it was revealed that 66% of the respondents paid close attention to the usage and meaning of the new words.
Metacognition Regulation

**Table 2A: Self initiation strategies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I think about my progress in vocabulary learning</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(64%)</td>
<td>(25%)</td>
<td>(11%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I try to find out all I can about the new words I learn</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(40%)</td>
<td>(40%)</td>
<td>(20%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I only focus on things that are related to examinations</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(17%)</td>
<td>(15%)</td>
<td>(68%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It was discovered that learners do self-reflective practices, thus it was revealed that 64% of the learners think about the progress in vocabulary learning. Furthermore, 40% of the respondents try to find out all that they can about the new word which includes; its meaning, usage, other definitions and pronunciation. The belief that learners only focus on the things that relate to examination was proved invalid as 68% of the subjects were against this concept.

**Table 2B: Selective attention**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I know which words are important for me to learn</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(51%)</td>
<td>(40%)</td>
<td>(9%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I look up words that I’m interested in</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(83%)</td>
<td>(8%)</td>
<td>(9%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I make a note of words that seem important to me</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(66%)</td>
<td>(11%)</td>
<td>(23%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I know what cues I should use in guessing the meaning of a particular word</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(32%)</td>
<td>(53%)</td>
<td>(15%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data revealed that 83% learners took own initiative to look up words that they were interested in. Also, 51% of the respondents know the words that are important for them to learn. To assist in achieving the latter, they make notes of words which seem important and a total of 66% learners attested to this. On the contrary, 53% of the learners stated that they were unsure about what cues to use in guessing the meaning of a particular word.
Guessing Strategies

Table 3A: Use background knowledge

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I skip words I don’t understand</td>
<td>19 (36%)</td>
<td>21 (40%)</td>
<td>13 (24%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I use my experience and common sense to guess</td>
<td>51 (96%)</td>
<td>2 (4%)</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I guess the meaning and then look at the dictionary (when I meet new words in reading)</td>
<td>45 (85%)</td>
<td>8 (15%)</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It was revealed in the study that majority of the respondents used their background knowledge (96%) such as experience and common sense in guessing the meaning of the words. One of the strategies that 85% of the respondents use after guessing the meaning is to look at the dictionary for its meaning and compare the answers.

Table 3B: Using linguistic clues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I make use of my knowledge of the topic to guess the meaning of word</td>
<td>46 (87%)</td>
<td>6 (11%)</td>
<td>1 (2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guess word’s meaning from word classes, such as nouns, verbs, adjectives, adverbs, to discover the meaning of new vocabulary items</td>
<td>35 (66%)</td>
<td>13 (25%)</td>
<td>5 (9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I analyze the word structure (prefix, root and suffix) when guessing the meaning of the word</td>
<td>25 (47%)</td>
<td>17 (32%)</td>
<td>1 (21%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In terms of linguistic cues, 66% of the learners use the word classes, such as parts of speech to guess and discover the meaning of new vocabulary items. Furthermore, 87% of the respondents highlighted that they used knowledge of the topic to guess the meaning of a word. It was also revealed that 47% of the learners analyze the word structure (prefix, root and suffix) in order to guess the meaning of the word.
Table 4: Dictionary Strategies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I use an English dictionary</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(66%)</td>
<td>(19%)</td>
<td>(15%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I use a bilingual dictionary</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(77%)</td>
<td>(8%)</td>
<td>(15%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I use the dictionary to find out the pronunciation of the word</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(81%)</td>
<td>(6%)</td>
<td>(13%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I use the dictionary to find only the meaning of the word</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(32%)</td>
<td>(19%)</td>
<td>(49%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I look in the dictionary for the grammatical patterns of the word</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(60%)</td>
<td>(23%)</td>
<td>(17%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I look in the dictionary for collocation patterns</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(62%)</td>
<td>(25%)</td>
<td>(13%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I use the dictionary to find the appropriate usage (example sentence)</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(90%)</td>
<td>(8%)</td>
<td>(2%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

One of the methods to learn new vocabulary is through dictionaries. It was revealed that 66% respondents use an English dictionary. In addition, a higher data revealed that 77% learners used bilingual dictionaries. Also, it was found that a common use of the dictionary by the 81% EFL learners is to check the pronunciation of the vocabulary. On the contrary, only 32% use the dictionary to find the meaning of words.

It was interesting to note that 60% of the respondents recourse to the dictionary for the grammatical patterns of the word. Furthermore, 90% of the learners make use of the dictionary in order to find the appropriate usage of the word which includes example sentences.

Table 5: Note Taking Strategies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I have a vocabulary note book to list down new word</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(47%)</td>
<td>(11%)</td>
<td>(42%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I write down the English word and translation of the word in my language</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(62%)</td>
<td>(19%)</td>
<td>(19%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I only take note the meaning of the word</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(8%)</td>
<td>(23%)</td>
<td>(69%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I take note of the usages of the word (example sentences, part of speech, etc.)</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(58%)</td>
<td>(19%)</td>
<td>(23%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I take note of the synonym or antonym of the word</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(32%)</td>
<td>(30%)</td>
<td>(38%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A common practice in EFL classroom where learners use vocabulary was also highlighted in the research. The data showed that 47% of learners list down new words in a vocabulary note book. It was impressive to see the role played by translation as 66% of the respondents stated that they write down words and then translate the words into their own language.

Furthermore, 69% of the learners disagreed that they only took note of the meaning of the word. As 58% of the learners stated they took note of the usage of the word, part of speech and example sentences as well. Interesting to note through the data, 32% take note of the synonym or antonym of the words whereas; 38% do not take note of the synonym or antonym of the word.

**Table 6: Activation Strategies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I make use of the words I learned in speaking and writing</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I make use of the words I learned in everyday situations</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data revealed that 86% of the learners make use of the words learned in speaking and writing. In addition, 45% of the respondents stated that they make use of words learned in everyday situations. This means that learners are confident in using words in everyday situation in either spoken or written English.

**Table 7: Memory/ Repetition Strategies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To remember a word, I repeat it aloud to myself</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To remember a word, I write it repeatedly</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I create a mental image of the new word to help me remember the word</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To remember a word, I analyze the word by breaking it into different parts (prefix, root, suffix)</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In terms of memory strategies, it was highlighted that 77% leaners repeat words aloud to themselves in order to remember a word whereas, 53% of the respondents also choose to write words repeatedly, in order to remember a word. Furthermore, it was interesting to note that 62% of the
respondents create a mental image of a new word in order to remember a new word. However, only 28% of the participants analyze the words by breaking it into different parts in order to remember words.

Table 8: Sources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I learn new words only in my class from my teacher</td>
<td>2 (4%)</td>
<td>6 (12%)</td>
<td>4 (84%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I learn new words from reading English materials (e.g. newspaper, novels, etc.)</td>
<td>45 (84%)</td>
<td>4 (8%)</td>
<td>4 (8%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data revealed that only 4% of the respondents learned new words from their teacher. In addition, it was highlighted that the major source of new vocabulary for the 84% respondents from reading English materials is such as newspaper, novels, magazines to name a few.

Table 9: Anxiety

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I feel anxious about reading in English</td>
<td>28 (53%)</td>
<td>10 (19%)</td>
<td>1 (28%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I skip words I don’t understand when I read in English</td>
<td>20 (38%)</td>
<td>21 (40%)</td>
<td>2 (22%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I do not know how to learn vocabulary</td>
<td>4 (8%)</td>
<td>10 (19%)</td>
<td>9 (73%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In terms of anxiety of learning English, it was found that 53% of the learners felt anxious about reading in English. It was interesting to note that only 8% of the respondents do not know how to learn vocabulary.

Discussion

5.1 Introduction

In section four of this research, the findings and analysis are shown using the questionnaire which is the adapted version of the vocabulary strategy questionnaire proposed by Gu & Johnson (1996) and similar to the study conducted by Noor & Amir (2009). The data was recorded accordingly in descriptive statistics format where frequency counts were tabulated and converted to percentages. The findings of the data illustrated that the strategies most frequently used by English as a Foreign Language (EFL) learners in this research were repetition, memorization, dictionary strategies, use of translation and using background knowledge and experience in order to guess.
5.2 Common Strategies

Table 1: Most common strategies used by English as a Foreign Language (EFL) learners

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Statistics in Percentages (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Repetition</td>
<td>89%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading</td>
<td>91%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guessing (through experience and common sense)</td>
<td>96%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dictionary</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translation</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note taking</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1: Common Strategies in Percentages (%)

Teachers of English as a foreign/second language have always encountered that learners find it very difficult to acquire vocabulary. When learners sometimes question teachers how vocabulary can be acquired then teachers are not equipped with a variety of strategies to explain to the learners but simply two or three. The learners need proper guidance when acquiring vocabulary as it is the basis of the whole language which they want to learn. Therefore, Figure 1 will give a clear indication on the most popular strategies that learners are using. These can be applied to EFL classrooms in order assist learners in acquiring vocabulary.

5.3 Sources

Table 2: Sources of New Vocabulary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sources</th>
<th>Statistics in Percentages (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teachers</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English Materials (e.g. newspaper, novels)</td>
<td>84%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In the research, it was revealed that only 4% of the learners relied on the teachers to provide new vocabulary. On the contrary, 84% of the respondents’ revealed that the major source of new vocabulary was through reading materials such as newspapers, novels and magazines. This implies the kind of materials which should be exposed in EFL classrooms. It also provides value insight that students rely more on reading materials then the teachers as source of new words. Therefore, EFL teachers need to review the kind of materials used in classrooms and provide a variety of reading materials so that learners can increase and enhance their vocabulary.

5.4 Use of Dictionaries

The various uses of dictionaries have been revealed in this study. Different learners make use of the dictionary in their own way. The statistics show the common type of dictionaries used as well as the purposes the learners use the dictionary for.

**Table 3: Types and Usage of Dictionaries**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Usage</th>
<th>Dictionary Types and</th>
<th>Statistics in Percentages (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>English Dictionary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bilingual Dictionary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pronunciation use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Grammatical use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Appropriate usage (example sentences)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 3: Dictionary Type and Usage**
The data on dictionaries is interesting to note as shown in Figure 3. More EFL learners prefer to use bilingual dictionaries (77%) than English dictionaries (66%). Furthermore, learners have indicated the different uses of the dictionary. Some of the most common uses of dictionaries highlighted in the research show that 81% of learners use dictionaries to check the pronunciation of a word. In addition, 60% of the learners’ use the dictionary for grammatical purposes and 90% of the learners use it to find the appropriate usage of a word which includes the example sentences.

This implies the importance a dictionary has as a strategy to an EFL learner in acquiring vocabulary. Therefore, learners must be encouraged to make essential use of the dictionary in order to facilitate vocabulary learning.

6.1 Introduction

This research on Vocabulary Learning Strategies (VLSs) is a platform for solving learner frustration as this is one area which makes the whole component of language learning. As mentioned by Wilkins (1972), “without grammar, very little can be conveyed, without vocabulary, nothing can be convey”. In a foreign land example Uganda, if someone is feeling very thirsty, then knowing the correct grammar is not that important. What is most important in that situation is the correct vocabulary, if the person who is thirsty is able to say “water” in the Ugandan language then the needs is met and communication is actually what was required.

The learners of EFL/ESL need to acquire the strategies of learning vocabulary, not just for classroom purposes but for communication outside the class and in daily context. It has been often observed that due to time constraints, teachers are unable to educate learners on VLSs. However, this research will allow learners to employ VLSs on their own and encourage independent learning.
Furthermore, when teachers are aware of the various vocabulary learning strategies available then it will significantly contribute to the kind of materials they prepare for classes. This is an important topic which will benefit a wider audience and not limited to or specifically for English as a foreign language.

6.2 Recommendations

Vocabulary learning is an integral process of English as a foreign Language; Ediger (1999) embraces the idea that developing students’ vocabulary knowledge should be a major goal in each academic discipline. Vocabulary development emphasizes that students seek purpose in learning (Noor & Amir 2009). Thus, purposeful learning in vocabulary development means that students perceive reasons for achieving good vocabulary knowledge.

It is also important to the teachers; there is a need to understand that learners develop their vocabulary over a period of time.

Furthermore, it has been suggested by Anderson (1999) that there should be a steady study of vocabulary within a reading improvement program. As highlighted in section 5, the data revealed that 91% of the learners acquired their vocabulary through reading a variety of English materials. It is therefore recommended that educators introduce a variety of English reading materials in the class.

Furthermore, the dictionary is a power tool to use and as indicated in section 5, the learners prefer English and bilingual dictionaries for a variety of purposes. These include checking of pronunciation, learning the grammatical usage of a word as well as checking the appropriate usage of a word such as the example sentences. In addition, Folse (2004) states, research shows that learners who use a dictionary learn more vocabulary than those who rely on guessing from context and that learners who use a bilingual dictionary actually remember vocabulary better than those using a monolingual dictionary.

Knowing and understanding why certain factors become the reason of vocabulary learning strategies choice will benefit the teachers and researchers so that they can design appropriate materials for the students. This is attested by Ghazal (2007), stating learning new vocabulary is a challenge to foreign language students but they can overcome by having access to a variety of vocabulary learning strategies.

6.3 Conclusion

This study investigated the most frequently used vocabulary learning strategies by adult English as foreign language learners. The various aspects of the study and the methods that were employed in order to achieve the objectives will be significant to a larger audience of language learning. Folse (2004) states, perhaps the recent interest in second language vocabulary research will also mean a rethinking of the way we approach the teaching of vocabulary including the necessity to teach vocabulary extensively to our students. Further, Folse (2004) adds; for too long, second language
teaching has been dominated by an emphasis on communication, but accurate communication depends largely on an extensive knowledge of vocabulary.

Despite the fact that there has been much research in finding the best strategies learners can use in order to acquire new vocabulary, the papers reviewed show that there is still great potential in this area. In fact, it is very difficult to conclude which strategy is best to be employed by learners; the research shows that if learners use a variety of strategies then only they will be able to learn more vocabulary. Gu (2003) explains that Vocabulary Learning Strategies (VLSs) are an indispensable tool in describing and explaining the vocabulary development of a foreign language. VLS are also tools in empowering learners to make wise decisions in terms of what to learn and how to learn.

The focus of attention should be on how actually vocabulary acquisition takes place in order to understand the strategies that can be applied to make significant benefits to English as Foreign Language learners. Vocabulary acquisition research in the linguistics tradition has largely concentrated on vocabulary (target: what is to be learned; or product: what is learned) rather than acquisition (how is vocabulary learned, the learning/acquisition process) (Crow, 1986; Meara, 1980).

It was demonstrated in a research by XHAFERI, B., & XHAFERI, G. (2010) that learning new words is a complex process and the students need to use many strategies in order to remember the meaning of the words. However, the teachers' greatest concern is helping students to learn new words and Gu (1992) points out that "It is only the number of strategies and the frequencies of strategy use that deprive the poor of improvement, providing them with more alternatives obtained from the strategically rich and telling them to use their strategies more often would easily solve the problem". Little effort has been made to teach students strategies to improve their vocabulary learning. However, merely giving students lists of words to learn does not result in effective learning, despite the growing awareness on the part of learners of the importance of enhancing their communicative competence of the target language and the recognition that a much larger vocabulary is needed to this end (XHAFERI, B., & XHAFERI, G. 2010).

One of the first question’s that is asked a large number of times in EFL/ESL classes is how to learn new vocabulary of the English language, and from the research note taking and making effective use of a dictionary proves to be a good strategy. The change in the status of vocabulary in language learning has affected teaching and learning practices, as well as materials writing which has become more selective about what vocabulary to include (O’Dell, 1997).

Therefore, the analysis of various strategies highlighted in this research is a worth employing and introducing to EFL learners. There is also potential for future research in this field and researchers can use the data from this study as future framework.
Acknowledgement

Firstly, I would like to extend my deepest appreciation to the students I taught in South Pacific Freebird Institute and Project Abroad (Fiji) for taking time in participating in this research through questionnaires, informal discussions and interviews. Without their input, this research would have been incomplete.

Secondly, I would like to acknowledge the unending support and guidance of Mrs. Manpreet Kaur, Lecturer of Linguistics at the University of Fiji. She has taught me the value of one’s own work and encouraged in writing an effective content.

Finally, I would like to acknowledge the blessings of my parents who have always believed in me.
References


-Scholfield, P., Cluster analysis in the study language variation, farthing coming.


-Widiyanti, R. A. What Are the Factors Influencing the Use of Vocabulary Learning Strategies?—A Research Proposal.

Appendix
A). Semi-structured Interview/Guide for students

Dear (Name of participant)

Thank you once again for your kind participation. In this interview, I would like you to share your opinions on vocabulary learning and use of strategies in your regular practice. You will be given a list of interview questions in advance and 5 minutes for your preparation. Thank you for your kind help.

Regards,
Prashneel R. Goundar

Interview questions
1. How important do you think vocabulary learning is? Why?
2. Do you consider yourself an efficient vocabulary learner? Can you give me any illustration?
3. Do you think as long as you work hard enough, you can learn English vocabulary well?
4. Have you ever set a goal in vocabulary learning? If so, what is it? Have you fulfilled it?
5. What is the most common feeling in your vocabulary learning? What are the occasions it usually emerges?
6. Which way do you consider the most efficient in learning vocabulary? For example: rote memorization, unintentional learning in the context.
7. What does it mean to you when you say you have learnt a word?
8. Do you do extra work in vocabulary learning other than the teachers’ requirements? How?
9. What are vocabulary learning strategies?
10. Can you give some examples of vocabulary learning strategies?
11. Which sources have helped you to learn vocabulary learning strategies? Examples, teachers, colleagues etc.

B). Questionnaire on Vocabulary Learning Strategies
Table 1: Beliefs about vocabulary learning
(Please put an ‘X’ in the appropriate box)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The best way to remember words is to memorize word lists</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repetition is the best way to remember words</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is only necessary to remember one dictionary definition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can acquire a large vocabulary by memory of individual words</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1b:
(Please put an ‘X’ in the appropriate box)
I can identify the meaning of most words through reading
I can expand my vocabulary through reading a lot
Guessing words in context is one of the best ways to learn vocabulary

Table 1c:
(Please put an ‘X’ in the appropriate box)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I revise the new words I have learned</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I use the words that I have learned</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When I learned the word I pay close attention to its new usage and new meaning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When I have learned the word, I will recall the meaning to help me understand the context</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Metacognition Regulation
(Please put an ‘X’ in the appropriate box)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I think about my progress in vocabulary learning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I try to find out all I can about the new words I learn</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I only focus on things that are related to examinations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2b: Selective attention
(Please put an ‘X’ in the appropriate box)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I know which words are important for me to learn</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I look up words that I’m interested in</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I make a note of words that seem important to me</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I know what cues I should use in guessing the meaning of a particular word</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Guessing Strategies
(Please put an ‘X’ in the appropriate box)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I skip words I don’t understand</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I use my experience and common sense to guess</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I guess the meaning and then look at the dictionary (when I meet new words in reading)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3b: Using linguistic clues
(Please put an ‘X’ in the appropriate box)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I make use of my knowledge of the topic to guess the meaning of word</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guess word’s meaning from word classes, such as nouns, verbs, adjectives, adverbs, to discover the meaning of new vocabulary items</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I analyze the word structure (prefix, root and suffix) when guessing the meaning of the word</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4: Dictionary Strategies
(Please put an ‘X’ in the appropriate box)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I use an English dictionary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I use a bilingual dictionary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I use the dictionary to find out the pronunciation of the word</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I use the dictionary to find only the meaning of the word</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I look in the dictionary for the grammatical patterns of the word</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I look in the dictionary for collocation patterns</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I use the dictionary to find the appropriate usage (example sentence) of the word</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5: Note Taking Strategies
(Please put an ‘X’ in the appropriate box)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I have a vocabulary note book to list down new word</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I write down the English word and translation of the word in my language</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I only take note the meaning of the word</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I take note of the usages of the word (example sentences, part of speech, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I take note of the synonym or antonym of the word</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6: Activation Strategies
(Please put an ‘X’ in the appropriate box)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I make use of the words I learned in speaking and writing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I make use of the words I learned in everyday situations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 7: Memory/ Repetition Strategies
(Please put an ‘X’ in the appropriate box)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To remember a word, I repeat it aloud to myself</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To remember a word, I write it repeatedly</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I create a mental image of the new word to help me remember the word</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To remember a word, I analyze the word by breaking it into different parts (prefix, root, suffix)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8: Sources
(Please put an ‘X’ in the appropriate box)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I learn new words only in my class from my teacher</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I learn new words from reading English materials (e.g. newspaper, novels, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9: Anxiety
(Please put an ‘X’ in the appropriate box)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Unsure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I feel anxious about reading in English</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I skip words I don’t understand when I read in English</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I do not know how to learn vocabulary</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C). Sample Consent Letter

Dear Sir/Madam

I am writing this letter to seek your permission to carry out a research in teaching English as foreign language field. I am currently employed by Projects Abroad Nadi as the English teacher and have been teaching English as a Foreign Language for the last 4 years. As part of my Mater of Arts research project at the University of Fiji, I need to request the consent in order to complete my research.

My research topic is “Vocabulary Learning Strategies of adult English as a foreign language learners”. The aim of this study is to find out which strategies a learner uses when they learn vocabulary as it is one of the most challenging components of language learning. This study will not only be significant to students of English as a foreign/second language but to students learning any language. Learners get frustrated when they are unable to express themselves and the main reason for this is when they lack enough vocabulary or the suitable vocabulary. I have
chosen your institute because it has students from various countries, therefore, the findings of this study will be useful to a wider audience.

Enclosed in this letter is of the plan which outlines the research methodology and how the questionnaires will be disturbed and how the interviews will be conducted. I would be very grateful if you could respond to me with your permission to carry out the research at the institute from August 2013 until September 2013.

I would appreciate your feedback and suggestions also, please feel free to let me know if you have any queries.

Yours faithfully

_____________________
Prashneel. R. Goundar
Phone: 999 1453
Email: prgoundar@gmail.com
Speech Acts in Selected Political Speeches

Suhair Safwat M. Hashim
University of Sulaimani, Iraq

Abstract

The study investigates the role of language in the communication and interpretation of intentions by examining selected political speeches of John Kerry in Presidential Campaign in 2004 and George Bush- Inaugural address in 2001 since they have the same purposes as pieces of discourse with specific goals. Hence, the study focused on the pragmatic functions of locution, illocutionary and perlocutionary acts of the speeches.

Twenty sentences were selected from the two speeches. The findings show that the overall relative frequency percentages for the selected speeches are: commissive 40%, assertive 35%, directive 20%, and expressive 5%. The results show that Kerry relied more on sentences that performed commissive acts than other speech acts since he committed to some future actions, and he promised to make the world fit the words. Bush used sentences with assertive acts more than other speech acts since the assertive has a truth value which can only enhance the effect of the asserted proposition. Hence, the data are characterized by a preponderance of commissive, assertive and directive acts that are mostly used as mobilization strategies, especially in political campaigns, where it is essential for candidates to persuade their listeners to win elections.

Politicians communicate directly with the general public in order to convince them of their programs or ideas. Usually, the speakers would promote about their self and talk about their potency to be a good leader with all their goals to convince the hearer. In this area, the speech act analysis of the political speeches provides the understanding that political leaders perform various acts through their speeches. The revelation of the dominance of Speech Acts is a reflection of the purpose of political speeches which are to influence, persuade, impress, convince, and even to deceive the populace.

Keywords: Speech Acts Theory, Political Discourse, Political Speeches.
Introduction

Political language deals with the use of power to organize people’s mind and opinion. It is an instrument used to control the society in general. Speech heard by a lot of people, every person has different interpretations that can influence the success of the candidates. Political speech can be seen as a means of establishing and maintaining social relationships, expressing feelings, and selling ideas, policies and programmes in any society. In pragmatics aspect, this means Speech Act Theory; speech act performed by particular word often depends on the speaker’s intention and the context in which the word uttered.

Some scholars have examined the communicative strategies employed in political processes and the role of the media in the dissemination of political messages. In a related work, Rudyk (2007) examines power relations in Bush's union speech. The speech which focuses on the semantic, syntactic, and pragmatic levels of manipulations, studies the abuse of power in the US-Iraqi war and its effects on the recipients. Pu (2007) investigates the development of linguistic and rhetorical strategies in Bush's speech at Tsinghua University, China. This paper presents a speech acts analysis of two political speeches in presidential campaign. It tries to find the meaning of utterances based on the context of the speaker.

Political Discourse

Many studies of political discourse deal with the language of professional politicians and political institutions, some of which are discourse-analytical. (Chilton 2004: 14). Political discourse is identified by its actors or authors, viz., politicians. Politicians in this sense are the group of people who are being paid for their (political) activities, and who are being elected or appointed as the central players in the politics. But we therefore should also include the various recipients in political communicative events, such as the public, the people, and citizens. All these groups and individuals, as well as their organizations and institutions, may take part in the political process, and many of them are actively involved in political discourse. (Van Dijk 1997: 13).

The organization of public life around style-oriented service and consumer activities has also shaped conceptions of political representations. It may therefore not come as a surprise that politicians themselves have adopted a more personalized rhetoric of choice and life style values to communicate their political messages to citizens. (Simpson and Mayr 2010: 42-3).

Political discourse is not only about stating public propositions. It is about politics. It is about doing things with words. Words are used to affect the political body. Lexical items not only may be selected because of official criteria of decorum, but also because they effectively emphasize political attitudes and opinions, manipulate public opinion, manufacture political consent, or legitimate political power. The same may be true for the pragmatic management of speech acts and interactional-self presentation. In other words, may be the structures of political discourse are seldom exclusive, but
typical and effective discourse in political contexts may well have preferred structures and strategies that are functional in the adequate accomplishment of political actions in political contexts.

Studies on presidential speeches as an aspect of political discourse have been from wide range of perspectives. Undoubtedly, political discourse has been a major domain of language use that has attracted the interests of researchers for a long while. This is because political discourse is a complex human activity that deserves critical study particularly because of its central place in the organization and management of society.

The paper reveals the effectiveness of discourse tact in ensuring that speech acts force is achieved in discourse.

**Political Speeches**

In political speeches, ideas and ideologies need to be conveyed through language so that they are agreed upon by the receivers as well as by others who may read or hear parts of the speech afterwards in the media. Words and expressions are used or omitted to affect meaning in different ways. Moreover, political speeches are composed by a team of professional speech writers who are educated in the use of persuasive language. A political speech is not necessarily a success because of a correctness of truth; rather it may be a matter of presenting arguments. (Bread 2000:18).

Several speeches are made to address the people before election; these speeches could also be referred to Pre-election special addresses especially at rally and campaign. A political speech serves as a text, as an output and as a process which may be spoken or written.

Pragmatics is seen as the study of language use in particular communicative contexts or situations of necessity, this would take cognizance of the message being communicated or the speech act being performed; the participants involved; their intention, knowledge of the world and the impact of these on their interactions; what they have taken for granted as part of the context; the deductions they make on the basis of the context; what is implied by what is said or left unsaid; etc. (Leech 1983:20, Watson and Hill 1993:146, and Thomas 1995:7).

Most politicians are unaware of the fact that there is a link between what is said, what is meant, and the action conveyed by what is said. In the study of political speeches, one major theory that has been affective and adequate for analysis is the speech act theory.

**Speech Acts Theory**

The study of meaning as an enterprise in language study has attracted a lot of enquiries from various language experts. So far, two major directions have been distinguished; these are semantics and pragmatics. Although, these perspectives are different, they are complementary. Semantics as a branch of linguistics has been defined as “the study of meaning”. According to Yule (1996: 114), in semantic analysis, there is always an attempt to focus on what the words conventionally mean. Thus, Semantics
studies the conventional meaning conveyed by the use of words, phrases and sentences of a language. Pragmatics, on the other hand, is often described as the study of language in use. The difference, however, is that “while in semantic analysis, there is an attempt to focus on what the words conventionally mean, pragmatic analysis focuses on what a speaker might want the words to mean on a particular occasion.” (Grundy 2000: 33).

Central to Pragmatics is Speech Acts Theory. It is a tool to interpret the meaning and function of words in different speech situations. It concerns itself with the symbolism of words. The difference between a meaningful string of words and meaningless ones, the truth value or falsity of utterances, and the function to which language can be put.

Speech is premised on the fact that people perform various actions through the use of words and when utterances are made, a particular act is performed; this is called Speech Act. Speech Acts according to Austin (1962) fall into three classes, which are: locutionary, illocutionary, and perlocutionary acts. A locutionary act is an act of saying something; that is, the act of producing an utterance. Illocutionary acts are the core of any theory of speech acts. Illocutionary act is identified by the explicit performative. That is, the conventional force achieved in the saying of that utterance. This is realized, according to Austin (1962) as the successful realization of the speaker’s intention, which for Searle (1969) is a product of the listener’s interpretation.

The perlocutionary act is the effect or influence on the feelings, thoughts or actions of the listener/hearer. Perlocutionary acts could be inspiring, persuading, consoling, etc. It brings about an effect upon the beliefs, attitudes or behaviors of the addressee. Hence, Searle (1969) categorizes the illocutionary acts into five classes:

1- Assertives: Commit speakers to the truth of the expressed proposition, e.g. stating, claiming, reporting, announcing, etc.
2- Directives: these are statements that compel or make another person’s action fit the propositional element. It is usually used to give order thereby causing the hearer to take a particular action, request, command or advice.
3- Commissives: Commit speakers to some future actions, e.g. promising, offering, swearing, etc. to do something.
4- Expressives: Count as the expression of some psychological state, e.g. thinking, apologizing, congratulating, etc.
5- Declaratives: These statements are used to say something and make it so, such as pronouncing someone guilty, resigning, dismissing, accepting, declaring a war, etc.

We adopt Searle’s classification for the purpose of analysis. Political communication involves a focus on meaning, the understanding of which is largely a function of reaching the illocutionary force of a speaker’s utterances. Politicians articulate a lot of intentions in their speeches: they inform, inspire, assure, accuse, promise, direct, suggest, apologize, disagree, criticize, etc. this underscores the relevance of Speech Act Theory to our data analysis. This application
of the Speech Act Theory in the analysis will allow – in- depth research into the linguistic features that have been explored by the speaker to inculcate meaning into the formal linguistic properties of the selected speeches.

Objectives of the Study

The research attempts in general terms the analysis of the selected political speeches within the theory of Speech Acts. Thus, the research is meant to identify the speech act features of the selected speeches, to analyze the features in relation to the contexts in which the speeches were presented, and to determine how the identified features project the message in the speeches.

Research Methodology

In this research, two political speeches were selected of John Kerry from the 2004 Presidential Campaign about The Economy and Middle Class Families and the second is George W. Bush speech – Inaugural address in 2001. The selected speeches were downloaded from the internet and analyzed to show the speech acts performed in the course delivering the speeches. The linguistic approach adopted is based on the linguistic framework of Speech Acts Theory of Austin (1962) and Searle (1969). The selected speeches vary in length and number of sentences. We, therefore extracted specific portions from the speeches, ten sentences were selected. In the course of analysis, the two speeches selected are labeled A and B. The number of sentences in the extracted portion are ten; therefore, we have A → 10 and B → 10. This was done in order to make the analysis clear and easy to understand. The calculation of the percentages of the speech acts in a speech is made so as to make interpretation of the tables clear and empirical.

Speech Acts Analysis of Kerry’s Speech (A)

A1
Locution
Today, I’ve got a message for that woman and every other middle-class American struggling to build a better life for their family: I’ve got yours too.
Illocutionary act: Assertive (reporting).
Expected Perlocutionary effect: Hopefulness.

A2
Locution
Time and time again, George Bush has proven that he’s stubborn, out of touch, and unwilling to change course.
Illocutionary act: Assertive (stating).
Perlocutionary effect: Loss of confidence.
A3
Locution
*Middle class families deserve a new choice, and one month from today, they’ll have one.*
Illocutionary act: Commisive (promising).
Perlocutionary effect: Encouragement and hopefulness.

A4
Locution
*That’s what I stand for, that’s who I’ve fought for, and if you give me the chance, that’s where I’ll lead this nation as your president.*
Perlocutionary effect: Encouragement.

A5
Locution
*Our plan starts by offering a new choice on jobs.*
Illocutionary act: Commisive (promising).
Perlocutionary act: Happiness and hopefulness.

A6
Locution
*We will offer after school opportunities to another 2 million children, so your kids have a safe place to go while you work.*
Illocutionary act: Commisive (offering and promising).
Perlocutionary act: Encouragement and hopefulness.

A7
Locution
*We can fight for the middle class with my plan to finally make America energy independent of Mideast oil.*
Illocutionary act: Directive (appealing).
Perlocutionary effect: Inspiring.

A8
Locution
*But today, for too many families, the dream is harder to reach because of decisions made by the administration.*
Illocutionary act: Assertive (stating).
Perlocutionary act: Loss of confidence.
A9

Locution

We choose health care that works for all Americans— that lowers the cost to business, lowers the premiums for families, and makes health care affordable and accessible to everyone.

Illocutionary act: Commissive (offering).
Perlocutionary effect: Hopefulness and happiness.

A10

Locution

We will help Americans meet demands at home at work by expanding family and medical leave.

Illocutionary act: Commissive (promising).
Perlocutionary effect: Hopefulness and excitement.

Speech Acts Analysis of George Bush’s Speech (B)

B1

Locution

I am honored and humbled to stand here, where so many of America’s leaders have come before me, and so many will follow.

Illocutionary act: Assertive (stating).
Perlocutionary effect: Excitement.

B2

Locution

And we are confident in principles that unite and lead us ahead.

Illocutionary act: Assertive (stating, announcing).
Perlocutionary effect: Hopefulness.

B3

Locution

As I begin, I thank President Clinton for his service to our nation.

Illocutionary act: Expressive (thanking).
Perlocutionary effect: Cheerfulness and happiness.

B4

Locution

Today, we affirm a new commitment to live out our nation’s promise through civility, courage, compassion and character.

Illocutionary act: Assertive (claiming).
Perlocutionary effect: Hopefulness and encouragement.
B5

Locution

The enemies of liberty and our country should make no mistakes: America remains engaged in the world by history and by choice, shaping a balance of power that favors freedom.
Illocutionary act: Directive (claiming).
Perlocutionary effect: Determining and encouraging.

B6

Locution

America, at its best, is a place where personal responsibility is valued and expected.
Illocutionary act: Assertive (stating).
Perlocutionary effect: Cheerfulness and excitement.

B7

Locution

Never tiring, never yielding, never finishing, we renew that purpose today, to make our country more just and generous, to affirm the dignity of our lives and every life.
Illocutionary act: Commissive (promising).
Perlocutionary effect: Encouragement and hopefulness.

B8

Locution

We will build our defenses beyond challenge, lest weakness invite challenge.
Illocutionary act: Commissive (promising).
Perlocutionary effect: Hopefulness.

B9

Locution

I ask you to seek a common good beyond your comfort; to defend needed reforms against easy attacks; to serve your nation, beginning with your neighbor.
Perlocutionary effect: Inspiring and encouragement.

B10

Locution

We will reform social security and Medicare, sparing our children from struggles we have the power to prevent.
Illocutionary act: Commissive (promising).
Perlocutionary effect: Hopefulness and encouragement.
Table (1) Illocutionary Acts of Speech (A).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Illocutionary Acts</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Commissive</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assertive</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directive</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (2) Illocutionary Acts of Speech (B).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Illocutionary Acts</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assertive</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commissive</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directive</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expressive</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (3) Summary of Tables (1) and (2).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Illocutionary Acts</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Commissive</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assertive</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directive</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expressive</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Findings and Discussion

Language is a powerful weapon in getting to the political thoughts and ideologies of politicians, hence the language use of Kerry and Bush is studied through the two selected speeches in order to get to their thoughts. The Speech Act Theory was applied with the five categories of Searle’s (1969). It was discovered from Kerry’s speech that he had used sentences that are commissive as they have a total percentage 50% while 30% are assertive and 20% are directive. Kerry had used mainly commissive speech acts in his presidential campaign to commit himself to some future action. Commissives are promises, threat, refusals, and pledges, and they can be performed by the speaker. In using the commissive, the speaker undertakes to make the world fit the words (via the speaker).
The assertive in Bush’s speech are 40%, that is to say Bush used language to state, maintain, inform, and announce by asserting his authority. 30% are commissives, 20% are directives, and 10% are expressive speech act.

From the overall relative frequency percentages tables that 40% of the total sentences are commissives, followed by assertive acts with 35%, while directives have 20% and expressive have 5%. It is found that commissive speech acts are identified more than other types of speech acts in the selected political speeches. Here we find out that the two speakers promise and challenge their hearers to show that they are committed to the task of rebuilding their nation.

Conclusion

The study has examined selected political speeches as pieces of discourse with specific goals. The identification of speech acts types in speeches go a long way in ascribing meanings to such speeches. In other words, the speech acts bring to the fore meaning in speeches. As observed, in the process or act of saying something; other speech acts are performed. The speech acts in a work portray the personality of the speaker.

The analysis of the two speeches reveals that Kerry’s speech is characterized by the use of commissive speech acts, especially in political campaign where it is essential for candidates to persuade their listeners towards a desired goal of winning elections. In Bush’s speech, the use of assertive speech acts have a truth value which commits the speaker to the truth of the expressed propositions and consequently provide whatever motivation and/or justification. The Speech Act Theory as a framework in the analysis of the selected speeches enables us to explore the language use of political leaders.
References


Violence et effets

Sihem Hasni
University of Gafsa, Tunisia

Résumé

Dans cet article, nous nous interrogeons sur la violence et son effet en montrant comment la violence verbale a pu être un moyen de réalisation des effets perlocutoires désirés ou réels, résumés dans la réponse à une réclamation, à travers un énoncé scandé pendant la révolution tunisienne. Notre question porte sur la manifestation de la violence à travers les mécanismes discursifs de l'énoncé dégage, slogan révolutionnaire produit pendant la révolution tunisienne, . D'abord scandé et ensuite devenu un slogan sociopolitique de grande envergure, l'énoncé violent a eu des effets positifs.

Mots-clés : énoncé, violence verbale, violence langagière, discours, actes de langage.
Abstract

In this article, we question violence and its effect showing how verbal abuse could be a way of achieving the desired or actual perlocutionary effects, summarized in response to a complaint, through a statement chanted during the Tunisian revolution. Our issue is the manifestation of violence through the discursive mechanisms of the statement emerges, a revolutionary slogan product for the Tunisian revolution. First chanted and then became a major sociopolitical slogan, violent statement has had positive effects.

Keywords: statement, violence abuse, verbal violence, speech, speech acts.
Introduction

La communication et la vertu performative du langage sont le lieu de toutes les expressions. Elles permettent aux sujets communicants de consigner les traces communicationnelles et de créer une relation entre le dire le faire et l’être qui se fait par l’enchaînement des relations constructives entre l’énonciation et la situation environnante dans laquelle s’inscrivent les normes communicatives. Dans ce cas, l’énoncé peut entrainer des effets positifs ou négatifs sur l’attribution des valeurs et la modification du système de positionnement. Comme il engendre des glissements attitudinaux (involontaires ou calculés) susceptibles de déclencher une violence qui peut aboutir au résultat attendu.

Parmi ces situations, nous proposons de nous pencher sur la violence verbale et le phénomène de montée en tension (Moïse et al, 2008a) dans un contexte conflictuel qui associe un peuple et son président. En mettant l’accent sur les moments de la manifestation du mécontentement du peuple, nous essayons, à travers cet article, de traiter de l’impact de la violence verbale sur la réalité perceptive. Cette violence, abondamment mise en parole et geste, annonce le présent d’un peuple et recompose son passé par des formes multiples sur fond de réalité.

Dans cet article, nous tentons de montrer comment la violence verbale peut être un moyen d’accomplissement de l’acte et comment par l’arme unique le langage violent, le peuple protestataire a accompli son acte énonciatif. En comptant sur sa force illocutoire, il a fait réagir l’allocutaire et a réalisé les effets perlocutoires désirés ou réels, résumés dans la réponse à la réclamation scandée.

En faisant valoir notre propre interprétation de l’énoncé dégage! nous approchons l’étude de la violence et son effet par le biais des points suivants :

- la manifestation de la violence
- la violence langagière
- la violence lexicale

Notre objectif est de déterminer la valeur pragmatique d’une expression axiologiquement négative et de saisir sa représentation interprétative en posant comme problématique la question de la violence verbale et son effet.

Pour mener cette étude, nous nous inscrivons dans la perspective des actes du langage afin de pouvoir traiter la structure formelle de l’énoncé ainsi que le fonctionnement des relations interpersonnelles et de la pragmatique qui nous permettra d’atteindre le sens communiqué à l’aide des données contextuelles et d’étudier les techniques discursives qui résultent d’une parole argumentée justifiée par l’inscription du discours social sur une scène publique.
Notre corpus est composé d'un énoncé scandé dans le pays phare du printemps arabe. Cet énoncé est le verbe dégage !

I. La manifestation de la violence

La violence qui constitue l'indice d'une rupture de consensus en rapport avec la manifestation d'une agressivité verbale, signifiée par les circonstances de son apparition, a été traduite par la masse populaire en *acte de langage* doté d'une signification sociopolitique (un événement de langage et un événement social et politique) exprimé par une forme de slogans révolutionnaires, des slogans de manifestations qui ont été jugés par Austin (1962 : 273) comme des actes de langage.

Le mécontentement qui a réuni toutes les classes sociales sans leaders, sans partis politiques, sans perspective, etc. autour des slogans *Ben Ali dégage !* ou *dégage !* a provoqué une violence « symbolique » et engendré des effets psychologiques et émotionnels (Braud,2006). Bien qu'elle soit « une réponse à la confrontation entre le principe de désir et le principe de réalité » (Grettiez, 2008:17), elle a libéré la parole et brisé le mur de la peur : l'impensable devient une vérité et le dire devient un faire.

I.1. Le passage de la langue au discours

Par un passage de la langue à la pragmatique, la violence verbale est devenue capable de transformer par un simple fait de dire une politique longtemps considérée comme le destin d’un peuple. C’est par le biais de la parole que le verbe français *dégager* a occupé une place primordiale dans la révolution tunisienne et a connu une nouvelle acceptation qui reflète sa réalité discursive. Ce terme—qui a été employé pour la première fois le 10 janvier 2011, avant la révolution, dans la vidéo d'un opposant tunisien appelé Tarak Mekki—est emprunté à la langue française. Il est devenu essentiel dans le lexique révolutionnaire tunisien.

*Dégage* a pris une signification politico-sociale et il est devenu un slogan emblématique de la révolution du 14 janvier, une révolution contre un système politique oppressif et un dictateur. C’est ce que le peuple veut.

L’usage violent de l’énoncé cité antérieurement ne cesse de perpétuer durant les différentes étapes de la révolution et le français devient alors une institution au sens actif du mot, une composante d'un ensemble de pratiques qui font le fondement d'un nouvel Etat. Autrement dit, un terme qui lui donne naissance, en préserve l'existence, le symbolise et en garantit le fonctionnement plus tard.

Dans l'usage effectif du langage tel qu'il se réalise dans une situation énonciative essentiellement particulière mettant en présence des interlocuteurs, effectuant des actes de caractère linguistique, nous nous interrogeons sur l'acte déclenché par les Tunisiens dans l'intention de communiquer et de faire.
Dans notre cadre de travail, nous allons échapper aux tendances de la description d'un mécanisme communicatif des schémas de la communication usuellement proposés tel que celui de Jakobson figurant dans son livre *Essais de linguistique générale* dont les différents facteurs inaliénables de la communication verbale peuvent être schématiquement représentés comme suit :

```
Contexte
Destinateur---------Message-------------Destinataire
Contact
Code
```

et expliqués ainsi : un destinateur adresse un message à un destinataire à propos d'un certain référent, à l'aide d'un code linguistique et grâce à un canal sonore ou graphique (c'est l'« encodage » de l'émetteur) ; de son côté, le destinataire reçoit et comprend le message (c'est le « décodage » du récepteur), puis les deux interlocuteurs échangent les rôles lors de la réponse. Cette description présente le processus de communication linguistique sous un jour quelque peu simplificateur.

Ici, nous n'allons pas réduire le mécanisme à ses traits essentiels, mais nous opérons une modification radicale de point de vue. C'est-à-dire, nous n'allons ni nous borner à reconnaître un cas particulier de transmission d'informations ni à identifier le destinataire et le destinataire respectivement à un émetteur-encodeur et à un récepteur-décodeur, mais nous les tenons pour ce qu'ils sont vraiment, à savoir des interlocuteurs assumant des rôles.

La communication réalisée implique alors l'acte de langage violent, incluant des actes de caractère linguistique où l'explicite cohabite avec l'implicite et pensé comme un passage de la langue au discours énonciatif. Ce passage qui souhaite substituer à la description d'un mécanisme communicatif celui d'un processus énonciatif consiste à opérer les formes de la violence que l’allocutaire subie de la part du locuteur qui est un agent qui produit le message et en assume la responsabilité, par sa manifestation et sa présence dans l'énoncé afin d'accomplir son acte. Dans ce cas de l'exécution violente de l'acte langagier, qui représente une avalanche d'actes menaçants, adressée de la part du peuple au président de l'Etat, nous enregistrions un changement d’attitude adopté par le locuteur qui passe de la position de faiblesse à la position de force, par l’effet de scander le slogan dans le but d’insinuer un acte de révolte et de mettre en exergue l'engagement à l’action.

**1.2. Les mécanismes discursifs**

La phrase *dégage!* qui est un objet construit, dénué de toute singularité énonciative dans la langue, est devenu un acte violent actualisé à travers un énoncé, c'est-à-dire une entité langagière produite et insérée dans une situation d'énonciation, par nature singulière. De cette violence verbale singulière liée aux partenaires mis en présence et aux circonstances spatio-temporelles de l'énonciation résulte l'unicité de cet énoncé qui apparaît non répétable.
Le Tunisien qui veut que le président de la république soit ôté, dit :
Dégage !
Le matin du 14 janvier, l’allocataire n’a pas exécuté l’acte souhaité. Le locuteur a répété le même énoncé Dégage !

Bien que le même énoncé soit répété plusieurs fois dans les mêmes circonstances spatiales, nous disons que les énoncés prononcés successivement ne se confondent pas. Certes, en l'espace, les partenaires n'ont pas changé, mais l’instauration d’un climat de tension qui augmente progressivement, la transgression des règles du respect du président de l’Etat au moyen de l’affectation de son image en fonction des représentations linguistiques et culturelles des protestataires et le délai qui sépare la suite d'énoncés, du fait que chaque énoncé devient une réénonciation du précédent, introduisent immanquablement une nuance différente et plus sévère par rapport au premier, par exemple la colère violente, l'impatience et l'insistance.

C’est dans le discours que la composante du langage où l'unité préénonciative, la phrase dégage ! engagée dans une situation d'énonciation chargée de tension, se transforme en une violence verbale qui véhicule l’idée d’une infraction et du déni.

L’étude du mécanisme discursif répond donc à cette transformation qui nous indique sous quelles conditions une certaine situation énonciative impose à un énoncé une signification différente du sens de la phrase dont il procède.

II. la violence langagière :

Au cours de l’analyse de la structure formelle de notre énoncé, nous allons classer les actes langagiers véhiculant des menaces et montrer les divers aspects de la violence langagière pour atteindre l’objectif désiré.

II.1.L'aspect implicite

La violence verbale n’apparait pas dans l'interprétation sémantique de notre énoncé. Elle ne concerne pas la prise en compte de son élément informatif explicite mais l'explication de ses éléments implicites qui suivent des mécanismes relevant de l’inférence et du type de phrase. C'est par la connaissance du contexte et de la situation d'énonciation qui sont indispensables que s’éclaire la signification de la violence de notre énoncé et que la forme linguistique associée à l'acte de parole soit perçue comme détournée et implicite. Elle va recevoir une autre perception, celle d’acte de menace direct.

II.2.L'aspect illocutoire

Le maintien de la violence continue avec d’autres formes comme la condition de l’engagement énonciatif qui est la composante pragmatique (grec pragma = « acte ») de l'énoncé. Autrement dit, dans notre énoncé, le locuteur ne parle pas pour simplement entrer en communication avec autrui. Mais, il parle pour dire quelque chose et pour exprimer un ordre.
En disant dégage ! les manifestants accomplissent leur acte de révolution en entraînant des rapports d'influence et de force avec l'allocutaire. Ils se distinguent comme des révolutionnaires contre le régime. La réalisation langagière violente de cet acte est en fait apparue dans la forme même de la phrase : ainsi, il y a une morpho-syntaxe de l'ordre qui est l'impératif.

De point de vue pragmatique, nous soulignons une convenance entre la situation énonciative et la nature de l'acte effectué lors de l'énonciation. La composante pragmatique est présentée par un acte violent dans le but illocutoire est la prise d'une attitude de la part du locuteur à l'égard de son allocutaire (le président de l'Etat). Cette prise d'attitude du locuteur a pu déclencher l'effet progressif de la violence auquel il a associé des actes menaçants véhiculés dans l'intonation, le rythme de la voix pour attribuer une valeur de justification à cette violence verbale et attitudinale à savoir le désaccord qui renvoie à l'existence d'un refus catégorique de la personne du président et pour la légitimer. L'association du verbal et du non verbal sont autant de révélateurs de l'attitude du locuteur, voire de sa violence qui place la phrase dite de type impératif non dans son cadre syntaxique propre mais dans celui qui exprime un haut degré dans la dépréciation de la condition vécue. C'est un acte interpellatif présenté par l'ordre.

L'énoncé dégage !, cet acte performatif qui repose sur le complément décisif des actes (les bras levés, l'intonation, etc.) et sur la parole est pris en charge par un énonciateur explicite (le peuple tunisien) est identifié comme violent au motif que la réalité à laquelle il réfère est engendrée de l'énonciation. Ce n’est qu’au moment où l'énoncé est proféré que la réalité qu'il engendre accède à l'existence.

II.3. L’aspect perlocutoire

Nous nous arrêtons sur deux aspects perlocutoires :

- l'acte indirect

  L'énoncé Dégage ! est à interpréter au sens de je t'ordonne de dégager. L'énonciateur a utilisé une façon indirecte de dire. Dans le cas de cet acte indirect, tout autorise le président-allocutaire à penser que son peuple-énonciateur parle du départ, s'il dit dégage ! ou Ben Ali dégage, ce n'est pas pour l'informer ; d'où la réinterprétation perlocutoire sous forme de modalité d'énonciation où les rôles respectifs du locuteur et de l’allocutaire dans l’acte de parole apparaissent à travers l'emploi de la phrase impérative, forme privilégiée qui correspond à un acte d'injonction exprimant l'ordre et la colère violente de la masse tunisienne. Cet acte est accompli dans la mesure où les manifestants cherchent à obliger Ben Ali à céder le pouvoir et à démissionner.

  La réinterprétation perlocutoire est liée au contexte énonciatif et à la collaboration du destinataire : si le président-destinataire ne veut pas partir, le locuteur n'a aucune réinterprétation à attendre de lui ; l'énoncé restera un ordre. Or, par la prononciation du seul énoncé dégage !, en le scandant, en se basant sur la force d'un énoncé ayant une valeur violente d'ordre et en utilisant des éléments paralinguistiques, le locuteur (le peuple tunisien...
protestataire) a pu réaliser les effets perlocutoires souhaités et accomplir son acte énonciatif. Ces effets perlocutoires déterminent et identifient déjà le slogan révolutionnaire en le distinguant des autres types.

- Le sous-entendu

Le sous-entendu n'est pas déductible de la phrase, par inférence mais par le non-dit. L'énoncé dégage ! peut avoir un sous-entendu comme dégage, je m'engage ; dégage, je n'ai plus envie de toi, monsieur le dictateur, etc.

Désireux de scander ce slogan, le locuteur préfère exercer une violence verbale agressive marquée par la violation de la règle de la cohérence plutôt que celle de la qualité informative qui exige qu'on dise ce qu'on croit vrai. Le mot devient alors un énoncé qui exprime une pensée, une opinion et une orientation positive sous-jacente, révélant un moment fort de l'action, orienté vers une nouvelle signification en tant que slogan de révolution. dégage assigne alors au terme d'origine une valeur bidimensionnelle. D'une part, il assure une valeur politique, d'autre part, il devient symbole de protestation. Par le biais de l'emploi du verbe dégager, la langue a fait l'objet d'une prise en charge publique violente. Elle entretient des rapports étroits avec le social et le politique et devient une sorte d'appropriation réflexive à des fins plus ou moins délibérées d'illustration. Elle est tenue pour moyen dont la continuité assimile la variété des motivations : strictement politique, quand il s'agit d'abord d'affirmer la mobilisation et la protestation non contre la prise du pouvoir mais contre celui qui l'accapare et de déloger la dictature puis, plus social en cette circonstance, quand il s'agit de faire de la langue le vecteur et le signe de la dénonciation du chômage, d'une vie sans dignité et sans liberté et de l'appel aux droits essentiels des citoyens : l'emploi, la liberté et la dignité, composantes primordiales de l'idéal démocratique.

Dégage ! demeure donc un symbole de rupture entre le peuple et le président, mais il a connu ensuite des significations autres variables selon les contextes, le temps et l'espace.

III. La violence lexicale:

« dégager » l’autre, donc les actions à accomplir par l’acteur révolutionnaire vise à s’attaquer à la face de l’autre en cumulant des actes menaçants pour ternir son image.

De ce fait, la relation devient asymétrique puisque le protestataire se place dans une position de pouvoir et de dominance qui engendre une inégalité qui s’inscrit dans le contexte et qui peut se transformer en « une tentative de proposer /imposer son propre monde pour gagner la partie. » (Ghiglione et Trognon,1993 :277).

Conclusion:

En ayant recours à notre énoncé et se focalisant sur la violence verbale sur une scène publique et son effet, notre analyse a révélé que le locuteur, qui a opté pour l’usage d’une langue qui n’est pas le sien, a montré son agression par le biais des actes de langage et du lexique. La relation entretenue entre lui et l’allocutaire est marquée par des moments de confrontation qui se caractérisent par la manifestation différentielle de la violence verbale en rapport avec la réclamation demandée. Dès le départ, le locuteur a annoncé sa confrontation ouvertement. Il se situe dans une violence fulgurante marquée par son acharnement sur son interlocuteur. Il s’explose sous l’effet d’un débordement interlocutif révélateur de son état d’emportement qui l’a poussé à suivre le projet de vengeance personnelle en cumulant d’accomplissement des actes de menaces qui produisent un effet négatif sur ses faces.

1 La face est « une valeur sociale positive qu’une personne revendique effectivement à travers sa ligne d’action que les autres supposent qu’elle a adoptée au cours d’un contact particulier, la face est une image de moi délinée selon certains attributs sociaux approuvés et néanmoins partageables » (Goffman, 1974 :9)
Références


Feminist Criticism: A traceable premise in Welsh and Malaysian Short Stories

Nor Hashimah Isa
Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris, Malaysia

Abstract

This is a comparative study of short stories from Wales and Malaysia, countries which are in many ways as culturally distant as they are geographically remote. There are several corridors which might lead to a fruitful comparative study. Both countries have more than one official language and have a history of cultural tensions arising from different legacies of colonialism including prominent discourses of authenticity and rootedness positioned against imported cultures. The National language of Wales and Malaysia is Welsh and Malay respectively. But, the two short stories, one from each country that will be discussed are written in the English language. The ways in which women’s loyalties may be divided between religious or national affiliations and feminist aspirations are also interesting to compare. This research acknowledges key differences how women writers from Wales and Malaysia negotiate feminist aims in often conflicting cultural, national and religious contexts. Stories from post war Welsh and Malaysian women writers are compared. Interesting findings include different ways of resolving conflicts in a patriarchal society where the Welsh women are more vocal and ensure that their voices are heard in one way or another. The Malaysian women on the other hand are voiceless and relentlessly suffer in silence. The Welsh woman as depicted in the story is deprived of help in her dreaded daily chores and all she could possibly do is to shout and scold her husband to no avail.

Keywords: Feminist criticism, Patriarchal society.
Stories from post war Welsh and Malaysian women writers are compared. Interesting findings include different ways of resolving conflicts in a patriarchal society where the Welsh women are more vocal and ensure that their voices are heard in one way or another. The Malaysian women on the other hand are voiceless and relentlessly suffer in silence. This paper highlights stories by Welsh and Malaysian writers to identify the writers’ ways of recognizing women and their experiences in combating issues in a patriarchal society. When Welsh story is compared with Malaysian story there are prominent ways the women characters used in confronting issues with male characters who are defiantly very patriarchal. Similarities and differences are revealed.

The stories compared are Davis (1967) by Sian Evans and The Journey (1967) by Shirley Lim. Both Welsh and Malaysian stories are written in English. Davis is about a husband named Fred Davis, who is rather lazy in terms of doing work in the farm and other chores at home. He feels that his wife nags him a lot, ‘Nagging night and day; it ain’t my fault, damn you’ (p.181). His wife Mary is very upset with his laziness and complains to him, telling him of his duties and that she has no vegetables to cook. They rely on their small patch of land and a few animals for consumption and to survive. Davis realises he has to do this and repair that but he deliberately does not do them as required of him, much to his wife’s anger and frustration. She yells at him saying he is such a lazy pig and how she wished she did not marry him. In their bed at night he tries to rekindle the passion with her but to no avail. He promises her he will do the chores in the morning. But when morning comes Davis continues sleeping as his wife carries on with his difficult chores in the farm and the house.

The Journey by Shirley Lim was written in 1967, ten years after the country achieved its independence from the British. This story is about a Chinese young girl who is born into poverty with a pregnant mother, a gambler father and many siblings. Her father is a Mahjong player, a form of Chinese gambling. Her mother is a housewife and she has many children. The girl who is not named in this story is the eldest. Her mother asks her to go to a place to get some herbs for her. She has to board a bus and the journey is rather long. She follows her mother’s specific directions on how to get to the place and what to do when she gets to the specific house. Although she is rather scared she willingly goes on this journey for the love of her mother. She knows this journey is vital for her mother. She reaches the house and takes the package from a man and pays him. She then boards the bus again to go home. Her mom boils the herbs and drinks the brew. The young girl is unaware that the herbal preparation is to help abort her mother’s fetus. That night she is awakened by a loud groan of her mother in excruciating pain. She dashes to the bathroom and sees her mother lying on the floor in a pool of fresh blood, ‘Dark messes were splattered on the floor, her mother’s clothes were blood-red with a flow from some secret wound, while the woman herself’ squatted, eyes contracted, body rigid and contorted’ (p.17). The girl feels repulsive of blood but in the pale light she helps her mother, giving her warm sweet milk from the baby’s flask. As her mother lay asleep, the girl cleans the bathroom floor, scrubbing and pouring water.

The story ends with the young girl pouring cold water, shuddering and crying as she cleans her mother’s blood on the floor. She is too young to understand that the herbs she took earlier are actually for abortion. Her mother does not want any more children as the youngest one is still a baby. She is
weak and has many children. She has no choice but to take matters into her own hands and drink the herbs. She suffers in silence because her husband only cares for his gambling. The mother endures deprivation of love and care by her dominant husband as she tries to tend to her many children and her daily duties.

It is evident that the female characters in both stories yearn for their male partners’ attention, love and care. It is apparent a female yearning for something that is lost from a male significant other or husband is portrayed in Davis and The Journey. The female characters in Davis and The Journey appear to want their partners to listen to them and to share their sorrows but to no gain. The object of much yearning for attention and care in all stories is unquestionably desire for a man’s love and care. With his love comes his affection and undivided attention. A feminist writing would still agree that men and women need one another biologically and emotionally. One completes the other and therefore if one is not getting enough attention from the other the person will definitely feel it and is affected miserably. In these stories the women negotiate feminist aims such as to just ignore the abuse, continue with their chores, move on with their lives or find other means to handle their problems. In so doing they may endanger their lives such as in the case of the pregnant mother in The Journey.

Felman states that just as man considers himself superior to nature, so he considers himself superior to woman (p.321). This is irrefutably true as men have the last say in many cultural settings. The parallel between the stories is Welsh and Malaysian women are subjected to suppression and alienation by their husbands in patriarchal dominated societies regardless of cultural and geographical setting. It is evident that in these stories, the women are treated as mere objects by the men. They are silenced by the patriarchal dominated men. Sands & Nuccio (2008) say feminist writings across disciplines have illuminated an understanding of the status of women in a patriarchal society, sexist biases in social and behavioral theories, and the feminization of poverty. The difference is whether the Welsh and Malaysian women find ways to liberate themselves from their stifling environment. If they did then what are the ways they attempt to resist the men’s domination?

In the stories, the writers show us the female characters are stifled and alienated by the males’ demonstration of a very patriarchal dominance. The males are the husbands and the breadwinners for the family and the wives are just the female caretakers. They are not treated as wives, showered with love but merely the persons who take care of their food and needs and who work for them. Tolan F. explains how De Beauvoir, a French philosopher and novelist constructed an epic account of gender throughout history, examining biological, psychological, historical, and cultural explanation for the reduction of women to a second and lesser sex (p.320). Felman, S (1993). in her article ‘Women and Madness. The Critical Phallacy (p.133 -153) quotes a book that derives and disputes a ‘female psychology’ conditioned by an oppressive and patriarchal male culture. (p.134)

The Welsh woman has a voice and demonstrates some form of resistance. She releases her bitterness and sadness by calling her husband lazy pig and saying she wishes she did not marry him. She has courage to resist suppression and alienation because Welsh women have a different value orientation and culture than the Malaysian women. The Welsh women had some education and some
went to college. In Wales the women had free education which even started as early as the eighteenth century. There was the women’s movement that started in France which was responsible for many women movements in Europe. Welsh women in early twentieth-century took part in protests and many were put in jail. Hence, the psyche of the Welsh woman writer is portrayed in the story. There is some distinct difference between the stories in terms of the timeline. In Malaysia not many women are educated in early post independence or post Second World War. The only education they probably would have received is lower primary. They received little or no education during pre independence which affects their lives during post independence. What they had was just little education from Primary vernacular schools in their villages and they did not continue to English Secondary schools. The Welsh women on the hand had education from biblical teachings in churches to secondary schools. Some Welsh women had the opportunity to study in universities in Wales and England.

The similarity in the stories is that the women are all ‘abused’ and harassed by their husbands. Here, abused is not physically abuse but abuse in terms of not helping out with chores that are theirs and giving a deaf ear to their female partners. The women are wives and in the journey, she is a mother of many children. Yet, both are not given the respect they deserve. In Davis, Karen is constantly doing her husband’s chores because he is too lazy to do them. Isn’t it the duty of the male in a family to put food on the table for his wife and children? In Davis, there are no children, yet, it is such an ordeal for Davis the husband to do his daily chores. He is too indolent because he knows if he does not execute the cumbersome chores the wife Karen will do them instead.

Another similarity is the women abide to all foes and fancies of the husbands as obedient wives. Karen in Davis still prepares her husband’s supper although she yells and screams at him for being so lazy. Apparently, the female character in The Journey by Shirley Lim cannot discuss this issue of not wanting anymore children with her dominating gambling husband. Being a woman and a wife she has no choice but to drink the preparation of herbs to abort the fetus. This is the tragic fate of being a woman in a patriarchal society. In The journey, the Chinese wife who is the mother of many children takes care of her family and endures her fate in silent. She is voiceless even to the extent of drinking herbs preparation to abort her fetus illegally. She has had enough of successive pregnancies. Hence, she takes care of it in her own dangerous way. On the contrary, Karen in Davis finds her voice by scolding and yelling at her lazy husband but in The journey the Chinese wife is voiceless. Perhaps it is due to her Chinese or Asian culture. In the early days, the superiority of the Chinese father is carried to such an absurd length like sons cannot sit at the same table with their fathers if there are any guests present. Eastern values such as that of the Chinese and Malay stress respect to elders, especially the father. Nor Hashimah Isa (2007) states the Chinese or Malay father is superior because he is the man of the house and responsible for everyone and everything under his roof. His accountability is huge. Hence, he must ensure that the children obey and respect him and this is to discipline the children. The father knows that children, being merely children, would definitely behave unbecomingly especially in the presence of guests. Be it to discipline the children or to uphold their superiority, Chinese fathers and parents work to earn filial respect from their children. This respect for fathers and the elders is still a strong value that is inherited for years.
The Welsh and Malaysian women had very difficult and demanding domestic chores as wives and mothers in a very patriarchal community. The Welsh and Malaysian men as males in a very patriarchal society may have disregarded or suppressed their wives’ feelings or their attempts to be heard. More often than not the women were thrown into obscurity. They existed only to prepare food, scrub soiled clothes, and wash dirty dishes. Not to mention other tasks prioritized to the family like giving birth and taking care of the children and husbands. Beddoe, D (2000) says the Welsh women had to scrub their husbands’ backs that were dirty with black coal daily. Mothers were too busy doing other chores like cooking and feeding husbands who had to go back to work in the quarries.

In conclusion, regardless of any geographical or cultural location women writers bring forth the suppression and annihilation experienced by fellow women via their literary works. Depictions of women’s loyalties that may be divided between religious or national affiliations and feminist aspirations in combating patriarchal society are made known through their creative works. Welsh and Malaysian women endure deprivation of love and care by their husbands and partner but they differ by having a voice. This is due to their cultural and religious value orientations that allow them to find their or prevent them from doing so.
References


Speaking: A Review

A. K. M. Mazharul Islam
King Khalid University, Abha, Saudi Arabia

Abstract

We are usually not aware of the process of speaking, as we are unconscious of our breathing in oxygen and breathing out carbon dioxide; as if they are automatic and effortless. We become conscious of our breathing only when we gasp for a little air and likewise, fumbling for the right word very often makes us aware of our speaking. Surprising facts about speaking are there. A chain of subtle and intricate activities takes place within moments. The starting is in our brain where the message is conceptualized, and then in the physiological level, the message travels through the nervous system and finally in the physical level, the message is passed to the articulatory speech organs to produce sounds. In this writing, we shall see how the messages are formed and monitored in a preverbal state and how those messages receive phonological and grammatical encoding following some phonetic plan. Various stages and features of speaking and the role of long and short term memory are also dealt here. This writing will hopefully facilitate the interested learners of the phonetics and psycholinguistics.

Keywords: speaking, the intricate and voluntary process of speech, the location of speech in the human brain, conceptualizer, formulator, articulators, grammatical and phonological encoding of speech, self-correction, pause and other features of speech.
Introduction:

The rare blessing of speaking has secured human being a unique position in the world amidst a numberless species and all our thoughts and dreams, prayers and meditations, relation and communication dwell within our speech. This act of speaking is of immense importance in psycholinguistics, though we are rarely aware of this act while we talk, as if, this is an involuntary and natural flow of passing information. But this is not so. The act of speaking is a very intricate and complex one. Firstly, the message is formed in the brain then it, in a preverbal state, receives phonetic and grammatical coloring and then it goes through a speech plan and finally it is passed to the articulatory organs for the articulation of the sounds. While speaking the messages in the verbal form follows a definite pattern in respect choosing phonological, morphological and syntactic aspects. And the various features of speaking are also very interesting to know.

What is speaking?

It is not very easy to delimit speaking under some definition. Speaking is said to be a voluntary act of a speaker with an intention to influence the listener in a desired way. It concerns an alteration in the state of knowledge. A speaker may state, enquire, promise, bet, warn, and exclaim, order and so on. Clark and Clark (1977) put it in the following manner:

Speaking is fundamentally an instrumental act. Speakers talk in order to have some effect on their listeners. They assert things to change their state of knowledge. They request things to do things for them. And they promise, bet, warn, and exclaim to affect them in still other ways. The nature of the speech act should, therefore, play a central role in the process of speech production. Speakers begin with the intention of affecting their listeners in a particular way, and they select and utter a sentence they believe will bring about just this effect.

The act of speaking is not mere opening and closing the mouth. It roughly comprises three stages. They are - psychological, physiological and physical. Initially, an idea is formulated in the speaker’s brain and secondly, human nervous system transmits this linguistic message to the organs of speech, and thirdly, the organs of speech are activated and they create certain sounds. Those three stages are reversed on the part of a listener. In the physical level, the message is received as a linguistic code, in the physiological level, the linguistic code is passed to the brain and finally, in psychological stage, the code is deciphered or interpreted. Surprisingly enough, all these chain of actions take place within moments or within fractions of moments.
**We speak with our left hemisphere:**

Let’s have a brief look at the language location in human physic. Definitely, the origin is in the brain. The human brain is just like a CPU of a computer for a human being. There are two halves or hemispheres in the human brain. The right hemisphere minds the jobs of the left side of the body and the left hemisphere is entitled with the functioning of the right side of the body. Language is located in the left one. To zoom in, we find the areas responsible for language production are Broca’s area, Wernicke’s area, Motor Cortex and Arcuate Fasciculus.
Broca’s Area:

Speech production is linked to the posterior inferior frontal gyrus in the frontal lobe of the left hemisphere. This area is named after Paul Broca, the French neurosurgeon in 1861. Broca’s patients had injuries resulting in inability in speech production. It is known as Broca’s aphasia. This kind of inability of speech is also known as expressive aphasia.

Wernicke’s Area:

Wernicke’s speech area is responsible for Language comprehension. It is the posterior section of the superior temporal gyrus (STG) in the dominant cerebral hemisphere. German neurologist Carl Wernicke discovered this area of the brain in 1871. Lesion in this area results in an inability of the speech comprehension. Wernicke’s aphasia is also called Receptive fluent aphasia. It is also known as Jargon aphasia.

Arcuate Fasciculus:

A bundle of nerves connecting Broca’s area and Wernicke’s is called arcuate Fasciculus. It plays an important role in the language comprehension and production process. Lesion to these nerves causes a certain kind of aphasia where the patient can understand speech of others but cannot repeat words and produce meaningless speech.
Motor Cortex:

Motor cortex controls the articulation of the speech organs. Movements of all the articulators from larynx to lips are regulated by this motor cortex. Chewing, swallowing, salivating etc. are also controlled by this area. Injury to this area causes stammering. Damage to this area causes the loss of control of salivating, swallowing and chewing.

Articulators:

In the physical level, the message from the cortex is passed to the diaphragm. The diaphragm gives a squeeze and a flow of air rushes out through the windpipe and finally released either through the oral cavity or nasal cavity. In case of consonant sounds, the flow of the air is obstructed almost at a dozen places. But regarding vowel sounds that flow of air is not hindered anywhere and directly let out in the air. Following figures would help us to understand the production of consonant and vowel sounds. Figure - 1 shows the diaphragm where from the air-flow is thrown Figure 2 shows various articulators. The flow of the air is being played by a group of active and passive articulators for producing consonant sounds in figure 4. Figure: 3 shows that the air stream is directly emitted to the air without having in blockage or obstruction for the production of vowel sounds.
Process of Speaking:

The course of speaking is a very interesting one. Willem Levelt of Holland is outstanding in this field to present a covering model of the speaking process. The model is the outcome of his many years’ ceaseless effort. All the aspects of speaking are explored here very beautifully.
The three levels mentioned in the earlier section are differently treated by Levelt. The major components of speaking procedure, according to him, are CONCEPTUALISER, FORMULATOR and ARTICULATOR. The circle and the oval shape in the figure represent knowledge stored in the long
term memory and they are directly related to conceptualizer, formulator and speech comprehension system. In the very first stage, the message is generated and monitored within the conceptualizer then it is passed to the formulator in a preverbal state. The preverbal message receives grammatical and phonological encoding within the formulator. Then it achieves the state of a phonological plan or internal speech which is then passed to the articulators for transforming them as sounds. Overt speech is the outcome of the articulatory level. Being received by the audition and processed by the comprehension system the message is again sent back to conceptualizer. Comprehension system is fed with the message as a phonetic string from the auditory organs. While speaking, Levelt recognizes, the speaker also listens to his speech very closely to check the accuracy and clarity of the message and this checking out or monitoring takes place within the conceptualizer.

Suppose, somebody wants to say TIGERS ARE FEROCIOUS. Now let us see does says this following the model of Levelt.

- From the long term memory they retrieve the idea TIGERS ARE FEROCIOUS. The speaker also retrieves other associated bits of information with it at the same time but they are filtered aside.

- The phonological forms are retrieved from the form part of the ‘form’ part of the lexical entries in the memory.

  Tiger - /taɪɡə/    ferocious - /fəˈrɛʃəs/

  They are brought under surface structure –
  /taɪɡə/+(noun,plural) + verb+ /fəˈrɛʃəs/ (complement)

- Morpho-phonemic features are added /taɪɡə/+ /z/ and so on

At this stage the message is in ‘phonetic plan’ stage. Now it is to be prepared and passed to the articulator.

- The speaker listens to and does self monitoring and brings changes if necessary.

- The speaker builds a syntactic frame from the probable lexical entries.

- Supra-segmental features like stress may be added at this level where the speaker feels necessary.
Features of speaking:

We are going to throw some light on a few curious characteristics of speech that we never cared to know such as speech rate, active vocabulary, pauses and fillers, kinds of speech and so on. Some of these interesting features of speaking are given below:

- How many words do we speak per minute is known as speech rate. The normal speech rate of a grown up human being is 150
- A normal educated adult speaker has got an active vocabulary of 30,000 words
- Within a second a speaker make a choice two to five times
- Per second the maximum possible number of syllable on the part of the human articulator to produce is eight

When we talk, very often we have pauses. Why do we take pauses? A remarkable characteristic of speaking is its pause. There are causes, types and effects of a pause.

\[ \text{PAUSE} \]

- Empty pause
  - Longer (of 600 milliseconds)
  - Shorter (of 200 milliseconds)
- Filled pause
  - Hesitation markers (er, um, etc)
  - Fillers (well, u know …)

*Figure: 3 Pauses*

According to Field (2003) pauses can broadly be categorized into two types – empty pauses and filled pauses. Empty pauses of are two types – longer and shorter. Longer empty pause consumes 600 milliseconds whereas shorter ones 200 milliseconds. Filled pauses are also of two types. They are hesitation markers and fillers. Hesitations markers like um, er, erm are very frequently used by the
native speakers. Commonly used fillers are like u see, you know, I mean to say, I mean well and so forth.

Important points about pauses are as follows:
- People pause to make speech plan.
- The pauses tend to appear at the clause boundaries, at the finishing of one and the outset of another.
- Pausing is vital to remove the speech buffer
- People may pause to retrieve an infrequent word
- Situation or physical fatigue may cause pause
- Pauses may, more importantly, be used to mean the turn over
- They may rhetorically be used to mean what comes next is important

In relation to pauses, considering phonological phrase and chunks of speech Laver (1994) divides speech into following three categories:
- Continuous fluent speech (several phonological phrases without pauses)
- Non continuous fluent speech (several phonological phrases with pauses)
- Non continuous hesitant speech (with hesitation pauses)

Our talk is very much different from the mechanical talk of a ‘talking clock’. Rhythm, assimilation, elision and linking all these happen when a normal native speakers speaks his mother tongue. Rhythm is a notable feature of any language. Many language speakers like English use stress-timed rhythm and many other use syllable-timed rhythms like French. We always do not talk in a slow tempo very often we speak very fast. Then assimilation, elision, and linking of words frequently do occur. Some samples of English language are cited below from Roach (2000):

- Assimilation That person – thap person
  Light blue – laip blue
- Elision Lots of them – lots o them
  Looked back – look back
- Linking Formula A – formulaR a
  Media event – mediaR evernt

Stages of speaking:

Sequencing of the linguistic components is an important issue to take note of. Following an order different levels of processing go on in assembling the spoken utterances. Let’s look at the slips of the tongue below:
a) ice-cream in the fridge → ice-cream in the oven
b) he swam in the pool → he swimmèd in the pool.
c) Such fantastic acrobats → such fantastic apricots
d) Can you wriggle your ankle→ … … wriggle your elbow
e) Does it sound different? → does it hear different?
f) Fight very hard → fart very hide

Field (2003) studying a set of slips of the tongue like this derived some conclusions regarding the sequence.

- A meaning driven search in the lexicon is made
- At a stage words are given phonological form. Speakers has a meaning code or semantic shape following which he tries to retrieve a particular word
- A syntactic structure is established and words are later fitted to that structure. That is syntactic slots are later tagged with morpheme information
  - Syllable is an important unit of planning. Keeping the syllable same a phoneme may be dislocated.
  - Plans may be kept in a buffer
  - Intonation and word stressed are assigned. Intonation may happen at the time of syntactic structuring and stress come from lexicon at time phonological forming.

**Self-correction in speaking:**

A speaker is the first listener of his own speech. Levelt opines (2003), while listening; a speaker carries on doing a self-monitoring of his own speech. He corrects lexis, syntax, phonology, articulatory plans and so on.

A speaker may do monitoring of his speech for a number of reasons. According to Levelt (2003, pp90-92), a speaker may repair, replace, restructure when they feel the following questions:

- *Is this the message/concept I want say?*
- *Is this the way I want to say it?*
- *Is what I am saying up to social standards?*
- *Am I making a lexical error?*
- *Are my syntax and morphology alright?*
- *Am I making a sound form error?*
- *Has my articulation the right speed, loudness, precision, fluency?*

Let us look at some expressions:

- a) Hey, why didn’t you show up last week? Either of you two.
- b) What things are this kid – is this kid going to say incorrectly?
- c) Left to pink – er straight to pink. (Levelt)
d) I’m beginning to feel like a clippie… … who are doing all wonderful jobs (quoted in Cutting, 2002, pp44-45)

If we analyze the examples we will see that the speakers are instantly having the correction. In the example a) the speaker repairs the ambiguity by adding the remainder. In the example b) the speaker makes a correction of subject-verb agreement. In the expression c) the speaker almost has said straight but a wrong lemma left is activated. The example d) is a saying of the Iron Lady Margaret Thatcher. In 1979 she had been in election campaign and rode a double-decker bus to show that she mixes with all common people. Later she recollects her experience. She felt like a clippie meaning bus conductor who clips tickets. She did not feel honourable and says so. When she becomes socially aware that she might hurt the feelings of a group of people then she adds the later part of wonderful job to the sentence.

Field (2003) thinks it is not natural that a speaker attends and monitors all these aspects at a time. It may differ from context to context and a speaker’s attention to self generated troubles also fluctuates in course of speaking.

Conclusion:

Thus, we see that this apparent simple act of speaking is neither an automatic nor an unconscious job rather it is a deliberate, conscious effort on the part of the speaker where there are different subtleties. The location of speaking is in our left hemisphere of our brain. To pass a message through speaking, the process initiates in psychological level, then, through the physiological journey the message is sent to the physical level for production where various articulators are activated. In the psychological stage, the role of Broca’s area, Wernicke’s area, arcuate fasciculus and motor cortex are also seen. ‘The blueprint of the speaking process’ presented by Levlet projects the whole system very nicely. So, we see, human beings are especially favored by the gift of speaking, and, all the features of speaking including self-correcting, pauses, assimilation and elision are all very interesting to know.
References


-Levelt, Willem(1989) Speaking MA. MIT


Literature Review and Use of Benjamin Bloom’s Taxonomy

Matthew O. Iwuchukwu
University of Nigeria, Nsukka, Nigeria

Abstract

This paper explores the use Benjamin Bloom’s taxonomy in the process of reviewing the related literature and writing a literature review. Specifically, the discussion focuses on four fundamental issues raised in the study as follows: purpose and focus of literature review, literature review in the research proposal, literature review and use of Benjamin Bloom’s taxonomy, and writing a literature review. Six categories in Bloom’s taxonomy (ways of thinking) are elucidated as follows: remembering, understanding, applying, analyzing, evaluating and creating. Through the use of these tasks and ways of thinking in the literature review process, the study shows that the review of the related scholarship is one of the most important processes of research methods in the sense that it enables the researcher to determine the state of research in his or her area of investigation. The background knowledge acquired in the course of the research enables him or her to make useful connections between literature review and other parts of the research project, ensuring that the lacunae in the previously concluded research are addressed and that any possible gap is filled by the present study. Hence, it also shows that doing a review of the related literature is a serious business aimed at enhancing the quality and relevance of the research focus, theoretical framework, methodology and findings, thereby helping to promote originality and excellence in research in the scholar’s area of investigation or specialization.

Keywords: Research originality, literature review, Benjamin Bloom, taxonomy, remembering, understanding, applying, analyzing, evaluating, creating.

1 Paper presented at a capacity building workshop organized by the Faculty of Arts, University of Nigeria, Nsukka on November 27, 2014.
Introduction

In this paper, literature review or review of the relevant literature cannot be discussed without reference to research in tertiary institutions such as the University of Nigeria, Nsukka (UNN). Like their counterparts in other universities across the world, UNN lecturers and postgraduate students carry out research on a regular basis in various faculties such as arts, agriculture, business administration, education, engineering, law, medicine, pharmacy, social sciences, etc.

Research is defined as a “methodical investigation into a subject in order to discover facts, to establish or revise a theory, or to develop a plan of action based on the facts discovered” (Encarta Dictionary 2009). Essentially, the purpose of research is to study a subject or product carefully with a view to discovering new facts about it. Hence, the close correlation between research and development in various fields of human endeavour. In French, *la recherche savante* in the university system refers to scholarly research in various disciplines in the arts, social sciences, pure and applied sciences. On this note, the National Universities Commission (NUC) organizes periodically *Nigerian Universities Research and Development Fair (NURESDEF)*. In 2010, the University of Nigeria (UNN) hosted the 4th Edition of NURESDEF Exhibition with the theme “Research and the Realization of Vision 20-2020” and the Faculty of Arts and others participated in the research exhibition (See Uguru and Ezeonu, 2010). In the university system, therefore, a good research project should have a clear and well focused literature review, aims and objectives, theoretical framework and methodology that are geared towards national and international development in line with the vision and mission of the institution.

What is literature review? What role does it play in the research process? What is the role Benjamin Bloom’s taxonomy in the process of reviewing the related literature and writing a literature review? This paper will try to proffer answers to these questions through our discussion on the use of Benjamin Bloom’s taxonomy in the literature review process.

Purpose and Focus of the Literature Review

What is the purpose of literature review or review of the related literature? Its purpose is to examine all previously published material in the researcher’s area of investigation, that is, the contributions of other researchers in the area, thereby making it possible for the researcher to “introduce the reader to the subject [and] cite gaps that the present study would fill” (Adogbo and Ojo 2002: 35). In other words, according to Nwabueze (2009: 44), “the main aim is to the reader with the present state of scholarship in the area of investigation and assess their contribution to the advancement of knowledge in the area generally and on the topic particularly”. With a focus on research previously concluded on a particular subject by different researchers, which include university lecturers and
postgraduate students in different parts of the world, the review of related literature enables the researcher to avoid *des sentiers battus* or “beaten tracks” in the proposed area of investigation:

La recherche est une construction à long terme, tel un édifice auquel participe plusieurs architectes. C’est pourquoi il convient, avant d’ajouter sa propre pierre à l’édifice, d’examiner ce qui a été réalisé jusque-là […] étape préalable à toute nouvelle construction, afin que l’étudiant chercheur ne se trouve dans la situation inconfortable de celui qui refait à l’identique une étude déjà menée, parfois par des chercheurs bien plus chevronnés (Guidère 2004 : 27).

Research is a long-term construction project like a mighty building under construction by several architects. For this reason, before getting involved in the construction work, the researcher needs to know what has been done in the area of investigation […]. It is the first step in every new construction project, and this ensures that the student researcher does not repeat any previously concluded study such as a research project already completed by more experienced scholars in the area. *[A translated version of the above text in French by the author of this paper].*

Research is comparable to a long-term building project involving the activities of several participants as a team. In their *Playbook for Research Methods: Integrating Conceptual Frameworks and Project Management*, Shields and Rangarajan (2013) use “football as a metaphor to examine aspects of empirical research often overlooked in typical research methods texts” (electronic version). To participate effectively in the teamwork, the researcher has to demonstrate that he or she has adequate background knowledge in the area of investigation, that is, sufficient knowledge of the literature surrounding the topic. Dawson (2007: 59) clearly states as follows: “If there is other work which has covered this area, you need to show how your work will build on and add to the existing knowledge. Basically, you have to convince people that you know what you’re talking about and that the research is important”. On the other hand, if there is no previously published material in the area, you also have to say so, explaining how your proposed research will fill this gap.

In other words, through a comprehensive analytical review of the related literature, the researcher elucidates the state of research in his or her area of investigation. The relevance of research is determined by the focus and quality of the literature review, among other important factors, given that “literature review is a text of a scholarly paper, which includes the current knowledge including substantive findings, as well as theoretical and methodological contributions to a particular topic. Literature reviews use secondary sources, and do not report new or original experimental work” *(http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Literature_review)*.

On the issue of research focus in literary criticism, for instance, a topic like “Organization of Space in African Literature” appears to be too vast. This broad literary corpus (novels, short stories, poetry and drama written in various languages from different parts of Africa, from the colonial era to present) is rather inadequate and it would be quite difficult, if not impossible, to tackle the challenges of doing a good literature review in the proposed subject of investigation. Hence, it will be necessary to
adjust the topic and focus, situating them within the framework of literary production in a particular African sub-region, specific period and literary genre, for example: “Organization of Space and Political Discourse in Francophone West-African Novel: 1980-2010”. We can see clearly that this topic delimits the scope of the previous one, and that it will go a long way in sharpening the focus and objectives of the research project.

**Literature Review in the Research Proposal**

Apparently, review of the related literature is one of the most important processes of the research methods. Hence, the researcher has to present a summary of the literature review in a dissertation or thesis proposal before proceeding to discuss it in a chapter of the research project. Nwabueze (2009: 40) rightly points out as follows: “There is need to provide a brief summary of major research previously concluded in the area of investigation. This will pave the way for a more comprehensive review of scholarship which will ultimately occupy a chapter in the proposed study. This brief review of related literature [in the proposal] stands as an assurance that the researcher is familiar with the state of research in the area of investigation”.

**Literature Review and Use of Benjamin Bloom’s Taxonomy**

Shields and Rangarajan (2013) and Granello (2001) make useful connections between the activities involved in the literature review process and “Benjamin Bloom's revised taxonomy of the cognitive domain”. The latter comprises six interrelated ways of thinking applicable to the process of doing a literature review as follows: “Remembering, Understanding, Applying, Analyzing, Evaluating and Creating” (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Literature_review). At this point, let us to discuss each of them in turn.

**Remembering**

Remembering is the first category. It is the beginning of the literature review process which involves recognition, retrieval and collation of various sources of information on the subject of investigation such as books, journals, conference proceedings, dissertations and theses, bibliographic databases, the internet, etc. The expert researcher does not rely solely on the internet because a high proportion of the relevant material is not there, especially most journal articles, books, book chapters, monographs, conference proceedings, etc. On this note, Rugg and Petre (2007) state that “browsing alone runs the risk of missing key literature, but it does give you a chance to find something useful by serendipity” (50). Moreover, it is advisable to use the web carefully and sensibly for research purposes because anybody can publish information about a topic over the internet, and some of this information may be misleading or incorrect. Hence, the use of websites run by reputable and trustworthy organizations is strongly encouraged.

Examining the above delimited topic “Organization of Space and Political Discourse in Francophone West-African Novel: 1980-2010”, for example, a number of previous scholarly publications on the subject of investigation are available on the internet and library shelves as follows:

**Understanding**

A list of previously published books, journal articles and conference proceedings, etc. like those cited above are read and understood from the point of view of aims and objectives, theoretical framework, methodology, data analysis, research findings, lacunae and contribution to knowledge in the area of specialization or investigation. This second step is crucial in the literature review process in the sense that the understanding of the new terminology in these aspects of previously concluded work enables the researcher to equip himself or herself with the much needed background knowledge of the subject in the research project.

**Applying**

In Bloom’s third category applying, the researcher makes connections between the previously published material and his or her larger research project. This exercise is facilitated by the understanding of the texts read, especially in the case of empirical research where the literature review will constitute a chapter. Equipped with the background knowledge of the subject of investigation at this stage, the researcher begins sharpening the theoretical and methodological orientations of the proposed study in line with its focus.

**Analyzing**

At this point, the scholar has to identify, organize and analyze different parts of the scholarly material under review in a coherent order. A critical analysis of the related literature enhances the relevance and quality of citation, acknowledgement of sources, logical presentation of ideas, thoughts and arguments in the chapter dealing with literature review and subsequent chapters of the research project. In other words, the fourth category, analyzing, enables the scholar to present a feasible research outline and to develop frameworks for a comprehensive analysis in the proposed study.

**Evaluating**
The fifth step in Bloom’s taxonomy, *evaluating*, enables the researcher to make a comprehensive and systematic critical appraisal of the relevant scholarly material analyzed with a view to pointing out the strengths and weaknesses or lacunae in the theoretical framework, methodology, findings, presentation of ideas, thoughts and arguments, as well as in the structure, written expression, documentation methods or styles, etc.

**Creating**

*Creating* is the last category but not the least in Benjamin Bloom’s taxonomy. Apparently, this final step is one of the most important in the literature review process because, as the term *creating* suggests, the special skills developed in the above tasks and ways of thinking inject a measure of creativity and originality into the process of doing a literature review. The importance of creativity in empirical research is highlighted in *A Playbook for Research Methods: Integrating Conceptual Frameworks and Project Management* (Shields and Rangarajan 2013: Ch.8).

The creativity of the researcher at this stage will determine somewhat the quality and relevance of the proposed study. The researcher is capable of injecting metacognition into the literature review process. This will enable him or her to identify any possible gap, find and formulate a fresh and original research question, and make connections between the literature review and other parts of the research project.

**Writing a Literature Review**

Following the last category in Benjamin Bloom’s taxonomy, the researcher proceeds to write a comprehensive and systematic literature review as an integral part of the proposed study, adopting an appropriate method of organizing the scholarly material collected as well as the points noted for the review. Nwabueze (2009: 44-46) stresses the need to make a logical presentation of the material by taking into consideration four organizational methods, discussing each of them in turn: “chronological arrangement, thematic arrangement, methodological arrangement and categorical arrangement”.

**Conclusion**

In this paper, we discussed the process of doing a literature review through the use of Benjamin Bloom’s taxonomy (ways of thinking) as follows: remembering, understanding, applying, analyzing, evaluating and creating. The study explored the use of the six categories in Bloom’s taxonomy, showing that literature review is one of the most important processes of the research methods in the sense that it enables the researcher to determine the state of research in his or her area of investigation. The background knowledge acquired in the course of the research enables him or her to make connections between literature review and other parts of the proposed research, ensuring that the lacunae in the previously concluded research are addressed and that any possible gap is filled by the present study.

Hence, the study has shown that doing a review of the related literature is a serious business aimed at enhancing the quality and relevance of the research focus, theoretical framework,
methodology and findings, thereby helping to promote originality and excellence in research in the scholar’s area of investigation or specialization.
References


  [http://www.amicus.collectionscanada.gc.ca](http://www.amicus.collectionscanada.gc.ca)


Discours romanesque épistolaire dans *La voie de ma rue* de Kean Zoh: situation, défis et devenir juridiques des enfants de la rue

Matthew O. Iwuchukwu  
University of Nigeria, Nsukka, Nigeria

Résumé

Dans cette étude, nous avons tenté de faire une analyse sociocritique du discours romanesque épistolaire dans *La voie de ma rue* (2002) de Sylvain Kean Zoh afin de cerner les causes et les conséquences du phénomène des enfants de la rue, ainsi que le devenir de ces enfants relatif à leurs droits et à la justice sociale. Parmi les principales causes du phénomène, telles que dépeintes dans la narration, figurent l’exode rural, le chômage, la pauvreté, l’insécurité et l’imprévu dans la vie des personnages pourvoyeurs comme Delphine (maladie grave, dépression, accident mortel, etc.). Quant aux conséquences, repérables dans le texte et le para-texte, elles se manifestent aussi bien au niveau de la vie de l’individu que dans la vie sociale: vivre sans famille et sans abri, perte d’identité familiale et culturelle, trafic de stupéfiants, analphabétisme ou décrochage scolaire, ségrégation sociale, violence, violation des droits de l’enfant, etc. Ainsi, il faut souligner les droits fondamentaux bafoués de l’enfant de la rue tels que les droits relatifs à la santé, à l’éducation et à l’aide juridique. Malgré la gravité du phénomène dans le corpus romanesque étudié, Sylvain Kean Zoh entrevoit un avenir prometteur pour les enfants-victimes africains en ce sens que le héros autochtone Wonkato Éric, son porte-parole primaire, entretient une vision optimiste de la vie des enfants de la rue dans la narration. Par son récit, ce romancier mène une campagne de sensibilisation audacieuse à la situation dramatique des enfants de la rue, laquelle, croyons-nous, permettra de mettre sur pied un programme de réhabilitation fonctionnelle pour ces derniers.

Mots-clés: roman francophone africain, Sylvain Kean Zoh, sociocritique, discours romanesque épistolaire, enfants de la rue, situation, causes, conséquences et devenir juridiques.
Introduction


Dans *La voie de ma rue* de Sylvain Kean Zoh qui fait l’objet de la présente étude, on raconte pour l’essentiel l’histoire de l’héros-narrateur lui-même, Wonkato Eric, qui attire l’attention du lecteur sur le phénomène des «enfants de la rue». En quoi consiste le discours romanesque épistolaire sur l’enfance de la rue dans *La voie de ma rue* de Kean Zoh? Quelles sont les causes et les conséquences de ce phénomène dans le corpus retenu? Y a-t-il des droits à défendre et à promouvoir dans l’intérêt commun des enfants de la rue? Comment se présente l’avenir de ceux-dans le tissu discursif du roman? Ce sont là les questions-clés auxquelles tentera de répondre cette étude.

**Le discours épistolaire dans le genre romanesque**

Avant de procéder à l’analyse proprement dite du discours romanesque épistolaire dans *La voie de ma rue* de Sylvain Kean Zoh, convenons une définition du discours épistolaire dans le champ littéraire. Le discours épistolaire peut se définir comme le discours du romancier qui parcourt la narration dans tel ou tel roman épistolaire. En France, les origines de la littérature épistolaire, selon Iwuchukwu (2007 : 219) «remontent au XVIIe siècle où, en l’absence de toute presse fiable, la correspondance représentait un véritable moyen de communication et d’information, des lettres étant destinées à être lues à la fois par leurs destinataires et par le public qui les entoure».

feraient à un ami ou à un confident et sans que l’expression des sentiments semble passer par la médiation de l’auteur du roman.

Il va sans dire que le roman épistolaire n’est pas une autobiographie, laquelle raconte plutôt l’histoire de la vie de tel ou tel auteur écrite par lui-même, à l’instar de L’Enfant noir de Camara Laye. On remarque aussi que ce genre romanesque se rapproche du théâtre dans la mesure où il semble viser le renforcement de l’effet de réel en donnant au lecteur l’occasion de s’introduire dans l’intimité même des personnages du roman. Dans la perspective sociocritique, cette situation privilégiée du lecteur lui permettra de mieux apprécier la valeur utilitaire du di

**Discours romanesque épistolaire sur les enfants de la rue**


D’entrée de jeu, la narration s’annonce par la formule « Mon cher Touo », suivie de la longue lettre du héros-narrateur, Wonkato Eric, qui est comparable à celle de Ramatoulaye, narratrice d’*Une si longue lettre* de Mariama Bâ. La lettre d’Eric s’adresse à Touo, son ami d’enfance, qui est devenu journaliste et propriétaire même d’un « hebdomadaire traitant du quotidien des enfants de la rue »:

> Mon cher Touo, je voudrais, avant toute chose, te remercier pour la solidarité et la compassion dont tu fais preuve à l’endroit de ceux qu’il convient désormais d’appeler les enfants de la rue. Ton attitude est d’autant plus louable que, contrairement à l’opinion publique qui les condamne et réclame même leur éradication pure et simple de la société, tu exposes, chaque jour, dans les colonnes du journal, la vie quotidienne de ces malheureux enfants […]. C’est pourquoi j’ai décidé d’intervenir moi-même, non en tant que spécialiste quelconque, mais en tant qu’ancien enfant de la rue. J’ai décidé de te livrer un témoignage : la voie de ma rue. Je vais te dire l’histoire qui m’a conduit à la rue […] (p. 11-13)

L’incipit marque donc le début d’une longue lettre de cent cinquante pages destinée au lectorat francophone du roman, visant à amener celui-ci à prendre conscience de la gravité du phénomène des enfants de la rue en milieu urbain, en particulier dans la ville africaine de Man, le héros-narrateur lui-même ayant été obligé, à son enfance, d’êlire domicile à la rue de Man. Passons ensuite à l’analyse proprement dite du discours romanesque épistolaire à travers la lettre en vue de cerner les causes et les conséquences du phénomène des enfants de la rue, ainsi que le devenir de ces enfants relatif à leurs droits et à la justice sociale.
Les causes du phénomène des enfants de la rue

Quelles sont les raisons qui poussent les enfants à choisir la voie de la rue telles que dépeintes dans la narration ? Le héros-narrateur exprime sa déception et son mécontentement vis-à-vis de l’ignorance de ses concitoyens : « les gens ignorent ce qu’est un enfant de la rue, ils ignorent les raisons profondes qui drainent des milliers d’enfants de la rue les obligeant à élíre domicile au rez-de-chaussée des bâtiments, aux abords des écoles, des stades et dans les jardins publics » (p. 12). Il poursuit sa réflexion à ce sujet : « C’est à peine si on connaît leur histoire, leur parcours, les événements qui, progressivement et de façon irréversible, les ont conduits dans le monde qu’ils auraient pourtant voulu éviter […] Aucun enfant ne choisit d’être dans la rue pour le plaisir d’y être » (p. 12-13).

Vraisemblablement, l’origine du phénomène des enfants de la rue en Afrique sub-saharienne, dont s’est inspiré le romancier, remonte à l’ère de la colonisation étrangère, laquelle a donné naissance à la ville avec sa topographie et ses rues particulières. Dans son étude sur l’espace dans le roman francophone africain, Iwuchukwu (2002 : 100) a soutenu avec justesse que

la lecture des romans Mirages de Paris de Socé et Dramouss de Camara laisse présager que la ville n’existait pas en Afrique noire avant l’arrivée des colons étrangers. Autrement dit, la naissance de la ville (ancienne ville coloniale) se veut un événement historique très important dans les œuvres, car elle marque en quelque sorte le débarquement et l’installation effectifs des colonisateurs sur le sol africain.

De toute évidence, depuis sa naissance, la ville africaine ne cesse d’exercer toute une gamme d’influences ambivalentes sur l’existence humaine, en particulier sur les relations socioculturelle, politique et économique entre l’Occident et l’Afrique, comme en témoigne la déclaration de Kimoni (1985 : 188) : « Création de l’Europe, la ville est le point de contact de l’Occident avec l’Afrique. Elle est le symbole de la transformation sociale et économique du continent noir. Elle sert en tant que telle de cadre à beaucoup de romans africains […] Le roman africain présente la ville comme le lieu de l’inégalité sociale». Précisons que la plupart des romans dont il question ont été publiés avant les indépendances africaines, à l’ère coloniale.

On trouve que l’inégalité sociale se manifeste aussi dans les romans parus à l’époque des indépendances africaines, notamment ceux publiés après l’an 2000 comme La voie de ma rue de Sylvain Kean Zoh. Comment se présente la ville de Man dans ce corpus ? Aux yeux scrutateurs du héros-narrateur, la ville de Man est marquée, elle aussi, par l’inégalité et l’injustice sociales, comme le révèlent la situation de la famille d’Eric et celle de son ami d’enfance, Touo. Au début de l’enfance d’Eric, sa famille se présente comme une « famille idéale » où le héros mène une vie de plénitude et de « bonheur parfait », et où les parents et les enfants se préoccupent les uns des autres. Par contre, la famille de Touo est foncièrement déséquilibrée et pauvre, le père de famille lui-même étant alcoolique, violent et irresponsible : « Ton père continuait de boire. Tes sœurs, Viviane, Noëlle, et Lydie ne dormaient plus à la maison. Besoin d’argent obligeait. Michel se comportait de mal en pis » (p. 27). Selon la narration, l’ivresse alcoolique et la violence du père de Touo ne cessent de faire des victimes parmi les membres de sa famille, dont l’enfant Touo, et le héros-narrateur (Eric) s’en souvient :

http://ijhcschiefeditor.wix.com/ijhcs
Ton père t’avait cruellement battu parce que tu étais venu chez moi à midi. Après avoir accompli sa sale besogne, il t’avait enfermé dans ta chambre, la bouche bandée pour éviter que tu n’appelles au secours. Ta pauvre mère, qui n’avait que ses larmes pour pleurer, avait été menacée de mort si elle faisait quoique ce soit pour alerter le quartier (33).

L’état d’ébriété et la violence sanglante du père de Touo le rendent donc incapable d’assumer ses responsabilités de chef de famille. Il ne sait pas non plus réfléchir avant d’agir, et c’est justement tout ceci qui a poussé son enfant-victime le plus vulnérable, Touo, à élire domicile à la rue.

Une situation dramatique comparable a également conduit à la rue le héros-narrateur lui-même (Eric). Parallèlement, par un concours de circonstances particulières entraînant la mort accidentelle de sa mère, Delphine, son père (Edouard) s’est laissé anéantir, lui aussi, par l’ivresse alcoolique : « Un père toujours dans les bars, rentrant chaque nuit en chantant, toujours le même refrain : “Delphine m’a laissé, Delphine m’a abandonné, je suis seul, je souffre, Mes enfants souffrent. Alors je bois, je me soule... ». D’après la narration, la mort inopinée de la mère de famille a bouleversé non seulement son mari, mais aussi le héros-narrateur (Eric) et les autres membres de la famille. À la suite de la mort de Delphine, la toute première étape de l’enfance d’Eric, marquée par une vie de plénitude et de bonheur, sombre dans une vie de misère, de désespoir, qui le conduit irrésistiblement à la rue. Eric s’explique : « Je suis dans la rue depuis ma naissance parce que personne n’a jamais accepté de me venir en aide » (p. 146). Quant à son père, résigné, ne pouvant plus supporter la souffrance d’enfer dans la concession familiale, il finira par se suicider comme le révèle sa lettre intercalée dans celle du héros-narrateur (p. 132-136).

En résumé, parmi les principales causes du phénomène des enfants de la rue, telles que dépeintes dans La voie de ma rue de Kean Zoh, figurent l’exode rural, le chômage, la pauvreté, l’éclatement des familles, la violence faite aux enfants, l’insécurité affective et l’imprévu dans la vie des pourvoyeurs tels le père et la mère de famille (accident mortel, état d’ébriété, dépression, etc.). On dépeint une situation comparable dans Allah n’est pas obligé d’Ahmadou Kourouma, avec le menace de la guerre qui s’y manifeste de manière particulière.

Les conséquences du phénomène

Ce phénomène ne va-t-il pas sans entraîner des conséquences graves aussi bien au niveau de la vie de l’individu que dans la vie sociale ? Il faut signaler que le problème du manque de besoins essentiels au sein de la famille semble persistant, voire s’aggraver, dans la rue : pauvreté, alimentation insalubre, faim, maladie, insécurité affective, analphabétisme ou décrochage scolaire, etc. Ceci amène les enfants-victimes à s’adonner à toutes sortes de délits comme l’abus d’alcool, trafic de stupéfiants, la mendicité, le vol, la violence, etc. Dans sa longue lettre de plaidoirie à Touo, Eric déclare avec regret : « Il est vrai qu’ils [les enfants de la rue] sont livrés à tous les dangers et passent la plupart de leur temps à mendier s’ils ne jouent pas les pickpockets » (p. 12). Le héros-narrateur compare leur vie fragile à la fragilité d’un œuf, en poursuivant sa réflexion en ces termes : « Qu’il s’agisse de l’amour, du bonheur,
de la paix, de la richesse, de la famille et d’autres biens encore, tout est fragile. Ils ressemblent chacun à un œuf qui a besoin d’être tenu avec délicatesse afin de ne pas être cassé » (p. 13).

Il va sans dire qu’un enfant qui vit dans la rue est à la fois marginalisé et déshumanisé. Il appartient à la couche sociale des piétinés et des plus démunis, n’ayant pas le droit de s’affirmer ni de revendiquer quoique ce soit dans sa patrie. Autrement dit, on le considère comme une personne qui n’a pas de droits. Voilà pourquoi dans La voie de ma rue de Kean Zoh, les personnages-enfants de la rue tels Eric et Touo se révolteront tôt ou tard contre le statuquo, en se livrant à toutes sortes de délits qui constituent une entrave au développement de la société : vol, agression physique, etc. Dans sa narration intradiégétique, Eric tente de justifier leur résistance ou la rébellion des enfants-victimes : « Si le monde veut nous oublier, nous l’obligerons à se souvenir de nous. Par nos actes, nous lui montrerons que nous souffrons et avons besoin de son aide » (p. 139). Il enchaîne en précisant : « Tout se passe, en réalité, comme si le phénomène des enfants de la rue n’existait que de nom. Certains n’en parlent d’ailleurs que quand ils se font dérobés de un porte-monnaie, ou lorsqu’ils sont agressés » (p. 11). Parallèlement, le héros-narrateur d’Allah n’est pas obligé de Kourouma (2000), Birahima, et son adjuvant Yacouba seront également obligés de se révolter contre le statuquo, en commettant toutes sortes de délits criminels : drogue, meurtres, viols, fraude et même sorcellerie (p. 53-54).

Ainsi, on peut dire qu’à travers ces vices, les enfants ayant élu domicile à la rue s’attaquent à la société afin de l’obliger à reconnaître leurs droits, en particulier les dispositions de la Déclaration universelle des droits de l’homme applicables aux enfants. Comme les jeunes et les adultes, « tous les enfants, qu’ils soient nés dans le mariage ou hors mariage, jouissent de la même protection sociale » pour assurer leur santé et leur bien-être, « notamment pour l’alimentation, l’habillement, le logement, les soins médicaux ainsi que pour les services sociaux nécessaires », conformément à l’Article 25 de la Déclaration universelle des droits de l’homme (1994 : 16). Les droits de l’enfant se manifestent encore davantage dans le passage qui suit :

Les droits des enfants sont les droits de la personne qui s’appliquent aux enfants. Les jeunes ont notamment droit à une protection et à des soins attentionnés, au maintien d’un lien avec leurs parents biologiques, à une identité humaine, à la satisfaction de leurs besoins alimentaires fondamentaux, à une instruction financée par l’État, à des soins de santé, et à des lois pénales adaptées à leur âge et à leur développement. La portée des droits des enfants va de l’offre d’autonomie à la protection contre la violence physique, psychologique ou émotionnelle (la définition du terme « violence » demeure toutefois sujette à débat). D’autres interprétations englobent le droit aux soins et à l’éducation (http://fr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Droits_de_l’enfant)

Ce passage résume en quelque sorte les droits fondamentaux bafoués des enfants de la rue dans La voie de ma rue de Sylvain Kean Zoh. Ainsi, le héros-narrateur intradiégétique du romancier, Eric, dénonce implicitement le traitement inhumaine particulier auquel tous les enfants-victimes sont toujours soumis: « Tu es un enfant de la rue et un mur difficilement franchissable vous sépare des autres enfants. Ici, tu n’a plus de droit et la société vous refusera certaines choses sous prétexte que tu représentes désormais un danger pour elle » (La voie : 141). En matière de droit, Eric s’en prend ainsi à la discrimination sociale qui existe entre les enfants de la rue et les autres enfants. Apparemment, les
droits fondamentaux des enfants dans la *Déclaration universelle des droits de l’homme* représentent les besoins essentiels de ceux de la rue dans le cadre de la justice sociale, allant du droit à une alimentation saine et équilibrée au droit à l’aide juridique, en passant par le droit à la santé et à l’éducation.

**Le devenir des enfants de la rue**

Ceci nous amène à examiner, pour terminer, le devenir des enfants de la rue relativement à leurs droits et à la justice sociale. Comment se dessine, à travers le discours romanesque, le devenir des enfants de la rue? On peut dire que malgré la gravité de ce phénomène dans *La voie de ma rue* de Sylvain Kean Zoh, ce romancier laisse entrevoir un avenir prometteur pour les enfants-victimes comme le héros-narrateur, Eric. Il tente d’interpeller son lectorat francophone, notamment les autorités francophones compétentes, pour les amener à trouver des remèdes fiables à ce fléau, en se livrant à la défense et à la promotion des droits fondamentaux des enfants de la rue.

La campagne de sensibilisation menée par le romancier, croyons-nous, amènera le ou les gouvernements concernés, le secteur privé, les parents et les enfants à changer leur mentalité et leur comportement envers les enfants-victimes, en travaillant ensemble dans le but de résoudre les problèmes juridiques de ces derniers. Cette campagne libératrice sera intensifiée au moyen «de séminaires, de conférences, de journées de réflexion, de tapages médiatiques et de concerts [qui] seront organisés » (*La voie* : 141). Selon la déclaration du héros-narrateur lui-même, les parents auront également un rôle important à jouer : « Avoir un père responsable et une mère préventive était, pour mes frères et moi, une chance à souhaiter à tous les enfants du monde » (*La voie* : 27). Réciprocement, en vertu de l’africanité traditionnelle et moderne et de la culture igbo du Nigeria, les enfants se doivent de respecter leurs parents :

Rights and duties are very reciprocal in Igbo culture. Since the parents/families have the obligation to look after their children, educate, protect and bring them up, the children have also some important duties towards their parents and families [...] Respect for parents and the elderly is fundamental (*Anieke* 2013: 145).

Le devoir des parents et des gouvernements envers les enfants vise plus particulièrement les enfants de la rue. On aurait tout à gagner à mettre sur pied un programme de réhabilitation fonctionnelle destinée à ces derniers, à l’instar du projet de Mélanie qui a dû transformer la résidence familiale d’Edouard, chez le héros-narrateur lui-même, en une maison d’accueil par excellence : « Mélanie a transformé notre maison en un foyer où les ruinards du quartier viennent se faire soigner et manger de temps en temps. Edouard et Delphine, eux, achètent chaque weekend, des friperies qu’ils leur distribuent chaque fois qu’ils passent chez nous» (*La voie* : 149). Avec le temps, ce projet pourrait devenir une opération ou un organisme non gouvernemental (ONG) d’envergure nationale ou internationale. Selon l’enfant-narrateur, « Aujourd’hui, nous avons en projet la construction d’un centre d’accueil et de formation des « enfants de la rue » [...], je me réjouis à l’idée que ma famille ait compris et modifié sa vision des enfants de la rue. Ce sont des actions certes insignifiantes parce qu’insuffisantes » (ibid.). D’où la note d’optimisme et d’espérance qui s’exprime vers la fin du roman : « Nous ne baisserons pas les bras, il faut que le monde fasse quelque chose pour nous. Cela tardera
peut-être mais je sais que nous sortirons un jour de ce trou...Oui...J’en suis convaincu » (La voie : 145). Ceci exprime l’importance du proverbe « Charité bien ordonnée commence par soi-même/ Charity begins at home ».

On remarque, cependant, que faire fonctionner un tel organisme n’est pas une tâche facile du tout. Parmi les défis auxquels il doit faire face compte, par exemple, le financement. Aux yeux scrutateurs d’Eric et de ses adjudants comme Mélanie, porte-parole du romancier, il serait hautement souhaitable que le gouvernement et le secteur privé puissent comprendre la situation dramatique des enfants de la rue, afin de modifier favorablement leur vision vis-à-vis de ceux-ci. Ensemble, les concitoyens d’Eric pourront apporter leur contribution à la réalisation du projet de construire des centres de réhabilitation fonctionnelle pour les enfants de la rue dans la ville de Man, ville ivoirienne fictive, voire dans d’autres villes africaines frappées par le phénomène dévastateur des enfants de la rue.

Conclusion

Pour conclure, dans la présente étude, nous avons tenté de faire une analyse du discours romanesque épistolaire dans La voie de ma rue (2002) de Sylvain Kean Zoh, afin de cerner la situation, les causes et les conséquences du phénomène des enfants de la rue, ainsi que le devenir de ces enfants relatif à leurs droits et à justice sociale.

Après avoir défini la notion de discours romanesque épistolaire, nous avons procédé à une analyse sociocritique du corpus retenu. Parmi les principales causes du phénomène des enfants de la rue, telles que dépeintes dans la narration, figurent l’exode rural, le chômage, la pauvreté, l’insécurité et l’imprévu dans la vie des personnages pourvoyeurs comme Delphine (maladie grave, dépression, accident mortel, etc.). Quant aux conséquences, repérables dans le texte et le para-texte, elles se manifestent aussi bien au niveau de la vie de l’individu que dans la vie sociale : vivre sans famille et sans abri, perte d’identité familiale et culturelle, trafic de stupéfiants, analphabétisme ou décrochage scolaire, ségrégation sociale, violence, violation des droits de l’enfant, etc. Ainsi, il faut souligner les droits fondamentaux bafoués de l’enfant de la rue tels que les droits relatifs à la santé, à l’éducation et à l’aide juridique.

Malgré la gravité du phénomène dans le corpus romanesque étudié, Sylvain Kean Zoh entrevoit un avenir prometteur pour les enfants africains en ce sens que le héros Wonkato Eric, son porte-parole primaire, entretient une vision optimiste de la vie des enfants-victimes dans la narration. Par son récit, ce romancier mène une campagne de sensibilisation audacieuse à la situation dramatique des enfants de la rue, laquelle, croyons-nous, permettra de mettre sur pied un programme de réhabilitation fonctionnelle pour ces derniers.
Références


On the Bimoraicity of Tunisian Arabic Open Monosyllables: A Moraic Optimality-Theoretic Approach

Mounir Jouini
University of Carthage, Tunisia

Abstract

The paper aims to analyze Tunisian Arabic (TA) open monosyllables in terms of moras within the constraint-based framework of Optimality Theory (Prince and Smolensky, 1993/2004). It focuses on two major types of TA syllables, namely CV and CCV, whose surface shapes represent a challenge to an analysis that desires to satisfy the universally unmarked binary foot. In fact, if analyzed as monomoraic, these vowel-ending forms would violate the minimal weight required by minimal words which is two moras. Previous studies of Arabic dialects have generally opted for an analysis that affiliates the initial consonant/s with an additional mora alongside the inherent vocalic head mora, so as to satisfy the minimality condition. Another alternative, one which will be argued for in this paper, recognizes a certain bimoraic nature of final vowels, the second mora of which surfaces only under certain conditions.

Keywords: moras, minimal words, syllable, binarity, Optimality Theory.
1 Introduction

Tunisian Arabic exhibits words of the form CV, such as [ma] (water) and [Ξu] (brother) and words of the shape CCV such as [kla] (he ate) and [mΣa] (he went). These two types of words seem to challenge the universal binary foot, as their surface rimes consist in a monomoraic short vowel. Knowing that the minimal word in TA cannot consist of less than two moras, attempts to capture these minimal shapes went in (at least) two directions. First, there is the straightforward analysis of onsets as moraic (Topintzi, 2006). The word [ma] for instance, would be analyzed as bimoraic by virtue of onset moraicity [m,a], thus meeting foot binarity in terms of moras and satisfying minimality. Similar to this approach is the use of notions such as ‘degenerate syllables’ (Selkirk, 1981), and semisyllables (Kiparsky, 2003). A consequential violation of Strict Layer Hypothesis is necessary in these analyses. The second alternative, which is the one adopted here, allows mora count to take into consideration the underlying second mora in a final long vowel (shortened to V for peripherality reasons, as explained below; /maa/ > [ma]). The reason why the second mora does not surface owes to its failure to associate with segmental material as a result of the violation of PARSEPATH (Hewitt, 1994).

The next section presents a brief overview of the relevant theories within which the analysis is set, namely moraic theory and Optimality Theory. Subsequent sections review the previous studies of open monosyllables and present an alternative approach.

2 Theoretical framework

2.1 Moraic Theory

Syllable weight and the distinction between heavy and light syllables have been devised in three major ways: the CV-theory (McCarthy, 1979), the X-slot theory (Levin, 1985) and the moraic theory (Hyman, 1985 and Hayes, 1989). The monosyllabic word ‘ten’ is represented within the CV theory in [1a], the X-slot model in [1b] and the moraic theory in [1c]:

[1] Syllable representation
(a) CV theory

```
          σ
         / \    \
        C   V   C
       /     \     
      t   e   n
```

CV theory: Segments are specified as consonants (C’s) or vowels (V’s) on the CV tier. The problem with this theory is that it doesn’t account for phenomena such as the V-lengthening in eemi from Greek esmi (I am) since the deleted /s/ has a corresponding C-slot on the CV tier rather than the required V slot.

(b) X-slot theory

```
          σ
         / \    \
        O   N   C
       /   \  /   \ 
      t   e   n
```

X-slot theory: Segments are not specified as C’s and V’s, rather they are recognized as X’s, something that accounts for the V-lengthening of eemi from esmi. The theory however fails to describe, for instance, the Mokilese reduplicated
(c) Moraic Theory

i. Hyman (1985)

In Hyman’s (1985) model, all segments have an underlying Weight Unit (WU). On the surface onsets lose their WU’s and become dominated by the nucleic mora. Hayes (1989) proposes a model where the nucleus of the syllable does not share the mora with the onset. Both models agree that onsets are not moraic, an idea that is challenged in Topintzi (2006), where it is argued that onsets, just like codas, may or may not be moraic. In general, mora theory has the ability to account for the problematic instances encountered in CV and X-slot theories through mora counting.

ii. Hayes (1989)

The representations to follow adopt Hayes’ (1989) theory, according to which a monomoraic syllable is a light syllable that has a short vowel ($\sigma_\mu$), while a bimoraic syllable is a heavy syllable that has two moras ($\sigma_{\mu\mu}$) (the equivalent to CVC and CVV in CV-theory)$^1$. In both types onsets are nonmoraic. The two types are represented in [2] below.

[2] Light vs. heavy syllables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>a. light (CV)</th>
<th>b. heavy (CVV)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image1" alt="Light Syllable" /></td>
<td><img src="image2" alt="Heavy Syllable" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.2 Optimality Theory

The second relevant theory to be sketched is Prince and Smolensky’s (1993/2004) Optimality Theory (henceforth OT). The theory holds that at the heart of the Grammar there are constraints rather than rules. In other words, phonological generalizations are to be interpreted in terms of constraints with no reference whatsoever to linear rules. OT differs from its predecessors in various ways. It differs from the Chomskyan rule-based tradition in that it abandons the idea that a certain underlying form matches a certain surface form by means of phonological rules. Instead, it recognizes a set of constraints that militate for the formation of optimal outputs. The theory differs also from the preceding constraint approaches, such as the Theory of Constraints and Repair Strategies (Paradis, 1988) in that it considers constraints as violable and universal rather than inviolable and language specific. The conflict between the different constraints is resolved through ranking them in a strict dominance hierarchy.

OT is constructed around three basic components: GEN, CON, and EVAL. GEN (the generator) starts from the input and generates a (possibly infinite) set of output candidates. The latter may be identical to the input, somewhat modified, or even entirely unrecognizable. CON (for constraints) is the set of violable universal constraints. It serves to distinguish between the generated candidates. EVAL (the evaluator) compares the relational harmony of the candidates and selects the one that best satisfies the set of ranked constraints. The optimal candidate is the actual output used in the language.

Constraints in OT are mainly of two broad categories: Markedness constraints and Faithfulness constraints. Markedness constraints impose well-formedness conditions on the output. They may be formulated positively or negatively as exemplified in [3a] and [3b] respectively.

[3] Positive vs. negative formulation of constraints
a. ONSET Syllables must have an onset.
b. NO-CODA Syllables must not have a coda.

Faithfulness constraints control the relation holding between the input and the output. They militate for identity between the two representations in terms of number of segments, feature values, vowel quality, etc. In general, markedness constraints and faithfulness constraints are in an unremitting conflict and they are ranked in a strict dominance hierarchy. As Prince and Smolensky (1993/2004, p.3) note, “the grammar consists of the constraints together with a general means of resolving their conflicts”. Constraints are in conflict because each constraint brings along its own claims about the well-formedness of a certain representation. Closely related to the notion of constraint conflict is the concept of constraint violability, which means that the optimal candidate need not satisfy all constraints in the hierarchy. As Prince (2002, p.1) puts it “optimality is relative success, not perfection”. A candidate is optimal as long as it satisfies the higher-ranked constraints. The means that languages use to solve the conflict between the different constraints is to rank them in a strict dominance hierarchy, so that lower-ranked constraints may be repeatedly violated so long as higher-ranked constraints are satisfied. This means that the satisfaction of a higher-ranked
constraint takes absolute priority over the satisfaction of the remaining set of constraints ranked lower in the hierarchy. OT uses the symbol “>>” to designate the idea of dominance:

[4] Constraints ranked in a strict dominance hierarchy

\[ C_1 >> C_2 >> \ldots >> C_n \]

In [4], constraint \( C_1 \) is understood as being dominant as it is ranked higher than the rest of the constraints. The output candidates are evaluated against the set of ranked constraints and some of them are eliminated accordingly. Only one candidate survives and is selected as optimal. The selection process can be schematized as in [5].


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Input</th>
<th>( C_1 )</th>
<th>( C_2 )</th>
<th>( C_n )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Candidate a</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate b</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate c</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate d</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate ...</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
<td>( \rightarrow )</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[5] sums up the theory. It shows how from a certain input, \( \text{GEN} \) provides different candidates (a, b, c, d …); candidates in turn are submitted to \( \text{EVAL} \) to be evaluated, the output is the optimal form that is most harmonic with the input and that survives through the set of ranked constraints (\( C_1 >> C_2 >> \ldots >> C_n \)). To represent the claims in [5], OT makes use of tableaux. Let us assume (as in McCarthy and Prince, 1993) that a grammar consists of two constraints: constraint A and constraint B, and that \( \text{Gen} \) generates two candidates: \( \text{cand}_1 \) and \( \text{cand}_2 \) from an input i. A disagreement between A and B signifies a constraint conflict. This conflict is represented in the constraint tableau below.

[6] The constraint tableau in OT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>/i/</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>( \not\in ) a. ( \text{Cand}_1 )</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. ( \text{Cand}_2 )</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>!</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The tableau above includes most of the symbols and representations that OT uses: the input is at the top left corner; the candidates generated by \( \text{GEN} \) are in the first column; and constraints are ordered in the remaining columns. The order of constraints from left to right indicates the order of dominance (the one on the right dominates the other/s on its left); violations are marked by an asterisk (*); a fatal violation is marked by (!); constraint satisfaction is indicated by an empty cell; shaded cells are irrelevant after a fatal violation, and the optimal candidate is marked by the pointing hand \( \not\in \).

In the tableau above, \( \text{Cand}_1 \) satisfies constraint A but violates constraint B, whereas \( \text{Cand}_2 \) satisfies constraint B but fails A. \( \text{Cand}_1 \) is the optimal output because it satisfies the higher-ranked constraint A (A >> B). Similar representations will be used in the analysis of TA syllables within a moraic Optimality-Theoretic approach.
3 Open monosyllables

First, it is necessary to start with some generalizations about TA syllables. Words in TA may not start in a vowel; there has to be at least one consonant under the onset slot. Furthermore, triconsonantal tautosyllabic clusters are not permissible whether in onset or coda position (Jouini, 2014). In other words, at the left edge of the syllable there has to be at least one consonant and at most two. A syllable that has no onset consonant violates the ONSET constraint and a syllable that has three consonants violates the constraint *o[CCC. Both violations are always fatal.

With regard to the nucleus, it is always vocalic; there are no syllabic consonants. It can be formed by one of the main vowels /a/, /u/, or /i/ or of their long counterparts /aa/, /uu/, /ii/. Sequences of different vowels are not possible, so that forms such as *[au], *[ai], *[ua], *[ui], *[ia], *[iu] never exist. There are however [ay] and [aw] sequences, where the vowel is followed by one of the glides [y] or [w].

The coda position may or may not be filled. When it is not filled, the resultant form is either CV or CVV. When it is, it results in the syllables CVC, CVVC and CVCC but not *CVCCC or *CVVCC. Accordingly, while triconsonantal clusters are not permitted, biconsonantal clusters are allowed in both onset and coda positions (but not after long vowels). Given these generalizations, vowel ending monosyllables have one of three forms: CV, CCV, and CVV, with no possible longer forms such as *CCCV or *CVVV. Having said that CVV syllables undergo what is known as Final-Vowel Shortening and surface as CV or CCV, only two possible open monosyllables are left: CV and CCV. They are exemplified below.

\[
\begin{array}{ll}
\text{/CVV/} & \text{> [CV]} \\
\hline
ma & \text{water} \\
mya & \text{100 millimes} \\
hwa & \text{air} \\
bu & \text{father} \\
\Xi u & \text{brother} \\
hmu & \text{father-in-law}
\end{array}
\]

In general, CCV words are more common than CV words. Other examples include the verbs [dɔa] (he prayed), [mΣa] (he walked), [kla] (he ate), [wfa] (it ended), [bka] (he cried) etc. What is common between all the words in [7] is that they all seem to be formed of a monomoraic syllable, although prosodic words in TA cannot be formed of a single mora. In fact, the apparent short vowels in the words above come from underlying long vowels that have undergone shortening due to their final position. They stand as a further evidence for “[… prosodic weakness of final open syllables, which are liable to de-stressing, de-voicing,
shortening, truncation, and so on, under purely phonological conditions” (Prince and Smolensky, 1993, p.111). Interestingly, the addition of a consonantal affix or clitic renders the vowel to its initial state; a long vowel. For instance, [maah] means his water. The move of [ma] from having the minimal shape of a light syllable ([ma] = CV) to having a maximal monosyllabic shape of a superheavy syllable ([maah] > CVVC) as a result of the addition of [h] (his) is worth investigating and is further illustrated below. This move is also observed in verbs. The data in [8] is quite important in determining the real nature of these words.

[8] CCV verbs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3rd sg. fem. Perf.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kla</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mša</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ða</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The forms in [8a] belong to the variety of TA spoken in the capital city Tunis, and in most of the coastal regions. It is also the one used in the media (TVs and radios). The ones in [8b] belong to the variety of TA spoken in the northwestern city of Jendouba. Overlooking the vowel change, what is interesting about the varieties is that both of them force the stem syllable to move from CCV to CCVVC (8a) or CCVCiC (8b). Intermediate forms such as *klat and *klit are not possible in TA, which reflects an underlying preference for monosyllabic words to correspond to a superheavy syllable.

Still, CCV forms may be analyzed as bimoraic in different ways. Boudlal’s (2001) analysis consists in adopting the notion of ‘Minor Syllable’, which is very much like Selkirk’s (1981) notion of ‘degenerate syllable’ except that minor syllables contribute a mora. The way he represents CCV words is as in [9].


There is a lengthy argument behind the adjunction of the initial consonant to a mora, especially that onsets are inherently nonmoraic. Among the most oft-cited explanations is that vowel syncope, a process that deletes short vowels in medial CV syllables, forces forms such as [baka] to surface as [bka]. However, the process deletes the vowel and leaves behind a
floating mora which subsequently attaches to the onset of that initial syllable. This analysis is quite adequate for CCV forms, yet it is not extendable to CV forms. Notice the representations below.

[9] Disyllabic ‘ma’

a.  
\[\begin{array}{c}
\star F_t \\
\sigma \\
\hline
m \\
\end{array} \]

\[\begin{array}{c}
a \\
\end{array} \]

\[\begin{array}{c}
F_t \\
\sigma \\
\hline
m \\
\end{array} \]

\[\begin{array}{c}
a \\
\end{array} \]

The representation in [9b] meets the necessary minimal weight by interpreting the onset consonant as a minor syllable (as in Boudlal, 2001). This is unacceptable though, since the second syllable fatally violates one of the most highly ranked constraints, namely ONSET: no syllable may start in a vowel.

A more appropriate way to account for such minimal forms is to look for an explanation that has to do with the vowel. What is the nature of the vowel in nouns such as [ma] (water) and verbs such as [Za] (he came)? If we add a clitic or a suffix to the right edge, these vowels are long as the examples in [10] show it.

[10] Open monosyllables + C

a. CV + C

ma (water) -h (his) > *mah > maah (his water)

Za (he came) -t (fem.) > *Zat > Zaat (she came)

b. CCV + C

dwa (medicine) -k (your) > *dwak > dwaak (your medicine)

bda (he started) -w (they) > *bdaw > bdaaw (they started)

The data in [10] hides a long debate about the nature of the vowel: Is it a long vowel that undergoes final vowel shortening (in CV and CCV words)? Or is it a short vowel that exhibits pre-suffixal lengthening (in CV and CCV +C words)?

Angoujard (1978, p. 16) describes the phenomenon in TA and says: “à choisir entre une règle d’abrègement et une règle d’allongement ... à vrai dire, je n’en ai pas trouvé de clairement décisifs”. In other words he couldn’t decide on the nature of these vowels. This study prefers ‘final-vowel shortening’ (FSV) to pre-suffixal lengthening for three main
reasons. First there is the principle of ‘Richness of the base’ (ROTB) (Prince and Smolensky, 1993/2004) which requires that as much material as possible should be included in the base form. Accordingly, if the input form is to be stated as either /ma/ or /maa/ then the latter form is more convenient following ROTB. Second, the phenomenon of FVS is cross-linguistically attested, and it is less marked than pre-suffixal lengthening. Finally, a diachronic observation regarding open monosyllables shows that they are actually the result of the historical glottal elision and compensatory lengthening.


<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/raʔs/</td>
<td>&gt; [raa] (head)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/faʔs/</td>
<td>&gt; [faa] (pickaxe)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>b.</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/maʔa/</td>
<td>&gt; [maa] &gt; [ma]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/Zaaʔa/</td>
<td>&gt; [Zaa] &gt; [Za]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is obvious, then, that the vowels in CV and CCV words are underlingly long, yet they are subject to final-vowel shortening. In other words, these vowels are bimoraic, except that the second mora, which is present in the input form, fails to surface in the output form. There seems to be a silent mora at the right edge of these monosyllables. This mora is similar to Hammond’s (1999) notion of the catalectic beat: it exists to satisfy phonological rules but it is not apparent in the word. Below is an illustration through the words [ma] (*water*) and [maah] (*his water*).

[12] **Representing open monosyllables**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘ma’</td>
<td><em>water</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ft</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>σ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>μμ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>m a</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘maa’</td>
<td><em>his water</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ft</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>σ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>μμ μμ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>m a a h</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The barred association line in [12a] represents a violation of a correspondence constraint that requires input moras to associate with a segment in the output. This violation is motivated by a higher ranking constraint against word-final long vowels. This follows from the fact that final long vowels are permitted only when the prosodic word ends in a consonant (as shown in [12b]). Within OT, different ways have been proposed to deal with final vowel
shortening. Below is a review of a few of them. Only the last approach is deemed adequate here.

Fulmer (1997) deals with final vowel shortening by positing a direct markedness constraint ‘FINAL SHORT VOWEL’ (FSV) to force word-final long vowels to surface as short. The constraint has the shape *µµ]. Obviously, such an approach presents a number of analytical problems. First, were it not for the statement of the constraint, which tells that it concerns only vowels, the constraint *µµ] could also be extended to banning word-final VC rimes in an analysis where codas contribute a second mora. Second, it is argued (in Gouskova, 2003 for example) that economy constraints are unnecessary and even harmful, and that economy effects should result from constraint interaction rather than from positing an unmotivated markedness constraint; which is the case here with FSV. Finally, the analysis guarantees the choice of an optimal output with a final short vowel but it does not tell anything about the mora that fails to surface; is it completely deleted or is it preserved in the input? Is it accessible to weight scanning or not? For our present matter we need a system that prevents the second mora from associating to an output segment, while at the same time keeping it visible to minimal weight requirements.

McCarthy (2005) ranks FINAL-C, a markedness constraint against word-final vowels, below the gradual correspondence constraint MAX(V:), which cares for the preservation of vowel length between input and output pairs. An interaction between the two constraints comes to the consensus that only one mora may surface out of the bimoraic long vowel. In the present context, a candidate such as *[m] (out of the input /maa/ water) would fatally violate the high ranking MAX(V:). Candidates *[maa] and [ma] both satisfy MAX(V:) but violate FINAL-C. [maa] incurs two violations of FINAL-C while ‘ma’ incurs only one, by virtue of losing only one mora. The minimal violation incurred by [ma] makes it surface as optimal. The analysis in McCarthy (2005) is quite adequate in accounting for final vowel shortening; yet again, it entirely deletes the second mora that is needed for minimal weight in TA prosodic words.

Prince and Smolensky (1993/2004) introduce the constraint FREE-V, which states that word-final vowels must not be parsed. Interpreting FREE-V as a gradient constraint enables it to take into consideration the number of violations incurred by candidates. With regard to open monosyllables, the second mora is not parsed. The constraint MAX-µ, which militates for the surface realization of input moras, is ranked below FREE-V. The ranking FREE-V >> MAX-µ ensures that only one mora surfaces out of the underlying long vowel.

[13] FREE-V >> MAX-µ

\[
\begin{array}{|c|c|c|}
\hline
& \text{FREE-V} & \text{MAX-µ} \\
\hline
\mu & \mu & \text{FREE-V} \\
V & & \text{MAX-µ} \\
\hline
\text{a.} & \mu & \mu & ***!
\mu & V \\
\hline
\text{b.} & \mu & <\mu> & * \\
V & & * \\
\hline
\end{array}
\]
Though tempting, this analysis is still inadequate for the present matter. It is true that by not parsing the second mora, the vowel is shortened, yet not parsing an element is quite similar to denying its very existence. It is as if we were saying that the unparsed element has no role in the phonology of the word, at least as far as weight is concerned. The system that we need is one that treats phonetically short vowels in final positions as bimoraic within the phonology, even though their second mora is unfilled with segmental material. The rightmost mora will thus remain visible to mora count (in order to meet the bimoraicity minimum).

The objective can be attained by an analysis that is similar to the one in Hewitt (1994). Recall that the representation in [12] above recognizes the existence of the second mora but the association line fails to associate it with any segment in the output form. This is a violation of PARSEPATH. A statement of this constraint along with other necessary ones is given in [14]:

[14] Final V shortening constraints

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constraint</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. PARSE-μ</td>
<td>moras must be parsed into syllables.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. FT-BIN:</td>
<td>the foot must be binary under moraic or syllabic analysis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. *ALIGNR-PW-V:</td>
<td>the right edge of the prosodic word must not be aligned with the right edge of a vowel.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. PARSEPATH:</td>
<td>a path (association line) present in the input should be parsed in the output</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PARSE-μ ensures that moras are parsed into syllables, which is needed to account for the bimoraicity of the word. The latter is controlled by FT-BIN. *ALIGNR-PW-V scans just the rightmost unit of the prosodic word. By virtue of its being an alignment constraint, it has no access to what precedes the edgemost element. PARSEPATH is violated when an association line fails to associate an underlying element with a given phonetic realization. The constraint hierarchy is given in [15a], the analyses of ‘ma’ and ‘maah’ follow.
An OT analysis of small words

a. The constraint hierarchy:

\[
\text{PARSE-\(\mu\)} \gg \text{FT-BIN} \gg *\text{ALIGNR-PW-V} \gg \text{PARSEPath}
\]

b. Tableau for [ma] (input /maa/ water)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>/maa/</th>
<th>PARSE-(\mu)</th>
<th>FT-BIN</th>
<th>*ALIGNR-PW-V</th>
<th>PARSEPath</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.  (\sigma)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(\mu \mu)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[m a]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.  (\sigma)</td>
<td></td>
<td>(\star)</td>
<td></td>
<td>(\star)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(\mu &lt; \mu)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\star)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[m a]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.  (\varphi \sigma)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\star)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(\mu \mu)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[&lt; / &gt;]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[m a]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\star)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In this tableau, candidate (a) [maa]_{\mu\mu} is the most faithful to the input. However, it fatally violates *ALIGNR-PW-V which ensures that no optimal candidate may surface with a final long vowel. At the same time, the high ranking FT-BIN is ready to rule out any candidate that does not meet the minimum bimoraicity, which is the case with candidate (b) *[ma]_{\mu}\). With candidate (c) [ma]_{\mu\mu}, a compromise is attained as a result of constraint interaction. It recognizes the underlying presence of the second mora and it explains the absence of its realization in the output as a violation of low ranking PARSEPath. Monosyllables are interpreted as being bimoraic while at the same time constrained not to surface as such. The constraint that bans final long vowels does not intervene when the long vowel is not final. This is the case with polymorphemic 'maah'.
The optimal candidate ([16a]) satisfies all the constraints in the hierarchy. The other candidates are ruled out because they try to ban the second mora in an environment that allows it. The advantage of this analysis is that it does not require any mechanism of vowel lengthening from [ma] to [maah]. The second mora is already there; it is a floating mora that manages to gain a surface realization by associating to the vowel as the concatenation of the final consonantal clitic makes it unconstrained by *ALIGNR-PW-V. As for the association of the final consonant, it is overlooked here because it has to do with the representation of superheavy syllables, which is beyond the scope of this paper. Following an Argument in Jouini (2014), it should share a mora with the preceding vowel, as represented in [17].
In this paper, the interesting argument made about open monosyllables is that they should be treated as bimoraic. Thus, monosyllables of the form CV and CCV meet the bimoraicity minimal requirement by virtue of comprising two moras, yet the second mora fails to associate with any segmental material and incurs a violation of the constraint PARSEPATH. This mora is a floating unit that surfaces the moment a consonantal morpheme is concatenated with the right edge of the word. The analysis, in this respect, argues for ‘final-vowel shortening’ at the expense of ‘pre-suffixal lengthening’.
Note:

1 This distinction between light and heavy syllables follows McCarthy and Prince (1986, p. 7) “Light syllables contain one mora, heavy syllables two”. This has been challenged in de Lacy (1997) who argues that the distinction between syllables based on weight yields more than two types.
References


A thorough analysis of ‘Bontsha the silent’ short story by Isaac Leib Peretz (1906)

Fateme Moradian Fard Juneghani
University of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran

Abstract

The story of Bontsha the silent is a story written by I. L. Peretz, a Jewish writer. Bontsha is silent all his lifetime under various disasters and after passing away, he enters the heaven in which the authorities hold a court for him and finally is accorded the highest honors of heaven, while he still keeps silent and admits only some bread and butter. Bontsha seems to represent an oppressed group who keeps a perpetual silence under the governing society’s cruelty and even given an opportunity would not be able to take advantage of it. A defending angle defends Bontsha’s privileged rights in heaven which represents a group of people who justify every possible phenomenon in the society to their own benefit such as a dominant government or a dogmatic church. A prosecutor in trial session protests against the sentence who manifests a limited number of people in any society tending to cry the truth and the reality which are neither welcomed by the dominant group nor are given liberty or opportunity to declare their demands. This paper tends to analyze this story profoundly from different angles and evaluates symbols, ironies, fantasy, characterization, viewpoints, conflicts, emotions, plot and theme applied in the story.

Keywords: Bontsha the silent, I.L.Peretz, story analysis, Jewish stories.
Introduction

This story is known as a Yiddish folklore by many Americans. It is one of the most read and translated stories throughout the world\(^1\). The most outstanding characters in the story are three: Bontsha, defending angle and prosecutor. Each of these characters in reality manifests a certain group of people in a conflicted society.

Bontsha who was born in a Jewish family represents a group of people who either take a silence policy deliberately or are obliged to keep silent. They might prefer to keep silent for some reasons such as their internal feebleness or because they are being oppressed by another dominant group usually tending to take advantage of the oppressed one while the latter has to endure their cruelty and malice and prefers not to protest against them. Ignorance might be another cause for their silence, i.e, they perceive the status quo as their legitimate right and a predetermined fate. And, the dominant group abuses this attitude and imposes its thoughts on them and the continuum goes on.

The second group in the story manifested by the defending angle represents a group of people who justify every possible phenomenon in the society to their own benefit. In the story, the defending angle seems to be a representative of a dominant government or a dogmatic church taking advantage of laymen by keeping them ignorant and injudicious. They do this so tactfully that average people are content with the state and never protest against it. The defending angle apparently defends Bontsha and displays his silence as a great virtue lest nobody perceives his real intention. Bontsha, as a typical oppressed man is rejoiced and excited with the way they accuse him and sentence a verdict of his not being guilty.

The last group in the story whose representative is the prosecutor, in fact manifests a limited number of people in any society tending to cry the truth and the reality. Yet, unfortunately neither are they welcomed by the dominant group nor do they find liberty or opportunity to declare their demands and if they do so, they are immediately suppressed by the others specially those employed by the dominant group, the defending group. Thus, they also prefer to be mute and keep the policy of superficial silence.

Symbols used in the story

The most outstanding symbolic usage in this story is the silence of Bontsha, since it has been repeated frequently during the story and also its emphatic application depicts a meaning beyond its superficial meaning. Although the writer signifies his silence humorously as if it is a real virtue, his real purpose is to amplify the ignorance and sometimes stupidity of human beings in the world. Yet, the writer justifies his silence in a way that his certain situation in life was impulsive to his silence, as poverty, his mother’s death in his adolescence, having a step-mother etc.
Fantasy

Another important element in the story is fantasy. In the real world, human beings have on tangible information about the other world and their perception of that world is only taken from religious beliefs and Divine prophets. Nevertheless, in this story, the writer using the element of fantasy depicts a court and a trial execution in which the judge and angles are authorities of execution and the accused man is Bontsha, a man who does not have a lot to be accused, silence is his sole crime.

Ironies in the story

The defending angle in fact is defending himself and his own group to justify or account for that dominant group’s conduct. Yet, apparently, he is defending the oppressed group while readers are conscious of this fact, what can be called a dramatic irony. Bontsha was aware of the fact that silence is not a virtue per se, i.e., he didn’t expect to be given a red carpet treatment in heaven, yet he also didn’t expect to be received so extremely, another dramatic irony in the story.

At the end of the story, everyone expects Bontsha to request a precious property, since at this time he possesses every possible property in heaven and could ask for everything he was deprived of in his lifespan. Yet, ridiculously, he requested for mere bread and butter! The reader could consider this situationally ironic.

During the defense of the angle, he elaborated on a man whose life was revived by Bontsha and calls Bontsha a philanthropist and consequently, that man ought to compensate for this favor. Since Bontsha didn’t deserve such an attribute and defending angle was also aware of this fact, this is considered a verbal irony.

After Bontsha’s trivial request for bread and butter, even those who were the creator or defender of silence on the earth became exceedingly ashamed. In other words, the impact of silence was so great and incredible that even the dominant group were affected by the silence. Since they are not expected to feel ashamed, the phenomenon is an irony of situation.

Another ironical point (situational) is when defending angle depicts Bontsha’s name as befitting as a frock coat worn by a rich man, the prosecutor angle and the reader do not expect a fair lawyer to compare a man’s name to a frock coat- since a frock coat and a ragged simple one are the same for virtuous people and such sort of properties are not considered a criteria for virtue or piety. Nevertheless, in the story silence is considered a virtue, this might be considered another situational irony.

The next situational irony laid in the story is that God who is supposed to be the manifestation of justice and equality, plays no specific role in the process of accusation. He appears to have taken an impartial side and angles are the ultimate judges.
And finally, all of the mentioned ironies implicitly or explicitly advocate the central irony, i.e., silence. The most dramatrical irony is that even in that world silence is considered a virtue while one’s wisdom never confirms silence as a virtue to the extent of stupidity. The mentioned point is simultaneously a situational irony too, since silence could not be considered a criterion for judgment but they used it as a virtue and exonerated him from sin or wrong deeds.

Characterization

The writer uses indirect presentation in the creation of most characters in the story, like defending angle, prosecutor and judge, but direct presentation of Bontsha’s character. Whatever silence means for Bontsha, he has been silent all his life, this is what the author attempts to emphasize from the commence of the story, though via defending angle’s language. The characters in the story are consistent in their behavaiour, and sufficiently plausible in their treatment and speech. The characteristic features of all characters are depicted in such a way that one can simply correspond their behavior to the people of the real world. All of the characters are relatively of a flat type, since each has been characterized in one particular trait. Bontsha: silence, defending angle: defence and prosecutor: objection. The few characters of the story are static ones, since none of them undergoes a perpetual change in his or her character.

Point of view in the story

In this story, the writer has applied omnipotent point of view. He, as the author owns all knowledge about what’s going up in the heaven but not what has happened on the earth to the main character, i.e., the amount of omniscience of the author is limited, since most part of the story is told by a main character, the defending angle. Of course, cautiously speaking, the point of view he applies in this part is nearer to the limited omniscient. Yet, the writer remains as the story-teller until the end of the story.

The general situation of the story, especially the scene of the court and Bontsha’s accusation, trial in the other world all were impulsive to choose a narrative point of view. Therefore, the author has chosen this point of view.

Conflicts in the story

The most conspicuous conflict in the story is the emotional conflict between the defending angle and the prosecutor, it can also be applied as being a moral conflict, since the moral criteria the defending angle were following is a vast ocean contradictory with what the prosecutor believed in. For this reason, they never came to an agreement and kept a remote mental distance from each other.

A minor emotional conflict also occurs between the two important saints and the defending angles, when the writer states that their voices were touched with envy.
Another conflict seen through the whole story is Bontsha’s antagonism, his conflict against himself; as a matter of fact he knew he didn’t deserve so much reception in heaven and that was the reason for his antagonism. Another conflict related to Bontsha is his conflict against environment and society fate; the conflict he was carrying in all his lifetime, he couldn’t endure the fate considered for him by heaven.

Emotions applied in the story

In this story the writer exploits the element of emotion in such a way that the impression he means to occur is obtained easily and deeply. Although using exaggeration to represent Bontsha’s silence, he never does it for the sake of provoking sentimentality in readers, i.e., emotions like sympathy or empathy. A critic analytical writer might discriminate between creating emotion and putting it as his purpose of writing; i.e., emotion is however the by-product of this story not its end-product.

Humor is also applied indirectly in the story, as mentioned in the analysis of the story, the author seems to deride the whole situation of the court and trial and the matter of justice. He seems extremely unsatisfied with the system of religious principles or the dominant government in which silence is considered a great virtue and in order to reveal his great dissatisfaction and frustration with the whole situation, he depicts a court in which silence is ridiculously highlighted as a virtue and a silent man obtains the greatest rank in Heaven. However, applying the element of humor by the writer is fulfilled implicitly, indirectly and smartly.

Plot of the story

Bontsha the silent is a man whose main characteristic feature, as his name indicates, is silence—a sorrowful silence. He has imprisoned himself in a chain of silence in both worlds. He is a real misery, every catastrophe and wretchedness one can imagine is assembled in this man. Poverty is the main reason resulting in all sorts of problems: being entirely ignored and disregarded by people in his birth, youth, marriage and death, living unknown in a melancholy leading a life full of affliction, falling into jail for beggary and poverty desiring for a penny to earn a living... and simultaneously keeping a perpetual silence in all his life. ‘Unlike biblical Job, however, Bontsha lacks the dreams, aspirations, and passion to attain a better life 2.’ He is ignored and abused by all classes of the society even his own class and everyone used him to their own benefit. This is a general portrait of his disastrous life.

Now, he passes away and leaves this world to the hereafter. There, a series of extraordinary events happen which commence by Bontsha’s death. At the very moment he dies, all the angles of different ranks are informed of the event as is ‘his reception is excitedly anticipated 3’, everyone cries out the news and passes to the others. Hearing the piece of news, all are thrilled and prepare themselves to meet him even God and Abraham (who is called our father). He is saluted as a king and a majestic throne and crown are brought to him and in one word, he is incredibly received in that world. During
all these events, he is still silent and does not believe in his eyes, even dares not to open his eyes to behold something.

There, a heavenly trial ought to be set up for everyone and Bontsha is no exception even though as a formality. The court starts and an angle commences Bontsha’s occasions of silence in his first life. He visualizes all his deeds and justifies all of them as a virtue. Among them, for instance, the defending angle mentions his silence when his mother died and he was put under a cruel step-mother’s dominance or when he was put into jail and kept silence without complaining or even when he was thrown off by his own child, he never complained. While defending angle is uttering a long list of Bontsha’s silences in various occasions, once in a while the prosecutor angle objects and asks for facts not details; he protests against the unending realistic details that the defender points out to prove his innocence and calls some of them irrelevant, immaterial or sometimes he scoffs the defender’s pieces of evidence and questions them ridiculously. The defender angle’s reaction during all of these objections is the same; giving more examples of Bontsha’s life to support and prove his verdict and also to exonerate Bontsha.

However, when the prosecutor perceives the fact that his statements are of no particular significance, he kept a convenient silence and didn’t protest anymore. At the beginning of the trial, Bontsha is silent and can never believe that the court had been set up for him, he doesn’t believe his ears when he hears his own name, he is thrilled with fear, excitement and doubt. Ultimately, he overcomes his fears and opens up his eyes to see his surrounding and when he realizes that the trial has passed the sentence and has given verdict to his innocence, a permission to enter heaven and use it, he rejoices. ‘Although not noted for his holiness, fame, or righteousness, the silent Bontsha is accorded the highest honors to the consternation of some saintly residents’.

At the end of the story, Bontsha is asked to request whatever he wishes since heaven’s gifts are all at his disposal. As Ronald Pies (2010) states: “What supernal pleasure or reward does he request, after all his earthly suffering?” Yet, Bontsha astonishingly smiles and requests for only a piece of bread and butter “Well, then, what I would like, Your Excellency, is to have, every morning for breakfast, a hot roll with fresh butter.” A prevailing silence is cast all over heaven, even the creators and defenders of silence feel greatly ashamed of watching this poor man grown in silence. The prosecutor is the only permanent protestor who laughs, a bitter laugh to see all these events.

The theme of the story

Some societies might be categorized into two main groups; one group who is usually the dominant one may be religious authorities or governing class and tend to keep laymen in depression, subjugate them and suggest their own attitudes to them. However, another group who compromise the majority of people is usually the oppressed one who is under total control of the ruling group. But, occasionally the governing class might tend to keep in ignorance, i.e., they justify for their actions in such a way that people take their behavior as if the government protects them; for instance, they suggest people that their catastrophes and disasters are rewarded in the other world or what they suffer from is their predetermined fate and in this way, they content common people with their so-called fate.
Consequently, they admit every sort of cruelty as their fate lading to keeping a permanent silence and remaining weaker and weaker.

But, the harsh reality is that even heaven can not compensate for the oppression they have suffered; since they have been accustomed to weakness and extreme humility and in no situation, they can take their own legitimate rights.

Conclusion

Pinsker (1971) compares Bontsha the silent by Peretz with Isaac Bashevis Singers’ famous work “Gimpel the fool” and mentions that for many American readers, the story of Bontsha is a heavy dose of Yiddish sentimentalism, the sort of unadulterated play to the emotions that makes for a parochial, second rate product. (p. 58)

Pinkser considers Bontsha an everyman and states that he thus crystalized the experiences and aspirations of a people who saw themselves reflected, all too clearly in the mirror of his life. In Pinkser’s eyes, For Bontsha’s silence, his extreme passivity is less a cause for sentimental celebration than it is a call to action. Yet, some relate the story of court and heaven to the emancipation of the spirit in the next world.

They believe that slavery is not just a legal status; it is also a state of mind and Bontsha attained emancipation after his lifelong slavery. Yet, they state that God desires humility- but the true humility of Abraham and Moses, great men willing to argue against Him- not the passive meekness of a Bontsha.4

Hartley Mark (2013) also believes that the writer himself along with Bontsha might have been anticipative to obtain heaven after all their suffering on the earth. The author has written the story in 1906, the end of Czars’ dominance and the beginning of Bolsheviks’ dominance. In Czars’ period, religion is considered a powerful lever to justify poverty, disasters and all sorts of affliction which people suffer. On the other hand, Bolsheviks believe in no religion, yet are not anti-religion and generally take a neutral attitude towards religion. The author lives in the society which undergoes these dramatic changes, in a period which religious groups take advantage of people’s credulity and account for everything as a fate and suggest people what they suffer is justice and the will of God, hence people are kept in poverty and a wretched situation. The author seems to recapitulate the society’s status quo in this story in the best possible way.

Another hypothesis is that the period is also the beginning of Communism and as we know, in communism school of thought, economy is the foundation of everything and materialism prevails all over the communist society. The writer seems to believe that common people take no advantage of this world nor the other world and the main reason for this is their poverty, ignorance and weakness. Thus, it is estimated that the writer criticizes the period leading to Communism.
The powerful dictators seem to even replace the position of God in that world, i.e. the whole scene of heaven and court might mean that the dominant group even would not consider God as a supreme being and take His position by falsifying his exalted principles.

When people are kept oppressed they get accustomed to this situation and even in a nondiscriminatory society having no particular classification and ranks (here, heaven), they can’t request their rights and are satisfied with a little (as Bontsha is content with a little bread and cheese).

Footnotes
1- The Mendele Review: Yiddish Literature and Language, (A Companion to _MENDELE_) Available at: http://yiddish.haifa.ac.il/tmr/tmr03/tmr03013.txt
2- http://www.enotes.com/topics/bontsha-silent
3- http://www.enotes.com/topics/bontsha-silent/themes
4- Ibid
5- The paragraph adapted from Ein Eyah vol. I, p. 44 Available at: http://ravkooktorah.org/BO59.htm
References


-Peretz, Isaac Leib. (1906). Bontasha the silent


The Artist as A Healer: A Glimpse of Satendra Nandan’s writing as a Healer

Manpreet Kaur
The University of Fiji

Prashneel Ravisan Goundar
Fiji National University

Abstract

The aim of this research paper is to study the odyssey of the Fiji Indian writer in the Pacific: Satendra Nandan, who transforms his memoirs into artistic reconstructions through a strategy of writings heightened by exilic experience. Nandan’s writings dig deep into the experiences of the Fiji Indian. For the authors of this paper, Nandan’s works of art are expressions of a remarkable genius with a quest for writing the unwritten, untold tales of the people who suffered for many years. As a Fiji Indian, his mind and soul sensitively captures the remnants of indenture, and nurtured further by the Fijian coup culture, the education in Fiji, tertiary education in England, India and Australia, including the English language. His background represents the girmite experience, for he shows a willingness to confront the unimagined, the unrecognized and the unseen.

However, Nandan’s works shows an insightful grasp and deep understanding of the problems and ignorance of Fiji, a place which itself is a text to be deciphered, his mounting confidence in the capacity of human reasoning to interpret man and nature. His works bring to the fore the opposing myths that are related to any kind of diasporic condition, and in particular with the entire ethos, plight and history of the Girmite people.

Yet, many Indians in Fiji feel that they are a fragment that had been harshly expelled from their place of birth. Nandan, then, attempts to explore through his works of art, which appears both personal and political, comic and tragic, fictive and autobiographical, a portion of the anguish the Indians faced in Fiji ever since the beginning of the saga of the indenture. The researchers believe the historical experiences have taken root in the mind of this Fiji Indian writer. Thus, the centre in his fiction is also the self; the beginning of all his narratives is the writer himself. The multiplicity of voices in his writings is marked by the very people in his personal and professional life that shaped the man Nandan is at present.

The greatness of Nandan’s work is possible largely because of the works of great writers like Patrick White, V.S. Naipaul, M.K. Gandhi and Salman Rushdie. Hence, Nandan’s work provides an adequate base for a study of the colonial policy of separate ethnic
development and the threat of eviction by some ethnic leaders. He brings the discourse of the colonized to the fore by abrogating the language and using the bilingual writing itself. This research paper is an attempt to analyse Nandan’s works, and explore the multiple themes of politics in literature, exile and identity and what it is to be a Fiji Indian.

The political world of Nandan grows out of the special predicament of the Fiji Indians in Fiji. It is built around an intuitive grasp of the Girmit ideology, which Nandan occasionally blasts open, often parodies, but invariably enters into through a process of self-dialogue. Nandan extensively writes and laments the Fijian rebellion of May 14, 1987. Exactly 108 years after the arrival of the Leonidas in Fijian waters, the Fijian coup confounded the Fiji Indians at the very moment when, through political power, one kind of millenarian fulfilment was within their grasp. The repressed returned to haunt them and the Fiji Indians were left in a state of shock. Out of this conjunction emerged Nandan’s fictional autobiographical pieces which represent the essentially tragic world of the Fiji Indians.

Keywords: Fiji Indian writer, girmit, Satendra Nandan, Pacific, Fiji Indians.
Introduction

The exploration, the coming of the missionaries and the colonization of Fiji, has forever changed the history of our island nation. Today, Fiji and countries of the South Pacific are trying to come to terms with these foreign impacts. The 19th century Europeans felt that there was little to be said for ‘savages’ of any kind. The insidious idea was that the white men deserved to rule. That idea of eternal salvation made the West strong and they began teaching the foreign tongue. Bible came along in the South Seas. Nineteenth century was the great missionary era in the Pacific, as elsewhere.

Thus, during the early days of exploration and settlement in the Pacific, writing was only the art of the missionaries. Explorers such as Antoine de Bougainville, Joseph Banks and Samuel Wallis began to write books about the South Pacific. However, many of their writings were distorted and fabricated, e.g. *fruits fell from trees, the women are sexually unrestrained and the men are powerful yet they followed the white men like slaves* (Donnelly, et.al, 1994:7). However, it was Captain Bligh who wrote more accurately about Fiji and the South Pacific. Later, the missionaries produced religious texts to spread Christianity (1994:12). Other forms of literary art remained only in oral traditions, songs, folklore, myths and legends.

However, meagre are the possessions which immigrants bring to a new land, their mother tongue, folktales and myths are an inevitable and crucial part of their non-material baggage. Less certain is what may happen to these inseparable entities of one’s identity once they have embarked upon new lives in a new land.

T.S. Eliot wrote long ago that no poet, no artist of any art has his complete meaning alone (Soaba: 1994, 86). It is true that no individual is entirely free of the society that he lives and works in, nor the society entirely free of that individual. Both exist and function as separate entities, through their sentiments of contemporaneity for the benefit of sense of survival and continuity of each individual.

The colonization of Fiji is one important factor that has motivated past and contemporary writers. The coming of the Lapita people, who were a mixture of Melanesians and Polynesians, marked the beginning of Fiji’s colonization. Then came the Fijians, followed by the explorers, the missionaries and the Fiji Indians. It became a wave of colonizers and others being colonized. Each group came with their own ideas, intentions and belief systems. Also, the indentured labourers were brought to Fiji through greed and deception.

Defining the Impact of Nandan’s Writing

The world has known greatness in many forms – there are those who fought wars and celebrated military victories, those that deepened our knowledge of the physical universe, those that have helped us understand the workings of the human mind and those
who by their inventions in science, technology and medicine, have transformed the way we live. Of all greatness, only the artist provides the final healing of the burning heart. The word counter the sword. Word by word, without yielding, without violence one is able to look into the depth of their children’s eyes.

Writing had meant the practice of an art by a polished mind in civilized surrounding, because it is a great effort to create completely unsullied forms out of the rocks and sticks of words. Thus, ‘nothing is more penetrating than the cold impeccable print staring back at one with the detachment of a judge who not long ago was one’s intimate friend’ (2009:173). The interior calls for the lost hope. Writing holds firm one’s cold, sullen, wounded memories. The history of Fiji is one of tragedies. A nation, from the time of its discovery to the present day with much social difficulties, feudal hierarchy, to the 130 years ruling by the British throne, anxiety, the saga of indenture to three crippling coups is far beyond a mere human’s capacity to bear.

Against this backdrop of brutalities and injustices, we have a writer as the Indian diasporic writers whose works signify a cognizant departure from such ‘reflective’ treatment of ideology to a much more ‘transformed’ treatment of indenture consciousness. As Vijay Mishra (1979) suggests, “between the two poles – art as ‘reflection’ and art as ‘transmutation’ – lay the creative possibilities for the growth of Indo-Fijian writing to maturity”. The answers to uncertainties and a thick cloud of crimson forming torrential rain are no doubt forthcoming by the arrival of words like waves always lying between us.

**Significance of the Land of Birth**

More so, an artist belonging to a nation which has cultural homogeneity and is sufficiently organized has a significant degree of spiritual and psychological freedom. But for an Indo-Fijian artist, he enjoys no such freedom and his very art is an expression of his precarious existence and profound sense of social and cultural displacement. In this midst, imaginative art takes its form. Critics such as Mishra (1979:50) believe that imaginative art cannot adequately comply with a universal definition relevant at all times to all places or communities. But the Fiji-Indian artist has so organized himself after the initial shock of transplantation into servitude in an alien land and now questions through writing their position in a society they have helped mould. Referring to the girmit ideology, Nandan says (1985:51) ‘the indentured labourers underwent a psychic disintegration in this bitter cruel promised land. The Fiji-Indian consciousness was sharpened after the virtual loss of the migrant labourers cultural identity following the journey across the kala pani’.

Thus, the much more tortured outlook to life generally written by Nandan in the beginning is in contrast to his vision in the latter as a much more sensitive consciousness with its redeeming qualities of love and humanity. When he finally returned to Fiji after the horrific 1987 coup; his poetic verse was charged with urgency. He believed firmly despite the agonies of displacement and numerous ill consequences of acceptance on the part of a race, that Fiji is where he belongs. In the poem ‘Two Waves’ (2007:181), Nandan presents
a powerful voice of a child who yearns for his place of birth, with which his identity is associated:

This little village is my second womb
This little island will be my only tomb;
That formed – deformed my father’s breath
This is the country of my life and death!

The reference is to Fiji, which defines people in ways that no other word does or can. Nandan, like his ancestors know only one land, where they and he was born. He responds imaginatively far more to his place of birth, than to the glory of living in the country. The poet confronts the reader with the relatively strong hold for the place of birth. The feeling of identification is only with Fiji. In the end, a commitment to the ‘place’ is expressed. Fiji conjures up at least a million images in the poet’s mind. The place offers a kind of universal value and validity to the poet. The little village on a little Island gives a historical construction and a geographical entity, challenging and haunting the poet for self-definition. He for a second forgets and forgives those who caused him pain. The poet urges to be cremated on the land which the ancestors toiled and his ashes to be scattered only on this land. The land, whatever the root and routes – surpasses the poet’s dreams and nightmares, coolies and coups with that of the habits of his heart. He belongs to Fiji, before it belongs to him.

Artisticism in Writings

Nandan’s art of writing forms the medium by which the advance coherence of a fundamentally irreconcilable experience may be discovered to be meaningful. Surprisingly, despite the fundamental political, social and racial problems within Fiji, what remains in the forefront of his imagination is art –healing the artist. What cannot be resolved in life must find resolution in art, even if it is a transient solution. In ‘The Aunt’s Story’, the third of Patrick White’s novels published, is the first which fully reveals him as an artist of powerful and original vision.

As Australia’s most experimental novelist, White owes nothing to local literary tradition. His affinity is with those who have tried to extend the frontiers of the novel in the direction of grappling themes, issues, and the basic human problems in which readers could engage into a deeper level of transcendence. In ‘Happy Valley’ and ‘The Aunt’s Story’, he shows that sensitive human beings can hope for happiness only in rare moments of illumination: through art. White did not like the treatment of the Australians on the Aborigines. He began finding consolation in art. The illuminati’s in his writings spoke. He gave voice to the submissive and those viewed as different from the rest of the people — the sanest of all.

White’s protagonist for ‘The Aunt’s Story’, Theodora Goodman is denied the joys of a creative artist, her intelligence and sensibility are a source of anguish to her except in ‘moments of insight’ shared chiefly with her father. However, after her father’s death, which is described with a moving brevity and restraint, is the beginning of the
protagonist’s alienation from the world. Similarly, Nandan’s writings reveal his acts of separateness from Fiji, his parent’s, especially the aging father and his mother, who was dying a slow death. Theodora Goodman later enriches her mental experience by entering in imagination into the lives of the amusing as well as pathetic eccentrics at the Riviera Hotel, in Europe. Comparatively, Nandan began practicing the creative art. Hence, a mechanism of survival for an artist is to strip oneself of inessentials (a necessary preliminary for illumination).

Moreover, the characters in fiction or the persona in poems are free from the social conventions of the society one lives in. If the reality rejects a race, individuals find solace in writing. When an individual is hurt beyond healing, words give voice to the inner-self. It then unfastens all emotions, anxiety and fears on the lines, beneath another and the other filling in the page.

The inner-landscape is however, deprived of illusion. Colonial reality for the Indian writer is like a shadow never leaving the journey of the making. Indo-Fijian writer truthfully includes images from within. In Sudesh Mishra’s attempt to study Subramani’s prose fiction, he refers to reality as problematic because it houses a Pandora’s Box of unenunciated sub-realities originating from the experiences of colonialism (1992: 103). In relation to a writer’s way of responding to reality, all Fiji-Indian writers’ style differs. Similarly, in Nandan’s poetry the reader is able to see the problematic aspects of Indo-Fijian life and history. If he could not make his presence felt physically on a foreign soil, through writing, particularly poetry, he uses the recurrent motif of ageing men, the girmitiya dying a slow death on an alien landscape and his imagery to create peace with the unmerciful, trouble makers in Fiji. The solitary art then is symbolic to death itself, that final grace of epiphany realization.

However, in the altercation between ideology and art of a writer shaped out of the girmit past and its correlation to the imaginative awareness and consciousness of the poet, Nandan unlike Raymond. C. Pillay outwardly searches for meaning and order. To look for the Indian experience, Nandan in his poem ‘The House’ demonstrates through art an indispensable remoteness of the Indian in an alien land:

I push open the broken creaking door  
On the world so old, but why so poor? 
The table is bare save the burning grinning lamb  
Casting dancing shadows on walls dung-damp.

There is no fondness for objects like Patrick White’s use of ‘tables and chairs’. Nandan however, laments for the dilapidating of the house. More so, even the light amongst the four corners does not illuminate the place – home. The antithesis in this poem is applicable to Fiji, where Indians brought about agricultural prosperity but to no avail. There is still a tortured outlook to reality. The poet here is initially engaged in with a reality of historically fragmented world. The wound of history that is the colonial past
provides the life-blood that flows into the work of art. Eventually, the artistic spirit push opens the broken creaking door, like the song of Keats’ nightingale, escapes the bonds of time.

**Portraying True Images of Fiji: Past and Present**

Writers now must move away from distorting images of Fiji. Their inability to respond to the natural environment of Fiji or to their culture and the feelings of the natives would mean a deliberate attempt to remain aloof from each other. Nandan’s work over the years has moved away from geographical and political issues to a true nature of Fiji’s environment. Nandan has phrased it as follows (2007:221)

> ‘We may be drinking yagona and ruining our skins but our insight into the psychology of the Fijian ethos remains skin deep. The time has come when we ought to study, learn and teach more about the nature of native civilization, its origins, its history, its people, its hills. I think it is fair to say at present we lack an indigenous knowledge of our country.’

Nandan is right; not only is an indigenous knowledge lacking but the attitude of the mind which would enable to help forge a true Fiji-Indian bond. If the artist can heal, s/he has to move away from distorting images of Fiji by continuously and purposefully including horrific historical past in Indo-Fijian writing. As readers, the researchers of this paper strongly oppose even Nandan’s view on the drinking of yagona and its detrimental effect on the skin. Many Fiji-Indian writers work tend to portray Fiji as decadence and oppressive: dryness, dusty, muddy, savage, flies and rotting vegetation are the predominant imagery. Here in Fiji, both Indians and i-Taukei (Fijians) base their livelihood on land and many Indian farmers have flourished from farming itself. However, artists at times exaggerate land in Fiji with political thorn. In Nandan’s Poem: *My Father’s Son* (103) he presents the extensive imagery of the village as dark and dumb;

> ‘The village dark and dumb  
  so sullen in the sun  
  a muddy lost track  
  hobbles to a hut on the hill’

The truth is that the environment and its natives are not totally harsh and oppressive. According to Kacimaiwai (1985: 61), the Indo-Fijian artists must attempt to fathom the nature of Indian life and civilization in Fiji in relation to the Indigenous perspective. She believes many Indians are not in favor of the natives due to their girmit state of mind and a point of reference only to the historical past. Thus, the Indo-Fijian artists’ work must present Fiji in new light rather than brooding over the past and girmit ideology which in the opinion of the researchers has limited validity in this day and age. In order to move forward, like Nandan who has forgiven the coup leader, Sitiveni Rabuka and the other perpetrators, Post-Girmit Indo-Fijians should not delude with images of failed millennial quests. As Mishra writes (1978:62), ‘artists should be urged to search for a vitality and spirit in their writings so readers are capable of generating a liberated state of
mind and inspire a literature which is an authentic expression of the Fijian facet of the Pacific’s greatest cultures’. Since the hybrid nature of Fiji’s history does not belong to the Indo-Fijians alone, the composite of people and cultures must become an optimistic future of artistic experiences.

In addition, art takes its form from history. Even the traditions of artist fiction in European Literature could be traced back to Goethe’s novels (1978: 17), and reaching its culmination in the works of James Joyce. These novels have a special fascination for they both explore the nature of genius and help readers to understand the creative process itself. Also, where mortality is one fatal fact of existence, the artist attempts to transcend it through creative effort. Upon reading Nandan’s ‘The Wounded Sea’ (1977), there is an unusual logic of the Indian psychology and even the inexorableness of Fijian revolt of 14 May 1987, prophetically implicit in his fiction. Since tragedy has always been around the corner, against such shadows, a writer reasserts the value of the life of imagination. This phrase, Patrick White too made his own. Hence, the human imagination itself becomes a protean force.

Comparatively, White’s world is rooted in actuality – colonial, physical and social – but, he like Nandan, attempts to grasp issues beyond these. Colonial reality is just one layer of a multi-faceted structure of the ‘native and phenomenal world’ (1978:21). In the fatal impact of one civilization on another, writers have found a revealing image through which to comprehend and communicate the ever-expanding core of creative fragmentation.

Use of Humour in Nandan’s Work

At times writers also inculcate comedy to triumph over (even if momentarily) the immense rootlessness of the fragment world. In the fourth part of ‘The Wounded Sea’ for instance, Nandan presents Mr. Krishna Dutt, one of the Labour Minister’s in the Bavadra Government, who snores heavily during those terrible days of political incarceration in Borron House. Behind the immense laughter of those captivated by Rabuka, lie the tattered fates of Indians in Fiji.

However, through Nandan’s ‘The Wounded Sea’, the generic conventions and discursive domain of comedy mediates between the irreconcilable yearnings of the rootless fragment for its past, and its desire to adapt to the new land. Humour is one way of bypassing censure and self-criticism. Comic dimensions in writing are significant since it finally prevents the writer from lapsing into madness. Truly so, through the act of creative renewal, the imaginative reality glows at the artistic heart of a writer like the Indian diasporic writers here in Fiji – in an attempt to illuminate the barbarities of the past. Mahatma Gandhi said long ago; ‘the purer the suffering, the greater is the progress’ (Herring: 1990, 71). This is applicable to Nandan, who over the years moved out of personal tragedy into something larger and elemental. The artist is moving towards a revolutionary commitment tempered by artistic ambivalence.
Reflective Experiences

The mirror is one of the most ancient and persistent metaphors for literature: writers from Plato’s time to the present day have often described literature as a mirror of reflecting life (Steven: 1987, 53). The literary works of Indian diasporic writer as Nandan is at least to some extent a mirror offering the reader images of human beings as societies past, present and time immemorial. Not only is Nandan’s work a reflection of and a part of the human universe, his writings provide insight into human life and human itself providing insights into literature.

Thus, writing – a solitary art has radicalized our imagination. Sometimes we question how do we think the thoughts we have come to think? Literature is profoundly ideological discourse of certain issues in our real life. Ultimately, we as readers may discover meaning in literary writings by looking at what the author says and how he or she says it. Fiji just being a dot on the world map has a vast, rich, oral and written literature. Many of Fiji’s great writers are the natives of Fiji, the Indian descendents and other great imaginative people. Nandan is one such writer whose writings offer an artistic quality to the works of art. His work is important for children of Indian descendent.

Though Fiji is a plural society comprised of differing identifiable social, cultural and religious groups, the political and social tensions are such that the individual is aware of his position in the community. This is true of the artist. The trauma of indenture on the mind of the Fiji-Indian is emphasized by the recurring images of indenture, alienation, rejection in the Indo-Fijian writing and the coup culture in Fiji. However, Nandan’s work renders a vision, an imaginative realization of what once was and was not the world of the Indians here in Fiji, his poetry covers extensively the world of the Indentured labourer to his childhood, the journey of reading and writing, and the re-definition of old values with a consciousness of the visionary reality. The authors of this paper view Nandan conforming to the poetic process of creating a vision through the master and mythological metaphors to a mirror of culture’s vision- simultaneously voicing his poetic verses the disparateness of the visionary and the factual and historical realities of the Fiji-Indians.

Synopsis

Nandan’s works attempt to enhance the security of his social group by consciously drawing on the girmit ideology to provide a glimpse of an alternate world that not only negates the Indo-Fijians precarious social situation but also commissions a new direction.

Irrespective, the psyche of the modern Fiji Indian is inevitably influenced still by the girmit reality of the not-so-distant past. But the writer must be aware of the main current of thought of the present, of the mind of his country, which is changing continually while abandoning nothing. The writer must then have concern for the integrity of literature itself because of the crucial role it plays in relation to society. Literature then must be “the
mirror and the lamp, the reflection and illumination of human experience” (Howe, 1979:58).

Thus, a close appraisal of Nandan’s writings helps to deepen and organize one’s response to facets of culture within the society. As a writer, he is an articulate part of the life of society and his writings value ridden structure of Fijian and Indian community with a complex psychic life of an individual in Fiji. A writer then in Fiji has to find a space, that empty space which should surround one when he/she writes. Into that space which is like a form of listening, of attention, flow words that the characters will speak, provide ideas and inspire. If a writer cannot find this space, his/her writings may be stillborn.

Nevertheless, we are a jaded lot, in our threatened third world. Rather than only being good for irony and cynicism, we the budding readers and writers must restore that treasure-house of literature that has lost its potency. In Fiji, we are blessed with a legacy of languages, poetic art, and histories, bequest of stories, and myths and legends. The tales in Fiji go back to the first landing in Vuda, to chiefly systems and then the stories and plight of the jihaji-bhais, the cultural dance and songs, for our heritage of stories began in Islands, supernatural and the spirit world to Indian mythology.

A story teller is deep inside every one of us. More blessed is the story-maker who is with the person, the self; for it is our imaginations which shape us, keep us, create us – for good and for ill.

Summation

In retrospect, it is our writings that will recreate us when we are torn, hurt, even destroyed. As Doris Lessing (1997: 789) said on winning the 1997 Nobel Prize for literature: “it is the storyteller, the dream maker, the myth maker, that is our phoenix that represents us at our best, and at our most creative. The paper has analyzed Satendra Nandan’s writing as a healing process, both for the writer and those who suffered at numerous occasions due to the injustices done by the colonizers and our own natives with a segment of elite Indians greed for power. History and art is the core of this paper. Nandan’s power lies in the fact that he has been able to look into the void of the human heart inflicted with pain, and use art as a consolation for all miseries. Nandan’s tales explore a fragment society searching for concordance and a centre.

Note from the authors: Satendra Nandan is an acclaimed Fijian writer of an Indian Descent now residing in Australia. He has published poems, life writing and numerous scholarly papers. His work resonates the pains, suffering of having to leave ones homeland to experiencing life away from home.
References

Nandan’s work cited

-Centenary Centre for Multicultural Studies: A Proposal (illustrated), (Universal), 1979), 32pp.

-Creative Writing from Fiji, edited with Professor Stan Atherton, FW A, 1985, 176pp.


-From Literature and Women’s Studies to Politics and Tourism co-edited, Prestige Press, New Delhi, August 2002, pp. 480.


-Resistance and Reconciliation: Writing in the Commonwealth; co-edited, ACLALA in association with ADFA, ANU and UC, May 2003, ppAOO. Austral-Asian Encounters:


**Other work cited**


-Howe, I., Hollander, J., Bromwich, David (1979) *Literature as Experience* pp. 58.


Impact of the Tamar Communication Strategy on Sexual Gender-Based Violence in Eastern Africa

Lillian K. Kaviti
University of Nairobi, Kenya

Abstract

Gender-Based Violence (GBV) is today recognized as a serious global health and human rights violation. Crisis situations such as conflict or war usually exacerbate the extent of the problem, particularly with regard to sexual violence against women and children. Once communal protection and support systems crumble, the most vulnerable groups are exposed to sexual exploitation by virtue of their gender and socio-cultural status in society. These survivors inevitably experience social stigmatization from their families, who find it difficult to empathize and relate normally with them. In 2005, a Communication Strategy known as the “Tamar Campaign” was launched in Nairobi with the overall objective to address Gender-Based Violence (GBV) within a religious contextual approach. This Strategy was then rolled out to four different countries in Eastern Africa and the Great Lakes Region with the objective of providing a safe space to break the silence that often surrounds GBV. This paper examines the impact that this Communication Strategy has had in changing attitudes and deconstructing how certain African cultural practices encourage GBV. The thesis propounded in this paper is that to be effective, any strategy must engage women, men and the youth if it is to have a positive social change that is effective and sustainable. The compilation of success stories, challenges and lessons learnt also provides a learning resource to improve outreach efforts that lead to a better standard of living for vulnerable groups in Africa in conflict situations.

Keywords: Tamar Communication Strategy, Sexual Gender-Based Violence, Transformative Masculinity, Female Genital Cutting, Internally Displaced Persons.
1. Introduction

Gender-Based Violence (GBV) can be grouped into five broad categories, which are consistent with the 1993 Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women. Moreover, the UN General Assembly classifies and provides examples of various types of GBV to include (but are not limited to) sexual violence; physical violence; emotional and psychological violence; harmful (gender-biased) traditional practices; and socio-economic violence.\(^1\) Culture often acts as a medium through which retrogressive (gender-based) cultural practices are perpetuated and encouraged both in the home environment as well as in public spaces.\(^2\)

Sexual violence includes sexual harassment of any kind; incest, rape, forced prostitution, sexual slavery and marital rape. Physical violence is the most explicit type and includes spousal battering (often with women as the underdogs); physical assaults in public places, infanticide (usually involving the killing of female children in preference of sons) and various types of child abuse (physical or otherwise) that affect both male and female children. Closely linked to physical abuse is psych-emotional violence which includes threats of violence and abandonment; insults or abusive name-calling; forced humiliating acts performed in public spaces and blackmailing as a way of coercing vulnerable individuals to provide certain (usually sexual) favours. This study examines how the implementation of a communication strategy – referred to as the “Tamar Communication Strategy” – addresses culturally sensitive issues by creating a contextually-safe space where both men and women can engage together in an effort to combat GBV in Eastern Africa and beyond.

As a way of countering negative gender images, the Tamar Communication Strategy provides is designed to act as a liberating tool to raise awareness on GBV in a way that will empower women and encourage positive aspects of masculinity. The Strategy targets changing the mindset of groups by challenging culturally retrogressive behaviour, gender stereotypes and attitudes learnt through African initiation and socialization processes. This is considered critical because negative notions of masculinity reinforce lack of respect of females and ultimately contributes to gender inequality and various acts of GBV.

2. Contextual Background

In the last twenty years, GBV has become a serious global health, human rights, and development issue. The Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action (BPFA) defines it as:

\(^2\) These retrogressive cultural practices include patriarchy and the “inferior” position allocated to women and girls; Female Genital Mutilation or Cutting (FGM/C), abductions of young women into forced early marriages, wife inheritance and polygamy usually go against the human rights of females.
…any act that result in physical, sexual, or psychological harm or suffering to women, including threats of such acts, coercion or arbitrary deprivation of liberty that could manifest itself in public or private life.

According to the United Nations’ Institute for Research and Training, GBV is rooted in prescribed behaviour, norms and attitudes on the basis of gender and sexuality. These norms and definitions allow – perhaps even encourage violent behaviour within environments that assign privilege and hierarchical power to certain groups, which in most African cultures will be boys and men. GBV can therefore be viewed as the enforcement of power hierarchies and structural inequalities created, sustained and transmitted through religious belief systems, cultural norms and socialization processes. On its part, Sexual Gender Based Violence (SGBV) refers to:

any contact, gesture or act of exploitation of a sexual nature that is unwanted, or carried out without the consent of a person, which is imposed by physical force, threats, trickery, intimidation or duress.

SGBV in its various forms is endemic in communities around the world, and cuts across class, race, age, religion and national boundaries. Its magnitude is difficult to determine but it is widely acknowledged that the reported cases represent only a tip of the iceberg. Even in normal (non-conflict) situations, sexual violence will go unreported due to fear, shame, powerlessness (for the survivors), and lack of support and general unreliability public services in most Eastern African countries. The Tamar Communication Strategy targets combating mainly SGBV because it goes beyond physical violence and encompasses conditions and situations that systematically deny and devalue an individual’s right to life, health, decisions, choices and power.

The ICC, established in 2001, represents a significant step towards ending the impunity that is commonplace in cases of sexual violence. By criminalising sexual violence, the ICC statute embodies the principles of various UN conventions and declarations on violence against women. The problem of sexual exploitation and abuse is often exacerbated in situations characterised by poverty, conflict and/or displacement where the UN is actively involved. GBV is perpetrated primarily through patriarchal cultural practices, negative masculinity and a disparity between the rights of men and women. Rape, sexual assault, sexual slavery, forced prostitution, forced sterilisation, forced abortion and forced pregnancies are crimes under most national and international laws - yet the perpetrators of these crimes often go scot-free in Africa. This is because the socio-economic and culturally subordinate status of women and girls in Africa makes them more vulnerable to violence from boys and men.

Defilement involves the penetration of a child’s genital organs. Concepts such as ‘consensual sex’; ‘unlawful’; ‘forceful penetration’ or ‘fraudulent acquisition of consent’ are considered irrelevant

---

since a child has no capacity to consent to carnal knowledge. Defilement usually escalates during conflict situations in Africa. Unfortunately, families of the defiled minors often strike deals with the perpetrators of these sexual crimes to compensate the family, state authorities or judicial officials for the case to be silenced. This is done in total disregard of the survivor’s dignity or integrity. The vulnerability of minors drastically escalates when the traditional protection afforded to them by their families and communities is disrupted by displacement during situations of conflict. In such circumstances, children (and girls in particular) are exposed to threats or acts of violence by parties to armed conflicts – military forces, armed groups or the police – and also by members of peacekeeping forces or humanitarian workers. Targeting girls, who symbolise the ability to procreate and survive, is a method of demonstrating that they cannot be protected in the absence of their fathers and of bringing ‘dishonour’ upon an entire family or community. Moreover, even when rape and defilement cases are reported to the authorities, witnesses and police officers are often compromised by perpetrators of the crime to disrupt the quest for justice.

Abduction is a form of SGBV that involves taking away or detaining of a young girl or woman in order to have sex with her or force her into marriage. This process is usually executed either by using physical force or through deceitful persuasion. This form of violence is prevalent in many African cultures where girls perceived to have reached marriageable age are abducted by their suitors as long as their parents had consented to the marriage.\(^5\) Even when arrested, the accused persons are often acquitted due to lack of evidence or by compromising state officials through bribes. Such cultural practices often undermine justice and morality as marriage can only be contracted between two consenting adults. There have also been reported cases of men abducting women and children in IDP and refugee camps in order to molest them. Such cases often go unreported for fear, intimidation or lack of witnesses to the crime.

According to Garner (2004), domestic violence can be defined as: “...Violence between members of a household, usually spouses or a situation where a member of a household commits assault or other violent acts against another.” It also involves: “...the use of force or threats by a husband [wife] or boyfriend [girlfriend] to coerce or intimidate a woman [man] into submission. The violence can come in the form of pushing, hitting, choking, slapping, kicking, burning or stabbing.”\(^6\) Domestic violence is a manifestation of power imbalance between a wife and a husband and has its roots in gender inequality where in the majority of cases, a married woman depends largely on her husband for herself and her children’s sustenance. This often puts her in a highly vulnerable position if her husband has abusive tendencies. In such cases, such men will use their considerably higher economic status to manipulate or impose unreasonable demands on their wives and enforce these demands through various forms of GBV. In times of conflict, instability in families creates a fertile

\(^5\) These groups include (but are not limited to) pastoral groups including the Maasai, Samburu and Pokot ethnic groups in Kenya.
ground for domestic violence to take place. Women are generally more vulnerable, and conflicts exacerbate their vulnerability.

In African cultural contexts, men want to be in control of the surroundings in their family and thus perceive any signs of opposition from their wives as a challenge to their masculinity or authority. Hence, one way to regain their power and make their wives submit to them is through brute force and intimidation. This perhaps explains why some men continue to administer violence on their wives during conflict situations in camps meant for Internally Displaced Persons (IDP) despite the fact that everyone is facing difficulties brought about by war and conflict.

3. Methodology

The primary aim of this investigation was to examine the prevalence of GBV (and SGBV in particular) in Eastern Africa and the Great Lakes region. As part of the planning process for the Workshop, a comprehensive Literature Review was conducted to examine the context background (historical, cultural, socio-economic and political) background of each East African country in order to better understand the social, cultural and political factors that provide an environment conducive for GBV to take place. The objective was to identify the unique socio-cultural and religious elements that reinforce or rationalize negative masculinity. Moreover, the Literature Review was useful in identifying the various types of interpersonal violence inflicted on vulnerable groups in the family and public space.

The empirical data for this investigation was largely based on the experiences reported by the National Council Gender Representatives based in Kenya, Southern Sudan, Ethiopia, Uganda, Tanzania, DRC, Rwanda and Burundi. The Gender representatives were drawn from Faith Based Organizations (FBOs) in each of the countries. Each representative was responsible for rolling out and implementing the Tamar Communication Strategy in each of their respective countries.

The representatives provided factual information based on their experiences implementing the Tamar Communication Strategy in each of the countries and that they had faced in the process. This critical information was collected using research tools such as questionnaires and interviews conducted during group therapy meetings in their countries (“Tamar Circles”). These findings were then presented during the Nairobi workshop held in December 2013.

The next stage was to identify various manifestations of SGBV particularly during periods of conflict in each of the Eastern African countries. This was done in order to compare and contrast the various manifestations of GBV escalate particularly during periods of war and conflict.7 It was evident

7 The Communication Strategy methodology was developed and shared throughout sub-Saharan Africa and in other continents by the Ujamaa Centre for Biblical and Theological Community Development and Research at the School of Religion and Theology in the University of KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa.
that SGBV was used in each of the countries as a weapon of warfare. As a way to better comprehend the occurrence of GBV from an African perspective, it was pertinent to examine the role of socio-cultural practices such as patriarchy in rationalizing violence against women and other vulnerable groups.

During the Workshop, each of the representatives had the opportunity to share and compare their experiences. This process involved analyzing the feedback obtained from questionnaires distributed to each of the representatives and evaluating the impact the Communication Strategy had at the grassroots level. Each contact resource person provided their own unique accounts and challenges faced in their advocacy efforts.

The investigation further involved documenting success or change stories collected from the communities or individuals who had participated in the group therapy sessions also known as “Tamar Circles”. This process involved integrating the useful insights from individuals who had played a significant role in the launch, integration and mainstreaming of the Strategy in each of the Eastern African countries. In general, the findings of the study were that the most likely theatres for SGBV are within the domestic sphere, family space or context of marriage. To a lesser extent, public spaces such as workplace environments are also conducive for sexual harassment.

4. Discussion
4.1: The Culture of Silence

Religion has often been used selectively to propagate and justify certain cultural practises such as polygamy) and the submission and silencing of women and girls in society\(^8\). This “culture of silence” contributes to an environment that wrongly accepts, excuses, and even rationalizes violence against females.\(^9\) Such acts are therefore declared to be “ordinary”, “normal” or ‘permissible’. Other cultural acts that are considered normal include wife-beating and marital rape. In many African cultures, children’s rights are non-existent – hence, defilement of children is not considered to be a serious issue. In many African languages, the term “rape” does not exist. Rape is sexual intercourse with someone without his/her consent. It includes both the forceful and unlawful penetration of another person’s genitals without consent as well as the fraudulent acquisition of consent. Rape not only dims any prospect of marriage but can also have very frightening consequences that endure long after the assault: unwanted pregnancy, HIV/AIDS and other sexually transmitted infections (STIs), in addition to psychological trauma. In armed conflict, the perpetrators may include fellow victims of violence

\(^8\)In the Old Testament, (Christian Bible) polygamy was a common practise. The Koran also allows the marriage of up to 4 wives.
such as Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs), members of other clans or religious groups, or even family members. In many cases of rape and gang rape, the survivor knows the perpetrator(s).

Rape, sexual assault, sexual slavery, forced prostitution, forced sterilisation, forced abortion and forced pregnancy are crimes under national and international laws, yet the perpetrators of these crimes often go scot-free. Most cases of rape and defilement in Africa go unreported because the victims’ claims are often treated with cynicism and instead, their own morality is called into question. It is common for the victims to be subjected to questions such as: “What were you wearing? Did you provoke him?” Are you sure the two of you are not friends?” The underlying assumption behind such questions is that the victims were to blame for the sexual violence. This fear is founded in the misleading gender stereotype that women are to blame if they are subjected to unwanted sexual advances or sexual assault. The assumption is that a woman is courting rape if she wears a short skirt or trousers. Hence, the rape is seen as “intentional,” i.e., the woman invited the rape.

The blaming and stigmatization that SGBV survivors endure implies that they must have “encouraged” the sexual assault in some way. Consequently many women and girls avoid reporting the violations, since in most cases there were no witnesses present - it is the perpetrator’s word against the survivor’s testimony. Moreover, stigma and blame accompanies sexual violations and reporting the crime – rather than bringing justice for the survivor- often brings more dishonour and shame rather than the actual act itself. This sense of humiliation and shame is a significant barrier to help-seeking of any kind, which explains why so many rapes go unreported.

Stereotypes that have been perpetuated to justify SGBV in Eastern Africa include blaming the survivors for provoking the perpetrators by their dressing, demeanour or talk. The cliché that the woman’s refusal is actually a ploy to make the man try harder is culturally relevant in many African societies. In Kenya, rape is often not taken seriously as criminal behaviour. The experience of many women in Kenya is that after being violated, rush to a police station to report the crime only to have the (usually male) officers trivialize the experience or ask for details of what the survivor did to encourage the rapist. A case in point is the traumatic experience of a young woman in Western Kenya with the pseudo name “Liz” reported in the Kenya print media on October 2013. Liz was reportedly gang raped and subsequently thrown into a pit latrine where she sustained spinal injuries. She also suffered serious injuries resulting in Fibula Vistula, thereby making her incontinent and in urgent need of reconstructive surgery. The police arrested the young men responsible for this heinous act and the only punishment meted out to them was to cut grass around the police compound! This illustrates the trivialization, trauma and injustice that survivors of SGBV face in Kenya. Moreover, in many African contexts, there is no such thing as “marital rape.” There also have been cases of men being violated but most of these victims prefer not go public with their experiences and so suffer in silence.

SGBV has a greater impact on females, who suffer greater physical harm than males. Incest in particular remains a closely guarded secret within African families, leaving the affected victims
traumatized and suffering in silence. Other vulnerable groups include children who remain vulnerable to sexual violence because it is often perpetrated by persons whom the survivors know and trust. Hence, in order to avoid the social stigma and family shame, the knowledge of the abuse remains a closely guarded secret that is kept within the family. At times, families are paid “damage money” to buy their silence. This culture of silence and secrecy reinforces the impunity of the perpetrators of SGBV crimes. GBV affects more females than males, since African cultural norms tend to allow and encourage violent behaviour towards women by assigning privilege and hierarchical power to men. The enforcement of these power hierarchies and structural inequalities are created and sustained by belief systems, cultural norms and socialization processes.

The socio-economic and cultural subordinate status of women and girls makes them more vulnerable to violence and contributes to an environment that wrongly accepts, excuses, and even expects violence against the girls who undergo it. Furthermore, children are also at risk of sexual violence which is usually perpetrated by persons known to the victims. However, social stigma and family shame result in the knowledge of the abuse being kept within the family. This culture of secrecy serves to aid the impunity of the perpetrators. SGBV has a greater impact on women and girls, as they suffer greater physical harm than men when victimized. GBV during or around the time of pregnancy can lead to unique consequences on maternal and child health. Moreover, the psychological impact of GBV can have devastating results on the well-being of the mother, not only in the period surrounding pregnancy but even years later.

Survivors are unlikely to report spousal abuse because they fear the reaction of their spouses. There is a sense that what happens within marriage, even if this includes violence, is something private that should not be shared with others outside of the relationship. Women are made to feel ashamed for talking about their experiences with others. Women also have a very real fear that reporting violence to local authorities will lead to an escalation in the violence by their husbands. A socio-cultural barrier is the fear of the social consequences that result from reporting spousal abuse to the authorities. In particular, women fear that reporting abuse will lead to divorce, which will leave the woman without any financial support. When women experience GBV they are afraid to report their husbands to the police because doing that will break the marriage. Often the woman has no income to sustain her if she was to leave the matrimonial home. Inherent in this fear is the additional concern that being a divorced woman will render her an undesirable partner for other prospective husbands.

Similarly, women are concerned that their reporting of an incident will escalate the problem and even leave their husbands jailed. Others think that going to the police is useless because nothing will be done anyway. A common perception that the system is not built to respond to the needs of women who experience GBV. Reporting the violence or seeking help is further complicated by variables such as the

---

survivor’s age (e.g., is s/he “too old” or “too young” to be believed reporting on rape?), location (e.g., Are any services available for help? Does the provider have a relationship with the perpetrator?), and marital status (e.g., Will the survivor invite even more stigma for reporting violence that happened in an unsanctioned relationship? Isn’t this violence part and parcel of an intimate relationship?).

While this acceptance of violence as a part of relationships prevents survivors from feeling safe enough to report incidences of violence, even those who may want or try to report their abuse will be faced with obstacles. Women in abusive marriages therefore have to learn to “get used to” being beaten and “keep quiet” because even if they make a report to the local authorities, nothing is done, hence, she opts to remain silent. Men and boys who may be undergoing violence and assault from their wives or partners rarely report the cases because men are always expected to be superior in strength to women. Hence, the idea of a man facing GBV is ridiculed – thereby leading such men into depression and frustration.

The family frequently becomes a socio-cultural barrier in itself. Norms related to shame and the privacy of family matters serve as an obstacle to disclosing incidents of GBV outside of the family and immediate social network. Therapy cases are usually not reported because of the tendency of affected individuals to keep this as a secret because it is associated with shame and discrimination. The survivor’s family often decides to keep this a secret for fear of ruining the family reputation and to protect the image of the perpetrator.

Survivors of SGBV endure mental and physiological distress; have higher levels of anxiety, depression and psychosomatic complaints than persons who have not suffered such violence. Defilement, child molestation and wife battery retards the emotional development of the woman and the child. Most doctors at the Nairobi Women’s Hospital in Kenya recounted how they follow up survivors of SGBV in an attempt to alleviate the trauma they undergo. The psychological damage has long-term effects leaving many survivors severely traumatized. Survivors of sexual and gender-based violence have to undergo sessions of therapy to enable them to cope. In addition, even though monetary compensation cannot substitute the pain survivors endure, it helps alleviate some of the problems they have to live with, sometimes for life such as counselling fees, medical bills and other related support for the survivor may need.

The international community and African governments have been rather slow in recognizing SGBV as a crime against humanity. In Sudan, for example, although the Government (under massive pressure from the international community) acknowledged that rape was being perpetrated in Darfur, it refused to acknowledge the magnitude of this scourge, or that sexual violence was being used as a weapon of war against the civilian population. Too often, this attitude has denied survivors access to treatment, as those brave enough to seek medical care or to report the rape to the authorities have been harassed and even arrested. Unmarried pregnant women are treated like criminals, victimised not just by the initial act(s) of violence but again as they are arrested and subjected to brutal treatment by
police. Ironically, the survivors of SGBV who choose to come forward and make public their traumatizing ordeal more often than not end up isolated, ashamed and stigmatized by the community because of the high premium placed on female chastity. The shame and stigma attached to sexual violence, and the lenient penalties meted out to guilty offenders either by the state legal machinery or community judicial systems forces most survivors to keep silent about their ordeal.

4.2: Religious Norms and Beliefs

GBV occurs at all levels of society including within religious circles. The major religions practiced in Eastern Africa are Christianity, Islam and traditional African belief systems. As I will be demonstrate in a later section, some of the practices that violate the rights of girls and women are justified and reinforced by appealing selectively to certain sections of the Bible, Koran or other religious and socio-cultural norms. SGBV in particular, cannot be understood in isolation from the gendered religious beliefs and social structures that influence women’s vulnerability to violence. The informants highlighted numerous cases of incest, sexual and physical abuse and other forms of GBV perpetuated by Church leaders that were kept hidden due to the culture of silence. There have also been cases of various kinds of injustice meted out by religious leaders against their own families. Moreover, religious leaders seemed reluctant to confront members of their congregation who are abusive to their spouses and families particularly if these perpetrators of GBV also happen to be wealthy and influential.

It is common for religious leaders to propagate the culture of silence rather than directly confronting survivors of SGBV and yet this affects a significant proportion of their congregations. This silence and apathy is largely caused by the ignorance of religious leaders about where to send the survivors for legal and psycho-social support. These are essential services that the survivors of SGBV need to ensure holistic healing has taken place. Moreover, religious leaders who are guilty of perpetuating these vices tend to become overly defensive when issues to do with rape or incest are brought up or discussed.

With regard to the roles of men and women in marriage, the Christian Bible views the man as the “head” whereas the woman is the “neck”. This theology is not biblical for it implies that the “neck” (the woman) must take responsibility for anything that goes wrong with the “head”. For instance, when a couple have problems conceiving a child because the man is not capable of siring children, his sexuality is protected and arrangements are made for the woman to conceive with the man’s relative or friend. However, if it is the woman who is barren, she is ostracized by the community and exposed to ridicule since her worth comes primarily from her child-bearing capabilities.
4.3: Cultural Norms and Socializing Agents

Mothers are the primary socializing agents who often contribute to negative masculinity. Women often are the first ones to castigate those women who go against the norm, e.g. divorced women, single mothers, etc. A marriage is considered to be dysfunctional especially when women begin to question the man’s power. During initiation ceremonies, teenage boys are empowered to be men before they are physically, psychologically and economically ready for the challenges of manhood. Many acts of GBV are viewed as “acceptable” or “normal” which therefore has a negative impact on the willingness on the part of survivors to report acts of violence that they experience. This denies them formal or informal sources of support. This barrier may be particularly powerful in preventing women from reporting physical abuse by their husbands. The informants reported that in most African cultures, acts such as wife beating are “acceptable” or “normal.” Hence, the abused female survivors could not justify their accusations against their abusive spouses because the elders in the community would dismiss such complaint as trivial and part and parcel of marriage.

SGBV cannot be fully understood in isolation from the gender norms and social structures that make women and girls vulnerable to such forms of violence. In many cultures, traditional beliefs, norms and social institutions legitimise and, therefore, perpetuate violence against women. The subordination of girls and women is manifested in the gender stereotypes entrenched in these societies. Certain gendered norms, beliefs and cultural practices reinforce acts of GBV such as wife battering, marital rape, FGM/C and early (forced) marriages; “beading” of young girls to serve the sexual needs of young warriors; forced abortions and virginity tests; wife battering and coerced wife inheritance, favouritism of the boy child vis a vis the girl child amongst other cultural practices. In addition, most African communities, the testimony of a child cannot be taken as seriously as the word of an adult, especially if it challenges the integrity of a respectable person in society – hence, child defilement or molestation cases are often not treated with the seriousness they deserve.

Certain cultural customs that are supposedly helpful to women are actually very oppressive and provide a fertile ground for the spread of HIV/AIDS. One such practise is wife inheritance. In certain ethnic groups, when a man dies, his widow must undergo certain “cleansing” ceremonies and be inherited by a sibling to the deceased. Such cultural practices contribute significantly to the spread of HIV/AIDS. In contrast, the ethnic groups such as the Maasai do not practice wife inheritance and hence, a widow is “free” to engage in intimacy with other men. However, this concept of “freedom” is misleading because eventually, young widows end up worse than before, struggling to bring up many children fathered by different men who care less about sharing in the responsibility of providing for the children they fathered. Other practices such as the paying of bride price or dowry come loaded with cultural expectations for the wife who is now viewed as the man’s “property.”

11 The practice of “beading” is practiced in certain pastoral communities such as the Samburu in Kenya, where young girls are coerced into satisfying the sexual needs of young morans (community warriors) but are forced to abort should they conceive during these sexual encounters.
4.4: Patriarchy and Initiation rites

Patriarchy refers to the masculine nature of socialization prevalent in most African cultures. There is a link between patriarchy and GBV because it forces women to succumb to unacceptable acts that violate their rights and justifies their low status in society. Many cultural practices that reinforce SGBV are justified as being “normal”, ‘ordinary’ or ‘permissible’. In patriarchal cultures, masculinity is closely equated with power and control. It is instilled early in the lives of children through the socialization process and assignment of gender roles. This is further entrenched through cultural initiation rites such as circumcision and in preparing young people for marriage.

One of the most important moments in the transition of an African child’s life is the initiation ceremony around puberty when teenage a boy or girl undergoes certain rituals and rites to cross into manhood or womanhood. During such initiation periods, boys are exposed to highly gendered messages about what it means to be a man. From a cultural perspective, manhood is equated with the ability to provide and also exert power over others - if need be, through the use of physical force. However, such expressions of masculinity are a major driving force behind the disempowerment and consequent vulnerability of women and girls. Traditions such as abducting young girls for sexual purposes, wife battering and other manifestations of negative masculinity are culturally condoned and justified as “acceptable” ways of disciplining and “taming” a wife.

Gender inequality lies at the core of SGBV and depend on perceptions of male and female roles in society and the social expectations surrounding these roles. However, the notions of masculinity and femininity are gradually evolving. In many African cultures, a woman is regarded as the property of a man (either her father or husband) - hence an affront on women is an attack at the man. From an early age, a preconceived mould of masculinity is imposed on boys and men, just as stereotypes of femininity are imposed on girls and women. As men change, entire cultures begin to change, laying the foundations for a richer lifestyle. Girls are also socialized to believe that as women, they have to tolerate anything meted out to them. Hence, it is common for mothers to advise their daughters in abusive marriages to persevere and stay with an abusive spouse because -after all, the same mothers also experienced abuse from their husbands. The daughters are further advised to keep the abuse secret, thereby protecting the perpetrator and condoning the violence. In many ethnic groups in Eastern Africa, it was evident that cultural norms, traditional beliefs, and social institutions legitimise and, therefore, perpetuate violence against women. The subordination of women to men in most societies results from the generational gender stereotypes entrenched in these societies.

4.5: Negative Masculinity and GBV

Studies demonstrate that there is a close link between negative masculinity and GBV. According to Robert (2000), masculinity has three defining characteristics. Firstly, it is structured in
gender relations, meaning that it has to do with male and female roles and attitudes and how these interact with each other. Secondly, it is not static, meaning that masculinities are dynamic. For instance, the way a father manages his household does not always determine how his son will manage his own household later in life. Moreover, the manifestation of masculinity is not homogenous because it is affected by cultural and generational factors. It is a pattern of social conduct meaning that masculinity is largely influenced by the role of religion, the mass media and institutions of learning.\textsuperscript{12} Negative masculinity upholds and reinforces traditional stereotyped mindsets, which shape the identity and behaviour of young boys, thereby perpetuating gender inequalities and patriarchal norms. Such gendered stereotypes are largely inculcated through socialization processes which have a significant influence on how men and women will later interact and engage with their economic, political and social environment.

4.6: SGBV as a Weapon of Warfare

Whereas acts of SGBV take place all the time and are prevalent in all societies, situations of armed conflict, internal strife, economic and political crises often exacerbate the extent and escalate the manifestations of this violence. Insecurity and lawlessness creates an environment conducive for SGBV to thrive because sexual violence now becomes a weapon of war to humiliate the enemy and to achieve military objectives in crude, unorthodox ways. Sexual violence becomes an effective way to injure, control and humiliates the enemy in general, while at the same time, it violating the victims’ physical and mental integrity. Perpetrators of SGBV are often motivated by a desire for power and domination. Vulnerable, unarmed civilians therefore become prime targets of the aggressors who take them hostage, gang rape, injure them sexually and exploit them as sexual slaves or kill them altogether. More often than not, the aggressors are never arrested for their crimes thus leaving the survivors to suffer without any hope of restitution or justice. Such forms of violence tend to be gender-specific, with women and girls being the most vulnerable groups.

War and conflict situations displace communities and many are forced to flee their homes – either as refugees in neighbouring countries or living in camps for Internally Displaced People (IDP). Such horrors were witnessed during the 1994 genocide in Rwanda, the volatile conflict area of Eastern Congo, Northern Uganda, and Darfur region in Sudan and during Kenya’s 2007 Post-Election Violence (PEV) as a result of inter-ethnic conflicts. During each of these crisis situations, women and children were subjected to unprecedented and unimaginable levels of sexual abuse and GBV as they sought

refuge in the bushes or IDP camps. In most cases, the perpetrators of such violence get off scot-free, leaving the survivors with no means of seeking restitution or justice. It is important for governments to strongly condemn all forms of violence that affect men and women, the youth and children and to put in place measures to eliminate the vice. It is their responsibility, and it is in the interest of the state to focus national policies and legislation to promote and safeguard the rights of women.

Culturally, an African man is expected to be the primary provider of his family. However, if for some reason he is unable to fulfil this traditional role, this places him in a state of helplessness, anger and frustration. Such frustrations and anger are directed towards their families and wives in particular. This sense of powerless over their own lives and the lives of their families is extremely degrading on a man’s masculinity, especially when they are forced to seek shelter in IDP camps. They are often deprived of their livelihoods due to the prevailing insecurity and are forced to depend on relief food from charity organizations. This affects the man’s status, power and dignity as the provider for his family making some turn violent because of the perception that they must enforce obedience and authority on their wives. Others resort to selling some of their provisions to reassert their authority and prove that they were still in control of their families and do not take kindly to being questioned about it.

Traditional family systems where men were the providers and protectors of their wives and children has been eroded in many instances due to migrations to major towns to seek employment, poverty, chronic illness or armed conflict. With the breakdown of traditional family roles, a vacuum is left. Poverty and economic instability have also resulted in a crisis of masculinity where men’s traditional roles are threatened and rather than finding alternate roles, men have in some cases sought to assert their masculinity through irresponsible sexual behaviour or domestic violence. The expectations that a man ought to be strong and in control in all situations is actually not liberating and in many instances could be oppressive to the vulnerable men in society who are physically, economically or emotionally challenged in one way or the other. As part of the initiation rites, young boys are socialized to be strong at all times. This inevitably puts enormous psychological pressure on men who are forced to pretend to be what they are not because of the high expectations of society.

During conflict situations, the collapse of law and order provides an environment conducive for rampant sexual as well as other forms of abuse to take place on a massive scale. The situation becomes complicated when the individuals who were supposed to perform a protective role suddenly turn out to be the perpetrators of the crimes. Perpetrators usually take advantage of the state of insecurity to commit these heinous acts since the risk of identification and prosecution is minimal or non-existent. They include government security forces (policemen and state military personnel); rebel groups opposing the government forces; external peace-keeping forces, relief food workers and camp administrators (in refugee and IDP camps) as well as opportunistic members of the public.

Based on the empirical accounts provided by the representatives during the Nairobi Workshop, it was evident that SGBV escalates during periods of war and conflict – in essence, it becomes an
additional weapon of warfare against the enemy. Sexual violence therefore becomes a form of torture to inflict injury or as a means of extracting information. It is also used to degrade and intimidate those captured. One representative from the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC) narrated a horrific account of how captured men were forced to watch their wives and daughters gang-raped by soldiers.

Sexual violence is also used as a form of punishment for actual or alleged actions committed by individuals, their families or ethnic communities or to destroy the cohesion of certain communities. Sexual violence is further committed on young girls based on the mythical belief that having sex with a virgin girl is a cure for HIV/AIDS infection.

During times of war and conflict, sexual violence is strategically gender-specific and mainly targets the vulnerability of women and girls who then are taken hostage as sex slaves, gang-raped, or killed altogether. Girls may be recruited to fulfil various functions – such as domestic workers, porters, fighters, spies, suicide bombers, sexual slaves, or “wives” of the rebel commanders. When captured, men and boys are also subjected to various humiliating acts of SGBV such as sodomy, being forced to watch their wives or daughters gang-raped by the oppressors, castrated or forced to perform other degrading sexual acts. Sexual violence in conflict almost always springs from wider problems – a lack of security and protection, the low status of women and girls and a culture in which either sexual violence is not recognized as a crime or impunity prevails.

4.7: Failure of Justice, Restitution and Accountability Mechanisms

The primary obligation to protect women and girls from sexual violence rests with the state. However, many fail to meet this obligation even during peace-time. Most of the justice systems within the developing world are characterised by shoddy investigations, low arrest records and insensitive judicial procedures that criminalise and intimidate survivors. This encourages a culture of silence where cases of sexual violence go largely unreported thereby enhancing impunity and further human rights violations.

While the traditional criminal justice system engenders a paradigm shift in dealing with SGBV by affording direct compensation to the survivor, such awards are nowhere near sufficient. The notion in such systems was that the award is more a ‘benefit’ to the survivor’s family rather than a means of alleviating the survivor’s conditions. The prevalence of SGBV therefore escalates because of the reluctance of various actors in the justice system to act firmly and decisively to ensure that the perpetrators of these crimes face the full force of the law.

Although each of the Eastern African countries have legal frameworks to counter GBV and sexual violence, forms of violence such as emotional and physical abuse in marriage, matrimonial rape, coerced widow inheritance or disinheritance, forced early marriages and adultery are yet to receive legal recognition as offences, are very difficult to prove or are not recognized as “serious” offences in
courts of law. Courts have discretionary powers to be lenient in the interest of saving a marriage and it is common for complainants of domestic violence to be sent away from police stations or courts for lack of evidence. Other survivors are advised to consult their area chief or family elders to mediate the case. Unfortunately, many village chiefs tend to be biased and so are easily compromised to side mainly with wealthy and influential perpetrators whereas the woman is told to “go back and persevere like all good women do”.

Sexual crimes, justice and restitution mechanisms are not considered to be primary issues in the crafting of peace protocols relating to the cessation of conflict that would require urgent redress in the post-conflict dispensation. Traditional reconciliation and judicial processes such as the informal “Kiama” (council of elders) in Eastern and Central Kenya; “Gacaca” courts in Rwanda, and the “Mato-put” which is the Northern Uganda Community Peace mechanism often choose to pardon and re-integrate perpetrators of GBV into the society once they confess, apologise and pay a fine of some sort to the aggrieved family. This allows perpetrators to go scot-free into the post-conflict society to further perpetuate more acts of GBV. Such blatant disregard for accountability in safeguarding and protecting women and girls reinforces the culture of impunity.

5. The Transformative Approach of the Tamar Communication Strategy

Transformative masculinity is a relatively new approach which is currently being used as a tool during workshops in Uganda, Rwanda and Burundi. It involves religious contexts where sermons are preached that create awareness on GBV in order to empower women economically, psychologically and spiritually. During discussions, rural women show a general awareness that their rights are infringed upon by their men folk. However, they lack alternatives and fear the backlash from their husbands and society at large if they become too assertive in changing the status quo. The appeal of this Strategy lies in its transformation approach where direct questions concerning sensitive topics such as the rights of women can be discussed in a public domain. In so doing, it underscores the important role of women in society. A case in point in the Bible is the important role played by women, which in most cases is often overlooked or downplayed. A case in point is the presence of women such as Mary Magdalene in the ministry of Jesus. It is often assumed that there were only twelve men who assisted Jesus in his earthly ministry.

GBV is rooted in unequal power relations between men and women and is grounded in power imbalances, meaning that there is a close link between negative masculinity and the increase of GBV. It is therefore necessary to “deconstruct” the concept of masculinity before positive aspects of masculinity can be “reconstructed”. There is also need to deconstruct and then reconstruct masculinity as a means of finding alternatives ways of defining masculinity. “Deconstructing” masculinity means identifying the things that are not life affirming, while “reconstructing” masculinity implies reinforcing the life affirming values and beliefs. This entails establishing a balance between values of belonging, (partnership, inclusiveness, cooperation and generosity), with values of enterprise (individualism,
competitiveness, and materialism). It is important to strike a balance between values of belonging and values of enterprise and to re-evaluate the socialization process and initiation rites that children and the youth undergo in Africa.

The Communication Strategy consists of interactive study of texts drawn from religious texts where both the reader’s environmental context and the religious context (in this case, Christianity) are merged together. The primary objective is to raise awareness in order to create transformation through the ‘five Cs’ that refer to: ‘Community’, ‘Context’, ‘Criticality’, ‘Consciencization’ and ‘Change’. ‘Community’ implies that this communication strategy is meant to be interactive within a group setting. ‘Context’ means that the strategy must consider the social location of the audience. ‘Criticality’ refers to the need to critically examine the religious context of the particular religious text in use – in this case, the Bible.13 ‘Consciencization’ refers to the effort to raise the reader’s inner, reflective awareness of specific concerns; while ‘Change’ means that the end goal of the Communication Strategy is transformation of the reader’s behaviour through deliberate, personal action.

Over the years, various forms of religious doctrine have been used to condone and perpetuate acts of GBV and justify negative masculinity. In addition, issues to do with sexuality are often considered to be “taboo” subjects- thereby entrenching a culture of silence concerning acts of SGBV. For instance, using the Bible as a case in point, there are numerous examples of cultural bias, gender inequality and negative portrayals of women using their sexuality to tempt men to commit sinful acts. For instance, according to Christian doctrine, the first human couple created in the Bible (Adam and Eve) were thrown out of the perfect garden of Eden after the “temptress” Eve gave in to the temptation of the devil to eat the forbidden fruit and then convinced her husband to eat the fruit as well.14 Another example is cited in the Old Testament of a prostitute named Delilah who used her sexuality to lure the prophet Samson into letting out the secret that the source of his superhuman strength was his hair. Numerous other instances are cited of women caught in acts of adultery and condemned for their apparent promiscuity.

Other taboo topics highlighted in the Bible include the story of a woman who had a chronic bleeding problem for 12 years but was miraculously healed by touching Jesus’ garment. This incident highlights the stigma that chronic diseases have had over the years. By appealing to this story, is story is relevant to contemporary African societies making it easy for religious leaders are to discuss the stigmatizing effects that chronic diseases such as HIV/AIDS have negatively affected society and the empowerment that is brought after their healing. Another sensitive topic that can be discussed within a safe space concerns issues to do with racism, negative ethnicity and gender inequality which is alluded to in the story of the Samaritan woman who meets a Jewish man Jesus at a well and they have a conversational interaction which was a taboo at that time.

---

13 Although the Tamar Communication Strategy makes reference to the Bible, it does not exclude the application of other religious texts such as the Koran.
14 Genesis 3 (Old Testament, Christian Bible)
This story could be used religious leaders to facilitate a discussion on negative ethnicity, gender inequality, tribalism and to some extent racism (which is common in Africa) can be addressed in an amicable way. The story illustrates that these barriers can be broken – the woman gives Jesus water, and in return, she is offered “living water” that will benefit both herself and her community. The Strategy is non-confrontational and can be used to effectively deal with transformative masculinity by appealing to the positive aspects of masculinity and downplaying the negatives aspects as a way of encouraging gender equity and equality.

Ironically, no mention is made of any of the men the women were found with! These examples and others portray the female gender as (mis)using their sexuality not only to tempt men but also to bring about evil into the world – the underlying assumption is that it is through the female gender that an otherwise perfect world was ruined and also the reason for all the pain and suffering in this world.

6. Conclusion

SGBV is prevalent in the Eastern African region with the persons most affected being women and children. Efforts to eliminate it have been ineffective, considering that the sexual and gender-based violence is most prevalent in situations of conflict, in which the government is a major player. Certain forms of the violence are perpetrated by the patriarchal nature of the society, which makes women subservient to men. Because the legislative, administrative and policy decisions are in most cases made by male-dominated structures, the pace at which measures targeting elimination of sexual and gender-based violence have been half-hearted. Deeply entrenched African and religious cultural practices and attitudes perpetuate sexual and gender-based violence. Certain cultural practices reinforce gender inequality and the perception that women are second-class citizens lacking the capacity to sustain themselves. Many communities blame and ostracise the survivors rather than the perpetrators of SGBV.

FBOs have a duty to advocate for the right to justice for the survivors of GBV. This entails lobbying and advocating for legislative, administrative and policy decisions to combat SGBV as part of restorative justice. Other measures include conducting education and awareness campaigns to sensitize the public on harmful traditional practises that reinforce gender inequality. There is also need to set up special funds for the compensation of survivors of sexual and gender-based violence, as well as to sensitise the courts, the police, prosecuting agencies and Gender Desks. Each of the states in the Great Lakes Region have committed themselves to prevent and end Gender-Based Violence by ratifying international conventions and declarations, and in so doing, acknowledge the seriousness of the problem. Working in consultation and coordination with state agents, human rights groups and the

15 One such example of an adulterous woman is in John Chapter 8, New Testament, Christian Bible
international community can join forces to address GBV. More needs to be done to prevent, investigate and punish acts of violence whether against men, women or children. The survivors of GBV need to be supported and protected - a responsibility for which each state officials need to be held to account.

Prevention efforts need to focus on changing the deep-rooted attitudes and behaviours that foster GBV, which includes women’s low status, unequal gender roles and an imbalance of power between intimate relationships. It is important not only to influence individuals (women and men experiencing/perpetrating violence) but also the broader community, which is influential in creating a culture of non-tolerance for violence. The prevention of GBV requires a significant transformation in the value of cultural at individuals and the community level.

Religious leaders and FBOs need to be role models who value compassion and community building over constraining gender roles. In addition, places of worship need to be places of solace and healing for the survivors of violence. FBOs and religious leaders therefore need to be more pro-active in redefining masculinity and encouraging younger men to affirm women as equals in need of protection and not as instruments to edify their masculinity through subjugation and violence. Religious institutions such as churches and mosques must lead the way in redefining masculinity. This can be done by reinforcing legal and policy structures so that laws prohibiting violence against women and girls are enforced.

Addressing gender inequality and adverse cultural attitudes and practices including the larger cultural, social and economic factors that contribute to violence is critical. This involves taking steps to change them, including measures to close the gap between the rich and poor and to ensure equitable access to goods, services and opportunities. Because violence is a multifaceted issue, with psychological, social and environmental roots, it requires a variety of approaches targeted at a number of different stakeholders, including government and nongovernmental agencies, law enforcement agencies, the health and education sectors, state organs and FBOs.

Any intervention designed to contribute to the reduction of GBV must be multifaceted and target the elements listed which are all intertwined. Accordingly, efforts to address sexual and gender-based violence must deal with the cultural dynamics that relegate women to the periphery of creating and enforcing policy and hold perpetrators of sexual and gender-based violence to account. It is important for states to safeguard the rights of its citizens and put in place measures to eliminate it. It is their responsibility, and it is in the interest of the state to focus national policies and legislation to promote and safeguard the rights of women.

Even if services are available, sometimes rape victims do not make use of them due to lack of absolute confidentiality and privacy within a medical facility. In addition, acknowledgement of rape can have repercussions within the family, such as rejection or divorce, and wider social consequences of stigmatization and economic marginalisation. The political and legal system can represent a hurdle,
especially when extensive bureaucracy and contact with a proliferation of different authorities are required in order to report and file suit for rape. In some conflict areas, there are no authorities available to document violence or to provide legal recourse. National authorities can play a key role in facilitating SGBV projects simply by recognising that SGBV is an issue and enabling medical services or agencies to respond. The impact of stigmatisation makes it all the more difficult for SGBV to be handled in a general medical structure. One way is to establish ‘safe spaces’ such as the Communication Circles, where women can speak about SGBV with the assurance of full privacy and confidentiality. To truly respond to SGBV, international and national actors must demonstrate political will to invest significant financial and human resources in all these inseparable and indispensable dimensions of care for survivors of sexual violence.

Religious leaders are well placed to foster close relationships with journalists and media watchdog groups. The print and electronic media has the capacity to reach a wider audience and therefore needs to be used as a channel of advocacy that targets all levels of society. A multi-media approach includes engaging key public institutions, the disciplined forces and institutions of higher learning.

The recommendations advanced herein are that the Duty Bearers\(^{16}\) must address SGBV by: facilitating and providing adequate holistic assistance and support to all survivors; promoting equity in access to resources irrespective of gender and work towards addressing cultural norms and practices that encourage SGBV; providing access to medical and psychosocial assistance to SGBV survivors and enhance gender-sensitive structures for the reintegration of survivors as non-stigmatized members of society; and to sensitise the judicial system, state agents and prosecuting agencies. Public education and awareness campaigns are therefore necessary to empower vulnerable members of the society. Acts of SGBV need to be exposed by creating awareness of the vice and searching for strategies on how best survivors can be supported and the perpetrators brought to justice.

NGOs, FBOs and humanitarian organizations have an obligation to lobby for more aggressive legislative, administrative and policy decisions to eliminate SGBV as part of restorative justice. This can be achieved by conducting public awareness campaigns to sensitize the public on harmful traditional practices that reinforce gender inequality. A special fund needs to be established to compensate SGBV survivors and to further empower justice systems and prosecuting agencies on how best to deal with the vice. This can be achieved by working in consultation with the state machinery, human rights groups and the international community to eliminate SGBV while also establishing credible truth, justice and reconciliation commissions.

---

\(^{16}\) In this context, the Duty bearers include State Agencies, FBOs, NGOs, national and international organizations
Finally, each of the states in the Great Lakes Region need to demonstrate serious commitment to reduce acts of GBV by ratifying international conventions and declarations, and in so doing, acknowledging the seriousness of the problem. NGOs, FBOs and State machinery have an obligation to continuously expose acts of GBV, create awareness on the problem and search for strategies not only to curb the vice, but also to explore how best survivors can be supported and the perpetrators brought to justice. The survivors of SGBV need to be supported and protected - a responsibility for which each State ought to be held to account.
References


- UNIFEM (2008): Baseline Survey on Sexual and Gender Based Violence in Rwanda
  Report produced by UNIFEM, in collaboration with the Department of Applied Statistics of the National University of Rwanda
When Caesars Dance, Masks Multiply: Celebrating the Soul’s Otherness and Dionysian Initiation in Carole Maso’s *Ghost Dance*

Insaf Khémiri
University of Sousse, Tunisia

Abstract

With reference to Carole Maso’s *Ghost Dance* and focusing on one specific character, the Italian American grandfather, Angelo, the present paper tried to study the archetypal images of Caesars which fed the self-centred patriarchal Western ‘ego’ and, thus, poisoned the character’s soul, hindered his freedom, and affected his relationships. While the first part dealt with the four manifestations of ‘Caesar’: the Christian God, the patriarchal Father, the white Anglo-centric man, and the Italian ‘master,’ the second part attempted to highlight the importance of masks in freeing the ‘ego’ from the dominance of Caesars. The soul selects ‘its’ own society by discovering other images, gods, spirits, and ghosts and the character’s freedom depended on the ‘remythologization’ of these multiple facets of the psyche.

Keywords: Archetypes, the Dionysian, Otherness, Shamanism
As Holly E. Martin notes, U.S. ethnic writers revolt against the hegemonic idea of a “completely unified subject or self” (Martin 85) through including figures or ‘presences’ from ‘pagan’ myths and legends because the flexibility of these personages and their multiple facets might inspire the modern person with stories of transformation to facilitate the process of shifting identity in a multicultural world. Carole Maso is an Italian-American woman writer known for her avant-garde style in novels such as The Art Lover, AVA, and The American Woman in the Chinese Hat. Her first novel, Ghost Dance, portrays the life of an American family between the legacies of the past and the promises of the future. The present is in flux with the main character, Vanessa, looking for “some philosophy” (81) inside her. During her ‘dance’, Vanessa tells us about her artist mother, Christine Wing, her father, her brother Fletcher, and her grandparents.

This paper focuses on Vanessa’s Italian-American grandfather Angelo. Angelo tried to escape his ‘Old World’ to become ‘somebody.’ He came to the New World with his wife Maria seeking a new life, a new beginning for, as he says, “Europe became for the birds” and “Italy is for the birds” (77). However, Angelo reached a land where the history he tried to leave behind him was also there waiting for the little Caesars to feed the ‘American Self.’ After a long journey of searching for his ‘self’ in the New World, the Italian American character discovered Shamanic rites of transformation inspired by Native American Shamans, or Medicine Men, such as the ritual of the ‘Ghost Dance’. To become more human, the Ghost Dancer learns to accept the multiplicity of the ‘soul’ by embracing his own ‘otherness’.

The Realm of Caesar

Angelo cannot find his ‘new beginning’ because he is blinded by the American dream. He is bound by a “perfectionist obligation” (Miller 7) that makes him think about the end, the purpose, the goal. As David L. Miller states, “[a]ll our nurture—in education, religion, life—taught us to look for the end” (27) for “to be perfect is to be at the end, to end, happy ending” (Miller 25). The Italian-American character finds himself repeating the history of his ancestors: trying to become ‘the Greatest’, the richest, the most successful, the happiest, the perfect, the ‘real American’: “Maria,’ my grandfather said one day long ago, ‘today your name is Mary. Today I change my own name from Angelo to Andy. Today we are real Americans” (76). Indeed, Angelo wants to become a hero for, as James Hillman argues, the hero myth is the model for ego-development in the Western world (Blue 231) and as Vanessa proceeds, telling her grandfather’s story:

The evening of their second day here, my grandfather registered both of them for English classes at the local school. Right from the start he was a model student, staying late, trying to improve his pronunciation, preserving.

“I leaf in New Hope, Pencil-bannia,” he said hesitantly, concentrating impossible hard on every syllable. “I live, I live, I live in New Hope, Pencil, Pencil-vay-knee-a in the United States of America.” I’m sure my grandfather smiled when he got to the America part, for he could say it perfectly. He had being saying it his entire life.

“America begins and ends with the letter A. America. . . .

“The accent must go,” he said each night before bed. “The accent must go,” he said in the morning to his small son, Michael. “An accent is no good in this new country.” Maria sighed, exhausted by so much enthusiasm. (77)
The character left Italy, but he could not leave “the realm of ego, of Caesar” \((Blue\ 216)\). In his \textit{Myth of Analysis}, Hillman describes this ego as one ruled by an “Adamic-Apollonian consciousness” \((269)\). The archetype of the ‘Divine Child,’ the ‘Chosen One’ or the ‘Saviour’ who carries with him the cultural ‘baggage’ of his predecessors, haunts the Western world and makes people strive to achieve an unattainable perfection of the ‘self’. With this ‘Child,’ there is the ‘Father’ or the ‘Mother’ who nurtures the hero’s fantasies of ‘monotheism’: wholeness, oneness, pureness, whiteness, homogeneity, and, in a word, ‘Caesarness.’

In \textit{Ghost Dance}, there are four manifestations of this ‘Caesarness’ that possess the male character: The Christian God, the patriarchal Father, the white Anglo-centric man, and the Italian ‘master’. Monotheism is associated with dogmatism, racism, and colonialism. As Margot Adler argues, “Monotheism is a political and psychological ideology as well as a religious one” \((24)\). The crux of the problem is the Judeo-Christian understanding of ‘God’ as the omnipotent transcendent ‘One.’ In the name of this supreme God, hierarchal structures have become the norm in patriarchal societies granting those who are on top of the pyramid more power and legitimacy to ‘become divine’ and superior beings. As Whitehead remarks, “When the Western world accepted Christianity, Caesar conquered; and the received text of Western theology was edited by his lawyers” \((342)\) and since then, monotheism has been the doctrine of the higher races and ‘the Religion’ of chosen people while the narrow minds of the ‘inferior and the primitive’ cannot comprehend the idea of a “Supreme Creator” \((Adler 26)\).

A perfect example of a ‘Divine Child’ is the figure of ‘Christ the Shepherd’ because “the shepherd is a fundamental image of the sense of perfection” \((Miller 11)\). He is the “good” \((Miller 11)\) child who teaches his followers how to become ‘perfect’ lambs, “One Flock” \((Miller 11)\); “You, therefore, must be perfect, as your heavenly Father is perfect” \((MATTHEW 5:48 qtd. in Miller)\). This ‘Father’ is an archetype, a Patriarch who has been acquiring more power and supremacy thanks to an evolutionary reading of history, sociology, archaeology, arts, and geography, depriving the human being of his ‘freedom.’ This Father is also what haunts the imagination of artists like the Italian ‘masters’ who inspire Angelo. These masters reproduce the ‘Father-Divine Child’ archetypes by looking for ‘deification’ through ‘art’. To them, “Art is customary thought as a comforting form of relaxation, a kind of reward or bonus a prosperous society is able to afford certain f its members” \((Isaak 55)\). The master enjoys the “comfy chair” \((Isaac 55)\) of an artist, a ‘Creator,’ while his followers want to show their elitism by admiring ‘his’ Art/Creation. But James Hillman wonders: “[w]hy must the person who lives largely in terms of the creative instinct be damned out of common humanity?” \((Myth 39)\).

The image of God in patriarchal cultures is an expression of the reverence of the ‘eternal masculine stereotype’ and its manifestations:

There are a number of conceptions embedded in this picture. The image is hierarchical, based in ancient and feudal notions of kingship—God is above the world and rules it like a king. It is patriarchal, based in notions of the father’s power as supreme and unchallenged. It is racist—the heavenly Father is white, while sin and evil are dark and black. It is dualistic, separating the world into above and below, higher and lower, earth and heaven, time and eternity, good and evil. God’s realm, heaven and eternity, is both higher and better than earthly reality. \((Christ 27)\)
The white Anglo-centric culture of the New World reflects this belief in whiteness as related to 'perfectionism,' ‘goodness,’ and pureness. Indeed, as Liz Fawcett remarks, this dominating group uses religious discourses to “reinforce the notion of [its] innate superiority” (9) and transform the stories of their ethnic choices into a ‘nationhood’ rhetoric. Hence, national identity becomes more important than ethnic ones and the ‘Other’ ethnic groups are “constantly reminded that they ‘belong’ to a particular nation” (Fawcett 4).

In nation-states, the sense of grandeur is what predominates and leads to the construction of “superethnos, called the Germans, the French, the American people whose members think they have founded [the state] or should have a special role in running it” Baumann 31). Angelo admires “[t]his wonderful place, America, beginning and ending with A” (77) and as Baumann further explains:

Since modern nation-states arose in the West, roughly from 1500 AD onward, they had to overcome the boundaries of ethnicity among their citizens, and they did so by turning the nation into a superethnos. The nation is thus both postethnical, in that it denies the salience of old ethnic distinctions and portrays these as a matter of a dim and distant pre-state past, and superethnic, in that it portrays the nation as a new and bigger kind of ethnos. Most nation-states, however have failed to complete this project in that they included some ethnic groups and excluded others, or privileged some and marginalized others. (31)

The reason why superethnic nation-states are the predominant productions in patriarchal cultures is that this model enables small elite control the majority by defacing ethnic and cultural differences to impose their hegemonic views on people. In the United States, for example, the elite’s version of the story focuses on the mixed origins of people and, then, “everyone’s present identity would be the same = superethnically American” (Baumann 34). For this reason, Angelo tries hard to efface his ‘ethnic’ identity; ‘the accent must go’ and, moreover, as he confesses to his wife Maria, “We need new clothes for a new country;” he ‘must’ look like an “authentic” American and, hence, he bought “his own blue jeans and work shirts and boots” (77).

The patriarchs believe in the supremacy of the powerful; the one who has possession has the right to rule and to conquer and, as a consequence, they tend to claim their ownership of the roots, history, geography, arts, and stories. In these ‘superethnic’ states, ethnicity “invokes biological ancestry and then claims that present-day identities follow from this ancestry” (Baumann 19). Accordingly, nation-states cannot be religiously neutral. In the United States of America, narratives of the ‘chosen people,’ the ‘promised Jerusalem,’ the ‘Saviour,’ and the ‘Sacred Book’ define ‘Americaneness’ and inspire ‘The Americans’ with symbols to institute a “religion for all citizens” (Baumann 42). This civil religion is what marks ‘American nationhood’ which means that the United States is not a secular state because it is a superethnic nation-state where religion is rather ‘organized’ by the dominant elite that controls the ‘ethnoreligious capital’ of this “‘Nation under God, whose constitution stresses its ‘duty before God’ to ensure, in turn, the ‘rights of man [that] come from the hands of God,’ much as Tom Paine put it first. Its commonest means of social exchange, the dollar bill, bears three religious inscriptions and symbols” (Baumann 44).
The religious rhetoric of the ‘Chosen People’ and their supreme ‘masculine’ God provides patriarchs with the moral resources and symbolic images to construct what Liz Fawcett terms a “denominational religion” (Fawcett 9) and occupy the “cultural mainstream of their particular society” (Fawcett 10). This means that the dominant group makes of his religion a marker of nationhood to encourage “the ritual of collective worship” (Fawcett 5). Those who do not participate in this ‘collective worship’ of the “A,” “America” (77) are seen as ‘unauthentic’ hyphenated Americans and, hence, in nation-states, one is not allowed to ‘be’ ethnic. Therefore, ‘becoming’ ethnic is a subversive ‘choice’ that requires a revolt against the ‘religion’ of the nation-state and, thus, challenges the myths of Anglo-Saxonism, patriarchy, white supremacy, and capitalism.

Dionysian Becoming

When Angelo left to the New World, he becomes an ‘Other’. The ‘hero’ has fallen and is now an ‘ordinary man,’ a stranger in a land that has its Caesars. In his paper “The Stranger,” Alfred Schutz studies the figure of the ‘stranger’ and considers his/her role in subverting cultural hegemony: The stranger is ‘another Self’ (37);

[he], therefore, approaches the other group as a newcomer in the true meaning of the term. At best he may be willing and able to share the present and the future with the approached group in vivid and immediate experience; under all circumstances, however, he remains excluded from such experiences of its past. Seen from the point of view of the approached group, he is a man without a history. (97)

‘Without history,’ Angelo becomes able to move from the centre of the ‘mandala,’ that coherent symbol of unity and perfection, to the ‘borderland’ of outsiders and ‘Others’. He is looking at this white, patriarchal, Christian, and American culture from an ‘Other’s’ perspective. There, He is no longer a Caesar and, thus, discovers that this New World is different from what he expected and this is “the first shock to the stranger’s confidence in the validity of his habitual ‘thinking as usual’” (Schutz 99).

With this ‘discovery’ and the loss of “his status, his rules of guidance, and even his history” (Schutz 104), Angelo distances his ‘Apollonic ego’ who stands ‘there’ with American Caesars while ‘he,’ as a ‘soul’, is present with the ‘Primitive Others’ and, as the grandfather confessed to his grandchildren, “Primitive man was better” because “we had invented a system of hatred and fear so elaborate and so subtle and efficient—in short, so perfect—that it would be nearly impossible to crack” (129). Angelo feels “betrayed at the core” (130) and with this experience, he is reborn. Angelo’s awakening starts with a ‘vision in a dream’ where he is visited by a Native American ‘medicine-man.’ Thanks to this dream, Angelo enters, what James Hillman terms, a “Dionysian consciousness” (Myth 263) and “[t]o ‘enter’ means ‘to be initiated, and the Dionysian cult require[s] initiation” (Myth 281).

According to Jung, ‘rebirth,’ as a concept, has “five different forms,” and in Maso’s Ghost Dance, Angelo undergoes an “indirect rebirth,” a “participation in the process of transformation,” as Jung calls this fifth form of ‘rebirth’, where “one has to witness, or take part in, some rite of
transformation” (114-15). The metamorphosis of Angelo begins in his dreams when he is visited by a ‘Dionysian’ presence. This rebirth journey of “the transcendence of life” (Jung 117) involves the character in an “immediate experience,” a “spontaneous, ecstatic, or visionary experience” (Jung 118) where the character hears the ‘voice’ of the ‘underworld,’ the ‘unconscious,’ the deep realm of the ‘soul,’ the ‘Lord of Souls,’ another name for Dionysus. Then, Angelo meets his ‘psyche’ and recognizes that the “soul knows things we never taught it,” he tells his grandchildren, “the soul remembers things we didn’t think we knew. It knows languages we never learned” (80). This happening is what Jung identifies as a “natural transformation” or “individuation” that usually occurs through dreams and, hence, the initiate encounters the “other being,” or “the other person in ourselves-that larger and greater personality maturing within us,” that is to say “the inner friend of the soul” (130-31).

Welcoming this invitation to join the dance of his ‘inner friend,’ Angelo decides to go to this forgotten land to learn the languages of the soul. He voyages to visit the Native American ‘shaman,’ named ‘Two Bears’, “I dreamed of you,” Angelo says addressing the medicine-man, “I am here to learn” (78). The medicine-man helps him to “fetch” the soul that “has gone off” (Jung 119). He cannot learn the Ghost Dance without a soul; for this reason, “[t]o help make the soul pure and the body, too, the Indians have something that they call the sweat lodge ritual. Heat and steam are made by sprinkling water on huge white-hot rocks” (133). This ‘participation in a transformative rite’ allows the character to communicate with an “endless variety of figures,” the ‘dimanes,’ Underworld spirits (Hillman, Blue 43). The darkness of the lodge and the flowing waters recall the Underworld and summon the spirits from the “chthonic depths of the soul” (Hillman, Blue 43). The dream images become ‘presences’: James Hillman calls ‘remythologization,’ a process through which “psychic contents become powers, spirits, gods” (Blue 85).

With this rebirth, Angelo resurrects Pan and “when Pan is alive, then nature is too, and it is filled with gods” (Hillman, Blue 97). In this ‘ensouled world,’ “[a]ll things show faces” (Hillman, Blue 99). These faces mask Angelo’s ‘ego’ and frees him from Caesar: “Maria,” he says addressing his wife, “today your name is Wonderful Thunder” for the ‘Indians’ taught him about “the secret of rain, the dances of the sun, and the earth’s songs” and named him “Dreams of Rain” (79). They taught him how to do the Ghost Dance:

Everyone . . . must dance. There will be food and sweet grass. And the white man will become small fish in the rivers . . . . [E]veryone men and women began dancing the Ghost Dance. They wore the magic Ghost Shirts that were painted with sacred symbols and impenetrable to the bullets of the white man. . . . After doing the dance for a long time, men and women fell into trances. . . When they came back from the trances they told their dreams to others.

(197-98)

The ceremonial practice of the Ghost Dance is a rite of passage that enables the soul to find its images and to make “substitutes” (Hillman, Blue 105) by creating masks. The festive landscape with the frenzy shouts, the sweating bodies, and the coloured ‘masks’ create an atmosphere that is considered by Hillman an “initiation into the cosmos of Dionysus” (Myth 264). The result of this spiritual journey is to learn the ‘way of the shaman’ because a ‘Dionysian ‘madness’ helps the character to ‘become conscious’: with the blurring of religious and cultural boundaries, Angelo becomes “aware of [monotheistic] fantasies” (Hillman, Blue 39).
After performing the ‘Ghost Dance’, Angelo learns to communicate with his soul and free his ‘self’ from the domination of a heroic ego. He discovers that “[t]he soul is a beautiful boat, the soul is a slow, beautiful boat” (80). As Hillman further explains on such ‘Dionysian’ performances: “Training in sensitivity, participation in groups, and emphasis on body experience and imagination have become necessary first-level attempts to awaken psyche by making us aware of soul as it is extended through body, into others, and out to the imaginal realm” (Myth 28). According to Michael Harner, the father of ‘Core Shamanism,’ a Shaman (pronounced SHAH-maan) is a word from the language of the Tungus of Siberia, and has been adopted widely by anthropologists to refer to persons in a great variety of non-Western cultures who were previously known by such terms as “witch,” “witch-doctor,” “medicine man,” “sorcerer,” “wizard,” “magic man,” “magician,” and “seer.” (25)

Shamanism is a term that resumes the thoughts of ancient, medieval, and renaissance thinkers who were trying to understand the connections between the human, the natural, and the spiritual worlds. Shamans believe in the existence of spirits which can be encountered when the human being enters a “state of consciousness,” a trance, and thus becomes able to commune with creation and affect reality. As a practicing shaman, ‘Dreams of Rain,’ the Native American name of Angelo, “felt the wind against him on the mountaintop and praised, praised the Great Spirit. . . . He looked at the stones, knelt down and touched their smooth, flat heads. He knew the oldest gods lived there in stone. He lay on the sacred earth for a long time, and listened to the stones that speak” (77-78).

This Dionysian becoming is a universal rite inasmuch as Dionysus travels through the ‘imaginal realm’ to take different shapes and labels. While Hillman finds him in “Pan” and Wotan, to Jung he is the ‘Trickster’, the shaman or medicine-man that we find in characters like Hermes, Mercurius, and Yahweh (255-256). He is known for his “powers as shape-shifter, his dual nature, half animal, half divine” (Jung 255).

In Dionysus, borders join that which we usually believe to be separated by borders. The philosopher is also lover; Socrates is a drinking Silenus; the riotous Dionysus has but one wife, Adriane. Dionysus presents us with borderline phenomena, so that we cannot tell whether he is mad or sane, wild or somber, sexual or psychic, male or female, conscious or unconscious. . . . He rules the borderlands of our psychic geography. There the Dionysian dance takes place: neither this nor that, an ambivalence which also suggests that, wherever ambivalence appears, there is a possibility for Dionysian consciousness. (Hillman, Myth 275)

Entering Dionysus does not mean that the Caesar archetype disappeared, but that Angelo is no longer possessed by Caesar since, through ‘remythologization,’ he becomes open to a “multiplicity of voices” (Hillman, Blue 39) that awaken the character’s psychic archetypes. The masks represent the ‘Babel’ of the inner world because “[w]e are never only persons; we are always also Mothers and Giants and Victims and Heroes and Sleeping Beauties. Titans and Demons and Magnificent Goddesses have ruled our souls for thousands of years” (Hillman, Blue 5). Angelo is surrounded by Two Bears, Lone Star, Running Antelope, and other presences who “took [him] into their prayers. The sacred person prayed to the spirits of people who had died, of animals, of birds, . . . and he
prayed for [Angelo:] ‘Help the man who sits with us holding in his heart the whole burden of his race’, they chanted” (133-34).

Therefore, not only does Angelo change his Christian conception of God as a patriarchal male, but also reconsiders his Christian understanding of the human relationship to God. Human beings should not see in worshipping any deity a way to become a ‘Divine Child,’ an Apollo, because this kind of consciousness sanctions religious, social, and cultural hierarchies and leads to the birth of ‘Caesars’ who wear the perfect “mask of the divine patriarch” to “keep human beings in a state of infantile subjection” (Daly 18) waiting for the ‘Hero’ to save them. There should be a process of ‘becoming human’ to learn to respect each other’s humanity. After the fall of Caesar, Dreams of Rain identifies with his ‘Others’ and accepts his Otherness; he joins African Americans and Native Americans in the protest rally: “he suddenly felt the need to disassociate himself from the [watching white] people he stood with and . . . crossed the line and lay down with the demonstrators” while ‘Whites’ around them shouted, “Nigger-lovers!” and a white woman tried to “step on them” and Angelo shouted “Freedom now” (127).

Conclusion

Angelo’s dreams as a young man were about America as the Promised Land where one becomes able to nurture his ‘Self’ and enjoy a life of a ‘Caesar.’ But, then, another dream, “sometime later, something quite different, though unmistakably American, too” (223) saved him from his ‘ego’ and guided him to discover other possibilities: Angelo recognizes his ‘Otherness’ and becomes able to commune with a multiplicity of souls through the Ghost Dance. Then, he embraces his contradictions and learns to celebrate life. In Nature, every human being has access to this Divine language, but only those who open their souls to the ‘unknown,’ this Dionysian Underworld, and dare to doubt and question their ‘monotheistic fantasies’ can break free of an ‘Apollonic ego.’
References

Primary Source

Secondary Sources:


http://ijhcschiefeditor.wix.com/ijhcs
The Disruption of Space and Identity in Schizophrenic Experience

Amina Klibi
University of Carthage, Tunisia

Riadh Ben Rejeb
University of Tunis, Tunisia

Abstract

The aim of the present paper is to closely consider the notions of ‘space’ and ‘identity’ from two different perspectives of the human experience. We are most of all interested in the psychological realm to which we devote the major part. As such we intend to define a brain disorder known as schizophrenia in light of the duality of ‘space and identity’. We consider aspects of the deterioration of these notions that interact to further accentuate the breakdown of the patient diagnosed with the disease. These notions can be altered by factors that are not essentially biological or psychological. We argue that technology does also interfere to rework these notions as such bringing about a less rigorous effect but, still, triggering a less balanced human experience to dwell. This does not entail the onset of schizophrenia. However, it may lay behind other psychological problems. These may share to some extent a fragmented character that turn out to reveal aspects of a schizophrenic nature.

Keywords: Identity, Internet Technology, Schizophrenia, Space
1. Introduction:

The psychological balance of the human being is the outcome of the interaction between several factors, of which a simple disruption is most probably the first performer of a psychological pathology. In parallel path with the advancement in neuro-imaging studies, psychology is more and more inclined to define self perception and space perception as important to the stability of a person. Importantly, the disruption of the notions of space and identity reveals to be highly related to the onset of psychosis. One of the most severe types of psychosis in which this disruption is brought to its ceiling is schizophrenia.

The present paper aims essentially to reflect on this facet of the mental disease. Hence an objective is to define schizophrenia in light of the complex paradigm of ‘space and identity’. Then we will shift the focus from the perspective of ‘diagnosis’ to the one of descriptive while tackling the issue from a socio-cultural angle. In a digital network culture, ‘schizophrenic’ may turn out to be the ‘best word’ to describe the ‘connected’ community. Space believed to shape identity is inhabited not only physically but also virtually in an age where people of the same stay may need to disconnect in order to be connected (Doran, 2012). This suggests another use of the pathological term, ‘schizophrenia’, being a state of a whole community instead of being a state of a pathological mind. This shifts the concern from an unusual pathology to a shared terminology.

The paper is divided into three parts. The aim of the first part is to reflect on the notions of space and identity; to show how and why they are related. The second part is devoted to a purely psychological perspective which interferes a bit with some neuro-anatomical considerations. The intention is to show the psychological and anatomical basis of the relation between both concepts. In parallel path, schizophrenia will be defined with most focus on ‘self perception’ and ‘space perception’. In the last part, a socio-cultural perspective is adopted while referring to the role that technology undertakes to recreate the notions of space and identity. Focus will be on the negative side of the fact. This is meant to prepare the ground for us to suggest that the ever growing technology may be a chief cause for the emergence of many psychological problems in society.

Note: we admit that the identity of a person is a self-perception construct, hence, for the sake of simplicity, we will use the term ”self perception” throughout the paper interchangeably with ”identity” with no intention of literally equaling them.

2. Space and Identity; relation and correlation:

In this part, our intention is not to provide perfect definitions of these notions, nor do we intend to establish clear barriers between confounding terms. We simply propose that these notions as they can at their best be understood are quiet important and somehow interrelated. As living entities our interaction with space is a direct necessity that we experience from the prenatal phase until death that, supposedly, excludes us from time and space. This interaction is unique to each of us which reinforces its important aspect in shaping a person’s identity. This uniqueness is reflected in the following statement cited in John Welwood (1977):

‘Through every human being, unique space, intimate space, opens up to the world’
According to the Merriam-Webster online dictionary space can be defined as: “the opportunity to assert or experience one's identity or needs freely”. The perception of space, then, has a narrow connection with self-image and body awareness (Colpani, 2009) both of which are essential in creating the person’s identity. This way, the connectedness between space and identity is well established: Identity can be shaped by how one manipulates the space provided. The following figure taken from a website (with slight adaptation) may illustrate the idea:

Color contrast and choice of ‘how’ and ‘where’ to apply specific actions in the space provided serves to create an illusion about two different identities of famous personages; Hitler & Charlie Chaplin. The main point we want to deduce from the illustration simplified above is that the person’s existence is somehow traced in the space in which s/he moves. In the words of Doran (2012) space shapes identity. The trace you make will identify you from a set of thoughts transformed into existential acts that definitely mark the direct space in which you live, perform and act.

If we think about space as revealing aspects of identity then it normally follows that the notion of space we are so far considering is the interaction of different perspectives. On the basis of the work of John Welwood (1977) there are different types of space and this depends on how we choose to approach the notion itself:
While the perceptual space is the space “out there” in the words of Welwood, referring to the person’s ability to reach space through different modalities whether tactile, visual or auditory, the conceptual space is something we “physically” cannot reach into. However it is still measurable through mathematics and physics rules as explained Welwood (ibid.).

We are most interested in the last type, the so called psychological space. It is defined by Welwood as “space-as-experienced”. Minkowski (1970) better refers to this notion as the “lived space” (cited in Welwood, 1977). The term seems to allocate the directness of the actual perception of the spatial experience in live time. As Welwood declares, the term "lived space" refers to our “living, pre-articulate feeling of space” (1977).

There exist three interrelated kinds of lived space as classified by Welwood (1977):

- **The oriented space**
  - "involves the body as relating to physical objects and environment"

- **Feeling space**
  - “The spatial quality of the felt environment we create around ourselves”

- **Open space**
  - “totally unconditioned, formless dimension underlying all our activity”

The notion of Open space is very important. It excludes the self from the center. This way it smoothly refers us to the socialization process which gradually inherits children a kind...
of fear from the center less dimension of space. This fact can lead to becoming ‘‘threatened’’ by space and to developing various psychological problems. This is better explained in the previously mentioned work of Welwood. Important to us at this point is simply to witness the truthfulness of the connectedness between the notions of ‘‘space’’ and ‘‘identity’’. This in its worst manifestations can lead to some pathological conditions.

3. Psychological Perspective:

Any kind of imbalance that affects space and self perceptions will inevitably impair the person’s psychological stability. The imbalance of this duality has been extremely linked to the onset of an abnormal spectrum of behavior referred to by the term schizophrenia.

3.1. Introduction to schizophrenia:

In 1911, The Swiss psychiatrist, Eugen Bleuler, coined the term, ‘‘schizophrenia’’ to refer to a specific set of pathological conditions. The pathology itself was first distinguished some time before. However, the term used to refer to the disease was quite a mystifying word that tends to classify the illness as a kind of dementia. Bleuler’s term then comes to better suit the symptoms. Schizophrenia originates from Greek with schizo translating as split and phrene as mind. In Greek that would perfectly refer to the somehow ‘‘fragmented thinking’’ of people diagnosed with the disorder. Interestingly, schizophrenia is commonly misconceived as split or multiple personalities, which is not true. These are quiet separate conditions and there exist other technical terms to express them. (Information adopted from http://schizophrenia.com/history.htm#)

Schizophrenia is a severe psychiatric disorder in which the patient undergoes a pathological experience of distorted sense of reality. It is associated with ‘‘impairment in four principal domains of cognition: attention, working memory, verbal learning and executive functioning’’ (Renée Testa, et al., 2009). The highest cognitive functions are then disrupted marking the life with a serious trouble that makes the patient out of time and space to the extent of being ‘‘out of self’’.

According to Jablensky (1995), it is clinically characterized ‘‘by abnormal experiences’’ [Hallucinations] and atypical ‘‘beliefs’’ [Delusions],’’ disturbances of emotion and affect, as well as behavioral disturbances and impaired social functioning’’. Worldwide statistics estimate that at least one person in every hundred is subject to the diagnosis of schizophrenia.

Every pathological experience can be unique prior or towards the onset of the disease just as much as the fact that human experience, in its different aspects, is all unique. Generally, relatives report that at an early age of their loved concerned, especially after the onset of puberty, there was a kind of a sudden change of personality most described as stubbornness. They may also report the development of a ‘‘new’’ habit of talking to oneself or sometimes laughing out loud without seemingly a logical reason. A societal withdrawal has been also reported.
Schizophrenia goes through three stages and the earlier the diagnosis takes place, the better the prognosis will definitely be. However, professional diagnosis is not easy at the first stage of the disease. Many symptoms may be assigned to certain psychological changes linked to the onset of puberty or to certain environmental stressors. The psychiatrist/psychologist may go determined with the identification of a certain kind of depression till symptoms worsen to question the initial diagnosis.

According to the American national Institute of mental health:

```
" People with the disorder may hear voices other people don’t hear. They may believe other people are reading their minds, controlling their thoughts, or plotting to harm them. This can terrify people with the illness and make them withdrawn or extremely agitated. People with schizophrenia may not make sense when they talk. They may sit for hours without moving or talking. Sometimes people with schizophrenia seem perfectly fine until they talk about what they are really thinking.”
```

The previous passage describes some of the symptoms of the disease. Knowing that types are quite varied, the occurrence of several symptoms depends on the type of schizophrenia in question.

The causal psychopathological mechanisms are not perfectly understood as declare Gordana Rubeša et al., (2011). There is no simple magic blueprint with which we can explain the onset of the disease. Marcotte et al. (2001) declares that "Current research into schizophrenia has remained highly fragmented, much like the clinical presentation of the disease itself.” (Cited in Simon J. Hadlich et al., 2010). Most of all, the disease is due to the interaction between several factors of different nature. The following account, being very simplified, does not pretend to cover the theoretical rationalization and does certainly overlook a lot of important details.

Many of the information below are taken from the academic online course (October 2015) entitled Caring for people with psychosis and schizophrenia in which the lead educator is Dr Juliana Onwumere . (Available at https://www.futurelearn.com/courses/caring-psychosis-schizophrenia/1)

Schizophrenia is believed to be the result of the interaction between genetic and biological factors that necessitates the co-occurrence of some psychological/environmental factors to develop. Very rare genetic mutations are supposed to occur so to mark the body with a genetic predisposition. A neuro-chemical imbalance results in the occurrence of specific positive symptoms such like delusions. We can cite the Dopamine neurotransmitter as an example. Excess Dopamine may disrupt the normal thinking and make everything looks like significant. The patient starts considering surrounding things as signals or private messages. A lot of patients report receiving messages from TV. This neurotransmitter grasps their attention to everything and so they feel as if they are the center of everything which further nurtures the irrational prevailing thinking. Anomalous observations are documented in relation to cerebral mechanisms and structure, all revealing to be highly related to symptoms of the disease.
What actually triggers the onset of the disease is usually additional to the pre-existing genetic or biological abnormality. James Koenig (2014) states that “Early-life exposure to environmental stressors such as [...] childhood psychological trauma [has] been identified as possible risk factors of schizophrenia”. Drug use and most particularly the cannabis drug, are much related as well to the onset of the disease.

3.2. Space & Identity in schizophrenia: a fragmented self experience

If the wellbeing of the person is a construct of several factors some of them psychological and biological, the pathology we are so far considering disrupts the normal condition while disordering a lot of these factors with much like a fragmented style. Important to the person is his/her sense of self and how s/he manages to unconsciously construct a self understanding of ‘facts’ whether physical or psychological that reflect his/her identity. But identity is also a social construct so to admit the importance of external and societal conditions. This ‘outer’ condition is drawn into an ‘outer space’; the surrounding space. In schizophrenia, the patient witnesses a deterioration of the important notions of both: space and identity.

Je-Yeon Yun et al. 2013 declare that “anomalous sense of self is central to schizophrenia” and that “distorted implicit self-awareness is a core clinical manifestation of the disease (Parnas and Handest, 2003; Thakkar et al., 2011, cited in Je-Yeon Yun et al. 2013). This sensation is further accentuated by transcending the boundary of the self as a physical entity to reach up different components of actual human perception. M. Mancini et al. (2014) state that “Fragmentation appears a basic feature of lived time, as well as space, body and selfhood”. This fragmented awareness overwhelms the patient and cut him/her off the normal life spectrum.

Space and identity, as discussed earlier, are inevitably correlated. For a stabilized state of mind, the human being needs a steady conception of space and, of course, identity. From a psychological perspective, this may reflect and explain the spiritual crisis experienced by the schizophrenic patient. A painful disruption of reality interferes with the experience of space in a way that brings the amount of damage sufficient to dislocate the patient who loses in the process the notion of the self. The deterioration of spatial capacity along the distorted cognitive identity leads to a sore human experience.

At this point we are interested in sharing the following text, taken from an article written by Clara Kean, a patient diagnosed with schizophrenia. She wrote the article after being stabilized with medication. At the time of her writing the article she was an undergraduate from the Department of Physiology and Pharmacology in the UK:

‘’the real ‘me’ is not here anymore. I am disconnected, disintegrated, diminished. Everything I experience is through a dense fog, created by my own mind, yet it also resides outside my mind. I feel that my real self has left me, seeping through the fog toward a separate reality, which engulfs and dissolves this self. [...] it is purely a distorted state of being [...] My thoughts, my emotions, and my actions, none of them belong to me any more [...] Schizophrenia has silenced my real self” Clara Kean (2009)
This abstract reveals how the patient perceives herself, and how she experiences space in which she exists. The following figures are meant to illustrate what we can deduce at least from this short passage.

Very perplexed, confused and lost, Kean seems to be fractured into meaningless thoughts to which she totally surrenders. The pathology she cares has really “silenced” herself. She admits the non existence of her real self as if the one with which she actually performs is a disguise or may be a phantom of her reality. The external force controlling her thoughts, which in fact is nothing but one of her delusions, is defeating her. Her spatial awareness is totally disrupted. She feels unrelated to everything and she marks her ‘admitted’ self with stigma.

The disruption of space is a normal condition when the sense of self itself is lost and fragmented. The disconnection from space is rooted in the non-existence illusion of the self the same way as feeling distorted results in stigmatization and disintegration. The psychological relatedness between space experience and self perception is well established. If one thinks of his self as bodiless and non-existent then this will mark the first step towards the
fragmented space experience. Interestingly, there is an underlying anatomical connection strengthening the link between the two.

Neuro-pathological data acknowledges the evidence for frontal (Michael H. Thimble, 1990) and parietal lobes (Yildiz. M, et al., 2011) dysfunction in schizophrenic patients. Several neuro-imaging studies brought the evidence supporting that the prefrontal cortex is extensively involved in spatial working memory (Kessels. R.P et al., 2000). Any disruption occurring at the level of frontal lobe will inevitably disrupt this function and space perception will end up impaired to a certain extent. Besides, it is well admitted that there is an integral link between the personality of an individual and the pathology of the frontal lobe (Chow. W.T, 2000). The personality of the person is tightly linked to his/her identity. Thus, the frontal lobe is responsible for a stable conception of the person’s identity which entails that any trouble taking place at that cerebral element will so far affect the person’s identity.

In parallel path, neuropsychological data have shown that parietal lobe damage results in deficits of “spatial orientation” (De Renzi, 1986; cited in Min-Shik Kim & Lynn C. Robertson, 2001), “spatial attention” (Posner, Walker, Friedrich, & Rafal, 1984; cited in Min-Shik Kim & Lynn C. Robertson, 2001), and “spatial awareness” (Bisiach, Capitani, Luzzatti, & Perani, 1981; cited in Min-Shik Kim & Lynn C. Robertson, 2001). Therefore, parietal lobe is responsible for spatial judgment and spatial recognition. Other studies have also shown that it may play a role in self perception and therefore self identity. Studying the dysfunctional role of parietal lobe during self-face recognition in schizophrenia, Je-Yeon Yun et al. (2013) show how “deviant effective parietofrontal connectivity may underlie altered experience of self in SZ”. The inferior parietal cortex is believed to control “body image, concept of self, sensory integration, and executive function” Nasrallah (2012). Indeed, several preceding studies stressed that considerable processing for “spatial perception, attention, and self-awareness” do actually occur in the parietal lobes (K. Vogeley, et al., 2003 ; M.F.S. Rushworth, et al., 2001; cited in Yildiz. M, et al., 2011).

We can, therefore, deduce that related disrupted space experience and deteriorated self perception is rooted in the anatomy of the brain. This explains the dilemma of the patient and reinforces the connectedness of the notions of space and identity.

In relation to space perception in schizophrenic experience, Henry A. Narallah (2012) declares that “the unconscious perception of movement and spatial orientation arising from stimuli within the body itself” is impaired in schizophrenia. This refers us to the notion of proprioception which means essentially “the unconscious perception of movement and spatial orientation arising from stimuli within the body itself” (http://www.thefreedictionary.com/proprioception). Nasrallah(2012) indicates that mental proprioception “enables one to be fully aware of his identity and self-boundaries, and that his thoughts and actions are generated from within his own sphere of consciousness[...]. In schizophrenia, this function is altered. This perfectly explains why the sense of self in this pathology is fragmented along space perception.

M. Mancini et al. (2014) suggests that we can categories disorders of lived space
experienced by patients diagnosed with schizophrenia into three categories. The following is his account:

The patient diagnosed with schizophrenia may be unable to be fully conscious of his/her body which affects self awareness and also movement perception. The coherent sense of self and the surrounding space fade into confused illogical sensations. The phenomenon of fragmentation as such seems to perfectly describe the schizophrenic experience. Indeed, this phenomenon is believed to be a common denominator of the schizophrenic experience (M. Mancini et al., 2014). Patients experience this fragmentation both internally and externally what would be very painful for them to handle. Whilst the identity is split into pieces, the space as perceived and experienced may fall into unrelated items. Items themselves may lose dimensions or any physical detailed criteria. The patient may feel unrelated to the space in which s/he dwells despite how intimate in fact it used to be. STRANGE is what summarizes the way s/he conceives things and sometimes the way s/he admits conceiving one’s personal self. The self becomes a puzzle of detached pieces hard for the patient to gather. Clara Kean (2011) admits trying suicide in search of her ‘real self’. A paradox that is not easy to figure out unless aware of the never ending sense of disintegration and self-destruction to which the patient is submitting.

4. Socio-cultural perspective:

Definitely, internet technology is changing our lives with the power of transcending space and time boundaries. It offers new paths of knowledge and acquaintance. Beyond doubt lies the positive role it plays in extending human resources and shaping a new world image that we praise for goodness. Nevertheless, a dreadful side effect is veiled underneath the joy of this sensation. Whether conscious of the fact or still yet, internet is altering our identities and confusion to who we really are is establishing strong barriers between truth and lie. Transcending spaces, we are also excelling the truthfulness of our existence as a part of a
social community. Community in this digital age seems to fade in the walls of ‘Facebookers’ and ‘Twitterers’; in the walls … of the virtual.

Digital media is constantly changing how we act in space and how we perceive space itself. We spend most of our time surfing the web, skipping over different websites, sometimes consulting different windows at the same time, as such occupying different spaces with an omnipresent performer. As Colpani states “our exploration of reality becomes progressively mediated, abstracted from physical space” (2009). This way, virtual space is prevailing over real space which definitely leads virtuality to dominate our actuality. We end up with a relative exclusion of reality in a fashion that recreates the notion of the occupied space.

How we perceive space in which we live and act and how we understand the notion itself is changed into something unfixed. Space notion is all the way varying with the ever shifting space parameters linked to the virtual illusionary force. We are there and not there. We navigate in a way that makes us ‘over existing and over existence’ in the words of the artist Ryan Trecartin (cited in Doran, 2012). We seem to get acquainted to this virtual existence because certainly it pleases us through promising opportunities.

Annet Dekker (2009) observed that the use of advanced mobile devices “facilitates isolation in a private space, which is at the same time immersed in public space” (cited in Colpani, 2009). She admits that while preferring to be in contact with “distant others”, people, in fact, are “distancing themselves from the people around them” (ibid). Instead of directly contacting people we are most of the time virtually connecting to them. You may have a lot of connections but none of them is well experienced. The direct physical contact is all the way missing. To establish a strong connection with others, physical contact used to play a great role; direct eye contact, as a mere example was a key to create affection and friendliness.

This new aspect actually recreates the notion of space in a fashion that undermines the opportunities we think we have in the real. One of the most central skills we hope our children master well is how to engage in society “the open space” and how to interact with other people. The importance of social engagement is most highlighted when it reveals to be the cue towards detecting many psychological problems when it shows deficiencies. The network technology is rather encouraging withdrawal from society while offering virtual spaces full of virtual opportunities leading to a certain kind of isolation. If you have problem facing people and interacting effectively you are most likely undergoing a certain psychological problem not to say a specific pathology.

Having hundreds of friends in the virtual space may confuse our thoughts onto what friendship essentially means in the crowded Cyber world and whether in the real we still have that huge number of relations! You may end up feeling very lonely in a crowded virtual space. Many admit losing touch with their “real” friends while spending hours “keeping up contacts with the “friended”” (Turkle, 2011). The best phrase to describe this state may be “alone together” in the words of Turkle (2011).
In the same realm, technology has a say in recreating a person’s identity. Our newly based preferences are actually affecting our selves‘ perceptions and hence our identities. Technology interferes to alter the way we think about ourselves and the way we choose to act in the virtual community.

Doran (2012) argues that the self ‘‘as represented on a Facebook profile is one that is uploaded, modified, and edited according to the parameters of the site’’. Turkle (2011) describes how young generations keep on ‘‘composing and recomposing their digital personae’’. One can then argues that when it comes to this kind of social media every person ends up fragmented into selves instead of a unite self. Turkle (2011) says that in presence of many games, sites, worlds one has to remember ‘‘the nuance of how you have presented yourself in different places’’. You are constantly changing and adapting your ‘‘connected’’ self.

We are externally defined. ‘‘Information about and images of oneself must fit into the predetermined categorical boxes presented in the layout’’ (ibid). When using Facebook, twitter or the like, there is a constant feeling of being watched and that feeling causes people to mind every posting, every comment in order to build a positive image about one self. ‘‘We come to see our identities as those we would like to have or that we want people to see rather than who we really are’’ (Taylor, 2011)

Internet users are constantly thinking how to construct a positive image that pleases others so that they become ‘‘accepted’’ and approved. ‘‘Impression management and self promotion’’ summarize the daily struggle of many of the internet users. We unconsciously ‘‘sacrifice our true self-identities and shape our identities to conform to what the digital world views as acceptable identity’’ (Taylor, 2011)

We may think that we are using technology but in fact technology is using us while alienating us from others and more importantly from our real selves. We are in a daily basis recreating our identities to fit into the standards of the network community. Editing oneself to the extreme of ideal image about oneself, users ‘‘create highly fictionalized and performative identities’’ (Doran, 2012). Internet technology is consuming time, effort and the parameters of personality construction. Teenagers are so busy liking, so busy posting and commenting on others’ profiles. They are constantly thinking to update their profiles with truthfulness and sometimes the lie is needed to fascinate others and maintain the brightest social image in front of public. A new Big Brother is watching over the steps of everyone. The psychology of the person will be somehow affected by a certain feeling of instability and insecurity. The psychological need to be accepted by others and cherished is more and more accentuated and
instead of thinking to please ourselves we may end up more inclined to please others. Self control is as such vibrating in the virtual empire.

Societal withdrawal is very important to thoroughly consider. People are less interested in ‘‘directly’’ communicating with others, less engrossed in formulating relationships in the real since the virtual offers a lot of mediated intimacy. Doran (2012) declares that the Facebook site is enabling another kind of interaction to dwell; by ‘‘looking at a user’s profile, one is able to learn about that individual, depending on the information they disclose, wall posts by the individual or friends, postings on other users’ walls, and uploaded photos’’. This type of interaction is ‘‘paradoxical’’, since the Facebook user is still interacting with another user by the mere viewing of their ‘‘digital representation’’, however the interaction is ‘‘one-sided’’ (ibid). This way the definition of ‘interaction’ as needing at least two individuals is simply violated and out-dated.

The spirit of the virtual is dominating and prevailing. This dilemma is highlighted inside families since interactions seem to be reduced due to the influence of internet use. We may spend more time in front of screens than chatting with our relatives in the same household. Jose Van Dijck (2005) argues that the digital mode ‘‘suits the contemporary, fractured notions of family and individuality’’. This suggests another use of the term, ‘schizophrenia’, being a state of a whole community instead of being a state of a pathological mind which shifts the concern from an unusual pathology to a shared terminology.

In this concern Doran (2012) suggests that the internet in the prevailing network culture allows one to fracture its identity into a multitude of roles, forming a conception of self that she argues is ‘‘schizophrenic.’’

The emerging technologies enhanced by a network culture are creating a new ground for possible emergence of several psychological problems. If we think of schizophrenia as the mental disease alienating the patient from reality and isolating him/her from the normal flow of life, are not we chairing this alienation and isolation with too much internet embodiment in our lives? Turkle (2011) describes young people most engrossed in popular social networking sites as ‘‘feeling more alive when connected, then disoriented and alone when they leave their screens’’. The physical reality is less enjoyed and less required since it may entail loneliness and isolation among other depressive feelings. The sensation of blurred identities may be taken to the extreme while establishing a feeling of instability and insecurity. Excess engagement in the virtual world may lead to addiction and loss of self control which along the former outlook may generate several psychological problems.
5. Conclusion:

In the digital network culture, the term Schizophrenia may turn to describe a whole trend of thought and behavior, fully destructive of what stands to be an ecological definition of the term community. If patients diagnosed with this pathology are unconsciously drawn to a harsh sense of loneliness, added to the misery of living out of the real, the ‘un-diagnosed’ community is choosing consciously to share, to a certain extent the bitterness of fragmented thought, space and identity.
References


The Concepts Term and Terminology in the Modern Azerbaijan Language

Almammadova Sabina Mammad
ANAS, Baki, Azerbaijan

Abstract:

The vocabulary of a language always changes in connection with the development of the society; it is renewed and becomes richer. Every innovation observed at different fields causes the occurrence of lexical units serving to generation of the adequate reaction at the language being one of the organic attributes of the society according to this innovation, naming new notions and concepts occurred in connection with progress. In other words, development of sciences and the society makes necessary occurrence of lexical units serving to naming of separate notions of the learned objects. This process shows itself at different times and at the separate areas of the earth and it is reflected at the language facts of the different languages. That event has an international character. All changes and renovations occurred in the development of the society, science and technique over all periods of the history appear on the terminology layer of the vocabulary. Every newly arisen denotation shall be named by the lexical unit of the language not depending on the place of the Earth where they occurred and it is realized by terminological means. Enrichment, systematizations and putting in order of the terminological layer at the account of changes and renovations occurred in this layer of the language at all historical periods of the society and the language is on the focus of attention as one of the most necessary processes of the language. This paper studies the concepts of “Term” and “Terminology” in the Modern Azerbaijan Language.

Keywords: term, logical, function, language, linguistics.
The vocabulary of a language always changes in connection with the development of the society; it is renewed and becomes richer. Every innovation observed at different fields causes the occurrence of lexical units serving to generation of the adequate reaction at the language being one of the organic attributes of the society according to this innovation, naming new notions and concepts occurred in connection with progress. In other words, development of sciences and the society makes necessary occurrence of lexical units serving to naming of separate notions of the learned objects. This process shows itself at different times and at the separate areas of the earth and it is reflected at the language facts of the different languages. That event has an international character. All changes and renovations occurred in the development of the society, science and technique over all periods of the history appear on the terminology layer of the vocabulary. Every newly arisen denotation shall be named by the lexical unit of the language not depending on the place of the Earth where they occurred and it is realized by terminological means. Enrichment, systematizations and putting in order of the terminological layer at the account of changes and renovations occurred in this layer of the language at all historical periods of the society and the language is on the focus of attention as one of the most necessary processes of the language.

Fast development some fields stimulates development, enrichment of the terminology and stipulates for arising of new terms and term-word combinations in order to express clearly some notions and concepts in the Azerbaijani language. Thus, formation of relevant units in the Azerbaijani language has a natural character. It would be more expedient to give explanation of the notions of term and terminology before analyzing the ways and methods of arising of the terms. Because, for the first it is necessary to determine correctly the notion “terminology” while investigating the terminological lexicology of every area from the point of linguistics point of view and while elucidating its theoretical and practical matters. The terminology formed from the combination of the words “terminus” from Latin and “logos” from Greek is used in two forms in the linguistics: 1) the system of terms encircling the notion so certain areas of science, technique, art, production and social life; 2) the section learning the terminological lexicology and its regularities. Thus, it was approached from the different aspects to the notion of terminology by the linguistics. M. Gasimov writes: “Firstly, it is necessary to distinguish “terminology” having different scientific directions learning the terminological lexicology of the language, its development regularities from “terminology” in the meaning of collection of terms belonging to the different parts of science and technique” [1,p.27]. That is to say that the terminology that is one of the leading notions is used in two meanings in the linguistics, both as a fief of the science of linguistics and in the meaning of collections of terms concerning certain fields. A. Farajov states the terminology only in the meaning of collection of terms: “Besides forming special layer of the lexicology, the terminology is the collection of the terms concerning certain fields of science, technique, art and etc.” [2,p.204]. The notion of terminology is explained as following in the survey dictionary named “Explanatory linguistic terms”: “Terminology is the collection of the relevant terms in the system of notions of a certain field of science, technique, art and social activities. Technical terminology. Social-public terminology. Trade terminology. Linguistics terminology” As well. The section of the linguistics that learns the terminological lexicology, its development regularities is called “terminology” [3,p.364]. Generalizing the ideas of the linguists about the terminology, it is possible to come to a conclusion that the term used in two meanings in the linguistics is accepted as the terminological system of the language and the name of the linguistics learning this system. Besides, it is necessary to state that in the most cases the second
meaning of that word is forwarded in the linguistics and it is specially noted that the terminology is an independent field of science having special investigation objects, methods and theoretical basis.

Utilization of the term “terminology” in the linguistics in the meaning of the section of linguistics learning the terminological system of the language including the terminological lexicology concerning all sections of science shall be considered expedient. That is to say that the problem of term, terminology is included in the general linguistic theory and the notion of terminology is the section of linguistics learning the terminological system in one meaning. It is the result of the reaction shown to multiple terminological names formed by modern science and production that recently the linguists have shown serious interest to the terminology. Thus, notwithstanding a lot of research work implemented in the general linguistics in connection with the terminology the problems related to this section have not been totally solved.

Though that the notions as term and terminology have been in the focus of attention of the linguists for a long time, there are different ideas about their essence and nature.

It is known that in the historically developed areas of technique the terminology of the Azerbaijani language has been formed enough. But there are certain terminological areas where formation of the terminological units – terms upon those areas has recently become active and it is related to the development of those areas. Formation, regulation and unification of terms in the different areas stimulate development of the terminology.

The linguists have made statements from different points of view in the explanation of the essence of the terms organizing the basis of the terminological layer of the language. The term is derived from the word “terminus” and means limit, border. The term is a typical name given to distinguish the notions of technique and art, the events taken place in the nature and in the society and the production processes [4. p.268]. It is possible to generalize a lot of definitions with the terms in the linguistics and it concerns certain notions or objects as term-linguistic sign and it is a word or a word combination in the system of notions of the concrete area of science or technique. The term itself can be a word or a word combination, but their relation has one meaning. The terms always expresses a notion or an object (or some same objects). That is to say that the term is the word and the word combination naming the scientific or production-technological notions and having definition having special utilization section. Thus, the term is identical with the notions within the limits of certain areas of science or technique. The meaning of the term exists not depending on the context within the limits of this area. Firstly, it is necessary to appeal to word that is a general notion in order to understand the aspects differing the term from generally used words and the essence of the term, because the term is a word. And the word is the principal unit if the language. The term is the lexical category as word. The term has a nominative character as word and expresses things, events and certain concepts. The term is an historical category as word. It is formed in the certain period of the history of the language and has certain meaning. But the terms are not special words; they are the words that have special function. As the terms differ by their definitive function (the function of determining certain notions) besides the nominative function implemented by the words of the language (the function of expression of certain descriptions about a thing), take a special place among the vocabulary units of the language from the point of view of meaning and utilization and the scientific information are delivered exactly and in compact form.
Therefore, as the terms express certain notions and aspects used in the different areas of science and technique, the meaning of those notions are understood by the specialists.

Thus, the term expresses certain notion totally determined in the scientific-technical areas. But the terms express the notions not as other words included in the vocabulary of the language, but in the relevant order and at this time their specific signs appear. This character appears during mutual relation of the term and notion and causes to show themselves as one of the factors that stipulate determination of the different aspects of other words. When we touch the matter of relations of the term and notion, we shall state that firstly, it is the relation between the appearance forms of the objective reality and their name in the logical meaning. The term and notion appears at the same time, under the condition of close mutual relation. There is the relation of event and essence, form and context between the term and notion. The notion the term is not called as an ordinary word, the notion is attached to the term that is to say that the meaning of the term is its appointment. If the appointment is not known, the term is not known either. That is to say that the notion the term is not called as an ordinary word, the notion is realized thanks to it.

The translation of the terms “term” and “terminology” is given as the following in the "Russian-Azerbaijani dictionary" [5, p. 317]:

The translation of the terms “term” and “terminology” is given as the following in the "Russian-Azerbaijani dictionary" [5, 317]: Term - term,. Terminology - terminology, terms.

As it is seen, the term “terminology” was translated in two meanings. It is stated that the term “terminology” is sometimes used in two meanings, both in narrow, limited meaning and in wide meaning: “while stating “terminology” in the limited, narrow meaning, the system of terms reflecting the collection of the system of notions of a certain (concrete) area of science, technique, economy, culture and agriculture”. In the wide meaning while stating “terminology”, general collection of the terms used in all areas is deemed.

Besides, it is necessary not to forget that the terminology is an independent area of the linguistics that has special investigation object, methods, theoretical basis [7, p. 28].

All stated matters make confusions from the grammatical point of view in the theoretical matters of the terminology. We think that it is possible to eliminate abovementioned shortcomings, homonyms of the term very easily. Thus, utilization of the term “terminology” in the meaning of the linguistic section showing the terminological system of the Azerbaijani language (the terminological lexicology concerning all scientific areas is included) is expedient.

Thus, the term is the word and the word combination the has a definition, expresses, names the specific notions exactly formed from the logical point of view in the different areas of science and technique, economy and culture and bears special function. The notion of terminology is the section that learns the terminological system of the language.
References


- Nuriyeva M. The military words of the ancient Russian and Turkish language, Military knowledge №1. 2001.

- Розентал О., Теленкова М. Словарь-справочник лингвистических терминов. М., 1976, с.142


- Sadiqova S.A. In terms of physics and mathematics Baku, 1998
‘Displaced’ Muslim Women in Monica Ali’s *Brick Lane* and Leila Aboulela’s *Minaret*

Sherine Fouad Mazloum
Ain Shams University, Cairo, Egypt

Abstract

This paper seeks to explore the complex representation of Muslim women characters in two texts by two Muslim writers who live or have lived in Britain namely Monica Ali and Leila Aboulela. Since the two writers come of Asian and African/Arab backgrounds, their delineation of their “Muslim” female characters allow for a more comprehensive view of the daunting experiences of migrant ‘ordinary’ women who find themselves triply displaced as women/Oriental/Muslim. Both novels reflect the empowerment of the female characters Nazneen and Najwa who grapple with their migrant experience. This paper seeks to read the two novels as offering alternative forms of knowledge of Muslim women ‘displaced’ experiences. It acknowledges that the two novels trace the processes of transformation of the female protagonists in a metropolitan context, but focuses on how this process entails several reflections on their experience as triply displaced. The paper relies on Spivak’s concept of displacement and uses its insights to reflect the case of Muslim women’s displacement. The paper refers to Talal Asad’s discussion of the idea of Islamic tradition to highlight its argument that Islam is part of the tradition that influences Muslims’ subjectivities whether they embrace the religion or not. Hence, to work out their displacements, both protagonists undergo a process of empowerment and agency during their journey of finding a place in the world.

Keywords: Spivak’s displacement, Muslim women, Leila Aboulela, Monica Ali, contemporary British fiction.
Both Monica Ali and Leila Aboulela write their fictions in post 9/11 context which repeatedly shows Islam “as the Western world’s other” (Nash 5). Nash points out that critique of traditional beliefs in diasporic ethnic communities in favor of “the liberal western values” (Nash 27) is common among migrant fiction. Many critical views stress *Brick Lane*’s tendency to critique Bengali values in favor of liberal western values. To name just a few, Marx, Cormack and Brouillette focus on western feminist readings of *Brick Lane*. John Marx uses *Brick Lane* as an example that women change in the process of globalization. However, his observation that “*Brick Lane* considers Nazneen and Hasina as working in a comparative field whose complexity exceeds the binary of North and South” (17) draws attention to the need to reread such a complexity. Alistair Cormack claims that *Brick Lane* “is particularly of interest as an examination of the double bind that female migrants face, treated as alien by their host nation and as commodities by the men in their own communities” (700). Sarah Brouillette reads *Brick Lane* as a gentrification tale in which Monica Ali portrays women’s liberation from traditional gender roles becoming the provider for her daughters at the end (428). On the other hand, Eva Hunter suggests “Najwa’s limitations [in *Minaret*] reflect Aboulela’s own aversion to and misunderstanding of Western culture” (92). Other critical views on Monica Ali’s *Brick Lane* (2003) and Leila Aboulela’s *Minaret* (2005) have tended to interpret the two novels within the larger framework of the debate between secular feminists and Islamic feminism. Tancke sums up the argument concerning the two novels pointing out that Monica Ali’s *Brick Lane* and Leila Aboulela’s *Minaret* along with Zadie Smith’s *White Teeth* are novels “emblematic of the current cultural and political tendency to problematise facile visions of multiculturalism and to instead draft a more complex account of multicultural reality; they exemplify the parallel trend in British fiction to question exclusively celebratory accounts of multicultural coexistence” (4). He adds “Similarly to *Brick Lane*, Leila Aboulela’s *Minaret* is set against a backdrop of blurred cultural allegiances and post-9/11 Islamophobia. It differs from *Brick Lane*, however, in the way in which Islam features prominently in the female protagonist’s sense of self. *Minaret* does not involve a stereotypically “Western” emancipatory tale, conflicted though one of these might be, as does *Brick Lane*” (8). Tancke’s contention is similar to other reviewers and critics who seem to categorize the two novels as representing two opposite stories of Muslim women with Ali’s character opting for western feminist modes of agency and the other adopting an essence of Islam.¹

In fact, both novels reflect the empowerment of the female characters Nazneen and Najwa who grapple with their experience of tripled othering as Muslims, colored (Asian/African) and female in the western metropolis city of London. This paper seeks to read the two novels as offering alternative forms of knowledge of Muslim women ‘displaced’ experiences. It acknowledges that the two novels trace the processes of transformation of the female protagonists in a metropolitan context, but focuses on how this process entails several reflections on their experience as triply displaced.
Both Nazneen and Najwa undergo a process of empowerment which allows them to come to terms with the challenges of migrant experience. Despite different interpretations of this process of empowerment, both Nazneen and Najwa experience displacement and their empowerment stems from their agency and their engagement with their newly acquired systems of knowledge. The aim of this paper is to examine the two female protagonists’, Nazneen and Najwa, transformation in light of Spivak’s concept of displacement analyzing the process of empowerment as an attempt to deconstruct the assumed binary opposition that categorizes Brick Lane as the triumph of secular feminism and Minaret as the representative of “Halal fiction” (Ghazoul). This paper considers both female protagonists to be part and parcel of a displaced experience that is far more complex than the simple choice of west over east paradigm. Talal Asad’s discussion of Islam as a shaping social force in the lives of practicing and non-practicing Muslims is used to shed light on Muslim women migrant experiences as the complex product of multiple factors with the cultural encounter with the West as one of these factors. Exploring Nazneen and Najwa’s complex interactions across and through displacement, ambivalence and ambiguity allows transcendence of the polarities configured by the reception and categorization of these two novels. Hence, this paper will discuss the concept of Spivak’s displacement and its relevance to the current analysis of Muslim female experience in the two texts, it will highlight Talal Asad’s ideas on Islamic tradition and point out how they provide new understanding of Muslim women representations in Ali and Aboulela’s fictional accounts and finally show how the two texts could be read as two facets of the ordinary Muslim women migrant experience in a metropolis city despite attempts to consider them as representative of a polarity showing the triumph of secular feminist western views versus an Islamic feminist alternative. The underlying argument rests on the idea that the complementary reading of Nazneen and Najwa as different yet ordinary Muslim women living in the west would allow transcendence of the stereotypical categorization of Muslim women as the Westernized emancipated model or the Orientalist subjugated/passive fundamentalist. The paper is divided into four parts including an overview of Spivak’s concept of displacement in relation to the two female protagonists’ triple displacement; an analysis of the two protagonists’ complex relation with their bodies and clothes especially the veil and finally the significance of Asad’s discussion of Islamic tradition in offering new insights into the two Muslim female protagonists processes to find a place in the world.

Spivak’s Displacement and Displaced Muslim Women:

Our postmodern age is characterized by an increasing sense of displacement. Najwa associates her sense of displacement with her color and her migrant position, “For the first time in my life, I disliked London and envied the English, so unperturbed and grounded, never displaced, never confused. For the first time, I was conscious of my shitty-coloured skin next to their placid paleness” (Aboulela 174). Displacement in this sense is linked to lack
of stability, lack of a home country, and a coloured skin. Najwa, the dark-coloured Sudanese living in London echoes Homi Bhabha’s concept of the “unhomely” which regards migration as “a process of displacement and disjunction that does not totalize” (5). Bhabha’s concept sets the basis for postcolonial theorization on migration and highlights how Aboulela and Ali’s texts are interpreted as examples of migratory experience and how the issue of colour contrasts and alienates both Nazneen and Najwa from the surrounding whiteness of the English. On the other hand, the two protagonists have no real connections with their original nations, Bangladesh and Sudan respectively. Throughout Nazneen’s thirty five years – she is born in 1967 and lives in London from 1985 to 2002- her only connection with her homeland is her sister’s Hasina’s letters. The parts of Minaret which actually take place in Sudan show Najwa as an onlooker, an outsider who spends her days in the American club listening to Bob Marley and eating “pizza, pepsi, chips and tomato ketchup” (Aboulela 46). Najwa’s alienation is caused by her “[coming] down in the world” (Aboulela 1). Before becoming a maid, she used to feel more comfortable in London than Sudan, “Our First weeks in London were OK. We didn’t even notice that we were falling….Omar and I could not help but enjoy London” (Aboulela 56).

As Muslim women and third world migrants, Nazneen and Najwa are triply displaced. Spivak explains in her article “Displacement and The Discourse of Women” that Derrida builds on Nietzsche’s formulation of women’s capacity for masquerade and uses the woman figure as a model of uncertainty to criticize phallocentricism. However, the woman remains “a substitute”; the hypothesis or “the supposition”. Spivak dwells on the notion of woman “originary displacement” in Nietzsche and Freud but she also makes use of Derrida’s notion that although all human beings are displaced, in a discourse that privileges the center, women alone can be diagnosed as such. Spivak contends that the feminist project has privileged woman in a way that reproduces her displacement. What Spivak warns against is that even in a deconstructionist discourse that aims to expose essentialism, women are still the excess subject to the projection of male failures. The feminist project of the subaltern seeks to rewrite the social text. This rewriting, according to Spivak, is not an establishment of new meanings but an attempt to expose the errors in the established system of meaning. In “Bonding in Difference”, an Interview with Alfred Arteaga, Spivak states that deconstruction entails the exposure of errors by “constantly and persistently looking into how truths are produced…. [it is] a persistent critique of what one cannot not want” (24).

On the one hand, the western discourse of power has created versions of truth about women that subjugate and marginalize them. On the other hand, discourses on Muslim African and Asian women have created versions of truth about Islam and Muslim women that dehumanize them. The Islamophobia fetish is contested and exposed through an analysis of the Muslim migrant subaltern woman’s displacement. Spivak’s model allows “the displaced figuration of the ‘third- world woman’ caught between tradition and modernity.
(Spivak, *Critique of Postcolonial Reason* 304) to speak though it does not guarantee that she will be heard (Spivak, *Critique of Postcolonial Reason*, 247). Since the subaltern is a “divided and dislocated subject whose parts are not continuous or coherent with each other” (Spivak “Can the Subaltern Speak?” 276), the place of free will of this constituted sexed female subject is “dubious” (302). The argument on displacement is closely linked to the ability to exercise free will and to be heard. These two abilities are part of the transformation processes that involve Nazneen and Najwa. Analyzing these processes expose how “truths” about Muslim migrant women experience are constructed as part of the larger patriarchal discourse, whether Western or Islamic, which silences women.

Nazneen and Najwa’s migrant position places them in constant otherness which gradually allows them a special form of knowing. Their fictional narratives problematize the relationship between their bodies, their Islamic/orientalist culture and their newly acquired form of knowledge. Both characters think of themselves as limited and even stupid and they constantly look to the men around them for guidance. Najwa contemplates her position reflecting her inability to be independent, “I wished I could feel like an emancipated young student driving her own car with confidence….” In Khartoum only a minority of women drove cars and in university less than thirty per cent of students were girls- that should make me feel good about myself. But I preferred it when Omar was with me,” (Aboulela 10). Despite her apparent limitation, Najwa bears the change of fortune with admirable strength. Her wisdom is constantly shown especially when contrasted to Tamer’s idealistic impulsiveness. Reflecting on the fact that there are no differences between men and women in the grave, Najwa is stressing not only a religious belief but also an emancipatory philosophical note, “All through life there were distinctions-toilets for men, toilets for women; clothes for men, clothes for women- then, at the end, the graves were identical. Similarly, Nazneen is “an unspoilt girl from the village….Not tall. Not short. Around five foot two. Hips are a bit narrow but wide enough, I think, to carry children. All things considered, I am satisfied” (Ali 22-23). The narrative constitutes her as a sexed female subject following Spivak’s concept. Gradually her knowledge allows her to see beyond the oppositional framework of Karim, her lover, who is always looking for an opponent to engage with. Commenting on the withdrawal of The Lion Hearts, the opponents of Karim’s activists’ group in the novel, The Bengal Tigers, Nazneen suggests “Make another march”; She adds “Why you have to do it against someone?” When she declares “make it into a celebration. Some singing, some dancing” (Ali 346), she is presenting an alternative insight to the east/ west polarity which reproduces violence. An insight which this paper claims comes from the two female characters’ displaced positions which allow them to expose the stereotypical constructions of systems of meaning reenacted by Western and Islamic patriarchal discourses.
The sexual engagement with men of the world, Karim and Anwar, allow Nazneen and Najwa access to information and knowledge beyond their understanding. Karim in *Brick Lane* and Anwar in *Minaret* represent forms of patriarchal knowledge but being displaced coloured individuals in the metropolis underlie their confusion and expose them as failures. They project their failure on Nazneen and Najwa fulfilling Spivak’s interpretation of women as substitutes. However, the two women characters outgrow their lovers through their ability to perceive things differently. In an article entitled “To Know What’s what: Forms of Migrant Knowing in Monica Ali’s *Brick Lane*”, Angelia Poon points out how Ali’s text shows that “only through the acknowledgment of the instability and relativity of knowledge that any foundation of political action or moral praxis may be built” (428). Chanu, Nazneen’s husband, embody the quest for absolute and certain knowledge which he tries to seek in London by studying different disciplines but which he confesses that he cannot attain except back home in Bangladesh. His sense of displacement is highlighted in his conversations with another displaced character Dr. Azad. Both Chanu and Azad are in search of “a place in the world” (Ali 264). They reflect another form of male migrants’ failure. Both Azad and Chanu experience the going home syndrome which will supposedly provide the stability of knowledge. Dr Azad explains how migrants construct a concept of home which has all the truths to help them face the confusions and challenges of the host country, “They don’t ever really leave home,” he says. “Their bodies are here but their hearts are back there” (Ali 32). Both Chanu and Azad try to forge a constructed fictional place through their conversations, “They did what friends do, talked. From time to time their conversational paths intersected. More frequently, they talked around each other” (Ali 247). However, it is Nazneen who is aware of their illusionary quest for a place in the world, “It no longer amazed Nazneen that these fictions should be so elaborately maintained. What worried her now was the possibility of their collapse. The fence that they formed, though rotten, was better than nothing” (Ali 246). Chanu and Azad embody the displacement and disillusionment of migrant’s experience which perpetuates Orientalist and Imperialist discourses. The same argument is reflected in Anwar’s inherent inferiority in *Minaret*. Commenting on one of the Western converts to Islam whom Najwa praises; Anwar perpetuates the Orientalist discourse of inferiority “You say that because as Muslim our self esteem is so low that we’re desperate for approval. And what greater stamp of approval can there be than a white man’s?” (Aboulela 159) Both novels acknowledge the resurgence of imperialist/orientalist discourse post 9/11. Poon points out that knowledge claims became necessary post 9/11; however, “the tendency to reach clear cut principles of religious fundamentalism and totalizing knowledge systems” are constantly being challenged by *Brick Lane*. Poon adds that the only thing Ali asserts is “the instability of knowing” (429). The same argument extends to *Minaret*. The two novels span over periods of time which witnessed the rise of racial, ethnic and religious antagonism. *Brick Lane* focuses on the unfolding of events over two decades from 1985 to 2002. Similarly *Minaret*, despite its technique of shifting time and place, covers the periods from 1984 to 2004. They show that
misconceptions in systems of knowing are inherent in patriarchal discourse. Phallocentricism in this sense is not the outcome only of Western civilization but is echoed in Islamic fundamentalism as well. What Nazneen and Najwa represent is a way out of these polar meanings that can embrace difference. Hence, it is one of the attempts to reach Bhabha’s middle ground. A reading of how the two female characters expose the fixity of established discourse emphasizes the instability of knowing which enables agency.

The two novels underlie the instability of knowing. Both Nazneen and Najwa do not refer to a stable home land that has all the right answers whereas Chanu, Karim, Tamer and to an extent Anwar seek a ‘truth’ which privileges one side of the polarity whether it is a fixed concept of home, Islam, or activism. Najwa and Nazleen reflect the deconstructionist tendency of Spivak’s concept and evade the binary opposition represented by some postcolonial studies which argue that the Occidental epistemological production of knowledge is set against an Oriental inability to produce Knowledge or the essentializing fundamentalist claim to truth. Spivak warns against forms of western knowledge that “[decouples] secularism with Judeo- Christian traditions” and “de-transcendentalize all other religions but the religion that governs …[western] idiom” (An Aesthetic Education in The Era of Globalization 394). Spivak points out that secularism informed by Judeo-Christian concepts have been rendered as universal (396). That is why she urges the exposure of this alleged universality to allow race specific, class-specific and gender specific voices to hold up a just world (396). Asad highlights a similar point to Spivak when he discourages the “notion of Europe as the true locus of Christianity and the Middle East as the true locus of Islam”; he further objects to religion “being represented as the essence of a history and a civilization” (Asad, “The Idea of an Anthropology of Islam” 4). Hence, both Spivak and Asad argue against essentializing forms of knowledge and acknowledge the possibility of exposing errors in systems of knowledge.

Spivak’s argument highlights two important points for this research. First, that Western discourse of democratic secularism is closely linked to religious and cultural discourses of power. Second, that a post-occidental discourse requires a realization that knowledge formation of western modernity occurred within a metropolitan-peripheral framework that affected how we as Muslims conceive European/Western origins and hegemonized western conceptual authority. Spivak understands that the subaltern cannot speak and that it is the role of the intellectual to try to voice a different set of social values to resist those of the dominant forces. Spivak’s argument allows us to consider Ali and Aboulela’s novels as an attempt to voice such an alternative set of social values. Giving voice to their ‘different’ Muslim women characters, Ali and Aboulela try to show how Muslim women can find their chosen place in the world despite attempts to hegemonize them whether within western or Islamic fundamentalists’ frameworks. They show that both frameworks essentialize and categorize Muslim women.
What *Minaret* and *Brick Lane* attempt to show is that the subaltern Najwa and Nazneen have no “originary essence”, to use O’Hanlon term, to relate to. Instead their existence is that of fragments and their consciousness is constructed through their awareness that there is no “essential belonging” (O’Hanlon 81). In discussing the politics of knowledge production, Edward Said in *Orientalism* has argued that “because of Orientalism, the Orient was not (and is not) a free subject of thought or action” (3). Zine contends that Said’s argument means that discussions of Muslims or Muslim women have already been discursively determined. As a result, there is no pure space from which to create counter-narratives that capture the complexity which recurrent archetypes obscure and deny (Zine).

In the process of exposing errors in systems of knowing, both Nazneen and Najwa come to unlearn what they have known in their earlier days. Najwa’s consciousness is shaped by realizing the lies that she lived in Sudan. Her father is a corrupt official “Mr Ten Per Cent” (Aboulela 44) and her brother is a drug addict. Nazneen’s realization that her mother committed suicide and did not die in an accident like she was told makes her question the Bengali culture and her belief in fate. Nazneen’s whole life revolves around her firm belief that her life is in the hands of God and hence she has no choice. She is told that her own introduction to the world was a miracle ordained by God. During her son’s illness, she contemplates her options and resorts to the declaration pronounced years back by Banesa, the mid wife, “Fate will decide everything in the end, whatever route you follow” (Ali 16). Nazneen’s fatalism is a perpetuation of Orientalist discourse referred to by Said in his *Orientalism* as part of the colonizer’s power over the colonized. Nazneen is depicted as a woman who is convinced that “it [is] her place to sit and wait” (Ali 101). Such an essentialist concept of Islam is not only part of western discourse but of Islamic fundamentalists’ discourse as well. However, Nazneen’s journey of knowing allows a critique of both the fatalist cultural tradition of Bangladesh and western essentialist thought. Similarly, Najwa’s consciousness does not perpetuate traditional Muslim stereotyping despite critiquing western misconceptions of Islam. Adopting Islamic faith in Najwa’s case is an exercise of free will not the surrender to fate. This is especially evident in the times she reflected on how she believes that she must pray but she cannot. Choosing to become a devout Muslim is the decision she takes when she feels ready to adopt a new way of life. The two protagonist’s processes of knowing are shaped by two decisive factors: their bodies and clothes.

**Muslim Women and The Body:**

Toril Moi shows that woman’s subjectivity is rooted in her body. Explaining De Beauvoir’s understanding of the concept, Moi writes

> For Beauvoir, the body is our medium for having a world in the first place. We perceive the world through the body, and when the world reacts to our body in a more or less ideologically oppressive way, we react to the world. Our subjectivity is constituted


through such ongoing, open-ended interaction between ourselves and the world. We constantly make something of what the world makes of us. (391)

The body says Moi, “is perhaps the fundamental ingredient in the make-up of our subjectivity. Yet subjectivity can never be reduced to some bodily feature or other”. Subjectivity is “open-ended interaction” with the otherness of the world (391). In “Displacement and the Discourse of Woman”, Spivak points out that a woman’s body is part of her displacement. It is the site of coercion and marginalization which reproduce her otherness. Spivak writes “within the historical understanding of women as incapable of orgasm, Nietzsche is arguing that impersonation is woman’s only sexual pleasure” (170). Whereas Spivak links the coercion of women’s body with the inability to speak, Moi associates exploring the body with the ability to interact. Regaining the body is an integral theme in both feminist and postcolonial feminist studies. Judith Butler draws attention to the fact that subordination is both “the condition for and instrument of agency”; therefore, the conditions and processes that secure the subject’s subordination entail her becoming a self-conscious agent (10). Hence, the ideas of the female body as a trope, a site for subordination and agency, and a vehicle for a simultaneous interaction within the woman and with the outside others applies to Nazneen and Najwa’s negotiations with their bodies despite the difference of the outcome of these negotiations. On the one hand, Njawa covers up her body by the veil while Nazneen ravels in the experience of gaining control over her body embodied in her ice-skating at the end of the novel.

Nazneen’s sexual relations involve masquerading, indicative of Spivak’s argument. Her body is a sexed object manipulated by both Chanu and Karim who see her as a substitute for home. The narrator constitutes Nazneen’s body in terms of patriarchal/colonial discourse as a symbol of the nation and a substitute for men’s lack. “How did Karim see her? The real thing, he said. She was his real thing. A Bengali wife. A Bengali mother. An idea of home. An idea of himself that he found in her” (Ali 354). Nazneen’s problematic relation with her body is stressed during her nervous breakdowns: "beyond the body there was nothing: that was where she wanted to be" (Ali 324). During her nervous breakdowns, she constantly refers to herself as ‘she’ highlighting her displacement and mimicking her husband’s habit of addressing her as “she” in order to “emphasize her fragility”. Gradually, the third person reference is explained as a sign of defying him: “Oh, she is […] listening. But she is not obeying” (Ali 341). The idea of empowerment through regaining control of one’s body is further stressed by reference to aunt Mumtaz back home. Aunt Mumtaz’s performance of allowing her body to be inhabited by a jinni and the claimed authority she exercises over the villagers is an example of masquerading which allows freedom and agency. The jinni as patriarchy-ordained “spirit” (Ali 397) allows the aunt freedom and agency.

Both Nazneen and Najwa gain insight into their displaced positions through their sexual affairs with Karim and Anwar respectively. The context of the sexual affair reflects
the sinful feelings each of them feels as a result of the heritage of Oriental/Islamic tradition. However, the affairs raise the question of freedom and free will while acknowledging the sinful aspect. Therefore, Nazneen’s internal focalizer reflecting on her sexual affair with Karim says

They committed a crime. It was as crime and the sentence was death. In between the sheets, in between his arms, she took her pleasure desperately, as if the executioner waited behind the door. Beyond death was the eternal fire of hell and from every touch of flesh on flesh she wrought the strength to endure it. [...] she gave herself up to a power greater than these two, and she felt herself helpless before it. When the thought crept into her mind that the power was inside her, that she was its creator, she dismissed it as conceited. How could such a weak woman unleash a force so strong? She gave in to fate and not to herself. (Ali 299-300)

Nazneen’s sexual affair allows her empowerment but problematizes the theme of fate and free will which is integral to the novel; this is further emphasized by reference to Hasina’s story. Hasina, Nazneen’s sister, has made her choices in defiance to traditions. She chooses her husband and she chooses to escape from him when he starts beating her. Because of poverty and social pressures, she becomes a prostitute. Hasina’s free independent character is reflected in her letters written in broken English. When she is dismissed from the factory for having an affair with her landlord, she is forced to become a prostitute fulfilling the allegations against her. Her story reflects the ordeal of Bengali women’s lives that are ruined by rumors of sexual affairs: “I thinking this one thing all day. They put me out from factory for untrue reason and due to they put me out the reason have come now as actual truth” (Ali 169). It also reflects the theme of fate versus free will. Hasina contends that she is responsible for her fate, “Everything has happen is because of me. I take my own husband. I leave him. I go to the factory. I let Abdul walk with me. I the one living here without paying”(Ali 166). Rather than a victim of Fate, Hasina holds herself accountable: “Fate, it seemed, had turned Hasina’s life around and around, tossed and twisted it like a baby rat, naked and blind, in the jaws of a dog. And yet Hasina did not see it. She examined the bite marks on her body, and for each one she held herself accountable. This is where I savaged myself, here and here and here” (Ali 340-341). It is quite problematic to determine whether Hasina’s story shows that women have no chance of freedom in an Asian Bengali context. However, this reading sounds viable when contrasting Hasina’s story to Nazneen. Despite Razia’s warning to Nazneen at the beginning to shop in Sainsbury’s rather than in the Bengali shops: “if you go to our shops, the Bengali men will make things up about you. You know how they talk. Once you get talked about, then that’s it. Nothing you can do” (Ali 59).This echoes the effect of rumors on Bengali women’s lives in Hasina’s story but Nazneen enjoys more freedom in the western city of London. Both Najwa and Nazneen experience freedom through anonymity. Since no one knows them, they can be free to do what they want and do get away with their sexual affairs. Nazneen enjoys roaming in London streets unnoticed “They could not see her any more than she could see
God” (Ali 56). Regardless of being the silent subaltern other, Nazneen is free and her newly acquired agency is definitely the result of her newly acquired knowledge. The narrator accentuates the agency entailed in freedom, “Anything is possible. She wanted to shout it. Do you know what I did today? I went inside a pub… I walked mile upon mile, probably around the whole of London…I found a Bangladeshi restaurant and asked directions. See what I can do!” (Ali 59). Similarly, Najwa’s anonymity allows her freedom. Alone in a London restaurant, Najwa is self-conscious of her freedom “It wouldn’t be done in Khartoum for a woman to be alone in a restaurant. ‘I’m in London’, I told myself, ‘I can do what I like, no one can see me’” (Aboulela 128). Reflecting on sexual freedom, she remarks that years back “getting pregnant would have shocked Khartoum society, given my father a heart attack, dealt a blow to my mother’s marriage, and mild modern Omar, instead of beating me, would have called me a slut. And now nothing, no one. This empty space was killed freedom” (Aboulela 175). It is quite ironic that Anwar tells Najwa that by losing her virginity, she has become part of the majority. Najwa echoes Anwar’s argument, “He was right. I was in the majority now, I was a true Londoner now…. ‘I know you’re Westernized, I know you’re modern,’ he said, ‘that’s what I like about you – your independence’” (Aboulela 176). Unlike Ali, Aboulela shows that sexual intercourse has further subordinated Najwa and that it is through faith that she gains her independence. In Brick Lane, the contrast between social values in the west versus those in the east extends to the other characters not simply the protagonists. Thus, the narrative commenting on Chanu who longs to go back home though he does not pray and he drinks says “back home if you drink you risk being an outcast. In London, if you don’t drink you risk the same thing” (Ali 90). Freedom is associated with doing things that would have been prohibited or at least unacceptable back home. The emphasis is on how this freedom allows Nazneen and Najwa better understanding of their positions unlike the male characters who remain imprisoned within the migrant dilemma.

Working out their relationship with their bodies is part of the process of Nazneen and Najwa’s agency but Najwa chooses to cover her body. The body as a site of domination and subversion is part of the system of meaning of both Western and Eastern discourses. Nazneen and Najwa’s experience with their bodies echoes Davies’ contention “the body emerges as a site of mundane acts of resistance and rebellion as well as compliance” (Davies 12). Domination in body politics happens when “the female body is symbolically deployed in discourses of power […] which justify social inequality and power hierarchies based on gender and other forms of bodily difference” (Davies 10). Hence, the body becomes the site of domination and resistance. When Najwa decides to cover herself and wears the veil, she is subverting the Western system of meaning which associates the veil with subjugation and domination and at the same time exposing the Islamic/oriental patriarchal manipulation of covering women bodies since they are the site of sexuality, temptation and disgrace. By insisting that leaving Anwar and wearing the veil is her own free willed choice, Najwa is
offering an alternative way of ‘knowing’ Muslim women. This fulfils Aboulela’s aim in writing which she repeatedly refers to in her interviews.

**Muslim Women, Clothes and the Veil:**

The debate over Muslim women and their emancipation and empowerment is closely linked to the discussion of the issue of clothes especially the veil or hijab or head scarf. Western and Islamic feminists’ debates over the issue of Muslim women covering their bodies show the issue of covering as either the emblem of Muslim women’s oppression or a sign of piety and adherence to Islamic faith. Sayyid argues that western women have associated authenticity with unveiling and saw that veiling is a violation of feminine subject position (9). This has perpetuated a western gaze to Muslim women; this gaze continues to be upheld by western women who claim to be defending the liberation of all women. This assumption reproduces the orientalist discourse of othering. Besides, such a limited assumption about the veil perpetuates essentialism and reductionism. Mahmood’s statement about “the profound inability within current feminist political thought to envision valuable forms of human flourishing outside the bounds of a liberal progressive imaginary” (155) echoes Sayyid and others. Similarly, Leila Ahmed draws attention to the increased attention to the veil as a sign of Muslim cultural authenticity as well as an epitome of Islamic inferior treatment of women (Ahmed 14).

Aboulela attempts to show veiled women, like herself and Najwa, enjoying a different kind of empowerment. This is part of her project to represent an alternative meaning to the western stereotyping of Muslim women. Al Karawi and Bahar sums up the issue of the veil in this novel:

Leila Aboulela's *Minaret* provides the reader with an opportunity to explore how the veil is a metaphor or trope whose diversity can only be understood by unpacking the lived experiences of the Arab Muslim woman in the West…. The narrative also reinforces the argument that veiled women are not muted personas nor are their identities simple products of patriarchal norms …*Voluntary veiling* is believed to be an empowering tool of self-expression through which women increase their relationship with their own faith and culture …. Aboulela’s work, in showing the rootedness of religion in the lives of many Muslim women, thus fills a gap in Western representations of Muslim women. (256, emphasis added)

Similarly, Hunter, despite her criticism of *Minaret*’s limitations, asserts that “Aboulela’s fiction challenges what Poole notes as one of the “consistent” features of the British press, its “negative formulation of Muslims”, particularly as violent” (qtd in Hunter 96). However, Hunter also echoes western secular feminists’ assumption about Islam. She adds that one important aspect of Aboulela’s fiction is “perhaps to forestall Islamophobic
responses from readers who perceive her religion as linked to violence, she advocates for her female characters of faith an Islamic form of quietism, their withdrawal dovetailing with patriarchal views of the virtuous conduct required of women” (97). Steiner further emphasizes that Aboulela shows Muslims who are trying to practice their faith in an unsympathetic environment. She exposes racism and anti-muslim sentiment which “inserts her female characters into Orientalist/Africanist discourses” (41). Aboulela’s comments in one of her interviews about her reluctance to wear the veil in Sudan because her friends there would have ridiculed her as back-warded reflects how Sudanese elite internalized the western gaze and hence dismissed the veil as sign of submissiveness and confinement. Aboulela admits, “In Sudan, writers and intellectuals are usually liberal and left-wing and so on, and ... they want me to be the liberated woman, so they are appalled by this halal writer thing” (Interview with Leila Aboulela, 91). Together with Ali, Aboulela show that Muslim women are complex subjectivities that the west has represented as either “absent” or “distorted” (Sayyid 3).

Clothes acquire more significance in Brick Lane. Nazneen and her sister Hasina work in the textile industry. Nazneen patches jeans at home while Hasina works in a factory. Besides, Nazneen’s empowerment process is enabled through her new fashion project. In addition, the sari is a cultural dress that reflects Asian identity and tradition. Therefore, the issue of clothes is integral to Brick Lane’s preoccupation with Nazneen’s empowering process. On the one hand, Nazneen associates her freedom with clothes and believes that if she changes her clothes, her whole life will change; the narrator reflects “It was clear, that clothes, not fate made her life” (Ali 298). The narrative points out “Suddenly, she was gripped by the idea that if she changed her clothes, her entire life would change as well. If she wore a skirt and a jacket and a pair of high heels, then what else would she do but walk around the glass places on Bishops gate and talk into a slim phone and eat lunch out of a paper bag? If she wore trousers and underwear, like the girl with the big camera on Brick Lane, then she would roam the streets fearless and proud” (Ali 297). Clothes here are empowering. On the other hand, Razia and Mrs Isalm outfits epitomize the east/west encounter and accentuate their displacement. They wear western style shoes that do not match their saris. Nazneen notices that Razia and Mrs Islam look strange wearing strange shoes which underlines the encounter of East and West: “carpet slippers on over black socks” for Mrs Islam (26) and “black lace-up shoes, wide and thick-soled” for Razia (27). This distortion is emblematic of the clash of civilizations that migrants experience and it is part of the bigger need to be accepted in the host country. When Nazneen at the end goes skating wearing her sari, the scene has many intertwined meanings. On the one hand, ice skating symbolizes the challenges presented by western life and its value systems. Nazneen’s reluctance to try ice-skating before is part of her uncertainty. Coming to terms with her displacement allows her to accept the challenge symbolized by ice skating and the fact that she keeps her sari on is an indication that she does not need to be the “westernized girl” after
all (Ali 385). Her newly acquired sense of ‘knowing’ means that her place in the world could be a reconciliation of both her Muslim/Asian and migrant positions. Another reading would interpret not relinquishing her sari at the end as a writing back; a counter narrative. In all cases, when she starts ice skating with her sari on, Nazneen is appropriating western systems of meaning to show her own power as a Muslim third world migrant woman who has a place in the world. Her agency is gained through economic independence, and the power she feels from knowing.

Agency and newly acquired perceptions allow both characters to emerge as stronger, independent women who come to terms with their triple displaced experiences. This could be further understood in light of looking at Islam as a tradition rather than a religious faith.

Muslim Women and Islamic Tradition:

Both Najwa and Nazneen’s processes of self-realization follow a pattern of movement from a “coerced body” to a “docile body” or “a disciplined body” to use Asad’s terms. Asad refers to the body that is teachable by tradition in his “Thinking about Tradition, Religion and Politics” arguing “to be teachable is not only to be able to listen to another person (one’s teacher) but also and especially to be able to listen to oneself, that is a skill to be acquired and perfected through tradition”. Both Nazneen and Najwa learn to listen to their selves and outgrow their teachers: Karim and Anwar. Their listening ability allows them to critique the essentialized identities that Chanu, Karim, Anwar and Tamer represent. They are also able to save their coerced bodies through reconciling traditional and western systems of knowing. The female protagonists reach a middle ground whereas the male characters refuse to accept hybridity. Karim exclaims indignantly “to be cool, you had to be something else – a bit white, a bit black, a bit something … you couldn’t just be yourself. Bangladeshi” (Ali 263). Tamer, in Minaret, expresses another aspect of Muslims’ migrant’s existential dilemma: for he views himself as both a western and a Muslim while the way he looks “Tall, young, Arab-looking, dark eyes and the beard, just like a terrorist” inspires unease in the people walking in St John’s Wood (Aboulela 100). It is his Muslim identity which he decides to accentuate; he says “My mother is Egyptian. I’ve lived everywhere except Sudan: in Oman, Cairo, here. My education is Western and that makes me feel I am Western. My English is stronger than my Arabic. So I guess, no, I don’t feel Sudanese though I would like to be. I guess being a Muslim is my identity” (Aboulela 110). Unlike Karim and Tamer, the female protagonists because of their fluid identities can constantly negotiate their displacements and exercise their agency. They are able to find a place for themselves in the west through their own choices. These choices are far more complex than the simple privileging of western over Islamic values.

To examine Islam as a tradition in light of Talal Asad’s views allows for avoiding sweeping generalizations and focusing on the complexities and particularities in which Islam
is lived. Asad sees that the problem of Muslims who are trying to find a place in the west is always seen as one of assimilation into European value systems. He warns that this assumes that Europe’s structure and identity are fixed “as a secular egalitarian society”. Asad adds that similarly Islam is assumed to be an “illiberal religion” with a “sacred and absolute character” (Asad, “Do Muslims belong in the west?”). Asad asserts that people have presupposed notions of “West” and “humanity” as universal concepts that will make us act responsibly towards others. However, “to behave ‘humanely’” is perfectly possible without the notion of western humanity. He adds “It is not necessary to have this grand concept of humanity in order to behave decently”. Asad points out that Islam is “a way of living that is already in place” and therefore requires no “intellectual [justification] in order for it to proceed” (Asad, “Do Muslims belong in the west?”). Asad argues in “The Idea of An Anthropology of Islam” which he republished in 2009, “Islam as the object of anthropological understanding should be approached as a discursive tradition that connect variously with the formation of moral selves, the manipulation of populations (or resistance to it) and the production of appropriate knowledges” (10). Asad’s argument is suspicious of the notion of reification of Islam as unchangeable fixity. In this sense, he is like Spivak who draws attention, building on the work of deconstructionists, to the essentializing notion of Enlightenment Humanism. Asad proposes a reconsideration of Islam and Christianity since “forms of interest in the production of knowledge are intrinsic to various structures of power, and they differ not according to the essential character of Islam or Christianity, but according to historically changing systems of discipline” (7). He points out, in accordance with Spivak’s argument that “we need to find concepts that are more appropriate for describing differences” (8). Asad sums up his argument

the process of trying to win someone over for the willing performance of a traditional practice, as distinct from trying to demolish an opponent’s intellectual position, is a necessary part of Islamic discursive traditions as of others…A theoretical consequence of this is that traditions should not be regarded as essentially homogenous, that heterogeneity in Muslim practices is not necessarily an indication of the absence of an Islamic tradition. The variety of traditional Muslim practices in different times, places, and populations indicate the different Islamic reasonings that different social and historical conditions can or cannot sustain. (23)

Applying this analytic structure to the migrant Muslim women could disentangle Islam from the fixed essentialized representations that dominate western studies. Asad’s idea of tradition helps to understand and question arguments from within as well as formulate productive questions from outside. Rather than talking about Islam as a distinct intellectual object, Asad suggests that “Islam is neither a distinctive social structure nor a heterogeneous collection of beliefs, artifacts, customs, and morals. It is a tradition” (20). Asad points out that tradition is related to the past and the future through particular practice in the present (20). Asad emphasizes that practicing Islam is different and is part of the everyday lives of
practicing and non-practicing muslims because it is part of their past and will continue to shape their future.

In his article “Thinking about Tradition, Religion and Politics in Egypt today”, Asad distinguishes two uses of the term tradition in his writings:

the first as a theoretical location for raising questions about authority, time, language use and embodiment; and the second as an empirical arrangement in which discursivity and materiality are connected through the minutiae everyday living. This discursive aspect of tradition is a process one learns and relearns “how to do things with words”....Tradition stands opposed both to empiricist theories of knowledge and relativist theories of justice .... Tradition stresses embodied critical learning rather than abstract theorization.... Critique is central to a living tradition.... This is not a challenge of abstract theories but of embodied (and yet criticizable) ways of life. (emphasis in the original)

Asad is against “the kind of anthropology of Islam … which rests on false conceptual oppositions and equivalences, which often lead writers into making ill founded assertions about motives, meanings, and effects relating to “religion” (The Archeology of Islam 18).

In this sense, both Spivak’s and Asad’s arguments show that neither Enlightenment humanism nor Islam is fixed entities that migrant muslims who live in the west embody. Building on the fluidity of knowing and the constant living of tradition, human beings can act ethically regardless of their colour, race, class or gender. Islam as a tradition allow “winning over” the others. Many Muslims today argue that religion is the main instrument of female liberation and empowerment rather than an obstacle preventing emancipation. These women base themselves on the conviction that Islam does not justify patriarchy, and that the Quran re-read from a gender perspective can liberate women changing their current status. Several scholars of Islamic feminism like Amina Wadud, Asma Barlas and Ziba Mir Hosseini work to reinterpret Islam from a gender perspective. On the other hand, Mahmood draws attention to the practice of pious women as part of the mosque movements in Egypt and other Muslim countries who do not challenge Islamic orthodoxy and patriarchal readings of Qur'an but who call for extending daily acts of kindness to others showing the human aspect of Islam. These are attempts to present various possibilities to empower Muslim women. Hence, Ali’s and Aboulela’s narratives could be read as part of these ongoing attempts. The emphasis on the ‘humane’ ability inherent in Islamic tradition exemplified in the mosque movement though applicable on Najwa extends to Nazneen. Both of them show kindness and tolerance to others even those who wronged them. Hence, the issue of tradition discussed goes beyond the dichotomy of tradition versus modernity which Nash concludes is evident in Aboulela’s work. Nash writes “Tradition and ethnicity are by no means excluded, but they are subsumed into a pietistic faith which is at once unapologetic and universal in its address, and radical and specific in its argument with Western modernity” (Nash 136). It is their ability to live
non-violently and free of antagonism which makes Nazneen and Najwa come to terms with their triple displacement and emerge as capable human beings.

In accordance with Asad’s notion, both novels critique Tamer and Karim for seeing Islam as a totalizing religion that has not changed over the years. This is evident when Najwa draws Tamer’s attention to the impracticality and impulsiveness of his dream that the two of them “would go back in time. A time of horses and tents; swords and raids” (Aboulela 255). Najwa is aware that the heroic actions of Prophet Mohammed’s time are not suitable for the contemporary London setting of their story. She reflects “he takes money for granted. It is obvious in the way he touches the notes. He can get more from the till, from the bank account his parents fill for him. He thinks they will always be around, will always give to him unconditionally. I was like that at his age” (Aboulela, 255-256). Similarly, Nazneen outgrows Karim’s impulsive heroic behavior which longs for jihad in imitation of the conquerors of the prophet.

Both narratives reflect the human potentials that Nazneen and Najwa have and acknowledge their right and their ability to actualize these potentials. The novels negotiate the Islamic patriarchal paradigm which assumes that women are weak and submissive. In fact, Spivak’s concept suggests that women because of their original displacement can negotiate constructed phallocentric values and Islamic patriarchal values better than their male counterparts. The two novels are an attempt to get out of the polarity and extremity of masculine discourse which both Karim and Tamer remains entrapped in. Nazneen and Najwa’s displacement allows for a transcendence of this polarity; it is not impossible to be a Muslim emigrant woman and stand your ground. Najwa’s subjectivity will always retain her Americanized way of life but her commitment to Islamic faith becomes her own free choice which would not have been possible if she has not acquired knowledge and agency. Similarly, Nazneen chooses to continue wearing her sari despite her newly acquired agency. It is quite revealing that both Nazneen and Najwa’s free choices entail not having men in their lives any more. Besides, both of them enjoy the freedom to choose because of their economic independence. Hence, Najwa’s pilgrimage -haj- at the end is possible only because she has money from Doctor Zeinab; she is getting back the same amount Anwar took from her years back; “Now, in a strange way, I am getting my money back” (Aboulela 268). In spite of the undertone of poetic justice and God’s mercy, economic independence is an integral factor in women’s empowerment whether in Asia, Africa or Europe which stresses the capitalist reality we all live in despite our race or gender.

Conclusion:

*Minaret* and *Brick Lane* could be read within the broader context of the debate whether Muslim women’s liberation lies in following Islamic faith or in more secular ways. This paper argues that though the means are different, the intended outcome is the same.
Tracing the empowerment of the two female protagonists shows that Muslim women despite their differences have affinities to an Islamic tradition which allows them to act humanely. In a sense, the characters contest Islamic and western essentialist ideas by constructing their bodies and their everyday lives through their own voluntary choices. Therefore, an awareness of the complexity of Muslim women different yet simultaneously similar positions allows for a “middle ground” between the seemingly assumed polarities of Islamic versus secular and east/islam versus west. Spivak focuses on displacements of women warning against the privileging of identity and the essentializing tendency entailed behind this privileging. However, in a transnational world, Nagwa and Nazneen embody the dichotomy of privilege and essentialism; one which entraps not only the novelists but the critical reception of the two novels as well. One thing is concluded that migrant Muslim women attempt to forge a unified identity through the convergence of Islamic tradition and secular humanitarianism. In all cases, they need to be recognized as capable of ethical behavior and human understanding that connects human beings despite their differences and their otherness. This is reminiscent of Hannah Arendt contention in The Human Condition that being human is about being with the likes of oneself while simultaneously knowing those who are different. Indeed, Najwa and Nazneen enact this human condition.
End Notes:

1. For examples of reviews and critical articles that praise *Brick Lane* as representing Nazneen’s triumph by adopting secular western feminists’ ways, see Natasha Walter review in *The Guardian* “Citrus scent of inexorable desire”; Natasha Walter finds that Monica Ali's fêted first novel, *Brick Lane*, lives up to its hype (13 June 2003). See also Chris Leehman’s “Book Review on *Brick Lane*” (13 September 2003) in *The Washington Post*. Geraldine Bedell draws attention to the oppression of Nazneen as a Bengali young girl who is forced to marry Chanu who is twice her age and shows how the novel traces her liberation in Geraldine Bedell’s "Full of East End promise", *The Observer* (June 15, 2003). On the other hand, examples of reviews on *Minaret* are many including Aboulela herself who repeatedly refers to her writings as representing a “Muslim who has faith”. (See Aboulela’s “Interview by Students, University of Aberdeen, School of Language & Literature.” www.abdn.ac.uk/sll/complit/leila.shtml www.abdn.ac.uk/sll/complit/leila.shtml. n.p.) The emphasis on Islam as the source of solace and power in Aboulela’s novels in general and *Minaret* in particular is echoed in many reviews and critical readings. For example, Susan Fischer’s review of *Minaret* is exemplary of the reception of the novel which places it within the framework of Islamic feminism. Fischer explains “In Leila Aboulela’s *Minaret* (2005), the prescribed norms of Islam ultimately help the protagonist locate a sense of self as a refugee in London”. (Susan Alice Fischer, 'Review: Leila Aboulela, *Minaret*’ in *Literary London: Interdisciplinary Studies in the Representation of London*, Volume 5 Number 2 (September 2007). Online at http://www.literarylondon.org/london-journal/september2007/sfischer.html) (online reviews accessed on 24/7/2015)

2. Feminists such as Mohanty (1991) in “ Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses”, in C. T. Mohanty, A. Russo & L. Torres (Eds) *Third World Women and The Politics of Feminism* (Bloomington, Indiana University Press), 51–80. See also Amos and Parmar (1984) in “Challenging Imperial Feminism” in *Feminist Review*, No. 17, July, 3–19. See also Lazreg (1988) “‘Feminism and Difference’ the perils of writing as a Muslim woman on women in Algeria” in *Feminist Studies*, 14(1), 81–107. These writers among others have critiqued Western feminism for its representation of subaltern Muslim women through the binary relations of the West/East power relations. They have pointed out that the construction of Muslim and ‘Third World’ women as an ‘essentialized category of ‘other’ enforces the religious divide underscoring the ‘clash of civilizations’ thesis and shows Muslim women’s lives and experiences in an assumed irreconcilable tension with dominant Western values and sensibilities.


5. Mahmood writes a detailed account on the movement of sisterhood in mosques which became very prominent in the Arab countries especially Egypt during the nineties. This movement is reflected in the sisters at Regent Park mosque who help Najwa in her process of becoming a devout practicing Muslim. For further reading see Mahmood’s Politics of Piety: The Islamic Revival and the Feminist Subject. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2005.
References


The Qualities of a successful EFL Teacher in the Eyes of Learners

Youssef Mezrigui
University of Jendouba, Tunisia

Abstract

There are two major interrelated reasons behind examining the topic of this paper. In fact, even after many years of their learning English as a foreign language, a large number of secondary school students' level of proficiency in the language is so low that they cannot use it communicatively, and cannot major in it at university, either. Accounting for their underachievement, a respectable percentage of such students claim that many teachers still play traditional roles in the teaching-learning process, which has contributed to the problem. The main purpose of this paper, therefore, is to explore the extent to which such a claim is justifiable. In this frame of reference, a questionnaire was administered to a certain number of students on the extent to which the teacher responsible for the issue, as well as what they personally think the key characteristics of a good EFL teacher are. Along with this, the paper will equally look at other qualities that ought to be available in EFL teachers with the overall aim of helping them to do their job successfully, and hence attain the expected learning results.

Keywords: English as a foreign language, EFL learners, teacher affective roles, teacher academic roles
Introduction

Achieving a good level of proficiency in English as a foreign language among a respectable percentage of secondary education students in many Tunisian schools is still a formidable challenge for both the teacher and the learner even after many years of formal instruction in the language. There must be diverse objective reasons behind the issue. In this setting, wondering about the various reasons behind the issue, many EFL teachers believe invincibly that the main reason is mainly related to an educational system which has proved unable to meet students’ and their parents’ expectations. Many others think that what lies at the root of the problem is lack of enough exposure to the language in the sense that the classroom is often the sole environment where students are exposed to it. However, whenever asked about the causes of their low level of proficiency in English with the aim of prompting them to improve, a lot of secondary school EFL learners, as pointed out above, lay part of the blame on the teacher. This could be claimed to be justifiable in case the teacher adopts traditional ineffective roles in teaching the language and in dealing with the students both as learners and humans. By implication, in order for the EFL teacher to get round the problem of her or his students’ underachievement in the language, it is recommended that s/he ought to assume particular affective and academic roles as one drastic measure that can contribute to effective teaching and successful learning.

What lies at the root of the problem?

A questionnaire was administered to 117 fourth year Tunisian secondary school students from two different schools. They were asked to which extent they think the teacher is responsible for students’ low proficiency level in English. The results of the questionnaire show that the smallest percentage of answers (23.93%) is the one that does not consider the teacher responsible for the learners’ low level in English. About 50% of the questioned students think that s/he is to reproach to some extent, whereas 31 out of 117 students representing a remarkable percentage of 26.50% believe that s/he is the blame for the problem to a great extent. These results would prompt us to investigate what should be done on the part of an EFL instructor so as to redress the state of affairs.

For the sake of delving a little deeper into the matter, the same number of students (117) and one class of second-secondary school students totaling 33 individuals from another school were requested to specify what they blame their EFL teachers for in regard to their low achievement in English. Their overall answers center around a number of undesirable aspects of behavior related to the teacher’s affective and academic roles. Below are examples of these.

Examples of undesirable aspects of behavior related to the teacher’s affective roles:

Unfriendly; not understanding; does not call us by our names; often nervous; shouts at us; does not respect students; indifferent to students’ problems; mocking students; punishing students; too severe; favors some students at the expense of others.
Examples of undesirable aspects of behavior related to the teacher’s academic roles:

lazy; sitting most of the time; sometimes refuses to explain what students don’t understand; can’t control class; gives very low marks for oral tests; his tests are very difficult; assigning homework, but doesn’t control or correct it; uses difficult words; getting absent.

It is undeniably true that a teacher behaving as described above causes her/his students to scorn her/him and direct their attention from the subject s/he teaches, which is likely to lead to low results.

The same questioned students were asked to list what they think the qualities of a good teacher are. What they listed also pertains to her/his affective and academic roles. Below are examples of such qualities:

Understanding; having a strong personality; can control class; lenient; helps students with tests; gives good marks; involves all students in lessons; friendly; cheerful; uses easy methods in his lessons; treats all students equally (i.e. does not favor certain students at the expense of others); discusses students’ personal problems.

All this leads us to deduce that students are really aware that successful teaching can be achieved by the teacher’s imperative combining of her/his affective and academic roles, which implies the necessity of adopting a humanistic approach in her/his teaching methodology.

Teacher roles

On the basis of the undesirable aspects of behavior on the part of the teacher mentioned by students in the above questionnaire, as well as what I personally noticed among colleagues, a number of teachers still maintain a traditional role. Such a role has two principal characteristics: being authoritarian and speaking most frequently in class. One major reason behind being authoritarian is to maintain discipline in class, as a number of teachers believe. As to being the one who speaks most of the time in class, it could be deduced that it may equally be the result of the teacher’s severity, in the sense that a severe teacher may cause many students to be reluctant to participate in learning activities, by reason of their apprehension that they may make mistakes, which they think may provoke an undesirable reaction on the part of the teacher. Another reason is that being accustomed to her/his constant talk in class is very likely to make the students listen to her/him passively much more than playing an active role in lessons.

Accounted for by many teachers, their frequent talk in class is mainly the result of the low proficiency level of many students. Referring to the matter, one teacher once said, “I often feel I am teaching myself.”
However, however serious and numerous the difficulties are, a successful teacher does not resort to assuming a traditional role that s/he herself or himself may be aware that it cannot bring off the expected learning results.

**Teacher affective roles**

The affective roles of the teacher are intrinsically associated with her or his relationship with students as a person rather than a teacher in the mere traditional sense of the term. In this sense, Marks (2001: 82) points out that “the term ‘affect’ includes ‘anything to do with the emotions, moods, dispositions and preferences’.”

Taking affective factors into account is of considerable importance to the teaching-learning process. These include the learner’s personal emotions and interests, and hence her or his positive or negative attitudes towards learning activities. The teacher ought to be aware of the importance of these factors and the necessity of her or his being able to deal with them properly, so as to contribute to the success of the learning process. In this respect, the teacher’s affective role is of crucial significance. Instances of the teacher’s key affective roles are examined below.

**Friend:** Relying on a personal experience and on what the students mentioned in the above questionnaire, a good successful teacher is someone who establishes a good relationship with all students acting as a friend, and treating all of them on equal terms avoiding to favor brilliant learners over weak ones, or sympathize with boys at the expense of girls, or vice versa.

Apart from the teacher-student relationship, it is recommended that the teacher establish a good student-student relationship based on mutual respect and cooperation, which can contribute to facilitating the teaching-learning process in an agreeable atmosphere. Richard–Amato (2003) refers to this point arguing that “in classrooms in which mutual respect is lacking, differing values can lead to conflicts between student and teacher, and between student and peer” (p. 66). Therefore, it is imperative – as Ebata (2008) advocates – that teachers “teach all the students the importance of having respect for one another in a classroom so that each of the students can actively participate in lesson.”

Another factor relating to the teacher’s role as a friend is calling learners by their first names. Doing so is, on the one hand, one aspect of the good teacher-student relationship; it shows the teacher does not keep learners at a distance, but s/he is rather one of them. On the other hand, it motivates the learner and gives her or him some confidence, especially in situations in which s/he is addressed praising expressions followed by her or his first name when responding correctly or performing tasks in the right way.

Hess (2001: 16) lists a number of benefits of learning students’ names that concern both the teacher and the learners. She argues that learning students’ names is essential, because it promotes good basic human relationships;
it is helpful in monitoring students’ records (test results, attendance, assignments);

calling people by their names is basic recognition that they are individuals, and are being respected as such;

calling students by their names helps us to call them to order;

we begin to feel more comfortable with a class as soon as we know our students’ names;

students themselves feel better when they know the names of classmates.

**Motivator:** Motivation is of a vital role in language learning. In this framework, one of the qualities of a good, successful teacher is someone who is aware of this fact and implements it in class via diverse ways bearing in mind that motivating students frequently can actually pave the way for effective learning and hence facilitate successful teaching.

**Model:** Acting as a model is not solely one of the teacher’s academic roles, but it can be included in her or his affective roles. Putting it plainly, the teacher is not only a model for students to follow in teaching them the language, but also in guiding them directly to acquire some moral values and good aspects of behavior by, say, giving them pieces of advice in this respect, or indirectly through positive traits of her or his personality, which arouses their interest in learning. Where the teacher’s personality is concerned, it is irrefutable that it can affect the students’ perception of the teacher and their learning from her or him.

A few students among those questioned about the qualities of a successful teacher mentioned “strong personality”, and one female student cited “elegant”. In this setting, one ingredient of a person’s personality is the way they are dressed up. By implication, one of the characteristics of a successful teacher is maintaining an admirable appearance. This would bring her or him respect and esteem on the part of students. The fact that many of them sometimes try to imitate their teacher in her or his good looks, and would like her or him to have a good opinion on them in this regard shows how important the teacher’s appearance is in their eyes.

In a word, the teacher’s having a good-looking appearance is highly recommended, in view of the fact that students learn better from someone whom they respect and reckon as a model at more than one level.

**Fun:** One of the definitions of fun according to *Macmillan English Dictionary* (2002) is “someone who you enjoy spending time with, especially because you enjoy the same activities.” In this setting, students usually prefer teachers who are humorous to those who are very often serious and hardworking. A number of students among those to whom the aforementioned questionnaire was administered about the characteristics of a good teacher jotted down words and phrases connected to humor, such as **funny**, **makes pupils laugh**, and **tells jokes**. In the very context, Weiss (1993: 42) points out that “when students are queried about the characteristics of a teacher they most appreciate, they often reply ‘a sense of humor’ and ‘the ability to communicate knowledge in an interesting way’.” Therefore, an important characteristic of a successful teacher is being personally humorous and introducing humor in her or his lessons, so as to spare students being bored and anxious, and increase their attention span. Maurice (1988) stresses the role of humor in helping acquire or learn languages holding that “[…] much has been written in the field of TESL/TEFL in recent years about the place of
affective factors in language acquisition. Humor, as one affective ‘technique’, can be of some help to us in our task of facilitating acquisition within the classroom.” Gagné (1985), in turn, lists a number of instructional functions of humor. These are: (a) activating motivation, (b) informing the learner of the lesson objective, (c) directing attention, (d) stimulating recall, (e) providing learning guidance, (f) enhancing retention, (g) promoting transfer of learning, and (h) eliciting performance.

In a later section dealing with the teacher’s academic roles, we will make suggestions for ways of introducing humor in various learning activities relating to the four languages skills.

Social worker: Undertaking such a role in the right way requires the teacher to be au fait with the different social backgrounds of learners, their various interests and feelings, as well as their diverse attitudes towards learning.

As it is very likely to be difficult for the teacher to have enough information about all these issues relating to every individual student and recall it, s/he can resort to what is called a background questionnaire, which s/he can keep during the whole academic year so as to refer to it whenever need be.

A duty of the teacher’s as a social worker, and one of the highly-appreciated qualities of a good successful teacher is helping students with their personal problems, or at least taking them into serious consideration in case of learner frequent absenteeism, misbehavior, unsatisfactory learning performance, or low exam results. Dealing with the teacher’s role as a social worker, Wiriyachitra (1995) suggests that “s/he should create an atmosphere of friendliness and trust by listening to students, accepting their ideas/opinions, and if they have any problems finding ways to solve them.” Acting as such will certainly cause students to change much for the better at the level of their affect, their conduct, their perception of the teacher, and their view about learning.

Concluding her above statement, Wiriyachitra (1995) affirms that “students will feel relaxed, confident, assured, and not embarrassed. This behavior can definitely lower the students’ affective filter which, in turn, may enhance learning.” Personally, it is my experience that the students who have got some help from the teacher with their personal problems, and generally enjoy a friendly relationship with her or him show considerable interest in her or his subject matter, and do their utmost to ameliorate their proficiency in it.

In sum, it could be held that by assuming particular affective roles in the right way as those examined above can facilitate the teacher’s various academic roles a great deal. Roughly the very claim is expressed by Arnold and Brown (1999) who point out that “by attending to the affective realm […], teachers might well find that their whole task becomes easier.”
**Teacher academic roles**

It is argued that in the course of foreign-language classes, teacher roles are sometimes undertaken spontaneously or without the teacher’s being aware what they are. One characteristic of a successful teacher is being knowledgeable about the different roles s/he ought to play and the learning activities that can be best performed through assuming one or more particular roles.

In this section, we will consider the main academic teacher roles that are deemed to be in marked contrast with traditional roles, and on the other hand can help engage students as much as possible in learner-centered activities, and are hence of real benefits to the achievement of effective learning.

It deserves mention that the principal teacher roles that will be examined include other secondary, but important roles as will be discussed.

**Group leader:** What may count more with respect to the two-term name of this role is its first part, group; not leader. The teacher acting as a group leader implies her or his being the head of the whole class as one group or divided into a number of groups, and does – of course – not signify monopolizing the performance of the learning activities on her or his part, but these are rather student-centered. Rogers (2002: 190) sums up the function of the teacher as head of the group briefly stating that “[i]t is to keep the group together, to keep things going.”

The teacher’s role as a group leader lies primarily in devising suitable activities compatible with the learning objectives intended to be fulfilled, clarifying the instructions for these activities – acting thus as a manager – so as to ensure everybody understands what to do, and sometimes initiating them, or asking a good student to so do, if need be, for the sake of a better performance by the whole class.

With reference to the questionnaires referred to above, some students stated that one of the characteristics of a successful instructor is making the whole class participate in lessons, while some others expressed roughly the same opinion in different terms asserting that one of the teacher’s qualities they disapprove of is caring only for a few good students.

In this frame of reference, the teacher’s acting as a manager also involves assisting everybody in taking part in all classroom activities concentrating somewhat more on the shy and low-achieving learners; and in parallel with this, s/he ought not to allow good students to take the lion’s share of participation and outpace slow or weak peers in pair or group-work activities. Rogers and Horrocks (2010: 206) refer to such students as persistent talkers who try to monopolise the discussion, and recommend that “it is important not to let them wreck the group.”

Behaving with students of different levels of proficiency as suggested above requires the teacher to be of an outstanding pedagogical competence and to acquire sufficient knowledge about certain learners’ psychological characteristics so as, say, not to embarrass weak learners
by prompting them too much to be constantly active and present the desired performance, and on the other hand not to dampen brilliant learners’ enthusiasm so frequently that they may feel frustrated and discouraged. Therefore, the teacher should not only be a pedagogue, but also somewhat a psychologist – as it were – in respect of taking into account her or his students’ various feelings, emotions, and reactions to the diverse learning activities, as well as to the ways the teacher should behave with them as persons and her or his attitudes towards their learning performance.

Equally as a group leader, the teacher can function as a promoter of the target-language learning, mainly during group-work activities. Plainly speaking, for instance, as learners tend to use their mother tongue while working in groups, s/he should entice them through diverse ways to keep using the L2 as much as they can.

**Group member:** Acting as a group member denies the teacher’s being considered as authority in the classroom, and opposes the traditional belief that s/he is the only source of knowledge and the sole person who teaches. In point of fact, such a role implies the teacher’s performing activities alongside students learning from them while they are learning from her or him. Briefly, in other words, s/he is a teacher and a learner at the same time. Freire (1988: 67) strongly approves of such a role arguing that “the teacher is no longer merely the one – who – teaches, but one who is himself taught in dialogue with the students, who in turn, while being taught also teach.” In this way, as Larsen-Freeman (2000: 28) points out, “the teacher and the students are more like partners in the teaching-learning process,” which would help students – as Harmer (1998: 9) suggests – to be responsible for their own learning, which is one of the characteristics of good learners.

One practical way of encouraging students to be self-confident and making them realize that they are responsible for their own learning is to allow them sometimes to suggest homework assignments associated with a particular language-skill activity. The teacher together with all the students may agree upon particular homework assignment for the whole class with the intention of giving all students some freedom to do the homework that suits their ability, thus taking into account the learners’ different proficiency levels so as to guarantee everybody does the assignment.

From the above-considered roles derives the teacher’s part as a ‘co-communicator’ (Littlewood, 1981). This is mainly manifest in her or his participating in various forms of interaction with learners, such as dialogues, role-plays, simulations, and class discussions. The teacher-learner interactions have different aims. For instance, a particular form of interaction may take place between the teacher and a good student as an example for the whole class to follow with the object of facilitating a learning activity before they engage in performing it.

Further, as a mere ‘co-communicator’, the teacher can, of course, take part in class debates expressing her or his own views, listening to students’ arguments, and agreeing or taking issue with them; and on the other hand, giving learners a chance either directly or indirectly to freely comment on her or his opinions and argue for or against them if the
situation entails to so do. Behaving as such, the teacher makes it clear for students that s/he is not the domineering teacher who is the lone fountain of knowledge, whose voice is the most frequently resounding in the classroom, and whose standpoints are irrefutable truth. Therefore, since the teacher-learner relationship is horizontal, the teacher is regarded more as a friend – as noted above – and also as a ‘co-learner’ (by analogy with Littlewood’s (1981) use of the term ‘co-communicator’). In this way, students become self-confident or more so, and feel psychologically at ease, and that they learn in a comfortable atmosphere, which spares them apprehension of errors, and thus assists them in expressing themselves freely. All this can be among the key factors that can help promote effective teaching and achieve successful learning.

It is worthy of note that in much ELT writing, considerable mention has been made of the teacher as a learner without actually exploring what s/he can learn from students. Without fail, in order for the teacher to learn from students, s/he ought primarily to learn about them. A threefold query in this regard is to be raised: a) what should the teacher learn about students? b) What can s/he learn from them? c) What benefits does the teaching-learning process derive from both types of learning?

What the teacher ought to learn about her or his students are specific issues that are connected with their learning and have particular effects on it. It is recommended that the teacher deal with these issues in such a way as to make them affect learning positively. Principal instances of these are discussed below.

1. **Language attitudes**: Students have different attitudes, either positive or negative towards the target-language learning depending mainly on their need for the language and their proficiency level in it. In this setting, the teacher can assume the role of a psychological stimulator in boosting learners’ positive attitudes and helping the students who have negative attitudes to rid them of such attitudes, and create in them positive ones, in that these can enhance learning.

2. **Learning styles**: These are also referred to as learning strategies. Students of whatever proficiency in the language they are learning have a variety of learning styles on the basis of their command of the language as a whole, as well as their standard in the various language areas. By way of illustration, a student who is good at grammar and weak at mastering vocabulary may find no difficulty in the teacher’s methods of teaching grammar, but may find it difficult to learn vocabulary if, for instance, the teacher does not often use the learners’ native language. Such a student may prefer that the teacher use the learners’ mother tongue, and when learning on her or his own, s/he may use bilingual dictionaries very often in order to comprehend unfamiliar lexis, which is a strategy that can be reckoned as ineffective, especially in case it is resorted to frequently. In this situation, the teacher can assume the role of a mentor. S/He ought to encourage student effective learning strategies, but in respect of ineffective learning strategies, it is recommended that – as is the case for learner errors, the teacher should sometimes be tolerant of them. One justification for this argument is that the teacher’s disapproval of ineffective learner strategies in one way or another may result in certain negative attitudes towards learning on the part of students. However, the teacher’s tolerance of certain ineffective learning strategies can be taken as as
a temporary measure. In the course of time, as the teacher notices that students’ performance is improving, s/he can recommend learners implicitly to get rid of those strategies and substitute them for effective ones.

**Affective interests:** It is of considerable importance that the teacher be in the know of the students’ overall affective interests that are in connection with the learning course. One of the factors through which the teacher can take up the responsibility of a motivator is satisfying those interests as possible as s/he can. What the teacher can take into account in this regard are comprehension materials (listening and reading passages), speaking and writing topics (oral and written production), and certain types of activities, such as games, role-plays, and songs. The teacher should often select what can comply with the students’ interests, so that they can carry out the desired performance, and hence achieve the expected leaning results. By implication, therefore, it is imperative that the teacher should not depend much on the contents of textbooks, as one measure that can take part in fulfilling the above-mentioned objective.

**Language needs:** The most significant learners’ need for language is their ability to use it communicatively for diverse purposes, such as entertainment, traveling abroad, and jobs requiring fluency in the language. But, many learners are not aware of their current and future needs for English. In this context, a further role assumed for the teacher is a counselor. S/He ought to advise students about the necessity of learning English and sensitize them to their needs for it as the most used language for communication worldwide.

Besides what the teacher personally knows about the above-considered issues, using questionnaires, diagnostic tests, and interviews is of considerable assistance in providing her or him with sufficient data about those issues.

Responding to the previously-raised query as concerns what the teacher can learn from students as a ‘co-learner’, one could hold the claim that s/he can:

- learn how to adjust her/his teaching methodology in accordance with the overall proficiency of the whole class. A teacher who does not know enough about all students’ learning abilities and styles may not do so; it is likely that s/he keeps her/his teaching techniques always or often in conformity with brilliant students’ level only.
- become more tolerant. Tolerance of learner errors and ineffective learning strategies helps build self-confidence in students, and consequently can aid effective learning. Tolerance also implies patience, which is one of the qualities of a successful teacher. If s/he does not deal patiently with certain challenges, such as students’ underachievement and disruptive behavior, s/he is likely to risk feeling frustrated, which may make situations worse.
- easily find out the areas of weakness among students; and in the light of this matter, s/he can prepare a suitable remedial program.
- assume another valuable role: needs analyst. This requires the teacher to select the appropriate instructional materials and devise the learning activities suitable to the language needs of students. Such a role can pave the way for the teacher to get a more important job as a syllabus designer.
In addition to all this, the teacher as a ‘co-learner’ can equally learn directly from students, namely bright ones at both cognitive and pedagogical levels. For instance, they can remind her or him of or provide her or him with information s/he has forgotten or s/he does not know. Still, the teacher can learn from students how to approach certain tasks (e.g. problem-solving tasks and games) in a better way and perform them in a shorter time than s/he personally does.

It deserves mention that as a ‘co-learner’, the teacher should not feel ashamed of or embarrassed by learning from students. S/He ought rather to show them be it explicitly or implicitly that s/he is modest; s/he is not the only dispenser of information nor is s/he a know-it-all, and that s/he can learn from them as they do from her or him, as well as from one another. This is very likely to strengthen the good teacher-student relationship, motivate the whole class, and build or promote learner self-confidence.

In a word, the role assumed for the teacher as a group member can help her or him a great deal discover new key factors of success associated with the teaching-learning process, and can subsequently assist her or him in acquiring a more effective teaching methodology.

**Facilitator:** This teacher role is equally of paramount importance to the teaching-learning process for it facilitates both the teacher’s and students’ tasks. The role entails a set of factors in connection with the teacher, the types of learning activities, and the instructional materials.

Assuming the part of facilitator involves particular qualities of the teacher both as a person and an instructor. A couple of such qualities are – as noted above – being humorous and establishing a friendly relationship with students. We have examined so far how the teacher can be fun as one good trait of her/his personality. We suggest, in the table below, examples of humorous learning activities as a procedure for facilitating learning.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language skills</th>
<th>Examples of activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Listening</strong></td>
<td>Listening to songs; exchanging riddles in group-work activities; listening to music while doing another activity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Speaking</strong></td>
<td>Singing songs; telling jokes; chatting on the Net with English-speaking people; performing funny role-plays; describing a comedian comically; completing a short story funnily; telling riddles.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reading</strong></td>
<td>Cross-word puzzles; cartoons; reading comic selections; reading funny short stories.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Writing</strong></td>
<td>Writing jokes; writing funny mini-sagas; writing about a trick you played on someone; writing about a trick someone played on you; shadowing the lyrics of a song in writing.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig. 1: Examples of humorous learning activities
Ur (2006) refers to the benefit of inserting amusing elements in English courses asserting that
if students are listening to something entertaining they are likely to attend and get benefits from the listening experience. Moreover, the occasional introduction of pleasurable components like songs and stories into English lessons can improve student motivation and general morale, and show the language in a new light – not just as a subject of study, but as a source of enjoyment and recreation (p.63).

Another duty of the teacher as a facilitator is acting as an advisor. As was suggested above, it rests with her or him to increase the students’ consciousness of the great value of English as a worldwide medium of communication, and raise their hope for being good or better at using the language communicatively. This can be done through pieces of advice, as well as via providing learners with instructional materials that can assist them in being able to do so, such as newspapers, magazines and short stories; and guide them how to reap profit from them during their autonomous learning.

Equally of potential benefit as a measure for facilitating learning for students and contributing to their becoming effective learners is the teacher’s communicating with their families via diverse ways, and making them feel that they can really contribute to the success of their children’s learning. This argument is supported by Kraft and Dougherty (2013). They conducted a study based on a randomized field experiment which found that the frequent teacher communication with students’ families increased the learners’ engagement and their motivation for learning.

Probably included in the role of the teacher as a facilitator is her or his responsibility as an evaluator, and hence as a promoter of effective learning. In this frame of reference, although tests are an inevitable part of the teaching-learning process as they are the usual means of evaluating the learners’ performance, they ought not to be used as gauges to measure the rate of success and failure of students. They should rather be utilized as a mere means to see how much progress they have carried out, and as one stimulus for achieving the expected learning results. For the teacher’s part, they also serve to help her or him verify the extent to which the teaching objectives have been attained.

It equally rests with the teacher assuming the part of facilitator to do her or his utmost, in collaboration with colleagues and the school administration, to provide learners with the necessary instructional materials that can ensure a better performance of purposefully-selected learning activities that conform to the students’ affective interests and language needs. Further, facilitating the learning conditions for students on the part of the teacher also includes the setting where the teaching-learning process takes place. Plainly, the classroom ought to be a location where both the teacher and students work in a restful and comfortable atmosphere. One matter assuring such an atmosphere, namely in case of large classes, is that learners should be seated in a way that can allow them to work at ease in small or large groups, and make it easy for the teacher to move about, see and hear everybody in the classroom.
Teacher development

Another fundamental hallmark of a successful teacher is being aware of the necessity of professional development as a key factor that contributes a great deal to success.

Defining teacher development

As a process, teacher development refers to the operation of constantly improving one’s teaching experience through a wide variety of ways and keeping up with innovative teaching methodologies, so as to do one’s job as successfully as one should.

As an outcome of a process, teacher development as defined by Richards and Schmidt (2002: 542) is “the professional growth a teacher achieves as a result of gaining increased experience and knowledge and examining his or her teaching systematically.”

Ways of developing as a teacher

It is affirmed that developing as a teacher need not cover only teaching methodology, but also other areas that can aid effective teaching performance, namely general knowledge (necessarily including educational psychology), scientific competence in one’s specialty, collecting and developing instructional materials, gaining and bettering class management skills, and so forth. Within a similar framework, it is unwise to restrict teacher development to the in-service training sessions under the guidance of ELT inspectors and teacher trainers. These are not usually enough at all in terms of frequency, and are most often limited only to purely pedagogic matters. It is, therefore, strongly recommended that a teacher seek out ample opportunities and diverse ways of developing herself or himself on her or his own.

Listed below are ways the teacher can develop herself or himself on her or his own.

- Self-evaluating teaching performance on a regular basis. As suggested by Nolasco and Arthur (1995), this can be done by the use of observation sheets, or recording lessons on audio or video tape. The aim behind such a procedure is to overcome weaknesses and boost strengths;
- Observing colleagues’ lessons and inviting colleagues to observe your lessons, and devoting enough time to discussion just after each observation;
- Asking students occasionally to jot down what they appreciate and what they do not about the teacher’s lesson, as well as what they would suggest how certain activities can be better performed. The teacher should study what students have jotted down at a later time, and take into consideration the useful remarks. Since “teachers can never be quite sure what their students think of them,” as Harmer (1998: 3) puts it, learners can also be asked to do the same at the end of the academic year as concerns the teacher’s character and her or his teaching methodology during the whole year. This can be written in a sheet of paper without the students’ writing their names, so that they can express themselves freely. As
recommended above, students’ voices in that regard should be taken into serious account, because they can contribute to improvement.

- Devoting time to reading a variety of printed and electronic publications on ELT topics, educational issues, and teacher development. In this setting, Prodromou (1991) suggests subscribing to ELT magazines and journals. This would make the teacher avidly interested in reading, and thereby enlarge her or his knowledge in the field of English language teaching.

- Trying to contribute articles on ELT subjects and/or educational concerns to journals and magazines. Publishing articles is very motivating; it enhances reading and searching on the mentioned areas, which subsequently assists teacher self-development.

- Taking part in setting up a specialized ELT room in educational institutions, where a variety of resources and teaching materials are to be collected in collaboration with the teaching and administrative staff.

Other ways contributing to teacher development proposed by Prodromou (1991) include (a) joining professional organizations, such as IATEFL and TESOL, and attending their conferences whenever possible, (b) forming local teacher’s groups and holding regular meetings to discuss common problems, (c) inviting fellow teachers/teacher trainers and guest speakers to contribute lectures and workshops, (d) publishing an ELT newsletter on a local or national scale, and (e) arranging ELT book exhibition with the help of ELT publishers, organizations, such as the British Council, or relevant ministry.

**Conclusion**

In the light of what has been examined earlier, it could be claimed that the teacher’s assuming the affective and academic roles discussed above can be considerably beneficial to the teaching-learning process. Notwithstanding, it is worthy of note that one may argue that in situations where EFL classes include a sizeable percentage of low-achievers, the teacher playing such roles, especially that of a group member, in accordance of which s/he learns from students while s/he teaches them, with the aim of fulfilling the objective of making students responsible for their own learning may be reckoned as too idealistic.

EFL teachers, students, and their parents having such a pessimistic view ought to bear in mind that success cannot be achieved in just one day. No wonder, attaining the desired results is a gradual process. On the other hand, achieving one hundred percent success is beyond even the most successful and most experienced teacher, but achieving some or even the least success is, of course, much better than yielding to disagreeable situations and being hopeless of improving them or changing them for the better.

Aside from the various affective and academic roles a teacher ought to assume with the object of contributing to effective teaching and successful learning, teacher development is a requisite for the same aim.
Following from all this, it should also be borne in mind that our real success as teachers does not lie solely in helping good students to be better, but mainly in assisting low-achievers in being successful learners.
References


Intersex condition and the construction of gender identity

Paola Miano
University of Palermo, Italy

Abstract

Intersexuality is conceptualized as a disorder of sexual development (DSD), which includes congenital conditions associated with atypical chromosomal, gonadic and anatomic sexual development. DSD can be diagnosed at birth as a result of observation of ambiguous genitalia, or, in adolescence, if sexual development diverges from the assigned gender. Some DSD can only be recognized in adulthood as a consequence of reproductive difficulties. In children and adolescents with DSD, gender identity is strongly influenced by atypical sexual development. The comparison between two management models of DSD, the optimal gender policy and a holistic perspective focused on the individual, highlighted their differences with regard to effects on individuals with DSD.

Keywords: Intersex, Disorders of Sex Development, Gender identity, Psychosocial management, Coping.
Typical and Atypical Sexual Development

Sexual differentiation is a complex process, with clear sequences and occurrences that starts at the beginning of foetal development and comes to an end at puberty (Rugarli, 2005). According to Fausto-Sterling (1989) the sexual differentiation process is influenced by the presence of the Y chromosome and should be analysed in a complex model; molecular biology research underlines the fact that the Y chromosome alone is actually not enough to produce a male individual (Schiebinger, 2008). As emphasized by Rosario (2009), the Mendelian theory of inheritance is not appropriate for sexual development, because there is not a perfect and rigorous correspondence between a specific gene and a specific trait; in fact more than one gene is involved in the sexual differentiation process and at least fourteen genes are considered crucial in sexual development (Cotinot, Pailhoux, Jaubert, & Fellous, 2002).

The intersex condition is characterized by atypical chromosomal, gonadic and anatomic sexual development and it represents an element contradicting the binary male/female differentiation. The various types of intersexuality are diagnosed as Disorders of Sex Development (DSD) and individuals with an intersex condition show atypical sexual development. The sexual development model should bear in mind that it is not correct to assert that in the absence of the Y chromosome there will be a feminization process. The theory that considers the presence or the absence of the Y chromosome as the key element in sexual developmental, even if is not correct, is closely linked to a cultural dimension in which masculinity is associated with an active character, while passivity is connected to femininity, as in Aristotle (Jost, 1947): “it is the male who contributes the active component that leads to the greater vital heat necessary for the formation of a male foetus. If the father is healthy and not too young or too old he will produce stronger, more active male semen that is more likely to prevail over the female material and thereby generate male offspring” (Rosario, 2009, p. 273).

Intersexuality could be better explained through a complex model of sexual development that provides for male individuals, female individuals and intersex individuals. Subjects with an intersexual condition show something atypical in their sexual development; when there is atypical sex chromosome development it is possible, for instance, to have a complete or partial absence of the second sex chromosome, as in individuals with Turner syndrome who have a XO karyotype. Atypical gonadic development could lead, for instance, to the formation of an ovotestis, i.e. a gonad containing testicular and ovarian tissue; additionally, anatomic sexual development could result in a micropenis in subjects assigned to the male sex.

When a newborn child shows ambiguous genitalia the intersex condition can be recognized at birth and it is possible to choose the best sexual assignment for the child. If an intersex condition is identified during adolescence or adulthood clinical tests are required for a DSD diagnosis and it is usual to have indicators such as virilisation after puberty in a female adolescent or infertility in an adult female. In any case treatment should focus on adjustment strategy.

With DSD being so varied, treatment for individuals with an intersex condition should be individualized, although it is indispensable to follow the guidelines for each syndrome (Morland, 2008). DSD has quite a low frequency in the general population and the main diagnosis has a low estimated incidence (Blackless, Charuvastra, Derryck, & Fausto-Sterling, 2000): 0.0922/100 for the Klinefelter syndrome (XXY karyotype), 0.0369/100 for the Turner syndrome (XO karyotype), 0.00760/100 for the complete androgen insensitivity syndrome (CAIS or Morris syndrome),
0.000760/100 for the partial androgen insensitivity syndrome (PAIS) and 0.00770/100 for congenital adrenal hyperplasia (CAH).

Gender identity is one of the most important issues in an intersexual condition. The construction of gender is influenced by social factors and the social community represents a crucial variable in defining gender norms, role expectations and appropriate behaviour. Gender stereotyping tends to convey rigid images that are almost impossible for simple human beings to attain; we are supposed to be perfect men and women if possible, at ease with everything, ready to cope with all difficulties. According to Eagly & Wood (1999) gender stereotypes are risk factors for non-intersex subjects and we can therefore consider them as high risk factors for individuals with DSD, in particular with regard to psychosocial wellbeing, social acceptance, body satisfaction, close relationships, sexual gratification and available health services (Warne & Raza, 2008).

When a DSD diagnosis is made in infancy or in adolescence the whole family organization is involved in tackling the intersex condition. DSD entails processes of self construction and concerns both the person with DSD, his/her parents and other siblings; sexual in-determination in children or adolescents with an intersex condition might actualize oedipal dynamics and consequent conflicts. The main reaction to the DSD diagnosis in the family system consists in what Michel, Wagner & Jeandel (2008) called a conviction with two functions: a defensive one and an organizational one (Rajon, 1998). Furthermore, the stage in life cycle psychology in which the family discover the intersex condition is crucial; sexual ambiguity is always a disturbing element and is potentially traumatic. Parents might have been expecting a male or a female and are then not prepared to have a child with an intersex condition; additionally, persons with DSD often have a feeling of discomfort with their personal and gender identity (Dreger, 1998; 2006).

Hegarty (2000) underlines the fact that reactions to an intersex diagnosis depend on gender identity rigidity; the more stable the gender construction, the more traumatic might be the DSD. In any event, a DSD diagnosis does not always have negative consequences and for some individuals the intersex diagnosis could improve readjustment and reduce symptoms of psychological disorder; individuals may find a name for what they have always felt and may find a coherent reason for their difficulty in accepting themselves and for their ambiguous feelings about gender and sexual identity.

Managing a Sexual Development Disorder

Intersex conditions are extremely varied and their aetiology ranges from genetic to anatomic and hormonal causes; different aberrations in embryonic differentiation processes induce specific diseases with different symptoms. We can identify two main typologies of treatment distinguished by their theoretical framework, procedure, family involvement, evaluation of personal and social variable, short and long term effects. The first approach is indicated as optimal gender policy whereas the second is a holistic treatment focused on the individual.

The optimal gender policy is a theoretical and therapeutic model developed by Money (1975) to manage intersex cases; according to this model persons with DSD should be treated with a surgical intervention that will adapt external genitalia to the assigned sex. A further element concerns the timing of the intervention, since the sooner the operation is performed the more likely it is that the intervention will be effective. The optimal gender perspective was utilized for the first time at the Johns Hopkins Hospital, between the 50's and 70's, with the aim of assigning the child to
the sex that would better correspond to his/her external genitalia. The principal criterion for sexual assignment is genital appearance, since ambiguity is considered a severe obstacle to the adjustment process and gender identity construction is seen as a flexible development until the age of two years.

The best-known case treated with the optimal gender policy is the John/Joan case (Money & Ehrhardt, 1972; Money & Tucker, 1975; Money, 1975); John was a 7 month-old child whose penis had been burned by an electric scalpel during a circumcision operation resulting in a total ablation of the penis. Because of this accident Money recommended changing gender assignment, switching from male gender to female gender and proceeding with genital feminizing surgery. John’s parents pondered Money’s advice for ten months and then they decided to follow Money’s advice: John underwent genital surgery (orchiectomy and reshape of scrotum to labia majora) and was raised as a girl in line with a female role and typical gender expectations. According to 8-year follow-up data Money (1975) asserted that the new John/Joan’s identity was well-adjusted, did not present psychological problems and her development was comparable to that of her monozygotic twin. Data on John/Joan’s adjustment were rejected by Diamond & Sigmundson (1997), who found that at 6 years John/Joan opposed female gender re-assignment; subsequently he remembered the medical examinations with anger, described surgery as a traumatic experience and was teased and threatened by peers (Kipnis & Diamond, 1998). At 14 he opted for the name of David, instead of Brenda, and in adulthood he lived appropriately, in accordance with a male gender role, married a woman and adopted her children.

The optimal gender model considers gender as a developmental element that could be changed during the first two years of life, without negative effects; gender identity construction is evaluated solely as a cultural outcome that is not defined before the third year of life and can be changed: biological development during pregnancy is underestimated, while gender social roles are overrated. Reflecting on the David Reimer (John/Joan) case and in particular on its outcome (severe depressive symptoms and a suicide in 2004 at the age of 38), some researchers have underlined the need to determine a different model for handling DSD. These studies led to a second theoretical model that also lays down treatment guidelines and outcome variables to be evaluated.

The second model might be defined as a full-consent policy (Wiesemann, Ude-Koeller, Sinnecker, & Thyen, 2010) focused on the individual and emphasizing certain dimensions: specificity of different DSD, biological correlates, effects of genital surgery, global wellbeing outcomes, relational security, gender identity and sexual functioning and satisfaction. The importance of the latter variable, which explores whether people are at ease and content with their assigned gender and with their sexual life, was strongly emphasized by Chase (1998) and Crouch, Minto, Liao, Woodhouse, & Creighton (2004), who judged sexual functioning as one of the most important elements to be taken into account. To have established the priority of preserving sexual functioning and keeping nervous tissue intact, is very innovative if we consider that according to the optimal gender model male and female genital functioning is evaluated by focusing on potential peer discrimination (for instance because of a micro-penis) or on vaginal adequacy with regard to penetration (Slijper, Drop, Molenaar, & de Muinck Keizer-Schrama, 1998).

This approach characterizes the activity of the Intersex Society of North America (ISNA), which in 2008 changed its name to Accord Alliance; this organization focuses both on how people
with DSD perceive their condition and on genital surgery outcomes from the individual’s perspective. Accord Alliance activity helped subjects in an intersex condition, with their families and their partner offering advice to cope with developmental tasks. In 2006 a critical document was drafted by two important paediatric endocrinologist associations (Hughes, Houk, Ahmed, Lee, & LWPES/ESPE Consensus Group, 2006) and established guidelines on DSD management. Consensus Statement on Management of Intersex Disorders took into account the lack of data and the varieties of DSD and, in spite of this complexity, the authors were able to identify effective and flexible clinical strategies for avoiding social stigma; a subject in an intersex condition should not be assigned to one sex before specialists have given their evaluation; subjects with DSD and their families should be openly and fully informed about intersex conditions and predictable effects; their opinions and emotional reactions should be taken in account. Furthermore, treatment should be chosen on the basis of their capacity to avoid gender dysphoria symptoms: “factors that influence gender assignment include the diagnosis, genital appearance, surgical options, need for life long replacement therapy, the potential for fertility, views of the family, and sometimes the circumstances relating to cultural practices” (Hughes et al., 2006, p. 152). Another important issue concerns those intersex conditions that need to be treated with surgery due to a risk of neoplasia; in all other cases surgical intervention should be postponed until the person with DSD can take responsible decisions.

Families with a DSD Member Facing Decision-Making on Treatment

The Consensus Statement on Management of Intersex Disorders (2006) led to an essential reflection on different treatment and obliged medical staff and families to think short and long term effects through. On these bases Wiesemann, Ude-Koeller, Sinnecker, & Thyen (2010) reported the results of the German working group “Bioethics and Intersex” within the German Network DSD/Intersex, which tried to put together the perspectives of clinicians, individuals with DSD and families. One of the main principles regards the medical aspect of DSD: “the appearance of the external genitalia in DSD generally causes no medical problems or immediate health threats to the child” (Wiesemann et al., 2010, p. 673), so that it is suggested to wait until the age of 5 or 6 for minor interventions and until the age of 12 or 14 for the major ones. A surgical moratorium until the age of consent could help to avoid surgery that does not confirm identity gender in adolescence and adulthood. From the same standpoint the ambiguity of expressions that evaluate ethical reasons is stressed: what are the best interests of the child? Are they always the same one for everyone? Would a very anxious parent be more inclined to choose a surgical solution? Would being faced with ambiguous genitals be more difficult for an excessively firm parent? And what do we mean when we talk about the ultimate best interests of the child? (Chase, 2003; Diamond & Beh, 2006; Miano, 2011).

In any event parent-child relationships should be protected and parents’ reactions to DSD are among the most significant variables in the wellbeing of children with DSD. Parents and family members should be supported in accepting the intersex condition during the whole developmental process. Thus the 9 principles and recommendations of the German working group advocate “a shift in paradigm from optimal appearance and potential functioning to optimal emotional and social development trying to maximize the child’s and future adults’ participation in decision making on one hand and a good parent–child relationship on the other” (Wiesemann et al., 2010, p. 675).

Another issue is stressed by Davidian (2011), who wonders whether parents and guardians should have the authority to consent procedure that implies sterilization and loss of genital tissue.
and consequently the possibility of enjoying sexual relations. Intersex activists, by comparing intersex surgery with female genital mutilation (FGM), aim to bring human rights issues into the debate. The author states that this comparison failed in its purpose because of cultural reasons; FGM is considered a cultural practice whereas genital “cosmetic and normalizing” surgery is evaluated as a standard medical practice; instead of comparing genital surgery with FGM, it would have been more useful to compare it with male circumcision since they are both performed in order to enable children to meet their society standards and to be accepted by their community (Jurgensen, Hampel, Hiort, & Thyen, 2006; Frader, Alderson, Asch et al., 2004). This analogy makes it easier to understand the weight of social pressure with regard to gender identity and body appearance: “the need and desire to be socially accepted and understood cannot be overstated” (Davidian, 2011, p. 14). Bodily integrity is, therefore, a focal element in the intersex debate, but it will be hard to dispute parental consent as long as genital surgery is evaluated as a standard medical practice.

It seems that initial parental reactions to a DSD diagnosis have considerable influence on future decisions based around their own intuition, the appearance of external genitalia, the imaging reports of gonads and genetic testing results. Parents’ descriptions of DSD management reflect their emotional state and astonishment; parents view surgery as the only alternative “the minute he was born, here he had this – it has to be fixed... It was never any question whether he was gonna go through the surgery or not (…). We really never had to make a decision... the doctors told us what was gonna need to be done” (Crissman, Warner, Gardner, Carr, Schast, Quittn, Kogan, & Sandberg, 2011, p. 4-5). Nevertheless, doubts, anxiety and fears remain after surgery and with particular concern regarding gender identity and role, genital appearance, sexual function and couple relationship. Moreover there are constant worries about sharing the information with others; parents are troubled by the social stigma, by viewpoints about who has the right to talk about the DSD and the feelings associated with providing communication about DSD. Therefore, secrecy and privacy should be balanced out with the opportunity to receive social support and to choose with whom to share information (Crissman et al., 2011).

From a qualitative perspective Sanders, Carter & Goodacre (2011; 2012) emphasize, on the one hand, that, after childbirth, parents describe events and diagnosis as confusing and chaotic, and, on the other hand, that it is difficult for parents to protect their children from other people’s intolerance or curiosity. They try to prevent their children from being teased by not talking about the DSD and this attempt is associated with idealized expectations about the effects of surgery. Parents sometimes regret giving their consent for surgical treatment and feel as if they have abandoned their child: “there was no discussion about not having surgery, as she believed that surgery was essentially a solution that was able to completely fix complex genital issues: but you know, it was fine because he just told us what we wanted to hear which was...yes we can fix this” (Sanders, Carter, & Goodacre, 2007, p. 3192).

Coping was identified as a significant variable in evaluating family adjustment to DSD by de Medeiros Rocha Santos & Cavalcanti Ferreira de Araujo (2008); they recognized five typologies of functional or dysfunctional coping strategies in a group of caregivers of children with DSD (3 mothers and 1 grandmother): 1) before gender assignment the child is called by a gender neutral name; 2) caregivers do not expose the child’s body; 3) the gender assigned is considered definitive; 4) treatment is chosen by participating in the decision-making process; 5) children are left free to explore gender roles or 6) on the contrary, children are reprimanded or punished if they behave like
children of the opposite sex. In addition, parents provide advice on how to tackle social difficulties, reply to indiscreet questions and respond to peer teasing. As a consequence of this reflection it is stressed that psychological support must be continuous and addressed to all family members and is intended to help parents to enable their children to explore gender roles and gender expression through various toys, friends and attitudes.

The variety of coping strategies shows how they can have either positive or negative short- and long-term effects on individuals with DSD and their families (McCubbin, McCubbin, Patterson, Cauble, Wilson, & Warwick, 1983). Research by Duguid, Morrison, Robertson, Chalmers, Youngson, & Ahmed (2007) confirms that parents are often anxious about social stigma, but also about actual surgery and related anaesthesia. It might be interesting to underline that parents usually opt for treatment that avoids the teasing of children, but they do not associate the risk of stigma with surgical delay.

Furthermore, in order to take decisions about treatment, parents have to cope with DSD in the various developmental phases of their children. Hullmann, Fedele, Wolfe-Christensen, Mullins, & Wisniewski (2011) focused their research on five different stages (infancy and toddlerhood, preschool age, school age and adolescence) and analysed two variables in parenting capacity: parental overprotection and parenting stress; these two variables, moreover, could be taken as a measure of adjustment within the parent-child relationship. Parental overprotection indicates dysfunctional behaviour since caregivers tend to protect their children even if it is not necessary to protect them; parenting stress concerns the stress related to a parenting role. Both of these elements are associated with negative outcomes in emotional, behavioural and social adjustment and these negative outcomes get worse in children with chronic illnesses (Hullmann, Wolfe-Christensen, Meyer, McNall-Knapp, & Mullins, 2010). It is interesting that researchers found similar rates of stress and overprotection in parents with children in an intersex condition and parents with children with type 1 diabetes mellitus (Fedele, Kirk, Wolfe-Christensen, Phillips, Mazur, Mullins, Chernausek, & Wisniewski, 2010).

Parental overprotection seems to decrease as children grow up and overprotection during infancy and toddlerhood is higher than in the control group; on the other hand, during adolescence parental stress scores are significantly higher than in the control group and concern the parental role: “I feel trapped by my responsibilities as parent (…) Most times I feel that my child does not like me and does not want to be close to me” (Hullmann et al., 2011, p. 5).

Early surgery decisions do not prevent parents from facing gender dysphoria symptoms that might emerge during infancy, adolescence or later. In some cases children with DSD do not feel at ease with their assigned gender and wish to live in the opposite gender; it is very challenging for children in an intersex condition and their caregivers to differentiate between a real desire to live in the opposite gender and a predictable need to explore both feminine and masculine behaviour (Meyer-Bahlburg, 2008).

Families with a DSD Member Confronting Short and Long Term Effects

Surgical intervention represents one of the major issues regarding the intersex condition. On the one hand the optimal gender policy emphasizes the process of normalizing the intersex body and tends towards early surgical intervention in order to assign or re-assign children to the sex with the best adjustment prediction; from this viewpoint specialists use terms such as corrective surgery.
On the other hand surgical intervention is viewed as potential genital mutilation if subject with DSD does not actually seek it.

Feder recognizes a link between homosexuality depatologization and intersex depatologization, and identifies another way of reflecting on DSD; taking a perspective that could help to choose the best treatment for each individual: ‘rather than fight for the demedicalization of intersex conditions that indeed have consequences for individuals’ health, acceptance of this change can transform the conceptualization of intersex conditions from their past treatment as disorders like no other to disorders like many others” (Feder, 2009, p. 227).

Focusing on children and adolescents with DSD within their families, is it possible to identify characteristics that help subjects to cope positively with the intersex condition. As happens with other non-normative life events (Walsh, 2008) the meaning that each member of the family finds in each event changes the experience. In particular, we can recognize three factors involved in understanding the intersex condition and supporting individuals with DSD: gender stereotypes, emotional skills and sense of security.

Gender stereotypes define gender roles, behaviour and expectations regarding an individual, based on the individual’s gender; cognitive processes are influenced by stereotypes. Subjects with an intersex condition have an assigned sex that is not always well-matched with gender identity and often individuals with DSD report a mild or severe discomfort with regard to their gender (Schweizer, Brunner, Schützmann, Schönbucher, & Richter-Appelt, 2009). While transsexual subjects might not feel at ease with their sex because they feel they belong to the opposite sex (Witten, 2003), individuals in an intersex condition are often uncertain about their gender; DSD is frequently associated with Gender Identity Disorder (GID) and with the feeling of insecurity regarding one’s gender. Rather than a certitude that life would be better after a sex-reassignment, individuals in an intersex condition are often insecure and doubtful about their gender. There are periods (either short or long) in which they feel more male, others in which they feel more female and others still in which there is no prevalence in gender identification. We might suggest that the more rigid the gender stereotype, the more likely a gender identity disorder. Therefore, in a family system, we might affirm that the more rigid the gender role, the more difficult will it be to cope with an intersex condition; flexibility and the capacity not to be frightened by uncertainty are essential conditions (Melby, 2002).

Emotional skill is the second factor that could help in confronting an intersex condition. By expressing and managing emotions we increase our capacity to understand our inner world and that of others; in an intersex condition both the individual with DSD and his/her principal caregivers have to cope with strong emotional responses. Intersex conditions place individuals in a complex position with regard to their identity; for individuals with DSD it is often difficult to identify themselves as either male or female, to establish their sexual orientation and to establish their gender identity in order to have satisfying relationships with other individuals. In the unexpected event of a DSD diagnosis the person involved will tend to feel depressed, angry, shocked, disappointed and could suffer from a wide range of negative emotions. Subjects with high levels of reflective functioning are able to identify their emotional reactions and those of others; they can distinguish one emotion from another, give a name to each of these, accept both positive and negative effects and modulate negative effects in order to handle them more effectively (Fonagy, 2007). Therefore, dealing with an intersex condition will be easier for those who have higher
mentalization skills, which might help them to accept the DSD and to adjust to the intersex condition.

Another focal point in dealing with an intersex condition is the sense of security that individuals with a DSD might perceive as a resource. Subjects in an intersex condition often report that they have been rejected by parents, family and friends because of their condition (Chase, 1998); occasionally caregivers might be so upset about their children’s uncertain gender situation, so scared about how their children might develop, so overwhelmed by the issue of identity, that they are unable to maintain an acceptable and close relationship. On the contrary, other subjects with DSD report warm relationships with their principal caregivers and friends and underline how crucial it was for them to feel the sense of acceptance, love and security received from others; more specifically, it seems that a sense of security is associated with better adjustment and overall psychosocial wellbeing (Hegarty, 2000; Miano, Granatella, & Garro, 2011).

Conclusions

The issues of parental responsibility and parental consent to genital surgery regard various elements: emotional reactions, coping strategies, gender role, cultural issues. In this complex theoretical framework, parental legitimacy to authorize surgery is associated with potential iatrogenic harm as regards severe potential outcomes such as sterilization, infertility and loss of sexual pleasure (Gurney, 2007). A philosophical perspective might help in understanding how individuals, families, medical staff and communities perceive DSD and to promote a positive image of the intersex condition. Grabham (2012) highlights a theoretical issue concerning the conceptualization of the body and poses the question of timing in connection with surgery: “understanding the social and ethical effects of surgeries requires addressing the relationship between corporeality and temporality. In other words, surgeries, and their effects on bodily integrity, can and should be theorized as temporal phenomena, or at least as processes heavily influenced by ideas of time” (Grabham, 2012, p. 6). She wonders if it might be more correct to consider the body, before and after genital surgery, as two different bodies, or if it is preferable to perceive the body after surgery as reframing new features. Terms like to fix, to normalize and genital cosmetic surgery arise from an ideal body image in which everything should exist in a specific and exact manner; despite this fact, studies on reconstruction demonstrate that re-establishing wholeness (as a result of a malformation or an amputation) could have negative effects and could damage one’s self-identity. After structuring a positive personal identity and a satisfying self-image (independently of objective body appearance) surgery treatment engenders interruption, rupture, breakage and disjuncture, which are always associated with dissonance: “even if it is accepted that genital surgeries cause temporal interruptions, the implication here might be that these are interruptions of otherwise happy and healthy corporeal time-lines” (Grabham, 2012, p. 16).
References


McCubbin, H., McCubbin, M., Patterson, J.M., Cauble, A.E., Wilson, L.R., & Warwick, W.


University Press.


Afro–American Autobiography as Ideological Documentation: A study of Richard Wright’s *Black Boy*

Nasir Umar Muhammad  
Federal University Dutse, Jigawa State, Nigeria

**Abstract**

A pre-occupation with the political and social problem is evident in the works of a number of early black writers. The Afro–Americans and indeed, the black race had undergone several stages of human and material exploitation, from the triangular slave trade period of the 15th century to the colonization period of the 18th century. This paper examines the theory of Afro–American autobiography and places Richard Wright’s *Black Boy* within the continuum of Black autobiography. The paper discusses issues relating to the formation of an ideology in Afro–American Autobiography. The paper further seeks to prove that, autobiography a part from being a study of the Creative Process, a humanistic study of the ways of men and the forms taken by human consciousness can also be viewed as an ideological document.

**Keywords:** Black boy, autobiography, Ideology, race.
Introduction

Black Boy (1945) is Wright’s first autobiographical work, in it, he reveals in bitter personal terms the devastating impact of racial prejudice on young black males in the United States. The narrative points out the many psychological and cultural similarities between 20th century racism and its predecessor, slavery.

Wright’s other non-fiction works include Black power (1954), a commentary on the emerging nations of Africa; The color curtain (1956), which focuses on the so-called third world; Pagan Spain (1957), which addresses the fascist rule in that country; and American Hunger (1977), a second autobiographical work, in 1941, Wright collaborated with photographer Edwin Ruska on 12 million black voices, a folk History of blacks in America (Olney, 1980). Wright’s first book, Uncle Tom’s Children (1938; revised ), consisted of four novellas that dramatize racial prejudice. The book won first prize in a writing competition sponsored by the writer’s project.

According to David Marc, (2009: 20), “Wright’s most acclaimed works are the novel Native Son (1940) and the autobiographical memoir Black Boy (1945). Native Son explores the violent psychological pressures that drives bigger Thomas, a young black man, to murder. Through a special artistic ability, Wright presents a careful psychological and social examination of the story’s events and of American race relation. Native Son was an immediate sensation with white and black readers and this wide appeal, helped make Wright the first American writer to have a book – of the month club selection. (Marc 2009).

Wright moved to France in the late 1940s. He published several more novels during his life time, including The Outsider (1953), which describes an African American character’s involvement with the communist party in Chicago; and the Long Dream (1958), about a boy’s childhood in Mississippi. The short-story collection, Eight men and novel Lewd Today (1963) were published after Wright’s death.

What is important to note in all Wright’ literary sojourn as documented in both his fictional and non-fictional works is his concern with commitment and protest. Hazel (2001; 20) observes that “a part from the political sophistication and deep social involvement, Wrights’ books are notable for their passionate sincerity. He was perceptive about the universal problems that had the ability to destroy mankind.”

This perceptive ability to situate racism within a universal framework also proves the affinity of “Black Boy” with Peter Abrahams’ “Tell freedom” irrespective of their spatio-temporal locations. Because within the deep structure of racism, minority or majority is not a factor in the equation, but the existence of a super structure that ensures the perpetuation of and the continuity in the series of dehumanizing activities of destroying mankind deemed ‘inferior’ race by a supposedly ‘superior’ one.
If *Native Son* (1940) as Hazel (2001) pointed out ‘a brutally honest depiction of black urban, ghetto life’ is most successful of all his non-fiction works, then *Black boy* owing to his commitment to truth becomes his most successful non-fiction work. The book immediately after publication, (January 1945), its sales reached four hundred thousand copies by March of that same year.

John Herrick (1999:16), when commenting on Wright’s literary accomplishments pointed to the fact that, ‘here at last was a black writer who undeniably wrote considerably better than many of his white contemporaries’.

In Afro- American literary cycle, the period of the late 1940’s was the period of Richard Wright. And that period, marked the end of indulgence for Negro writers.

The closing of this era in the opinion of Herrick (1999:19) ‘in the final analysis is the greatest contribution Richard Wright made to the status of Negro writers and to literature’.

*Black Boy* As a Unique Story of the Reality of the African – American life

The reality of the African – American life in general is that of oppression; the task and the mission of the black writers therefore are with creating a work of art in a segregated society. In expressing this reality, the black writer, has to first; explain the society to him and create his art while opposing that society. And secondly, he cannot be honest with himself or his people without lending his support, at least verbally. It is within this intellectual milieu that black autobiography, a minority within a minority takes its power – the power of consciously representing the ideals of black people; the ideals of reasons and consistency.

Undoubtedly, Wright has been consistent in presenting his ideology in relation to the reality of the African – American life in “Black boy”. This is even so, since as observed by Rosenblatt (1976:176), ‘in autobiography, one is not merely getting at the self, but at reality as well, the one not existing outside its relation to the other’.

Born on a plantation near Natchez in Mississippi in 1908 Wright in his *Black boy* went to some pain to make clear that;

His cultural alienation had begun in his black home and in black community where as a small child he was scarcely aware of the existence of a white race …. That his family had tried to beat fear and submission into his mature years before interracial contacts made evident the rationale for a’ Nigger’ identity ….and saw black and whites as inseparably fused in their acceptance of a grotesque racial myth

In chapter one of a “Black Boy”, awareness comes to young Wright at the age of four. This awareness for a black child carries with it mixed and contradictory emotions: love, fear, guilt, distrust, longing and feeling of hopelessness, all within the early stage of growing up. So, Wright opens his eyes
as a child and find his psyche’ entrenched with an image reflecting the social and racial realities of his time.

According to Rosenblatt (1976), the ‘argument’ of black autobiography is:

Against the existing Universe which the narrator was and is an essential if uncomfortable part, the ‘argument’ of the work is extended against the Self. Black autobiography annihilates the self because by so doing it takes the world with it. (p.80)

At the beginning of *Black Boy*, Wright had set his house a fire, he said: ‘I yearned to become invisible, to stop living’. This incidence of burning his house at that age shows that, after coming face to face with an unjust reality of existence, young Wright felt that things must change immediately and revolutionarily too hence the use of fire. In creating the true picture of racism, Wright, narrated his disappointment when he saw the boat they were to board when travelling with his mother to Memphis.

‘For days I had dreamed about a huge white boat floating on a vast body of water, but when my mother took me down to the levee on the day of leaving, I saw a tiny, dirty boat that was not at all like the boat I had imagined’. And to further paint the picture of the ghetto in which the blacks live, he described their home in Memphis and its environment:

In Memphis we live in a one –story brick tenement. The stone buildings and the concrete pavements looked bleak and hostile to me. The absence of green growing things made the city seem dead. Living space for the four of us – my mother, my brother, my father, and me – was a kitchen and a bedroom. In the front and rear were paved areas in which my brother and I could play, but for days I was afraid to go into the strange city street alone.

In the above description, within Wright’s autobiographical consciousness, we find a succinct revelation of a life characterized by horrible experience from childhood. This made young Wright to see life as a harsh journey through which he must pass. And his defense strategies for survival within those conditions include a brutal approach. What he aims for is a feeling of satisfaction in most of those brutal actions, after setting the house a fire, the next brutal action was killing the kitten. Knowing fully that his father never meant what he said when he was asked to kill it:

How could I hit back at him? (His Father) oh, yes….he had said to kill the kitten and I would kill it! I know that he had not really meant for me to kill the kitten, but my deep hate of him urged me towards a literal acceptance of his word. (p.8)

Wright suffers serious hunger and deprivation and to artistically present to his readers that racism is always felt in everything a Blackman does the children of the blacks:

Mama, I’m hungry’ I complained one afternoon.
‘Jump and catch a kungry, she said trying to make me laugh and forget.
’ What’s a kungry?
It’s what little boy eat when they get hungry.
She said. ‘What does it taste like?’
I don’t know.
‘then why do you tell me to catch one?
‘I sensed that she was teasing me and it made me angry
But I am hungry, I want to eat’
‘You will have to wait ‘ But I want to eat now ‘
But there’s nothing to eat’ eat’ she told me ‘why’
‘ just because there is none, she explained
‘But I want to eat’ I said beginning to cry.
‘You just have to wait again but why?
For god to send food’
When is he going to send it?
I don’t know’
But I ‘m hungry
She was ironing and she paused and looked at me with tears in her eyes (p.12)

To further present the hollowness and hopelessness of existence, he narrated how adults made him drunk and says obscenities in a saloon at the age of six. This further demonstrates the bleakness of black life in America. The cultural Baseness of black life was equally presented after Wright passed through childhood and discovered that:

After I had outlived shocks of childhood, after habit of reflection had been born in me, I used to mull over the strange absences of real kindness in Negroes, how in genuine passion we were how void of great hope, how timid our joy, how bare our tradition how hallow our memories? How lacking we were in those intangible sentiments that bind man to man and how shallow was even our despair?

After I had learned other ways of life I used to brood upon the unconscious irony of those who that Negroes led so passionate an existence! I saw that what had been taken for our emotional strength was negative confusion, our flights, our fears our frenzy under pressure (p.31)

Wright in Black Boy, more than in all his other non-fiction works succeeds in dramatizing by fictional techniques the truth of his recreated life that culminates in the triumph of his will and ideology. He does this successfully by deliberately reversing the usual connotation western tradition has assigned to black and white that black is always bad and white good. The imagery of light and dark, black and white, is similarly mutable and resist simple formation. The south is dark, so dark that he wonders over the fact that the sun is still shining (Mandel, 1980). Another imagery used by Wright for his yearning is hunger. The entire book is strung between hunger and satisfaction; light and darkness; black and white; and many more opposing irreconcilable forces. Wright therefore set his biography within some ideological needs which locate the self as part of a social program aimed at change in a certain direction. The wind of change always blows from the north. To get the change Wright had to follow that direction and laments that:

Yet deep down that I could never really leave the south, for my feeling had always been formed by the south, for there had been slowly instilled into my personality and
consciousness, black though I was the culture of the south. So in leaving, I was taking a part of the south to transplant in alien soil, to see if it could grow differently if it could of new and cool rains, bend in strange winds, respond to the warmth of the other son and perhaps to bloom... And if that miracle ever happens and, then I would know that there was yet hope in that southern swamp of despair and violence, that light could emerge even out of the blackest of the southern night. I would know that the south too could overcome its fear. Its hate, its cowardice, its heritage of guilt and blood, its burden of anxiety and compulsive cruelty. (p.228)

In the above submission, Wright evokes the feeling of despair and the necessity to move north. Because that movement is in the main, the beginning of realization of the ultimate yearning for freedom. The voyage is a necessary evil. He has seen the light through literature; in literature the hope resides which has to be expressed in literary form.

Wright has clearly indicated that the religion (symbolized by the church) is only good in theory, but for obvious racial reasons, not practicable. For practicing it will equalize all God’s children on earth. And racism is always there to say no. Wright also made a blasphemous statement and is always quarrelling with Granny over her religious beliefs, he queried the machinery of Granny’s maneuvering when she sent a boy from the neighborhood to preach to Wright and bring him to God. Wright frankly expressed his understanding of the world in relation to the existence of God a propos the realities of racism:

Embedded in me was a motion of the suffering in life, but none of it seemed like the consequences of original sin to me; I simply could not feel weak and cost in a cosmic manner. I had been made to go church, I had given God’s existence a sort of tacit assent, but after having seen His creatures serve Him at first hand, I had my doubts. My faith, such as it was, was welded to the common realities of life anchored in the sensation of my body nothing could ever shake this faith and surely not my fear of an invisible power. (p.100)

On that same page, still on religion, Wright made a hypothetical statement that summed up his attitude towards God and the suffering in the world. In other words, he expressed his ideology about religion, that if after suffering from dread, fear, hunger, terror and loneliness, another fear of an invisible power is added to his miserable life then that invisible power, if it actually exists, and could not do anything to alleviate those visible calamities he had experienced firsthand, then it does not deserve either his acknowledgement of its existence or further additional subjugation of his already over troubled soul in the hope of reaping anything in the hereafter. To further prove that he is not afraid of the consequences of death, he puts the hypothetical statement thus:

“If laying down my life could stop the suffering in the world, I’d do it but I don’t believe anything can stop it”. (p.100)

Wright in his desperate attempt to remind his readers that the Negro is not in himself inferior to the White man, and that his apparent inferiority is essentially the result of poverty, neglect, lack of education and discrimination, he saved money for his education and sometimes going without food.
The fifteenth year in the life of our hero was a turning point in a more challenging manner. For young Lee, he lost all his savings and became homeless. The beginning of struggle against the forces of racism without home and a family to return to. And for young Richard:

I was in my fifteenth year; in term of schooling I was far behind the average youth of the nation, but I did not know that. In me was shaping a yearning for kind of consciousness, mode of being that was the way of life about me had said could not be, must be, and upon which the penalty of the death had been placed. Somewhere in the southern night my life had switched onto the wrong track and, without my knowing it, the locomotive of my heart was rushing forwards a dangerous steep slope heading for a collision, heedless of the warning red light that blinked all about me, the sirens and the bells and the screens that filled the air.(p.148)

So also Wright in his own ideological manner, resented and breaks out of the limits of knowledge and awareness that were laid down for him both by tradition and by the ‘JIM CROW LAWS’; that is the laws designed to prevent the Negro from enjoying any political power. Over the effect of these loaf sided Jim Crow Lows, Wright was:

Building up a dream in which I saw the entire educational system of the South to have rigged to stifle. I was feeling the very thing that the state of Mississippi had spent millions of dollars to make sure that I would never feel; I was becoming aware of the thing that the Jim Crow Laws had been drafted to pass and keep out of my consciousness; I was acting on impulses that Southern senators in the nation had striven to keep out of Negro life; I was beginning to dream the dreams of what the state had said were wrong, that the school had said were taboo.(p.148)

A part from the intensity of the Jim Crows Laws, Wright seems to tell the world that the whites were conscious only of what has happening at a given moment; this enables him to describe a certain kind of insensitivity, a failure to understand the significance of an event in light of whole story of that event – here, of slavery, of the civil war, of poverty, of discrimination. And in a systematic way, Wright always brings his burden of memory, knowledge and awareness (the essential tool that formed his ideology), hence his inability to accept the expected of him. The role of subservience, the role of the submission to aggression; the role of representing the cultural barrenness of black life, all these are to be played within ‘the aura of limitless freedom.’

Within this ‘aura of limitless freedom’, a sense of rebellion was born in the psyche’ of young Wright just as is the case of his counterpart Peter Abrahams in Tell Freedom when he blatantly refused to conform to the norms of white supremacy in South Africa. Such rebellious stances by autobiographers, always serve as a harbinger for trouble. Wright was sacked more than once from different places of work. This is because of the burning ideology that, he too is not less than human. (Dignity of man)

In this rebellious stance, Wright is a degree above Abrahams. This he demonstrates by his expression of feelings not merely of hatred of the white and all they represent, but by deliberate design
to act. This action is in form of attack. Therefore, he was sacked from job, in narrating and analyzing his ordeals. He clearly points out that:

As time separated me from the experience, I could feel no hate for the men who had driven me from the job. They did not seemed to be individual men, but part of huge implacable elemental design towards which hate is futile. What I did feel was a longing to attack. But how? And because I knew of no way to grapple with this thing, I felt doubly cast out. (p.170)

When he was sacked again from the drug store, he sat down to reassess what was wrong with him or the system that perpetually pushes him to the periphery of existence:

I knew what was wrong with me, but I could not correct it. The words and action of white people were baffling signs to me. I was living in a culture and not a civilization I could learn how that culture worked only by living with it. Misreading the reaction of whites around me made me say and do the wrong things. In my dealing with white I was conscious entirely of my relation with them and where conscious only of what was happening at a given moment. I had to keep remembering what others took for granted; I had to think out what others felt. (p.171)

In the fulfillment of black autographical formula, after Wright became saturated with ideas that stem from the reading of books on literary criticism, he resolved that moving north in form of self exile, becomes inevitable; because that idea is what give him a glimpse of hope in the future:

In the main my hope was merely a kind of self defense, a conviction that if I did not leave I will perish, either because of possible violence of others against me, or because of my possible violence against them. The substance of my hope was formless. Book didn’t add something to an already adequate life, but help to fill some of the holes in an inadequate life, in a swamp of despair and violence. (P.226)

With a feeling of hope and desire to actualize his dream Wright headed north on to the unknown:

I was leaving the South to fling myself into the unknown, to meet other situations that will perhaps elicit from me other responses and if I could meet enough of a different life then perhaps gradually and slowly I might learn who I was, what I might be. I was not leaving the South to forget the South but so that someday I might understand it, might come to know what its rigors has done to me to its children. I fled so that the numbness of my defensive leaving might thaw out and let me feel the pain years later and far away of what living in the south had meant. (P.228)
Conclusion

Wright establishes the fact that, through autobiography, experiences are presented to the reader. These experiences develop over time and culminate into an ideology. African Americans because of their long tradition as oppressed peoples have found an outlet in the autobiographical form. Within this fold of autobiography, Wright rightly points the consequent exploitation, discrimination, and repression which further hardened him and were accompanied by ideological explanations or inscriptions and policies at the bottom of which was deliberate subordination and exclusion of the blacks in the then South America. Within this terrain, it becomes evident that Wright was primarily influenced by Literature and through this he developed a yearning for a better future. All these put together gave him hope. And later, developed an ideology which he presented in an autobiographical form in his book, *Black Boy*.

From the foregoing analysis, Wright demonstrates what Barrett J. Mandel (1980-55) established about autobiographies: ‘Autobiographies are not essentially tabular; they are experimental: an autobiography shares experience as its way of revealing reality’. In this paper, we have shared Wrights’ bitter experiences and have seen the picture of reality he tries to depict in his autobiography. We have equally seen a unique reflection of the dominant racial prejudices that made Wright not only rebellious but ideologically different from other blacks in the same trauma and under the same condition in the South America of their time. These differences find expression in his dual dealings with whites sometimes with grave consequences and in his dealings with the members of his family and his immediate community, who equally suffer his predicament.
References

- Abrahams, Peter (1976) *Tell Freedom*. George Allan and Unwin G.B.


- Lawan , Farouk (1990) :Literature and Revolutionary Dialectics :
* A Study of literary Response To Apartheid*. (an un published M.A Thesis of The Department Of English & French Bayero University, Kano


“Unbinding Prometheus”

Imen Mzoughi
University of Jendouba, Tunisia

Abstract

Rewriting is a mosaic of citations, that is, a new kind of writing grafted on an old one. From this vantage point, Aeschylus’s play Prometheus Bound filiates the sources of two Romantic poets, namely, Byron and Goethe. These traverse back history to Prometheus and to the world of mythology. They identify themselves with the figure of Prometheus, who is a container of the foundational ideals of the Romantic vision of poetry and the poet. By the same token, the text becomes a place for the residual elements between traditional and contemporary communities. In this way, Lord Byron and Goethe appropriate and rework the mythical figure of Prometheus. “Unbinding Prometheus” is an endeavour to examine the different treatments of the myth of Prometheus in two different texts by Byron and Goethe with reference to Aeschylus’ Prometheus Bound as a manifest text.

Keywords: ‘Anxiety of Influence,’ Intertextuality, parody and Re-writing.
Any work of art is not immune from the influence of predecessors. As such, writers strive to possess the forms in which the spirit of great intellectuals manifests itself. This idea is at the heart of the dual function of the artist, and, more particularly, the poet who performs the task of ‘creation’ in consciousness of ‘tradition’. As to imitation, poetry is a mimetic art. It creates, but it creates by combination and representation. In this respect, the romantic poets, namely, Byron and Goethe appropriate and rework the mythical figure of Prometheus. Accordingly, they combine their own romantic vision of poetry and the status of the artist with what they ‘lifted’ from Aeschylus.

As one can easily infer, the lyric of subjectivity lies in-between the mythical and the poetic. Poetry entails the poeticization of the mythical. The multiple ‘I’s, in Byron’s and Goethe’s texts refer to a dispersed subjectivity occupying infinite positions, which stretch over the space of time separating the original event, that is, the beginning of the myth and all contexts of enunciation blending myths with realities. From this vantage point, the romantic vision handles a notion of parody. This is evident through the transformation partaken by the poets.

The first part of this paper sets the ground for the methodology adopted by the romantics in approaching the myth of Prometheus, more precisely, Harold Bloom’s notorious theory of the “anxiety of influence.” The second part undertakes a closer study of the texts in Byron’s ode and Goethe’s poem on Prometheus establishing the ground for a comparative study of: first, the reconfiguration of events, and second, the scenic representation of Prometheus by reference to the tradition of Greek mythology upon which the romantic rhetoric of the representation of Prometheus is built. The focus on the punishment of Prometheus and his closeness to humanity brings the two versions together in terms of the placement of the mythical figure.

Then, I will place the concept of rewriting at the heart of the departures undertaken by the Romantic poets examining the particular ideologies underlying each rewriting. The two texts rub against each other in terms of the stylistic and thematic concerns to produce an extended metaphor of the romantic vision of Prometheus, poetry and the poet.

The Romantic Vision of the Poet and Poetry: Parodying the Myth of Prometheus

An integral part to the re-writing of the myth of Prometheus is that the two poets foreground a form of parody. From a position which obliterates historical and geographical difference, the two poets have developed in the lyrics of their poems an abstruse and imaginative theory with regard to creation. Their texts on Prometheus are the fruits of an outburst of poetic energy under the stimulus of Aeschylus’s play. They first break with the form of soliloquy. Besides, the romantic poets obliterate the trajectory of movements in the manifest text. Their poems turn to be forms of resistance against forgetfulness suspended between the past of the myth, its present and future moments. As long as humanity exists, the myth shall always be remembered, hence, the power of the imaginative impulse rendered in a most poetic form.

Perhaps more importantly, the specificity of the two romantic poets’ texts is equally definite through their recurrent themes and the peculiarity of the tone of their re-writings of the myth. Their texts give us the metaphor of the palimpsest installing, hence, a double logic in which they blend the mythic and the poetic. The two poets thus operate within a structure of difference. Repetition is not a matter of a mere copy, but has a disruptive effect. It is precisely what Linda Hutcheon
describes as “discontinuity revealed at the heart of continuity, difference at the heart of similarity” (A Poetics of Postmodernism: History, Theory, Fiction 11).

The Romantics & the De-familiarization of the Familiar

The peculiarity of the Romantic poets’ texts lies in the fusion of two moments. The first is a poetic moment translated in the infusion of imagination and emotion, and a shift from the neoclassical balance, rationality and rigidity. The second is a socio-political moment, which targets the existing social and political conditions. Romanticism grows out of the tensions between the ideal concept and the failure of life to correspond to it. The grandeur of the figure of Prometheus is analogous to art, which is born out of constraints, lives through combats and dies to ensure freedom. In this regard, Harold Bloom has formulated a theory of poetry, which could lead toward a vivid critical life. This is obvious through Bloom’s early writings on his true precursor, namely, Blake.

Critics sagely observe that Bloom’s rewriting of Blake can be easily translated into the idiom of the ‘The Anxiety of Influence.’ The power of a poem, indeed, lies in both its referentiality and in its non-referentiality. In Bloom’s early reading of Blake, one can notice an emphasis on the relations between precursors and descendants as the central constituent of poetic meaning. Bloom chooses the figure of the covering cherub as the central emblem of his discussion of the ‘Anxiety of Influence.’ The cherub stands for the “creative anxiety that afflicts all imaginative people” (The Anxiety of Influence 36). This helps to demarcate the ‘other’ in all romantic quests, an ‘other’ now fully revealed to have its origins within the “spectre of the internalized poetic precursor” (The Anxiety of Influence 36), hence, the dialogue between the referential and the semiotic levels in poetic texts.

Intertextuality is the impetus which triggers the romantic poets’ journeys back to Prometheus and the world of mythology turning the familiar into unfamiliar. In their undertakings of the re-writing of the myth of Prometheus, Byron and Goethe engage their faculty of imagination to “make new things familiar and familiar things new,” using S. Johnson’s quote (as cited in http://www.gardendigest.com/poetry). In this sense, the poetic text turns to be the container of substitutions and transformations by means of inversion, conversion, expansion and juxtaposition. While the myth of Prometheus is literally presented in Aeschylus’s text, the two romantic poets complicate the matter further. The story in Aeschylus’s Prometheus Bound powerfully appeals to the idealists of the revolutionary romantic age. Goethe has seen in Prometheus the human creator shaping men in his own image and scorning the gods. For Byron, Prometheus is a symbol of heroic endurance.

In their different treatments of the mythical figure of Prometheus, the romantics’ representations of the character and the trajectory of events swing between sticking to the manifest text and departing from it. Aeschylus’s drama filiates the sources of the romantic poets. There is, indeed, a double-faced struggle between a poet and an adverse culture, and a struggle between two moments: one is traditional and the other is a contemporary moment. The text becomes a place for the residual elements between different societies. In this way, the romantic poet identifies with the figure of Prometheus, who is a container of the foundational ideals of the romantic vision of poetry and the poet.
Prometheus and the poet interlace in a perfect manner to the point that the readers cannot
distinguish between their respective voices. Such an achievement is assured by the innovation
of each poet in the process of artistic creation. Each poet brings something new in his distinct
representation of Prometheus, hence, transforming the ‘sociolect’ into an ‘idiolect.’ A closer study
of the texts will yield the romantic poets’ divergences in the re-writing of Prometheus at stylistic
and thematic levels.

Parodying the Form of the Original Text

Aeschylus’s manifest text *Prometheus Bound* fixes the mountain where Prometheus is
chained and the eagle is eating from his liver. This fixes the effect and explains the suffering and
pain endured by Prometheus. In their turns, the romantic poets transform the substance without
altering the outline. In other words, they adopt the same structure in the configuration of the events
with slight displacement of the scenic representation of Prometheus.

In his *ode* of Prometheus, Lord Byron opens his poem by an interjection “Titan!” and a
direct address of Prometheus followed by a series of rhetorical questions. There is, indeed, a slight
displacement of the chronological order of the events as they appear in the myth translated in a
series of questions: “What was thy pity’s recompense?” Besides, while Prometheus in Aeschylus’s
text uses the word ‘crime’ to talk about Zeus’ deeds, Byron twists and calls things by their actual
name. Byron re-establishes the chronological order in a very swift manner to better dwell on the
effects:

The rock, the vulture, and the chain

Moreover, Byron’s use of vague terms, like, ‘pity’ and ‘recompense’ centralize and
foreground the effect. In this way, Byron’s address centralizes Prometheus relegating, henceforth,
Zeus. From this vantage point, Byron minimizes the figure of the potentate to better handle the
worth, courage and nobility of Prometheus.

As for Goethe, the starting point is the present state of human beings who now master the
‘gifts’ offered by Prometheus. Goethe presents an already acquired state by humans. In terms of the
structure of the story, Goethe starts with causes. He first sheds light on the struggle between
Prometheus and Zeus. This is an early stage in the myth. Indeed, before he steals fire, Prometheus
“the one who thinks ahead” has detected Zeus’s determination to leave mortals as ants. Thus, we
still retain some form of effect-cause trajectory translated into a rehearsal of an early stage in the
story of the myth as presented in Aeschylus’s original text. Goethe extends the myth to include a
possible threat by Zeus. Goethe does not delineate the myth. He broadens the scope of the myth by
substituting Zeus by other evil elements.

Byron and Goethe repeat Aeschylus’s pattern of the myth in a different way. Like Shelley,
the English Romantic poet, who argues for the condensation of the myth, both Byron and Goethe
strive for brevity, which is ‘the soul of wit,’ using Shakespeare’s terminology. The power of poetry
lies in saying a lot using few words. Indeed, romantic poets approach the gods through poetry. The
newness of Byron’s and Goethe’s texts does not eradicate the sense of identification. This
constitutes a point at which the two texts meet with the manifest text paving the way for a
discussion of the appropriation of Prometheus’s attributes and deeds.
The myth of Prometheus is cherished by romantic poets. The moral interest of the fable, which is so powerfully sustained by the suffering and endurance of Prometheus, elevates Prometheus to a rank of a moral and intellectual perfection. The subject of Aeschylus’s play *Prometheus Bound* is the transgression of Prometheus, who brings fire to mankind and confers on them other benefits. Indeed, Prometheus endows mortals with ‘all art.’ The notion of art is inextricably related to the romantics’ vision of the world. Vision comes through the notion of art. Moreover, Prometheus steals fire to the gods.

As a motif, fire opens the eyes and minds of humans in order to rise above animality. In this way, humans become artistic developing a taste for goodness and beauty living in a dignified way. That is why, the deeds and attributes of Prometheus are celebrated in Byron’s Ode and Goethe’s poem. In Aeschylus’s text, Prometheus relates what he has done for mankind to the chorus of sea-nymphs:

```
Until I showed the risings of the stars,
And settings hard to recognize. And I
Found Number for them, chief device of all,
Groupings of letters, Memory’s hand maid that,
And mother of the Muses.
```

However, the two poets sing Prometheus’s deeds and attributes.

**The Representation of Prometheus’s Attributes**

Byron’s ode to Prometheus sings the deeds and attributes of Prometheus. He glorifies the persona of Prometheus endowing him with poetical characteristics surpassing in that the portrayal of Satan in Milton’s *Paradise Lost*. Prometheus is, in Shelley’s judgement, a more poetical character than Satan. In addition to courage and majesty, firm and patient opposition to omnipotent force, Prometheus is exempt from the taints of ambition, envy, revenge and the desire for personal aggrandizement. Besides, in Byron’s ode, the persona is no longer Prometheus narrating his story, but rather a son of Prometheus, who is the poet writing a praise song to his father Prometheus in order to establish a sense of justice for the ‘Friend of Mankind.’ The readers feel the poet’s as well as Man’s indebtedness to their ‘Saviour,’ who is a Christ-like figure.

Not only does Byron sing Prometheus’s attributes, but he also transforms what is ‘given’ into the lineaments of a solely visionary imagination. Indeed, Byron’s text unites his lyrically creative power of imagination and his passion for reforming the world. This is evident in the last stanza when the persona addresses directly his context ‘A Mighty lesson we inherit.’ Though the figure of the potentate is relegated, the poet’s power lies in addressing his time, namely, the ‘French Monarch’ and its tyranny, hence, illuminating the poet’s function within his society. Byron’s digressive technique in the last stanza calls attention to the poem’s self-reflexive relationship to its historical moment. The poet, therefore, appears as an enlightenment hero, who guides the community. He urges them to learn from Prometheus’s ‘mighty lesson’ and love each other.

As for Goethe, the handling of Prometheus’s deeds and attributes moves away from the sense of *écriture blanche* to create loaded and charged images. In this sense, the myth turns to be a kind of vessel reappropriating the attributes of Prometheus in terms of outburst. Goethe’s poem turns the mythical into human. The myth is never cut off from the reality of humanity. The myth
shapes humanity since Prometheus stands for Man. That is why, Goethe recuperates the basics of Prometheus’ heroic act, namely, his rebellion against the god of gods, Zeus to better accentuate the attributes in a form of confrontation between two single characters: Prometheus/Man versus. all form of hate/cruelty embodied in Zeus. Goethe has established an after-state in which human beings are fully aware of the now/here of their times, and like Prometheus, their benefactor, they are determined to stand still in front of totalitarianism and tyranny.

The rewriting of Prometheus’s attributes has become a sort of bespeaking of humane and divine self. One should follow the example set by Prometheus to bend the ills of one’s community and society. While human beings sympathize with their liberator under the form of un-dissociable fusion with Prometheus, the poet is determined to keep watch over humans:

Here I will sit, forming men  
After my own image,  
It will be a race like me,  
To suffer, to weep,  
To enjoy and to rejoice,  
And to pay no attention to you,  
As I do!

This revolutionary tone elevates the poet to the status of a viceroy, who is full aware of the persistence of evil.

Like Prometheus, the poet can see ahead of his times. Bound by a love for humanity, the romantic poet is not interested in filling the gaps, but rather in fighting the evil by returning to the original myth of Prometheus and his strong unrelenting love for humanity. There is a parallelism between Prometheus, who rebels against despotism, and the romantics who rebel against the tenets of neo-classicism in order to foreground what has been neglected, more precisely, the relegation of emotions and the power of imagination.

In short, this paper has striven to examine the re-writings undertaken by the Romantics of the myth of Prometheus. The peculiarity of the romantic poets’ texts lies in the fusion of a poetic moment with a socio-political moment. It is thus quite appropriate to say that the grandeur of the figure of Prometheus is analogous to art which was born out of struggle, lives to voice the marginalized and dies in the name of freedom.
References


The mediation of cultural identities: texts and contexts in Ghanaian video-films

Vitus Nanbigne
University of Cape Coast, Cape Coast, Ghana

Abstract

This paper examines the texts and contexts that inform the mediating processes that Ghanaian video-films have engaged in towards the creation of new cultural identities, often ambivalent, but sometimes extreme and contestable. The narratives and subtexts of video-films, particularly those of the Pentecostal and occult genres, have often posited new cultural identities and worldviews. The historical and cultural contexts within which these videos are produced and consumed often demonstrate their potential to create new perceptions about Ghanaians in general, and to effectively engage in the mediations and negotiations for new forms of socialization. This paper discusses those processes that inform contemporary public perceptions of Ghanaian identity (or identities) and what role video-films play in such processes, particularly within a Ghanaian context. Using theories of identity, representation and mediation, the paper attempts a textual reading of a sample of video-films in order to frame their narrative contexts and ideological subtexts in relation to their role in identity formation.

Keywords: Video-films, Mediation, Representation, Identity, Ghana, Text, Context.
Introduction

“Video-film” has emerged as the most popular expression, among several, to describe the practice of producing full length fictional motion pictures using video technology, and which are distributed on the same format or on various other digital formats. This practice, which emerged in both Ghana and Nigeria in the mid-1980s, and has become very popular across Africa, did not metamorphose out of the blue and grow in a vacuum. Rather certain cultural and economic contexts influenced their birth and growth. In the process of growing into considerably large industries, various cultural and economic factors came into play to mediate between the producers, the video-film texts and the audiences, thus producing a cornucopia of social meanings and new forms of identity formation.

In Ghana, whilst early video-films of the late 1980s were mainly concerned with the ongoing transformation of the national society at that time, following years of natural, political and social upheavals, video-films of the 1990s took on a wider variety of concerns, the most popular being the focus on the dualism between Christianity on one hand and witches, occultists and all others on the other hand. By 2005 video-film audiences had begun to witness a shift from these themes to more family dramas, postmodern themes and concerns over issues of royalty, albeit fictionalized and far from reality.

In these fictionalized representations of the nation, its people and culture, there have often been attempts to mediate new perspectives of various cultural identities. The socio-economic contexts within which the video texts are produced, marketed and consumed have often served as fertile grounds from which various ideas sprouted, including the good ones, the bad, the extreme, the purely nonsensical and the very ugly. What is of interest within the scope of this paper is how the producers of video-films have sought to create and popularize various forms of identities or to reinforce existing ones by employing the mediatory potentials of video texts to engage in dialogue with spectators, whether they do this consciously or not.

This dialogism, to borrow from Mikhail Bakhtin (1981), is that communicative process which results in new social allegiances and therefore the evolution of new identities. Dialogism is a school of literary criticism which emphasizes the relationship between an author and his/her literary work, the relationship between the work and its readers, and finally the relationship of all three to the social and historical forces that surround them.

Often these new forms of identity are expressed through the choice of social interactions, language styles, clothes, and tastes. For example, when one pays attention to local radio presenters in Ghana, one will notice many of them making great efforts to sound foreign, especially American. In the 1990s, following the introduction of tele-novelas from North and Latin America on Ghanaian television channels there was a noticeable increase in a preference for red dresses among women which were not funeral or Valentine-day related. Among some cultures in Ghana, the red colour is associated with funerals. I do not have empirical data to support this observation, but the sharp rise in trendy red dresses following the popularity of these TV soap operas was remarkable. I have also observed how lovers of the Charismatic-Pentecostal genre of video-films often engaged actively with the video texts, and by doing so, reinforced their beliefs in the physical presence of the supernatural, by identifying with the visualization and apparent physical manifestation of spirits,
which are portrayed in the video-films. Meyer (2004) has made similar observations about members of these non-orthodox Churches.

Video-films that depict family dramas (or families in crises) tend to be pontifical in their textual mediations and often audiences will take sides with the good characters and thus enjoy momentary feelings of moral superiority, if even for just one and half hours (or many hours, in cases where the video-film is produced in multiple parts). Both Sutherland-Addy (2000) and Meyer (2001) have also observed this type of engagement by many Ghanaian video-film audiences with the texts.

In the last ten years, there has been a shift to what may be referred to as postmodern themes, for want of a better expression. The tendency in Ghanaian video-films has been to depict a society that is being consumed by its own consumerism. The characters are depicted to be happy with their consumerist indulgence. For example, many video-films, such as *Princess Tyra* (2007) and *The King is Mine* (2009) portray Kings, Queens, Princes and Princesses living in environments that are far removed from contemporary royalty, and where ordinary citizens are shown to live in opulence but describe themselves as paupers. We see families, businessmen and women, and career oriented individuals who are all portrayed as successful in a certain ideal and utopian world, and yet who are not satisfied with their current statuses and want more. It is often a world that is portrayed to be devoid of economic challenges or cultural transformations. The conflicts are often centred on the individualistic and egoistic search for greater social power and unlimited wealth. This tendency reflects the producers’ fascination with, and an aspiration for ostentation, and by extension, feeds the fantasies of many audiences.

Before examining some of these videos, I wish to spend some time to propose some conceptual and theoretical frameworks within which this discussion of textual mediation will take place. For a start, I propose that our understanding of the key concepts of culture, identity and mediation be informed by their theoretical conceptions in both Media and Cultural Studies.

A Framework For The Study

The Concept of Culture

As a point departure, I will attempt a working concept of culture for my particular purpose in this paper. To try to define culture is to walk knowingly into a deadly mine-field. Many have tried and accepted the futility of such an exercise. The common definition that we mostly use for convenience is the amorphous and ambiguous definition that *culture is the total way of life of a people*.

As a human process, culture encompasses many things including media, mediation, identity and representation. These are themselves very fluid concepts because culture can be described as an arena for interactions, for negotiations, for interpretations and for the sharing of knowledge and experiences, which themselves are continuously in transformation.

Chris Barker (1999) has observed the futility in trying to define culture. Culture is noted as one of two or three most difficult words in the English Language. According to Barker, “culture is not ‘out there’ waiting to be correctly described by the theorists who keep getting it wrong. Rather,
the concept of culture is a tool which is of more or less usefulness to us in understanding human beings as a life form. Consequently, its usage, and therefore meanings, continue to change” (Barker, 1999, p. 11). Hence the aphorism that “Culture is dynamic” which implies that culture is not a given, a static existence, but a continuously changing phenomenon.

Stuart Hall, one of the most prominent scholars of contemporary cultural studies, himself has struggled with trying to grasp a holistic understanding of culture, which has led him into constructing several theories of it. Hall (1996) writes that “[b]y culture, here, I mean the actual grounded terrain of practices, representations, languages and customs of any specific society. I also mean the contradictory forms of common sense which have taken root in and helped to shape popular life” (Hall, 1996, p. 439). Notice that even this definition is quite vague and amorphous. The continuous dynamism of culture, for example, makes the concept of ‘grounded’ practices quite untenable. By grounded practices, I mean norms, ideas and rituals that have developed over time and may be considered the foundations of culture. Time tested practices still form important components of culture but they have ceased to be the most important even in traditional societies.

John Tomlinson (1999) observes the difficulty in defining culture and therefore attempts to avoid the minefield of such an enterprise. He however offers a scope that he uses for his own analysis, which I believe is quite appropriate for my purpose here.

According to Tomlinson, “culture can be understood as the order of life in which human beings construct meaning through practices of symbolic representation” (Tomlinson, 1999, p. 18).

I choose this very context-bound definition because of the focus on two aspects of culture contained in it – the construction of meaning and symbolic representation. These two are important for this discussion because the processes of cultural and identity formation part-take in the complexities of media construction and representation. Meanings do not exist a priori, in some form of pristine natural truth, or in a state of reality that is devoid of context, influence and manipulation. Instead, we make meanings out of what we are told, how we are told, what we see and how we see, and therefore our conceptions of reality, of ourselves and our answers to the questions “what is real?” and “who am I?” are dependent on our prior knowledge and experience of the world. This brings me to the question of identity, because the understanding of the self is often defined by the contemporary cultural context within which one finds one self.

The Concept of Identity

Identity is rooted in culture and is just as difficult to define because of its transient and slippery variables. Identity is not simply who you are, but also who you are not, and more importantly, it is who you have been and who you are becoming. As Kathryn Woodward (1997) has argued, identity is marked by difference, and this is experienced through symbols of representation. It is a process that is never ending.

There are many ways in which we form pictures of our societies and environment. The types of training that we may receive at home, the influences from our peers, what we learn in school, the indoctrination we receive in churches, mosques or other religious communities, all play roles in
forming our attitudes and approaches to life. But the most important influences in contemporary times, arguably, are the mass media.

In fact, it has been suggested that the present generation of young people are children of the media. That is because they grow up on a steady diet of media products. They spend more time watching TV, playing video games, watching movies on hand-held devices, listening to music and surfing the internet, than anything else. It also partly explains why the culture of reading has become quite unpopular. The knowledge that most young people acquire is contained in the mass media, and they tend to express their worldviews and define themselves through a process that is referred to as mediation.

The Theory of Mediation

To have a working knowledge of mediation, we can draw on Denis McQuail’s (1983, revised 2005) theory, which posits that mediation is a process of “relaying second-hand (or third party) versions of events and conditions which we cannot directly observe for ourselves” (McQuail, 2005, p. 82). More importantly for this discussion, mediation refers to “the efforts of other actors and institutions in society to contact us for their own purposes (or our own supposed good). This applies to politicians and governments, advertisers, educators, experts and authorities of all kinds” (McQuail, 2005, p. 82).

Mediation also involves relationships between the media, technology and society. The advancement in technology, such as the internet, satellite television and local radio stations, has reinforced the pervasiveness of media in society, thus offering us mediated perspectives of our broader national, cultural and political environments. This process of mediation is not only technological, but also epistemological, axiological and rhetorical.

Media texts are mediated because, as McQuail has pointed out, culture, of which media are part, is dependent on the economic and power structures of society, as Marxists have argued. “It is assumed that whoever owns or controls the media can choose, or set limits to, what they do” (McQuail, 2005, 79). Thus media shape our perception of experience by being selective. In fact selectivity is fundamental to the process of mediation because this allows a reduction of the complexity of society and culture to more comprehensible levels.

Media, such as films, have the potential of opening up the world to audiences in unlimited ways, but may also limit or control our perception of the world through context-bound selective processes. For example, the image of indigenous Afghan women wearing Burqas conjures various meanings to various people. For radical Muslims, it is a sign of obedience to the laws of the Qur’an, dignity for womanhood and respect for her husband and family. For the moderate Muslim, it might be a sign that Islam is failing to grow with the times and to be in tune with the rest of the modern world. For human rights advocates and feminists, that image might symbolize oppression, a violation of fundamental human rights, the abuse of the privileges of women, social seclusion, and the denial of basic human freedoms.

Therefore, our understanding of the image is dependent on the contextual frameworks within which the image is presented, in addition to our own previous knowledge and conceptions of
Islam. These together, offer specific meanings of the image. The one image of Afghan women will therefore present us with multiple realities. We can say, then, that the existence of prior knowledge in relation to the contextual framing of images (cultural representation) presupposes the existence of some reality, which is, in fact, constructed reality.

Media may be neutral in their presentation of reality, or of the world, but may also be actively participant in shaping the way in which the world is presented and therefore how the public perceives it. The consequence of the pervasiveness of media in our lives is that our experiences are mediated, shaped, and reformed through media texts, such as television, radio, newspapers and films (Giddens, 1991).

According to McQuail (2005), mass media and society continue to influence each other in mutual ways. As cultural industries, media, including films and video-films, respond to the demands of society to produce information and entertainment and at the same time employ their textual power to influence changes in the socio-cultural climates, which in turn create new demands for new media content. McQuail argues that “the media to a large extent serve to constitute our perceptions and definitions of social reality and normality for the purposes of a public, shared social life, and are a key source of standards, models and norms” (McQuail, 2005, p. 81).

McQuail argues that the notion of media intervening between audiences and reality is only metaphoric, but may actually connect particular audiences to other experiences. Media can achieve this through various forms of mediation “ranging from neutrally informing, through negotiation, to attempts at manipulation and control. The variations can be captured by a number of communication images, which express different ways in which the media may connect us with reality” (McQuail, 2005, p. 83).

This connection is often achieved in various ways, depending on the technology that is used, or in other words, the medium that is employed in conveying the message. Marshall McLuhan’s famous aphorism that “the medium is the message” (McLuhan & Fiore, 1967) could be interpreted to mean that “embedded in every tool is an ideological bias, a predisposition to construct the world as one thing rather than another, to value one thing over another, to amplify one sense or skill or attitude more loudly than another” (Postman, 1993, p. 13).

Here again the question of selectivity has a primary consideration in understanding the motives that guide the operations of mass media. For example, why does a video-filmmaker choose to produce a movie about a fictional kingdom where the practices have no connection to real Ghanaian royal gallantry, and yet present the images as if they were a mirror on reality? What is it that informs the choices of subjects by video-film producers, such as city living as against rural living? It is possible to discern these choices by doing what is referred to in Film Studies as textual analysis.

A Methodology for Textual Analysis

Textual analysis is often associated with the qualitative method of social scientific research, referred to, in other words, as “qualitative content analysis”. This phrase has been linked to the
German sociologist and cultural critic, Siegfried Kracauer who in the 1940s and 1950s became an important film theorist (Larsen, 1991, p. 121).

According to Larsen, it was Kracauer’s “manifesto of qualitative content analysis… ‘The Challenge of qualitative content analysis’ which dealt a severe blow to the type of quantitative content analysis practiced by many contemporary mass communication researches.” According to Larsen, Kracauer opted rather for “qualitative, hermeneutic, or humanistic procedures” (Larsen, 1991, p. 121).

Kracauer’s argument was that “the proposed quantitative strategies for determining the content or meaning of media messages are, if not useless, then certainly not as objective and reliable as suggested by Barelson and others” (Larsen, 1991, p. 121). The reason for this, according to Kracauer is that the breakdown of textual meanings into quantifiable units destroys the very object of study “since the atomistic character of the resulting data precludes a relevant examination of the relations within each text as a meaningful whole” (Larsen, 1991, p. 122).

Consequent to this argument, the text “should not be regarded not as closed, segmented object with determinate, composite meanings, but rather as an indeterminate field of meaning in which intentions and possible effects intersect.” Furthermore, “while media texts are thought of as complex and indeterminate, they are also said to be historically determined to the extent that they express the general ideological trends (zeitgeist) of a given period, which minimizes the danger of ‘subjective misinterpretations’” (Larsen, 1991, p. 122-3).

Following the trend set by Kracauer, other researchers (Lowenthal, 1961; Jay, 1973; Negt, 1980) sought to develop systematic methodologies or approaches to, and tools for the study of media texts, such as film, beyond the traditional literary approaches. Such tools included, for example, semiology or semiotics, intertextuality, hermeneutics, psychoanalysis and reflexivity. In recent times developments in gender and feminists studies have contributed tremendously to qualitative studies of media content and how media produce and disseminate knowledge and information.

There are four basic assumptions involved in media’s production and dissemination of knowledge and information. These are, the ontological which relates to the discourses of reality, the epistemological which deals with the relationship between the producers of media and the material that they are dealing with, the axiological which is concerned with the association of social values to the production of media content, and the rhetorical which has to do with the use of language.

There is a tremendous amount of literature on each of these tools, and it would take an enormous amount of space to attempt to discuss each of them separately. However, in the proceeding sections of this paper, I will endeavor to incorporate their theoretical and methodological assumptions in relating the texts to their contexts in order to bring out their manifest and latent meanings. A brief historical background to video-films will be a useful point of departure.
Textual construction and mediation

As I noticed earlier, video-films in Ghana during the late 1980s, when they had only just emerged, were mostly concerned with the radical social transformations at the time. Ghana had gone through various forms of social, economic and political rupture that left the citizens with few civil society organizations that possessed nationalist ideological orientations.

As Ninsin (1998) has argued, the PNDC government, which had come to power in a military coup d’état, had virtually put itself beyond reproach as Ghana’s “fledgling democratic institutions, laws and procedural rules were either set aside en masse; or … were brutally subverted” (It is not surprising that video-films of that period, generally avoided political themes, even in satirical forms. As Sutherland-Addy has noted, video-films were “rather less profoundly analytical of the evolution of the broad historical and political contexts of Ghanaian society” (Sutherland-Addy, 2000, 267). It is fair to say then that video-films of this period failed to offer a realistic picture of the contemporary social, cultural and economic circumstances of the nation. They mediated away from the pressing political and social upheavals that were of concern to almost every Ghanaian citizen. Instead, they sought to create and present a different kind of reality that was devoid of political implications and that which placed the responsibility of the nation’s problems at the feet of individual errant citizens.

However, whilst the culture of silence kept political descent on the quiet, the social ramifications of economic crises provided historical and thematic substance to video-filmmakers. The major issues that were dealt with in the video-films of the 1980s, focused on the “fickleness of human nature, domestic crises, and the stresses involved in the modernization process” (Sutherland-Addy, 2000, p. 267). As stated earlier, video-films of this period avoided political confrontations and dealt manly with social issues. As Sutherland-Addy has argued, video-films of this period represented “the nature and effect of certain forms of behavior or particular practices, especially as they relate to the domestic context and to the workplace” (Sutherland-Addy, 2000, p. 267).

One of the most popular themes among video-film producers was the family in crisis. This was a theme that resonated well among audiences as most patrons could relate to the economic and cultural transformations that offered fertile grounds for corruption, unfaithfulness, deceit and even murder, within families. It was common to hear audiences discuss a video-film they had just seen, and suggest that they knew certain families that had gone, or were going through similar experiences as portrayed in the movie.

Images of Families in Crises

The context was often the economic difficulties that made most females vulnerable to the exploitation of men, as often portrayed in the video-films. Many video-films offered a representation of families that ran into crises because one member of the family was usually unfaithful. Whilst it cannot be said that such representation was false, it certainly generalized the experiences of a few families to create the impression of a nation filled with crises-ridden families. For example, Kofi Yirenkyi’s A Heart of Gold (1993), portrays a family that is torn apart through deceit, but which is able to reunite. In the video, Julie frames her best friend with accusations of
infidelity, in order to have her thrown out of her matrimonial home, so that she Julie then moves in. She begins to maltreat the whole family, including the man who has taken her in. She attempts to use evil powers to consolidate her position, but she is exposed, driven out and the family reunites.

In fact, apart from video-films, a survey of popular cultural products in Ghana, such as hip-life, Gospel music, and tabloid newspapers, will almost certainly reveal the many ways in which what we know as the reality of our social culture, has been perceived and constructed by the producers of popular cultural products, and the ways in which various perceptive polarities have influenced the shape of these cultural artifacts.

Researchers of media have agreed that patrons of cultural products are not mere passive receivers of texts but that they are usually actively involved in creating the meanings generated in those texts. Therefore, we can infer that these texts are close approximations of the cultural characteristics of the producers and consumers.

In this dialogic sense, popular culture functions as a way of seeing the wider society and as a means through which people make sense of themselves, their societies and environment. This does not mean that popular culture reflects the reality of what obtains in actual societies in an empirical sense. This is because the production of cultural products involves a series of mediations informed by social and economic forces, by varying ideologies, cultural nuances, individual convictions and aesthetic considerations. For example, Africa’s most renowned filmmaker, the late Ousmane Sembène, once said about himself that, “I control the entire film process and I feel completely responsible for it” (Pfaff, 1984, p. 78). This presupposes the extent to which the content of his films may be manipulated to suit his ideological convictions.

We can agree with Schulz (2004) who argues that “by definition (and apparent from the etymology of the term), communication succeeds only if some kind of commonness arises between sender and recipient. Commonness is the result of transferring meaning through signs” (Schulz, 2004, p. 90). So, whilst the producers of stories of families in crises portrayed images of unfaithful men against their descent wives, or vice versa, in order to engage audiences in making life-style choices, those of the Charismatic-Pentecostal genre of video-films had a different agenda.

Charismatic-Pentecostal Texts

By the beginning of the 1990s, the emergence of so-called Charismatic-Pentecostal Churches saw the evolution of new identities, often radical, which then informed the types of narratives of video-films that came to be known as the Charismatic-Pentecostal genre. Not only were these video-films inspired by this emerging religious tendency, but the narratives and images were actually shaped by what obtained in the theology and practices of these new religious movements. The texts of the Charismatic-Pentecostal genre in turn became the source of inspiration for followers and prospective followers of Charismatic Petecostalism. Evidence of this is the religious nature of their spectatorship during the screening of such video-films. People could often be seen praying along with a character and stamping their feet in order to crush some evil being, or a host of actions that are intended to support the protagonist who is up against evil spirits.
These new identities that people often adopted, particularly the religious ones, were often then cinematically reconstructed, in exaggerated fictions, in order to portray familiar aspirations, characteristics and circumstances that the audiences might easily relate with. Charismatic-Pentecostal video-films often represented a society that was under attack by evil spirits, and it would only take the intervention of a powerful Charismatic-Pentecostal clergyman to fight such evil, and to bless the good people with wealth. Often such representations are false, but when they are informed by the behavior of the behavior of real Pastors, audiences tend to believe everything they see on screen.

As Okwori (2003) has argued, “[the] dominant refrain in these films (was) the utilization of the rituals and grotesque characters to generate contexts in which wealth and riches transport the characters from a normal reality to a world of fantasy” (Okwori, 2003, p. 8). Apart from the characters in the films, the audiences also experience the same transportation.

But can we claim a strong association of these fictional texts to reality? To borrow from Haynes and Okome (1997) most video-films “give us something like an image of the (Ghanaian) nation – not necessarily in the sense of delivering a full, accurate, and analytical description of social reality, but in the sense of reflecting the productive forces of the nation, both economic and cultural” (Haynes and Okome 1997, p. 21).

Okwori (2003) has described the inability of video-film producers to representative the truth about society and yet make the audiences believe they were watching true representations of the society.

“The economic and cultural productive forces is (sic) guided by beliefs – and ‘superstition’ – which thrive on the elaborate and intricate spinning of ‘fabu’. ‘Fabu’ is short for ‘fabrication’ – i.e. something which has been ‘made up’, ‘put together’. It is used in this instance to describe a genre of stories that are partly rumour and which have no definite source or origin, but which could be true, probably are not and yet are believed as if true” (Okwori, 2003, p. 9).

Drawing on Mbiti (1969) Okwori, argues that “the belief in the efficacy of rituals and an accompanying ‘superstition’ has always been part of the indigenous people’s attempt to come to terms with incomprehensible phenomena” (Okwori, 2003, 9). He points out the ambivalent nature of certain life choices that pitch Christianity against representations of traditional African belief systems.

 “[Even] in the age of Christianity, Islam and modernity the belief in efficacious ‘charms’ and rituals has not abated. Quite the contrary has taken place and more and more people are actually turning to rituals for protection from violence or, more pro-actively, for social or professional betterment such as promotion at work or success in business. It is this phenomenon which drives the popularity of the home-video movie among individuals and turns its production and distribution into an industry” (Okwori, 2003, p. 9).
The Dualism between Christianity and Traditional Africa

Even though these video-films represent various forms of rituals, particularly the money-making ones, they often also deny the efficacy of such rituals and tend to portray them as devilish, anti-social, destructive and powerless. At the same time, the depiction of ostentation and vast wealth, ostensibly achieved through money-making rituals, is an attempt to mediate the ambivalence felt by audiences of wanting to use similar ritualistic means of ending their poverty (or increasing their wealth as the case may be) and yet denouncing the evil nature of such rituals. Interestingly, most of such textual representations allude to good spirit in Christian, often foreign, images, whilst the evil ones are represented in black or African motifs.

In Ghana, there have been popular local paintings of a victorious white and handsome Jesus standing over a defeated black and ugly Devil. The associations are obvious. To draw on Frantz Fanon (1961), “[colonialism] is not satisfied merely with holding a people in its grip and emptying the native’s brain of all form and content. By a kind of perverted logic, it turns to the past of the oppressed people, and distorts, disfigures and destroys it” (Fanon, 1961, p. 210). This predicament is further aggravated by the complicity of the local artist through a self-imposed contempt and condescension, the subversion of one’s ovarian historical roots and therefore the denial of one’s cultural identity.

From this perspective, many video films have served as conduits for the denunciation of indigenous cultures in order to promote others, mainly Euro-Christianity. These video films, such as Namisha (1999), Expectations (1998/1999), and Time (2000) provide evidence of the confrontational relationship between traditional African beliefs, which are rapidly being retrenched, and mainly Charismatic-Pentecostal spirituality which provides new mediatory processes for identity formation.

Sutherland-Addy, has discussed the treatment of religious conflict in Ghanaian video films in which she identifies an uneasy co-existence of Christianity, Islam and African traditional religion, the latter, often cast in a negative light.

“In this framework, unexamined popular beliefs provide a convenient arena for the battle of good against evil. Villains are easily identified with indulgence in a negative spirituality which is, in the vast majority of cases, depicted as the practice of traditional African spirituality” (Sutherland-Addy, 2000, p. 271. Emphasis added).

Even though identity is not a fixed historical fact which the cinematic discourses may seek to represent, but rather a continuous process of production that is always constituted within representation (Hall, 2000, p. 704), it is quite problematic when indigenous forms of identity are portrayed not as part of the process but as the unwanted ‘other’ which must be discarded. Usually this attitude stems from the lack of adequate knowledge about the ‘other’, and the preference for forms of beliefs that, although apparently popular, have not been adequately examined. For example, there is no evidence that traditional forms of worship have been the source of evil in any society in Ghana, or indeed the whole of Africa. This is not to say that indigenous African societies
are devoid of evil-doers. However, the blanket generalization of all traditional forms of worship as heathen or evil by the video films of the occult genre is an ignorant proposition.

Debates over the cultural context of the videos represent what Hall (1997) describes as the tensions around the struggles for cultural identity and cultural diversity. These tensions have often resulted in cultural amnesia and the dislocation of people from their cultural roots. Drawing on Hall’s (1997) concept of the roots and routes of cultural identity it seems the ‘routes’ of identity formation appear to have replaced the ‘roots’ within both the individual and the collective consciousness of people. This ambivalence is very much evident in many video-films.

In the video-film Expectations (1999), for example, the complications over the successor to a traditional village throne is not solved through the cultural traditions of the people but by the intervention of a Pastor who has just returned from overseas, charismatic prayers, and a God, who by inference, is unknown to the village people. Apparently, from the point of view of the producers of this video, the traditional processes of finding a chief for the village, processes rooted in time-tested traditional wisdom and protocols, are not relevant. The video-film suggests that only a Charismatic Christian route is suitable for solving even the most traditionally African problem.

In Namisha (1999), an occult goddess, Obadzen, is located within a post-modern African setting. Even though she is portrayed as a good and generous spirit, she is still represented as inferior to a Euro-centric perception of God. For example, in one scene the Obadzen tells Ansah “you can’t fight the power of light”, thus alluding to her own ‘dark or evil powers’. She also declares her inferiority to “Jehovah-God”. The use of the signifier ‘Jehovah’ is an obvious allusion to Charismatic-Pentecostal beliefs (where it is used more frequently) and presumes the hegemony of their concept of God over any other. The self-denunciation of the Obadzen is typical of the postcolonial inferiority complex of the native African who has been positioned by the colonizer to accept the hegemonic superiority of Western concepts and beliefs.

In this video, Ansah, an Obadzen disciple who has converted to Christianity, tells Slobo, a new Obadzen faithful, that “I have been redeemed from the hands of Satan” and “I pray that God opens your eyes for you to see the light.” These declarations clearly demonstrate the contempt that Charismatic-Pentecostal believers feel for traditional spiritualists, no matter how genuine and positive the latter’s work may be (see Cyprian Fisiy and Peter Geschiere, in Richard Werbner and Terence Ranger eds., 1996, p. 193).

Postmodern Texts

The modest improvements in the economy of Ghana and the apparent demise of the initial euphoria that greeted Charismatic Pentecostal movements have shifted the focus of many to purely consumerist interests. From the early 2000s, video-films have changed their approach of the representation of contemporary society to one that is economically stable, where local traditions and postmodern attitudes intersect to feed the material and consumerist fantasies of both video-film producers and audiences.

In contemporary video-films, the directors, who are an integral part of society, often claim to understand the community’s need for escapism, however temporary, from the harsh realities of
their lives, and therefore pander to those ostensible needs by portraying certain idealized and often mythical situations. The community repays the filmmaker handsomely by patronizing his escapist products and the material wealth that he/she gains tends to distance him/her from sharing the more immediate and real concerns of the people.

Youngberg (2006) argues that because film is a medium that involves, evolves, and engenders its own conventions for representation, any cultural content for which it is the chosen medium for transmission will inevitably undergo a series of very complex processes of mediation which is endemic to the film production process.

Video-films tell stories by appropriating the various cultural motifs and beliefs, both past and present, as sources, but through a process of ideological mediation, the producers of video-films transform these motifs and beliefs into fictional creations, which nonetheless exhibit a social reflectionist quality from a reflexive point of view. The video-films of Shirley Frimpong-Manso are good examples of the representation of middle to upper class societies in which people strive to achieve their deepest desires or live out their fantasies. These may be economic, emotional or sexual. For example, in Scorned (2008), a woman pours out her frustrations on an almost helpless man just so that she can prove her feminine powers. In The Perfect Picture (2009) we see a group of ladies living out their (mostly sexual) fantasies at the expense of the men who are portrayed as hapless and unreliable. Audiences react to these videos differently. Whilst some feminists believe that Frimpong-Manso has found her voice and also offered a voice for women, some assume that she is merely representing her own aspirations and fantasies in reflexive narratology.

**Conclusion**

I will draw on Kilborn (1998) to conclude that the technological revolution that has made recording of social phenomena very accessible, has equally very challenging implications. As Kilborn has observed, “[in] recent years, there have been claims that we have been experiencing a video or camcorder revolution” (Kilborn, 1998, p. 201). Citing other writers, (Corner, 1994; Murdock, 1993), Kilborn argues that “the introduction of new recording and editing equipment has enabled quite radical changes to be made in the processes by which broadcast material is produced. All this has, in turn, given rise to much debate and speculation concerning the political and ideological implications of these developments” (Kilborn, 1998, 202).

Today, Kilborn will certainly need to revise his arguments since the revolution is now not merely a video or camcorder revolution, but that mobile technologies and the access to internet sharing of material, have completely and radically transformed the ways in which we gather, create and disseminate information across the globe. This has implications also for the way people now engage with media texts, such as video-films.

The question that Kilborn asks, which is absolutely crucial, has to do with the dialogism that I described at the beginning of this paper. “Do they pave the way for new forms of democratic involvement or do they point inevitably in the direction of ever greater viewer commodification and the triumph of market forces?” (Kilborn, 1998, p. 202). It is necessary to begin to think of new methods of understanding how relations between the producer, the text and the audience can be
constructed in a world that is now open to almost anyone who holds a mobile devise and can create content, and has access to the internet and can share the content worldwide.
References


La pluralité humaine comme essence du politique : Hobbes et Hannah Arendt

Guillaume Gaston Nguemba
Université de Maroua, Cameroun

Résumé

La théorie politique de Hobbes énonce un principe, celui de l'ordination de la multitude. Elle montre que le présupposé le plus général de l'État est que la multitude soit toujours ordonnée à la volonté d'un seul. Bien qu'ayant vu la profondeur de la pensée politique de Hobbes, Hannah Arendt ne se gardera pourtant pas d'y apporter des objections. Elle pense que le libéralisme politique classique dans sa version anglaise a construit une théorie politique qui aboutit à une instrumentalisation de l'État en vue de la protection des droits individuels, ce qui fait de l'artificialisme de Hobbes une théorie politique de l'individualisme. Or, si Hannah Arendt a critiqué la philosophie politique moderne, c'est pour montrer comment celle-ci a manqué l’essence du politique par la disqualification de la pluralité. L’intérêt de cet article consiste à montrer comment le concept de pluralité, saisi dans sa double dimension phénoménologique et volontariste, aboutit chez Hannah Arendt à l'idée d’une pensée politique humaniste.

Mots-clés : Pluralité, politique, liberté, action, désir de reconnaissance, intersubjectivité, État, état de nature, individualisme.
Abstract

Hobbes’s political theory states a principle that of, the ordination of the multitude. It portrays that the most general presupposition of the State is that the multitude be always ordered by the will of an individual. Although Hannah Arendt has seen the depth of Hobbes' political thought, she does not, however, always refrain from opposing it. She thinks that classical political liberalism in its English version has built a political theory leading to the instrumentalisation of the State for the protection of individual rights, that is, what makes Hobbes's artificialism a political theory of individualism. Therefore, if Hannah Arendt has criticized modern political philosophy, it is to show how this philosophy has missed the essence of politics by disqualifying pluralism. The interest of this article consists in showing how the concept of plurality, taken into its double dimension phenomenological and voluntaristic, results to the idea of a humanist political thought for Arendt.

Keywords: Plurality, politics, freedom, violence, gratitude desire, inter-subjectivity, State, state of nature, totalitarianism.
Introduction


L’objectif de cet article est de procéder à une analyse critique du concept de pluralité en philosophie politique moderne. Nous examinerons tout d’abord la thèse de Hobbes pour comprendre le sens qu’il donne à ce concept dans sa théorie politique. Nous montrerons ensuite les limites et les insuffisances que Hannah Arendt trouve aux idées de Hobbes qui, selon elle, transforment la pluralité humaine en une multitude d’hommes dont seul le « dieu mortel » (Hobbes, 2000 : 288) peut en garantir la paix et la sécurité, ce qui constitue à ses yeux une dérive de la pensée politique. Nous procéderons enfin à la critique de cette critique pour examiner, si possible, d’autres horizons susceptibles de conduire à des interprétations plus nuancées du concept de pluralité.

1. **Hobbes et la pensée de la multitude**

Hobbes a développé d’une manière tout à fait originale l’idée de multitude. Pour parvenir à la déduction du principe d’unité, qui constitue le présupposé le plus général du corps politique, Hobbes pense la multitude comme ce qui est au fondement de toute réflexion sur la constitution de l’ordre civil. Le principe de l’État est donc l’ordination de la multitude, soit par la volonté d’un seul, soit par la volonté de tous.

---

1 Texte d’une conférence prononcée le 15 avril 1982 à New York, lors de l’un des « Hannah Arendt Memorial Symposia in Political Philosophy » organisés par la New School for Social Research, et portant sur « L’origine de nos institutions »
2 Nous référons ainsi les œuvres anciennes (après l’année d’édition, nous référons la page et puis le numéro du fragment.)
1.1. Le concept de pluralité

Selon Hannah Arendt, toute pensée politique authentique doit partir de la pluralité humaine pour déduire les caractéristiques de l’ordre social et politique. Ce qui signifie que toute philosophie politique digne de ce nom doit se débarrasser de toute présupposition anthropologique ou sociale fondée sur l’idée d’une nature humaine. La pluralité des hommes est la seule chose qui soit empiriquement donnée et dont il faut tenir compte dans la déduction ou la définition de ce qui justifie la nécessité d’un ordre politique volontairement consenti. C’est ce qui fait de Hobbes l’une des grandes figures de l’artificialisme moderne, même si Hannah Arendt va penser qu’il n’est pas resté fidèle à son principe de départ. 3 Ce qui est important chez Hobbes, comme nous l’avons dit, c’est l’idée que la politique se fonde sur l’ordination de la multitude (Mairet, 1987 : 6). Ainsi, les hommes, parce qu’existant naturellement comme multitude, auront des sentiments d’envie et de haine les uns envers les autres, se verront obligés de se confier à l’Un qui se chargera de veiller sur leur vie et leur sécurité. Ainsi, comme le pense Hobbes, « la multitude ainsi uniée en une personne est appelée un État, en latin CIVITAS. Telle est la génération de ce grand LEVIATHAN, ou plutôt (pour parler avec plus de déférence) de ce dieu mortel, auquel nous devons, sous le dieu immortel, notre paix et notre défense.»

L’idée qui se dégage de cette pensée est que l’État comme Corps politique artificiel naît de la multitude des hommes uniée en une seule personne. « On dit qu’un État est institué quand les hommes en multitude s’accordent et conviennent, chacun avec chacun… » (Ibid. : 290). Il convient cependant de noter que chez Hobbes, la pluralité ou encore la multitude ne se limite pas au seul nombre, elle renvoie tout également à la diversité. Contrairement à ce que l’on peut croire, Hobbes n’exclut pas la diversité de sa conception de la multitude. Comme le rappelle Arendt, les hommes ne doivent pas être de simples reproductions d’une essence générique. La pluralité n’a de sens véritablement politique que si elle s’ajuste à la diversité. C’est pour cette raison que l’anthropologie hobbesienne est une anthropologie de la diversité, puisque l’uniformité, tout comme l’hostilité, peuvent conduire à des dérives totalitaires. Les chapitres VI (traité des passions), VIII (traité des passions), et X (traité des valeurs) du Léviathan attestent de l’importance que Hobbes accorde à la diversité des hommes. Il faut dire que l’une des thèses que développe majestueusement la philosophie politique de Hobbes est que la diversité des constitutions humaines est un fait irréductible. Il existe une variabilité des comportements et des attitudes parce qu’il y a une variabilité des hommes.

La nature humaine n’est pas perçue chez Hobbes comme une réalité constante. Elle se dilue dans la diversité des passions et des affects. Chaque individu s’investit selon ses intérêts. Mais il faut toutefois noter que cette diversité des passions n’exclut pas pour autant la similitude des comportements, c’est ce qui est affirmé à la fin de l’introduction du Léviathan :

(…) par la similitude même des pensées et des passions d’un homme avec les pensées et passions d’un autre, quiconque regarde en soi-même et considère ce qu’il fait quand il pense, réfléchit, raisonne, espère, craint, etc., et sur quels fondements, celui-là lira et

4 C’est Hobbes qui souligne.
connaitra, par cela même, les pensées et passions des autres humains, dans les mêmes occasions.  

(Hobbes, 2000 : 66)

Mais cette similitude se limite aux seules passions qui sont presque identiques à tous les hommes et ne concerne nullement les objets de ces passions. Hobbes s’en explique ainsi : « Je parle de la similitude des passions, qui sont identiques chez tous les humains, désirs, peur, crainte, etc., non de la similitude des objets de ces mêmes passions, qui sont les choses désirées, craintes, espérées, etc. » (Ibid.) Cette remarque tient son importance du fait que Hobbes dans sa science morale et civile considère la « nature humaine », non comme une essence immuable, une substance naturelle, mais comme un fond commun universellement observable en tous les hommes. Ce fond commun n’est autre chose que l’ensemble des combinaisons affectives de l’esprit humain. Qu’est-ce qui est donc important aux yeux de Hobbes, la similitude des affects ou la dissemblance des objets ? (Philippe Crignon, 2009 : 90). La réponse à cette question dépend de l’importance que l’on peut accorder, soit à l’anthropologie, soit alors à la politique. Mais il convient de noter que si l’anthropologie se fonde sur la similitude des hommes, parce qu’il est question de « se lire » et se connaître par la similitude des passions et des affects des autres, la politique, elle, se fonde sur la diversité et la variabilité des mœurs. Hobbes écrit :

Par MŒURS, je n’entends pas ici la bonne conduite, comme la façon dont on doit se saluer les uns les autres, ou comment il convient de s’essuyer la bouche ou de se curer les dents en société, et tout ce qui concerne les bonnes manières ; au contraire, j’entends ces qualités du genre humain qui concernent le fait de vivre ensemble dans la paix et l’union. (2000 : 186)

On voit bien que chez Hobbes les mœurs se rattachent à la civilité. Elles désignent l’aptitude à vivre en paix et en harmonie avec les autres. L’anthropologie hobbesienne, fondée sur la science des passions et des affects, conduit inévitablement à la question politique. L’état de guerre permanente, chacun contre chacun, ne peut donc pas se déduire de la nature unique des hommes. Il est sans aucun doute le fait de la pluralité des hommes. Similitude et dissemblance constituent en quelque sorte les modalités principales de la pluralité des hommes. Elles correspondent respectivement à l’anthropologie et à la politique qui, elles-mêmes, renvoient à la question de l’état de nature, c’est-à-dire à la condition naturelle des hommes avant leur entrée à l’état civil.

1.2. L’état de nature et la condition naturelle des hommes

L’état de nature est défini par Hobbes, non pas comme une réalité historique, mais comme une hypothèse logique (Macpherson, 2004 : 44) qui permet de déduire théoriquement l’existence de l’État à partir d’une anthropologie des affections de l’homme, notamment les désirs et les passions. Hobbes n’emploie pas fréquemment le terme « état de nature », il préfère parler, comme au chapitre XIII du Léviathan, de « la condition du genre humain à l’état de nature ». Le but dudit chapitre est de montrer qu’en l’absence d’un pouvoir qui garantisse aux hommes la paix et la sécurité, il n’y a qu’un état de guerre de tous contre tous. Cet état de guerre permanente est déduit des penchant naturels des

\[\text{C’est l’auteur qui souligne.}\]

\[\text{C’est l’auteur qui souligne.}\]

\[\text{C’est l’auteur qui souligne.}\]
hommes. L’idée d’un état de nature ne vient donc pas du fait que Hobbes s’imagine un état historique lointain où les hommes auraient vécu dans des conditions de vie primitive, sans une moindre sociabilité. L’homme naturel de Hobbes n’est pas l’homme primitif des origines. L’état de nature qui dérive non des origines, mais des inclinations naturelles des hommes, est décrit tout d’abord par Hobbes comme un état où les hommes sont naturellement égaux :

La nature a fait les humains si égaux quant aux facultés du corps et de l’esprit que, bien qu’il soit parfois possible d’en trouver un dont il est manifeste qu’il a plus de force dans le corps ou de rapidité d’esprit qu’un autre, il n’en reste pas moins que, tout bien pesé, la différence entre les deux n’est pas à ce point considérable que l’un d’eux puisse s’en prévaloir et obtenir un profit quelconque pour lui-même auquel l’autre ne pourrait prétendre aussi bien que lui. (Hobbes, 2000 :220)

Il s’ensuit que les hommes sont égaux par nature et cette égalité est une égalité de principe, elle n’est pas fondée sur une uniformisation empirique des facultés. Il s’agit pour Hobbes d’une égalité selon le droit de nature8. Le principe d’égalisation qui veut que quelque soit le degré de force ou de puissance physique, le plus faible soit suffisamment fort pour tuer ou tromper le plus fort, conduit indiscutablement à une homogénéisation des hommes. Voilà pourquoi Hobbes trouve que parmi les humains, « l’égalité est plus grande en ce qui concerne les facultés de l’esprit qu’en ce qui concerne la force. » (2000 : 221)

Un autre principe qui conduit à l’idée d’une nature humaine chez Hobbes est la généralisation de la défiance et de la guerre. L’égalité engendre la défiance : « si deux humains désirent la même chose, dont ils ne peuvent cependant jouir l’un et l’autre, ils deviennent ennemis et, pour parvenir à leur fin (qui est principalement leur propre conservation et parfois seulement leur jouissance), ils s’efforcent de s’éliminer ou de s’assujettir l’un l’autre. » (2000 : 222)

De la défiance mutuelle à la guerre généralisée il n’y a qu’un pas : à force de contempler leur propre puissance à l’œuvre dans les conquêtes, ils les poursuivent bien au-delà de ce qui est nécessaire à leur de sécurité ; si bien que les autres, qui sans cela se seraient contentés de vivre tranquillement dans des limites modestes, augmentent leur puissance par des attaques, sans quoi ils ne seraient pas longtemps capables de survivre en se tenant seulement sur la défensive. (2000 : 223)

Hobbes reconnaît à la nature humaine trois sources de conflit, notamment la concurrence ou la compétition, la défiance et la gloire. La première, comme il le souligne, conduit à la recherche du profit, la seconde à la sécurité et la troisième à la réputation.

[..] Dans l’état de nature tous les hommes ont le désir et la volonté de faire du mal, mais ils ne procèdent pas des mêmes causes […]. Car tel homme, se fondant sur l’égalité naturelle qui règne parmi nous, accorde à autrui autant qu’à lui-même (ce qui est raisonnement d’homme modéré qui a juste opinion de son pouvoir). Tel autre, au contraire, s’imaginant au-dessus d’autrui, s’accorde licence de faire tout ce qu’il veut et

8 C’est ce qui est expliqué au chapitre XV du Léviathan, Hobbes énonce une caractéristique importante de la modernité : le juste n’existe pas dans la nature. Pour vivre en paix et en sécurité, les hommes doivent renoncer au droit qu’ils ont sur toutes choses, c’est-à-dire au droit de nature. Ce sont donc les conventions qui leur garantissent la paix et la justice. Est donc injuste ce qui est contraire aux conventions.
exige respect et honneurs comme lui étant dus en priorité (ce qui est raisonnement d’esprit foudroyant). Son désir de faire du mal vient de la fausse gloire et de la fausse opinion qu’il a de sa force ; celui du premier procède de la nécessité de défendre sa personne, sa liberté et ses biens contre la violence du second. (Hobbes cité par Macpherson, 2004 : 82)

Le mal vient de la nature des hommes et des relations qui existent entre eux. L’état de nature est donc un état d’insécurité et de violence permanente.

Une autre caractéristique que Hobbes attribue à cet état est qu’il n’est pas seulement un état de violence, il est également un « temps », c’est-à-dire une période où les hommes manifestent la volonté de tout résoudre par le conflit. Car, comme le remarque Hobbes :

[… de même que la nature du mauvais temps ne consiste pas en une ou deux averse, mais en une tendance au mauvais temps, qui s’étale sur plusieurs jours, de même, en ce qui concerne la nature de la guerre, celle-ci ne consiste pas en une bataille effective, mais en la disposition reconnue au combat, pendant tout le temps qu’il n’y a pas d’assurance du contraire. (Hobbes, 2000 : 224-225)

La plus grande menace n’est donc pas la guerre en tant que telle, ce qui constitue le plus grand danger, c’est ce que Hobbes appelle le « temps de guerre » où rien n’est assurant, les hommes vivent dans un horizon d’incertitude. La peur de la mort et de la violence constitue le motif majeur qui pousse tendanciellement les hommes à renoncer à leurs droits de nature pour se confier à un souverain par le moyen d’un pacte. La condition humaine à l’état de nature est donc problématique chez Hobbes puisque la fondation de l’État ne suppose aucun préalable ontologique. Les hommes n’ont naturellement ni le désir, ni la capacité de vivre ensemble. Seule l’institution de l’État peut les conduire au vivre-ensemble. Pour Hobbes, l’individu et la communauté existent conjointement. La partie ne précède pas le tout, ni le tout la partie. La communauté civile, fondement de toutes les autres communautés, ne suppose aucun donné à sa base. Les hommes partent d’eux-mêmes tels qu’ils existent dans leurs relations naturelles pour contracter entre eux des conventions en vue de la paix et de la sécurité.

Mais ce que Hannah Arendt conteste chez Hobbes, c’est le fait qu’il n’y a pas dans sa pensée politique une rupture radicale avec la pensée antique d’inspiration aristotélienne, attribuant à l’homme une nature politique. Tout compte fait, il y a chez Hobbes l’idée d’une nature humaine, même si cette idée n’est pas systématisée comme chez Aristote. Toujours est-il dit que les hommes, formant une multitude, ne décident pas à partir de rien de former une communauté civile, ils se fondent sur ce qu’ils sont, non pas ontologiquement, mais accidentellement dans leurs relations avec les autres. Si l’homme n’est donc pas un *zoon politikon*, il est tout au moins un être relationnel, un *homo homini*. C’est cette idée de dynamisme relationnel comme fondement du politique qui mérite d’être examinée chez Hannah Arendt.

2. La critique arendtienne du *zoon politikon*

L’un des objectifs de la pensée politique de Hannah Arendt, comme nous l’avons souligné, a consisté à réfuter jusqu’à la moindre preuve la disqualification de la pluralité dans la pensée politique moderne, en mettant en exergue les limites de la thèse aristotélienne sur la nature politique de l’homme. Que pense donc Hannah Arendt de la question de l’homme en politique ?

http://ijhcschiefeditor.wix.com/ijhcs
2.1. La caractérisation de la politique et la question de l’homme.


Contrairement à cette idée, Hannah Arendt pense que « la politique repose sur un fait : la pluralité humaine. » (1995 : 37) C’est la pluralité qui constitue l’essence de la politique. Il n’y a de politique que là où il y a des hommes. Il convient toutefois d’établir une distinction entre la pluralité et la simple multitude des individus. La pluralité renvoie aux concepts de relation et d’unicité : « la pluralité est la condition de l’action humaine, parce que nous sommes tous pareils, c’est-à-dire humains, sans que jamais personne soit identique à aucun autre homme ayant vécu, vivant ou encore à naître. » (Hannah Arendt : 1983, 42-43). La pluralité humaine est quelque chose de plus complexe que la simple multitude. Elle signifie identité et différence dans un monde où la liberté permet l’action et la parole. Hannah Arendt souligne que

la pluralité humaine, condition fondamentale de l’action et de la parole, a le double caractère de l’égalité et de la distinction. Si les hommes n’étaient pas égaux, ils ne pourraient se comprendre les uns les autres, ni comprendre ceux qui les ont précédés ni préparer l’avenir et prévoir les besoins de ceux qui viendront après eux. Si les hommes n’étaient pas distincts, chaque être humain se distinguant de tout autre être présent, passé ou futur, ils n’auraient besoin ni de la parole ni de l’action pour se faire comprendre. (Ibid. : 231-232)

On comprend que les hommes sont reliés mais tout de même séparés parce qu’ils sont à la fois différents et identiques, ils tissent entre eux des liens qui les rassemblent et les séparent en même temps. Ils forment un monde commun : le monde des hommes. Le présupposé le plus général de la politique est l’existence du monde. Pour Hannah Arendt, l’Homme n’existe pas, il y a plutôt des hommes. La question politique est rattachée non pas à la question de l’homme comme entité métaphysique abstraite, mais à la problématique de la pluralité des hommes.

C’est parce que la philosophie et la théologie s’occupent toujours de l’homme, parce que toutes leurs déclarations seraient exactes quand bien même n’y aurait-il qu’un seul homme ou seulement deux hommes, ou uniquement des hommes identiques, qu’elles n’ont jamais trouvé aucune réponse philosophiquement valable à la question : qu’est-ce que la politique ? (1995 : 37)

La disqualification de la philosophie et de la théologie sur la question politique date depuis le désaccord entre Platon et Denys, Aristote et le jeune Alexandre. Mais avant d’émettre des objections à
cette remarque arendtienne, il nous semble important de chercher à comprendre les raisons d’un tel échec : qu’y a-t-il dans la politique que la philosophie ne comprend pas ? Pourquoi, selon Hannah Arendt, les grandes œuvres de philosophie politique, y compris celles de Platon et d’Aristote que l’histoire de la philosophie a reconnu comme monumentales, ne sont jamais parvenues à la profondeur de la pensée politique ? Mais de quelle profondeur s’agit-t-il, celle des faits ou celle des idées ? La réponse est donnée par Hannah Arendt elle-même : « Le sens de la profondeur qui fait défaut n’est rien d’autre qu’un sens défaillant pour la profondeur dans laquelle est ancrée la politique. » (Ibid : 38). La philosophie politique que Léo Strauss (1994) distingue bien de la pensée politique en général a donc manqué l’idée de pluralité et même d’action, parce qu’il n’y a d’action possible que là où il y a des hommes et plus particulièrement des hommes libres. La politique a pour objet le monde, c’est-à-dire la pluralité. Hannah Arendt affirme que

« La philosophie a deux bonnes raisons de ne jamais trouver le lieu de naissance de la politique. La première est :

1) Le zoon politikon : comme s’il y avait en l’homme quelque chose de politique qui appartiendrait à son essence. C’est précisément là qu’est la difficulté : l’homme est a-politique. La politique prend naissance dans l’espace-qui-est-entre-les hommes, donc dans quelque chose de fondamentalement extérieur-à-l’homme. Il n’existe donc pas une substance véritablement. La politique prend naissance dans l’espace intermédiaire et elle se constitue comme relation. C’est ce que Hobbes avait compris.  

Cette critique est également dirigée vers l’Occident qui a cru trouver la solution en substituant l’histoire à la politique et en transformant l’homme en « Humanité ». (Ibid.) Il n’est donc pas étonnant que l’histoire soit le théâtre des violences de toute sorte où les individus sont sacrifiés sur l’auteur de l’Universel par la « ruse de la raison ». (Hegel, 1965 :129) Hannah Arendt pense que cette philosophie de l’histoire, faute de reconnaître le vrai sens de la liberté, c’est-à-dire un « espace intermédiaire propre à la politique », s’est repliée sur cette « absurdité épouvantable » qu’est la « nécessité » historique. (Ibid. : 40) Il y a donc un domaine propre à la politique, propice à l’action et à la liberté : l’espace interstitiel qui existe entre les hommes. La politique est la pensée de la liberté et la liberté n’a de sens réel que si elle se définit comme milieu d’intersubjectivité, c’est-à-dire d’interaction entre les hommes. Voilà pourquoi on n’est jamais libre tout seul. Je ne suis libre que si les autres le sont aussi. La liberté est toujours un espace politique d’intersubjectivité, défini et limité par la loi. C’est ce qu’Alexis Philonenko a bien compris chez Fichte. Les catégories de loi et de droit se définissent substantiellement comme des conditions d’intersubjectivité. Comme le souligne Luc Ferry, « l’intersubjectivité apparaît ainsi comme la condition nécessaire de l’existence même de l’individualité et de la conscience de soi. » (1984 : 152)

C’est en ce point précis que la critique arendtienne de la politique et de l’homme montre lumineusement comment le concept d’individualité conduit inéuctablement à l’intersubjectivité.
Nul doute qu’elle s’est abreuvée à la bonne source de Fichte\(^\text{10}\). L'idée du monde comme horizon de sens a tellement marqué Hannah Arendt qu’elle en a fait la source même de sa philosophie politique. Comme le pensait son maître Heidegger, à la différence de l’animal qui est « pauvre en monde », seul l’homme est riche en monde parce qu’il en est à la fois le serviteur et le maître. Le monde se limite exclusivement à l’ensemble des hommes et en cela il est à distinguer de la nature et de l’univers. C’est dans ce sens que Hannah Arendt s’interdit de penser la liberté en dehors du monde. L'idée d’une liberté hors monde est donc une absurdité. Notre monde est le monde de la liberté parce qu’il est l’expression de notre pouvoir de créer, voilà pourquoi le monde des hommes est un horizon sans limite. C’est ce que Robert Misrahi (2015) appelle le « pouvoir de créer ». La phénoménalité pratique de notre liberté s’exprime dans notre capacité de créer, c’est-à-dire le pouvoir de commencer quelque chose de nouveau. Le monde historique est essentiellement changeant. La liberté, la créativité, l’action et même la pensée (Hannah Arendt, 1991 : 27) sont autant de caractérisations qui découle non pas de l’homme, mais des hommes, c’est-à-dire de la pluralité. Il n’y a donc pas sur terre de réalité autrement que plurielle, seul le genre humain manifeste la « paradoxe pluralité d’êtres uniques » (Hannah Arendt, 1983 : 232), parce que les hommes sont libres. Ils sont libres de créer, d’agir et de juger. Le jugement et plus précisément le bon jugement est la faculté politique par excellence, c’est elle qui confère à la pluralité des hommes le pouvoir d’humaniser le monde en le rendant perfectible. Sans se limiter à la politique excrémentielle des politiciens non réfléchis, la politique reste et demeure une pensée du monde, c’est-à-dire une pensée de la multitude. L’une des tâches auxquelles la philosophie politique devrait s’atteler consiste à délivrer la politique des préjugés.

2.2. La critique des préjugés

Hannah Arendt, contrairement à certains théoriciens du politique, a focalisé son attention sur les préjugés qui déforment et désorientent le sens réel de la politique. Hannah Arendt n’est certainement pas la première, bien avant elle, Machiavel, dans le chapitre XV du Prince, souligne que « mon intention d’écrire des choses profitables à ceux qui les entendront, il m’a semblé plus convenable de suivre la vérité effective de la chose que son imagination. » (1952 : 289) Le premier préjugé contre lequel Machiavel s’insurge est celui de la réduction de la politique au domaine de l’imagination, ce qui a conduit à la disqualification de la réalité effective de la politique dans le champ d’investigation philosophique. La conséquence de cette disqualification de la réalité va pousser Hannah Arendt à ce constat que « nous sommes parvenus à une situation dans laquelle nous ne nous comprenons pas politiquement, où nous ne nous mouvons précisément pas encore de façon politique. Le danger consiste en ce que le politique disparaîsse complètement du monde. » (1995 : 43)

Un autre préjugé contre la politique, selon elle, est la violence. L’invention de la bombe atomique, souligne-t-elle, a plongé l’humanité dans la peur de la politique. L’invention de cette redoutable arme a transformé la politique en une monstruosité effroyable, capable de faire disparaître l’humanité. Cette peur a nourri une illusion : l’espoir de voir un jour la politique disparaître du monde, espoir que Hannah Arendt qualifie d’utopique.

\(^{10}\) Le projet de Fichte dans la Grundlage des Naturrechts était, comme le souligne Luc Ferry (1984 :149), de résoudre la difficile question de l’existence d’autrui autrement que de façon simplement empirique et inductive.
Selon Hannah Arendt, l’une des caractéristiques du monde moderne est qu’il est sans discernement, les hommes émettent des jugements sur les événements sans en avoir le moindre critère d’objectivité.

Cette défaillance des critères dans le monde moderne – l’impossibilité de juger ce qui a eu lieu et tout ce qui se produit chaque jour de nouveau – en fonction de critères solides et reconnus de tous, de le subsumer comme les cas particuliers d’un Tout universel bien connu, de même que la difficulté qui en découle de fournir des principes à l’action qui doit avoir lieu, voilà ce qui a souvent été décrit en termes de nihilisme inhérent à l’époque, d’inversion de toutes les valeurs, d’espèce de crépuscule des dieux et de renversement catastrophique pour l’ordre moral du monde. (1995 : 55)

Les préjugés de la politique s’expliquent par le fait que les hommes manquent de jugement, c’est-à-dire qu’ils sont incapables de subsumer le particulier à l’universel. Contre le concept de vérité, Hannah Arendt privilègie certaines catégories de la vie politique telles que le jugement, l’opinion, le choix et même l’amitié. La survalorisation de la vérité conduit toujours à l’intolérance et à la violence. Le totalitarisme est avant tout un crime contre la pluralité d’opinions. Un Etat totalitaire est un Etat fondé sur la totalisation de la politique. Un seul est libre et croit détenir la vérité de tout, il devient normal d’imposer celle-ci à l’ensemble de la communauté. La difficulté pour l’homme d’accéder à la vérité absolue est donc salutaire, parce qu’elle pousse les hommes à dialoguer. La possession de la vérité signifierait donc la fin du dialogue, la fin de l’amitié, et donc la fin de l’humanité. (Hannah Arendt, 1974 : 37) Voilà pourquoi Merleau-Ponty pense qu’en histoire la vérité n’est jamais a priori, elle est toujours l’aboutissement d’un dialogue, d’un travail collectif.

Contre les préjugés, il faut apprendre à comprendre le monde tel qu’il est et non pas tel qu’on voudrait qu’il soit. L’homme cultivé, souligne Hannah Arendt, est « celui qui sait choisir ses compagnons parmi les hommes, les événements, les pensées, dans le présent et dans le passé ». (1972 : 288)

Les préjugés sur la politique ne doivent pas sonner le glas du politique. Rien n’est plus dangereux que l’idée d’une fin du politique. En développant cette idée, Hannah Arendt n’avait pourtant pas oublié ces moments d’incertitude qui ont caractérisé la seconde moitié du XXe siècle. Il faut souligner que sa pensée naît des catastrophes de la politique : deuxième guerre mondiale, crimes contre l’humanité, génocide juif, nazisme, etc. Contre les incertitudes de la politique et de la violence, elle en appelle au jugement, seul capable de rendre les hommes lucides, inventifs et créatifs. La philosophie devient ainsi un apprentissage au jugement. Philosopher, peut-on dire, c’est apprendre à juger, à discerner entre le bien et le mal. Seule la faculté de juger permet à l’homme de subsumer le particulier à l’universel. Kant définit le jugement comme « la faculté qui consiste à penser le particulier. » (1965 : 27)

Le concept de jugement implique l’intersubjectivité, c’est ce que Kant veut dire quand il affirme que « la manière de parler consiste à ne pas se considérer ni se comporter comme si l’on enfermait en soi le tout du monde, mais comme un simple citoyen du monde. » (1964 :19) Le monde, comme le pense Hannah Arendt, est un espace intersubjectif. On ne peut juger tout seul, on juge toujours en relation ou par référence aux autres. Le jugement est ce qui donne sens à la politique. Ce qui singularise Hannah Arendt sur l’arène de la pensée politique, c’est le sens extraordinairement novateur qu’il accorde à la pluralité. Le monde se définit exclusivement comme la communauté des hommes. Le monde des animaux n’existe pas, parce que les animaux – si nous
pouvons les qualifier ainsi – sont des représentativités non-positionnelles, c’est-à-dire des êtres sans conscience, sans faculté de jugement. Le jugement est donc la faculté politique par excellence, parce qu’il se réfère à la pluralité et par ce fait permet aux hommes d’humaniser le monde en s’opposant au totalitarisme. Tout sentiment de rejet de la politique se montre donc comme une faillite du jugement.

3. Au-delà de la perspective arendtienne : la théorie de la reconnaissance

Hannah Arendt a vu dans la philosophie politique moderne et plus précisément chez Hobbes les limites de la pluralité. L’auteur du Léviathan, selon elle, aurait manqué dans sa théorie politique, l’idée de pluralité. Rappelons que la politique dans la pensée arendtienne se définit comme un espace contradictoire entre identité et altérité. La politique conserve donc paradoxalement ce qu’elle est supposée dépasser : l’acosmisme. Ecart et rapprochement sont ce qui caractérise toute communauté politique. Mais au-delà de la perspective arendtienne de la pluralité et de la politique, il y a la théorie de la reconnaissance qui pose le problème de l’altérité autrement.

3.1. Strauss et le dynamisme relationnel

Hannah Arendt a perçu dans l’état de nature de Hobbes un obstacle à la pluralité humaine. Cette interprétation n’est pas partagée par Léo Strauss qui pense que l’état de nature de Hobbes n’est pas en tant que tel la négation de la pluralité. Car, selon lui, dans cet état « naturel », les hommes ne sont plus naturels, l’apparition du langage et le sentiment de rivalité les ont transformés, d’où la diversification de leurs passions due à la diversification des objets de leurs désirs. La proximité des hommes enclenche donc la dynamique des relations intersubjectives. L’homme n’est plus un être naturel mais un être relationnel, il est essentiellement homme pour l’homme, homo homini.

Contrairement à certains critiques de Hobbes qui réduisent sa théorie politique en une science des affaires civiles, Léo Strauss, lui, en fait une tout autre interprétation en y voyant, non pas une épistémologie, mais une morale fondée sur des prémises anthropologiques antérieures à toute considération sociale ou politique. En effet, pour Strauss, toutes les thèses politiques de Hobbes dérivent de sa conception de l’homme. De celle-ci découlent deux postulats : premièrement que l’homme est naturellement animé d’un sentiment de vanité ; deuxièmement que sa vie est dominée par la peur de la mort violente. Il faut reconnaître que ces deux postulats relèvent fondamentalement de l’intersubjectivité, c’est-à-dire du rapport à l’autre. La question de la pluralité n’est donc pas séparable de celle de l’altérité. Si l’homme est doué d’un sentiment de vanité, c’est certainement parce que son désir est infini et c’est en cela que l’homme se distingue de l’animal dont le désir tend limitativement à la seule préservation du corps. Hobbes au chapitre XI du Léviathan montre comment ce désir infini de l’homme se transforme en désir de puissance. Or, ce désir de domination et de puissance n’est possible que si l’homme se trouve en présence de son semblable. Léo Strauss affirme que « Hobbes ne se lasse pas de souligner ce qui fait la spécificité de l’homme par rapport à l’animal à savoir l’aspiration à l’honneur et à des situations honorables, à la prééminence sur autrui et la reconnaissance de celle-ci par autrui. » (1991 : 30) Mais il faut toutefois souligner cette difficulté que Strauss observe chez Hobbes sur l’origine de la vanité : dire que la vanité est un sentiment naturel équivaut à reconnaître que l’homme est un être naturellement méchant. Il est
Selon Strauss, la vanité et la peur de la mort violente sont indissociables. L’homme vaniteux a besoin de la reconnaissance des autres. Il est vaniteux aux yeux des autres qui doivent reconnaître sa supériorité. Les hommes sont donc en quête de reconnaissance et cette reconnaissance s’effectue sous forme de lutte. L’aspiration à la prééminence engendre donc la peur permanente de la mort. De cette idée, il ressort que la lutte pour la reconnaissance suppose la dynamique intersubjective. La thèse de Strauss est que la philosophie politique de Hobbes a un fondement moral, qu’elle ne dérive pas des sciences de la nature (1991 : 53), mais plutôt de l’expérience de la vie humaine. Strauss a vu dans la philosophie politique de Hobbes un développement de la théorie de la reconnaissance. La pluralité ne peut constituer l’essence du politique que si elle est considérée, non pas comme un état statique, mais comme une dynamique relationnelle. Ainsi, contrairement à ce que pense Hannah Arendt, la théorie politique de Hobbes rend bien compte de la pluralité.

3.2. La lutte pour la reconnaissance

Léo Strauss dans ses études sur Hobbes s’était inspiré, durant son séjour à Paris de 1932 à 1933, des travaux d’Alexandre Kojève sur Hegel, en établissant un rapprochement entre le désir infini que Hobbes reconnaît à l’homme et le désir de reconnaissance que Hegel reconnaît à toute conscience objective, libérée de la survie animale. Ainsi, comme le souligne Kojève:

> On part de l’homme dans l’état de Begierde [désir], qui se met à vivre dans le milieu humain. La Begierde existe toujours, mais elle a changé d’objet. Elle porte sur un autre homme, mais l’homme autre n’est reconnu que comme un objet, et désiré comme tel : en vue d’une négation, d’une appropriation. L’homme cherche à être reconnu par les autres : le simple Désir (Begierde) devient désir de reconnaissance. Cette Reconnaissance est une action et non pas seulement une connaissance. (A. Kojève, 1945 : 52)

Ce texte trouve sans aucun doute ses fondements sur la dialectique du maître et de l’esclave de Hegel. En mettant l’accent sur l’action, Hegel montre comment le désir de reconnaissance se manifeste dans la lutte des consciences, c’est grâce au mouvement dialectique que l’esclave se libère de sa conscience servile pour accéder à la claire conscience de sa nature. En réalité, Léo Strauss a compris Hobbes à travers Hegel. Sans pour autant trahir Hobbes, il a su interpréter sa pensée en empruntant la voie hégélienne. On ne s’étonnerait d’ailleurs pas que son ouvrage sur Hobbes soit dominé de part en part par Hegel à qui il reconnaît le mérite d’avoir vu la supériorité de la morale hobbesienne. Il écrit :

> Sur des questions touchant la philosophie de la conscience de soi, on ne peut espérer juge qui fasse davantage autorité que Hegel. Hegel reconnaît implicitement la supériorité du fondement philosophique de Hobbes sur celui de Descartes lorsqu’il décrit l’expérience dont est originellement issue la conscience de soi comme une lutte pour la vie et la mort, lutte provoquée par la reconnaissance par autrui. (Strauss, 1991 : 90)
Au début, Hegel était admiratif de la cité grecque, il était d'accord avec Aristote sur le fait que, selon la nature, le peuple est antérieur à l'individu comme le tout est antérieur aux parties. Ce qui signifie que l'individu en lui-même n’est rien sans la communauté éthique qui le détermine. « Hegel, manifestement, s'inspire encore ici de l’idée aristotélicienne selon laquelle la nature de l’homme comporte en elle-même une dimension communautaire qui se développe pleinement dans la *polis.* » (Axel Honneth, 2013 : 29)

Mais Hegel va faire un double usage de cet héritage aristotélisant. D’une part, il assume et adopte le principe ontologique d’Aristote qui attribue à tout processus une finalité immanente ; d’autre part, il fait de ce processus une réalité dialectique, c’est-à-dire constituée en conflit, de la lutte, de l’opposition. Il faut souligner que c’est davantage sur Fichte\(^{11}\) que Hegel va s’appuyer pour développer son concept de reconnaissance. Il a repris très positivement la théorie fichtéenne de la reconnaissance pour en faire un processus de subjectivisation où la conscience par le jeu de la négation s’oppose à une autre conscience. L’usage que Hegel se fait des philosophies sociales de Machiavel et Hobbes a consisté à réinterpréter leurs modèles de lutte originelle comme le moyen par lequel les individus passent du stade de la conscience de soi naïve au stade de la conscience pour soi objective.

Il ne faut donc pas dire que le contrat passé entre les hommes met fin à l’état précaire dans lequel chacun doit lutter contre tous pour sauvegarder son existence, mais plutôt considérer la lutte comme un moyen moral permettant de passer d’un stade primitif à un stade plus avancé des rapports éthiques. (Axel Honneth, 2013 : 34)

Dans ses analyses, Kojève fait une interprétation rigoureusement dialectique des rapports de reconnaissance entre les individus. Cette interprétation d’origine hégélienne a permis à Strauss de faire un rapprochement entre Hobbes et Hegel. Selon Philippe Crignon,

l’intérêt de ce rapprochement, outre qu’il permet à Strauss d’accorder au jeu rationnel toute son importance, est qu’il le rend aussi particulièrement sensible à la contradiction ontologique que constitue l’état de nature. Il évite ainsi l’alternative, courante parmi les commentateurs, entre une interprétation qui fait de l’état de nature une situation historique et une autre qui le considère comme une hypothèse méthodologique. (2009 : 97)

L’état de nature se conçoit donc comme une étape transitoire qui permet aux individus de se dépasser par la lutte pour la mort. De cet état de guerre généralisée nait dialectiquement un état de paix et de sécurité, où la lutte se transforme en moyen de reconnaissance. L’état de nature en réalité est une contradiction, une négation nécessaire de la pluralité. Tout individu qui consent à y demeurer se contredit et s’oppose à sa propre nature. C’est pour cela qu’il faut considérer l’état de nature comme une condition naturelle des hommes et non pas comme une condition des hommes naturels. La thèse de Hannah Arendt sur l’homme trouve ses fondements sans nul doute dans la pensée politique de Hobbes et plus précisément dans son anthropologie. Hobbes, contrairement à ce que pensent certains critiques, ne reconnaît pas à l’homme une quelconque nature au sens de la *ousia* aristotélicienne. Il n’y a pas chez Hobbes une nature humaine en tant que telle. Comme nous

l’avons souligné, ce sont les conditions de vie des hommes qui sont naturelles et non pas les hommes eux-mêmes. La violence naturelle qui caractérise cet état résulte non pas de l’homme générique, mais des hommes, c’est-à-dire de la pluralité. Par le jeu interpersonnel, les hommes s’opposent entre eux et se dépassent en surmontant les hostilités naturelles. La pensée de la pluralité ne signifie autre chose que l’existence sociale des hommes. Et la politique ne peut saisir l’homme que dans ce sens. Aristote a bien compris cela, mais il n’a malheureusement pas vu la complexité et la profondeur des relations intersubjectives. La pensée grecque antique a manqué l’idée de subjectivité. Faute de pouvoir fonder la politique sur la subjectivité, c’est-à-dire le relationnel – je ne suis sujet que dans et par mes relations avec les autres – les Anciens ont fondé la vie sociale sur la nature, d’où l’émergence d’un droit naturel au mépris d’un droit subjectif.

3.3. Quelques limites de la lecture hégélienne de Hobbes par Strauss

Examinons l’essentiel du rapprochement entre Hobbes et Hegel et voyons ce qu’il en résulte. Si Leo Strauss et Alexandre Kojève focalisent leurs analyses sur le lien qui existe entre Hobbes et Hegel, ce n’est pas simplement pour montrer que le premier est le précurseur du second, c’est surtout pour montrer que l’état du second est le dépassement du premier. Si Strauss, par une interprétation hégélienne de l’état de nature, souligne que cet état est une lutte dialectique pour la reconnaissance, il court certainement le risque d’aboutir à des conclusions qui contredisent l’anthropologie de Hobbes. La lutte pour la reconnaissance ne conduit pas chez Hobbes à l’idée de l’État comme fin de l’histoire. Comme le précise bien Philippe Crignon, « l’État hobbesien se pense comme fondation (donc origine) non comme synthèse (donc fin). » (2009 : 99) Hobbes a fondé l’État sur un contrat qui vise à ordonner la multitude, l’État hégélien par contre n’est pas de nature contractuelle, il est le divin sur terre. L’État a une naissance historique chez Hobbes, ce qui suppose également sa mort. Une telle idée, selon Hegel, ne peut provenir que des philosophies politiques de l’entendement et non pas de sa philosophie politique de la raison.

Il y a lieu de reconnaître que cette lecture conduit à certaines objections sur le concept de pluralité :

Premièrement, il y a chez Hobbes une théorie de la pluralité qui énonce que le présupposé le plus général de l’État est que la multitude soit toujours ordonnée, soit à la volonté d’un seul (la monarchie), soit à la volonté de tous (la démocratie). Il n’y a pas de vie politique possible en dehors du principe d’ordination de la multitude. En plus, l’état de nature n’est pas une simple confrontation dialectique des consciences, comme le montre Kojève à la suite de Hegel. Il s’agit selon Hobbes d’un état de guerre généralisée suscitant la peur de la mort violente. La pluralité a donc toute sa signification chez Hobbes, les objections d’Arendt mériteraient d’être nuancées.

pas vu à quel point Hobbes pouvait, grâce à cela, être un rempart contre la logique historique de Hegel. » (2009 : 100)

Troisièmement, Strauss considère la dynamique relationnelle comme un processus à la fois logique et ontologique, toute chose qui s’énonce en conformité avec le système hégélien. L’état de nature y est pensé comme une contradiction logique et ontologique. Ce qui le pousse à minimiser l’institutionnalisation du contrat, moment fondateur de l’État chez Hobbes.

3.4. Hannah Arendt et la critique de la modernité

Il n’est pas de doute que la question de la modernité ait fortement préoccupé Hannah Arendt, au point qu’elle a produit diverses œuvres qui témoignent de son souci constant de réorienter la politique, non pas pour créer une nouvelle théorie, mais pour repenser la modernité. A l’opposé de J.-S. Mill et, à travers lui, de Hobbes, Hannah Arendt, fascinée par l’idéal républicain depuis Machiavel – qui pense que le citoyen doit préférer la cité à son âme – focalise la critique de la modernité politique sur le décentrement du problème anthropologique de la nature humaine vers l’intersubjectivité, d’où l’importance qu’elle attache au concept de pluralité. Car « ce sont les hommes et non pas l’homme, qui vivent sur terre et habitent le monde. » (1983 : 41) La particularité de la politique est donc qu’elle se rapporte essentiellement au monde comme pluralité interactive des hommes. Les thèses républicaines que Hannah Arendt a défendues contre le libéralisme et le totalitarisme ont contribué significativement à la critique de la modernité. Face à la montée des mouvements totalitaires et du développement industriel, elle affiche son scepticisme. Elle rejette l’idée d’un monde social hyper privatisé, fonctionnalisé et dépolitisé. Sa préférence pour l’humanisme civique des Anciens dont Aristote, Cicéron, Polype et Machiavel lui a valu aux yeux de certains critiques quelques soupçons d’anachronisme, mais à bien y regarder son admiration pour ces auteurs anciens lui a permis d’apporter une contribution importante à l’historiographie du néo-républicanisme. Son Essai sur la révolution n’est-il pas dominé de part en part par des références historiques renvoyant à la vertu républicaine.

Un autre aspect de sa critique de la modernité est la question de la liberté politique. Il faut tout d’abord souligner que Hannah Arendt ne partage pas l’idée défendue par certains classiques libéraux, notamment Hobbes, qui définissent la liberté comme un droit individuel, un domaine purement intérieur de la conscience. Pour elle, « l’homme ne saurait rien de la liberté intérieure s’il n’avait d’abord expérimenté une liberté qui soit une réalité tangible dans le monde. » (1972 : 191-192). La doctrine libérale définit la liberté comme un droit individuel moral, qui présuppose une forme de liberté antérieure à l’état politique. Voilà pourquoi Hannah Arendt reproche à Hobbes d’avoir réduit la politique à la domination. Le rapport politique de l’Un et du Multiple est fondé sur la domination. Or, la politique n’est pas un rapport de domination, elle a pour fin ultime la liberté. Il faut souligner que le contrat de Hobbes n’est pas un contrat social, mais un contrat politique. C’est donc en opposition au paradigme libéral que Hannah Arendt rejette toute forme d’apolitisme. Le libéralisme préconise toujours la dépolitisation de la liberté en la rattachant à des considérations naturalistes anhistoriques. Hobbes, selon elle, a développé une conception apolitique de la liberté qui ne représente que la sphère de l’individualité et non pas le domaine public en tant que tel. Le libéralisme, tel qu’on peut le voir chez Nozick et Hayek, tend vers la minimisation de l’État et l’affaiblissement de la citoyenneté. Il interdit à l’État d’interdire. La critique arendtienne de la modernité met en lumière la perte de sens de la politique comme domaine public, comme pensée du...
monde. L’égarement de la philosophie politique s’explique du fait que les modernes ont développé des théories métapolitiques foncées sur un objectivisme juridique qui a favorisé paradoxalement l’émergence de la raison d’État et donc du totalitarisme, c’est-à-dire la négation de la pluralité des hommes et des idées. Hannah Arendt situe les origines du totalitarisme dans la modernité pour la simple raison que celle-ci n’a pas pu protéger l’espace public et penser la politique en rapport avec la pluralité. Au sujet de la pluralité, elle affirme que « si tous les aspects de la condition humaine ont de quelque façon rapport à la politique, cette pluralité est spécifiquement la condition – non seulement la condition sine qua non, mais encore la condition per quam – de toute vie politique. » (1983 : 41-42).

Hannah Arendt distingue la pluralité du pluralisme, et plus précisément du pluralisme libéral qui fait de la multitude naturelle un état pré-politique fondé sur le droit naturel, c’est pour cette raison qu’elle voit chez les classiques libéraux la propension à vouloir fonder la modernité sur un naturalisme juridique. Allusion faite ici à Hobbes et Mill. Le concept de pluralité revêt donc chez elle un caractère particulièrement politique, parce qu’il est à la fois phénoménologique et volontariste.

**Conclusion**

La pluralité telle qu’elle est réfléchie par Hannah Arendt se définit comme l’essence du politique. Selon elle, Hobbes a eu le mérite d’avoir fondé le Corps politique sur l’idée de multitude, mais cette idée lumineuse du philosophe anglais s’est limitée malheureusement au seul rapport de domination, la politique consiste à soumettre la multitude. Hannah Arendt pense que si la philosophie politique n’a pas réussi à saisir l’essence du politique, c’est parce qu’elle a énoncé, comme Aristote l’a fait, l’essence politique de l’homme. Or, la politique est extérieure à l’homme, elle ne tire pas son origine de la nature humaine ; elle naît de la pluralité interactive des hommes et se définit essentiellement comme « espace-qui-est-entre-les-hommes ». L’idée de pluralité comme phénoménalité de la politique conduit ainsi aux concepts de liberté et d’égalité. Les hommes agissent parce qu’ils sont libres et leur liberté consiste à créer un monde commun. Contre l’artificialisme hobbesien, Hannah Arendt préconise la pensée de la pluralité fondée sur le principe du jugement et de la responsabilité dans la gestion de l’effectivité sociale. L’humanisme républicain qu’elle défend peut être interprété comme le retour en force d’une pensée protectionniste des sociétés contemporaines en proie à la financierisation de l’économie et aux violences de toutes sortes. Sans nier le paradoxe qui existe au sein de tout espace politique entre l’identité et l’altérité, Hannah Arendt, en objection à toute négation de la pluralité, opte pour une collectivisation de la politique.
Références


A Lexico- Semantic Analysis of Military Language

Takim Ajom Okongor
Federal University Dutse, Nigeria

Abstract

Language is one of the most important possessions at the disposal of man to help him shape and dominate his environment. Man therefore uses language in various contexts and situations either to offer information, influence attitudes or to maintain social relationship. Because of these variegated functions which language is called upon to perform differences exist in vocabulary and style.

This paper focuses on Lexico-Semantic Analysis of military language. The aim is to describe the language of the military as a specialized variety with its own distinctive features. Data collection was by oral interview and observation technique. The findings show that the features of military Language are comparatively quite distinct from all other varieties. The author concludes that language of the military is peculiar as well as relevant to those in the military profession.

Keywords: register, military, profession, lexico- semantic, analysis.
Introduction

This study focuses on the sub-variety of the occupational variety of English language, that which is often used in the military profession. This forms the basis of Moody's (1970:2), opinion that:

Every language has develop means for the
differentiation of distinct functions and association.
And our knowledge of language is incomplete
until we recognize, interpret and originate all the
subtle in relation to varying needs of our personal,
social, political and profession involvements.

This definition states the variation of language as well as its flexibility in order to account for its demands and usage. It is necessary to consider the social and contextual background of military in order to effectively appreciate how the functionality of language used in the military demands particular linguistic terms. According to Asher and Simpson (1994:2496) the soldierly trade is almost as old as man. Priests and warriors have long established themselves as soldiers within every society. The warrior ethic was known in distant past with sign, symbol and dress, badge and ritual ceremony. All these provide a particular form of communication. As warfare became complicated, military conversation became the language of professionals. Military conversation is also encouraged by growth of distinct specialization as well as the impact of technology. The skill of war and the recognition of its requirements needed a language of its own that will enhance communication among soldiers.

The modern society is advancing technologically. The world has now moved into the age of “hi-tech warfare”. The description of the battlefield and its experience has change. Verbal communication is now electronically transmitted. The relationship between the harmful weapons and the words used to describe their effect is contradictory. The terms conveying death and destruction have given way to what has been regarded as the domestication of battlefield violence.

Acronym, euphemism, abbreviation, and slang are converted into more important use to enrich the military language. The military language must perform its established function such as the investigation of war. With the invention of computer, military language serve as a medium for information management linking “hi-tech “ with human capabilities as a means to facilitate the identification of information and also provide the opportunity to cope with the changing situation.

The military must be regarded as a specialized group, whose language is used in state service or government. The military language is an affirmation of institutional identity that controls deadly, destructive weapons.

The History of Nigerian Army and its Role

According to Obasanjo (1987:-34-43), Lt. Glover of the Royal Navy in 1863 selected eighteen indigenes from the northern part of the country and organized them into a force called “Glover Hausas”. The force was used by Lt. Glover, the governor of Hausas” was renamed “Hausas Constabulary” in 1863. It performed civil and military known as “Lagos Constabulary.” It was incorporated into the West African frontier force in 1901, and it became “Lagos Battalion”.

http://ijhcschiefeditor.wix.com/ijhcs
The West Africa Frontier (WAFF), by the end of 1901, has incorporated all paramilitary units in the other British all units in each of the dependencies into a regiment. The merger in Neria produced the Northern Nigerian Regiment and Southern Nigerian Regiment.

When Queen Elizabeth of Britain visited Nigeria between 28th January and 15th February, 1956, the Nigerian Regiment became known as the Queen’s Own Nigerian Regiment (QONR). The regionalization of west African Frontier force (WAFF), came into existence in the same year and each military force became the Nigerian Military force (NMF). By 1st June 1958 the Nigerian Government took over the control of the Nigerian Military form British Army Council in London. When Nigeria became independent in 1960, the Nigerian Military Force became known as Royal Nigerian Army (RNA), and in 1963 the Royal Nigeria Army (RNA), change its name to the Nigerian Army.

The functions of Nigerian Army are: protecting the Nigerian territory; it maybe involved in international war if the need arises. This is done to protect the interest of the nation. The Nigeria Army in addition to Safeguarding the interest of Nigeria also gets involved in international peace keeping in Africa as well as other continents.

**Statement of the Research Problem**

Misinterpretation, misunderstanding and contradiction are some of the problems that hinder the soldiers from carrying out their duties. By studying the language use in the military we hope to draw the attention of all categories of men and women of the Nigerian Army as well as the public to the importance of effective communication. Therefore, the questions this paper attempts to answer include:

- What are the special registers in the language of military and what are their meanings?
- What are the rules and norms governing military discourse?
- What is the consequence of these on the meaning of the military language?

This research assumes that language used in the military is a distinct and functional variety of English Language.

**Aim and objective of the study**

The aim of this study is to describe the language of the military as a specialized variety with its own distinctive features. The specific objectives of the study are to:

- Examine the special registers in the language of the military and their meanings
- Highlight the rules and norms governing military discourse
- Highlight the consequence of these on the meaning of the military language.
Scope of the Study

There are different approaches to the study of language of the military. However, for the purpose of this study, our attention is limited to certain lexical items, which have specialized functions in the military. The study is limited to some and not all lexical items of the language of the military due to constraints of time and space.

Literature Review

Registers

Malinckjaer (1991:140), defines registers as “what you speak at a particular time and as determined by what you and others are doing”. According to Akinpelu (2001:181), cited in Ubahakwe and Sogbesan (2001), registers refers to specific vocabulary and range of language items, which are frequently used when talking about a particular functions or professions. In other words, there are special vocabularies or technical words for special concept in every field of study such as Machine, Law, and the Military e.t.c Nwofor (1990:41) sees registers as “particular set of lexical items associated with a form of language linked to one’s area of human experience and endeavour”.

Register, according to Chaulky, (1982:75), are “the type of linguistic variation most closely related to the basic social function of the language”. Different register fulfill this function of initiating, maintaining and controlling social interaction by allowing speakers to convey their social position relative to that of their listeners, while simultaneously communicating a message. Like any other language, English has different register or styles from which its users almost unconsciously choose as they change from one situation to another in everyday life. It should be noted that certain types of sentences, words and collocations differentiate each register. For example, the register used by lawyers in the document they prepare for their clients is marked out by long, clumsy sentences and words and collocations, like “plaintiff”, “liable”; “aforesaid”, “defendant”, etc.

The register of sport is marked out by words and collocations like ‘referee”, ‘draw”, and “score” “attacker”, “commit a foul “ “away win”, “ home win” and “rough tackle”. Each time we use English, therefore, we have to be able to use the register that is appropriate for which we happen to discussing.

Military Language and Context (Soldier Talk)

Malinowski (1949:312-315), is of the view that “Language is always used to do something “. Languages function as a mode of action. Malinowski studied the pragmatic function as well as the non-pragmatic function of language. According to him, the pragmatic function is when language is used to achieve concrete goals, recall the past and the non-pragmatic is when language is used to establish social intercourse. He considers the non-pragmatic as functional use of language, labeling it “phatic communion .” He describes such conversational uses of language as “a type of speech in which ties of union are created by a mere exchange of words” Malinowski (1949:316).
Any one who has ever served in either the armed forces or military organization of any country will recognize that “soldier talk” is a language in its own right. Just as the military is a separate world, so does it also have its language. According to Asher and Simpson, (1994:2499):

The familiar is dissolved in a thoroughly unfamiliar environment where even elementary domestic routine becomes strange. The soldier’s language is an attempt to construct a reality of his own to give himself a particular identity in the face of the system, e.g the U.S.A infantry men in vietnam were the “grunts,” deadly weapons are given amiable and innocuous designations. The heavily armed gunship-emerge as “puff”, the Magic Dragon, the hug life helicopters as “Jolly”. Green giants, clumsy, chemical warfare clothing as “Noddy suit”.

The submariners, air crew, gunners and tank troops each has its own internalized language. Like the rest of the “soldier language” it is designed to set up distinctive and demarcations of skill or achievement. The universal language of the universal soldiers is obscene, crude and raw. The soldiers’ talk varies from one country to another.

According to Asher and Simpson (1994:2500), the word “fuck” can turned into adjective, noun, verb, and suffix depending on the situation. The man, the piece of equipment or weapon, an enemy, neighbor, the weather, and food can all be used to express range, frustration, despair and contempt. Much of soldier talk is also self mockery.

The military organization is an establishment with goals. So in order to enable it perform its objectives, more concern is paid to procedures, laws and rules and regulations. That is why the military ends up in hoarding more information than is given out because procedures, laid laws, rules and regulations have to be strictly obeyed.

Because of the rigidity of the military, power is at every stage concentrated in the hands of a person. At every stage of organizational hierarchy, a soldier is answerable to a superior officer under whose control and supervision he is. For an institution as the military to achieve its goals, there must be collective responsibility, loyalty and effective communication. This brings about situation whereby the superior officer gives order and the juniors obey. This situation calls for an organized and situational language use as an effective means of communication.

The Uniqueness of Military Language

The language of the military desire uniqueness from its inherent linguistic features and characteristics. The language is characterized by the use of signals, which are used as the primary medium for communication. The signal is verbal or written. To achieve effective communication there has to be professional training and expertise.

According to Kyenge (1999:45) a signal must be an action or the product of an action demanding response or correspondence. The way in which a message flows within the military hierarchy is dictated by the tone of the message, which is formal. It must be clear and brief. It also
depends on who is sending signals and to whom. For example, if it is from a captain to a major, then it must be polite and frank giving the most detailed information and inferring that final decision is with the superior officer.

It should be noted that whatever is the direction of the hierarchy, a signal message is characterized in two ways: (a) it is detailed and often conscious of rank and position. (b) It is brief and precise, often making adequate use of coded expressions, abbreviation and symbols. In communication, adequate attention is given to the fact that such codes carry pragmatic as well as semantic information. This also varies and depends on situation and context.

The military language is precise when used internally. There is high degree of care especially in the use of 1st and 2nd person singular pronouns. This is done in order to avoid personal responsibility for actions taken in the course of performing formal functions.

There are special vocabularies or technical words for special concept in every field of study such as medicine, law, photography, building, engineering, religion, journalism, printing, library, agriculture et central.

Theoretical Framework

The Researcher has decided to adopt Systemic Functional Linguistics Approach. This theory has been found appropriate for this work. Systemic grammar has the ideals of coherence, consistency and explicitness. Systemic grammar often demonstrates how the forms of a human language or variety of a language can be related to its social functions. It deals with the description of varieties of language, which depend on social situations, register and social dialects.

The main emphasis of systemic grammar is sociolinguistics because it has sociolinguistics as its focus; it is so much concerned with the functions of language that are relevant to stylistics and textlinguistics. Systemic grammatical studies given a very high priority to the sociological aspect of language.

Language as social system is subject to variation to use - register variation in meaning. Register variation, therefore reflects the social order in the special sense or social processes. The notion of register is a notion required to relate the functions of language to those aspects of the situation in which it is being used. These are the relevant aspects for us to include under the nature of speech situation or context. According to Halliday (1985:77), the relevant aspect of speech situation are what he calls field, tenor, and mode respectively. As concept they help to explain how language users interpret the social context or textual environment in which meaning are made. As a descriptive term, field refers broadly to the subject matter or topic. That is what is going on – the social action which has meaning in a social system. Field of discourse refers to what is happening in a discourse. What a particular text is about. For example, weather, football e.t.c the tenor of discourse relates to who is taking part in social situation. It includes the role structure into which the participants in the discourse fit. For example teacher and student or mother and child. Actual speech roles are included, through exchange itself.

The mode of discourse deals with the role that the text or language itself is playing in the situation at hand.
Methodology

Sources of Data

In carrying out this study, the sources of information include: primary and secondary. The primary source was mainly oral interview with selected cadre of military men and officers of different ranks and statuses in the Infantry Division of the Nigeria Army.

The secondary source includes textbooks, published and unpublished works like magazines, journals, newspapers and bulleting e.t.c

Data Collection Techniques

A combination of techniques were employed in the collection of data for the purpose of this research. Oral interview and observation technique were used for data elicitation and collection.

Oral interview

Oral interview was used as one of the techniques for eliciting relevant linguistic data from the informants. The oral interview consisted of a set of guided questions, which have helped us answer our research questions. Questions were asked or presented to the informants or interviewees in an informal and relaxed atmosphere where most significant or reliable and valid information and facts about military register were elicited and gathered. This may otherwise been difficult in a formal situation. We used the technique of random sampling and spoke only to the willing soldiers. After all, it was usually encouraged that a limited number of informants be chosen to ease data handling problems or rather for effective data handling.

Analytical procedure

This research work is a lexico-semantic study of the language of the military. The registers and corresponding interpretation of such registers are outlined in a tabular form. That is the data is arranged in a tabular form to aid understanding and to present the work in a neat manner. The data is analyzed further to give a clearer picture how these terms are used within the military profession.

Data presentation

The registers are presented in one column, and their technical meanings in another column. This orderly presentation of the data is made to facilitate our understanding of the meaning of the some of the lexical items associated with the military.

Military Terms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Word</th>
<th>Technical Meaning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>actual</td>
<td>The (marine) unite commander, used to distinguish the commander from the radioman when the call sign is used</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advance</td>
<td>Move forward</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agency</td>
<td>The central intelligence agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-gunner</td>
<td>Assistant gunner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Term</td>
<td>Definition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air bone</td>
<td>Refers to soldiers who are qualified as parachutists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-40 rocket</td>
<td>A shoulder-held rocket-propelled grenade launcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ball game</td>
<td>An operation or a contact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Band-aid</td>
<td>Medic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bandoliers</td>
<td>Belt of machine gun ammunition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic</td>
<td>Basic training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carpet-bomb</td>
<td>Bomb (an area) intensively</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Captor</td>
<td>A person who capture another</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capture</td>
<td>Take or get by force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cartridge</td>
<td>A casing containing a charge and a bullet or shot for a gun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Casualty</td>
<td>A person killed or injured in a war</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dash down</td>
<td>Take cover</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defence</td>
<td>Military measures for protecting a country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Die with one’s boot on</td>
<td>Die fighting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disarm</td>
<td>Take a weapon or weapons away form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disarmament</td>
<td>The reduction or withdrawal of military forces and weapons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enemy</td>
<td>A hostile nation or its armed forces in time of war</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enlistment</td>
<td>Enroll or be enrolled in the armed service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatigue</td>
<td>Clean up</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fireabomb</td>
<td>A bomb intended to cause a fire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire power</td>
<td>The destructive capacity of guns, missiles, or a military force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firing squad</td>
<td>A group of soldiers order to shoot a condemned person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fratricide</td>
<td>The accidental killing of one’s own forces in war</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Area of operation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guard house</td>
<td>A building used to accommodate a military guard or to detain prisoners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guardroom</td>
<td>Cell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gun</td>
<td>A weapon with a metal tube from bullet or shells are propelled by explosive force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gunboat</td>
<td>A small ship armed with guns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House wife</td>
<td>Needle and thread</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kit</td>
<td>bag</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Langalanga</td>
<td>Cutlass</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master parade</td>
<td>Morning inspection of soldiers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mess</td>
<td>A place members of the armed force may eat and relax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Military honours</td>
<td>Marks of respect paid by troop at the burial of a soldier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mine</td>
<td>A type of bomb placed on or in the ground or water, which explodes on contact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minefield</td>
<td>A short large bore cannon for firing bombs at high angles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No 1 dress</td>
<td>Ceremonial dress</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
No 4 dress | Camouflage
---|---
No 5 dress | Tertaron or OG green
Operation | A strategic movement of troops, ship for military action
Order | Trial
Padre | Chaplain in any of the armed forces, for example a priest
Parade hour | Devotion time
Parade | A formal or ceremonial muster of troops for inspection
Parade ground | A place for the muster of troops
Party | A paper containing military information
One | Position within the armed forces
Recruit | Take on (someone) to serve in armed forces
Regiment | Permanent unit of any Army
Retreat | Withdraw from attacking enemy forces
Rifle | A gun with a long spiral grooved barrel to make a bullet spin and thereby increase accuracy over a long distance
Salute | A raising of a hand to the head, made as a formal military
Sentry | A soldier stationed to keep guard

Data Analysis

From the data presented above, it is evident that there are great differences in meaning between technical terms used in the military and the meanings these words carry outside the military (literal meaning). A discussion talk with some professional soldiers has also revealed the same thing. It has been realized that most of these words are taken from the general English language and used in this specific area to mean more than they ordinarily do.

If we consider the words “ground” for example, the first thing that comes to mind is the solid surface of the earth or land of a specified kind, but in the military language, it is an area of operation. That is, the battlefield. The word “axis” in ordinary usage is an imaginary line through a body about which it rotates, or an imaginary line about which a regular figure is symmetrically arranged. In mathematics “axis” is a fixed reference line for the measurement of coordinates, while in the military, “axis” is an estimated area.

It is important to note that the use of context also plays a very important role in this analysis. Since we know that words could lose their meaning if isolated, bearing in mind the importance of meaning that is the aim of communication, the use of context becomes a vital tool in the disambiguation of utterances and words present in the military registers. For example, in this conversation between uniform and Zulu:

- Uniform to Zulu- I repeat –Uniform to Zulu. Can you read me?
- Zulu speaking: I read you loud and clear, over.
A civilian would feel lost. The code Uniform and Zulu do not refer to the distinctive clothing worn by members of the same organization or school and the language of the Zulu people in South Africa. The codes are used to refer to two people in a radio transmission. Words have their meaning from the context in which they are used that is in the military context military. In another context it means another thing. In the language of transport “boot” means the luggage compartment of a motorcar.

The examples are numerous and they all help to explain the point that military language is a unique form of language most of which is restricted and highly technical. The examples also show that in every register used for communication meaning cannot be ignored because meaning is what is being passed across.

Findings

In the process of analysis, we found out that the features of the language of the military are comparatively, quite distinct from all other varieties found in English Language. This is due to the nature of their terminologies which are shared less by other varieties of English Language. The registers are set out to perform particular functions.

The military language also has a unique style. This includes its use of abbreviations and acronyms, which also have technical meanings. There is also the unique way of combination of words to derive other words, which have new meaning. For example scar face, papa-Alpha-Yankee. This makes it very difficult for a person who is outside the context to understand the meaning of such words.

Conclusion

From our analysis, we can conclude that language of the military is peculiar as well as important to those in the military profession. It is technical in nature because it makes use of abbreviations and numbers that can only serve to confuse the layman.

Recommendations

The need for the military registers to be understood by people other than the professionals themselves has become necessary over recent times. More and more military registers are being linked with general language. This is done to enhance credibility of information amongst other factors. This is not a clamour for the non-professional to attain vocabulary expertise equivalent to the professional. But rather it is the recognition for a diffusion of these register with day-to-day language. The end result should therefore be an increasing number of people fairly knowledge about the important lexical items of the military that have a prominent effect on our everyday lives.
References


-Bensman and B. Rosenberg (1976), Mass, class, Bureaucracy: An Introduction to Sociology, USA praeger publishers Inc.


-Chaulkly, A. (1930) the Patterning of Language Variation. New York: Macmillan


-Firth J.A. (1957), Ethnographic Analysis and Language with Reference to Malinowski’s Views in


-Leech, G. (1975), semantics great Britain: Hazel Watsen and Vinety Ltd.


- Trudgill, P. (1971), Sociolinguistics Hambondworth: Penguin


A Morpho-Semantic Analysis of Verbs as Lexical Categories

Ọmọmegbe Mercy Ọmọmegbe
University of Benin, Benin City, Nigeria

William Ighasere Aigbedo
University of Benin, Benin City, Nigeria

Abstract

A principal aspect of a language analysis is the investigation of the structure of words and their organization into the grammar of a language. A language satisfies the communicative needs of the society and people using it when certain rules are observed in the production of linguistic expressions. Lexical category is a unit of classification of words in the grammar of a language and serves to portray the unique configuration properties of certain words and word classes. This paper surveys an aspect of word categorization in Edo language (lexical category) with special focus on the properties of the verb as a member of this class. Illustrations will be provided in the paper to justify first of all the dichotomy between different classes of words in the language (lexical vs functional) and the place of the verb in the category of words known as ‘lexical’. The findings of the paper will show that the verb possesses rich morphological, syntactic and semantic features that justify its inclusion in the class of lexical class of words.

Keywords: grammatical category, lexical category, verbs and morpho-semantics.
1. Introduction

The basic concepts in a language are encoded as words which are related together within the grammar by means of categories. Baker (2004) identified three items that can be classified as lexical categories in a language as: nouns, verbs and adjectives. Rauh (2010) treats the concept of grammatical categories as ‘syntactic categories’ following in the steps of generative grammars conception of categorization. He claims that syntactic categories are part of the syntactic description of languages, and the syntactic description of languages is concerned with the structure of sentences. Syntactic categories are therefore defined as “the set of linguistic items that can occupy the same positions in the structures of the sentence of a given language” (Rauh, 2010:28). This definition seeks to identify the members of a syntactic category and to describe the properties/features that are relevant for category membership. It equally tells us or provides an insight into which unit can occur in a given position of a sentential structure and which cannot as well as the categorial features that may be responsible for this occurrence restrictions.

Tsojon, et. al. (2014) present a critique of the contemporary classification of English word into grammatical categories. In their appraisal, it was observed that words were classified by traditional linguists on the basis of their semantic properties. This they claim was too simplistic and hence not satisfactory for a proper analysis of word classes in a language like English. They eventually proposed a three-tier method for classifying words into categories as:

- Form (morphology),
- Distribution (syntax), and
- Function (semantics).

Tsojon, et. al. (2014:1).

The basis for this position is because a given lexical item may belong to or take the shape of different grammatical categories depending on the use to which it is put.

2. Methodology

The data collected and used in this study is the Orédó which is the Standard variety of Êdo. The data were obtained by direct interview and observation of certain utterances in different contexts by the researcher who hails from that part and is a competent speaker of the language. Data were also solicited from colleagues from the University of Benin particularly from the Department of Linguistics and African Languages who are also competent native speakers of the language. The native speaker’s competence of the researcher was also employed in getting these data particularly in the selection of relevant information and validation of linguistic items so collected. These data consisted basically of lexical items and larger derivations like, phrases, sentences and texts.

Analysis will be geared towards knowing the morphological shapes of constituents in Êdo as well as their syntactic distribution (as the data consist mainly of lexical items, phrases and sentences of various expressions) in line with the Dixon and Aikhenvald (2004) in the prototypical treatment of the class of Adjectives in some languages. They (Dixon and Aikhenvald) were of the view that word classes can be identified between languages (and
assigned the same names) based on two criteria: similarity of syntactic function and similarity of meaning.

3. The verb in Edo

The verb is the class of lexical categories used to refer to actions, process, activity and state engaged in by an argument. The verb is the lexical element at the nucleus of a clausal structure as its features on the one hand determines the spatio-temporal relations of other elements in a sentence while also determining the number and compatibility of arguments in a derivation. Omoregbu (2012) identifies different classes of the verbs in Edo based on their semantic features reflecting the peculiarities of different activities and how these determine the class of verbs used. Before delving into the semantic classification of verbs in the language, we will first of all look at the morphological compositions of the different verbs in Edo in the sub-sections that follow.

3.1 Morphological Classification of the Edo Verb

The Edo verbs, like their nominal counterparts, possess two basic morphological shapes: simple and complex. The simple verbs are those with a simple morphological form and these verbs cannot be decomposed into different component units. These verbs are also known as inalienable verbs while other verbal forms are the composition of the simple verb and other word classes and as such can be decomposed into their component units when the need arises. This second set of verbs is known as alienable verbs and is the complex form of verbs in Edo. The different morphological forms of the verb as a lexical category are discussed below.

a. Inalienable verbs in Edo

The simple verb is the basic form of the verb in Edo. This verb form cannot be subdivided into different component units or morphs. This is the form of the verb in its natural state as seen from the examples below:

1. i. kpóló ‘sweep’
   ii. ló ‘grind’
   iii. dô ‘do’
   iv. diá ‘straighten’
   v. bàn ‘pull’
   vi. khúi ‘lock’
   vii. dúvida ‘scatter (of uncountable nouns)’
   viii. rrié ‘take’

The verbs here cannot be separated into their component units as this will mean doing a phonological analysis of the different sound segments employed in the derivation of these words. They therefore represent the form of the verb stem without the addition of other morphs and are thus described as inalienable elements.

b. Alienable verbs in Edo
This is the form of the verb after undergoing a morphological process such as compounds. A verb in the language can combine with another verb, a nominal or a particle to derive this form of the verb. So a complex verb is one that is composed from more than one element as seen from the examples below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verb Stem</th>
<th>Compound</th>
<th>Derivation</th>
<th>Gloss</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i. mù ‘carry’</td>
<td>mu + egbe</td>
<td>mùègbé</td>
<td>‘to get ready’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii. dò ‘stealthily’</td>
<td>do + rrie</td>
<td>dòrrié</td>
<td>‘steal’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii. rrié ‘take’</td>
<td>rrie + rrọ</td>
<td>rriérro</td>
<td>‘hang’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv. tié ‘read’</td>
<td>tie + gbẹn</td>
<td>tiègbẹn</td>
<td>‘dictate’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>v. fián ‘cut’</td>
<td>fian + re</td>
<td>fiàngẹ</td>
<td>‘bite’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vi. rrié ‘take’</td>
<td>rrie + rre</td>
<td>rriérre</td>
<td>‘bring’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The verbs in 2a-f are derived verbs or compound verbs as a result of the process of derivation. A variety of combinatorial patterns can be found in the structures like, Verb-Verb, Verb-Noun and Verb-Adverb. The compound verbs (especially the Verb-Verb and Verb-Adverb compound) express acts that can be called double or a two-in-one activity. The verb, dò ‘stealthily’ for instance combine with, mú ‘carry’ to express the combined act of hiding to take something which is stealing.

3.2 Semantic classification of the Verb in Edo

The present study will employ the prototypical classification system for the verbs in Edo by dividing them into the following semantic classes based on the description of verbal prototypes in Dixon and Aikhenvald (2004). These classifications are supposed to account for the nature of the different activities verbs are used to portray in a language. The different semantic manifestations of verbal categories in Edo are described below.

a. Motion verbs

This is the class of verbs associated with events that are transitionary in nature. They are used to express the kind of activities that involve movement or locomotion. The following examples comprise of motion events or activities in the language.

| i. rhülé ‘run’ |
| ii. kpàá ‘leave’ |
| iii. fi ‘throw’ |
| iv. rhié ‘take’ |
| v. mù ‘carry’ |
| vi. sàán ‘jump’ |
| vii. dán ‘hop’ |
| viii. hiín ‘climb’ |
The verbs above are used to portray different activities embarked on by animate arguments. Some of the activities indicated above have similar connotations by different participants like sàán ‘jump’ (human nouns) and dán ‘hop’ (non-human nouns).

b. **Verbs of rest**

These verbs specify events that have to do with a locomotive activity. The activities sometimes can be the state of an entity at a particular time or the position taken at other times. The examples below represent this verb class in the language.

4. i. hèwè ‘rest’
   ii. tòtàn ‘sit’
   iii. dàyì ‘hold’
   iv. lòvbìè ‘lie down’
   v. mùdià ‘stand’
   vi. vbiè ‘sleep’

c. **Affective verbs**

These verbs are used to show the effects of an activity. They are activities portrayed by a verb which affect an entity and it is visible or concrete. These activities involve some physical exertion of force by an entity on another entity (ies). Examples of affective verbs in Edo are presented as follows:

5. i. fì ‘throw’
   ii. gbè ‘beat’
   iii. gièn ‘burn’
   iv. bòlò ‘peel’
   v. bó ‘build’
   vi. lè ‘cook’
   vii. guóghò ‘destroy’

d. **Verbs of Attention**

These verbs are used to denote activities involving any of the five organs of sense like hearing, seeing, feeling, tasting and smelling. They are associated with activities that have to do with perception based on any of these senses. The verbs of this class in the language are given below:

6. i. bèghé/dèghé ‘see’
   ii. miè ‘see’
   iii. hòn ‘hear’
   iv. bálò ‘pain’
   v. tòn ‘roast’
   vi. wìà ‘smell’
   vii. dànmwè ‘taste’
e. **Verbs of Speech**

These are verbs that denote verbal actions, those activities that involve the anatomical properties of language (speech/utterances). These verbs are outlined below:

7. i. **g̀ọ̀** ‘shout’
   ii. **vàn** ‘shout’
   iii. **tà** ‘say’
   iv. **guàn** ‘talk’
   v. **tié** ‘read’
   vi. **nô** ‘ask’
   vii. **khue** ‘answer’
   viii. **tâmà** ‘tell’

The classes of verbs identified here are in line with Dixon and Aikhenvald (2004) prototypical classification and identification of grammatical categories based on semantic contents. These are not the sum total of the classification of verbs in the language but an extension of what Ọmọrọgbẹ̀ (2012) did with respect to the verbal classes in Edo.

The forms of the Edo verbs can also be discussed much in the same way as the prototypical classes of the verbs presented thus far. Like the nouns examined earlier, these verbs exhibit two basic morphological forms: simple and complex which will refer to here as alienable and inalienable verbs respectively.

### 4. **Criteria for Classifying Verbs as a Lexical Category**

In the preceding sections, the common properties of what is called a lexical category (Verbs) were examined. In this section, attempt will be made to provide the modalities that informed the decision to place this word class into this category. Information will be provided on the morphological features and semantic functions. It is expected that at the end of the analysis and illustrations in this section that more insights will be provided to the peculiarities and place of this two word class in the grammar of a language like Edo.

#### 4.1 **Morphological criterion for lexical categories**

Morphology has to do with the study of words and their units or morphs as well as how they are organized in a language. It is one level of linguistics that shows the composition of words from sound units or phonemes and the different ways a word can be modified. This modification either results in the extension of the semantic information in the base before modification or leads to an outright change in the semantic content. These are known as inflectional and derivational morphology respectively. In this subsection therefore, we will be evaluating the morphological properties of the verbs in Edo.

#### 4.2 **The morphological criterion of verbal categories**

The Edo verb can be modified morphologically for time and number. The morphological marking of verbs in the language reflect a tendency towards agglutination as
this is done mainly by affixation. The Edo verb is inflected for time morphologically by means of the –rv suffix which is used to mark past tense on the verb when it occurs in clause final positions. The examples below represent the morphological marking of verbs for tense (past).

8. **Verb stem** -rv suffix **Derivation**
   a. bàn ‘pull’ -re bánrę̀n ‘pulled’
   b. biè ‘deliver (of a child)’ -re bièrè ‘delivered (of a child)’
   c. dò ‘to do’ -re dòrè ‘did’
   d. diá ‘to straighten’ -re diárè ‘straightened’
   e. giè ‘send’ -re gièrè ‘sent’
   f. wù ‘die’ -ru wùrè ‘died’
   g. gbèn ‘write’ -rèn gbènrèn ‘wrote’

The verbs in 8a-g are marked for past tense by the –rv suffix reflecting the dual nature of this tense marking in the language (which is basically phonological by means of a high tone /ː/). Based on Ọmọręgbẹ’s (2012) analysis of the inflectional category in Edo, the –rv suffix is the combination of a constant consonantal phone /r/ and a vowel /v/ whose basic shape is the mid-high front unrounded oral vowel /e/. Her analysis of the –rv suffix in Edo is that this is a morphologically realized affix, dependent on the quality of the last vowel in the stem of the verb it is attached to. Thus, the suffix is oral when the stem to which it is attached is oral and nasal when the verb stem is nasal. She further states that these vowels agree in tongue height, lip rounding and position of the tongue in the course of their realization and always carries a low tone. She was of the opinion that the –rv suffix as a post-verbal marker is both a tense and aspectual marker contrary to previous positions that it marks only tense in the language. This suffix was also claimed to participate in transitivity alternation due to the fact that it occurs in clause final position which will be contested in the present work.

The Edo verbs are also morphologically inflected for number by the –lv suffix. The derivation involving such a suffix denotes an activity that is repeated or repeatedly carried out. The claim here is that the action is not always a repeated one but a reflection of the number of participants or arguments associated with the action or activity. The following are examples of number inflection on verbs in the language.

9. **Verb stem** -lv suffix **Derivation**
   a. gbè ‘kills’ -le gbèlè ‘kill’
   b. dé ‘buys’ -lè délè ‘buy’
   c. bó ‘builds’ -lò bòlò ‘build’
   d. kpàn ‘plucks’ -nọ kpànnọ̀ ‘pluck’
   e. biàn ‘slices’ -nọ biànnọ̀ ‘slice’
   f. khien ‘sells’ -nè khìnnę̀ ‘sells’

The verbs in 9 are morphologically inflected by the –lv suffix. This inflection results as a result of the multiplication of the activities/actions communicated by the verbs. This is directly related to the number of arguments (either subject, object or both) involved in the activities specified in the clause where they are used. It is to be noted that as observed by
Ọmọrôgbẹ (2012), the –lv suffix is a composition of the alveolar lateral /l/ and a vowel which is conditioned by the type of vowel in the stem of the verb being suffixed.

4.3 The semantic criterion of verbal categories

A major semantic property of the verb in a language is its transitivity effect on the structure of a derivation. This is the feature of the verb that tells or shows us the number of arguments (subjects and objects NPs) a verb subcategorizes for or selects. While some verbs take just a single argument, some take two or more arguments while others alternate between selecting a single argument or more. Verbs that select a single argument are known as intransitive verb, those that take more than one argument are known as transitive verbs while those that take either one or more arguments are known as ditransitive verbs. Verbal transitivity shows the functional ability of a verb in the course of arguments’ selection and distribution. The subsections below show the manifestations of verbal transitivity in the distribution of arguments in the language.

a. Transitive Verbs in Edo

A verb is said to be transitive when it syntactically subcategorizes for an argument in object position. This is often linked to the classification of verbs as action words. A transitive verb selects more than one argument and shows the effect of a particular action or activity performed by an entity (subject) on another entity (object). The derivations below show the subcategorial attribute of transitive verbs in the language.

10. i. Osagie bâló âmè
    Osagie pres-scoop water
    ‘Osagie is scooping water’

ii. Èbàbá bó ówá
    father pst-build house
    ‘Father built a house’

iii. Osàzęè tié èbè
    Osažeé pres-read book
    ‘Osažeé is reading’

iv. Ìyè dè akhè
    mother pst-buy pot
    ‘Mother bought a pot’

v. Úyi kpâán àlímòi
    Uyi pst-pluck orange
    ‘Uyi plucked an orange’

vi. Òzó mú ágá
    Ozo pst-carry chair
    ‘Ozo carried a chair’

The derivations in 10i-vi above are transitive because the verbs: bâló, bó, tié, dè, kpâán and mú subcategorize for an object NP. This is possible as a result of the presence of the verbal features: [+action, +effect]. The verbs demonstrate the activities carried out by the arguments: Osagie, Èbàbá, Osàzęè, Ìyè, Úyi and Òzó. The results of these activities are: âmè, ówá, èbè, akhè, àlímòì and ágá.

b. Intransitive Verbs in Edo

This category of Edo verbs includes those that do not subcategorize for more than one argument in a clause. In these derivations, verbal attributes are exclusive to the subject arguments which are the only ones permitted or selected by the verb. The verbs are mainly
stative which express the state of being or activity that has no effect on other arguments except the performer of the activity. Consider the examples in 11 below:

11.i. Ṣosasú  gbé
Osasú ability hab-dance
‘Osasú can dance’

11.ii. Ṣakpólo vbić
Osakpolo pres-sleep
‘Osakpolo is sleeping’

11.iii. Ídélé gbinnárên
Ídele pst-fight-rv
‘Ídele fought’

11.iv. Ídádá gôrô
Idada pst-shout-rv
‘Idada shouted’

11.vi. Òmómó kùù
baby pres-play
‘The baby is playing’

The structures in 11i-vi above are the manifestations of verbal intransitivity in the language. The activities expressed by the verbs: gbé, vbić, gbinná, gô, kùù and lèç are exclusive to the subject arguments: Ṣosasú, Ṣakpólo, Ídélé, Ídádá, Òmómó and Írán. The basic feature of intransitive verbs is the presence of a single argument (the subject NP).

c. Pseudo-transitive Verbs in Edo

A further syntactic characteristic exhibited by Edo verbs is that of pseudo-transitive (dual transitivity function). This verbal form either subcategorizes for an extra argument(s) or does not. Pseudo-transitive verbs reflect activities that are either exclusive to the subject of the derivation or whose effects can be felt on other elements. We say that such verbs participate in transitivity alternation as they alternate between a single argument and two or more arguments. The derivations in 12 below show the manifestations of this verbal form.

12.a (i) Ṣosasógíè tâlô gbé
Osasogie pres-talk much
‘Osasogie talks too much’

(ii) Ṣosasógíè tâlô bèmwe
Osasogie pres-talk word
‘Osasogie is talking’

12.b (i) Ṣosasú kpôló
Osasú pres-sweep
‘Osasú is sweeping’

(ii) Ṣosasú kpôló òwá
Osasú pres-sweep house
‘Osasú is sweeping the house’

12.c (i) Òtasòwíè nwò nè
Otasowię past-drink already
‘Otasowię is drunk’

(ii) Òtasòwíè nwò àsè
Otasowię past-drink water
‘Otasowię drank water’
The data in 12a-c above show the different realizations of ditransitive verbs in Ẹdo. These verbs have the dual function of selecting a single argument (intransitivity) as well as more than one argument (transitive) in the derivations considered. A further manifestation of this pseudo-transitive class of verbs is the case of cognate derivations shown in example 13 below.

13. a. (i) Òzó nwiná = intransitive
   Ozo pres-work
   ‘Ozo is working’

   (ii) Òzó nwiná inwiná = transitive
   Ozo pres-work work
   ‘Ozo is working (real work)’

b. (i) Òdósà vbié = intransitive
   Odosa pres-sleep
   ‘Odosa is sleeping’

   (ii) Òdósà vbié òvbé dán = transitive
   Odosa past-sleep sleep bad
   ‘Odosa slept badly’

The verbs in the structures above (13a-b) are ditransitive but cognate as the object argument selected by the verb is a copy of the verb (nominalized verbs). The object arguments are duplicates of the verb which are copied into the object slot in the derivation.

5. Conclusion

The presentations and discussions thus far in this paper have been on the status and properties of the verbs in Ẹdo as lexical category within the word classes obtainable in the language. This word, we claimed possesses some morphological and semantic features that separate it from other word classes. The verbal element constitutes the principal constituent of a clause without which, the defining characteristics of such a clause will be violated and its grammatical description will be considered incomplete. There exist a number of agreement relations between other constituents of a clause and the verbs by way of such concepts as: selectional restriction, subcategorization, number and time specification.
References


The Element of Symbolism in non-animals featured in the Yorùbá Health-related Genres

Qlándélé Caleb Òrímòógùnjé
University of Lagos, Nigeria

Abstract

This paper will attempt a study of how symbolism portrays some in-animate objects featured in the verbal arts used in the Yorùbá indigenous healthcare practices. We shall attempt to show how symbolism is related to in-animate characters in the indigenous healthcare practices. We shall analyse the texts under study at the metaphorical level taking their socio-cultural contexts into consideration. The psychological dimension on the users of health-related genres will also be investigated. Various scholars have used Symbolism as a critical concept and tool in their analysis of literary works.

Keywords: Symbolism, Genres, Health-related, metaphorical level, meta-symbolism, metasymbolism.
Introduction

The work of Ogden and Richards (1923:9) on symbolism has really been exciting in the manner it defines symbolism as being relevant to literary texts and the outside world.

Symbolism is the study of the part played in human affairs by language and symbols of all kinds and especially of their influence on thought. It singles out for special inquiry the ways in which symbols help us and hinder us in reflecting on things.

According to the scholars cited above, it is revealed that there is hardly any aspect of human endeavour to which symbolism is not relevant. In his view on symbolism, White (1949:35) concludes that “…the key to this world and the means of participation on it is the symbol.”

From White’s perspective, man cannot but make use of symbols in his endeavour simply because the device is regarded as the essential function of human consciousness, and it is undoubtedly basic to the people’s understanding of the operations of the language. This is most especially true in the case of Yorùbá health-related genres, as it will soon be shown. In Preminger (1965:833), Friedman, who discusses the functions of symbol sees it as being able to

…unite an image (the analogy) and an idea or conception (the subject) which that image suggests or evokes

What this scholar drives at is that symbolism comes in when an image, either concrete or abstract, leads to an idea or conception. To establish the fact that symbolism is unavoidable in man’s daily activities among the Africans in general and the Yorùbá in particular, Smith (1966:11) stipulates that

Symbolism enters into the very texture of African art, religion, social custom, everyday speech.

It can in fact be rightly concluded that the Yorùbá have symbolised all their activities in all human endeavours. This indigenous method of communication is known as àrokò which has been explicitly explained in Ògùndèjì (1997) who works on its communicative and semiotic contexts. Potter (1967:148) declares the importance of symbolic expression thus:

…The essential act of thought or cognition is symbolization. It is this; above all else, that raises the mental faculties of men above those of animals. It is also this ability to use symbols that has made man the master of the world of nature.

The above quotation expresses symbol, as being the instrument with which man comprehends his natural environment and the thing that makes him feel elevated among other creatures. In Firth’s (1973:76-77) studies on symbols of various phenomena, it is asserted that, symbolism is an instrument of expression of the communication of knowledge and of control. Firth’s (1973: 172) regard to this device shows that it is an inevitable instrument in the life of man. In his earlier discussion, language is regarded as
…an important system of symbols through which the individual transforms physical reality into experienced reality. So giving something a name gives it recognition and status in the categories of experienced reality.

If language itself is a symbolic system as Firth notes, then it can be regarded as the basic human symbolic system which is employed in the interpretation of other symbols. Ògundèjì (1997:156) also shows, for example that ‘…the linguistic medium…’ is ‘…the final channel of interpretation’ in àrokò the Yorùbá symbol-communication. This we believe, is true of almost if not all other symbolic communications. Even when an image is used to decode another image, one still needs language to explain further. An image which is a sign of a given phenomenon is even an aspect of language. Òlátunji (1984:160-162), in his work, describes symbolism as applied to ìfọ̀ as a symbolic word-play which is used as an instrument to get their targets. This is commonly found in Ìfà and its sub-types (àyájọ́, ìwúre, ẹgbẹ and ẹpẹ́). In our own view, and from the perspective of this study, symbolism in ìfọ̀ and other genres under study refers to concrete images apart from the verbal aspect.

Emananjo (1977) has worked on the use of symbolism in Igbo folktales and explained that time, place, characters and number are symbolic in the genre. In this study, we borrow the idea of this scholar, but with a little modification in the treatment of symbolism. What he refers to as symbolic time and place are changed to temporal and spatial symbolism respectively. Besides this, a more elaborate analysis is given on the symbolic characters in this study by suggesting various classes of characters with the ideas they symbolise in the health-related verbal arts among the Yorùbá. This symbolic analysis is discussed at meta-symbolic, meto-symbolic and phono-aesthetic levels as suggested in Ògundèjì (1988: 37-43).³

**Symbolic Inanimate-object-characters**

There are various inanimate object-characters found in the health-related verbal arts. Despite the fact that they are inanimate, the Yorùbá have a strong belief that they have invisible spirits that facilitate the healing system. The inanimate objects discussed in this section may appear as objects or characters in the verbal arts used for health purposes. These inanimate ingredients include omi (water), ilékẹ́ (beads), ọkè (hill), epo (Palm oil) adún (palm kernel oil), etc. We shall discuss the most prominent among them- Òmi (water), and ọtì (alcoholic drinks)

**Ômi (Water)**

Ômi (water) is the most useful and prominent object or object-character in the Yorùbá indigenous healthcare delivery system. The Yorùbá believe that water is medicinal and it has the properties for curing ailments. The devotees of a divinity called Ọṣun, among the Yorùbá believe solely in the medicinal power of Ômi (water). Its nature being an essential commodity in mankind is demonstrated in a verse of ìwúre (supplicatory blessings):

Omi làbùwè.
Omi làbùmu.
Enikan ki i bómi i sọtá.

Water is used for bathing.
Water is used for drinking.
No one keeps malice with water.
The verse of *íwúre* is made up of two lines of incantatory positive assertions and a line of negative assertion based on the indispensability of *omi* (water) to mankind. Seventy five percent of humans body and indeed of the whole world is said to be made up of water. Man needs to drink a good quentity of water daily to be in good health. A good number of the Yorùbá herbal preparations especially the *àgbo* (potion) type are dissolved in water or the liquid. Man also needs water for cleaning not only the body but also most other things. Hence the assertion that no one can afford to be an “enemy” of water, i.e. no one can do without it. This may be taken to imply a kind of natural love and desire for it because of its constant relevance and indispensability. This is therefore what water tends to symbolise as the chanter’s application of the assertive statements is always that people around him/her should love him/her and be interested in his/her situations and conditions to the extent that they will not be able to do without him/her just as man cannot do without water. *Omi* (water) in Yorùbá *íwúre* is also a symbol of fulfillment and an indelible foot-print in life as shown in the saying:

Bómi bá bále,
Omi a népa.
Ká népa sówó.
Ká népa sómọ.
Ká népa sákú.

If water drops on the ground,
Water usually leaves a mark.
We shall be remarkable in money.
We shall be remarkable in procreation.
We shall be endowed with longevity.

This is another example of incantatory assertion derived from both physical truism and phono-aesthetics. When water drops on the floor, the mark it makes is always visible. This is described as *ípa*. The chanter is using their truism as a premise for his supplication that he also may live a glaring mark in the mentioned aspects of his life. The same noun *ípa* is used in Yorùbá for describing this. The association or relationship between the two marks i.e. *ípa omi* (mark made by water) and *ípa owó, ọmọ àtì àìkú* (remarkable success as far as the issues of money, procreation and longevity are concerned) are metaphoric, hence water in this example is a meta-symbol of remarkable success in general. It should be remembered that the issues referred to are directly or indirectly connected with health and general well-being. Water also symbolises victory, tranquility and peace. The nature of *omi* to cool down hot things, quench a fire and put an end to draught is what allows for the symbolism:

Omi níí7 poró iná.
Ọjọ̀ sọsọ̀ níí poró ógbẹlẹ̀.
$mi ni k7 n r1y8n =tq mi.

Water usually quenches fire.
A rainy atmosphere neutralises the effect of draught.
I should conquer my enemies.
The above ṣọọ (incantation) is used by a chanter who does not want any of his/her adversaries to be a clog in the wheel of his/her general well-being. He/she wishes to conquer his/her adversaries and enjoy peace and tranquility like that of an undisturbed lake. Analogical attention can also be drawn to the potential power of water as torrents and falls for the purpose of buttressing the ambivalence of the symbolism. Water, it is usually said will always find its level. As a torrent, it sweeps away obstacle on its path. It is therefore no surprise that it is seen as a meta-symbol of insurmountable power. Furthermore, ọmì (water) symbolises inexhaustibility. The concept of water as the ocean or the sea, a large lake that never dries off is what is at focus in this symbolism. The users of Yorùbá health-related genres in indigenous healthcare practices do desire to have inexhaustible wealth and health:

Àbùdî ní ní tomi òkùn.  
Àbùdî ní tomi ọsà.  
Àtọjù ọtẹrùn.  
Ilé alákan kí i gbi.  

The sea water does not dry  
The lagoon water does not dry  
Both in rainy and dry seasons  
The hole of the crab never dries

A physical analogy drawn in this positive assertive lines of incantation are premised upon the fact that no mark is left on water whenever some of it is dropped out of the sea or ocean and the fact that the crab’s hole is always wet, even during the dry season. By implication, the chanter’s desire is that his/her course of health and wealth will be inexhaustible. This idea of inexhaustibility of water is given another meaning, when the chanter desires that nothing should tamper with his/her health in the following lines of incantative assertions.

A kí i sá omi lògbè.  
A kí i ta ẹjúú ọfà.  
A kí i rójú ṣogbè ọnà lara omi.  

No one machetes the water.  
No one shoots the wind with an arrow.  
No one can find wounds of machete-cut of the previous day on the water.

The emphasis in these three lines of negative assertion is that it is impossible to harm water. The chanter in this case extends this to him/herself through some metaphysical associations. By implication it will be impossible for the chanter to be harmed. These lines of incantation is used for protection against attackers who might want to wound and maim him/her. The lines are usually used to accompany a charm called ọkígbè (anti-machete-cut).

Ọtì (alcoholic drink)  
Ọtì (alcoholic drink) is a popular drinks in the Yorùbá traditional setting. This liquid substance symbolises various things. It plays a prominent role in the Yorùbá indigenous healthcare delivery
system, as shall be explained in this section. Qūṭi is an antedote of amnesia (loss of memory). Ṣrūnmílā used qūṭi to heal amnesia he was suffering from according to a verse in Odù Òdí Méjì as it is presented in Abímibólá (1968:57-58) thus:

Ô tápá lókun
Ô tákíti lóśá
Akàn ló gbénú ódó
Ô ŋ sebọ šuruṣuru Òfóòfin
A diá’fun Ṣrūnmílā,
Nígbà tí Ófá ọ mu bábà,
Tí Ófá ọ mu ńsekbè.
Ófá ọ níyè nínú mò.
Nwọ̀n ní ó káakí mòlé,
Ó jàre
Ebọ ní ó ńse.
Nwọ̀n ní ó rú ńpóòlòpò qúṭi;
Nwọ̀n ní kí óun náà ón bù mu níbè.
Ijó ní njó
Ayó ní ńyò
Ó ń yí n awoo rè,
Áwọn awoo rè ń yí n’fá.
Ó já ń yí n kótó
Orí ní awoo ní ńókò
Ó ní ńtá bá aládé gbagbá qúṭi kàn
Íyè Èdù lámàá

It stretches out its leg in the sea
It stretches out its leg in the lagoon
The crab is usually in the stream
Performing sacrifice persistently for Òfóòfin.
Ifá divination was performed for Ṣrūnmílā,
When Ifá did not take bàbà drinks,
Ifá did not take ńsekbè drinks.
Ifá was suffering from amnesia.
He was advised to adore the spirits
He should please,
Perform a sacrifice,
He should sacrifice with some alcohol drinks;
He was advised to take out of it.
He was dancing.
He was happy.
He was eulogising his priests,
His priests in turn were eulogising Ifá.
He opened his mouth
Singing the cultic songs
He said the crowned king took a cup of alcohol
He became conscious.

The Yorùbá have the cultural belief that alcoholic intake aids being mentally active. Qūṭi (alcoholic drink) is regarded as the embodiment of quintessence, that is, it is a commodity that mankind cannot do without. This cultural fact makes people take it, so that they will gain physical and mental fitness that will make the society be in need of them. This symbolic fact is stipulated in Odù Ogbe-
alára³ where ọtì (alcoholic drink) was banished from Ifẹ-Akẹlúbẹ̀bẹ̀ (see Orímọ̀gúnjé 2004:198-202 and 266-269). Thereafter, there were chaos and pandemonium to the extent that the whole society lost her consciousness and mental stability. It was when ọtì was granted an amnesty that the whole society was able to regain her consciousness. Ọtì also represents anxiety reliever and trouble shooter. It has its own peculiar nature that gets rid of any trouble that can make one nervous. This is concomitant with the saying of the Yorùbá: ‘ọtì pari ọjọ’ meaning that alcoholic drink dismisses cases that can demoralise one. This fact is also depicted in ọfọ aforàn (case-dismissing incantations) used to quell the effect of serious cases in the court of justice. This method of getting one discharged and acquitted has been among the Yorùbá from time immemorial through the use of the type of incantation presented below:

Ôrò téọ̀ ré ókèè sì
Alé àna ni mo fi sọtì,
Mo ti fi mu,
Mo mòmò fi mögùrò.
Mo fi sọtì, 5
Mo fi mu.

The trouble you were nervous for.
I had put it in the alcoholic drink yesterday.
I had drunk it.
I had drunk it along with ọgùrò.
I put it in the alcoholic drink,
5
I had drunk it.

The belief of the chanter in the potency of ọtì and other alcoholic drinks to make man trouble-free and to dismiss one’s existing civil and criminal cases, is connected to his/her nervous system. This thereby gets him/her relieved. Also, another saying that reads thus:

Eni ọtì ki ọ tì.
Eni bàbà ki ọ bà.

One who is fond of alcohol never fades
One who is fond of guinea-corn liquor never spoils

The phono-aesthetic symbolism that features in the above ìwúre (supplicatory blessing) adds literary dexterity to the saying. The verb tì (fade) drawn from the noun ọtì and the verb bà (to lose taste/get spoilt) drawn from bàbà are to give the user confidence that heath wise he/she will not lose natural and physical strengths.

Conclusion

Symbolism plays a great role in the indigenous healthcare delivery system in the Yorùbá traditional setting. The meaning given to each symbol in relation to the belief of the users makes the position of the Yorùbá in health-related issues clear and rational in using these genres as therapeutic indices.
Endnotes

1. Meta-symbolism and meto-symbolism explain how metaphor and metonymy are respectively used as literary devices in this study, while phono-aesthetic symbolism is used as pun and could be likened to what Olátúnjí (1984:160) refers to as symbolic word-play. Meta-symbolism explains how signs are motivated based on the cultural belief of the users. Though these signs are not physically apparent but their process of derivation is logical. In the case of meto-symbolism, there is an obvious communicable relationship between the signifier and the signified.

2. Other liquid alcoholic substances are bàbà (alcohol made from guinea corn), ọgòrọ (wine, tapped from the raffia palm), ọtì ọgàdàngídì (alcohol made from plantain), Ėmu-àran (wine tapped from palm tree) ñèkètè (alcohol made from maize).

3. Ogbè-alárá is one of the minor Odù, a combination of Ogbè and Otúrá. It is otherwise known as Ogbétúrá and Ogbeyónú:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ìjá ló dé lorin òwé.
Ọrò isiyi won o tójà.
Ìjà ló dé lorin òwé.
A diá f’ótí tìi ọsọ ọni ìlóde Òlórípé.
Ìjá ló dé lorin òwé.
Ọrò isiyi won o tójà.
Ìjà ló dé lorin òwé.
A diá f’ogùrọ tìi ọsọ won ìlóde Òlórípé.
Ìjá ló dé lorin òwé.
Ọrò isiyi won o tójà.
Ìjà ló dé lorin òwé.
A diá f’ómi tìu tìi ọsọ won ìlóde Òtúnmò́bá
Wón wáá péte pèrò
Wón lótí lo nífẹ́ Akèlúbèbè
Lísò Ìpè.
A wá ń solójọ,
A à gbóhùn ẹþé.
A ń ọwááró,
A à gbóhùn abèbè.
A ń sàjóníjúmòdún o,
A à gbóhùn alágogo
Ọgèdè-pagbo-má-jóò, ọrè ọtí
Ọun ló ọ lèè mútì wálé
La ń ọlójọ,
A ń gbähün ṣòò. 25
A ń ṣòwàrò.
A ń gbähün ń̀bèbè.
A ń ńjìjìjìmòòù nò, 30
A ń gbähün alòògògo.
Ọ́ n ń ṣòtì lə̀vwà̀gùn awò ó, ọ̀̃lọ̀gbé-ń̀bèbè, ń̀bèbè, ńjadi, Ọ́gbègbè-ń̀bèbè, awò ònì.

I scolded you because you were found guilty
The matter is not worth fighting for
Proverbial songs ensue when a fight is on
Ifá divination was performed for Ọ́tì who hails from Ìlù̀rè
I scolded you because you were found guilty
The matter is not worth fighting for
Proverbial songs ensue when a fight is on
Ifá divination was performed for Ọ́gùrò who hails from Ìlòdè
I scolded you because you were found guilty
The matter is not worth fighting for
Proverbial songs ensue when a fight is on
Ifá divination was performed for cold water who hails from Ìtùmòbà

They conspired
To banish Ọ́tì from Ìfè-Akèlùbèbè
Lísò Ọ̀pè
We celebrated Ọ̀lójò festival,
We did not hear people clapping
We celebrated Ọ̀wàrò
Without enjoying the sound of local fans
We celebrated the end of the year
Without enjoying the traditional gong
Ọ́gèdè-ń̀bèbè, the friend of Ọ́tì
Went to bring Ọ́tì back home
We now celebrated Ọ̀lójò,
With clapping,
We now celebrated Ọ̀wàrò,
With local fans.
We now celebrated the end of the year,
With traditional gong.
He said the initiates drink ọ̀tì to make them vigorous
Ọ́gèdè-ń̀bèbè, the friend of Ọ́tì
The intake of alcohol makes people strong.
References


Federico Fellini: Between Myths and Realities

Feten Ridene Raissi
ESAC Gammarth, Carthage University, Tunisia

Abstract

Having always distinguished the intense connection between myths and realities in the universal unforgettable masterpieces of the 7th art, we chose to study this duality in the three most famous feature films of the Italian director Federico Fellini.

In La Dolce Vita, Otto & Mezzo and Amarcord, Fellini always sailed between the palpable and the phantasmagorical.

In this article, we will try to decorticate this complementarity, by attempting to clarify what Fellini tries to convey to the audience as a real fantasy.

Keywords: Fellini, Italian Cinema, La Dolce Vita, Otto & Mezzo, Amarcord, Real, Evident, Concrete, Palpable, Mythological, Phantasmagorical, Oneiric, Dream
Résumé

Ayant toujours distingué le rapport intense entre les mythes et les réalités dans les œuvres mondiales inoubliables du 7ème art, nous avons choisi d’étudier cette dualité dans les trois plus célèbres long métrages de l’auteur italien Federico Fellini.

Dans La Dolce Vita, Otto & Mezzo et Amarcord, Fellini a toujours navigué entre le palpable et le fantasmagorique.

Dans cet article, nous tenterons de décortiquer cette complémentarité, tout en essayant de clarifier ce que Fellini essaye de transmettre comme réel fantasmé.

Mots clés : Fellini, Cinéma Italien, La Dolce Vita, Otto & Mezzo, Amarcord, Réel, Evident, Concret, Palpable, Mythologique, Fantasmagorique, Onirique, Rêve…
If we compare the cinema to a mirror whose aim is to reflect the reality, we could say that the shooting’s fruit, where the camera replaces the eyes, is only a duplicate truism. The oneiric trim, which is added by the director, aims only to make the viewer able to distinguish the reflexive fingerprints between an author and another, given that every one of them adds his own ‘spice’ to his ‘dish’, which makes the ‘consumer’, recognize its ‘taste’ without any doubt.

Based on Fellini’s three headlights, namely La Dolce Vita, Otto & Mezzo and Amarcord, I will try to show how I can find a close connection between the myth and the reality. The cinema through the supreme beauty of these three films which are classified unforgettable, takes viewers into a parallel universe of thought, inviting them outstandingly to wonder: Is this real? Is it imagination? Or it is an oneiric reality, which takes them to immerse themselves in a phantasmagorical dream? Gilles Deleuze answers these questions by saying:

‘As for the distinction between subjective and objective, it also tends to lose its importance [...]. We run in fact into a principle of indeterminability, of indiscernibility: we no longer know what is imaginary or real, [...], in the situation, not because they are confused, but because we do not have to know and there is no longer even a place from which to ask. It is as if the real and the imaginary were running after each other, as if each was being reflected in the other, around a point of indiscernibility’

The indiscernibility of which Deleuze talks, represents the fairy effect that the movies make the audience (whether theorists, filmmakers, criticizers, reporters or simple cinephile) feel. It seems like a trip, of which no one knows the final destination and goes on as well, with a deep admiring to the navigation between the palpability and the mythology which characterises the movie.

Many authors, through their cinematographic masterpieces, have made their shooting, as a kind of UFO (Unidentified Flying Object) which transports the audience on a trip between the ‘Earth of real’ and the ‘Galaxy of oneiric’. Trying to decode this junction between fiction and effectiveness, I chose one of the most famous authors who meet this condition of movement between myths and realities: Federico Fellini.

Having acquired experience in his movies of the 50s', Fellini gave birth to an unforgettable trilogy, recognized as masterpieces all over the 7th Art's world. Through Dolce Vita, Otto e Mezzo and Amarcord, Fellini baptized the autonomous sequences which replaced the narrative continuity.

According to Fellini², artistic productions in cinema, poetry and painting, compose the phantasmagorical activity of mankind, reflected on screen, paper or canvas. Fellini also formalizes a necessary link between dreams and the

² Entretiens Fellini © Damian Pettigrew (adaptation: Cyrine Mamy, Subtitles: Eclair Vidéo)
unconscious, which, once united, they have no bounds. In this way, he invites artists as well as spectators to sail hugely and without borders in their imaginations.

I am going to analyze the bidimensional real-myth bond in each one of these movies in order to show how much Fellini has left in it his fingerprint, whether as director, writer, editor, designer or even sometimes as an actor, by dint to be integrated into his films, by showing actors how such grimaces should be associated with such a scene. By this process, I wish to make a maximum approach from his thought to the ideas and messages that he wants to convey to the audience through the roles played by actors that he chose for each film.)

The palpable axis of La Dolce Vita revealed in the chronicler Marcello, is nothing but a reflexion on the real Fellini, the native of Rimini, who has been a redactor during his youth. Through this autobiographic vision, Fellini declares that he has been journalist before becoming a filmmaker.

A second reality reflexion, through which Fellini aimed to highlight the oneiric link between the Christian liver and the social-economic roman revolution, triggers the movie’s beginning with the helicopter’s trip scene fig. 1. It exhibits the Majestic Christ Statue from Milan to Vatican: a stage that was taken from a newsreel³ filmed in Italy on May, 1st 1959.

³ http://www.cineclubdecaen.com/materiel/cthistoire.html
By integrating through an alternate mounting, his own scenes in which Marcello and his ‘Paparazzo’ are -supposed- in the process of filming this movement, aren't they a ‘real-fiction fusion’?

Besides, Fellini establishes a ‘comic link’ between the bourgeois ladies while sunbathing on the building’s rooftop - which is nothing but a realistic illustration of the Italian socio-economic boom- and the statue of Jesus Christ ‘blessing’ the young ladies’ sunbathing, when passing, open-armed, above the building’s rooftop.

Likewise, by passing through construction sites in several shots, Fellini reports the recovery of Rome. Thus Marcello is nothing but an alter ego of Fellini during his youth while he was a journalist. This is a ‘Fellinian’ way to scandalize the Italian society’s turpitude, and that is what has

---

4 This term’s birth (frequently used nowadays) took place since La Dolce Vita’s release
taken the Vatican newspaper: L'Osservatore Romano to accuse that ‘Fellinian’ shot of blasphemy⁵.

In addition to the reflection of the Italian reality, after the Second World War, Fellini has attributed to his movie, an unforgettable phantasmagorical specificity through the shots of Sylvia (Anita Ekberg) with Marcello on ‘La Fontena Dei Trevi’ figure 2, which was so mythical that it leads the audience to imagine that they kissed each other, although no kiss took place. It is the same case on the royal social class’ stage, where the audience finds some idle aristocrats funding a roman castle restoration: an oneiric and comic criticism at the same time.

‘In his autobiographical films, Federico Fellini creates a "legend" of himself and films that legend’ [John C.Stubbs, 2002]. Like most of his movies, Fellini has made from Otto & Mezzo a fantasized reality. In fact, he was about to start shooting a movie, whose sceneries have not been yet installed; despite he found himself blocked, not knowing what he should neither write as a script nor shoot as a stage. This situation brought to Fellini the idea to shoot those thoughts’ deadlock situation. And as he hasn’t yet decided the script title, he named it Eight and a Half since it was his eighth movie and the half as he gathered the sum of his short sketches.

Eight and a Half is clearly classified as a fusion between the real and the fantasy: real since Guido (Marcello Mastroianni), or Fellini's alter-ego, was hospitalized at the beginning of the film. Fellini in fact was really hospitalized for

⁵ Fellini : Le Magicien du Réel, Jean A. Gili : p.31
a specific period due to a severe fatigue he has suffered from because of his successive shootings, in full time and without rest.

And even while hospitalized, his inspiration has never stopped. He delivered his spirit to the delights of his words to write his autobiography or diary he titled *Propos*, where he was sailing in the corners of his hospitalization to describe the behavior of doctors, nurses, sisters he called "religious" or even his hospitalized neighbours and the parents who were visiting them.

The dreamlike quality contrariwise appears in the flight scene while he was fleeing from asphyxia, while locked in the car from which he freed himself by flying to the wide sky a fairytale scene imaginary cut by a friend at the seaside who pulled his foot with a rope- as if he was a kite *fig. 3*, and while returning to reality when the doctor came to examine him in his room, and apologized for having cut his concentration *fig.4* as well as while expressing the interest that the doctor reserves to his art.
Likewise during the scene of alternation between the beloved girl of his dreams and the one who was serving him some water or even at the end of the movie: this ending was originally designed to take place in a diner-wagon of a train. Fellini decided during the mounting step, to replace it with the stage that gathered together all the characters of his dreams in a large round that Guido, the alter ego of Fellini, has tamed by a whip, to make them dance together on the farfare music.

Isabella Conti and William A. McCormack ask: “*To what degree does the movie accurately represent his life experience?*” [Biography, 1984]. So we should answer that on several occasions, the diseased state of Fellini was his source of inspiration. Having written his memorandum: *Propos* while he was hospitalised before shooting *Eight & a Half*, was nearly the same like his recovery during his temporary return to *Rimmini*.
(his native town), where he wrote: *La Mia Rimmini*\(^6\), and a good part of which coincides with several scenes of his movie *Amarcord* that reflects a bit of his childhood period.

After having browsed in his reminiscences; and in order to strengthen his memories by clarifying what he found dark, Fellini chose Tonino Guerra: a screenwriter and poet from Rimmini too, so that the scenario be the most amalgamated possible between the fantastic and the real.

This is what led him elsewhere, to reap a marvellous masterpiece as *Amarcord*, that we can describe as an ‘umbilical cord’ linking the memory of the ‘mature’ Fellini during the seventies to the ‘foetus’ of his teenage in Rimmini, that he had spent during the fascism period of the thirties.

The imaginary adventures that Fellini reflects in *Amarcord* were more evocative than the pale reality of his childhood in Rimmini. He seemed to make of his memories, a playhouse of projection and staging where he reflects at the same time: madness, beauty and humor.

The crazy uncle of Titta \(^5\) invaded by the purity of his madness while he emits a universal cry, represented the imaginary in its purest form. While the beauty appears in the portrayal of the women who is simply a sin in Catholicism: that is what Fellini shown in the dreamlike image of Volpina \(^6\) .

---

\(^6\) *Le monde Magique du souvenir Fellinien* : Documentary of Angela Ramboni

http://ijhcschiefeditor.wix.com/ijhcs  Page 695
However, for Giudizio, the Amarcord's phantasmagoria is mainly humorous; Fellini reflects in this character the innocent unconsciousness while Giudizio smiles when the Gardisca (Magali Noël) and her accompanying were passing in front of his eyes fig. 7.

During the shooting of Amarcord, Fellini went into the skin of all the roles of his script even by playing a few scenes in front of the actors, so that they identically convey his ideas.

Through these comic scenes at school, Fellini touches his remembrances during his teenage life. The classroom shooting stages were just some reflection axes of Rimmini’s atmosphere during the thirties.

In addition to the ten minutes of the concentrate which reflects the teachers' twitches, Fellini also represented through this autobiographical movie some key indicators of his native town, such as the average Italian man, the province, the family,
the country and most of all the fascism of which he mocked remotely and without sermonizing.

In this article, I concentrated on Fellini’s three flagship movies. Nevertheless, I can clearly find that this formula of deeply linking the oneiric with the palpable is almost proved in all his twenty four masterpieces.\(^7\)

Having started since his childhood as a scribbler of his dreams before becoming a filmmaker, greatly pushed Fellini in his staging, to approximate his experience in reality to what he dreamed about and translated by his drawings. In many interviews, he confessed that this passage through his dreams, garnished with his autobiography, in the eyes of the audience, produced in him a supreme sense of pride and satisfaction.\(^8\)

By associating this 'Fellinian' narcissism to the success of his works that are considered immortal until nowadays, I can nominate Fellini as a ‘tightrope walker’, who keeps a supreme balance between myth and reality.

In this regard, and in an interview\(^9\) that was directed by Damian Pettigrew, Fellini answered his ‘shipwreck-question’, by describing himself as an attentive observer, who could "describe the Apocalypse, and put it into images in a

---

\(^7\) 21 feature films + 3 short movies
\(^8\) Le monde Magique du souvenir Fellinien : Documentary of Angela Ramboni
\(^9\) Entretiens Fellini made by Damien Pettigrew (Bonus in ‘8 & ½’ DVD)
movie, after having lived it " [Fellini’s answer: minute 18 of the interview]. It is nothing but a declaration from Fellini about his ability to reproduce the palpable by his own fiction, through keeping it identical as if he had lived the situation in his real life then reflected it in his movies.
References


- Pettigrew, Damien. Entretiens Fellini, Bonus in ‘8 & ½’ DVD

- Ramboni, Angela. Documentary : Le monde Magique du souvenir Fellinien

Moral Condemnation of Partition Violence in Manto's *Toba Tek Singh*

**Dadhi Ram Panthi**  
Tribhuvan University, Chabahil, Kathmandu, Nepal

**Abstract**

The research paper; written on the theme of Indian Partition of 1947 on Saadat Hasan Manto’s *Toba Tek Singh*; attempts to explore the quest for universal moral values. In doing so, the writer presents a character named Bishan Singh who is revolutionary in nature. His attempt to break the religious and cultural boundaries is praiseworthy as he is ready to die in the border i.e. no-man’s land raising the voice of true universal moral values. In fact, millions died during partition violence. The Muslims died chanting the slogans- “Pakistan Zindabad” and the Hindus and Sikhs died chanting the voice of their liberation and demanding separate state on the basis of their religious principles. In such critical condition, the character Bishan Singh neither supports India nor Pakistan; rather he climbs on the tree that lies in between India and Pakistan. His death on no-man’s land indicates that he is opposing partition and intends to live in harmony. The writer’s attempt to disqualify the ethical aspects by highlighting moral values is his condemnation of partition violence.

**Keywords:** Indian Partition, Revolutionary, Universal moral values, No- man’s land, Ethical, Moral.
Introduction and Analysis

Saadat Hasan Manto's *Toba Tek Singh* exposes not only the idea of trauma of the Indian partition violence but it also highlights the importance of universal moral values and human values. He is presenting his idea through the role of the protagonist Bishan Singh. Bishan Singh represents Toba Tek Singh and Toba Tek Singh represents Bishan Singh and at the same time Toba Tek Singh represents no man's land from where he is expressing his ideas. Despite being neutral, Bishan Singh, an extreme victim of partition violence is forced to leave Pakistan and is taken to the border in the police custody with all the Hindus and Sikhs from the Lahore asylum. It was decided two or three years after the partition by both Indian government and the government of Pakistan that Muslim lunatics from Indian institutions should be sent over to Pakistan and Hindu and Sikhs lunatics from Pakistani asylums should be allowed to go to India. Bishan Singh seems quite radical and wants to protest the decision of both the governments as he is quite away from politics and force which is being exercised in the name of religion.

When force is used to chase the partition victim Toba Tek Singh away and then he remarks, "I want to live neither in Pakistan nor in Hindustan- I will live on this tree"(15). It clearly indicates that he is quite neutral and he is far from politics and ideology. He means to say that human life is greater than the nation. He is climbing on the tree which lies in no man's land. Some of the lunatics, who are not completely mad, shout "Pakistan Zindabad and Pakistan Murdabad!"(18). Here, Manto tells us that human values or moral values lie in complete lunacy. People forget their ideology if they are completely traumatized, as traumatized as Toba Tek Singh. He condemns the force used by any government either by Indian government or by Pakistani government. Toba Tek Singh or Bishan Singh is speaking from common ground that is neither Pakistan nor Hindustan. In the story, the expression, “When the guards threatened to use force, he installed himself in a place between the borders and stood there as if no power in the world could move him"(19). It exposes that use of power violets human values. Force is used upon Toba Tek Singh and other lunatics to displace them and it exemplifies that misuse of power leads to the end of moral values and it is the sign of anarchy.

Bishan Singh's cry is the cry for human values. The end of his traumatic life is not the end but it is the sacrifice for human values and moral values. He is dying in no man's land calling human values. While dying it is heard,"... a piercing cry arose from Bishan Singh..."(19). And the expression indicates that Bishan Singh's extreme pain is unbearable. Toba Tek Singh's neutral position can be felt through the expression as Manto exposes, «Beyond a wired fence on one side of him was Hindustan and beyond a wired fence on the other side was Pakistan. In the middle, on a stretch of land that had no name, lay Toba Tek Singh"(19). His life ends in such a land which has no name, no any national boundary and he does not confine him within the limit of any religions. For him, the earth has been common home in which all human beings should have equal rights and freedom for life. And religions, customs, forces and issues of nationalism all are the obstacles that distort moral values.

Taranum Riyaz argues that the main character Bishan Singh in the story "*Toba Tek Singh*", is the writer Manto himself as he says:

It seems that the main character of the short story, a mad person, is no other than Manto himself. At the time of partition the piece of land, Toba Tek Singh, fell neither within...
the boundary of India nor of Pakistan. Toba Tek Sigh is a piece of land which has no specific national identity....(205)

Here, Toba Tek Singh's identity allegorizes Manto's identity that is forced on him. In this sense Toba Tek Singh is partly autobiographical. On the one hand, Toba Tek Singh represents a fictional character named Bishan Singh. On the other Manto's own life.

For Devendra Issar, Manto's Toba Tek Singh exposes Manto's identity as "Liminal Zones". He argues:

Manot's stories often take place in liminal spaces where borders are erased and consciousness loses its bearings, where sanity and insanity, health and sickness, moral goodness and sin cease to be sharply demarcated. The asylum and the hospital are apt symbols for life in such spaces.(186)

The main issue raised by Devendra, in this sense, is the issue of moral values. He might be indicating that there lies humanity where borders are erased and consciousness loses. Asylums and hospitals can be such liminal spaces where issues of nations become minor and all the victims are seen through the perspective of human values. Such spaces are free from politics.

Prakash Bodh in his "Nation and Identity in the Narratives of Partition" writes:

Bishan singh's identity is established by his pseudonym, Toba Tek Singh, the name that alludes to the character more often than to his village. By this simple device, Manto is able to collapse the individual and the communitarian identity. Bishan Singh is Toba Tek Singh both literally and metaphorically. He not only belongs to his village; he becomes his village, land and home....(14)

Prakash Bodh's idea expressed in this essay is that when we are able to collapse our individual identity and communitarian values then after human values will appear. Forgetting our personal identity and communitarian identity, we will be able to see and analyze the real trauma of the partition victims. We should see the pain of the sufferers by forgetting our identity, community and politics. This is Manto's demand.

Harish Narang expresses that Manto's Toba Tek Singh does not talk about the lunacy of the victims but it is the use of force that becomes lunatic. The power exercising authority has been brutal and this is the act of lunacy. Bishan Singh is ironically presented as a lunatic. He is extreme victim but not real lunatic. Both the governments forgot human values and moral values so Bishan Singh is presented here as the character who carries human values. Harish Narang argues, "Use of force upon common but the very lunacy of forcing people to give up their roots-physical, cultural and psychological"(72). It shows people have been traumatized physically, culturally and psychologically due to the use of force even after the partition violence. Khalid Hasaan writes, "India was free. Pakistan was free from the moment of its birth, but in both states, man's enslavement continued: by prejudice, by religious fanaticism, by slavery"(90). Prejudice, religious fanaticism and slavery are the problems of both India and Pakistan even after the partition violence and these problems have been the obstacles in the path of development and moral values have been collapsed due to these problems. He further argues,"... wherever I go, I will make my little world"(89). In this way, he is in favour of mobility and he believes that our identity is determined through mobility but not within certain national boundary fixed by certain nations. Gopi Chand
Narang asserts, "The logic of human relationship is more powerful than the logic of religion" (vii). He is making us aware that human values are better than religious values. In *Toba Tek Singh*, the protagonist Bishan Singh does not listen about any religion but he sees only human being in the centre. Beerendra Pandey argues, "Trauma is sociopsychological"(125). His notion of trauma is neither singularly cultural nor exclusively psychological; it coalesces the two. Pandey agrees to Manto's notion of trauma as he knows, "Morality, for Manto means emphasis on human relations..."(131). It means trauma of 1947 should be seen through humanitarian level neither through merely cultural nor psychological level. Pandey's disagreement is that both India and Pakistan are involving in identity politics forgetting the real trauma of the victims which is dangerous for both. Pandey further argues:

The trauma of 1947... means speaking to a shared suffering from the perspective of a shared moral need for the pain to be listened to by a moral community... morality functions as the basis for disqualifying ethics concerned with personal and communal relationships. (131)

Ethics is disqualified in the presence of morality because ethics does not care about the real pains of the victims. Like Manto, Pandey demands for the formation of moral community.

In her "Trauma and Testimony," Veena Das raises the issues of prophecy, everyday business and acknowledgement. She studies the prophecy theory of Reinhart Koselleck and Achille Mbembe's theory of subjectivity and proposes for remaking. Koselleck's notion is futuristic notion where as Mbembe's notion is 'self-writing'. Mbembe argues that Afro-American don't write themselves but others write about them so their subjectivity cannot emerge in their writings. Without subjectivity trauma cannot be authentic. Veena Says real trauma can be realized only through everyday business and acknowledgement. She further argues, "I found that the making of the self was located not in the shadow of some ghostly past but in the context of making the everyday inhabitable"(300). It shows if victims are busy in daily business, they will be less traumatized. Actually, she is studying the gap between prophetic approach and diagnostic approach for the remaking of the future. Here, she is quite hopeful about future as she expresses,"...public acknowledgement of hurt can allow new opportunities to be created for resumption of everyday life"(302). In this way she speaks in the behalf of future community. Manto also seems quite optimistic about the creation of good future community. Geoffrey Hartman writes, "Monuments can foster forgetfulness in the way they select what is to be remembered. They are highly visible metonymic markers that can be politically exploited..."(72). Video testimony tries to struggle to be authentic/truthful but it remains only realistic. Video testimony loses its aura due to simulacrum so video testimony can be realistic but not truthful. Remembering trauma through monument is not authentic. Trauma should not be forgotten deliberately because forgetting refers to 'mental block'. Acknowledging trauma is a must. Remembering trauma through icon is metonymy. So remembering trauma through icon is political which is quite dangerous and it creates a lot of conflicting situations. Hartman's ideas can be connected in Manto only in the sense that both are in search of authenticity of traumatic testimony. But Agamben is quite closer to the ideas of Manto because Agamben in "Testimony and Authenticity", raises the issue of "Muselman" (qtd. in Hartman: 87). 'Muselman' refers to a survival with extreme pain. 'Muselman' is the extreme victim of extreme violence. 'Muselman' is also called living dead. There is contradiction between Hartman and Agamben in terms of the authenticity of trauma. For Agamben, living dead or extreme victim can be the best source of authentic testimony but for Hartman true witness is the dead. So searching
truthful testimony is a vain job but Agamben disagrees with him and tells that truthful testimony lies in extreme victim or living dead or 'Muselman'. In this connection the protagonist Bishan Singh of Manto's *Toba Tek Singh* is the extreme victim of extreme violence who has lost consciousness and is demanding freedom. He is lunatic in the sense that he is in the state of melancholia due to extreme violence. In other words, he is 'Muselman' of Agamben. His speech becomes authentic because he is not escaping or running away from no man's land. He cries a lot and dies there. Video testimony is the interest of Hartman and the problem in it is the problem of ethics. But Agamben's interest is the interest of Muselman's muteness or unspeakability. Agamben, like Manto is highlighting moral issues not ethical issues.

In *The Ethics of Memory*, Avishai Margalit also raises the problem of ethics and memory. Ethics is in binary opposition to morality. Remembering the past is our ethical responsibility. He argues, "Being moral is a required good; being ethical is, in principle, an optional good"(105). Ethical issue is optional whereas moral issue is a need. The major issue raised in this essay is the issue of relation. Relation consists of two parts: thin relation and thick relation. Ethical relation is thick relation whereas moral relation is thin relation. If we want to be the member of a certain community we are in thick relation but if we take us as a member of whole universe we are in thin relation. The members of thin relation are few because very few people believe in moral values. The writer further argues, "For the goodness within the relation, memory is crucial"(106). So thick relation is good relation in ethical level and good relation is based on memory. But thin relation seems better in moral level. In *Toba Tek Singh*, Bishan Singh is maintaining just thin relation as he strongly believes in moral values. He has a very thin relation with India or Pakistan so he has been alone. The writer further says, "Ethical element that makes good relation"(106). We lack human values if we live just ethical life though it seems better in individual and cultural level.

Amitav Ghosh, in his novel *The Shadow Lines* expresses that national and cultural boundaries are useless. Partition is the power to make the familiar to unfamiliar even uncanny. Nationalism is a problem for him. He does not talk about Indian line or Pakistani line but his journey is towards human line. This is his cosmopolitan attitude. The writer exposes this attitude through the mouth of the narrator which is expressed,"...believing in the reality of space... I believed in the reality of nations and borders; I believed that across the border there existed another reality"(219). Here, the writer is using the phrase ‘another reality’. What does it indicate? He might be indicating that human values exist beyond the reality of nations and borders. So 'home' is not a geographical entity, but an emotional, moral and intellectual entity which can be identified in *The Shadow Lines*. This is the meeting point of Manto and Ghosh as both are in the quest for 'Home' which is common ground for all. The protagonist Bishan Singh's struggle is the struggle for common home where human values exist. This is his cosmopolitan notion.

Allen Meek is quite influenced by Agamben's theory of Homo sacer and argues,"In Agamben's theory Homo sacer, once a marginalized figure, has become no longer the exception but the rule..."(25). Meek's opinion proves that victims are not real victims. They are made up victims by force. If they get freedom they can be rulers not just exception. In this sense 'Homo sacer' is a person of bare life and he is the person who has been marginalized by the people who are in the power. So far as Manto's *Toba Tek Singh* is concerned, Bishan Singh is not real lunatic but he has been made lunatic by force. It shows biopolitics is the main cause of the violation of human values. Meek further agrees to Kristeva and says photographs are more speakable than the experience of real death itself in the trenches as he argues reading Kristeva's theory of *Powers of Horror*.
The spectacle of mass death and decomposing bodies in trench warfare was unprecedented. Julia Kristeva has argued that such an experience of the abject - the body as disgusting other - threatens the foundations of the self's sense of individual integrity. The experience of death in the trenches was more than indescribable; it was unspeakable. But photographs could show it. (59)

It shows the world of traumatic image is more communicable and speakable than real experience of traumatic violence and death. In Manto's Toba Tek Singh it is quite clear that the image of the death of Bishan Singh is comparatively more traumatic and painful than such real event like the real event of 1947 partition violence of India and Pakistan.

Walter Benjamin, in "Theories, Histories and Images" argues, "Articulating the past historically does not mean recognizing it 'the way it really was'. It means appropriating a memory as it flashes up in a moment of danger"(qtd. in Meek: 41). Benjamin sees problems in history as it is not written from the below. Traumatic memory tends to come in our mind but we forcefully try to forget it. This is the moment of danger for Benjamin. Real trauma comes automatically through memory and we never try to suppress or forget it. In Toba Tek Singh, the writer Manto has presented such a character named Bishan Singh or Toba Tek Singh who is naturally expressing his pain without fear. He does not care about the use of force and dies in no man's land with a loud shriek. He knows it is moment of danger but he does not afraid. His cry is the cry against biopolitics. Lacapra's emphasis is on empathy where as "Benjamin rejected empathy"(Meek: 43). It shows Lacapra was interested in cultural politics where as Benjamin hated it. For Benjamin humanity was greater than culture. Benjamin's major concern was to "brush history against the grain" (Meek: 44). His interest was that truth of violence emerges if history becomes 'discontinuous' and if it is written in 'unsettled' manner. Unless and until it is done human values are always in the shadow. Same thing is expressed in Manto's Toba Tek Singh because no one shows interest to listen the voice of Bishan Singh or Toba Tek Singh.

Elissa Marder in her "Trauma and Literary Studies" writes, «Elman proposes that certain historical trials inadvertently put the very blindness of the law to its own limits on display in the trail ... and enacts the effects of the very trauma that law is unable to see"(50). Elissa and Felman both favour moral values. The major point of Felman is that trauma does not have legal values. Trauma cannot be closed through law. Felman argues that law is unable to heal trauma. Literature is more authentic testimony than court of law. Law only works on the basis of closer. Literature can be taken as a traumatic testimony but not history or law. Trauma literature is acting out and it has some healing power. "Literature", in the words of Manto, "is not a malady but a response to malady. It is a measure of the temperature of the country, of the nation. It tells us of its health and disease..."(qtd. in M Asaduddin: 24). Manto is quite hopeful in the sense that literature emerges with some sort of healing power. For him literature is not sickness but rather a response to sickness. He means to say that literature only can address trauma but not history and literature carries human values and moral values. So Manto's Toba Tek Singh is a piece of literature but it is more powerful than any historical document and law.

Manto's Toba Tek Singh is a triumph of ambivalence as it proclaims the in-betweenness of the protagonist. The madman's death takes place in no man's land where the writ of neither nation prevails. The story shows the partition as an outbreak of collective madness which is turned upside down. For Manto, the partition was primarily a lived reality which became a metaphor for human depravity. The partition became a metaphor for the post independence communal divide. The story
is short but it tells a lot about partition violence of India and Pakistan in 1947. Manto suggests us to fight for humanity and morality forgetting national boundary, culture and religion.
References


Salman Rushdie’s *Midnight’s Children*: Re-visiting India’s Past

Safia Sahli Rejeb
University of Jendouba, Tunisia

Abstract

This paper explores the ways in which Salman Rushdie’s *Midnight’s Children* (1980) re-visits the political history of post independence from the British Empire in 1947 including significant moments such as the Partition of Pakistan India and Indira Ghandi’s state of Emergency. What is significant in the literary text is Rushdie’s ability to fictionalise history, fantasize his depiction of historical reality and combine history with politics through the portrayal of the individual, Saleem Sinai the narrator, in relation to the larger historical context that fashions the Indian society. *Midnight’s Children* creates a history of India that is extremely heterogeneous and diverse, replete with stories, images and ideas - a multifarious hybrid history. By re-visiting the past of India, and re-writing one’s own history, one which allows for the infinite variety of experiences, cultures and perspectives that make up our world, Rushdie’s novel clears up a place in the historical record for those the suppressed and the silent voices of history.

Keywords: History, Rewriting the past, Hybridity, India.
In his collection of essays, *The World, The Text, and the Critic* (1984), the literary critic Edward Said argues that “the point is that texts have ways of existing that even in their most rarefied form are always enmeshed in circumstance, time, place, and society – in short, they are in the world, and hence worldly.” (35) The purpose of this paper is to explore the ways in which Salman Rushdie’s *Midnight’s Children* (1980) re-visits the political and social history of post independence from the British Empire in 1947.

What is significant in the literary text is Rushdie’s ability to fictionalise history, i.e. fantasize his depiction of historical reality and combine history with politics through the portrayal of the individual, Saleem Sinai the narrator, in relation to the larger historical context that fashions the Indian society.

*Midnight’s Children* creates a history of India that is extremely heterogeneous and diverse, replete with stories, images and ideas- a multifarious hybrid history. Thus, the narrative addresses the political and social problems of modern India and questions established methods of historical discourse and storytelling. By re-visiting the past of India, and re-writing one’s own history, one which allows for the infinite variety of experiences, cultures and perspectives that make up our world, Rushdie’s novel clears up a place in the historical record for the suppressed and silent voices of history.

In writing his novel, Rushdie also brought the history of twentieth century India to the West that is far from cementing the Anglo-Indian cultural bond. Rather than forcing the self into the image of the nation as British colonial protagonists, Rushdie “comically and mock- heroically insists on creating Nation in the imaginative image of self” (Shah 78). As a product of postcolonial India, Saleem must piece together the multifarious fragments of his identity, just as India must begin anew in rebuilding her identity in the wake of colonialism.

The novel traces the development of Saleem Sinai, the narrator and protagonist, and the history of his family as his modern Indian nation develops. Saleem is depicted as the embodiment of his national, deeply historic culture. By simply being born along with a thousand other children, on the stroke of his nation’s birth/independence, does in fact symbolize his nation, modern political India. Saleem’s need to confront his relationship with the history of India begins with his birth on the hour of midnight on 15 August 1947, “mysteriously handcuffed to history [his] destinies indissolubly chained to those of [his] country” as the narrative announces. It is also a response to a letter he receives from the prime-minister of India, stating that [Saleem’s] life will be a “mirror of our own” (*M.C* 22). From that moment on, the novel follows its complex path through the twinned histories of Saleem’s family and India as Reena Mitra poignantly remarks “the story traces the various events in the life of the central character that synchronize with major happenings in the recent history of India”. (23)

Salman Rushdie’s vision is clearly historical rather than personal in the sense that he is inclined to see the individual in relation to the larger social and historical forces that condition his life. He himself declares in an interview directed by Gordon Wise that everything in the novel “has had to do with poetics and with the relationship of the individual and history.” (59) History in the novel is mediated through the narrator’s consciousness and hence the apology for whatever distortions there may be. Born of history, the narrator creates history and this reciprocal creative
activity remains till the latter is “sucked into the annihilating whirlpool of the multitudes.” (M.C 463)

The essential characteristic of Rushdie’s novel is to explore the history at the margin and to recover India’s past. He gives the reasons of his decision to write the novel:

> The colours of my history had seeped out of my mind’s eye, now my two eyes were assaulted by colours, by the vividness of the red tiles, the yellow-edged green of cactus-leaves, the brilliance of bougainvillea creeper. It is probably not too romantic to say that that was when my novel *Midnight’s Children* was really born; when I realised how much I wanted to restore the past to myself ... I, too, had a city and a history to reclaim. (*Imaginary Homelands* 9-10)

The novel is not meant to be a chronological linear account of the period depicted, but is rather a blend of fantasy and reality. As a result the narrator lacks punctuality regarding the order of chronology, as the literary text does not follow a linear movement with a beginning, middle, and an end but rather moves forward and backward in time that makes it hard to trace the commonly order of events, causes, and results that make up India’s pre-and post-independence years.

The mistakes, elisions, exaggerations and solipsism in the narrative are not simply the result of a foolishly unreliable narrator, but they are intentional on Rushdie’s part. In his book of essays entitled *Imaginary Homelands*, he states that he made Saleem “suspect in his narration” through “mistakes of a fallible memory compounded by quirks of character and of circumstance to show the inevitable problems in any historical discourse”. (10)

As a matter of fact, for the past several centuries the Western discourse has been concerned with creating and maintaining grand overarching narratives that give a single and unifying identity to a nation and it is in response to this which backs up Western civilization that Rushdie proposes Saleem’s historical narrative, an expansive, meandering, and fantastic one, to attempt a new way of writing one’s own history, one which allows for the infinite variety of experiences, lives, and perspectives that make up our world.

The political and ideological dominance of the West over the rest of the world is manifested in the commonly accepted view of history as a linear and progressive narrative of colonization and civilizing missions, overseas expansion and profit engineered through an enlightenment discourse so as to justify the dominance and superiority of the white race and the subjugation of others. Michael Dash claims that history as presented in Western narratives is a “fantasy peculiar to the Western imagination in its pursuit of a discourse that legitimizes its power and condemns other cultures to the periphery”. (qtd in Gikandi Simon,7)

Anything written outside these particular confinements is branded as “a collective fiction” because “a nation which had never previously existed was about to win its freedom, catapulting us into a world which although it has five thousand years of history […] was nevertheless quite imaginary”. (M.C150). In *Narrative Desire and Historical Reparations* Tim Gauthier clearly points to Rushdie’s belief that such “progressive history is fundamentally untrue and repressive” since it
does not “accurately speak for the multitudes, [is] repressive in its attempt to eradicate those differences that undermine its wholeness”. (136)

Such progressive histories include a “cleansed reading of the past that simply washes away whatever does not accord with the imagined national narrative” (Narrative Desire 144) negating, thus, the supposed historical value of such readings. These “enlightened” narratives are simply incomplete as they ignore the trauma of the past, and focus solely on one single Truth. Rushdie argues in Imaginary Homelands that “history is always ambiguous:

Facts are hard to establish, and capable of being given many meanings. Reality is built on our prejudices, misconceptions and ignorance as well as our perceptiveness and knowledge. The reading of Saleem’s unreliable narration might be, I believed, a useful analogy for the way in which we all, everyday, attempt to ‘read’ the world”. (25)

Rushdie’s focus on the indeterminacy of truth in the text is not to completely negate the typical Western historical discourse, but to rather to decenter it. Michael Reder claims in “Rewriting History and Identity” that Rushdie “wants to open up the notion one Truth, showing the many versions of possible truths” (234)

Throughout the text, Saleem alters the facts of India’s history, mixing up dates or changing the reasons and results in order to fit the specific story he wants to tell. Many of the errors seem intentional. The following passage from Midnight’s Children captures not only Saleem’s self-awareness of narcissistic narrative but also invokes one of the many intentional errors in the text, bringing it to the foreground and imploring the reader to situate this error in the realm of a reality created by human memory:

Reality is a question of perspective […]. Re-reading my work, I have discovered an error in chronology. The assassination of Mahatma Ghandi occurs, in these pages, on a wrong date. But I cannot say, now, what the actual sequence of events might have been; in my India, Ghandi will continue to die at the wrong time. Does one error invalidate the entire fabric? Am I so far gone, in my desperate need for meaning, that I’m prepared to distort everything—to re-write the whole history of my times purely in order to place myself in a central role? (220)

In Imaginary Homelands, Rushdie discusses the writing of Midnight’s Children and how he “went to some trouble to get things wrong” (23). Introducing these errors into the story, Rushdie mimics the workings of memory and how a person’s memory creates a reality that may not conform to recorded facts, yet is as valid for that person as those recorded facts. Saleem later decides, however, that the error is simply a part of his narrative pinpointing the true nature of memory. He declares “memory’s truth, however memory has its own special kind. It selects, eliminates, alters, exaggerates, minimizes, glorifies, and vilifies also; but in the end it creates its own reality, its heterogeneous but usually coherent version of events”. (M.C 292)

Hence, memory, which is intrinsically flexible and malleable, plays a vital role in the creation of history or story. Reder observes that “when Rushdie speaks of ‘memory’, he is not speaking of cultural memory or national consciousness but of individual memory, […] the history in Midnight’s Children is seen through the eyes of an individual: it is not the dominant, official,
‘History’ but a history that is personalized and therefore given life, significance, and meaning” (Rewriting History and Identity 226)

Not only does Saleem alter the facts of the story or remarks on the very nature of history and historical discourse, putting into question his role as a narrator, he frequently focuses on himself. Though he claims that his story is about the life of India, he nevertheless connects himself to the major events of post-independence India. This egocentrism is clearly revealed through his role as the most powerful of the midnight children, the 581 children born during the midnight hour of August 15, 1947. This latter sees himself and his story to be more important than the external history, the history of India.

The best example is represented in the moment of India’s independence. He states “For the moment, I shall turn away from the generalized, macrocosmic notions to concentrate on a more private ritual[…] I shall avert my eyes from the violence in Bengal and the long pacifying walk of mahatma Ghandi. Selfish? Narrow-minded? Well, perhaps: but excusably so, in my opinion. After all, one is not born everyday”. (MC 150) Linda Hutcheon argues that this kind of narrative is “narcissistic”. (Narcissistic Narrative 20) Saleem, from the very beginning, is aware of his “centrality” in giving directions to the major events in the history of the nation. At a moment in the narrative, he even considers himself as “a competitor for centrality” (420) along with Indira Ghandi. Such novels that exhibit characteristics of narcissistic narrative emphasize the creative process and do so with an awareness of that process, breaking down old conventions and proposing replacements for those conventions. The need for a new way of looking at older historical forms makes Midnight's Children a prime candidate for analysis in terms of narcissistic narrative, providing an example that explores new views of history.

The novel invites the reader to discover an alternative to the typical historical traditions of archaic historical truth as merely recorded facts. Saleem considers himself to be indissolubly linked to the fate of India and that he is “linked literally and metaphorically, both actively and passively” (MC 330). In fact, in the novel Saleem’s “life is the microcosm that reflects and affects the macrocosmic life of the state” (Reena mitra, 12). Reder considers that individual history can be an “alternative historiography for the recapturing of Indian history” (228). As a result one would consider that Saleem’s individualized perspective offers a new way of seeing and writing history, one that endorses the inevitable influence of the narrator or writer on a story.

Saleem embarks on a desperate search for meaning as he attempts to link his own history with that of his nation. Saleem wonders if he is prepared to “re-write the whole history of [his] times purely in order to place [himself] in a central role,” (M.C 191) and in doing so, Saleem’s project of “chutnification”- of writing history- results in cracking, “a destruction manifested in his physical deterioration as well as that of his country both politically and geographically” (183) as Todd Giles notes in his article. By looking for one unified meaning, rather than accepting the multiplicity of meanings, Rushdie depicts the disintegration of the traditional conventions of a unified, history as a unity of meaning.

Therefore, any re-writing of history is bound to subjectivity, because as Giles believes that “the history of India, […] is already bound to failure, [and] Saleem feels compelled to rectify it, but in doing so, he recognizes his own inability to attain absolute truth.” (183) Saleem uses the
metaphor of “chutnification”, a culinary metaphor to give a message that history has undergone a process of confusion and alterations. The term “chutney” is an Indian dish, which is a side dish and tangy, adding flavor to any course of the meal. And it is understood as such in English. By adding “fication”, Rushdie has changed an Indian word into an English one to stand for transformation, so the chutnification of history comes to mean the rewriting of it along some specific lines derived from the word “chutney”.

In an attempt to “enter into the discourse of Europe and the West, to mix with it, transform it, to make it acknowledge marginalized or suppressed or forgotten histories”, (Culture and Imperialism 260) Midnight’s Children is, therefore, a way for Rushdie to reject any claim that establishes a single way of representing India’s history. At the end of the book, Saleem, the narrator, tells us that “Every pickle-jar […] contains […] the most exalted of possibilities: the feasibility of the chutnification of history; the grand hope of the pickling of time […] in words and pickles. I have immortalized my memories, although distortions are inevitable in both methods,” (M.C 642) only possibilities and distortions, no certainties, no absolutes. According to Reder “History, like making chutney, involves both preserving and combining a finite number of ingredients from an almost indefinite number of choices. It also involves the altering of form, changing yet preserving”. (242).

Likewise, the narrator-author Saleem is given voice through his attempts to write his story and the history of his country, the purpose behind his narrative is to offer the reader the opportunity to question narratives that we have come to accept as official and historical truth. Michel Foucault gives importance to power and knowledge nexus in writing history and his emphasis on the role played by power leads to question which discourses have been privileged, and which histories have been told, in whose name and for what purpose if one takes into consideration that the write always writes from a position of authority. Unlike traditional history, contemporary histories deal with the interrogation of the past from a marginal position, clearing up a place in the historical record for the suppressed and silent voices.

Midnight’s Children offers a new way to view the past that turns from the enlightened discourse of progress and its rules to an always expanding narrative of the nation; which opens up various possibilities for postcolonial subjects to re-right/re-write their past. Foucoulit sums it up in making “the success of history belong to those who are capable of seizing these rules, to replace those who have used them, to disguise themselves so as to perfect them, invert their meaning, and redirect them against those who had initially impose them.” (Language ,Counter-Memory, Practice 151)
References


“Female Silence in William Faulkner’s The Sound and the Fury, As I Lay Dying and “A Rose for Emily”: Crossing the Borders of the Speakable”

Mourad Romdhani
University of Sfax, Tunisia

Abstract

In William Faulkner’s The Sound and the Fury (1929), Caddy Compson moves outside the borders of language and resides in silence. In “Hearing Caddy’s Voice” (1990), Minrose Gwin admits that despite her disbelief in Caddy’s silence, she does not fully understand what she is saying, for “she is something more than we can say” (36). Likewise, in her single monologue, in As I Lay Dying (1930), Addie Bundren reveals a skeptical stand point about language, stating that “words are no good. [. . .] Words don’t even fit what they are trying to say at” (159-60) and dreaming of “the dark land talking the voiceless speech” (163). Caddy’s and Addie’s silence is indeed an experience that crosses the confines of a masculine-biased linguistic system and that can arguably be read in Sociocultural feminist theories question ethnocentric assumptions which privilege voice as the only medium of intelligible communication and try to draw attention to the silences spoken words are preloaded with. Tillie Oslen’s ‘natural silences’, Adrienne Rich’s conception of silence as a ‘historic presence’, bell hook’s silence as a ‘talking back’ process, Suzan Gubar’s and Sandra Gilbert’s ‘exclusionary silence’ and ‘palimpsest’ stories, Elaine Showalter’s ‘silent plots’, highlight silence as a border crossing medium of expression that overcomes the confines of a patriarchal language and celebrates ‘female zones of experience’.

Overcoming the borders of a dominant language and moving toward silence, Caddy’s as well as Addie’s act can readily be reiterated in Julia Kriesteva’s notion of the semiotic being ‘unspeakable’ and ‘unavailable to conscious verbalization’ and Hélène Cixous’s feminine voice that “can only keep going without ever inscribing or discerning contours” (Cixous 89). Similarly, the women’s silence may be read in Luce Irigaray’s language of their own that “asserts women’s difference and names her identity as not-man” (Roberts 15) and Monique Wittig’s ‘pre-gendered’ new expressive identity that ‘crosses back’ toward the mirror stage as a way of articulating the multiplicity of female desire.

The present paper reads the matriarch’s movement from the speakable to the unspeakable in Faulkner’s texts and studies the motives of this mobility with reference to sociocultural and psychoanalytical feminist theories.

Keywords: Myth, politics, poetics, postmodernism, centre, intertextuality, linguistic experimentation.
Introduction:

From anthropological, historical, social and geographical research to critical theories, the term ‘mobility’ is strongly resonant. Migration studies use the term to describe long-term migration movements as well as short-term movements like travelling to work or going on holiday (Sharp & Mc Dowell 168). Feminists criticize the employment of the term in migration studies for ignoring the gender of those who perform the act of mobility, scrutinizing the issue only from a masculine perspective and obscuring the complexity and variety of female mobility. Other studies concentrate on mobility from a social perspective, suggesting the term “social mobility” to refer to changes in a person’s social status (168). Studies of social mobility are equally criticized by feminists for measuring status solely from a masculine outlook, focusing on a son’s social status in relation to his father’s status and obscuring the status of daughters, wives and mothers (168). In both cases, feminists criticize the study of the term ‘mobility’ which privileges a particular identity and marginalizes others.

Defining mobility as a movement from one space to another, much research attributes a major role to physical space in the analysis of mobility. However, little has been said about symbolic mobility which does not require physical space. In this respect, the present paper aims to concentrate on symbolic mobility implicitly advocated in feminist theories. Symbolic mobility highlights a female endeavor to overcome the confines of a masculine-biased linguistic system and reach a more fulfilling medium of articulation residing in silence. The central argument of this paper is to read the matriarch’s deliberate movement from the speakable to the unspeakable in sociocultural and psychoanalytical feminist theories with particular focus on William Faulkner’s three female characters, namely Caddy Compson in The Sound and the Fury (1929), Addie Bundren in As I Lay Dying (1930) and Miss Emily Grierson in “A Rose for Emily” (1930).

Classically evoking denigrating associations as absence, powerlessness and negation and interpreted as the failure of verbal communication, silence is paradoxically loud, empowering and expressive, for it can signify a state of fullness and presence rather than of absence and negation. In “The Aesthetics of Silence,” Susan Sontag stresses the significance of silence as a non-verbal medium of articulation which “remains, inescapably, a form of speech […] and an element in a dialogue” (11).

Feminist theories overlap with psychoanalytical theories in dealing with the theme of silence as both theories agree that official and dominant discourses are deeply grounded in a closed linguistic system that represses and confines the individuality and subjectivity of the ‘other’. Feminist critics like Elaine Showalter argue that the patriarchal discourse dominates female voice, confining it into a system of representation that defines woman as ‘object’. Conversely, feminists like Sandra Gilbert, Susan Gubar, Elaine Showalter and Hélène Cixous see in patriarchal silencing strategies a good opportunity of female sedition and a movement toward voice and articulation. Defying invisibility and silencing, feminists suggest silence as a functional instrument of resistance and a medium of mobility toward voice and identity.

1 Feminist Geography critically approaches research on Human Geography, arguing that it is characterized by a predilection toward the patriarch, reinforcing a masculine bias. For instance, the writing of landscape is traditionally equated to the feminine. Subsequently, it is subordinate to male geographers’ interference and authority (Johnston & Sidaway 312).

2 The terms ‘silencing’ and ‘silence’ should not be taken as synonymous for they have totally different meanings. Silencing refers to direct prohibition like traditional censorship of woman’s voice in religious and sociopolitical
1. Silence in feminist theories: a border-crossing medium of articulation:

1.1. Sociocultural feminist perspective:

In *The Second Sex*, Simone de Beauvoir talks about the situation of confinement and abnegation women have to face in patriarchal cultures, pointing out that a woman is a prisoner of her body for she is locked in a process of natural functions – fulfilling male sexual desires and giving birth – and imprisoned in her bodily cycle of life. Any attempt to change such a natural cycle will otherwise be thought of as a source of “fear” and “anxiety” as it represents a threat to patriarchal laws and orders. De Beauvoir conceives a series of oppositions which revolve around the duality Subject/Other. For instance, while the masculine is culture, the feminine is nature; while he is human she is less than human; while he is voice and presence she is silence and absence and while he is mobility she is immobility.

Likewise, in *Silences*, Tillie Olson states that female creativity is thrown into forgetfulness and silence. Olsen states that “women’s books of great worth suffer the death of being unknown, or at best, a peculiar eclipsing, far outnumbering the similar fate of the few such books by men” (40). “Eclipsing,” “devaluation,” “neglect” and silencing are the outcome of a cultural judgment built upon a male vision that “women’s experience and literature written by women are, by definition, minor” (40) and, consequently, ought to be silenced and eliminated from consideration and analysis.

Olson’s contemporary Adrienne Rich deals with the relationship between voice, gender and silence. In her book *On Lies, Secrets and Silence* Rich records the struggle of women to have a heard voice. She describes silence as an oppressive patriarchal means imposed on females, stating that “in a world where language and naming are power, silence and oppression is violence” (204). Accordingly, Rich suggests a “revisioning” process built upon an “act of looking back, of seeing with fresh eyes, of entering an old text from a new critical direction” (35) so that women can overcome the chains of silence and acquire an independent voice.

In “Feminist Criticism in the Wilderness,” Elaine Showalter sees in silence a potentially subversive element that enables women to move outside the contours of a male-dominated discourse and celebrate “female zones of experience.” Similarly, in “Talking about Ourselves,” Canadian feminist critic Barbara Godard asks: “How can we be an object, be constructed by a ruling discourse and still constitute an opposition to it, be outside enough to mark an alternative? If outside, how can one be heard at all?” (Birch 167). Godard concludes that the answer is “to redraw the circle for us, shift the relationships of centre and periphery of authoritative word and marginal silence” (167).

Like Showalter who suggests a return to the mother’s body as a way of finding a lost voice, Audre Lorde believes that, in order to survive, a woman needs to return to the poetry within her, “for we are not only casualties but also warriors. We need to reach out to transform silence into language and to share a commitment to reclaiming language that has been made to work against us” (41-42). Lorde adds that silent poetry inside the woman is what gives her voice, power and life.
Without that inner poetry, a woman “cannot name the nameless and so cannot think the nameless. Without poetry, without women’s language, she gives up the core of power. Without poetry, a female sees the world only through the perception of the patriarch and perpetually speaks in a foreign tongue (39). Although it is a dangerous and revolutionary act, Lorde believes, speaking ‘from and into silence’ is a vital necessity for women’s existence and identity (37).

Silence becomes a woman’s way of resistance for, unable to find a place in mainstream language, women’s return to silence becomes fulfilling and liberating: “There [. . .] we take the oppressor’s language and turn it against itself. We make our words a counter hegemonic speech, liberating ourselves in language” (hooks, Teaching 175). hooks suggests listening to voices silenced and suppressed by white patriarchal “master” discourses:

I suggest that we do not necessarily need to hear and know what is stated in its entirety, that we do not need to master or conquer the narrative as a whole, that we may know its fragments. I suggest that we may learn from spaces of silence as well as spaces of speech, that in the patient act of listening to another tongue, [. . .] we may disrupt that cultural imperialism that suggests one is worthy of being heard only if one speaks in Standard English. (186)

hooks asserts that the English Language carries power structures that are employed to silence voices of the marginalized. Certain slang, colloquial or ethnic speech is silenced and eliminated from Standard English because it is not understood in a dominant culture. Such a linguistic practice, hooks remarks, perpetuates the same patriarchal power structures that elevate certain people and suppress others.

1.2. Psychoanalytical feminist perspective:

In The Revolution of Poetic Language, Kristeva states that language has two aspects namely the semiotic aspect, which comes from the maternal body and which is closer to nature and the unconscious, and the ‘symbolic’ aspect which is more closely identified with the father figure and is rather associated with culture and conscious behavior (4). Kristeva describes the infant as possessing a sense of self closely attached to the mother. She describes the Freudian mirror stage as a metaphor for the change from the ‘semiotic’ to the ‘symbolic’ stage, pointing out that language favors the symbolic over the semiotic since, as speaking subjects, all we acquire is a ‘phallic position’. Subsequently, “in women’s writings, language seems to be seen from a foreign land [. . .]. Estranged from language, women are visionaries, dancers who suffer as they speak” (Kristeva, Oscillation 118). Kristeva argues about the necessity of finding a new form of articulation that subverts the masculine symbolic order and favors the more feminine semiotic which is more closely connected to the rhythms of the body, to the mother’s figure and to the nonverbal.

Following the Freudian model, Kristeva’s semiotic is constructed on bodily origins, for it draws upon corporeal memories commonly referred to in psychoanalysis as ‘mnemonic traces’ or “a reminiscence of the play of energy and drives –both destructive and pleasurable– experienced in the body with great intensity before the achievement of real and symbolic separation from the mother” (Smith 16). The semiotic aspect of language, Kristeva argues, is unspeakable and unavailable to conscious verbalization. It can be made manifest in “tone, timbre, intonation, modulation of voice and in tears [. . .] relating to emotion, pleasure and pain” (22).
The access to language and identity signals a ‘symbolic’ break with the maternal body and a passage into a masculine language grounded in phallogocentricism. Kristeva claims that in the pre-oedipal semiotic stage, there is no opposition between the masculine and the feminine. Such an opposition and the overt privileging of the masculine over the feminine are not natural. They are rather a cultural and linguistic practice in the symbolic order. As such, within the Kristevian perspective, silence can be regarded as a pre-oedipal purely natural condition that ensures equality between the feminine and the masculine.

Women are silenced in the ‘symbolic’ stage because they are totally alienated from the discourses constructing their body. A woman is bound to voice her body through the medium of a phallocentric linguistic system that excludes her. Subsequently, her body remains ‘unspeakable’ and unspoken in the symbolic realm. A woman’s body becomes “the state of a contradictory and unlivable state, a body in crisis” (174). If a woman attempts to articulate her body and her desire, she might overpass the borders of the symbolic linguistic system, for she is impelled toward new signifying structures that destroy the ‘Law of the Father’ and the phallogocentrism of the symbolic order.

As such, woman’s silence becomes a medium of expression that constitutes a threat to a patriarchal linguistic system. In this respect, Kristeva comments on the importance of silence as a way of resisting the symbolic order which negates the feminine, claiming that through silence the feminine moves beyond the linguistic definition of the symbolic: “the belief that one is a woman is [. . .] absurd, for a woman cannot be [. . .]. She is something that cannot be represented, something that is not said” (qtd. in Brewer 32). To Kristeva, it is only through the nonverbal that the feminine can achieve mobility and articulation.

In the same vein, Hélène Cixous argues that women should learn to make use of the semiotic aspect of language so as to write their bodies as a form of resistance against phallogocentric cultures. Like Kristeva, Cixous thinks that a feminine writing can build upon the semiotic nonverbal experiences of the mother’s body to break with the restrictions of the symbolic cultural systems. Cixous is for the idea of constructing an idiosyncratic feminine medium of expression. In The Newly Born Woman, she argues that “we must do so for what will become of women if we are forced to use a master discourse, where only one kind of knowledge is transmitted, a knowledge tied up in male power” (38). Cixous claims that if women rely on the patriarchal discourse of the symbolic order, they will end up linguistically disabled and incapable of articulating themselves. To find new ideological mediums, women need to reject phallocentric discourses and find a new feminine medium of articulation. Cixous suggests a backward movement to the mother’s body so as to explore its potentialities and overcome the rigid binary oppositions established by a phallogocentric symbolic order. If the feminine “explores her body with its thousand and one thresholds of order, she will make the old single-grooved mother tongue reverberate with more than one language” (84).

Moreover, in This Sex which is not One, Luce Irigaray claims that “Female sexuality has always been conceptualized on the basis of masculine parameters” (23). Accordingly, female desire is deliberately repressed within the patriarchal linguistic system and it can be “recovered only in secret, in hiding, with anxiety and guilt” (30). Articulating her desire within the contours of a patriarchal language, Irigaray insists that a woman’s desire is not her own. Reiterating Woolf’s statement that a woman needs a room of her own, Irigaray suggests a woman is required to seek a desire of her own. Therefore, a woman “is urged to assert her difference, to name her identity as not-man” (Roberts 15). In this case, women face the necessity of substituting the patriarchal linguistic system, alien to the feminine, by a new language of their own that functions outside
patriarchal parameters. Respectively, silence is presented as an alternative to male-biased discourses. However, it is not silence that originates from a position of powerlessness, marginality and absence. Rather, it is an expressive medium that signals female resistance and full presence.

In an article entitled “Veiled Lips,” Luce Irigaray similarly evokes the female’s inevitable reverberation of the masculine speech, describing this as the male “economy of the same.” She states that “only the father’s daughter, she repeats his discourse without much understanding, carries out his law, spreading it everywhere, in the middle of everything; intermediary for all to the point of intrigue, where her charm takes the place of violence” (99). As the mother fails to offer a voice and a language of their own, a daughter finds no other way of articulation but the Symbolic medium of expression in which the patriarchal “God” of Speech dominates.

Irigaray suggests that women should cross back toward the mirror stage\(^3\) so that they could articulate themselves. Irigaray postulates that women are required to move back in time as a way of regaining articulation and voice. Such a crossing back process into the semiotic stage can be achieved through silence as a way of undermining male discourses. In this respect, Christian Makward in “To Be or not to Be: A Feminist Speaker,” suggests mobility as a main feature of the feminine writing from a French feminist perspective, describing it as “open, fluid, exploded, [. . .] attempting to speak the body i.e. the unconscious, involving silence, incorporating the simultaneity of life as opposed to [. . .] masterly or didactic language” (96). By the same token, in Gender Trouble, Judith Butler stresses female mobility outside the contours of a masculine-biased language as the sole way to articulation, stating that “the possibility of another language or signifying economy is the only chance at escaping the ‘mark’ of gender which, for the feminine, is nothing but the phallocentric erasure of the female sex” (35).

Irigaray’s contemporary Monique Wittig equally argues that patriarchal language is a powerful hegemonic medium that subordinates and excludes the feminine. Language is “among the concrete and contingent practices and institutions maintained by the choices of individuals and [. . .] weakened by the collective actions of choosing individuals” (35). To Wittig, language is a system established in an effort to restrict and obscure the production of identities outside the axis of the patriarchal hegemony. Wittig underrates the patriarchal linguistic system in which the mark of gender is evident. She calls for a feminine “pre-social” and “pre-gendered” linguistic identity which substitutes the language and the Law of the Father and gives voice to a feminine silent/silenced identity.

2. Female Silence in William Faulkner’s The Sound and the Fury, As I Lay Dying and “A Rose for Emily”: Crossing the Borders of the ‘Speakable’

In William Faulkner’s texts, female migration outside the margins of patriarchal language is concretized by women characters whose resistive silence signals their mobility. Among many others, Caddy Compson’s silence in The Sound and the Fury, Addie Bundren’s silence and her critical attitude toward a patriarchal language in As I Lay Dying and Miss Emily Grierson’s deliberate forty-year silence in “A Rose for Emily” testify to the credibility of the claim that

\(^3\) According to Lacan, the mirror phase occurs when the child learns to know him/herself as reflection of the mother. This stage takes place in the imaginary/semiotic order before the separation from the mother’s body and the inscription into the male symbolic order.
Faulkner’s women escape the confines of language and reside in silence as a border-crossing act of sedition and resistance.

In *The Sound and the Fury* (1929), Caddy Compson is not allowed to a voice, for she never appears as a free direct speech, being told and retold by three brothers or three masculine tongues. Nevertheless, she figures so prominently in the novel as she is the main topic of her brothers’ talk and thought. In “Hearing Caddy’s Voice,” Minrose Gwin admits that despite her disbelief in Caddy’s silence, she does not fully understand what she is saying, for “she is something more than we can say” (36). Likewise, in her single monologue, in *As I Lay Dying* (1930), Addie Bundren’s silence proceeds from a critical standpoint about language. Addie overtly states that “words are no good. [. . .] Words don’t even fit what they are trying to say at” (159-60) and dreams of migrating to “the dark land talking the voiceless speech” (163).

Likewise, in a “Rose for Emily,” Miss Emily’s voice is suffocated and her concerns are silenced by a patriarchal narrator. Even when allowed to voice herself, Miss Emily opts for very short utterances giving the impression that she deliberately refuses to speak. However, Miss Emily’s imprisonment in her father’s house has an empowering role, for the more silent and introverted the lady is, the more obsessed with her the townspeople become. Thus, the silence of Faulkner’s females can arguably be described as an act of mobility that enables them to overpass the limits of patriarchy and reside in eternity and timelessness.

Miss Emily’s silence adds to her portrayal as a character with divine attributes and thus her movement beyond the human. Several times in the story, Miss Emily is referred to as an idolized angel: “When we saw her again, her hair was cut short, making her look like a girl with a resemblance to those angels in colored church windows” (52). The lady’s deliberate confinement in her house and her total absence in Jefferson is equally reminiscent of the silence of the divine: “After her father’s death she went out very little; after her sweetheart went away, people hardly saw her at all” (50). Miss Emily lives as a recluse in the town for a period of almost forty years. However, by virtue of her physical absence and silence, Faulkner’s female achieves total presence in Jefferson’s thought like a divine power whose absence and silence reflect omnipresence and eternity.

Caddy Compson’s, Addie Bundren’s and Miss Emily Grierson’s deliberate refusal of words falls within what Elaine Showalter terms as a potentially subversive element of silence that enables women to move beyond a patriarchal language as a way of expressing themselves in a male-dominated culture. Showalter argues that in every explicit theme articulated by a woman, there is always a hidden silent theme that is not expressed. To Showalter, any woman’s form of communication can be read as “double voiced” or as a “dialogic discourse,” containing a dominant and a silent story or a “palimpsestic” story, to use Sandra Gilbert’s and Suzan Gubar’s term. Showalter emphasizes the possibility that different discourses constituting a story can simultaneously tell two stories to the reader. One is a voiced dominant masculine-focused story while the other is a subversive feminine-based narrative or an *écriture féminine*. Seen from Showalter’s perspective, Faulkner’s Females’ stories as silent women dressed in white and always in need of patriarchal custody is the dominant masculine-biased story while their story as ladies who resist the patriarch by virtue of their voicelessness is a “palimpsestic” narrative that escapes the confines of a patriarchal language and celebrates the unarticulated female body, constructing them as goddesses of silence and resistance.
Caddy Compson in *The Sound and the Fury*, Addie Bundren in *As I Lay Dying* and Miss Emily in “A Rose for Emily,” are Faulknerian women characters who have bodies uncontrollable and uncontainable by a phallogocentric society (Clarke 4). Their maternal power and their linguistically uncontainable bodies construct them as a feminist counterforce against the Law of the Father in the same manner French feminists like Julia Kristeva, Luce Irigaray and Hélène Cixous criticize Lacanian assumptions about the Law of the Father and suggest a backward mobility toward a mother figure rather than a prohibiting father figure.

This attachment to the mother figure is abundantly referred to in Faulkner’s texts. In “A Rose for Emily” although the mother figure is missing, as there is no reference to Miss Emily’s mother, the whole town’s interest in Miss Emily’s silence and introversion ironically turns her into a mother figure which fulfills the townspeople’s pre-oedipal desire obscured by the dominance of patriarchal culture. In the same way, the Compson brothers’ obsession with their absent sister in *The Sound and the Fury* and the Bundrens’ journey, talk and thought, in *As I Lay Dying*, revolving around their matriarch’s wish to be buried in Jefferson reflect the remarkable presence of a pre-oedipal attachment to the mother figure in Faulkner’s texts, a presence that enables the female characters to move beyond the confines of panoptic patriarchal spaces and engage in an overflowing process of motion and openness.

Female characters’ remarkable silence throughout Faulkner’s texts meets Kristeva’s argument about the necessity of finding new forms of articulation that resist the masculine Symbolic order. Miss Emily’s intentional silence can arguably be classified as a Semiotic aspect of language which can be manifested through “tone, timbre, intonation, modulation of voice and in tears [. . .] relating to emotion, pleasure and pain” (Kristeva, *Revolution* 22). Miss Emily’s ‘cold’ and ‘dry’ voice, her wordless tears when she admits her father’s death and her silent stare to the druggist disclose a resistive medium of articulation which is unspeakable and unavailable to conscious verbalization (22).

In an article entitled “Semiotics: A Critical Science and/or a Critique of Science,” Kristeva uses the term “silent production” to account for such a nonverbal medium of articulation: “This concept of a ‘work’ that means nothing and of a silent production that marks and transforms while remaining prior to all circular speech, to communication, exchange or meaning” (83). Kristeva uses the term in a deconstructive manner which revises the dichotomy language/silence in a way that the mere act of opposing silence to speech is no longer relevant. Instead, “silent production” becomes synonymous with an “unquiet silence, one that inhabits and disrupts sound” (Walker 95). Respectively, Miss Emily’s silence becomes a “silent production” which compels the townspeople, as well as the readers, to reevaluate a resistive medium that is anything but silent in the strict patriarchal sense.

Besides, Kristeva argues that in the pre-oedipal Semiotic stage of language, there is no opposition between the masculine and the feminine. Such an opposition and the overt privileging of the masculine over the feminine are not natural. They are rather a culturally-based linguistic practice in the Symbolic order. The role of patriarchal culture in establishing the superiority of the masculine over the feminine is concretized in “A Rose for Emily” in the tableau analogy where the masculine “spraddled silhouette” overwhelms the feminine and turns her into “a slender figure” (51) and in Homer Barron’s description as a “big voice” (53). As a reaction to a culturally constructed male superiority, Miss Emily applies her silence as a pre-oedipal natural condition that ensures equality between the feminine and the masculine. In this respect, the lady’s silence is “a semiotic
kind of unquiet silence. A silence that speaks” (Walker 173) and tells about a contradictory and unlivable female condition of crisis and alienation in a patriarchal Symbolic stage. Bond to voice her body through the medium of a phallocentric language that excludes her, Miss Emily resorts to a silent life that not only contains her unspeakable state of body crisis but also overpasses the ‘Law of the Father’ and the phallocentric order of the Symbolic stage.

Similarly, Hélène Cixous claims that women are required to learn how to make use of the Semiotic aspect of language, marked by non-verbal experiences of the mother’s body, to overcome the restrictions of the Symbolic order. To Cixous, women are incapable of appropriately articulating their concerns and their body through a masculine constructed Symbolic language. Hence, the rejection of phallocentric discourses is to Cixous a new medium of articulation that crosses the borders of the linguistic. In “The Laugh of the Medusa,” Cixous argues that phallocentric language is written in “black ink” with its totalitarian and rigid structures whereas feminine modes of articulation are produced in “white ink” or “the water from the body,” the endless source that flows freely and spontaneously.

In “A Rose for Emily,” the note Miss Emily sends to the mayor is of archaic shape “in a thin, flowing calligraphy in fade ink, to the effect that she no longer went out at all. The tax notice was also enclosed, without comment” (48). Miss Emily’s note mirrors the lady’s body for it is as archaic and thin as its sender. Besides, it is written in “fade ink,” reflecting a fading body, a dying sexuality and, most importantly, the tax notice standing for the Law of the Father receives no comment from the part of Miss Emily, which is an indication of the lady’s adoption of a Semiotic language that favors the unspeakable and overcomes the patriarch’s Symbolic language.

Hélène Cixous adds that even when she speaks, a woman’s voice is kept in silence because she speaks in a masculine-constructed tongue that is alien to her. In the same way, a woman cannot be heard as her words fall upon deaf male ears which hear only the masculine (82). Besides, if a woman dares to speak in a patriarchal Symbolic order, she becomes an emblem of desire of the pre-oedipal semiotic order and a threat to the settlement of the Law of the Father. Consequently, a woman becomes doubly alienated in the language of the Symbolic that do not voice and allow the expression of her body. In the same spirit, Juliet Mc Cannell talks about the daughter’s silence and the wifely echoing of her man’s language which are “the only channels open as she closes her mother’s voice” (107).

Accordingly, Faulkner’s females’ silence is in an attempt to overcome the confines of the Symbolic language and a crossing-back toward a pre-oedipal stage highlighting the mother figure and the silent potentials of the female body. Talking about her body before its invasion by Anse Bundren, Addie recurs to silence as a better medium to voice its purity in the semiotic order and to overpass the contamination of a Symbolic linguistic sign: “The shape of my body where I used to be a virgin is in the shape of a and I couldn’t think of Anse, couldn’t remember Anse. It was not that I could think of myself as no longer unvirgin, because I was three now” (161). The blank typography describing Addie’s body is indeed a silent moment celebrating a pre-sexual prelinguistic state that cannot be contained by words. In this instance, silence results in a textual absence which is, on one hand, an evocative and tempting beauty for the reader, telling about virginity and purity and, on the other, representing the lady’s struggle with the word and her resistive powers of silence. In this vein, Arnold Weinstein, in Nobody's Home: Speech, Self, and Place in American Fiction, talks about Faulkner’s females “plenum of silence” constructed upon a poetics revisioning and resistance:
The plenum of silence has often been thought to be at the center of Faulkner’s poetics, a plenitude unmarred by language’s tricks, a fullness essentially undeliverable but there nonetheless, beyond the words, seemingly daring the writer to come at it, to yoke it into his operation, actually damning him to failure. (161)

Though “the plenum of silence” is visually concretized as a textual gap, it is indeed pregnant with meanings moving back the female body to a pure semiotic order which patriarchal language fails to translate.

It is face to phallogocentric control of the Symbolic language that the disruptive presence of women’s silence emerges “with the potential to redefine established conventions and to suggest different methods of creativity” (Clarke 5). Miss Emily’s silent life which haunts the patriarchal town of Jefferson as well as Addie Bundren’s conclusion, in As I Lay Dying, that “words are no good; that words don’t even fit what they are trying to say at” (159) fall within what Hélène Cixous describes, in “Laugh of the Medusa,” as the feminine endeavor to “un-think the unifying, regulating history that homogenizes and channels forces, herding contradictions into a single battle field” (81). Through their resistive silence, Faulkner’s women move outside the Symbolic aspect of a masculine-oriented language, rewriting their body in a new medium of articulation which Deborah Clarke terms, in Robbing Mothers, as “not-language” (6).

Additionally, Luce Irigaray suggests that women should resist the masculine-biased language of the Symbolic order and cross back to a “mirror stage” which better enables them to articulate themselves. This stage takes place during the prelinguistic Imaginary Order. Miss Emily’s hair which was cut short, making her look like a girl (52) concretizes the woman’s wish to cross back to a prelinguistic mirror stage after the death of her father. The same wish to escape from a Symbolic linguistic system is reiterated with female characters in Faulkner’s texts.

Through her silence, Caddy Compson escapes from the Symbolic Order and resides in a pre-oedipal, pre-social Imaginary order in which she is remembered by a child-like brother, Benjy, via the smell of flowers, trees and leaves rather than linguistic signs (13-17). In As I Lay Dying, Addie Bundren rejects the Symbolic aspect of words and finds in silence her best medium of articulating her body. Faulkner’s female characters exhibit a readiness to escape to a mirror stage or a pre-gendered, pre-social, pre-Symbolic order, to use Monique Wittig’s terms, where silence substitutes the Symbolic Law of the Father and provides female characters with a chance of mobility beyond the confines of a Symbolic language controlled by the Law of the Father.

Conclusion:

Overcoming the borders of a dominant language and moving toward silence, Faulkner’s women characters echo bell hook’s notion of silence as a border-crossing “talking back” process, Kristeleva’s movement from the confinement of patriarchal language toward a semiotic sphere which is unspeakable and uncontainable by patriarchal verbalization. They also reverberate Hélène Cixous’ feminine voice that “can only keep going without ever inscribing or discerning contours” (89), Luce Irigaray’s language of their own and Monique Wittig’s pre-gendered new expressive identity that crosses back toward the mirror stage as a way of articulating female identity.

Silent throughout Faulkner’s texts, Caddy, Addie and Miss Emily remain quoted or referred to as the “other.” Nonetheless, silence constitutes an empowering instrument and a resistive female
agency. In *The Most splendid Failure*, André Bleikasten highlights the resistive element of female voicelessness, arguing that Faulkner's silent females are an “empty centre” which in our attempts to fix it, we find ourselves overwhelmed by it in it and to it (57). Female silence in Faulkner’s texts signals the matriarch’s movement from the speakable to the unspeakable; a mobility aiming at crossing the borders of a patriarchal language and celebrating linguistically uncontainable female zones of experience.
References

Primary Sources:


Secondary Sources:


The Discourse of Local Public Broadcasting Managers and Producers: The Speech Act in the Midst of Organizational Transition

Gerry Schlenker
University of Sioux Falls, Sioux Falls, USA

Abstract

South Dakota Public Broadcasting (SDPB) underwent significant structural and organizational transition in the 1990’s. This historical study provides a description of the discursive activity of SDPB managers and producers in the midst of that change. It also discusses a number of structural and historical arrangements that appear to have caused contradiction and conflict.

What follows is the transcribed discourse and speech act activity of a number of individuals involved in South Dakota Public Broadcasting including those in management, programming and production. It describes interaction during activity such as departmental strategic planning meetings, network reorganizational sessions, production meetings, interviews and Educational Telecommunications Board (ETB) meetings, as well as hallway conversation over the course of many months.

Since Universal Pragmatics encourages attention to the representation of the external, internal and social worlds through language in the context of everyday life as it is lived (the lifeworld), these transcriptions provide substantive evidence for analysis of how reality is constructed by these local public broadcasting managers and producers in the midst of conflict and change.

Universal Pragmatics assumes that the presence of such "de-linguistified steering media” as power and money can replace language as a mechanism of social integration and therefore have a "disintegrative effect on the lifeworld (Habermas, 1984, 343)."

My previous article (IJHCS 1(4), 2015, pp. 469-490) held that various steering mechanisms can exist within institutions like South Dakota Public Broadcasting and can influence the relationships within them. It suggested that Universal Pragmatics could be used as a methodology for analyzing institutional cultures. This work is the second of three articles in a process that will put that methodology into practice.
The following historical analysis includes three segments concerning a time period during a year in which there was a resignation and replacement in the Executive Director position at South Dakota Public Broadcasting. This became a catalyst for total network reorganization. The three segments include (1) a six-month period following the resignation of the Executive Director, (2) the arrival of the new Executive Director, and (3) a three-month period following the arrival of the new Executive Director.

Keywords: Habermas, Universal Pragmatics, Ideal Speech Situation, Public Sphere, Culture, Democracy.
The Executive Director Resigns

South Dakota Public Broadcasting's Executive Director resigned in April of 1992. It was the beginning of a time of challenge and change for the network. The theory of communicative action assumes input and the opportunity to participate for those in the lifeworld whom challenge and change will affect.

A communicatively rationalized lifeworld would have to develop ... limits to the inner dynamic of media-steered subsystems and to subordinate them to decisions arrived at in unconstrained communication. Central to these institutions are those that secure an effectively functioning public sphere, in which practical questions of general interest can be submitted to public discussion and decided on the basis of discursively achieved agreement (Habermas, xxxvii, 1984).

Since the Executive Director's resignation came under duress and as a result of conflict with the Secretary of the Department of Education and Cultural Affairs (DECA) and consequently a loss of ETB confidence, the situation as it developed may not have been conducive to limiting the media-steering mechanisms of money and power, or in fostering unconstrained communication. Various facets of SDPB appear to have been effected including programming and production.

Following the Executive Director's resignation, SDPB made some controversial programming decisions. In July of 1992, SDPB refused to broadcast a Masterpiece Theatre program titled Portrait of a Marriage. The program involved content concerning a three-year lesbian relationship, and SDPB network programmers canceled it because they said, "even Masterpiece Theatre can deliver a program that is not appropriate for all audiences."

The decision not to air Portrait of a Marriage sparked a controversy that received a great deal of attention in state newspapers and numerous letters to editors from members of the public. Headlines of stories concerning the issue included "Viewers Can Select TV Shows," (Hepner, August 7, 1992), "Public TV Decision Sparks Uproar," (Grauvogl, September, 10, 1992), "Public TV Tangled in Power Struggle," (Grauvogl, October 14, 1992), "Board Meeting Excludes any 'Portrait' Discussions," (Grauvogl, October 17, 1992), "Public TV is Failing Viewers," (Gambill, November 7, 1992), "Editorial View on PBS Accountability off Base," (Bonaiuto, November 10, 1992) and "TV Declines Review of 'Portrait'," (Grauvogl, December 10, 1992).

In one October story, the Sioux Falls Argus Leader newspaper reported that South Dakota Public Broadcasting's decision not to air Portrait of a Marriage is not an isolated situation. In the past few months, pieces of other series also have been pulled in South Dakota (Grauvogl, October 15, 1992, 1A).

From the time of the Executive Directors resignation in April, through October of 1992, the
network refused to air a number of programs including Tongues Untied, Metamorphosis, American Tongues, The Lost Language of the Cranes, Alive TV, Looking for Langston, Used Alive, Watunna and Ogichidag, Reckin' Shop, The Issue is Race, Great Performances 20th Anniversary Special: Celebrating Creativity, American Style and Portrait of a Marriage (Grauvogl, October 15, 1992). All of these programs dealt with cultural diversity related to either sexual identity or ethnic and racial issues.

Canceling Portrait of a Marriage sparked so much controversy that the Educational Telecommunication Board decided that at its August, October and December meetings it would invite public comment on the issue. At the August meeting about 50 people spoke both for and against showing the program.

As I see it there are at least three important things, which are related to this issue.

(1) ETV has various recommendations submitted by individuals who are members of the public. ETV should take these comments seriously and consider the seriousness of censorship of any material on South Dakota Public Broadcasting. It is therefore important that ETV consider adding "sexual persuasion" to its list of things that should not be discriminated against in programming.

(2) The Friends of South Dakota Public Broadcasting have recommended that the program be shown, however so far, that recommendation has been ignored by ETV. It is incumbent upon this organization that it adhere to guidelines related to the programming of material involving diverse content.

(3) Finally, let me stress that programming policy not be set on that basis of fear of retaliation from either state leaders whether they be legislators or the governor. The public broadcasting system should be free of undue state control (Roberts, October 16, 1992).

The Board's apparent openness to discuss the issue seemed to lend credence to the expectation that they were willing to take a position on the issue and perhaps support the ideal of cultural diversity in SDPB programming. However, at all of these meetings the Board listened to public comment, and then went ahead with other items on its agenda with little or no discussion.

At the December, 1992 ETB meeting, several more individuals expressed their opinions. The SDPTV censorship of Masterpiece Theatre and Portrait of a Marriage has shocked South Dakotans. Censors have deleted programs which are controversial but which show a better cross-section of America. With ever constricting programming, South Dakotans are losing the larger views of mainstream America. Programs about African-Americans, racism, Asian-Americans, and so on, are not broadcast here. This shrinking mirror on life and the arts fosters an image of South Dakota as a cultural isolationist. This reputation will not be good for economic development.
The Friends of Public Broadcasting have in one year contributed nearly $700,000, collected through fund-raising from private citizens and businesses. Their generosity pays for at least half of programming costs. In return they are getting a shrinking menu for their money and their concerned advice is being ignored. Programs like Bill Movers, Masterpiece Theatre, Point of View, and Great Performances, have already been censored. Similarly, prime-time slots have already changed, the evenings are dominated more and more by programs that do not educate, nor challenge, nor provoke, nor deepen, no test the experiences of South Dakotans.

Public television programming avoids its mission by being measurably less free, culturally ingrown, and politically right wing. SDPTV provokes us as much as a quaint old-time dance orchestra of a vanishing era with a conductor that leads the ensemble in playing the same anonymous bland song over and over again (Gambill, December 9, 1992).

As it did during the August and October meetings, the Board simply allowed people to speak and then went on to other items on its agenda without even addressing the issue. The behavior of the Board seemed to answer SDPB managers' questions about control of the system. The combination of events including HB-1123 (the legislative proposal to move administrative control of SDPB from the ETB to DECA) earlier in the summer, the Executive Director's resignation and the controversy over Portrait of a Marriage had cast a cloud over the network regarding who was in charge. The Board's unwillingness to "second guess" management's cancellation of the program was perceived to be a positive development in favor of SDPB management (Acting Executive Director, December 9, 1992).

However, in the middle of all of these events, the Co-Chair of the S.D. Joint Appropriations Committee, who had sponsored HB-1123, began having secret meetings with some SDPB employees. This was considered an intrusion and an effort to circumvent the authority of the Acting Executive Director and the ETB.

We have had some legislative intrusion which has bothered me greatly and it may well be why Dave Leonard is no longer with us, at least I think it was a major contributing factor. I think there are some appropriate ways that legislators and the legislature collectively should be involved in who we are and what we do in South Dakota Public Broadcasting. One of those is the Appropriations Committee, and we should answer to them. They have every right to question us about how we are spending state money.

But we have seen a transgression which has gone far beyond that to the point where we have a legislator who is meeting with staff, privately without either the Board or management knowing about it. To me that is unconscionable and unprofessional and unethical, and it just makes absolutely no sense, however well intended it might be.

I think if there are serious questions about things going on in the network, the first place a legislator should start is with the governing board. It then ought to be the Board that is held accountable,
and it ought to be the Board then that goes to the Executive Director and says "What in the world is going on here?"

This has been undermining the authority of the licensee (the ETB) and it undermines the authority of the senior management of the network and thus there may well be a sense at the producer level that what they do or don't do may somehow be measured or graded or positively or negatively received and they may be thinking more about the legislator or group of legislators than their audience.

I think therefore there is a sense of frustration that all of us have over who is in charge and that has been voiced verbally at our last Board meeting. We had a staff meeting ahead of the Board meeting and the Board came in and met with the staff at that meeting and several of the staff came in and said, "Who is in charge?"

Some of the concern then was directed at the Secretary of the Department of Education and Cultural Affairs, because I think there has been a real sense of the usurping of authority by the Secretary of the Department of Education and by the Chair of the Appropriations Committee. She has the ability to intimidate a lot of people including the DECA Secretary and some ETB members.

As late as October, the Chair of the Appropriations Committee had met with some staff again on some issues. I was fairly livid and went to the Board again and said this is ridiculous and that the Board needs to assert itself and let her know that this is not something she ought to be doing. The Board agreed that something needed to be done, but I've heard nothing since October that anyone has confronted her.

I think it's reflective of reluctance on the part of the Board, they just want everything to be healed and to go away. I think it is a systemic problem and expecting that we can run the network from Pierre in terms of personnel decisions is a mistake, it creates great problems and difficulty.

The Secretary of Education and Cultural Affairs does affect personnel very, very acutely and I don't know how you separate control of personnel and control of programming. And the connection is that it is easier for the Chair of the Appropriations Committee or anyone else to deal with a single political appointee like the Secretary of DECA, than it is to deal with a multi-headed monster like an Educational and Telecommunications Board. And according to the FCC, as the licensee, they should have the responsibility for programming, for personnel and for fiscal affairs (Acting Executive Director, January 14, 1993).

Other managers including the Director of Television Programming indicated that they felt similar pressures and conflicts involving political intrusion from state legislators.

Politics interfere. Politics are getting in the way of doing business. It ought not to be that way but
it is. The bureaucracy has taken on a life of its own and that can be kind of nasty. Dave Leonard is not here because he got crossways politically with the wrong people, I might not be here in six months because I got crossways with the wrong people.

The real test of an Executive Director's success is in keeping the politics away from the producer level, it should never get out and permeate the staff people, they should always be removed from it.

As long as you have politicians who are elected and therefore appoint boards to control entities there needs to be some kind of removal of control outside the political arena. We have to go before the Appropriations Committee to have our budget approved. If we do not make them happy, we could be in trouble.

Its control and accountability, and by having control of the purse strings you can control it. I don't know if it is politics per se, but it is the power that goes with politics. Because of the way the system is set up, you are not in charge of your own destiny.

Therefore it is important to gain an understanding of what that audience wants. One of the key elements of what I do is knowing the audience and understanding them, and I've been listening to them for seven years. You read this mail on a daily basis for seven years and pretty soon you get a feel for what the majority wants and that is where I try to go, I don't try to exclude the minority. If I had scheduled this (Portrait of a Marriage) at midnight, it would have come and gone with very little fan fare.

I don't think censorship has anything to do with it. We are just trying to make adult material available at a safe time.

We really are not a whole lot different then the commercial world, except we do not need the big numbers (Director of TV Programming, January 11, 1993).

The time between the resignation of the Executive Director and the arrival of the new Executive Director was both a period of frustration and anticipation for managers and producers of SDPB. Frustration existed because of the controversy over Portrait of a Marriage and because of a perception that no one really knew who was in control of the system. Producers in particular seem to have looked forward to a "changing of the guard."

I'm excited personally. I don't know a lot about the new guy coming in but a I know what the old guard was like and I like the fact that he has a younger mentality, is an ex-hippie, and therefore a certain amount of liberalness and used to work for a community license station and has done all kinds of jobs. That means he probably will like to be in touch with staff. The past administration, to me had a certain elitist attitude, "I'm an administrator and you're a peon. You guys are to be foot soldiers and I will give the orders and you will carry out the orders, while I stand up here on the hill and direct the battle."
In reality we are too small a station and don't have enough people, therefore the people at the top have to be involved. Like when I ran the department, I told everybody, we have to think like community theatre, we don't have enough numbers and so everyone has to be involved right up to me. But there are people in this organization, particularly at the administrative level that think "I'm an administrator and I hand down orders and they carry them out." I don't think that is viable in such a small organization and is not conducive to creating an atmosphere of working together and cooperation.

I think the pyramid management style needs to be hanged to something more round, more cooperation. I think a lot of people here are more excited in regards to just the few things they have heard about this guy. It's as simple as getting a recent E-Mail message from him and calling himself "Staff" and using inclusionary language like that rather describing himself as part of "administration." That's really exciting to think that someone like that is coming in after dealing with people like we have had in the past.

The Portrait of a Marriage thing for instance, makes me suspicious of this administration. To me people who are bigoted toward one aspect of cultural diversity are usually bigoted toward other aspects of the world, whether its culture, religion, race. When you make arbitrary decisions and stick to them the way they did, I think it is very indicative of their style of management that they think "I'm right and they're wrong and by god I'll go down in a flaming ship to prove it."

I think when the first title wave of negative response came from the public they should have said "Alright fine, we'll put it on a 11:30 at night and will flag it and you will get to see it," and that would have been the end of the problem. But they stiffened up and said, "We aren't going to be told what to do, we run the show here." And I think that is what got them into trouble. I think that is indicative of what their style has been like and I don't think you can get away with that. I don't think a totalitarian mentality can survive in this day and age.

For me I have to read a lot of things in the paper in order to find out a lot of information instead of knowing from the inside. That's made me concerned because when you find out from someone else about programs which have been recorded and shelved that you don't even see, you get concerned.

I have had a running gun battle with administration, part of it is personality but part of it is message. If you go to them they will say "Well its because he is a disgruntled employee who is trying to push the boundaries of our tolerance and live in his own world and do his own thing." But I turn around and say, "I was a good employee until I was discriminated against by this organization." Thereafter I have been in a low level battle with administration because if people push you, you push back.

So I am looking forward to the new guy and starting over with a clean slate. Because if he does have an open mind, we can start from scratch and work from there and he can see the product I'm trying
to put out and can see what I am trying to do because I don't have any selfish motive for doing what I'm doing. I just have an ability to combine an interest in cultural issues with this visual medium (SDPB Producer #1, January 20, 1993).

The New Executive Director Arrives

The new Executive Director arrived on January 25th. One of his first activities was to schedule a general staff meeting for employees at KUSD in Vermillion. The expectation that his management style would be defined by openness and a willingness to listen to everyone and anyone, seemed to prove valid during this meeting on January 28th. About 75 people gathered in the South Dakota Public Television studio.

The meeting started with introductions including everyone in the room involved in describing who they were and what they did at SDPB. The atmosphere was generally relaxed and the use of humor helped define the situation. Following the introductions the Executive Director (ED) attempted to set a tone for discussion.

ED: I guess, what I would do is ... ah tell me what you want to know about me or anything. Go ahead; ask me anything, "How does Superman fly?"

Audience Question (AQ): You're from Indiana, are you a Hoosier fan?

ED: I am probably more of a Notre Dame fan. The "Fighting Irish," all those guys. Did anyone watch An American Experience the other night? Newt Rockney, All American, wasn't it great. I thought it was pretty interesting to watch that. The unfortunate part of An American experience was that WNIT didn't produce anything on the show. That sort of bummed me out, cause we live right there and I wondered what happened. Sometimes as you may know, producers come into town and do things that you don't even know about 'til you see it somewhere. It's happened in a number of places I've worked, and we've wondered, "Why didn't anyone call us?"

But we had a pretty good relationship with Notre Dame. Notre Dame is a pretty good-sized college, the student population is probably no larger than here, but the endowments are rather large and the campus is pretty neat. In fact Notre Dame is one of the only universities I know of that owns a commercial NBC affiliate, WNDE. A very well funded facility and we were real tight with them, worked a lot of neat things, and did co-production and a number of other things. It was a good relationship.

Anyway my background ...? I've been in broadcasting since 1966. If any of you saw Good Morning Vietnam, I did that. That's what I did in 1966 and '67. I was a radio announcer in Armed Forces Radio and Television. Spent some time in Southeast Asia, talking and playing records and having a great time. Then I moved into commercial radio for a while, CBS affiliates in Richmond, Virginia and Pennsylvania and all of those wonderful places. Little jobs, doing everything, everything ... literally.
Then one day I decided I didn't like the way things were getting done, so I started fighting with management and began to realize that the only way I might affect some change in management was to become one of them. And I thought that was a pretty good idea. In fact what happened was my boss told me, "Shut up, if you don't like the way things are being run, get one of your own and run it yourself."

That made some sense, and I started thinking, "That's what I'm going to do, I'm going to try that." Then once I got into management I began to realize how much trouble it really is. It's not the easiest job in the world because you're dealing with so many different personalities, dynamics and problems. But the exciting part has always been that diversity. That's why I like public broadcasting.

Most recently, I wanted to get out of this business, and I took a little hiatus, and I went into the wonderful world of cellular communication. I became the state sales manager for Sentel Cellular Corporation, which is a large company with 44 thousand employees. I managed the sales force and I tried to sell cellular phones. The more I did this ... and the benefits ... I'm telling you we could fund several state networks off of the waste in corporate America. But the more I did it I realized that it wasn't really what I wanted to do, and I missed my public broadcasting family, and decided it was time to get back into it.

And that's sort of how I ended up here in South Dakota. And I'm just beginning to get a feel for what has been happening here, and what we want to do and where we need to go. All indications are that we have a great staff, fairly decent facilities, a lot of potential, a lot of room for growth, and I'm in a honeymoon period right now, so I can say anything I suppose, and we'll be able to measure direction better later on as I get a firmer feel for what's going on.

I'm very open to communication. I am a real big believer in trust and in honesty. Those are the two major things I've learned in the 45 years I've been on this planet to work hard at trying to establish. So I'm going to be up front with everybody, and you can count on that, that I'm not going to pull any strings and I probably ... oh I don't know .. I may say things that not everyone agrees upon. But hey, isn't that what public broadcasting is all about? I mean, think about all of those programs we run which are not the most comfortable situations, but we do it anyway.

So hopefully I'll be able to set up some kind of communication with everybody so there's lots of input, I like input. We're all in this together. That's always been my vision. And as far as organizational charts go and all that, they're necessities and yeah, you live with them, and job descriptions are important, and all of that's wonderful, but I come from an "up the organization" school of management. I don't feel I am any better than anyone else, I'm just the leader of a group right now, and have been fortunate enough to have moved into this position for whatever the reason.

I've heard all kinds of stories about, "Oh boy, we can't wait to get a new guy in South Dakota and
things are going to change." But it isn't going to be me, it's going to be everybody in this room and all over the network that are going to help change us and push us in some direction.

I can't open up heads and change morale, I can't change attitudes. It's all of us working together, and I'm hoping that we're going to have that kind of comradery and team spirit and all of that rah, rah, boom, boom, yeah, yeah, team! stuff that goes on.

So, I don't know, ask me anything.

AQ: What are your experiences and concerns about television?

ED: I have produced and directed a lot of things, and I have executive produced and I'm a real stickler for "look." That's all we have, is our look. People decide who we are ... you know ... people ... the average ... everybody out there in TV land that watches, they don't care about us. I mean you got to think about that, us personally, and I don't mean to sound cynical, but they could care less about what's happening inside this building. All they care about is that when they turn on the TV, what is there is what they said is going to be there and that it is the highest quality we can present. And it today's world, viewers are very sophisticated. That is something that we never used to think about. People used to be amazed with snowy pictures and all of that, but today people don't stand for that. So my efforts have always been to try and create a situation where the organization that we belong to can become a standard, so that people begin to look at that and go, "Wow, those guys know there stuff, they look great." So our "on-air" is totally critical to me, I'll be watching. I think there is some room for improvement in our on-air look, our breaks, how we use our breaks, all of those things.

And I'm not going to make decisions in a vacuum or just say we're changing things, I'm going to expect all kinds of input. I want to work with you and help make that all better. And I think some of you at least have indicated that you feel the same way and that there is some room there. It's just a matter of deciding what we need to do, how we're going to do it, what do we need to do to get there, do we have the money? How innovative can we be? It's surprising what you can do when you put your mind to it. The biggest thing is getting over the frustration of all of the ... of just letting yourself get down about a lot of things. It's easy to get into that rut.

AQ: What is your philosophy of programming in general and local production in particular?

ED: Well programming in general is an easy answer because I believe that public broadcasting has this broad ... broad ... a large effort or goal of trying to present a lot of different things to a lot of different people. And I believe in the philosophy that it is our job to expose viewers to the world around them. It doesn't necessarily reflect our beliefs. You know if we run a program on communism or homosexuality or whatever it might be, doesn't mean I buy into that, doesn't mean that South Dakota Public Television buys into it. What it means is that that's the world around us folks and that's happening and this is a vehicle for you to take a look at stuff and make some decisions. So I like that, I know we're
going to run programming that isn't the most comfortable. And I think that when the phone rings with people saying, "I hate what you're doing," or "I love what you're doing," we are doing are job.

"Local production?" I don't know. That's a good question. I think it depends on what we want to do with it. Who are we serving? The need. What are our reasons for doing local production? Are we altruistic, or is it just a project that someone is really pushing? Does it serve a purpose? Can we afford it? These are questions we need to talk about. It is a tough decision, sitting there trying to decide what to we can afford to do and what makes sense to do. Is there funding? And then you get into the whole question of, "Well yes there is funding," people are coming to you with money. Then you have to decide if you want to do it just for the money. Does it make sense?

AQ: Can you give us an idea of what any outline might be for ... lets say the first one hundred days?

ED: Well obviously you all know better than I some of the things that are sort of bubbling around, and fermenting and growing. House Bill 1123, have you heard of that? That's happening. I don't know what that all means yet, I need to get a handle on that with the powers that be up in Pierre. I guess as I become more comfortable with what is going on, I'm going to try and communicate with all of you about what it all means to us and how it will affect us or if it will affect us. I think what I want to be able to do is to help resolve the negative stuff that might be going on so that we can get on with our business of public broadcasting, radio and television, to make some kind of environment here, working with all of you that will allow us to feel good about what we do and want to keep doing it so we can get better at what we do. How can I do that? What do I need to do? You all probably have a better handle on that then I do. But ... the first hundred days? Hey, am I going to make it that long? (Laughter). But, hopefully will move in a very positive direction ... you know, do we have a morale problem around here? Do we? How many people think we have a morale problem? (Hands rise). Why?

Audience Answer (AA): What you said before, "Trust" and "Honesty."

ED: I want to fix it, I really do? And, you all have to help me to, because I don't want to be stepping on land mines. I don't want to go off doing things and then getting killed for it. I'm going to be counting on you to be giving me direction and input.

What other problems do we have?

AA: "Communication."

"Communication" is a good one. I want to communicate. I hope that some of the initial things that we do, like division head meetings, can all be made available on E-Mail. We'll create a sort of bulletin board, if you will. You all need to know what is going on. Now from time-to-time there will be an executive session that comes up and there are certain things that I'm not going to be able to share with
everybody, but for the most part I don't see in any organization anything that secretive that's going on that people don't need to be aware of.

I mean rumors, you know ... boy, they get started fast when it seems like people are plotting and planning things, so I want to keep communication open, and call me anytime. I'm pretty direct. I'm not afraid to deal with people one-to-one, individually, groups, whatever. I may be wrong ... sometimes, and I'm not afraid to admit that. I'm not perfect. So communication is very important to me. I'll do everything I can to make sure you all know what is going on. And sometimes we are going to run into things that we probably aren't going to be able to change, that I'm not going to be able to change. And then we're going to have to decide whether its worth crying over, fighting over, whatever, or do we get on with it.

There's politics in all of it. People get mad about programming. I mean ... "Tongues Untied," ... I had an underwriter who gives 35 thousand dollars a year write me a letter thanking me for not running that program, and that they would continue to support. It was a controversial thing in our state. And part of the reason it was controversial was because people were not really on top of what was going on with that program. It was a last minute situation. The biggest they had in that state was that most of the people didn't communicate on their own staffs about what as going on with the program. Programming wasn't talking to management, management wasn't talking to programming.

Luckily for us, we communicated and we turned that into a real positive thing for our station, which I think worked out real well. We didn't air it, but we still got a real positive bunch of press out of it and a lot of other things, and I think we handled it pretty well.

AQ: How do you feel about the HB-1123 thing?

ED: I guess we're under the Department of Educational and Cultural Affairs anyway aren't we, and I think this bill is nothing more than finalizing that. Is that true? At least that is the reading I get from it, so I'm not sure it's ... I don't know ... it seems to me ... here is an analogy. Somewhere in the past somebody stabbed the state monster. Somewhere. Opened a wound. It seems that over a few years, people keep sticking sticks in that wound and that monster is starting to look back there and see what that is all about. I'm getting a feel for that. I don't know whether it’s good or bad, but somehow or another we've got to heal that wound, and let the monster go on its way.

What I get from DECA and ETB and everybody at Pierre, is that I can do anything and everything I want within the guidelines of state government. They are going to be counting on me to make those decisions, they aren't going to be making them for me, and that's what they have told me. Now, true, one of the problems that we have that's scary is that the guy who is the secretary is an appointed official, and you know that two years from now he isn't going to be there anymore. And maybe he is a friend of public broadcasting, I don't know, and maybe the next guy that comes in won't be. Who knows? I don't know whether we have any power. Don't get me wrong, I do believe in integrity when it comes to who makes
programming decisions, and I think that lies here, that rests here. And I think that in running our 
operation, that rests here and I want to be involved in the people that work here and who don't work here 
and all of those things. I don't want to be a puppet and I don't think anyone else wants to be a puppet. 
Right? I think we want to do our thing ... and be rewarded for it to the best that we can be and all of that.

AQ: Doesn't it concern you that in giving an appointed official additional power as far 
as this organization is concerned?

ED: Are we giving them additional power?

AQ: Well if it's taking something away from the Board, isn't it placing it somewhere else.

ED: I guess that's what I don't understand yet and I will be trying to get a handle on that 
(SDPB Staff Meeting, January 28, 1993).

While this meeting was constructed as a question and answer session between the new Executive 
Director and his staff, it also included other characteristics. At times it resembled a class lecture or a 
sermon, with the Executive Director expounding on various concepts concerning public broadcasting in 
an attempt to construct knowledge for his new parish.

It also had characteristics of a campaign stump speech including topics which in later meetings 
and conversations he frequently talked about. His concern over SDPB's "look" is an example.

The lecture itself involved an introduction and a re-construction of his professional life, which 
seemed to lend validity to his selection as Executive Director. He also frequently referred to his 
philosophy regarding openness and the importance of communication in the organization. Most 
interesting, at least in retrospect however, may have been his self disclosing comments concerning his 
own stormy relationship with management. "If you don't like the way things are being run, get one of 
your own." It was only a matter of weeks before a number of staff members came to understand the 
poignant meaning of those words.

This session also resembled a pep rally in an attempt to bolster morale following all of the turmoil 
of the last few months. He skillfully referred to each issue which had been effecting the organization 
including HB-1123, Portrait of a Marriage, and SDPB's relationship with ETB and DECA. Yet at the 
same time he claimed to be just the "new guy" with little knowledge of what was really going on, and 
soliciting help in understanding the situation.

The session had a calming and yet and energizing effect on the staff. The hallway conversation 
following the meeting was enthusiastic and upbeat. Assumptions about him being the one to turn the 
orGANIZATION around appeared to have been validated. His expressed willingness to be accessible and to
communicate with everyone about "everything" was accepted at face value.

**The Executive Director's First Three Months**

Between February 1st and May 1st of 1993, a number of developments began to affect dramatic change on the SDPB organization. First of all the 68th legislative session slashed SDPB’s operating budget by $225,000. Later in the same session HB-1123 was re-introduced and passed by both houses of the South Dakota State Legislature. As chapter six pointed out, HB-1123 contains wording which would transfer administrative control of South Dakota Public Broadcasting from ETB to DECA.

A number of individuals including the former Executive Director, the Deputy Executive Director and the Director of Programming feared that this move would further enhance the state's control of SDPB. Both the former Executive Director and the Deputy Executive Director had strenuously fought the provision.

In late March, the Deputy Executive Director and the Director of Programming resigned their positions. In addition the middle manager group, which had been managed by the Deputy Executive Director and included all division heads from Television, Radio, Engineering, Business and Public Information/Development was dissolved. A Management Team headed by the new Executive Director replaced this.

Also about this time, word began to circulate at SDPB that a number of changes were about to take place concerning the focus, organization and location of the television production department. On March 17, the department again met in order to discuss strategic planning. By now however, their perspectives of the new Executive Director had changed from including anticipation and expectation to including perplexity and concern. The March 17th meeting was another attempt for them to construct meaning in the midst of organizational change. Attending was the Production Manager (PM) and four producers, P1, P2, P3, and P4.

PM: This is what I’ve got on the agenda for strategic planning meeting here is, where it’s at now, what's the new message being sent and the changes that we're going to be looking at. Then we'll look at personal working relations. Our future relies on the team.

Goal one: To produce quality television program services that effectively meet the educational, instructional, cultural and informational needs and interests of the people of South Dakota.

Under that is objective A: To serve a broader population through improved program acquisition, scheduling, promotion and services.

Activity One: Television will continue to obtain and use ascertainment information in acquiring
and scheduling programs and services to reach that segment of the population that it would most benefit. The reason I left that in is because we are becoming more service oriented and that incorporates outreach promotion to our projects.

Objective B: To produce programs and services that provide public and private school systems with materials that directly correlates with national and state education goals.

Those kind of go along with what has been my understanding of what the message of the Executive Director has been. And that is to do more programs that we're producing and services for the public school system, with materials that correlate with national and state educational goals. And so we're trying to look more at the goals of other state agencies.

That's about what I've been hearing, anybody heard anything different? You haven't heard anything different?

P2: We haven't heard anything about that.

PM: Does that sound like everyone else has heard?

P4: Um, it still seems to be kind of a gray area as to what we define as service. Whether we're talking in line with the old special projects unit concept of service to other state agencies. In other words, we do in house non-broadcast productions.

PM: No that would be like secondary market use of the product that we produce. We have to look at the after market and how it fits with the educational strength. At least that's what I'm reading. It looks like there should be more of an after market for our product after it hits our air.

P1: Also a determinant to me is, who is going to make the initial contact? Is it every different organization that wants to have something done? Are they going to come to us and all of a sudden we're going to say, "All right, we're going to do it for you." That's the attitude that existed with the special projects group which was a fiasco because they always came and wanted you to do things too cheaply. As compared to, do we make decisions to target certain areas and then approach organizations and say, "You're trying to do this, we'd like to help you."

PM: That's part of the reason for joining with other state agencies that have similar goals as we have, and then trying to use their resources.

P4: Rather than letting them lead and letting them define who we are?

PM: Right, so it's going to take us to find out what the other state agencies are looking at as far as
their mission and goals.

P4: In terms of local production though, I think that we have to, kind of, within the organization, not without, but within the organization we have to lead the other departments, or the other departments will lead us. In other words, if PI becomes a major thing, as a department within public television, we don't want our missions and goals defined by PI. The same is true of PI and management as a whole. We have to define our own.

P1: But who defines that, I mean who makes the decision as to what's the priority and what's important, and what kind of areas we should be getting into?

PM: Well, it was brought up in a meeting not too long ago that the Executive Director had said that we all, as a network get behind a drive such as pre-school education and adult literacy. Well you know, that covers a broad base. But at least it gives us a focus and a direction that we're going to go for the next year or two.

P4: But does it define everything we should be doing? Are we getting narrow focused?

P1: Yeah, I think that is a concern.

P4: I've got a big concern, and I realize that I'm arguing against what could be considered my area but while right now education might be the thing, a few years from now when we have a new governor it might very well be a totally different focus. He may be totally into gambling. I don't know.

PM: Well you've got a good point, but I guess the other things he is looking at is, what are the national goals? And that's the drive right now, the national goals. And those are going to be around for a few years.

P4: Well that's one of the drives. It certainly isn't the overpowering drive that it was under the Bush Administration. Even though he did nothing, it was one of his banners. And part of that same argument is that health care is at least as big as education. So are we going to define ourselves in terms of health care too?
PM: Well when it comes down to it we need to focus on our department and what we do. We need to include what we feel we should be doing. We have to lay it out and say, "This is the way we feel the network should be going."

P1: Yeah, but the reality of it is that we don't ultimately make those decisions.

PM: No, but at least we've got that input. And if we don't, then what are we doing here?

P2: So if we make a suggestion that's a little bit off to the side of what comes down as THE decision, would our decision temper that? I mean we can't gear everything in one area can we, is that a smart thing to do?

P4: That's why I asked the question. Our fundamental driving principle, all of these years, has been that we are an alternative programming system.

PM: But with the alternatives that are out there now days, you know, that's stretching it pretty thin.

P4: Well, there are a lot more vehicles of delivery out there now, but there still is very little alternative programming. And what there is, still is not South Dakota specific. And, the fundamental principle behind all public television systems, from the beginning, has always been to serve our local public first and priority, and that we service them by giving them alternative programming that they cannot get elsewhere, and that includes in a state like South Dakota, giving them opera. That includes in a state like South Dakota, dealing with race issues that deal with Native Americans because that is of most importance. It also includes giving them other minority points of view that they are not exposed to.

PM: That's why the big meeting on April 1st in Sioux Falls is going to be so important because what we hear from the Executive Director will determine the direction we are going.

P4: But are you assuming that we should just let him say where we should go and that's not why we called the meeting.

PM: Well no, I agree, but I have a feeling that he's got a predetermined direction.

P4: Well, yes he does, but he also has his antenna out and he's saying, "Listen folks your part of the equation."

P2: Well the one thing you know is that he wants to align with other state agencies.
PM: Yeah, more of education programs oriented with what DECA's got.

P2: The thing is defining "education." How strict, how narrow, how broad? Because "education" is broader than most people think.

P4: And it’s broader than if you asked DECA.

PM: And I think that when the producers from both Vermillion and Brookings get together in Sioux Falls they will be hashing out the direction we need to be going.

P2: Because the producers should have input in their areas. I mean the Executive Director will make the decision, but he's got to be informed of the areas, because ... you know ... it's just his lack of knowledge on the areas and the people, because South Dakota is a unique state.

P4: I think his intention is to have an open forum discussion with all of the producers, not to tell us where he wants us to go but to get us to tell him where we want to go so, that he can evaluate where he wants to go, where he's being pushed to go, because a lot of this is from outside. Because he is being told which direction to go too like from the Board and different members of the Board.

P4: For instance when I talked one-on-one with the Executive Director he defined "education" much more narrowly than I would. He defined it more along the lines of K through 12 which is basically the way DECA looks at it. And that is not unlike the ETB chair's definition of "educational TV."

PM: And this will be more clearly defined at the April 1st meeting. But my own feeling is that we have to be prepared when we go into that meeting that we know what direction we need to be going as a production department. Like I said before, I here messages coming down ... the writing on the wall, if you want to call it that, is that "education" is going to be the key to the programs that we do whether it be pre-school or adult literacy.

That doesn't mean that we can't do these other projects that we're talking about doing and we also need to get defined what the Executive Director means by "education."

P4: Well he's getting his definition from the Chair of the House Appropriations Committee, he's getting it from DECA, he's getting it from the Board, he's getting it from the governor's office.

PM: Well he keeps coming back with, "The legislature, the legislature, what are we
showing the legislature?" He wants to make sure that what we are doing is visible enough to the legislature to justify why we're around and get the funding.

P4: Right, it all comes down to that.

P1: But the thing about it is that we're losing focus again, and we're allowing people in leadership positions of state government to say, "Here's what should be." But I can guarantee that if we go out into the community and get a grass roots perspective, it will be totally different as to what they want to see from us as compared to what these people at the top want to see from us. Because basically you got people at the top in charge like the DECA secretary and the Chair of the Appropriations Committee who is also a high school principal, all defining "education" in terms of K through 12 and very narrowly.

What we need is either enough money budgeted to an ascertainment study conducted properly or they need to allow the producers who know their areas best to do their jobs.

I talk with people and use gut reaction. As a gate keeper, its part of my responsibility to make those decisions, I mean that's what we are basically. I know saying and I make decisions from there. And then I analyze and study the overall picture in order to develop an agenda for using this medium to affect change, to affect attitudes, to affect feeling, to affect emotions, to push people's buttons, to push them into action, you know ... to call them to action.

P4: You hit the nail on the head. You listen to people. That doesn't mean you go the direction they tell you to go. You listen to them and you incorporate all of these different things together and that's what we're paid to do as producers. And to some extent I'm leery of too much attention being paid to only one or two of the other gate keepers out there; the governor, legislators, or whatever. Yes they control our money, but our viewers are what we're all about.

P1: The fact that I've completely stuck with American Indian issues is plainly because I've felt that that's one of the most critical issues that's going to face this state into the next century. I have firm beliefs in that, strong beliefs, very strong beliefs, and I feel I have the data to back why I feel the way I do.

I think its one of the most critical issues we can get into. We can talk about conflicts of gender and conflicts of other minority issues but they just don't raise the red flags the way a conflict between the Lakota/Dakota people here in this state and the non-Indian people who live in this state and the critical issues that surround it. And so I've basically made a conscious effort to focus and concentrate what small resources I have on this issue.

I fear that if we go any other direction for making production decisions we will lose program production as the center of the network because everything will get too watered down.
P4: That's why we exist. People keep saying, "We have to figure out why we exist." We exist for our product. The product doesn't exist because we exist, we exist because of the product. And he's right we have to get back to production being the center. When Martin Busche started the network we were central to it. But we have become since less important than the Business Office, less important than PI (Public Information), less important than the Program Guide, less important than Operations, and we can't allow that to continue. We have to signal our own value to the network.

PM: That's something that will have to be a main focus, that we have to make sure that we are signaling our value to the network, otherwise if we don't have any value were does that leave us. Nowhere.

And you know, the PBS Signaling Value, you know ... PI was going to come in and give us all the low down ... they sent I don't know how many people from PI down to Arizona last time and did the signaling value thing.

P4: And who went from production?

PM: We didn't hear a damn thing about it. And I still hear bits and pieces and I don't hear any more than that.

P3: The other question that concerns me since that first meeting with the new Executive Director is what he said about us maybe having too many producers. I think that is definitely going to come up at this meeting on April 1st and what are the implications of that?

P4: Yeah, that concerned me a little bit too.

PM: Yeah, I'd like to know too because I don't quite understand what he meant by that other than saying, "Well if that's the case what are you going to do," are you going to reallocate people, are you going to say that we're only going to have so many producers and their just going to be in a pool, doing so many different projects and we're only going to allocate so much money for three or four different projects or what?" I haven't gotten any feedback, have any of you guys heard anything?

P4: No.

P3: He's told another producer outright that there's going to be layoffs. I mean that certainly ...

PM: Well now, I haven't heard that one!
P4: I haven’t heard that one yet either.

P3: Not from him, but I've heard from you know ...

P4: He also did say that there are a lot of rumors floating around ...

P3: Well, no, this producer said that he asked him point blank if there were going to be layoffs and he said, "Yes, there are."

PM: Well I guess I'll go ask him myself just to quell any rumors.

P4: Yeah, and I'm a little curious as to ... you know ... he did say that he wanted to quell any rumors, but I haven't seen so many rumors flying in twenty years.

PM: Well, part of the thing is that he does throw out ideas just to get feedback from everybody else.

P4: I think you hit it on the nose, he does play devil's advocate in order to see where you're at.

P3: But I think that has destroyed my morale, hearing that there's going to be layoffs, you know.

P4: But she raises an important question. Do we have too many producers and if so why? Cause we're not doing enough? Is it because we don't have enough budget to support that many projects? Is it because we don't have enough support staff to keep all those projects afloat for all of those producers? Or is it because as producers we are all on our own agenda?

PM: I think it's all of those things, agendas, support ... the other thing is that there probably are some things we don't need to be doing, like some of the stuff out of Brookings like, well I'm not going to make any hits.

P3: Oh why not?

PM: Ok, On-line is one of them. Midwest Market Analysis, we don't need to be doing Midwest Market Analysis. South Dakota Outdoor Guide, I don't know about that one. What does that have to do with what we are in place to do?

P4: But the political realities keep those shows going.
PM: Well, it's the same thing with the South Dakota Affairs producer, there are a lot of producer positions, do they need to be there? Or do they need to be so well defined that everybody's only doing one thing?

P1: The thing that worries me is that Brookings is the one that right now has too many producers but the mentality is that if Brookings loses one then Vermillion has to lose one. They're the ones that have the problem and they're the ones that are going to have to bite the bullet.

P3: But as the Vermillion staff, that's one of the things that we're going to be fighting against at this meeting.

P4: Well, if at the meeting it goes ... "Ok, we're cutting back to five producers over the network, who's going to take the hit?" No body's going to say ... "Oh, well, go ahead, I'll leave." So everybody's going be justifying what they do. I mean they can justify South Dakota Outdoor Guide by saying, "Well we have lots of viewers."

Ok, but is that justification enough? Then they'll say, "Well it's kind of educational," or "We can make it educational!"

On-line is the same way. Midwest Market Analysis, is all but handed to them on a platter, why do they need a full-time producer designated for it?

P1: Ag Extension is who produces it, we should get completely out of agriculture.

P4: Except here comes the political battle again because as soon as you say, "We're eliminating the Ag producer from the South Dakota Public Television network," you have the number one industry in the state saying, "Like hell you will! You will not eliminate it."

You have the Ag University up there and their president and the whole of Ag Extension and everybody else saying, "You're not going to eliminate that."

P1: But these are questions we need to be ready with.

P4: We also need to be ready to defend our positions in arts, cultural and minority affairs.

PM: That's what is going to happen at this meeting on the first. We're going to have to sit down and take a real hard look at everything, and everybody's going to have to be there to justify why they're there and what they're doing. And so we have to really try to step outside our positions in an
objective sense and say, "Well if you look at Midwest Market Analysis, as a prime example, let the extension people do it, you don't need to be doing it, we don't need to be doing it, let them take care of it." That's one prime example.

P1: Then we better sit down and decide what our plan of attack is going to be, how we as a production unit in Vermillion are going to justify keeping our positions even if Brookings takes a hit (SDPB TV Production Meeting, March 17, 1993).

The Vermillion producers however, never got a chance to sit down and decide what their "plan of attack" was going to be. During the next few days, word came definitively from SDPB management that some major changes were in the works for the way the production units were organized. All work on strategic planning was to stop until network reorganization could be accomplished.

It was virtually certain that most if not all Vermillion producers would be moved to Brookings where what was coming to be defined as "external production" was to be located. External production was described as local program production while "internal production" which was to be located in Vermillion was described as anything related to promotion, development and fundraising.

Vermillion producers seemed demoralized and appeared unable to respond to the impending development. For them it was a debilitating prospect because many of their program oriented resources existed in Vermillion. They looked upon such reorganization as destructive to the programs which they produced. They thus came to the April 1st meeting in Sioux Falls in a somewhat disillusioned condition. On the one hand they had believed the new Executive Director when he had told them many times that he would listen to them, respect their opinions and wanted them to be a part of the decision-making process in the network. On the other, they felt as if they were even farther removed from decision-making processes then they were before.

Before the meeting in Sioux Falls, one producer expressed a newly developed perspective of the Executive Director. "I've pretty much said all I'm going to say to him. I don't think he cares one bit about minority or cultural affairs. I don't think he has been truthful with us" (SDPB Producer, Interview, April 1, 1993).

The April 1st meeting was held at the downtown Holiday Inn, in Sioux Falls, a midway point between Vermillion and Brookings. The conference room chosen for the meeting was organized with tables in a U shape. In somewhat symbolic, if not predictable fashion, the Vermillion and Brookings producers sat opposite from one-another, with the newly formed SDPB Management Team at the connecting table.

The Executive Director began the discussion, explaining that the day would be structured so that the morning session would be generally devoted to the network reorganization plan while the afternoon
session would be dedicated to a discussion about programming.

The Sioux Falls Meeting

What we're looking at today is major change, philosophically, structurally and everything else in re-shaping what South Dakota Public Broadcasting is in this state. This is not just a cosmetic, minor thing that we're talking about. We're talking about everything in this network is under a microscope, and I think it should be after all of these years. We're looking at how best to use the resources that we have, the people that we have, and all of it to serve the people of South Dakota to provide them with programming.

Now there are a lot of different factors involved in this. Obviously some of the factors are state government and state funding. Two hundred and twenty five thousand dollars is being cut out of the 1994 budget. Can we get it back for fiscal year '95? Possibly. I talked to the people in Pierre and they say that once we get reorganized and everything is functioning well we might be able to make the case to see that funding come back, who knows?

On the other hand, just look around you at the world we live in and what's going on in this country today and what's going on in state public broadcasting networks, what's going on in the corporate world. This morning we're reading about the airlines laying off 30,000 people. They're talking about restructuring all over this country in corporate America. Colleges are restructuring, medical institutions are restructuring, everything, its a changing environment. I think we're going to be seeing more and more diminishing funding for state agencies and state resources as well as the battle that we're constantly fighting at the federal level.

What it means, ladies and gentlemen, is that we're living in a changing, dynamic world that will impact all of us. It's not business as usual and nothing will be the same. Everything is changing. I've always been a proponent of change and I've never feared it and have never thought it was a negative thing and under the right direction, change can be very beneficial.

I can't guarantee that everyone at SDPB will be employed by SDPB. There may be circumstances due to budget cuts that cause us to reduce our staff. The $225,000 ... yeah its operations but again be realistic as to what that means.

Obviously the state is looking at cutting operating budgets because politically and everything else they don't want to get into that whole fight with personnel. But what they're doing is laying it on us, because if they take your operating money away then one has to say, "What are we going to do with these people?" You need to be aware of what can happen.

Who's to say that in 1995 we don't see another budget cut, who's to say that the legislators don't
push the privatization thing even further? What happens if they say, "SDPB needs to reduce its funding by ten percent, you guys figure out how you're going to do that."

All of this is a monumental dilemma and a monumental management task to bring about this change. So my approach has been to create a Management Team, a new structure. You know who the players are in that structure. And you have to understand, and you have to trust, and you have to believe that group of people isn't sitting around a table just throwing out wild ideas and crazy thoughts. There's a lot of discussion and viewpoints and thinking and deliberation that goes into trying to set direction.

One of the big problems has been two locations for primary staffing and production. There has always been this Brookings and Vermillion thing going on. I've been thinking that maybe we can find one place to consolidate, maybe Sioux Falls? Whatever. But I don't see that as a short-term thing given the fact that we're seeing our funds being reduced. So I see consolidation as a long-term thing with a lot of other players needing to be involved.

But for the short term how do we resolve our problem between Brookings and Vermillion? The problem seems to be that we have a group of people charged with doing programming in two locations. So as I begin to think about this it began to make sense that if we're going to live with two locations, then maybe those locations would be charged with certain very defined goals and duties.

So, we have a network operations center, and that network operations center has all of our on-air, development and all of that, and that group of people is responsible for those tasks under a manager that can drive itself and do its thing.

Then, as one management team member calls it, our external side, will be the actual television production that gets done. That's the goal of the other side, the Brookings side. That group of people is driven by doing quality production, based upon the kind of things we've been talking about ... education, children, community as part of our mission.

The problem with all of that is that it does mean that people may have to move. It does make it likely that people will have to move from Vermillion to Brookings or from Brookings to Vermillion. The fact of the matter is that we haven't determined who those people are, who the players are going to be or any of that. We're just looking at this from the broad viewpoint that this makes sense. So that is how we have gotten to where we are (SDPB Staff Meeting, April 1, 1993).

This lecture on the part of the Executive Director also contained a number of elements which he mentioned over and over again during the rest of the day and in one-on-one conversations elsewhere. Some of the key terms used during the day were "reorganization", "on-air look", "seamless programming", "players", and "teamwork". In addition, the Executive Director consistently repeated
the necessity of using the new CPB programming goals identified as education, children and community.

He attempted to lead both a pep rally and a revival meeting. He chastened people for being critical of the management team concept and gave a mild tongue lashing for what he called "off color comments" about the reorganization. On occasion he lapsed into an "I'm just the new guy" or "I'm just one person" speech wherein he begged for their help and assistance to get the job done.

For the first time in public, he mentioned the term "privatization" in connection with the recent legislative decision to cut $225,000 from the network's budget. He made the connection that danger existed in showing that they could raise the deficit through other ways such as by corporate support. It might then be assumed that the network could do quite well without state support on a permanent basis.

The Executive Director then turned the rest of the time over to the Management Team members (MTM's). They included the Director of Development and Marketing, the Director of Engineering and Technical Services, the Business Manager, the Director of Radio Broadcasting, the Network Production Manager, and the new Director of Television Programming. Each in turn gave a summary of their vision for the area which they supervised. Occasionally the Executive Director interjected commentary in order to clarify certain points.

On occasion the term "signaling value" was used. It refers to a marketing program promoted by PBS and patterned after various advertising strategies used in the corporate world hinging primarily on promotion of a particular image based upon a specialized positioning statement.

"Institutional positioning is creating a strategic identity. It means differentiating your station from others in your market, from other community services or institutions, and in the mind of your viewers and members. Chevron provides a good example of an organization that adopted a strategic communication program when it began a long-term institutional positioning effort to combat a strong negative image (PBS, 1992, 9,10).

After each MTM's presentation the Executive Director offered additional commentary or asked for questions about what the MTM had said. A number of individuals did ask questions. The Vermillion producers were present but silent, except during the Network Production Manager's (NPM) presentation wherein he further explained his vision regarding the dichotomy between external and internal production and the potential personnel moves involved.

P4: How long a term are these changes for? You're saying, "We'll determine what programming we need to do and then we'll move people to accommodate that." What happens next year when and if your priorities change? How permanent is this structural change?

NPM: I've come to the realization in the last three weeks, and I think the rest of the
management team has that there ain't nothing permanent anymore.

P4: So we can look forward to selling houses and moving every year?

NPM: I've come to the realization that whatever ... something may happen next year that will totally change my life and I have to either accept it or move away and do something else.

This meeting appeared to be a pivotal point for a number of reasons. Not only were things like "privatization" contextualized but also a management style using language such as "either accept the change or move on" began to be articulated. Following the Network Production Manager's presentation, the Executive Director offered support for the perspective. "I came to Vermillion, bought a house, put money down, nobody paid for that. I don't have any guarantees. It goes with my territory, I have to accept that." This style seemed to gain momentum with this meeting and came to be more clearly defined later in the month of April.

In addition, the Vermillion producers expressed concern that they had not been represented on the Management Team.

P4: What about in terms of input? You indicated that most of your input in terms of production came from the Network Production Manager. But he's been 120 miles away (in Brookings) and this is no reflection on him, but he had his shop up there to run and I don't see where the Management Team has gotten a whole lot of input from Vermillion production. I don't see how we could have been represented fairly.

A number of MTM's attempted to defend the contention that Vermillion production had been fairly represented and that many of them had articulated concerns for Vermillion producers. MTM's insisted that they were taking a holistic approach to management as opposed to carving out territories within the network. Following the Executive Director's (ED) lead some of them began indicating that these changes were hurting them as much as they were hurting everyone else.

MTM1: We don't want to jack you around. We're trying to be sensitive about it and it hurts us too. And I know it’s easier to say, "Well you don't have to move, so it’s easier for you." Yeah, we're making changes in how we do business.

ED: I think it’s important that we understand that this hasn't been comfortable for anybody on the staff. If you think that as Executive Director this is a comfortable situation ... you're wrong. I'm charged with making changes, setting direction and trying to do that. This isn't easy. It's April Fools maybe we should call the old Executive Director and have him come in and give us some counseling. Come on guys, something has to be done and I'm trying to do it. It may not be the most comfortable approach, but I believe it’s going to work. I can't please everybody.
When I have to sit down with any employee and tell them that, "Due to these circumstances you're no longer needed," that's not fun. You want to do that. When we have to sit down and make hard decisions you have to make hard decisions too. But it’s life choices. That's what it gets into ... life choices.

This generally concluded the morning session. The afternoon session consisted of a discussion of programming goals based primarily upon the new CPB study involving education, children and community. The Network Production Manager (NPM) took a position at the front of the group with three flip charts available; one for education, one for children and one for community.

The group then began suggesting topics for potential programs relevant to each category while the NPM wrote them down for everyone to see. The stated assumption was, "At this point, no idea is a bad idea."

Numerous topics were suggested throughout the afternoon. In the "Education" category for instance, some topics included ready-to-learn, drug awareness, literacy, GED, continuing education, vocational education, day care, elderly ... Under the "Children" category some topics included health, youth at risk, teen pregnancy, addictions, nutrition, government, self esteem, parenting ... For the "Community" category, a number of topics included health, addictions nutrition, day care, elderly care, economic development, patenting, resources, racism, lifestyles, women's issues, violence, domestic abuse, poverty, taxes, AIDS ...

After about an hour one producer suggested that the group consider the relevance of the topics listed.

It seems to me that what we're doing is just making a list of all the social ills of America, and I'm not quite sure where this is going in terms of productions. I mean we could sit here all afternoon and talk about all the bad things that are going on in America ... you know, and all of our social problems. I'm not sure what that means to us in terms of making programs.

ED: Yeah, I know I have been sitting here thinking too that we could list lots of things but I think it's a good exercise. I keep thinking that I can't believe that there are not a lot of people or agencies in this state that have picked out a lot of reasons and are trying to make some kind of difference and that's where I see part of our collaboration with other agencies.

Because then what we're doing is we're building partnerships so that when state funding comes around, and other things come around, not only do you have your viewers and members supporting public broadcasting but you have other agencies saying, "No you gotta keep them in place because
they're very important to our mission."

Another producer, however took issue with the breadth of the exercise and attempted to inject another perspective about the way program production choices should be conducted for public broadcasting.

P1: What we're doing is venturing into the development of propaganda. Basically you take an issue, make your message simple and pound the hell out of it, into the people's minds, that's how you change attitudes. That's how its always been done in warfare, that's how its always been done in advertising. Making a simple message and continuing the process of always constantly bombarding people with that message until after awhile they'll begin to believe it.

Yeah there's a lot of stuff up here but I think we've got to boil it down to the critical issues that matter to life.

I've been talking to tribal elders for an awful long time. Men who are connected with the natural law, with the natural world and the messages that are being spoken. There are certain things in place and decisions must be made about what direction we need to go. As an organization we must decide, What ... are ... THE ... critical ... issues that are going to make the difference. We can't deal with everything, there's no way. So we have to decide what are the critical issues and where are they going.

ED: How do you narrow it down?

P1: You've got to look at the things that are going to affect the world, our world ... the things that are critical. Water is critical, you have to live. Peace of mind is critical, we can't be at each other's throats. I would propose two issues of very high priority. One is racism and the other is natural resources especially water.

Because when you look at South Dakota, North Dakota and Montana; some of you have listened to this story, I'll lay it out again. What happens? How come water development hasn't happened? Because of money, from D.C. for big time projects. When New York and Chicago began to use their water up and the numbers began to make a difference then the money will be there.

What we have to do is to educate our society about regionalism because that's what it's all going to be about. People sit here and think that the ideals of America will temper things like are going on in Bosnia and various other places around the world. It's not. It won't. It's just a matter of time. It's just a matter of time.

Like I said before, I've been talking to tribal elders for a long time, people who I believe have insight and connection to what's going on. And what they're saying is that the number one issue, the
number one issue, not only in the Indian community, but community wide is that we have to learn respect for each other, and respect for the mother earth. And unless we begin to adopt those sorts of principles and begin to adopt those sort of ideals and begin to work towards those ideals, it’s inevitable that we're going to end up on the rocks.

We can go one course or another, but we've got to make a determination and that's where we come in. I've got my ideas about what is important. For me self-esteem and alcoholism are the two critical issues in the community. How do you build up self-esteem, make them believe in themselves, make them feel some self worth in what they do in the culture, their language, their spirituality.

Alcoholism is a driving force and a Catch-22. No one will become part of a community while they are unstable and until they get off of alcohol and drugs.

Right now the average age of an Indian person is 18.5. The average age of the non-Indian person is 35.5. The non-Indian population is leaving the state and getting older. The Indian population is getting bigger and staying younger with more children and a more rapid rate. The problem within that context is that in 27 years the Lakota culture, the Lakota people will represent 33 percent of the population of this state. And out of that 33 percent, 10 percent will be highly affected by fetal alcohol syndrome. It costs between 2 and 3 million dollars per person from childhood to death. Who's going to pay for that? We are. That's why I see alcoholism as one of the most critical issues facing this state.

And, I've decided that that's what I'm going to attack because it's time that we as Indian people face up to that issue. Not a lot of people are going to. Some of you have read my script for Pine Ridge Lullaby. It's getting a lot of mixed reviews. A lot of people like it. A lot of people don't want to talk about it. The bottom line is that the people who are in control of the political mechanisms say its time we declare war on this thing but nobody wants to. Since they all have to live in that society, no one wants to take action.

I have chosen to. You know what I've been told? "Get a gun." That's what I've been told. But I've chosen to take this on anyhow. And that's what we all have to do. Make a decision about what we're going to do and how we're going to do it. If we're going to commit to it, where are we going with it? How are we going to do it? In the past we take one issue and play with it for a while and then we drop it. It doesn't make changes. It influences a few people, but it really doesn't make a change. If we're going to make solid change, pick an issue and pound the hell out of it.

NPM: The other part of that is to make them watch. We can put all of the stuff we want on that TV and they're not going to watch.

P2: They'll watch.
P4: Well if all we're worried about is that they tune in and say, "Wow, that was a good documentary!" that doesn't do any good because there is no participation, no actors involved. There has to be participation. It means getting people to sit down and talk. It means getting people to sit down and say, "By golly, racism doesn't exist only in Sturgis, it exists right here in the oldest university community in the state."

P1: And you have to get them to understand the ramifications. That's why a program like Buffalo Nation Journal is so effective because I'm taking Ph.D's from the Indian community and people who are doctors, lawyers, professional people from the Indian community and giving them a voice and letting people see what the Indian community is all about. People begin to see that Indians are not all welfare drunks and that's what it's all about.

P5: The thing is, it's trendy right now to talk about social issues and things like what a jerk Christopher Columbus was. And we're talking about all of these social issues. Well the CPB sits down and says we'll we have all of this stuff for kids and education and you look at the PBS rundown and you see Nature and you see Nova and you see Mystery and you see Masterpiece Theatre and you see all of these other programs and every once in a while they'll throw in a show about some social issue.

And we're sitting, talking about doing shows about all of these social changes and we're talking about trying to get viewers. Well, you're not going to get viewers to watch by running programs about alcoholism. You might be able to get some people to watch but in general the Executive Director is saying that he wants to have an audience.

ED: The problem is that if we look at this in the context of this idea of privatization. If we look at all of the money we make in underwriting and membership and however many hundreds of thousands of dollars, what is it ... a million bucks a year? That million dollars a year, why are we getting that money?

A: From people who enjoy the programs.

ED: What programs?

A: We might be presenting Lawrence Welk to a lot of influential people.

ED: I would venture to say that the number one reason people are funding South Dakota Public Broadcasting with their own money and the tax dollars of this state ... First of all I think we can all agree that we receive our state appropriation for a number of reasons but the number one reason is that we do a Statehouse program.

I think that legislators are our biggest underwriters to the tune of about three million dollars a
year. Now there's other things they believe in that we're doing; education and all of that, but probably high on their list is that we're providing this statehouse service. So there's three million bucks that comes in, not because we're doing anything but a local show that doesn't deal with any of these issues. Then, when you start looking at the money that comes in from underwriters, they're very program specific, yeah, McNeil/Lehrer, yeah this, yeah that, the other thing. They'll underwrite and give money if they like it. And then the members. There are a variety of reasons, but the number one reason is their favorite program. And that favorite program could be Mystery, Masterpiece Theatre, Sesame Street, the children's block, it's all national stuff.

Then, inside of that feeling of giving us money they might say, "Well, I think it's nice that you do local programming or that you're ours, that you're South Dakota Public Broadcasting."

What I'm saying is that if we were going to go out and say "We do all of these local programs about all of these issues," and if we were to support ourselves on this and try to find funding, we wouldn't be able to sell any of it. So the question becomes, if we weren't doing any local programming, how much money would we lose?

We have to realize the politics involved in all of this. What if we all decide that we shouldn't be doing Statehouse, that we should be doing something else. If we sit here like a group of adults and professionals and say, "That show is really not doing much for us," we've all agreed now that we are going to take those resources and produce THIS show which we think will have a bigger impact on the state of South Dakota ... what's going to happen reality wise?

We're probably going to lose funding (SDPB Staff Meeting, April 1, 1993).

Shortly after this, the meeting ended. Some individuals expressed the opinion that they had learned a great deal. The group generally agreed to consider what had been discussed in terms of the topics listed. In the near future, program proposals would be considered with a hope that this discussion would prove fruitful in determining a focus for both local program production and programming in general.

The Vermillion producers, who were responsible for Cultural Affairs, Minority Affairs and Instructional Television programming, and who had been the most vocal in articulating concerns about network reorganization were ambivalent about the meeting's meaning. They said they feared a move for them would compromise the momentum of their programs since many of their resources existed in the Vermillion area.

In retrospect, the network producers who had been most critical of the new network organizational plan and direction, had produced the most controversial programming and had articulated a definition of "educational programming" in terms of diversity rather than traditional K through 12, were the ones which were being asked to uproot their lives.
The Management Team meeting ended and the Executive Director and Network Production Manager left to tell the producers "the way it was going to be." The Vermillion producers who were responsible for Minority Affairs, Cultural Affairs and Instructional Television productions were essentially given the choices of moving or leaving the network.

A new Management Team policy regarding the definition of producer duties in terms of specialties was established. Producer duties were longer be defined in terms of such categories as "Minority Affairs" or "Cultural Affairs." Rather they simply became known as "producers" for South Dakota Public Broadcasting and described as "generalists."

Expressing dissatisfaction with the decisions made and the direction the network took, the current Minority Affairs producer said, "Its another example of non-Indian people making decisions on what they are going to give them."

Summary

This article discusses the discursive behavior of South Dakota Public Broadcasting managers and producers in the context of organizational change. It allows them to tell their stories that include dealing with conflict, contradiction and struggle while the world around them is undergoing transition.

This story encompasses many facets of a large statewide network affected by legislators, state agencies such as DECA, the Educational Telecommunications Board, SDPB managers and producers, and members of the public. It is thus a complex saga with many "players."

It also provides a glimpse of some of the interaction and speech act behavior of individuals involved. During departmental meetings, general staff meetings, ETB meetings involving both Board members and members of the public, interviews and hallway conversation, it is possible to gain a partial understanding of the complexities, the emotions, the dilemmas and the conflict imposed by the steering mechanisms of money and power which affect the human condition and the lifeworld.

This was not a pleasant experience for many employees of the network. But it occurred for reasons related to historical developments, to structure and to steering mechanisms. It was affected by action which may not be communicative in nature, for such action has apparently forced them to construct meaning for their lives in less than democratic contexts. As a result, this affected program production at South Dakota Public Broadcasting.

Essentially, producers of the system were forced to make choices which they opposed for philosophical reasons and to which they had very little if any genuine input. At the same time, by
articulating opposition they were being defined as less than "team players", and the productions they developed, less than appropriate for SDPB.

The "team" metaphor which was used over and over again as in: "Management Team," "team player," "I'm here, and I'm playing and I'm playing hard," "play by the rules," among others; was being used to define individuals who were conforming to certain ideals but which still may have had very little to say about diversity and democracy, the very ideals upon which public broadcasting was founded.

The final article in this series, to be published at a later date, will apply the concepts of Universal Pragmatics including communicatives, representatives, regulatives and constatives and their four respective validity claims: comprehensibility, truthfulness, appropriateness and truth (Schlenker, 484) to the speech acts of SDPB managers and producers detailed in this current work. It will provide further understanding of the steering mechanisms involved and either the facilitation or lack of facilitation of the ideal speech situation for employees at South Dakota Public Broadcasting and consequently, also for the people of South Dakota.
References

- Gambill, N. "Public TV is Failing Viewers," Argus Leader, November 7, 1992, 1-B.
- Hepner, R. "Viewers Can Select TV Shows," Argus Leader, August 7, 1992, 10A.
- Schlenker, G. “Universal Pragmatics as a Methodology for Analyzing Institutional Cultures.”

- SDPB Staff Meeting. April 1, 1993.
- SDPB TV Production Strategic Planning Meeting, March 17, 1993.
‘Men Who Hate Women’: Masculinities, Violence and the Gender Politics of Nordic Noir

Katy Shaw
Leeds Beckett University, UK

Abstract

Gender politics is at the heart of what crime novelist Hakan Nesser called ‘the strange genre of Nordic Noir’ (quoted in Foreshaw 2012: Preface), a contemporary body of writings with historical roots in a heavy political subtext that betrays a wider dissatisfaction with both the demise of the welfare state and the ideal of post-war utopianism in contemporary Scandinavia. Steig Larsson's The Girl With The Dragon Tattoo (2005) quickly became regarded as a key example of the emerging new genre of Nordic Noir and one of the biggest global publishing phenomena of the twenty-first century. As a result of its popular female protagonist, Lisbeth Salander and section headings featuring damning statistical data about male violence against women in Sweden, the novel has been celebrated as a vessel for Larsson’s ‘deep feminist sympathies’ (Whitelaw 2010).

Challenging claims that the novel offers a vision of female empowerment, this article instead suggests that Larsson uses his first fiction, and the wider Millennium Trilogy of which it is a part, to create and cull female characters using the men who ‘hate’ them as representations of the competing tensions between masculinity and violence in the new genre of Nordic Noir. Nordic Noir is the product of claustrophobia, of small countries in the midst of population crises, frustrated at a lack of safety promised in the post-war years and experiencing a growing lack of faith in the authorities governing them. This article suggests that beneath popular imaginaries of seemingly peaceful and equal societies, Nordic Noir exposes violent masculine authority as an expression of the relationship between the individual and the neoliberal state in the twenty-first century.

Keywords: Nordic Noir, Gender, Politics, Genre Fiction, Steig Larsson.
Gender politics is at the heart of what crime novelist Hakan Nesser called ‘the strange genre of Nordic Noir’ (quoted in Foreshaw 2012: Preface), a contemporary body of writings with historical roots in a heavy political subtext that betrays a wider dissatisfaction with both the demise of the welfare state and the ideal of post-war utopianism in contemporary Scandinavia. Steig Larsson’s *The Girl With The Dragon Tattoo* (2005) quickly became regarded as a key example of the emerging new genre of Nordic Noir and one of the biggest global publishing phenomena of the twenty-first century. As a result of its popular female protagonist, Lisbeth Salander and section headings featuring damning statistical data about male violence against women in Sweden, the novel has been celebrated as a vessel for Larsson’s ‘deep feminist sympathies’ (Whitelaw 2010).

Challenging claims that the novel offers a vision of female empowerment, this article instead suggests that Larsson uses his first fiction, and the wider Millennium Trilogy of which it is a part, to create and cull female characters using the men who ‘hate’ them as representations of the competing tensions between masculinity and violence in the new genre of Nordic Noir. Nordic Noir is the product of claustrophobia, of small countries in the midst of population crises, frustrated at a lack of safety promised in the post-war years and experiencing a growing lack of faith in the authorities governing them. This article suggests that beneath popular imaginaries of seemingly peaceful and equal societies, Nordic Noir exposes violent masculine authority as an expression of the relationship between the individual and the neoliberal state in the twenty-first century.

Concerned with reframing Scandinavia in the eyes of the post-millennial world, Steig Larsson’s first fiction is set in Sweden. In 2007, Sweden was ‘named as best practising democracy by *The Economist*, the least corrupt nation by Transparency International, most equal in gender relations by the World Economic Forum, and most generous donor of overseas development aid by the OECD’ (Armstrong 2010). With a lower suicide rate than France, Germany, Australia and New Zealand it appeared to be the pinnacle of national perfection. As one of the most highly developed welfare states anywhere in world, with comprehensive access to health care and education, free trade and 80% of the work force in trade unions, Sweden tops league tables for social welfare ahead of much wealthier countries like America. Significantly, the Global Gender Gap Report in 2006 rated Sweden number one in the world for gender equality. However, Sweden also enjoys above average crime rates for assault, sexual assault, hate crime and fraud. Although Scandinavian countries like Sweden seemed to be living the dream on paper, Nordic Noir is suggestive of a very different reality on the ground. As novelist Henning Mankell commented, ‘our system of justice doesn’t work, democracy is doomed. I think we are worried about that, so maybe that is why detective stories are so popular in Sweden [...] Until recently it was a very cold, isolated culture. Our art can’t bring about social change, but you cannot have social change without arts’ (Armstrong 2010).

Politics lie at the heart of Nordic Noir, whose historical roots lie in the landscape of the countries it represents. Debunking images of Sweden as a social paradise, Nordic Noir instead interrogates a wider loss of faith in the police and masculine authority to solve crime. The murder of the Swedish Prime Minister in 1986 – a crime for which no one has ever been successfully charged - marked the end of a humanist and controlled society, the encroachment of arbitrary brutality and a
realisation that the country was not hermetically sealed from global influences. From this point onwards, the troubles of the rest of the world flooded into Sweden with new waves of immigration threatening a formerly homogeneous society. Generating insecurity about the fate of country, these fears lie in the criminal and so appear in the crime genre. Concerned with a veritable Pandora’s box of transgression, Nordic Noir expresses a wider national anxiety through the microcosm of novels and their characters. As Ibsen reminded us many years prior to the rise of Nordic Noir, social situations can create outcasts who can act violently. Reflecting on changes to the social, economic and political landscape, Nordic Noir counters images of blondes, Ikea and the midnight sun with sexual violence, a Nazi past and a corrupt corporate present.

In Nordic Noir, collective conflict can be understood through the individual. Larsson’s novel offers a highly critical view of gender and identity by engaging with affairs of the state, as well as the heart. In Nordic Noir the state is not peaceful or egalitarian and in Larsson’s work in particular there is something profoundly rotten in the state of Sweden. Functioning as a reflector on the rise and fall of the welfare state, Nordic Noir bears a debt to the golden age of British crime fiction as well as the hard boiled US tradition. With an emphasis on social realism and critique, trauma is mirrored in the landscape of novels that use crime as a means to reflect upon the state and society. Populated by masculine authority figures who are exploitative, violent, and aligned with a politically inspired notion of critique, Larsson focuses on excluded and marginalised women to offer the relationship between masculinity and violence as a prism through which to view contemporary neoliberal life.

Vanessa Thorpe reflects that ‘crime fiction, it is clear, has now overtaken Abba and flat-pack furniture as the most influential Scandinavian export’ (2010). Reflecting on internationalism and the crime genre, Zizek argues that ‘main effect of globalisation on the detective fiction is discernible in its dialectical counterpart: the powerful re-emergence of a specific locale as the story’s setting’ (2005). The force of the settings from which Nordic Noir takes its name is key to the success of these novels which are set in wealthy and seemingly harmonious countries – a so-called ‘soft society’ according to Nesbo – where a cradle-to-grave welfare system provides a false sense of security and hides a dark underside.

_The Girl With The Dragon Tattoo_ is both a good example of this new genre of Nordic Noir, a first fiction for its author Steig Larsson and the first part of the _Millennium Trilogy_. Book one offers an orthodox crime novel with a self-contained mystery. Number two is a police thriller and number three is a political thriller. While plotting improves throughout the trilogy, the first novel tries to encompass many sprawling plots centred around a genealogical tale of five generations of the Vanger family. Spanning several continents, the first novel bears the influence of both English and American crime fiction and situates its story in real Swedish towns – a classic marker of Nordic Noir. _The Girl with the Dragon Tattoo_, begins with Mikael Blomqvist, crusading financial hack and part-owner of 'Millennium' magazine, facing life after losing a libel action against a leading industrialist. With his reputation shredded and being personally liable for damages, the opportunity for Blomqvist to lick his wounds and earn some cash comes in the form of an offer from a former lion of Swedish industry, Henrik Vanger, who invites him to his isolated home in Sweden's northern lake district to solve the mystery of the disappearance of Harriet, his 16-year-old niece, from the
family's private island some 40 years previously. Vanger is obsessed by the thought that she was murdered by a member of his family even though nobody was ever found and no one saw her leave. Blomqvist finds himself in the middle of a much wider and more serious mystery as his investigation intersects with fundamental tenants of contemporary Swedish politics and economics. Aided by Lisbeth Salander, a computer hacker and social misfit, the pair attempt to restore justice.

Nordic Noir novels exhibit a degree of topicality that few could have anticipated in advance of the genre’s development. Larsson’s first fiction, The Girl With The Dragon Tattoo, was published in the UK in September 2008, the same week that Lehman Brothers collapsed. Casting bankers and industrialists as villains, his plots and characters hold a mirror to contemporary Swedish society, revealing a deep mistrust of government, the promotion of profound individualism and a celebration of the ethics of journalism. Sweden is not all about Volvo, Abba and Ikea, and as such Nordic Noir sets out to re-imagine the country. Encouraging a move away from images of a bland land where the sun never sets and paternity leave is endless, Nordic Noir rips this facia apart to reveal an underworld of violence, sex and corruption across men in business, law enforcement and the secret services. Reframing ideas about violence and masculinity against the experiences reality of these ideals, it explores their manifestation in debates about welfare state retrenchment, the rise of neoliberalism, and corruption in corporate practice. In this novel the Vanger corporation stands as a model for the decline of old models of masculinity and previous Swedish ways of conducting business. With its old men and declining health, the novel makes clear that the Vanger corporation must open itself to globalisation in order to survive.

Sex trafficking and immigration were prominent in the Swedish headlines at time Larsson was writing and Sweden’s past social-democratic consensus was beginning to show signs of tension. The ‘Sjobo Debate’ which broke out in the late 1980s and early 1990s attempted to tackles increased immigration that had pushed up unemployment as the number of asylum seekers soared and a backlash began from local governments under pressure to take them. This culminated in the city of Sjobo taking a vote against accepting any more immigrants. Subsequent political debate led to the Aliens Act of 1989 which produced a combined immigration and integration system. 2009 saw an immigration high of over 100,000 people in a year coming to live in Sweden (the biggest groups coming from the former Yugoslavia and Iraq) and by 2010 14.3% of the population were born outside Sweden according to Eurostat. Nearly a fifth of the Swedish population is either foreign born or a child of two foreign born parents. In Larsson’s novel, Dragan Armansky is the most prominent example of successful immigration. Born in Croatia to immigrant parents, he builds a successful business and contributes towards his new country. But tellingly, there are no successful female immigrants in Larsson’s text. Immigration is a hot topic in Nordic Noir, a new genre which is as concerned with the threat from the outside other, as it is from the disgruntled native.

In an early email to his editor Eva Gedin, Steig Larsson asserted that his first fiction much be ‘called Men Who Hate Women’ since it is ‘also the theme of the novels’. While this title was only retained by the Swedish version of the text – the other foreign versions opting for the more commercial and less political The Girl With The Dragon Tattoo – Larsson’s original wish foregrounds gender relations as being central to the plot of the novel. Discussing his construction of characters in the same email, Larsson told his editor he had ‘deliberately changed the sex roles [...]
in many ways Blomkvist acts like a typical “bimbo”, while Lisbeth Salander has stereotypical “male” characteristics and values’ (quoted in Johnson 2010). Setting gender laws and ideals against the reality of his characters life experiences in twenty-first century Swedish society, Larsson uses crime fiction to conduct a fictional exploration of the men who hate women.

The reality for women in the fictional world of Steig Larsson is that, despite the laws and advances of twenty-first century Sweden, they cannot have it all. His female characters must choose between motherhood and professional success, a relationship or a fulfilling sex life. In a novel containing numerous examples of women who are subject to sustained physical, psychological, linguistic, legal and economic abuse, gender becomes a key factor in power struggles which usually resort to violence and rape as means of revenge and justice. Suggestive of a wider system of violence against women in covert ways across all sectors of society, sexual violence becomes a mechanism in Larsson’s work. The novel prefaces each of its sections with a statistic about violence against women in Sweden (including the claim in its opening epigraph that ‘18 per cent of the women in Sweden have at one time been threatened by a man’). Yet the novel has been criticised for its conservative gender paradigms. Harriet Vanger is the only model of motherhood offered by the text which is not dysfunctional but even she is forced to flee to Australia to set up her own business (the Cochran Corporation) which cannot flourish under a sexually abuse father and a socially abusive Swedish corporate structure. There is a marked absence of a successful female immigrant in the novel and the traditional ideal seems to be staunchly Scandinavian. As security head Dragan Armansky reflects, ‘The women he was usually attracted to were blond and curvaceous, with full lips that aroused his fantasies. And besides, he had been married for twenty years to a Finnish woman named Ritva who still more than satisfied these requirements’ (36).

Larsson’s women together constitute the ultimate male fantasy, a smorgasboard variety pack of womanhood it all its various forms. Larsson’s most powerful women usually end up in bed with his protagonist Blomkvist. Erika Berger – an upper middle class, international Swedish-Belgian, lives in posh suburb of Stockholm and has a sexy and classic appearance and non-conventional sexuality (she sleeps with both Blomkvist and her husband who is bisexual and allows her to sleep with her ex and colleague on the magazine). Inspector Sonja Modig is a policewoman who thinks of her children as she draws her gun and who exhibits both physical and moral courage. Annika Giannini, Blomkvist’s sister (and the one exception to the sleeping with Blomkvist rule!) is a top-flight lawyer while Amazonian investigator Monica Figuerola ends up in love with him at the end of the trilogy. The Millennium Trilogy as a whole represents women in masculine professions – working as private security guards, as boxers and even as female warriors. Women in these books might be editors and lawyers but significantly their work usually involves defending male sexual freedom. In The Girl With The Dragon Tattoo, female agency is enabled to protect men.

As the trilogy progresses, these women are marginalised from the narrative to allow Salander to take centre stage. Salander comes to enjoy a dominant presence over all other women. Celebrating the power of the individual over the collective, the Private Investigator over the police, the crime genre promotes and is usually concerned with loner operators. In her work as a self-employed contractor, Salander is the ultimate individualist. As Mary Evans highlights in The Imagination of Evil, the best Scandinavian crime fiction interrogates the ground that connects the
rich, powerful (and usually male) insiders with poor, vulnerable (usually female) outsiders (2009). Larsson’s novel connects corporate business, political and social corruption and criminality. However, neither the state nor the collective comes to the aid of the victims of his work, they do not protect them – and people do not turn to the state or to collectives in times of trauma – they turn to detective agencies, to specialist anonymous individuals, which is why in Larsson’s novel Salander does not report her rape, Dragan Armansky’s private security business does so well and the police are called upon so little.

Interrogating materialism and idealism, Larsson shows that masculinity expressed by violence lies at the heart of the bourgeois neoliberal state. Salander is raped by her guardian, not just a random man, and this imbalance of power relations is used to represent both a wider imbalance in society and the endemic corruption of responsible government bodies. Larsson has been accused of sensationalising misogyny but misogyny is not sensational. As Susan Brownmiller famously argued in her 1975 text Against Out Will: Men, Women and Rape – ‘rape is violence, not sex. Rape should not turn us on’ (1993 [1975]: 423-4). Minimising the book’s brutal rape, torture and murder of dozens of women, the end of the novel is entirely inconsistent in showing ‘principled’ character Blomkvist and ‘feminist avenger’ Salander concealing the murders from the police and the families of the victims. Thrusting the reader into the role of the voyeur, the novel engages with the problematic and largely covert relationship between masculine authority and violence. Negotiating familiar dynamics of power and control, the end of the novel shows that powerful men are still getting away with abusing helpless women - a code of silence not only sanctioned, but perpetuated, by both Salander and Blomkvist.

As Melanie Newman points out in her less than enthusiastic analysis of the novel, ‘Stieg Larsson should be a feminist hero’ (Newman 2009). Many readers and critics did celebrate his first fiction as offering a genuinely new and feminist icon in the shape of Salander. As one blogger reflects, ‘I lost count of the book reviews I read that basically went like this: HUZZAH FEMINIST STIEG LARSSON, FEMINIST PENNER OF FEMINIST THRILLERS FOR FEMINISTS LISBETH WHAT A BABE’ (Rejectionist 2010). Yet, there is no avoiding the fact that most female characters in the trilogy are, at some point across the three novels, subject to violence as an expression of male authority. The Men Who Hate Women in these novels are also men who enjoy exercising power and control over women. Despite Larsson’s ostensible feminist agenda, his campaigning against the hatred of women and his work promoting equality, his novels occupy a problematic grey area in which accusations of the reproduction of aggressive gender limitations and expectations can be exchanged. The titles of the Millennium Trilogy – The Girl With The Dragon Tattoo, The Girl Who Played With Fire and The Girl Who Kicked The Hornet’s Nest - imply that these are feminist texts whose main interest lies in making women the central focus of the story. However, beyond the covers, the texts can be seen as scarcely feminist at all.

In Larsson’s work, sex-positivity – the celebration of sexuality as a positive aspect of life - is shown to be a male preserve. Those women who attempt to engage in this are punished and labelled and always pay the price. Offering a nod to second wave feminism in its focus on female identity and separatism in the form of individualist characters such as Salander and Ericka Berger, Larsson’s women operate alone and align themselves with men rather than other women in order to
survive. As a result, Larsson creates a world devoid of female friendship or communication. What is perhaps most problematic about the relationship between masculininity and violence in these novels is that it is shown to be at least as significant and endemic a problem as fascism or corporate crime, yet these latter two are the only things explicitly condemned and punished by the text.

Despite the avowed claims of the spectral presence of the author and the championing of marketing executives, *The Girl With The Dragon Tattoo* is no feminist polemic and nor can its central female characters be called ‘feminist avenging angels’ (Cohen 2009). Instead, this first fiction evidences the troubled expression of masculininity through violence. Every crime in this novel has motivations that lie in the sexual as much as in the political and its conclusion offers a depressing realignment of gender liberation and capitalism. Salander only becomes truly independent when she siphons off some of the corrupt cash and no longer needs to rely on her male guardian to dole out money to her. While the novel does represent the kind of multi plat-formed violence women face every day of their lives, a hatred of women also penetrates the nature of the criminal acts against the opposite sex. One victim is choked to death by shoving a sanitary towel down her throat while others are subject to the explicit rape fantasies of their male attackers. In this violent novel that not only represents violence against women but arguably sexualizes it, Larsson’s focus on the men who hate women at the expense of the women themselves becomes part of the problem, not a solution to it.

Reflecting on the structural juxtaposition of genre fiction, Umberto Eco argues that genre ‘must achieve a dialectic between order and novelty – in other words between scheme and innovation’ and that this ‘dialectic must be perceived by the consumer, who must not only grasp the contents of the message, but also the way in which the message transmits these contents’ (1985: 173-4) In choosing to focus on the commercial potential of the ‘dragon tattoo’ title over the author’s original ‘men who hate women’ title, the publishers, marketing men and male estate driving Larsson’s first fiction undermine its potential as a polarising political statement about masculininity and violence in the new millennium. Every violent crime against women goes unpunished or is not brought to trial in this novel. The welfare state is clearly not working and gender equality is a distant dream. Blomkvist and Salaendar work to mask crimes against women and in doing so corroborate in the structural, systematic and sexual violence meted out. Larsson’s first fiction is therefore both something new and something very old indeed. As Salander tells Blomkvist, the true horror of this story is that the criminal male is ‘not an insane serial killer […] it’s a common or garden bastard who hates women’ (418). Both in this first fiction and across his Millennium trilogy as whole, Steig Larsson’s male characters engage in physical, psychological, emotional, linguistic, legal and political violence against women as the mask of feminist thriller slips to reveal a series of texts that revel in rape, fetishise sexual violence and act out misogynistic fantasies on the female form.

As part of a wider move towards socially conscious crime fiction, Larsson uses the new genre of Nordic Noir as a means of generating popular debate and a call for a more individual re- visioning of violence as an expression of masculine authority in contemporary society. Drawing on classic Norwegian authors like Henrik Ibsen and Amalie Skram, a tenuous fragile version of social democracy remains in this novel. As a contemporary Nordic saga, the Millennium trilogy’s first
instalment presents a country focussed not on Ikea and the welfare state but on Nazis and misogynists. Yet his novel also develops the seedy aspects of Noir, the underworld exposes and the casual sex of a fast and duplicitous society. Combining elements of the police procedural with sums and surveillance, it does not push against the boundaries of the genre but work within them, addressing new meanings and contexts of a changed twenty-first century Sweden.

In the new millennium, crime fiction has diversified to become a media and cultural phenomenon. It is as a result of this diversification, a result of the ‘strange genre of Nordic Noir’, that crime fiction is enjoying a vibrant and growing position in the fields of not only literary studies, but translation, television, film and cultural studies the world over. By re-centring the focus on Larsson’s tale on a locked-room violent thriller in which economic fraud (a Swedish company ripping off the government to fund a fake business in Russia) rather than violence against women becomes the real – and punished - crime of the tale. His publishers mobilise the political heritage of the crime genre to highlight a corruption that permeates society. As we are reminded by Blomkvist, ‘when it comes down to it, this story is not primarily about spies and secret government agencies, it’s about violence against women, and the men who enable it’ (514) This crusading journalist and his freelance private investigator take on the classic locked room mystery of Harriet’s disappearance to reveal much wider truths about Swedish society, and crime fiction, in the new millennium. Innovating rather than redefining the crime genre his amateur detectives Blomkvist and Salender chart the rise of violence as an expression of masculine authority, celebrating individuality over the collective as the ultimate expression of neoliberal principles in contemporary Sweden.
References:


Impact of Application of Structural Linguistics and Communicative Theory on Public Senior Secondary Schools Students’ Performance in Content Generation and Expression Skills in Written English

Lawan Shu’ainu
Federal University Dutse, Jigawa Nigeria

Abstract

Learning adequate proficiency level in written English among learners of English as a second language is very critical and challenging task to applied linguists, educators and governments. This study has investigated relative impact of applications of provisions and principles of structural linguistics and communicative theory on performance in the written English of public Senior Secondary Schools Students in Kano State of Nigeria. The study has paid focuses on two key pillars of any written discourse: content generation and expression skills. Stratified probability method of sampling has been used to select the six sample schools for the study and systematic method of sampling has been used to select the twenty sample scripts for the study. Analytic scoring system has been used to score the sample scripts and descriptive statistics using percentages has been used to analyse the data. The results indicate that employing the principles and provisions of structural linguistics theory in written English among the subjects enables better content generation and expression skills than employing the provisions and principles of communicative theory of language. The study recommends that both the teachers and textbook writers of written English in senior secondary schools should incorporate the provisions and principles of structural linguistic theory in the business of inculcating content generation and expression skills among the students.

Keywords: Structural linguistics, Communicative theory, Expression, Content generation, Written English.
1.1 Background to the Study

This research work is aimed at investigation the relative impact of the principles and provisions of communicative competence theory of language and structural linguistics theory on rural and urban senior secondary schools students’ performance in content generation and expression skills in written English. Interest for the study has been developed out of the following circumstances:

1- The general Nigerian public outcry, the various WAEC, NECO annual Chief Examiners’ Reports on candidates’ written English and various research reports and other related academic works which describe the senior secondary school students’ performance in written English as poor
2- The pivotal role that written English plays among Nigerians especially in formal settings
3- The “unnaturalness” and complex nature of written English compared to the other macro language skills
4- The researcher’s long-term exposure to senior secondary schools students’ performance in written English in his capacity as WAEC examiner in written English
5- The researcher’s interest in investigating the possible impact of the two selected language theories as they relate to content generation and expression skills in secondary schools students, in order to arrive at tangible and cogent proof that would address the controversies mentioned above

Structural linguistics and communicative theories of language have been chosen for the study as the theoretical framework in view of the wide-ranging applications of their principles and approaches vis-à-vis written English.

Choice of senior secondary schools for the study has been due to the facts mentioned in (1) and (2) above.

1.2 Research Questions

The study has been designed to find answers to the following questions:

1. Do the applications of the principles and provision of structural linguistics theory lead to better content generation and expression skills than the applications of the principles and provisions of communicative competence theory in the written English of rural and urban public senior secondary schools students?

2. Which, between application of principles and provisions of structural linguistics and application of principles and provisions of communicative competence theory lead to better achievements in content generation and expression skills in the written English of rural and urban public senior secondary schools students?
1.3 Statement of the Problem

There has been a general consensus among linguists that writing to communicate effectively particularly in a second language is a skill in which students all over the world have one problem or another (Arapoff, 1965; Nunan, 1989; Tribble, 1997). This goes on to show that problems in writing, especially in a second language, defy geographical, cultural and linguistic backgrounds. Writing in a second language, even for professionals, isn’t an easy linguistic task (Williams 1990; Nunan, 1989). What is unique in learning to write is not so much learning to state the facts, but how to organise and use them. Therefore when writing, second language users must keep in their minds their purpose, think about the facts they need and think about organizing the facts in a coherent fashion. This complex process involved in second language writing is what prompts Arapoff (1965) to regard second language writing as a complex process fraught with problems.

One of the problems second language writers face is in the area of knowledge of the second language. Weigle (2002:35) calls it “limited second language knowledge” and Williams (1990:160) calls it “users’ low levels of maturity vis-à-vis their control of basic lexis and structure in the target language”. Since writing is the process of using grammar and facts as tools in carrying out a particular purpose (Arapoff, 1965; Aliyu, 2006; Williams, 1990), poor or inadequate mastery of the linguistic knowledge of the target language becomes an immediate stumbling block resulting in grave consequences.

Weigle (2002) states three major consequences. First is that limited linguistic proficiency in the first language makes the cognitive processes of text interpretation (understanding the writing task) and text generations (encoding one’s ideas into written text) more difficult for second language writers. Secondly, higher order issues in writing such as content and organization are given less emphasis because the writer is struggling with linguistic issues, which take the largest chunk of his devotion. Finally, limited linguistic knowledge in target language makes the written product of second language writers not to match the original writer’s intention; this is because the second language writers lack the necessary linguistic skills to encode their thoughts into written texts. As a result of this, text generation may tax the writer’s resources so completely that the idea is lost from working memory before it can be put down on paper. Consequent upon these, second language writing is more constrained, more difficult and less effective than first language writing. Second language writers plan less, revise for content less and write less fluently and accurately than first languages writers (Silva, 1993; Weigle 2002).

Limited Linguistic knowledge in the target language is not the only major problem confronting second language writers. Cultural intrusion into the style of writing of second language writers (Williams 1990) or social and cultural factors (Weigle 2002) is another problem. This is to say that writing in a second language situation is influenced by the writer’s socio-cultural underpinnings, because writing, like language in general is a meaning-making activity that is socially and culturally
shaped (Sperling 1996). This being the case, a limited knowledge of socio-cultural rudiments of the target language could have negative effects on the appropriate ways in which various functions are expressed or expectations of readers from the target language.

Advances made in the area of contrastive rhetoric, first introduced in Kaplan (1966) shed more light on the cultural influences of second language writers. In Kaplan’s study, a large number of ESL (English as a second language) essays from different cultures were analyzed and distinctive features were found. It was found that particular cultural preferences existed in which greater use of certain options among linguistic possibilities were preferred. ESL (English as a second language) essays whose writer’s first language was Arabic were characterized by heavy use of co-ordination and parallelism. In a related study, Collarado, (1981: cited in Lekki 1992; cited in Weigle 2002), found that Spanish writers preferred lengthy introductions; they made use of digractions and do not focus on the main ideas of essay as in English. In another instance, Chinese writers provide a series of examples without stating the main points of the examples or tying them together through generalizations, in contrast to the English preference for transparent, explicit connection in prose (Matelene, 1985, cited in Lekki, 1992; cited in Weigle 2002).

These “cultural ways” through which second language writing is undertaken can have a grave consequence. Since readers bring their cultural background knowledge and expectations, misreading of the author’s intended message is possible. Hindus (1987, cited in Weigle 2002) differentiates between “writer responsible language” and “reader responsible language”. In writer responsible language, the writer makes explicit the connections between propositions and ideas in the text, so that readers do not need to infer these connections on their own. In reader responsible language, the writer leaves examples and details implicit and it is the reader’s job to make inferences to get the intended meaning. The Nigeria’s National Policy on Education (2004) recognizes English language to be a core subject at nearly all levels of education. From primary IV upwards English is supposed to be the medium of instruction. This being the case, it is only logical for one to expect the written English of senior secondary schools students to be generally good to meet this national demand. Unfortunately however, several research reports indicate a wide range of incompetence in the written English of secondary schools students making it far from meeting this national demand.

1.4 Basic Assumption

This study has been based on the assumption that using or applying the provisions and principles of structural linguistic theory and communicative competence theory enables rural and urban senior secondary schools students to achieve equal performance in terms of content generation and expression skills in written English.
1.5 Objectives of the Study

The study has been designed to achieve the following objectives.
1. to determine the comparative impact of applications of provisions and principles of structural linguistic theory and communicative competence theory vis a vis their capacity in enabling senior secondary schools students towards achieving content generation and expression skills in written English
2. to compare the performances of rural and urban senior secondary schools students with regard to content generation and expression skills in written English

1.6 Significance of the Study

The findings of this study are expected to be of significance to the following:
1. Department of English in various colleges of education in Nigeria in their role as those who train English language teachers, guided by the findings of the study, they can best train English language teachers with regard to written English.
2. Departments of English in Nigerian universities as their products are very important stakeholders in English language usage in Nigerian secondary schools
3. English language textbook writers because they play a critical role in English language usage in schools. The study is expected to make it easier for text book writers to identify and address more adequately the problems associated with students’ written English
4. Literature on general knowledge in applied English linguistics useful to all intending researchers in the field

1.7 Delimitation of the Study

The study has been designed to investigate the relative impact of the provisions and principles of structural linguistics theory and communicative competence theory in the achievement of content generation and expression skills in the written English of students of some selected public senior secondary schools in Kano State of Nigeria.

2.0 Conceptualisation

The concepts of content generation and expression are very critical in any meaningful and successful written English. Expression in written discourse can hardly be successful if the content to be expressed is poorly generated. According to Weigle (2002), content generation is a critical cognitive process poor mastery of which results in poor expression skills among second language writers. According to the West African Examinations Council (WAEC) (2011 & 2014), content generation skills among candidates include two main requirements: adequacy of points/ideas/propositions discussed in a text and relevance of the points, ideas, and propositions to the essay. This means that
content of any written essay must satisfy the twin requirements of adequacy and relevance; otherwise the candidate would score very low mark in this regard.

Expression in written English is the writer’s ability to communicate the content of the written discourse appropriately. Generating a lot of content without the appropriate skills to express it would not result in a good written English discourse. According to the West African Examinations Council (WAEC 2015), skills in expression are dependent on appropriate use of register, appropriate level of formality/informality, use of correct sentence forms and use of contracted forms.

2.1 Structural Linguistic Theory

Structural linguistics is an approach to linguistics which treats language as an interwoven structure, in which every item acquires identity and validity only in relation to the other items in the system (Encyclopedia.com). This approach to language study originates from the post-humus publication of Ferdinand de Saussure’s Course in General Linguistics in 1916 (Wikipedia.com, Philip, 2009). Structural linguistics methods and procedures are based on relational view of language. According to Eastman (1978:80) structural linguistics is based on the following principles:

1. the study of the structure of language
2. viewing the relationships between the various language units as more important than the units themselves
3. the assumption that the underlying structure of language is systematic
4. the discovery of general laws of language

Bloomfield is the linguistics scholar considered to be the major developer of twentieth century structuralism in America. For Bloomfield, the structure of language should be the central object of linguistic study. He stresses the use of empirical data only. To Bloomfield, the grammarian task was to collect as much language data as possible. Such linguistic data should be analyzed and classified, and on the basis of objective evidence alone, conclusion could be reached. This research work has borrowed and used the two central cruxes of Bloomfield’s structural linguistic theory: (use of empirical language data as empiricist methodology in language study in which concrete language data in the form of sample text has been used and inductive generalization in language study in which generalizations on the sample text are adopted by the subjects to write their individual texts).

Language acquisition and language learning are two related concepts that have continued to capture the attention of linguists. In Chomsky’s grammatical theory, for instance, the explanatory adequacy aspect of the theory explains how it is possible to acquire knowledge of language. Adding to the applied contributions of structural linguistics theory to language learning, Paulston (1992:79) states that “linguistics as we know it today would never have existed if people had not tried to do things with language all the way back to Panini”. Furthermore, according to Confucius, “The essence of knowledge is, having it, to apply it.” (Confucius cited in Banjo, 1983:15). While all linguists necessarily maintain
an interest in theoretical linguistics in the study of language as pure science, many of them are keen on applying their research to the solutions of problems in other areas. To this end, applied linguistics has come to be known as a branch of linguistics where the primary concern is application of linguistic theories, methods and findings to the elucidation of language problems which have arisen in other areas of experience (Crystal, 1991). One of such areas is second language teaching and learning.

2.2 Communicative Theory of Language

According to Brumfit (1986:Vii), “the shift away from a view of language as a static observable system to be learnt to the view that it is fluid, negotiable system to be performed is fundamental to recent developments from a wide variety of sources”. Communicative language theory dates back to the 1960s as a result of changes in the British language teaching tradition (Richards & Rodgers, 2001). The term “communicative approach” comes to be associated with the writings of British applied linguists on theoretical basis of communicative approach to language usage. The theory of language underlying communicative approach starts from theory of language as communication. According to Hymes (1972:281), The goal of language teaching is to develop communicative competence”. Hymes coined the term communicative competence in order to contrast communicative view of language with Chomsky’s theory of competence which is captured vividly in Chomsky (1965:3) thus:

Linguistic theory is concerned primarily with an ideal listener-speaker in a completely homogeneous speech community who knows its language perfectly and is unaffected by such grammatically irrelevant conditions as memory limitations, distractions, shifts of attention and interests, and errors (random and characteristics) in applying his knowledge of the language in actual performance.

Chomsky’s linguistic theory could be summarized in three theses. The first is that language should be pursued as a purely cognitive state rather than a type of behaviour. Secondly, language study should be pursued in abstraction from the socio-cultural matrix within which it is found. Finally, how humans acquire language knowledge should be pursued within the theory of grammar. Canale and Swain, Canadian linguists, are perhaps two most famous linguists with regard to lending support to Hymes’s view of language. Canal and Swain (1980) could be claimed to be the most influential analysis of communicative competence in which four dimensions of communicative competence are identified. Rodgers & Richards (2001:160) identifies the four components of communicative competence as discussed by Canale and Swain (1980):

1. Grammatical competence: This kind of competence corresponds to Chomsky’s linguistic competence and Hymes’s concept of “formally possible”. It includes knowledge of lexical items and rules of morphology, syntax, sentence-grammar etc (Canale and swain, 1980:29)

2. Sociolinguistic competence: This involves knowledge of socio-cultural rules of language and of discourse, i.e. understanding of the social context in which communication takes place
including role relationships, the shared information of participants, and the communicative purposes for their interaction.

3. Discourse competence: This is the ability to connect sentences in stretches of discourse and form meaningful whole out of series of utterances. Richards & Rodgers (2001:166) considers this aspect of communicative competence as the interpretation of individual message elements in terms of their connectedness and of how meaning is represented in relation to the entire discourse or text.

4. Strategic competence: This includes the verbal and non-verbal communication strategies that may be called into action to compensate for breakdown in communication due to performance variable or due to insufficient competence. This aspect of communicative competence is mainly coping strategies that communicators employ to initiate, terminate, maintain, repair and re-direct communication.

Employing communicative approach to impart skills in written language has been recommended by several scholars. For example according to Raimes (1983), writers do their best when writing becomes or is projected as a truly communicative act, with writers writing for real readers.

3.0 Literature Review


In its focus on previous studies and related works on the written English of senior secondary school students, this study has paid special attention to the various research designs, procedures followed and implications identified. The purpose of this is to see how this study relates to the previous ones, and how it can best be designed to achieve its purposes.

Achor, S. and Ohikhuare, C. (2001) studies the use of tenses and their implications on students’ performance in written English in Federal College of Education Kano Staff School. 200 students have been sampled. It has been found that poor mastery of English tense, excessive use of Pidgin English and poorly trained English teachers as the main factors of the students’ general poor performance in written English.

Writing from communicative point of view, Sunusi, A. Yusuf, S. Mohammed, A. and Raji, Y. (1997) is a case study on communicative problems secondary school students face in both written and spoken English. Thirty teachers and seventy-two students have been sampled. The study finds that the students are deficient in written communicative competence. The study recommends that grammar teaching should be approached indirectly, i.e. through the use of “bottom-down approach”.

http://ijhcschiefeditor.wix.com/ijhcs
Samuel, R., Abdulaziz, I., Arogun G. and Bello, M. (1992) is a study on errors in the written communication or compositions of post primary schools in Kano State. A stratified sampling is used in which 40 respondents are selected from the sampled secondary schools. Structural errors, lexical errors, mechanical and miscellaneous errors have been found. The researchers recommend that students should engage in wide reading so as to improve on the use of grammar and that teachers should engage the students in drills particularly on the problematic areas the study has found.

Although each of several studies reviewed in this study has accounted to some degrees the problems of poor performance in the written English of secondary school students (rates and categories of errors found, recommendation on how to deal with the poor competence of the students in written English, etc.) none of the studies has investigated the impact of structural linguistics and communicative theory of language on the students’ achievements in written English. The uniqueness of the present study lies in contrasting and investigating the possible impact of structural linguistics theory and communicative competence theory on the students’ achievement in written English.

4.0 Methodology

This study has been focused on impact of application of principles and provisions of structural linguistic theory and communicative competence theory on public senior secondary schools students’ performance in written English, with particular reference to content generation and expression skills.

4.1 Sampling Techniques

No concept is as fundamental to the conduct of research and interpretation of result as is sampling (Osuala, 2005:114). Suleiman (1998:17) defines sample as “that portion of a population which is studied closely in order to gain some knowledge and or make generalizations about the population it represents”. Stratified probability method of sampling has been used in selecting the six schools (three rural senior secondary schools and three urban senior secondary schools). Systematic sampling has been used to select the number of scripts per school; after having jumbled the total number of the scripts per school, the tenth script was selected.

4.2 Research Instruments

Two researcher-constructed written tests have been used to elicit the data for the study (primary data). One of the tests has been constructed based on provisions and principles of structural linguistic theory and the other test has been constructed based on the principles and provisions of communicative competence theory.
4.3 Source of Data for the Study

Primary data in the form of written tests of the subjects is the source of data for the study.

Data Collection Procedure

a) Preamble: After a short introduction, the subjects were given a popular topic on which they wrote an essay for thirty minutes. This is to ginger them for the forthcoming writing task.

b) The subjects were exposed to the principles and provisions of the two language theories (structural linguistics theory in the case of rural senior secondary schools and communicative competence theory in the case of urban senior secondary schools).

c) The subjects were given a new topic on which to write another essay using the structural linguistic theory (in the case of rural senior secondary school) and communicative competence theory (in the case of urban senior secondary schools) which they had been exposed to in (b) above.

d) The scripts were collected from the subjects.

e) The scripts were sampled and marked by use of analytic scoring system.

5.0 Data Presentation and Analysis

Introduction

This research work has been designed to compare the relative impact of the provisions and application of structural linguistics and communicative competence theories of language on rural and urban senior secondary schools students’ achievement with regard to content generation and expression skills in written English. The data collected for the study has been treated according to the research questions of the study. The study contains research findings, discussions and conclusions.

5.1 Overall Performance of Urban Area Students in Content Generation and Expression Skills in Written English

The following table presents both the individual scores of the content generation and expression skills in written English and the total percentage of each of the sample scripts so that the fact can be more graphically represented.
Table 5.1 Scores on Content Generation and Expression Skills for Urban Senior Secondary Schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Script</th>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Expression</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>G.S.S Naibawa</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12/30 40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.S.S Naibawa</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>13/30 43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.S.S Naibawa</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9/30 20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.S.S Naibawa</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10/30 33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.S.S S/Kofa</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12/20 40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.S.S S/Kofa</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13/30 43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.S.S S/Kofa</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12/30 40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.S.S K/Nassarawa</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>15/30 50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.S.S K/Nassarawa</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9/30 30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.S.S K/Nassarawa</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8/30 26.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.2 Total Scores and Percentages of each of the Two Writing Components in Urban Secondary Schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Maximum Marks</th>
<th>Actual marks scored</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Content</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expression</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.1 and 5.2 illustrate that although the performances vary among the subjects, such performances are generally low. The subjects performed better in the content generation skill component with 8 marks out of the maximum 10 marks being the highest score, and 3 marks out of the 10 maximum marks being the lowest score. The subjects did not do well in the expression component of written English. The highest mark is 7 out of the maximum 20 marks and the lowest mark is 2 out of the maximum 20 marks.

The total score of the content generation component skill is 54 marks out of the maximum 100 marks, representing 54%. The total score of the expression component skill is 56 marks out of the maximum 200 marks, representing 28%.

5.2 Overall Performance of Rural Areas Students in Content Generation and Expression Skills in Written English

The following table presents both the individual scores of content generation and expression skills in written English and the total percentage of each of the sample scripts so that the facts can be more graphically represented.
Table 5.3 Scores in Content Generation and Expression Skills in the Written English of Rural Areas Students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Script</th>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Expression</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>G.S.S.S. Bichi</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>19/30</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.S.S.S. Bichi</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16/30</td>
<td>53.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.S.S.S. Bichi</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>13/30</td>
<td>40.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D/Kudu Science college</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>21/30</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D/Kudu Science college</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>18/30</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D/Kudu Science college</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>18/30</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D/Kudu Science college</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>14/30</td>
<td>46.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.A.S.S.S Kura</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20/30</td>
<td>66.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.A.S.S.S Kura</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20/30</td>
<td>66.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.A.S.S.S Kura</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20/30</td>
<td>66.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.4 Total Scores and Percentages of Content and Expression Skills in the Written English of Rural Areas Students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Maximum Marks</th>
<th>Actual marks scored</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Content</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expression</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.3 and 5.4 indicate that students’ performance in content generation and expression skills in written English is generally above average. The highest individual student score is 21/30 representing 70% and the lowest individual student score is 13/30 representing 40.3%. The total score in content generation skills is 77 marks out of the maximum mark of 100, representing 77%. In the expression skills, a total of 102 marks were scored out of the maximum mark of 200, representing 51%.

5.3 Comparative Analysis of Rural and Urban Students’ Performances in Content Generation and Expression Skills in Written English

The following table displays the comparative performance of the rural and urban secondary school students’ achievements in terms of content generation and expression skills in written English. This has been done with the aim of comparing more easily the two components of skills in written English between the two the groups.
Table 5.5 Comparative Performances between Rural and Urban Secondary School Students in Terms of Content Generation and Expression Skills in Written English

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Urban Secondary Schools</th>
<th>Rural Secondary Schools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total marks</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expression</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the content generation component, urban secondary schools have 54 marks representing 54% of the maximum mark and the rural secondary schools scored 77 marks representing 77%. In the expression component, urban secondary schools scored 56 marks out of the maximum marks of 200 which represent 28%. The rural secondary schools scored 102 marks out of the maximum mark of 200 which represents 51%.

6.0 Findings of the Study

After treating the students’ scores, the following are the overall findings of the study.

1. Performances in content generation and expression skills are generally weak among the urban subjects.
2. Subjects in rural senior secondary schools performed better than the subjects in urban senior secondary schools in both content generation and expression skills.
3. Expression skills are more difficult for all the subjects, i.e. both the urban and rural senior secondary schools students.
4. Expression skills are particularly very poorly achieved among the urban senior secondary schools students.

Summary, Conclusion and Recommendations

This study has investigated the relative impact of the provisions and principles of structural linguistics and communicative competence theory towards the achievement of content generation and expression skills in the written English of students of some selected public senior secondary schools in Kano state of Nigeria. To achieve this, the study has found answers to the research questions of the study by drawing the conclusion that using the provisions and principles of structural linguistic theory enables better content generation and expression skills in the written English of the senior secondary schools students.

In view of the problems and inferences drawn from this study, the following recommendations have been made:

http://ijhcschiefeditor.wix.com/ijhcs
1. A general reading/writing culture among teachers and students should be established. Reading culture could be enhanced through the setting of classroom and school libraries.

2. Samples of written articles, essays, sermons and advertisements as well as badly written materials should be made available in the school environment. Such provide sources of real models for discussion, emulating or rejection.

3. Senior secondary school students should be exposed to the structural and syntactic aspects of English language so that they acquire the correct structural and syntactic rules of English necessary for generating structurally and syntactically well-formed English expression.

4. Establishment of school clubs such as debate club, drama club, etc. should be emphasized. Written communication skills should be emphasized side by side with the usual oral skills usually associated with such clubs.

5. The school compound should be elevated to literacy – friendly environment. This could be achieved through creating periodically ever exciting signposts and miniature billboards with arresting write-ups and notices. Such innovations could heighten the enthusiasm for reading and writing.
References


Discourse on linguistic diversity in Africa

Sassongo Jacques Silue
Université F-Houphouët-Boigny de Cocody, Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire

Abstract

The prevailing linguistic literature typically depicts the African linguistic landscape as the most heterogeneous in the world. Surely linguistic diversity of the African continent cannot be denied, however, it can be noted that the mere evocation of this natural manifestation of language change is on the agenda, sounds excessive compared to actual facts. The discourse on the African linguistic diversity has steadily stemmed from a biased Eurocentric ideology. Explorers have first invented the ethnic group; then the colonial administration has striven to partition functionally homogeneous communities into countless ethnic groups, and missionaries, using questionable linguistic methods, have encouraged linguistic distinctiveness so further emphasizing the sentiment of linguistic fragmentation.

Keywords: Linguistic diversity, ethnic group, missionary, explorers, linguistic landscape, writing.
Résumé

La littérature linguistique dominante dépeint généralement le paysage linguistique Africain comme le plus hétérogène au monde. Certes, la diversité linguistique du continent africain ne saurait être niée, cependant, on note que l’évocation de cette manifestation du changement linguistique, du reste naturelle, prend les allures d’un discours excessif sans commune mesure avec la réalité sur le terrain. Le discours sur la diversité linguistique africaine a été construit sur des ressorts idéologiques à forts relents euro-centristes. Les explorateurs auront d’abord inventé l’ethnie; ensuite l'administration coloniale s’est évertuée à partitionner les communautés fonctionnellement homogènes en myriades d’ethnies, et les missionnaires, usant de méthodes linguistiques discutables, ont cultivé et encouragé la fragmentation linguistique.

Mots clé : Diversité linguistique, groupe ethnique, missionnaires, explorateurs, paysage linguistique, écriture.
Introduction

If linguistic diversity is the dispersion of languages and dialects over space and their change over time, then this phenomenon is a normal manifestation of language change. And since no known human community or nation is strictly monolingual, linguistic diversity is the norm rather than the exception.

No one would seriously deny that the African language landscape displays a fairly high linguistic heterogeneity. Yet, the extreme multiplicity of languages on the African continent sounds more like a discourse than actual fact. Is the African continent the most linguistically heterogeneous in the world? According to UNESCO estimates cited by Brown and Ogilve (2010: 319) the African continent has a slightly lower linguistic diversity, with 2,058 languages representing 30% of all the world languages compared to Asia which hosts 2,197 corresponding to 33% of the total languages. Unfortunately, whenever the issue of linguistic heterogeneity is on the agenda of a scientific gathering, the current (socio)linguistic literature gives the impression that linguistic diversity is more characteristic of the African continent.

The encyclopedic knowledge and research procedures accumulated over the centuries in social sciences are, to a large extent, a heritage of the “archeology of knowledge” of the West. The current academic systems of knowledge are the product of prevailing ideologies; even the meta-language to describe African languages, which includes the identification of linguistic categories, draws essentially from the terminology used long ago in the study of Greek and Latin. If the African linguistic landscape is portrayed this way could it be that western academia has a singular view on the African continent and its peoples?

This paper aims at showing that the perception of the African landscape as extremely heterogeneous has been progressively construed through the varied accounts of European “actors”, from the early explorers to the colonial administrators and the Missionaries. They have, in one way or another contributed to the construction and reinforcement of the discourse on the African linguistic heterogeneity an impression which is now firmly anchored in the minds of language researchers.

The paper successively looks at how European explorers’ accounts on the “mysteries” they “discovered” in Africa have impacted African linguistics, how colonial administrative practices have contributed to the fragmentation of African speech communities and thus artificially increased linguistic diversity, and the way in which the works of Missionaries on African languages have unfairly credited the erroneous sentiment of the fractionalized spectrum of the African linguistic landscape.
1. A Continent of Mysteries and Myriads of Ethnic Groups

Although language issues were not directly the top priority of the first European explorers, their exploratory activities combined with those of anthropologists and ethnologists have had a significant impact on African linguistics in general, and especially on the way the language landscape was and is portrayed.

Compared to North Africa (i.e. the Maghreb), the inland area and specifically Sub-Saharan Africa was basically unknown to Europeans until about the end of the 18th century. It was reported that, looking up a sketchy version of a map of the continent, the British explorer Henry M. Stanley was impressed by the many “blanks” left by map-makers. In his view, these "blanks" were areas waiting to be explored. The findings and discoveries of these explorations were intended to meet the curiosity of western scientific circles and the authorities who commissioned exploratory missions. The titles of two memorable exploration accounts by Henry M. Stanley are very telling of his perception of the continent: one such mission to East and Central Africa was supposed to take him Through the Dark Continent, and the second one, an alleged rescue operation, led the explorer In Darkest Africa. The “darkness” associated to the African continent was a direct reference to the mysteries surrounding the geographical make-up of the continent and the strange lifestyles of its peoples. Henry M. Stanley’s perceptions of the continent do not contrast with the views of his contemporaries. The German philosopher, Hegel (who was theorizing on civilizations in the world) is well-known for having excluded the African continent from the history of humanity: “What we properly understand by Africa, is the unhistorical, undeveloped spirit, still involved in the conditions of mere nature, and which had to be presented here only as on the threshold of the World’s History” (Sibree 2001: 99). The Hegelian views were shared by many other scholars, such as Trevor-Roper (1965), who was also of the opinion that “at present there is [no African history], or very little: there is only the history of the Europeans in Africa. The rest is largely darkness... and darkness is not a subject of history.” These pseudo-scientific certainties derive from an approach that consists in regarding other cultures in contrast with European cultures, or through the prism of Euro-centrism. Being ““African” was codified in opposition to what it means to be a fully human "modern" social agent” (Mudimbe, 1988: 12) and anything that did not display the genuine European feature was treated as an “exotic and incomprehensible alterity” (Ibid: 72).

The initial antagonist paradigms of “civilized societies” of Europe and the “primitive societies” of non-European communities were next replaced by corresponding paradigms: “industrialized societies” in opposition to “pre-industrialized” ones. Understandably, the ideologically loaded labeling of the two societies reverberates in the no less ideological loaded reference to the people: industrialized societies were portrayed as being structured around economic production, whereby social stratification was conceived in terms of “social groups”. By contrast, pre-industrialized societies, like African societies, in which social and economic life was structured along a different logic, were seen by ethnologists and anthropologists as social organizations based on “ethnic groups” (Simonet 2011). “Ethnicity” and “tribe” then became the descriptive concepts for the African society. The “ethnic group”, in the hands of European social scientists (anthropologists and ethnologists), became a theoretical construct, that is to say, a product of ideology. As Gruénais (1986: 358) pointed out, “[I]les ethnies de l’anthropologie ne sont pas dissociables des dynamiques politico-économiques”. In other words, the “ethnic group” was a
convenient category to construe African societies in compliance with the representations of Western social scientists. Explorers were conducting their exploratory missions at a time when scientific procedures substantially drew on structuralism, known to be keen on the identification of the components of the systems under study and their subsequent classification. Therefore, it is no surprise that African populations were viewed in terms of groups identifiable by what was then perceived as defining characteristics; and one such characteristic happened to be the "tribe" or the "ethnic group". After all, the “job” of explorers was to “disclose” the mysteries of the “dark” continent. It follows that the most deserving and zealous explorers were those who could bring back the most detailed accounts, highlighting the striking and exotic peculiarities that could help distinguish groups of populations as different from one another. The mores, manners and customs of the people explorers met would be described with maximum details, so as to establish a mapping knowledge on the communities observed. This led Simonet (2011) to conclude that “ethnology and anthropometry are affirmed”, and the concept of ethnicity took off within the system of knowledge constructed.

Explorers were then be credited for having “discovered” tribes or ethnic groups. Epistemologically, such discoveries were not immune of an ideological load: to discover a place or a group of people bears the claim that the thing discovered was unknown from any previous human experience which is simply nonsensical since the places and people explorers would claim to have discovered might have been there for immemorial time... (Abbattista 2011). The ethnic group was a conventional representation of social “otherness” (Mudimbe, 1988) meant to meet the necessity to find distinctions among groups of people, so as to make them unique and distinguishable. This has led a number of researchers (Abolou, 2006; Calvet, 1992; Breton, 1997; Amselle, 1983) to say that “ethnicity” is a construct that became the foundation of a social science – ethnology and anthropology - especially carved for the African continent and its people. The term “ethnic group” has its own history. Lentz (1995: 304) recalls that it “was coined in the 1970s by European anthropologists in replacement of “tribe” thought to be offensive in that it hurts the sensibility of African researchers”.

At the time European explorers and colonizers started venturing on the African continent, the West did enjoy a certain internal organization with political entities in the forms of kingdoms, empires or state-nations. All these organizations were formed on the basis of the common Judeo-Christian culture and, most importantly, around the language of the political authority, the official language. The most telling cases that contemporary history still retains are the English language, which was decreed the official language of the nation by Edward III in the 14th century and the French dialect of Tour, which was imposed as the official language of Kingdom by Francois I. By contrast, most African political organizations (Kingdoms and Empires) were multilingual, but the presence of several languages and dialects within the same political entity was not regarded as a factor of disharmony among the people paying loyalty to the sovereign authority.

In short, the perception of Western explorers, who were looking at African society in contrast to European nation-states contributed to the ideological a priori that there is no way to make sense of African social organizations, if not in terms of ethnic groups. And since distinctiveness looked more exotic than cultural and linguistic homogeneity, explorers could but discover in Africa a myriad of tribes and ethnic groups.
Furthermore, the prevailing assumption was that the ethnic group had its own language, and languages were named after speech communities. Language became the fundamental feature to characterize and identify an ethnic group (Simonet 1992: 31). Therefore, postulating the existence of a countless number of ethnic groups necessarily foreshadowed extreme linguistic heterogeneity: a myriad of ethnic groups axiomatically implies a myriad of languages and dialects. Diversity and variability were seen as the defining feature of African societies, corresponding to their mysterious social fabric, while homogeneity characterized the Western world. Along the same lines, the African polytheism was generally opposed to the Western monotheism and based on the Biblical legend of the Tower of Babel, Mansour (1993: 2) notes that “monolingualism becomes equated with civilization whereas multilingualism […] is God’s punishment for the wicked” Africans. In short, the discourse on an extremely high linguistic diversity in Africa is due, to a large extent, to the perception of Africa as a continent made up of a myriad of ethnic groups.

2. Colonial Practices to Increase Linguistic Diversity

Historically, explorers and anthropologists in the mid-18th century paved the way to the discourse on African linguistic diversity. The colonial administration did not take a different route. The carving of colonial borders and the administrative necessity to label artificially constituted communities also contributed to cultural and linguistic fragmentation.

2.1 Fanciful Straight borderlines

The alleged existence of a myriad of ethnic groups and the ensuing linguistic heterogeneity cannot be blamed on colonial agents directly. The job of explorers and anthropologists was to “create” ethnic groups, and this was achieved by labeling groups considered to be similar or different, according to criteria forged by those claiming to have discovered them. The information gathered by the explorers and other social scientists was used by the colonizers to implement their agenda. The place names and peoples were crucial information for the administrative delimitation of colonial territories, and more so when the Berlin Conference dismembered the African continent.

Cases of deliberate splits of cultural units which reinforced the impression of ethnic diversity abound, especially in instances where competing colonial powers settled next to one another. For example in the equatorial African region, although the Congo River appears to be a natural geographic boundary, people on either bank of the river shared the same economic practices or other cultural traits and could reasonably be said to constitute one cultural entity. Yet, the sharing of this region between the French and Belgian colonial administrations split this cultural entity. Over time, the populations so artificially divided developed competing reflexes around the exploitation of natural resources and progressively viewed themselves as completely different communities from one another. In fact, no novel ethnic group had spontaneously come into existence; and yet, the artificial restructuring of space eventually created “two new ethnic groups”, so reinforcing the impression of the multiplicity of ethnic entities, and the related impression of an unlimited number of languages.
One of the most salient aspects of the colonialism in reinforcing ethnic diversity is the way borders were "carved" to create colonial states. The natural distribution of indigenous populations or their historical patterns of settlement borders were not taken into account in demarcating the boundaries. On the field, borders between communities could take all kinds of shapes. They rarely coincided with the traditional delimitations of cultural communities. According to Englebert, Tanrago and Carter (2002), up to 44% of colonial borders in Africa have arbitrarily split some 150 communities over several and distinct colonial states or zones of influence, with each and every part of the split community being generally given a different label, hence, adding to the impression of the fragmented linguistic profile of the continent.

In West Africa an Akan community located across the border of Côte d’Ivoire and Ghana provides a telling illustration. On the Ghanaian side, this community is called the Nzemas; whilst, on the Ivorian side of the border, the same community is known as the “Apolos”. The case of the Nzemas/Apolos, like many others across the continent, is interesting because, whilst they are labeled as different entities, the two communities have never perceived themselves as two distinct cultural entities. Both pay loyalty to a unique King and engage in the same rituals (political succession, funerals and other religious celebrations). The so-called Apolos always refer to themselves as Nzemas, when using their language, and only use the label “Apolo” when speaking French.

Likewise, in the southern and coastal regions of West Africa, a component of the South-Mande family that stretches across Guinea (Conakry) and Liberia is alternatively identified as the Kpelles in Liberia and the Gbreses in Guinea. On either side of the border however, this community does not claim separate identities. Similarly, in the same region, the Weh, a sub-group of the Kru family in Côte d’Ivoire and Liberia, is called the “Khrans” in English-speaking Liberia whilst in Côte d’Ivoire, they are known as the “Weh”. Furthermore, the Weh of Côte d’Ivoire are split into Guere, Wobeh, and another fourteen different "languages", all of which only use these labels when speaking French. This, even though the lexical mutual intelligibility rate is well above 90%.

2.2 Colonial administrative organization and the labeling of languages

Linguistic diversity also originates from the territorial organization colonizers have put in place. This is particularly visible in the South-West region of Côte d’Ivoire. The French colonial administration created administrative units called the “administrative circles”, which were further divided in “cantons”, meant to correspond to cultural entities regarded as “tribes”. Communities of the Bete region (Gagnoa, Daloa, Guiberoua), for instance, continue to identify themselves according to the denomination of these cantons. This way, any researcher undertaking linguistic research in the region is told by the local populations that there are several Betes: the Bete of the Yokoli Canton, the Bete of the Guebié Canton, the Bete of the Zabia Canton, the Bete of the Bamo Canton, in all totaling no less a dozen Bete languages! These labels suggest that the so called languages are in fact the names of the administrative units created by the French colonial administration exactly on the model of the territorial organization in France, French-speaking Belgium and French-speaking Switzerland. One is justified to conclude that it is the naming that has actually given an existence to those speech forms which variation does not impede seriously inter-comprehension among the communities. In the late 1990s, the Centre of Advanced Studies of
Afrian Societies (CASAS) based in Cape-Town, South Africa, had conducted a research on mutual intelligibility in the region; this research has come to the conclusion that the difference between those dialects is generally a matter of prosodic features if we ignore loan words that each territorial community take from neighboring Kru and Mande communities. Clearly, the colonial territorial organization, which was not a linguistic enterprise had a direct impact on the way the linguistic landscape of the Bete region was and is viewed: one of the most linguistically fragmented region in Côte d’Ivoire.

Tabouret-Keller (1997) once asked: “Who gives names to languages.” Today, most linguists agree that the number of languages in Africa, and presumably in other parts in the world, is a matter of labeling (Abolou, 2006; Halaoui, 2009). Names can derive from local populations, who did not use them as identifiers of speech communities, but as place names or addresses. Progressively, the place names took a functional property whereby groups of population living in the area were named after the geographical space of their settlement. In West Africa, the Baule, a component of the Akan group, offer a good illustration of how place names turned into languages. The Nzipli are the Baule communities settled on the banks of the Nzi River (Center of Côte d’Ivoire), the Wallebo, are those Baule, who decided to live under the protection of a mystical tree (walle). If such names have become ethnonyms of communities, they were not meant as labels of languages in the first place, especially since the Baule, who fled from present Ghana in the 17th century, have a clear consciousness of using the same language which spreads out as far as to Togo, where its speech community is known as the Cokosis. Mutual intelligibility between those distant populations and those settled in Côte d’Ivoire is reportedly fairly high. Yet, in the “official” linguistic atlas of the Baule land, the Nzipli, Wallebo and many other language/ethnic labels are used to identify the allegedly different languages/ethnic communities.

Similarly in the Gur cultural area with the Senufo, a number of sub-communities are named after the place of their historical settlement or the nature or circumstances of their migratory movement. Linguistic separateness can also be found in the case of the Cebaara variant which has been equipped with a writing system since the 1960s. As a result, a Senufo version of the Bible was produced. However, recently, another Senufo variant – the Nyarafolo – was given its own scripts with the final objective of producing another version of the Holy Book. When these scripts are used for adult literacy, the mid and long term consequences will be the progressive reinforcement among the populations that they really speak completely different languages, and the sentiment of distinctiveness will be further strengthened. This is quite likely, since there are national plans to use these scripts in formal education as part of an on-going national project. When asked why they do not use an alternative solution, whereby transversal writing systems encompassing dialectal variation are compiled for the whole cluster, the Missionaries say that their prime objective is not linguistic research, but communication effectiveness, and that their ultimate objective is to equip every single variety with its own version of the bible, provided the financial resources are available.

In the mountainous region of the West of Côte d’Ivoire, the action of Missionaries among the Dan people (from the South-Mande language family) offers another illustration of the celebration of language distinctiveness. The Dan sub-cluster acknowledges two variants: the Yakuba and the Tura. Research teams commissioned by the Protestant Missionaries have devised a parallel writing system for each variant and produced two parallel translated versions of the Bible.
In the Kru language family, the Bete variants have also been allocated distinct writing systems for the varieties spoken in the major administrative regions of Daloa, Gagnoa and Guiberoua. Is it true that, in the cases quoted above, Yakuba and Tura speakers on the one hand, Bete speakers of Daloa, Gagnoa and Guiberoua on the other hand, do not understand each other?

The language labels has fossilized in the academic literature, because other researchers, be they Europeans or Africans feel compelled to keep the terminological references of the pre-existing literature. As for populations, they tend to integrate the labels used by their local or national administration as glossonyms, all things that contribute to the impression of a high linguistic diversity, when the reality on the ground indicates that this is far from being the case.

3. Missionary Linguistics

There is no exaggeration in stating that Missionaries had a significant impact on the perception of the African linguistic landscape in general, and specifically on the issue of linguistic diversity. Concerning what can be termed “missionaries’ linguistics”, it should be noted that the British and French missionaries developed different language policies (Prah 2000:16) that were dictated by different attitudes for African languages. Not only French catholic Missionaries showed very limited interest in local languages, they had generally adjusted their perception of the African linguistic landscape to the way the French colonial administration had identified local languages, that is, reliance on the territorial organization of the colonial space.

3.1 Celebration of distinctiveness

Most influential in African linguistics is the contribution of Protestants, from British and German clergies essentially. Missionaries needed African languages to convert Africans to their religion and lifestyle, as efficiently as they could. All their actions on language were determined by pragmatism. When settled in an area the speech form they encountered would be immediately exploited to convey the religious message, regardless of how their area of settlement connects linguistically with the larger geographical territory. The "language" would then be equipped with a specific writing system and often used for educational purposes. Mufwene (2009: 2016) quotes the case of a variant of Kikongo in the DR Congo that was “coined” by the Missionaries and named Kikongo Kisantu (“Language of the Saints”). In the mind of Missionaries, the new "language" was “unadulterated” and morphologically “richer”, so that it was perfectly appropriate to express all the required semantic subtleties specific to their religious discourse. The only problem was that this new language sounded a bit strange in the ears of local Kikongo speakers. Makoni (1998) also quotes the case of "languages" being invented by Missionaries from the Shona language spoken in Zimbabwe, Botswana and Mozambique. In the process of developing languages by equipping them with orthographies, rival religious institutions had eventually created three "languages" within the Shona cluster. The Zimbabwean case dates back to the period of colonialism; however, the ideology-driven perception of the African linguistic landscape as very fragmented has not changed over time. Although there is information on the classification of African languages that has allowed a relatively accurate identification of language clusters, Missionaries generally show little interest in a globalizing approach to African languages and do not consider variants in the same cluster as daughter speech forms. Wedded to the stereotyped view of a congenital variability of the African
linguistic landscape, they insist on and reinforce the impression of linguistic fractionalization. The celebration of distinctiveness is institutionalized through the codification of languages using writing systems and subsequently the translation of clerical texts in adjacent variants of the same language cluster.

3.2 Methodological shortcomings

The distinction between dialects of the same cluster generally relies on mutual intelligibility. If the use of mutual intelligibility to delineate variants cannot be brought into question, the problem is how this index is computed and exploited. A large proportion of the writing systems in use in the religious literature are phonetic transcriptions, which can hardly be considered orthographic. From the theoretical and practical points of view, a writing system using phonetic transcription must be regarded as the representation of “parole” rather than “langue”, especially when speech forms are approached only on the basis of their spoken form. Taking into account all the inherent idiosyncratic practices and negligible dialectal differences (Silué 2014), it is obvious that dissimilarities will override inner and invariant features that may suggest similarities among variants of the same cluster.

We have being arguing that the fascination for distinctiveness when dealing with African languages and which led to the overwhelming impression of linguistic diversity is based on ideology essentially. Ideology also translated into the research methodology as a by-product of the overall knowledge system. African linguistics as a research paradigm did not start before the late 18th century; and those involved in research on African languages were not professional linguists. The methodological inconsistency starts with the type of data used to sustain the contrasted views of European and African linguistic landscapes. In contrasting African languages and European languages, researchers often failed to see that the comparison was biased right from the start. Whilst almost all African languages are still unwritten, if not all, the great majority of Western languages enjoy a fairly long-standing written tradition. And since variability is inherent to oral speech whilst structural harmonized format is the a defining feature of written speech, it is no wonder that the African linguistic landscape looked much fractionalized in contrast to the Western linguistic landscape. By way of example, when listening successively to native speakers of English from Britain, the United States, Nigeria, Australia, Ghana or Jamaica, one would note crucial differences in their oral speech; however, when reading a text written by one of these speakers, it would be really hard to tell whether it was written by an American, an Australian, a Jamaican or a Nigerian.

The case of Chinese is even more telling of the methodological inconsistencies in the phantasmagoric description of the African linguistic landscape. Chinese language acknowledges no less than 400 dialects; however, this dialectal diversity is overshadowed by the unicity of the pictographic script. The Chinese writing gives the impression of homogeneity, whilst oral speech stresses variation. This methodological bias distorts the diversity of African languages, when in actual fact, it is just a matter of different corpora: the oral corpus for African languages versus the written corpus for Western languages. Whilst orality gives the impression of unpredictable variability, writing gives the impression of unity. The impression of the extreme variability of African languages confined in orality against the relative homogeneity of western languages reminds us of the same methodological discrepancy that led Léopold Senghor (1988: 177) to the
surprising conclusion that the French language is naturally equipped to “speak sciences”, whilst African languages are genetically appropriate for artistic expression.

It sounds reasonable to hypothesize that writing has, in the long run, an impact on linguistic landscapes, say linguistic heterogeneity. Ka & Diallo (2005: 58) note that “l’écriture peut limiter la diversité idiomatique et les changements au sein d’une langue, parce qu’elle standardise cette langue à divers niveaux”. Empirical observation informs that the human communities which enjoys a long-standing writing tradition are more linguistically homogeneous compared to communities that are vegetating in oralture. Second, it can also be hypothesized that, as a social practice, writings significantly impact thinking strategies on the one hand, (Ong 2000; Goody 1979, 1981; Graff 1981; Caniesa-Doronila 1996, Scribner & Cole 1981) and on the other hand, scripts influence the internal structure of languages. Further research is required to confirm this intuition but for the time being, we hypothesize that alphabetic or syllabic writing are meant to transcribe speech sounds, that is, the most intimate parts of language structure. By contrast, whilst pictographic and ideographic scripts like Chinese do have an impact on social practices and even social transformation, they have a very limited influence on the structure of the language. This, because such pictographic scripts represent concepts only and as such they are completely disconnected from the spoken word which relates to the structure of language.

Mansour (1933: 15) argues that the exaggeration of linguistic diversity in Africa is also due to the lack of sound sociolinguistic data. It may also originate from poor data collection methodology, ranging from the selection of appropriate respondents, to the accuracy of the questions. Missionaries have often resorted to their catechists or untrained domestic staff, who generally lack theoretical or technical metalinguistic consciousness about the nature of language. On relying on these respondents, the researcher runs the risk of collecting the wrong information. Irvine (2006) quotes the case of large proportions of Igbo populations which had been deported in the process of the slavery trade from their home region (present day Nigeria) to the south-west coastal region of Sierra Leone. Not knowing that these Igbo originate a very far-distant region (Nigeria), Missionaries used them as first-hand respondents for the identification and seminal description of the languages and dialects found in this coastal region. As can be seen, not only they had compiled very inaccurate information, but they would then claim having “discovered” a language which, understandably, would be unknown to local people in the area.

The research methodology of Missionaries and other non-professional language researchers raises concern over frequent communication gaps between respondents and field researchers, who come in with questionable preconceptions. The ordinary African is so driven by communication pragmatism, that he is generally polyglot and appreciates multilingualism as a normal phenomenon. In African markets, a seller and his client may even bargain in parallel dialects, each of them using their own speech form and the interaction would still unfold without failure. In such circumstances, they do not think of their respective languages as strictly dichotomic speech forms, but as different speech styles. A European researcher, ideologically conditioned by rather questionable differences among languages will view these speech forms as discrete entities that can be analyzed independently of the speakers. The researcher and the respondent having such diverging appreciations of the linguistic profile of communities, the intents of the researcher, when
formulating his/her questions, and the spontaneous response of the respondent, about the same linguistic situation are likely to bring about ambiguities. If the respondent is asked whether s/he understands the language of fellow countrymen, s/he is likely to assert mutual intelligibility, which in his/her mind, means functional inter-comprehension. As such, the response does not fit the ideological frame of the Western researcher. By contrast, if the same respondent is asked whether his/her speech form is different from that of his/her neighbors and s/he acknowledges the s/he and his/her neighbors speak differently, the researcher may conclude in this instance that this is evidence of different languages, an evidence that could not be less scientific since it comes as, (Van Den Avenne, 2012) ironically put it “de la bouche même des indigènes”.

Conclusion

Linguistic diversity is a natural manifestation of language change. The fact that the current sociolinguistic literature portrays the African continent as the most linguistically heterogeneous region in the world originates from preconceived Eurocentric ideas. Glossonyms often coincide with ethonyms; and since a great number of tribes and ethnic groups are colonial inventions, accounts on linguistic diversity in Africa are significantly overstressed.

Beyond the ideological factor, the perception of extreme diversity has also been reinforced by questionable research methodologies, since the Missionaries or colonial administration officers, who inaugurated African linguistics in the late 18th century, were not qualified for this kind of task. Therefore, whilst linguistic diversity on the continent cannot be denied, it is, by far, less a reality than a myth entertained by an ideologically loaded discourse and as Djité (2008:46) once notes, “language classification [in Africa] is more telling about the classifiers than the [languages] classified”.

Languages do not exist out of speech communities and African societies are changing rapidly through contacts contracted with other regions of the world in the context of a fast-going urbanization which is even accelerated by globalization. Whilst urbanization seems to have a relatively low impact on that African language landscape, especially in rural areas, globalization which might presumably accelerate urbanization on the continent during the next coming decades, is much likely to modify the language ecosystem of the continent. In other words, the internal evolving linguistic ecosystem suggests that some African (Trans)-national lingua francas (Silué 2013) will progressively erode the current African linguistic diversity.
REFERENCES


- Canieso-Doronila, Maria I. 1966. Landscapes of Literacy. UNESCO Institute for Education & Luzac Oriental


Economic Background of Dambadeniya, Yapahuva, Kurunegala, Gampola and Kotte that led to Social Changes in the Medieval Period of Sri Lanka

N. A. Wimalasena
University of Peradeniya, Peradeniya, Sri Lanka

Abstract

The economic factor can be regarded as the decision of social development in a human society and with that development of the economic situation; various structures of a society similarly are described. Several scholars have analyzed through their various researches that commercial activities and development of commerce are major facts which a society will organize systematically in the world. The economic factor which was a reason for the origin and development of socio-political organization of ancient Sri Lanka can be studied under two major divisions. Those are an economy based on agricultural activities and economy based on trading activities. R. A. L. H. Gunawardhana has suggested that periods of prolific activity in building of irrigation works in Sri Lanka coincided with the most flourishing periods of trade. The explanation for this is that commercial gain provided the resources for hydraulic engineering. He points out that there was only one new major irrigation project undertaken between the seventh and the ninth centuries, in sharp contrast to the intense irrigation activity in the period immediately proceeding. H. J. Benda has clearly shown from his primary studies that economy based on agriculture and commerce has affected the changes of society and political organization. Therefore, from this research, the growth of commercial activities will be discussed based on those views and how the commercial activities affected the society. Commerce is a factor which is based on buying of items, transaction, selling and consumption. A commercial market is a place where meeting of merchants and consumers takes place. The research will be mainly based on primary sources and wherever necessary material will also be obtained from limited secondary sources published on the political system of the island.

Keywords: internal trade, International trade, Social change, Commercial commodities, Trading groups, Muslim Merchant community.
1.1 Introduction

When we study commercial history of ancient time, we need to note that there were two major parts which were called local trade and long distance trade. As has been pointed out by Classen, this idea had confirmed the origin of several society and states, and changes of societies as well. The social history of a country cannot be studied without knowledge of internal trade and international trade of that country because commercial activities affect very seriously to change a society. Those societies become very wealthy societies due to the commercial activities. In relation to Sri Lanka, firstly it describes the growth of local trading activities and how far it affected the development of the Sri Lankan society.

1.2 Economic background

Explaining causes for the declining of Rajarata civilization Michael Roberts says that haven provided by the Wet Zone and the potentialities it held out led the population to concentrate their attention on the South-West rather than to attempt a recovery of the civilization in the dry zone. (Roberts, 1971: 99-109). In his view the drift to the South-West was not merely a story of its occupants being pushed out of the dry zone. It was a push pull process. He further states that the more widespread use of iron enabled peasant cultivators to effectively cultivate the Wet Zone and that attention should be devoted to the influence of the coconut palm and the extension of its culture in assisting the population to move to the lowlands of the South-West. Siriweera says that there was a special attraction or process in the South and South-West during and after the thirteenth century to which Michael Roberts has not paid any attention. During this era, there were marked changes in the Indian Oceanic trade. Although there had been a demand for gems, pearls, ivory etc. in the oceanic trade from the very beginning, international trade in spices such as cinnamon, cardamom and nutmeg witnessed an unprecedented spurt after the thirteenth century. Therefore, the Sri Lankans, rulers as well as the ruled, paid greater attention to regions which produced spices. It is due to this factor that ports such as Negombo, Chilaw, Colombo, Bentota, Beruvala, Galle and Dondra developed between the thirteenth and sixteenth centuries. (Siriweera, 2002: 74). He further says that even the kingdom of Jaffna which towards the last quarter of the thirteenth century concentrated on international sea-borne commerce and expanded along the sea coast in order to gain a greater share in this trade. (Ibid., 74) According to this view, trading activities got a high position during this period. This led to the social change in the relevant period. Therefore, we should refer to the commercial background in this period.

As has been pointed out by Hettiaratchi, Paṭṭanagāma or Paṭungam which are showing the development of commerce can be heard in this period. Alakēśvara Yuddhaya and Rājāvali tells us that of officers were appointed by Aryacakravarti to collect the revenues from the Nava Toṭamuna. (Hettiaratchi ) Many of these have located in the Nothern and Western coastal areas. Prince Sapumal won the Yāpā Paṭuna. Kolomtoṭa or Colombo which was camped by the army of Aryacakravarti, Toṭupalas such as Vattala, Halāvata, Mundalama and Puttalas were located in the Western and South-Western coastal areas. Paṭṭanas such as Pānadura Toṭa, Beruvala, Galle, Vāligama and Devinuvara were located in South and Eastern coastal areas.
The term Seṭṭhi who is the person mentioned in some chronicles and other sources was rich and had been an important member of society by commercial activities. Commerce had become so important in the Polonnaruwa kingdom, that the chief of the commercial group or chief of the Seṭṭhi was a member of the king’s Council. This term is mentioned in the Nikāya Saṃgrahaya as the Siṭunā (Nikāya Saṃgrahaya, 1987: 18), and as the Kadagoṣṭhiye ättavun in the inscription of Niśśankamalla’s Rājasabhā. The two terms Siṭu and Mahavelandanā have been mentioned in the Kandavuru Sirita (Jayathilake 1956: 139) and Pājāvali. (Pājāvali, 1965: 113). Seṭṭhinātha was one of the persons who revolted against king Vijayabāhu I (1070-1110). (Mahāvamsa, LIX, 17). It shows that what kind of important status the trading communities had in the Polonnaruwa period. The Alagakkōnāra who was a descendent from a very rich trading family had got a very important place in the Gampola kingdom. It can be said that there were many opportunities to advance through the commercial activities. The Jōti Siṭāna (Epigraphia Zeylanica, Vol. III, 9.) who was the main administrative officer at in Kandy area in the period of King Parākramabāhu VI (1412-1467) Kotte period, reached a high level status of the society.

Because of the immense population, the main cities of the country became the major points of the commerce. Members of the kings’ Council, their families and retinues, army and related officers, mercenaries and various foreigners lived within the city wall or in proximity to the city. Their necessities would have been provided by the merchants. In addition to becoming the administrative centers, some capitals became religious centers. Therefore, those cities were very famous among outside people. And it was also a factor which had developed the trading activities. Furthermore, the king and the devotees had to supply basic needs of monastic establishments of a city. According to the model of capital and functions, it was necessary to have separate market rooms and specific areas for merchants. Some streets in the Polonnaruwa were separated for commercial markets full of commercial items. (Mahāvamsa, LXXIII, 149). There were commercial streets in Kurunegala (Mudiyanse, 1971: 22) and many markets with the abundance of commercial commodities on the two sides of the road in Kotte. (Hāṃsa Sandēśa, 1960: v. 24).

Taking into consideration the planning space of capitals, it can be imagined that commercial centers may have been located in the city or outside the city. The commerce was a one task of a capital city and main task was the port city. There were many port cities in the island such as Mahātittha which was the most important port in the island about the thirteenth century, Ūratoṭa which was a place of bustling trade activity, Galle, Dondra and Colombo were ports more important after the thirteenth century. (Siriweera 2003: 125-134). Galle Trilingual Inscription is vital for this time. (Epigraphia Zeylanica, Vol. III, 334-341). This discloses much information about a larger region in which this island continues to occupy a central position. The tree languages evidently, were the regional commercial languages during that period. Historically, thus the 15th century turns out to be the high water mark of peaceful trade and international cultural intercourse in this region of different territorial, racial, linguistic and religious ethnicities. This tolerance is glaringly apparent from the multi-lingual nature of this Galle inscription. This understanding and collective sharing of mercantile profit among diverse peoples of this immense oceanic highway was rent as under with the commencement of European activities from the beginning of the 16th century when violence, rapaciousness and intolerance replaced the age-long co-operation and understanding that prevailed among these oriental
people. Other ports such as Godapavata can be dated to the 2nd century, Weligama which can be dated to after the 12th century, Beruwala, Bentota, Wattala and Chilow which can be dated to the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. (Ibid). Many Sandēsas have pointed out that there were wide streets in port cities. (Tisara Sandēsa, 1991: vv. 52-55; Parevi Sandēsa, 1967: vv. 84-88; Gīrā Sandēsa, 1920: v. 104). In addition to that, there were many shops of all kinds full of commodities including beads, pearls, gems and other valuable items. The port city was the import and export centers of commercial commodities as well as centers of collecting of commercial items and distribution. Merchants collected export items such as pearls, gems, spices and elephants in the internal areas of the country and transported them to the port city. Production of some export items and collection were done in the port city or in proximity areas to the port city. If not, they were transported by internal production centers. Current archaeological excavations, which have been carried out in Alakolawāva, located five kilometers from Sigiriya, Kuratiyawa located fifteen kilometers from Sigiriya and Samanalaweva close to Belihuloya, showed that there was a very high quality and large amount of 99% pure iron production. (Juleff, 1998: 3-9). A part of these sometimes would have been used for exporting. While some exported luxury commodities such as ceramic ware, silk, perfumes and wines were channeled to local commercial market, a complex trade organization was necessitated for all these things.

Understanding of this commercial network is very limited due to the lack of evidence. A Cola inscription that can be dated to the 11th century, mentions a very important account about production of trade items in port cities. Taxes for weaving machines in Mantai have been described in this inscription. (Subramanya Aiyar, South Indian Inscriptions, 1937, Vol. IV, no. 1412; 1414b). It is reasonable to believe that coir industry was very successful in areas close to Western and Southern coasts after about 12th century AC. Omani and Yemeni ships came to Sri Lanka for coir for ropes, coconut trees for masts of ships, timber for their ship industry. (Gunawardhana, 2003: 29). Many port cities were properly protected by soldiers using walls and doors. Population of those cities consisted of various races and there were variety of groups of communities. There were many and famous monastic establishments in these port cities such as Mahātittha, Devundara and Wāligama. It is reasonable to acknowledge that necessities of permanent people, people of suburban areas, religious establishments and sometimes of foreign merchants had been completed by merchants in port cities. (Saddharmaratnākara, 1912: 641; Rasavāhini, B. E. 2434: 128). These merchants sold the commercial items which were collected from ports and fulfilled the necessities of minor traders. An inscription located in Māntai, reveals that there was a person called Tēvan. Tēvan deposited money in the names of commercial guilds Chankarapatiyar, Verylai Vaniyar and Valakkai Vaniyar in Mantai for the purpose of lighting street lamps close to the Tiru- Irāmishwaram Kovil in that port. (South Indian Inscriptions, Vol. IV, no. 1414B). Nānādēsi was also a trading guild which connected to Sri Lankan commercial activities.

Imported luxury commodities such as silk, ceramic ware, perfumes and wines were transported by ox carts or pack animals from port cities to capital and merchant cities and commercial items for exportation were transported in the same way to the port cities. It was easy to transport these trading items, because there was a road network combining the capital and port cities. (Siriweera, 1986: 17-38). It has been revealed by archaeologival and literature sources that there were roads from Anuradhapura to Mahātittha, Anuradhapura to Jambukola Paṭṭana via Rambāva, Pāvatkulama and
Vavunikulama, Anuradhapura to the Gokanna via Mihintale, Mahakanadarāva, Pankulama and Ratmale. A road which had been directed via Kataragama, Buttala, Yudagananda, Mahiyanganaya and Dāstota, was connected to Magama or Tissamaharamaya, Anuradhpura and Polonnaruva. There was another road which had connected the Southern plain and the North via Mahānāgahula close to Ambalntota, Magama, Devanagara, Bhimatittha, Titthagama, Kalatittha, Muhunnaru, Badalatittha, Mahāgalla and Mandagalla. Trading fairs like Tavalama were held on these roads. Galapāṭa vihāra inscription, dated to king Parākramabāhu II (1236-1270), mentions about a medieval Tavalama and Caravan leader (Sāttunā) situated close to Bentota. (Epigraphia Zeylanica, Vol. IV, No. 25). A Tamil inscription which was found in Padaviya, mentions that another Tavalama in which the money was collected as taxes. (Velupillai, 1971: Pt. I, p. 55; Pt. II, 19-20). The term Kadigai- Tavalam of medieval South Indian inscriptions has denoted itinerant trading groups or trading fairs. (Abraham, 1988: 113).

Information was gathered only about two merchant cities of all other merchant cities which were located in Padaviya and Vahalkada in the Eastern part of North central plain. These cities became very important commercial centers at least in the period of 11th, 12th and 13th centuries. Archaeological remains of Buddhist and Hindu establishments with the expansion of considerable area in Padaviya reveal that there were Sinhala and Hindu people. (Pathmanathan, 1982: 11). This town had a central place which had a wall round eighteen acres. This had mainly benefited as an army security place in the Cola period. Tamil inscriptions at Padaviya which have mentioned about South Indian trading communities such as Ceṭṭin, Nānādēsin and Aiññurvar clearly show that these communities played a very important role in commerce in the Padaviya market town (Nakaram) composed of commercial shops and fairs. (Velupillai, 1971: 46-57; Velupillai, 1971: 32-35).

Vahalkada, located close to Horowpotana was a general market town which was developed from a long time. Tamil inscriptions, found in the Vahalkada, mentions about South Indian trading communities such as Nānādēsi and Valañgiyār who were chiefs of this market town. One of these inscriptions has mentioned about a gathering of many component groups of the town. This group included the guild chief related to the boats in Māntai. (Ibid., 46-57). It means that Vahalkada market town had very large connections and it was represented at two levels in the commercial development which can be named long distance trade and local trade. The same inscription mentions the superintendent of the streets in the Vahalkada. It can be seen that the market town had a very efficient administrative organization. The term Akkasālai, mentioned in that inscription, denoted an industry which was producing crafts. It can be imagined that there were various kinds of craftsmen who produced crafts items.

Officers who were appointed directly by the king or trading communities collected taxes in the main commercial centers such as capitals, ports and the market towns. Perhaps commercial communities were assigned this task, due to getting a lump sum or regular payment to the king. According to the Devundara inscription of King Parākramabāhu II (1236-1270), an officer who was called Mahāpanḍita, collected customs duties at the Dondra port. (Paranavitana, 1953: 63-64). It seems that some market towns and port cities were reckoned as special units for administrative activities. S. Pathmanathan expresses by quoting Tamil sources that Mahātittha or Mātoṭṭam was a
separate administrative unit and Padaviya and Vahalkada were mainly ruled by the trading community in the period of 11th and 12th centuries. (Pathmanathan, Op. Cit., 1984: 145). However, those units were under the king and did not act independently.

Although commerce in villages was limited, ideas of self-sufficiency of village should be reconsidered. Views of some earlier British administrative scholars about Asia affected Marks on ideas of Asiatic mode of production which is based on self-sufficiency economy. (Thorner 1966, pp. 33-66). As has been pointed out by Moris and Stain, the patriotic or nationalist bias of Asian writers resulted in exaggeration of the self sufficiency of the Asian village. But, it should be mentioned that some essential commercial items such as salt and metal wares were not produced in all the Asian villages. Metal and metal products were always brought to villages in Sri Lanka from the areas of production and manufacture. Salt had to be transported from coastal areas to the internal areas of the island. The other necessities which could not have been fulfilled by village communities locally, merchants from outside had to fulfill. Money exchange or items exchange was necessary for this activity. Mediaeval literature has mentioned that villages paid money (Kahavanu) for buying ghee, venison and lime. (Saddharmālaṃkāra, 1954: 450, 503, 675). While merchants who were engaged in commercial activities from home to home, had to always move via regions, they played an important role by selling clothes, rings, necklaces and bracelets which were light trading items to villages. (Mahāvamsa, LXVI, 134; Rasavāhini, Lankādīpappattivattuni, 24 and 134; Pūjāvali, 517). At least some villages had permanent commercial centers. For instance, the Cūlavamsa mentioned that there were some trading shops in the vicinity of Polonnaruwa. (Cūlavamsa, LXXII, 212) Parevi Sandēśa, written in the Kotte period, describes the commercial centers of villages. (Parevi Sandēśa, v. 105). Some items which had been produced in villages circulated in the villages themselves by exchanging or selling. For instance, fishermen sold fishes to villages of that area. Saddharmaratnākara mentions about a fisherman who had exchanged two thirds of his fish daily for rice, ghee, milk and oil. (Saddharmaratnākara, 1912: 469). Saddharamaratnāvali refers to a person who had exchanged his fish for metal weights known as Aka. (Saddharamaratnāvali, 1985: 449). One aka, as has been pointed out by Hettiaratchi, is 20 vī ātas and 8 akas is 1 kalanda. (Hettiaratchi, 1988: 263).

Kings in ancient and medieval Sri Lanka played a very important role for the foreign trading activities as well as local trade. Specially, the king directly dealt with the foreign merchants besides the ruling of commerce in port cities and market towns as well as measurement in the capital. Some exported commodities such as gems, pearls and elephants were under king’s monopoly from the period of 10th century AC. Abu Side, an Arabian writer, has written that the king appointed the men to protect the gem mines. However, as has been pointed out by Batuta and Vartema, king had all the rights to the gems. But the king gave permission to work relating to gems through some payment.

According to inscription found at Gadaladeniya, dated to the 14th century AC, officers of the king could not interfere with the elephant commerce, producing coins and mining of gems. Barbosa’s record shows clearly that elephants were king’s monopoly. The king had a right to pearls bank. According to the Chang-Ta-Yuan, a person who worked with pearls, they had to give half of the harvest of pearls to the king. When Ibn Battuta met Āryacakravarti in Jaffna, servants of Aryacakravarti were categorizing best pearls from a large amount of pearls. Barbosa tells us that small
pearls were to the divers and large ones were to the king. Servants had to give some payment to the king for diving for pearls. And the king got a large income from the pearls monopoly. Barbosa furthermore claims that cinnamon also was the king’s monopoly.

King Bhuvanekabahu I (1272-1284) sent envoys to Egypt (Codrington, 1919: 82-85). and King Parâkramabahu VI (1412-1467) sent an army to the Adrayanpet (Ati vârâmpâtna) port. (Girâ Sandeśa, V. 148-149; Somarathne, Op. Cit., 1975: 125). These facts were directly connected with kings’ desire to promote trade. However, the king had to develop internal trade activities. The research of S. Pathmanathan which mentioned in the South Indian merchant guilds such as Vâlaṅgiyâr, Vîra Vâlaṅgiyâr and Nânâdesi as well as Ceṭṭin, Ceṭtiputtas, Chankarapatiyar and Vanniyâkas who were assistants of leaders of guilds in the places such as Mahatittha, Anuradhapura, Polonnaruwa, Padaviya, Vahalkada and Viharahinna between the 10th and 13th centuries AC is an extremely vital one, because the nature of connections between the king and guilds helped to develop the economic which led to undergo changes in society. (Pathmanathan, Op. Cit., 1982: 11; Indrapala, 1971: 106-107). These commercial communities which managed their trading activities accepted the permission by the ruling king on the promise of paying some money assessing the income of market towns. Some market towns such as Padaviya and Vahalkada were independent units. Army officers were appointed for their security reasons and there were arrangements for public facilities. The functions of these communities are not clear in the politics and war- fare of kings. But, there are many facts regarding the interaction and collaboration of the establishment and maintenance of religious and cultural institutes. (Pathmanathan, Op. Cit., 1982: 11). For instance, Queen Leelawathi made a custom house in Anuradhapura, to be built by the Nânâdesis who was from an Indian merchant guild. The income of that house was utilized to supply spices and other things to the arms house which was called Palabalavimēdhâvi. (Epigraphia Zeylanica, Vol. I, 179-181; Paranavitana, 1960, pp. 12-13). Re-examining Lankatilaka Tamil inscription, Pathmanathan says that the Tamil inscription engraved on the rock at Lankatilaka, which records a royal order pertaining to the endowments made to the temple, refers to a grant made by the community of merchants called patineṇvishaiyam. The inscription provides an indication of the close interaction which the merchant community had with the newly established state temple and the role played by the patineṇvishaiyam in the internal and maritime trade of the Gampola kingdom. (Pathmanathan, 2002: 39)

According to Sri Lankan and foreign sources, Sri Lanka became an entrepot of sea-borne trade which was managed by Eastern and Western merchants via the Indian Ocean from the period of Pre-State in Sri Lanka. Contemporary foreign reports tell us that merchants came to Sri Lanka from ancient times, because Sri Lanka was located in a naval route and it had very important ports and abundance of pearls, gems, tusks and spices. It can be mentioned that pearls and gems were very important commercial items on the commercial history in Sri Lanka. (Deraniyagala, 1969: 140-142; Inscriptions of Ceylon, Vol. I, No. 335, p. 28, No. 606, p. 46, No. 931a, p. 72, No. 1158, p. 74.). It will be very beneficial to study early commercial activities from archaeological evidence such as potteries and horses which were imported from various countries in pre- state in Sri Lanka. (Deraniyagala, 1990: 211-291).
Sea borne trade and transportation were implemented by organized merchant groups and sometimes interference of rulers of various countries in the ancient and medieval world. These merchant groups posted their merchant members at the ports in the various countries and maintained very close connections with the internal merchants for the purpose of collection of trading items and division of the country as well. Rulers of the country encouraged such activities, because there was a large income by customs duties and foreign items were very useful for the elites in their countries.

The most important function of the Eastern Sea borne trade was activated by Chinese and Indian merchants, Muslim merchants came from Arab and other countries from the period of about 8th century to the 16th century. Islam merchants came from various countries and they were unified under the banner of Muslim flag. After the birth of Mohammad, the biggest empire was built by the Arabians of the ancient world in the seventh century. Persia was invaded by them in the 7th century and they got the place which had belonged to the Persians in the Sea borne trade. Umayyad and Abbasid Calif were ruled theoretically whole Islamic kingdoms including from Spain to Al-Sind or the door of India in the period of 7th century AC to 9th century AC. There was a peaceful and stable empire under the Tang Dynasty in China during this period. This atmosphere helped to develop the Indian Sea borne trade and countries like Sri Lanka which were situated close to the sea routes joined this commerce in largely.

Al- Biladuri a writer of 8th century mentions that King in Ratnadveepa or Sri Lanka several Muslim girls who were born in Sri Lanka, were gifted to the Calif. According to the Albiladuri’s report, these small girls were of a late Muslim merchant. (Siriweera, 2003: 119). According to the inscription, found in the Muslim cemetery in Colombo, datable to the 949 AC, it can be said that Muslim merchants lived in the Island in the 10th century AC. Similarly, a tomb was found at Puliyantiv in Mannar dated to the 10th century. (Siriweera, Op. Cit., 2003: 119). Muslims had lived close to the Canton port in China in 8th century AC. Canton was called by them as “Kanfu.” (Hirth and Rockhill, 1911: 14-16).

Golden and silver coins which can be connected to the Muslim dynasties of Bagdad, Alexandriya, North Africa and North India were found in areas between Colombo and the central hills. (Codrington, Op. Cit, 1924: 157-158). Mahāvamsa mentions that Yavana or Muslims brought gifts to the king Parākramabāhu (1153-1186) of Polonnaruva. (Mahāvamsa, LXXVI, 264). The objective of this action may have been the extension of commercial activities of Sinhala kingdom. Muslims were the main merchants in the ports of Colombo, Beruvala, Kalpitiya, Chilaw, Weligama, Galle and Hambantota in Sri Lanka in the period 13th, 14th and 15th centuries. Some of these Muslims came from Arabia and Persia and some of them were originally from Malasia and India.

Chinese people and South-East Asian people, Sri Lankans and South Indians with the Muslim merchants played a very important role in the Indian sea borne trade in this period. South Indian merchant groups such as Aiññuruvar, Valaṅgiar, Nānādēsi, Balaṅgiyar and Nakarattār activated the internal as well as foreign commerce in Sri Lanka between the period of 8th and 13th centuries. Inscriptions record that their trade centers were located ports like Mantai as well as internal places such as Padaviya, Viharahinna and Vahalkada. (Indrapala, 1970, pp. 1-15). Commerce was the main factor
to establish the political hegemony in Sri Lanka by the Colas in the early period of 11th century. Barbosa, a writer of 16th century, mentions that merchants who came from Indian areas such as Coramendal, Vijayanagar, Malabar, Deccan and Cambey to Sri Lanka, bought elephants and tuskers from the king. (Barbosa, 1866: 167-168).

Luxury commodities were circulated by the necessities of elite class in the international commerce by the time of ancient and medieval periods. Accordingly, except items which were exchanged for re-export of intermediaries in Sri Lankan ports, items produced in Sri Lanka such as pearls, gems, ivory, turtle shells, spices, elephants and tuskers were exported from Sri Lanka. Although spices such as cardamom were exported from ancient time, Cinnamon was important in commerce from the medieval period. *Aja- Ibf- Alhind* or Wonders of India, written by Bushug Ibn Shariyar in the 10th century can be considered as the first book which was written about the Sri Lankan cinnamon by a foreigner. (Yusuf, 1970: 142). Records which have been kept in Cairo by Jewish merchants in 12th century AC, tell us that the source of the cinnamon is Sri Lanka. (Goitein, 1973: 120). After that, a letter of Father Montikovino John who went on missionary activities in 13th century refers to Sri Lankan cinnamon. Ibn Battuta who came to Sri Lanka in 1344 AC, mentions that men at Marbar in India gave clothes as gifts and got cinnamon from Sri Lankan king. (Hussain, 1953: 217).

R. A. L. H Gunawardhana who had examined Al- Kitab- Al Rudjari, written by Al- Idrisi, emphasizes that Arabian ships came from Oman and Yemen to Sri Lanka as well as proximity islands of Sri Lanka for the purposes of buying ships, masts, ropes and timber for planking for ships. (Gunawardhana, *Op. Cit.*, 2003: 27). There are clear evidences about the export of coconuts from the Island at least from the period of 15th century AC Reports of Gaspar Coreya, a Portuguese writer describes that when ships of Lorenzo de Almeda arrived in the Colombo port, several ships of Muslims which were loading cinnamon, small elephants, timber and coconuts had been seen. The writer Barose mentions that coconuts were exported from Sri Lanka in the 16th century. (Ferguson, 1908: 36).

Gadaladeniya inscription dated to the 14th century, mentions that king’s officers were banned from trading, minting coins and mining gems. (*Epigraphia Zeylanica*, Vol. IV, No. 3). Barbosa kept a historical record in the second decade of 16th century, presents that elephant trading was a monopoly of the king. (Barbosa, *Op. Cit.*, 1866: 170). If we come to a conclusion according to the conditions of ruling of coastal areas of Portuguese and the Dutch, it can be said that even cinnamon exportation was also under the monopoly of the king. Barbosa’s record mentions about the king’s monopoly of the cinnamon. (*Ibid.*, 167).

Variety of luxurious clothes can be considered as very important ones among the exported items to Sri Lanka. India, China and Burma were the main countries which exported textiles to Sri Lanka. There was a great demand for Chinese silk in the world in ancient period. Facts relating to Chinese silk imported from China and Kasi salu imported from Eastern India can always be seen in the literary sources in Sri Lanka.
It cannot be surmised correctly whether Colombo was the main port where the Muslims lived from 10th century AC. (Nicholas, 1959: 121). Ibn Battuta has mentioned that Colombo was the most important city, when he arrived in Sri Lanka in 1344 AC. It was called Kalanbu by Ibn Battuta. Battuta furthermore describes that Jālasti who had five hundred Abysinians under him, ruled Colombo and he was called the “Prince of Ocean.” (Hussain, 1953: 223-224). According to these facts, it seems that Colombo was an important place in the maritime commerce. The Colombo port had been developed as the main port of the Island when the Portuguese arrived in the Island.

Even Wāligama was important from the 12th century AC. Cūḷavaṃsa mentions that there were rich merchants during the reign of king Parākramabāhu I. (Cūḷavaṃsa, LXXV, 45). Kalyāṇi inscriptions records that a ship which was sent by the Burmese king reached Weligama. (Buddhadatta, 1924: 23). According to the Sandēśa poems such as Tisara, Parevi and Kōkila, Weligama was an important port by the time of 15th century. Weligama was also a town where many Muslims lived. The above mentioned Sandēśas show that Muslims, who lived here, spoke Tamil and sang Tamil songs. (Tisara Sandēśa, v. 43; Parevi Sandēśa, vv. 103-104; Kōkila Sandēśa, vv. 55-57).

Galle was also an important port by the middle of the 14th century. Ibn Battuta mentions that he went from Devundara which was called Deenavura to Galle which was called Kvali and a Captain, named Ibrahim who had a house, treated him well. (Hussain, 1953: 223-224). Chinese ships which sailed to Malabar or African coastal area via the Malacca too came to Galle. Tri Lingual slab inscription in Galle which was written in Chinese, Persian and Tamil languages, mentions that Many Chinese, Muslim and South Indian merchants were the ports in Southern Sri Lanka in 14th and 15th centuries. (Epigraphia Zeylanica, Vol. III, No. 36). According to the Sandēśa poems, Galle was a town which had wide streets and beautiful houses on both sides of the streets. (Tisara Sandēśa, vv. 52-55; Parevi Sandēśa, vv. 87-88).

Devundara was also a very important commercial port in the period of 13th, 14th and 15th centuries. Devundara inscription of king Parākramabāhu II (1236-1270) is an inscription which had mentioned about the rules and regulations related to the customs duties and protection of merchants. According to this inscription, Devundara port what was called Tendirātoṭa, was ruled by an officer named Mahāpandita. (Paranavitana, Op. Cit., 1953: 63-64). Parevi and Haṃsa Sandēśas describe that there was a highly developed town in Devundara in the 15th century. (Parevi Sandēśa, vv. 163-164; Haṃsa Sandēśa, vv. 100-101). The above mentioned Tri Lingual slab inscription in Galle records that Items such as gold, silver, silk and sandalwood were sent by Chinese envoys to a religious centre located Devundara. (Epigraphia Zeylanica, Vol. III, No. 36). Senarath Paranavitana tells that this religious centre was erected by a local king in South India on behalf of the God Varuṇa about 7th century AC. (Paranavitana, Op. Cit., 1953: 10).

With the political centers drifting to the South-West and development of the South-Western areas, ports in Beruvala, Bentota and Vattala became quite important. Farther John de Marignolli arrived at the port Perivils by a ship in the 14th century. (Siriweera, Op. Cit., 2003: 123). Henry Yuls tells us that this was the Beruval port. The record of Father Marignolli as well as Sandēśa poems such as Parevi, Tisara, Girā and Kōkila, Kahakuruļu certify that there was a Muslim center in Beruvala.
The ports such as Bentota, Vattala and Chilow were important basically for the purposes of sailing small ships and transportation of people. Salawath or Chilaw was also a very important port. Damadeṇi Asna tells us that foreigners landed in this port. (Damadeṇi Asna, 1997: 3). Nikāya Saṃgrahaya mentions that the Āryacakravarti had army camps at Colombo, Wattala, Negombo and Chilaw. (Nikāya Saṃgrahaya: 31).

Sri Lankan had the knowledge of the irrigational technology, building and Arts technology from the early period. Similarly, they had the naval technology too. Details about building of ships in Sri Lanka can be obtained from king Vaṭṭagāmaṇi Abhaya’s reign 103-77 BC) by the stories of Bamiṇitiyāsāya. The commentary of Sammohavinodani describes that some monks ran away to India for survival during the famine, and ships were built in the Jambukolapatta for their transportation. (Sammohavinodani, 1933: 445-446). Sammohavinodani further mentions that there were three decks (Tibhumakam) in these ships and the lowest deck of the ship was built in immersed in water and second part was built for living for the monks and the top part of the ship was built for keeping items. (Ibid.). According to the R. A. L. H. Gunawardhana, this type of craft was probably in use in the coastal trade of South India and Sri Lanka. (Gunawardhana, Op. Cit., 2003: 18).

It can be assumed that there had been a special attention about navigation according to a three early brahmi inscriptions which depicted features and expressions. Duvegala inscription in the Polonnaruwa District inscribed a ship with a mast. (Inscriptions of Ceylon, Vol. I, Pl. XXV). The oldest figure of sailing craft is inscribed in this inscription. There are two other inscriptions in the Paramakanda in Puttalama District (Ibid., 83). and Maligatenna in the Kurunegala District. (Ibid., 76). The term Parumaka Navika can be seen in these inscriptions and it can be decided that there were local naval men who were engaging in marine activities from the earlier periods. As has been pointed out by Pliny the Roman writer, naval personal on Taprobane brought pigeons and they decided the land area by freeing the pigeons and in what direction they flew. (McCrindle, 1877: 103).

Cosmos has mentioned that commodities were exported in the Sri Lankan ships in the 6th century. (Ibid., 160-162). Chinese records in 9th century mentioned about the Sri Lankan ships. Li Chao expresses that the various ships that sailed to Chinese ports and ships in lion kingdom were the largest ones and they had ladders to go to all the parts of the ships. (Gunawardhana, and Y. Sakurai, 1981, p. 148). This is corroborated by Kien- tchen, the Chinese writer. (Gunawardhana, Op. Cit., 2003: 25). Chinese records mention further that Ships in Sinhadveepa were long about 200 feet and could transport about 700 passengers.

The records of Al- Idrisi, the Geologist, in the 11th century, shows that Sri Lanka had a very prominent place in building of ships. He mentioned that ships of countries like Oman and Yemen came to Sri Lanka to get masts, ropes, trunks of coconuts and planking etc for the purpose of repairing the ships. (Ibid., 23). His report says that Middle East countries came to Sri Lanka to build ships. Timbers such as coconuts, Jack etc were used for the building of ships. (Ibid.). South Indian Tamil inscription shows that King Parākramabāhu I (1153-1186) built ships in Uraturai to invade South India.
Mahāvamsa mentioned that when king Parākramabāhu I was ready to invade the lower Burma, the whole Sri Lankan coastal area became a ship building industry. (Mahāvamsa, LXXXVI, 45-48).

The letter which was sent by King Bhuvanekabāhu I to the Mamluk Sultan of Egypt has mentioned about ships and that they can supply 20 ships per year which were made from the best timber. (Codrington, Op. Cit., 1919: 83). Gunawardhana analyzes this letter in another way by saying that this letter points to the persistence of the tradition of shipbuilding in the island. The Sri Lankan Ruler further stated that his kingdom had a good supply of timber and offered to construct twenty vessels each year for the Mamluk Sultan. (Gunawardhana, Op. Cit., 2003: 29). Ibn Battuta, came to Sri Lanka in 1344 AC and he mentions that he saw about 100 ships which were owned to the Ṭṛiyā Cakravarti in Jaffna in Malabar Coast. (Ibid., 30).

Muslim community and their trading activities was also a cause to lead social changes during this period. Kiribamune and Devaraja have emphasized that Muslim trade established its closest ties with Sri Lanka after the middle of the thirteenth century. (Kiribamune, 2003: 171-182; Devaraja, 2003:183-190). Al Qazwini, a Muslim Encyclopaedist of the late thirteenth century speaks knowledgeably of Sri Lanka and the arrival in Bagdad of a Muslim lawyer of distinction from there. (Imam, 1971: 18-23). Wassaf describes Sri Lanka in glowing terms and seems to suggest that the advantages of trade between Sri Lanka and the Muslims were weighted on the side of the former. Marco Polo who travelled from China to the Persian Gulf in a Chinese ship is a useful authority on maritime trade in the Indian Ocean towards the end of the thirteenth century. He broke journey in Sri Lanka which would have been on the usual East-West maritime route. Reference is made to the immense wealth of gems in Sri Lanka and the attaches great importance to the presence of Muslims in the country. His statement that Sri Lankan rulers hired Muslim soldiers is interesting. (The Travels of Marco Polo, 1958: 231-232; 255-258). Merchants were forced to employ soldiers to combat piracy in the Arabian Sea and the soldiers whom Marco Polo speaks of may have been there to guard Muslim trading interests. This brings out even more forcefully the importance attached to the Sri Lankan trade. That piracy was a problem around Colombo is mentioned by Ibn Battuta a little later. (The Rehla of Ibn Battuta, 1953: 217). Involved in this trade were both Muslim and Hindu merchants, Indian and Arabs. Efforts were made by some Sri Lankan rulers to exclude the Indian middlemen and enter into direct trade with Egypt and West Asia. To quote an Arabic document of the thirteenth century which refers to an embassy sent by Bhuvanekabāhu I (1272-1284). (Codrington, 1919: 82-85).

Referring to this statement, Kiribamune further says that one can see that this state trading was attempted and efforts were also made to attract Muslim merchants from countries such as Egypt. (Kiribamune, 2003: 178). These links with Egypt are confirmed by a number of Arab coins of the thirteenth century found between Colombo and the hill country. Among them, the greater number belongs to Sultan Qulaun of Egypt, the king to whom Bhuvanekabāhu I sent his envoys. (Codrington, 1924: 158). In this connection one could point to a recent find of four Sri Lankan coins, the last of which belongs to Bhuvanekabāhu I at Mogadishu in Kenya. (Chittick, 1980, Pt. 2: 123). Local inscriptive evidence can be shown relating to the thirteenth century. This inscription was written in Arabic on a rock surface at Adam’s Peak. The Document simply records an invocation for the blessings of the Prophet. (Sameer, 1966: 37). It would seem that Adam’s Peak in the gem country held its spell.

Muslim traders and settlements were very much part of the Sri Lanka according to the Sinhalese literary works of the fifteenth century. The *Kōkila* and *Girā Sandēśas* refer to Muslim women (*Yon Liya*). (*Kōkila Sandēśaya*, v. 59; *Girā Sandēśaya*, v. 104) and a Muslim settlement at Mahaveligama in Southern Sri Lankas referred to in the former text. (*Kōkila Sandēśaya*, v. 56). Beruvala figures as a Muslim trading centre frequented by foreign ships. (*Tisara Sandēśaya*, v. 74; *Girā Sandēśaya*, v. 74.) Galle trilingual slab inscription also can be shown as an example for the Muslim merchant activities in Sri Lanka. This inscription was set up by the Chinese ship captain Zheng Ho in 1410 AC. (*Epigraphia Zeylanica*, Vol. III: 331-341). This was inscribed in Persian, Tamil and Chinese. This document contains lists of offerings to the deities of the Buddhists, Hindus and Muslims. The inscription was obviously set up for the benefit of the merchant community at Galle or littoral. This is a clear indication that even in the early fifteenth century the external trade of Southern Sri Lanka was still in the hands of foreign merchants, among them Persian speaking Muslims. Prevalence of Persian may not indicate an Iranian connection but links with Muslim India.

Gunawardena has emphasized that there were a few women at the ports of this island (as at other ports of the world under such circumstances) to provide some consolation to the lonely sailor or trader. (Gunawardena, 1959: 84). It is natural to expect, therefore, that in course of time, there would arise a considerable community of mixed descent-Arab and Sinhalese or Arab and Tamil- at the sea ports of Sri Lanka. When in the cause of time, non-Muslim merchants make but rare appearances at the ports-as was the situation by 14th and 15th centuries-these communities at the ports must have acquired an increasingly Islamic character. But by that time or even considerably before it the Arab element in these settlements was being replaced by Indian Muslim elements. Arab traders virtually disappear from the scene and Indian Muslim merchants dominate it to a greater extent than the Arabs had ever done. Apart from the coastal places which developed Muslim settlements in course of time, there probably was one other place which developed a Muslim settlement much more rapidly. This was Beruvala, which during the Battuta’s journey along the coast in 1344 does not figure as a place where Muslims were found. Five or six years later it was an important Muslim settlement which John de Marignolli was not pleased with. The tradition about Beruvala is that it was colonized from Kāyalapṭṭanam. The Parevi and *Girā Sandēśas* of the first half of the 15th century refer to Beruvala as being peopled by *baburas* a generic term like *Yōna* or *Marakkala* to denote Muslims. As a result of mingling Sinhala and Muslims, it was led to the social change during our period as well as Kandyan time. Thus Gunawardena says the word *Kandyanisation of these men*. (*Ibid.*, p. 91).

The story of ethnic interaction becomes even more interesting after the fall of Polonnaruwa because of the emergence of a third major group, namely the Muslims. Their origins go back to the West Asian as well as Indian Muslim trade settlements at the ports and market towns of the island.
These Muslim traders, it must not be forgotten, married local women and, therefore, their descendants share the ancient ancestry of the Sinhalese and Tamils. Since the Malay soldiers and the Portuguese who came later did not bring their womenfolk with them but married locally, the Malay and Burgher communities, too, share the ancestry of the others.

In ancient times, services rendered to the state were paid for more by grants of land than by the payment of cash. The members of the upper class had the designation of Samdaru. The officials of the royal palace and the various departments of administration were recruited from them. The most desirable of land tenure was the pamunu, an estate possessed in perpetuity by a family in hereditary succession… In some cases owner of a pamunu estate had the full rights over it, and apparently was not obliged to pay any dues to the State…… Those who enjoyed pamunu lands were referred to as pamunu laddan and they appear to have held their estates irrespective of any services they rendered the State. (Attigalle, UCHC, Vol. I, Pt. II, 1960: 375-376). The situation describes to the late Anuradhapura period. In the Polonnaruwa period, this system developed further. “Next rapidly the members of the Buddhist Sangha and brahmins, who enjoyed a privileged position, came those who had acquired a patent of nobility the possession of land heritable in the family (pamunu) from which they derived rents……,. A desirable form of land tenure is referred to in the documents of the period by the term parapura which must have denoted land which had come down in succession in a family. (Ibid., 560-561). In regard to the period with which this research is concerned the system of land tenure which prevailed this period was basically the same as that in the Polonnaruva period. (Ibid, 720). Quite probably the janapraveni of family such as the Sēnāḷiṃkāra, and the Alagakkōṇāras, which were referred to in our sources, would have preferred to the pamunu and parapura lands. It may also be remembered that a modification in the fiscal system of the time was the overlord, instead of appropriating a portion of the produce of all the land, had a price of land in his land holding cultivated free by the villagers the produce of which he appropriated totally.

The very products that demand for which are growing in the outside world such as Cinnamon, Cardomons, Pepper etc. either grows wild on the lands in the wet zone, or the climatic conditions were such that they could be easily grown. It is probable that the traditional administrative hierarchy, which received lands on service tenure or, were given lands on the pamunu or parapura basis, i.e. heritable lands would have interested themselves in cultivating, collecting and selling these products to the trade network that were operating in the country, which had contacts abroad as well. This would have been motivated to do this by two factors. Firstly, the revenues acquired from the land even under the modified system of land holding described above, would have been less than what their forbears in the dry zone had received. Secondly, their efforts in trading would have been facilitated by the State, which was also interested in increasing its revenues making effort to encourage the growth of trade. It was probably under their circumstance that the traditional noble families, the descendants of the samdaru of the Anuradhapura period such as the mehenavaras, the Ganavesi and even later entrants to this class such as the Alagakkōṇāras, came to have great wealth they possessed in the 14th century. Sēnāḷiṃkāḍhikāra of the menavara family and of the the Sangharāja Sīлавamoṣa Dhammakitti of the Gaṇavāsi family were very wealthy persons. The Mayūra Sandēśa refers to the great wealth of Dēvamāṇtriṣvara, nephew of Niśṣanka Alagakkōṇāra. We find in documents of the period, several references to persons bearing the title siṭu. The word is derived from the Palihad seṭṭhi, meaning
wealthy merchant or banker. (Childers, 1909: 473). Jayamahale, who was either a son of Vikramabāhu III, or a person bearing this title in 1373 AC, is called situi in the Niyamgampaya Sannasa. (Sahitya, 1972: 128). Among the grants made to the Gadaladeniya vihara in 1344 AC were a house and a garden for his own maintenance. (Epigraphia Zeylanica, Vol. IV: 90-100). Verse 159 of the Mayūra Sandēsa, of the late 14th century, mentions the nagaram situi of the court of Bhuvanekabāhu V of Gampola, a word which Paranavitana interprets as controller of finance. (Attigalle, UCHC, 1960: 729).

In this context, Alagakkōnāras were doubly fortunate in acquiring their wealth. As members of the merchant caste, they would have engaged in trading with foreign countries, and as a family which had intermarried with other local noble families, and had become absorbed into the social fabric of the island, they would have formed a part of land owning aristocracy as well. They would thus have drowned profits from the earnings of their hereditary pamunu lands in their fief at Raigama, and gained additional profits as traders as well.

The picture that emerges from the above evidence is the existence of a number of persons from leading families who seem to have possessed great wealth. It must be emphasized that this did not represent the rise of a new merchant class distinct from the land owning nobility itself to financial affluence as a result of the products of their lands finding a merchant class to the upsurge of trading activity in the Indian Ocean. It must be remembered also that the land owning class was the class from which the administrative hierarchy was recruited.

Along with the increase of the wealth of land owning class, we find a situation where the group of families that had governed the country for nearly a thousand years had dried out and even those who claimed descent from this family, such as the Savulus of Dambadeniya, did not have their claims substantiated by recent occupancy of the throne. They, in fact, were only another noble family whose only difference from their colleagues was that they claimed royal descent, and in fact, they had intermarried with the other local nobility. Under their circumstances, the personal sanctity available to a family which had been in recent occupation of political leadership was not available to them, which in turn resulted in their dependence on the support of their wealthy and powerful nobles who sometimes placed them on the throne as happened in the case of Sēnālamkādhikāra placing Bhuvanekabāhu IV in the position of kingship. The political leadership of the country in the 14th century, therefore, lay, not in a single family whose position was stabilized and sanctified by long occupation of the throne, but in the hands of a wealthy land owing oligarchy itself closely interconnected by marriage.

Simultaneously to this situation had come the weakness of the economic position of the State. There is no doubt that on the case of Anuradhapura and Polonnaruwa kingdoms, and even the Dambadeniya kingdom, the economic power of the king, and hence his military power was such larger then any single one of his subordinate rulers or nobles. The large grain surpluses enabled him to collect a larger amount by way of taxation which enabled him to maintain effectively the instruments of State power. As against this, the ruler of the wet zone kingdoms did not possess the same degree of revenue potential, the increase in trade probably not compensating for the loss in land revenue. Thus the differential between the financial power of the state and the financial power of the land owning nobles became less. Apart from the lack of personal sanctity attached to at ruling dynasty of the 14th century,
the latter would have found it necessary to obtain the support of the wealthy noble families in the country in maintain themselves on the throne with any degrees of stability, as the power of enforcement of state authority was much less in their case than was the case with their predecessors of Anuradhapura and Polonnaruwa.

This interaction of these forces, i.e. the reduced military power of the central government, the loss of stabilizing factor by a ruling family that had an element of sanctity attached to it and the rise of the land owing administrative class to a position of economic financial affluence, explains the instability and fragmentation of government authority that was a feature of the 14th and 15th centuries, we find Sēnalaṃkādhikāra, a wealthy noble, setting up Bhuvanekabāhu IV on the throne, a position rendered vacant by the disappearance of the Dambadeniya royal family, and Alagakkōnāra, another wealthy noble, supporting Vikramabāhu III who had rebelled against Bhuvanekabāhu IV. The noble became so powerful that they came into existence the title of prabhuraja, connoting the most eminent of the local nobles. The position ultimately come to be occupied by the Alagakkōnāras who were foreign origin, and not long standing members of the hereditary administrative class (though they had intermarried with it) which itself show the growth of the power of the nobles. In the reign of Bhuvanekabāhu V, the various members of the Alagakkōnāra family were at war with each other, not for the kingship, but for the post of prabhuraja, the post of de facto power. Even in the 15th century, a nobleman named Jōtiya Siṭāna, who was in control of the hill country, rebelled against Parākramabāhu VI of Kotte. (Attigalle, UCHC, 1960: 760). In the reigns of Bhuvanekabāhu VI, two chief named Siriwardhana Patiraja and the Lord of Kuragama rebelled against the king. (Ibid., 679). During the same reign, a prince named Senasammata Vikramabāhu established himself as the ruler of Kandy. (Ibid., 680). We find the same pattern, being repeated in the case of the latter; in the Alut Nuvara Inscription inhabitants of the Satara Korale, (Epigraphia Zeylanica, Vol. IV. 268-270) led by Yāpā Bandāra, Dodanvela Parākrama, Varāve Bandāra and Gampola Bandāra declared their fealty to Sēnāsammata Vikramabāhu in return for his promise not to caurse them harm, a situation unheard of in the reigns of Vikramabāhu I and Parākramabāhu I of Polonnaruva, who made short shrift of revels by hanging and implying them. (Cūla vaṃsa, LX, vv. 42-43; LXXV, vv. 160-162; 192). This chronic weakness of the state, which continued till no political factors came into play after the arrival of the Portuguese in 1505 AC, was a result of the fundamental economic and social changes that had occurred with the shift of the base of power of the Sri Lankan kings to the wet zone of the island, and the rise of the power of the land owing class as result of the upsurge of trade in the period under survey.

As has been pointed out by Indrapala, there were also other ordinary people who migrated to perform economic functions. (Indrapala, 2005: 284). It is well known that the origin of some of the major castes in the Sri Lankan society is to be traced to such migrations from South India. In the fourteenth century, when the lucrative trade in cinnamon began to expand, the Sinhalese kings encouraged members of the Tamil Cāliyar (weavers) caste to migrate. In time, this community became the caste of cinnamon-peelers and was absorbed into the Sinhalese population as a service caste with the name of Salāgama. (De Silva, 1995: 179-180). De Siva says that the weaver caste of Cāliyar find mention in the south Indian inscriptions of the Cola period. The migration of this caste to Sri Lanka may have begun as early as the eleventh or twelfth century. De Silva says that the salāgamas who were an important group which had migrated from the Malabar, Coast between the thirteenth and the
sixteenth centuries had originally been primarily weavers. Some of them had been ordered by the king of Kotte to peel cinnamon. With the rising demand for cinnamon there was a tendency to enlist all of them for cinnamon peeling. In time, members of other castes too were required to peel cinnamon and there are instances of karāva, hunu and batgam people performing this task. In course of time, these peelers were absorbed by the salāgama caste.” By the sixteenth century, the new immigrant karāva, salāgama groups were developing identification with an occupation but had not as yet developed a ritual connection with the goygamas. (De Silva, 1995: 179-180) Obeysekere is however, inclined to treat the salāgama as later immigrants. He tells us that The salāgama caste were weavers, later cinnamon peelers from Malabar who were brought to the south coast by the Portuguese… The original settlers of the West and South were Sinhala goigama (farmers), some of them originally from Malabar. Much later, in early Portuguese times, there were immigrations of karāva (fishermen, karaiyar of South India) and salāgama. (Obeysekere, 1984: 527). As Gunawardana has stated, “there were several waves of immigration which brought not only linguistic groups like Demaḷa, Malala, Kaṇṇaḍa and Doḷuvara (Tulu) from South India but also the Jāvakas from south east Asia, and these groups of immigrants who originally spoke different languages came to be absorbed into the two main linguistic groups in the island. (Gunawardhana, 1990: 65).

The result of all these interaction was a mingling of peoples that led some to caution those who talked about racial purity or exclusively or superiority in modern times. Citing Gunawardene, Indrapala says, while endorsing the view that Sinhala had become an umbrella-like term giving shelter under to persons of diverse linguistic origins,” quotes a cautionary statement by W. A. de Silva, made early in the twentieth century. Analyzing the evidence of the class of Sinhala writing called vittipot, de Silva pointed out that one vittipota states that from very early times the island was colonized by people from all parts of India who mixed freely to form one nation. Concluding the analysis, de Silva added; “Therefore those inhabiting this Sinhala (country) should not say that they belong to some one particular family or race. (Indrapala, 2005: 284).

1.3 Conclusion

In the light of foregoing discussion, it may be concluded that economic background led to the social changes during the period under survey. Muslims, One major ethnic community in Sri Lanka emerged with the development of commercial activities in this period. As much as there was political instability in the Muslim world since the fall of Bagdad in 1258 AC, Sri Lanka too encountered a period of political unrest after the middle of the 13th century. Though this had adverse effect on the economy, the island’s foreign trade grew in importance and Sri Lanka still continued to be an important strategic centre in the east-west trade of the period, and the Muslims still played a significant role in the country’s external trade which was carried through to the ports of west coast such as Kalpitiya, Puttalam, Chilaw, Negombo, Colombo, Kalutara Beruwala and Galle. It was shown that with the increase in the importance of foreign trade, the Muslim settlements in in the coastal areas especially around ports increased. The Sri Lanka Sandēśa poems of the 14th and 15th centuries refer to the commercial prosperity of some places.
According to the facts analyzed above, it could be seen that there were commercial activities in Pre-Colonial Sri Lanka in the medieval period of Sri Lanka. With the development of irrigational technology, building activities, Arts and Architecture, there was well organized commerce in ancient and medieval Sri Lanka. Commercial activities were very important in the capital, port cities and market towns. Although agriculture was the main economy in the country, itinerant merchant had a task at the village too. After the 12th century AC, trading activities very rapidly came to the zenith of the economy in Sri Lanka according to the above mentioned facts. Therefore, the development of commerce resulted in the wealth of the society. With the wealth, elites and various groups of community emerged during this period.
References


-Ferguson, Donald (1908). The History of Ceylon from the Earliest Times to 1600 A.D. as related by Joan de Barros and Diogo Du Couto, *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society, Ceylon Branch*, No. 60.


-Hirth and Rockhill (1911). *Chao- Ju- Kua, His work on the Chinese and Arab Trade in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries*, St. Petersburg.


The Social and Political Background of the `Abbasid Revolution: The Rise of the `Abbasid Caliphate

Mahayudin Hj Yahaya
Islamic University of Sultan Sharif Ali
Negara Brunei Darussalam

Abstract

This paper aims at analyzing the social and political conflict between the different tribal groups within the Umayyad rule and to establish a link between the Islamic values adopted by some of the Umayyad Caliphs and the `Abbasid Revolution. One of the particular concerns of this paper is to see the changes following the `Abbasid Revolution’s victory, mainly the complete assimilation of all members of the Muslim community, Arabs and non-Arabs into the empire. The transfer of the Islamic capital from Damascus to Baghdad had its significance namely the intersection of several trade-routs which could give real prosperity to the `Abbasid empire, and subsequently led to the remarkable rapid spread of Islam among the non-Arabs in the east and the far-east including the Malay Archipelago. The remarks in this paper are intended to present a new picture of conclusion reached in a more detailed study of the `Abbasid Revolution, conclusions which are based on evidence contained in the earliest Arabic sources available to us.

Keywords: Social, Politics, Abbasid, Khurasan, Revolution.
This paper analyses the social and political conflict between the different tribal groups within the Umayyad rule and to establish a link between the Islamic values adopted by some of the Umayyad caliphs and the Abbasid Revolution. The remarks in this paper are intended to present a new picture of conclusions reached in a more detailed study of the Abbasid Revolution, conclusions which are based on evidence contained in the earliest Arabic historical sources available to us, notably those of al-Tabari, al-Baladhuri and al-Ya`qubi.

One of the main and still current interpretation of the Abbasid Revolution put forward by Van Vloten and J. Wellhausen in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries is that it was mainly a national struggle of the Iranians against the Arab ruling class. This conclusion is apparently based on a statement by al-Jahiz: “Abbasid state was Persian and Khurasanian that of the Marwanids, Umayyads and Arabs”.

However, the opinion that it was a renaissance of Iranian nationalism was mainly due to the influence of racialist ideas circulating by the turn of the 19th century. Although racial antagonisms played their part, they were not the prime motivating forces of the revolution. Although some mawali (non-Arab Muslims) were involved in the movement and worked side by side with the Arabs for the Abbasids, they were not by any means exclusively Persians, but included Iraqis, Syrians, etc. The Persian dahāqin (local heads) had adopted themselves to the Umayyad regime and played an important role in its working. In return, they were given full power in the assessment of taxes in the different districts of Khurasan. It was left to the dahāqin to decide how the burden of the tribute would be divided. The Arabs had nothing to do with the allocation of taxes: they simply received the money.

The clear feature of the Abbasid Revolution is that the change from the Umayyads to the Abbasids was brought about mainly by the Arab element in Khurasan, whose interpretation was broader than the relatively limited Umayyad view. Those Arabs were the settlers of Merv and its surrounding villages who lost their position as members of the Arab ruling classes and who were also grieved by their position as subjects of the non-Muslim Iranian aristocracy of Merv. So, the reasons for the conflicts between the different tribal groups must be sought in their interests rather than in legendary animosities. Wellhausen was wrong when he said that "If the tribal-feud abated in Basra were transferred because its conquest was achieved from there". Although these two provinces had a similar reason for revolting, mainly unwillingness to submit to the authority of the central government, their circumstances were different. Therefore, their risings took different forms and followed different political paths from the very beginning until the Abbasid Revolution.

---

4 Ibid.
The Abbasid Revolution took place in Merv, Khurasan. It came about as a result of an extensive and successful secret revolutionary movement and organization representing the discontent of the Arab tribesmen in Khurasan with the Arab ruling classes and of the people of Khurasan, both Arabs and non-Arabs, with the local heads and central government. With the collapse of the central government of the Sassanians, the local heads in Khurasan of the Sassanian who formed the local nobility continued to enjoy their pre-Islamic privileges under Arab rule namely in respect to the allocation and collection of taxes. They as well as warriors, the priests and the civil servants, were exempted from the poll-tax. The burden of the taxes fell heavily on the peasantry and they also had to serve in the infantry in the army. In the cities the bourgeoisie were in a better situation for while they paid the poll-tax they did not have to serve in the army. Under Arab rule, this system was continued, and the tax-payer continued to pay his land tax or trade tax in addition to the poll-tax. The Arabs who were able to purchase certain land in some villages had to pay the tax imposed on this land to the local heads. If the Arabs were paying a land tax, they certainly were not paying a poll-tax and that was precisely where the new reform of Caliph `Umar bin `Abd al-`Aziz (Umar II) declared equality between the Arab and non-Arab Muslims in Khurasan.

The conquest of Khurasan started during the reign of Caliph Uthman ibn Affan under the leadership of `Abdullah ibn `Amir (29-35A.H./649-655A.D.). Meanwhile the situation in Iraq was tense as a result of the influx of the new Arab tribesmen into the garrison towns of Kufa and Basra. The arrival of these newcomers caused severe social and economic problems in the province which had never occurred before. Caliph `Uthman's solution to these problems was to open new fronts in new territories to consume the energies of the newly-arrived tribesmen. In the year 31A.H./651A.D., `Abdullah ibn `Amir, after preparing his army, started towards Khurasan. When he arrived at Tabasyn he immediately concluded a peace treaty with its people, and sent Ahnaf ibn Qays to Khurasan with an army of 4,000 Arabs and 1,000 Persians. He was opposed there by the Hayatilahm the Hephthalites, who were assisting the people of Khurasan, but Ahnaf put them to flight and captured Khurasan.

When Mu`awiyah was recognized as the first Umayyad Caliph in 41A.H./661A.D., the Arab army was re-established and `Abdullah ib `Amir was restored as governor of Basra with Khurasan and Sistan in his governorship. In 45A.H./66A.D., Ziyad ibn Abi Sufyan was appointed to replace Abdullah ibn Amir as governor of Khurasan. In 50A.H./670A.D. when Kufa was added to Ziyad's governorship he divided it into four divisions. The head of each division was appointed by the central government from among the best men. He also revised the record of the diwan, the list of the Arab warriors entitle to stipends, `ata`, but removing all the names of the dead and the Khawarij from it and adding instead some of the names of the newcomers into it. Despite this revision many of them were still excluded from the diwan. As a solution to this problem, Ziyad sent as many as 50,000 Arab

---

7 Hephthalite (hayatilah) were the nomadic tribes of Iranian origin fro Central Asia. They appeared for the first time in the 4th century among the armies of the later Kushans, helping them against the Aasanians. Soon they became the successors to Kushan.
tribesmen and their families from Kufa dan Basra to Khurasan to settle permanently there, securing the conquests already made and providing the forces needed for their further expansion. This was the first time that the Arab tribesmen from Kufa were employed in the conquest in Khurasan; and none of them withdrew from Khurasan after the time of Ziyad until the Abbasid Revolution. It is also worth noting that the settling of 50,000 Arab families in Khurasan was an aggressive step taken by the central government in this part of the empire; the dahaqin on the other hand, were controlling the local administration in different districts of the province.

After the death of Mu`awiyah and his son, Yazid, tribal feud between Mudarites and Qaysites occurred in Khurasan. This was ended with the victory of Mudarites, the majority of Arab tribesmen in Khurasan. This troubled province alarmed `Abd al-Malik, a new Caliph, and compelled him to change his policy to one which could bring the tribesmen in line. He saw that al-Hajjaj, a newly appointed governor of Iraq and eastern provinces, including Khurasan, was the only man who could apply such a new policy and restore order in the province. Abd al-Malik must have realised the needs and interests of the people of Khurasan, and believed in the ability of al-Hajjaj to deal with any problems regarding the military and administrative affairs. Thus, al-Hajjaj was given more than half of the empire, including Khurasan to control. From the very beginning, al-Hajjaj realized that the tribe of Mudar was predominant in Khurasan and he saw that if matters were left in their hands, the situation would be dangerous. So, he decided to balance it with another Qaysite which could perhaps change the situation. One of the strongest Qaisites was al-Muhallab, whom al-Hajjaj hoped could handle the increasingly complex in the province. In fact, during the governorship of al-Muhallab, a very small income was received by the central government as only one-fifth of the booty was sent; and there is no indication that al-Muhallab had attempted to settle the Arab tribesmen in Khurasan.

When Qutayba, another Qaysite was appointed to replace al-Muhallab, a new policy was introduced in Khurasan. He applied the policy of using the local population to support his army. During Qutayba's governorship in Khurasan, a number of Iranians had converted to Islam and were enlisted in the diwan and received the regular stipends of the muqatilah, warriors, and this policy was applied to all of Khurasan. We are told that in the siege of Samarqand (96A.H./715A.D.) the levies of Bukhara and Khwarizm were called `abid by Qutayba. When the prince of Samarqand protested, Qutayba had to prove to him that he also had some `Arab in his army. However, the situation had demoralised the army of the conquered land thus discouraging it from joining Qutayba. Thus, Qutayba had to ask al-Hajjaj to supply him with fresh troops to assist him in his campaigns. From now on the situation in Khurasan became hazardous and revolts broke out against Qutayba. When Qutayba went to Khurasan he was not accompanied by any `Arab troops but merely used `Arab tribesmen in Khurasan and conquered peoples in his expeditions. This policy would have succeeded in the long run if it had been helped by an effort to consider their interests and assimilate them with the Arab community. But Qutayba did not do this, he instead followed the opposite policy, making use of these people and neglecting their interests, segregating them in a special division of his arm instead of leaving them to join the Arab tribesmen. For the Arab tribesmen they also had their reasons for

---

revolting against Qutayba. The increasing power of the central government lessened their tribal chiefs authority. For example, in the case of Waqi` ibn Sud of Tamim, he was recognized by the Arab tribesmen in Khurasan as the provisional successor of Qutayba. Instead, he was driven from his position by Qutayba who appointed a certain man of Bani Darar al-Dabbi. At the same time, they had been long on the battlefield and felt that the time had come to live in peace and settlement.

When Qutayba tried to support Caliph al-Walid's attempt to abandon the terms of his father, `Abd al-Malik's `ahd, oath, and nominated his son, `Abd al-`Aziz as his successor he was strenuously opposed by `Umar II and the Arab tribesmen in Khurasan. This analysis implies that the Arab tribesmen in Khurasan had already hoped that another caliph, that is Sulayman ibn `Abd al-Malik, would change the policy of the empire. And it may also be noted that `Umar II himself knew that Sulayman ibn `Abd al-Malik favoured a change of policy so that immediately after al-Walid died he secured the succession to Sulayman. During the short reign of Sulayman (96-99 A.H./715-717 A.D.), some important actions were taken, including that of releasing the prisoners in the jail of Basra, and bringing back those who had been on campaign.

The success of the caliph Sulayman and his political achievements deserve some attention. Although information about him in our sources is scanty and unclear, there is sufficient ground to believe that his policy was directed by his adviser, Raja` ibn Haiwah al-Kindi, a mawla (non-Arab) of the aristocratic South Arabian tribe of Kinda already influential under `Abd al-Malik and playing the role as the Umayyad's court theologian. During Sulayman's reign, Raja` was one of the most influential personages and had a special relationship and high place of honor with Sulayman which no one else enjoyed. The Caliph placed complete trust in him and relied upon him.

Suyuti, several centuries later, though he was careful to excuse himself from being flagrantly anachronistic by saying that the term "vizier" was not yet used at that time, nevertheless in his usage of it indicates how later ages viewed Raja` ibn Haiwa's position vis-a-vis the Umayyads. M.A.Shaban has given due weight to Raja`'s role, pointing out that, despite Raja`'s services to `Abd al-Malik and al-Walid, his special position of power under Sulayman indicates that he was basically out of sympathy with the Arab expansionist policies of the Qaysite party in the state, of which al-Hajjaj and Qutaybah were supreme examples. He also sees Raja` as a reformer, preparing the way for the more radical changes of policy in `Umar II's caliphate. Where Sulayman's policies had been ambiguous, Umar II's were clear and radical. It is certain that the sudden death of Sulayman in 99 A.H./717 A.D. prevented him from drawing up his policy, but this was achieved under `Umar II with an element of experience

14 Bosworth, op. cit., p.44.
and continuity. Above all, Raja` was called the advisor of the caliph and such phrases as *khassa bihi*, in preference to others, or *hua al-ghalib `ala* (he is dominant) are mentioned in the Tarikh al-Ya`qubi.\(^{16}\) `Umar ibn `Abd al-`Aziz was in fact a capable caliph and a real Muslim statesman. Some modification had already been introduced during the reign of `Abd al-Malik ibn Marwan, who took the religious duties seriously in that he was frequently accompanied by theologians. But the first Umayyad caliph really to think in theocratic terms was caliph `Umar ibn `Abd al-`Aziz. This caliph was inclined to draw logical inferences from his standpoints towards problems which had been taking shape over many years but had been left in abeyance.\(^{17}\) It is very probable that his religious and political attitude was much affected by Raja` ibn Haiwah, his personal secretary, to whom he owed his succession. Raja` once said to him “If you desire to achieve salvation from the punishment of God, He is magnified and exalted then make desirable for the Muslims that which you have made desirable for yourself”.\(^{18}\)

Caliph `Umar ibn `Abd al-`Aziz's financial and administrative changes, including the famous proclamation of fiscal policy circulated to provincial governors and the redressing of abuses in the local taxation systems, are stated in Sirah `Umar ibn `Abd al-`Aziz by Ibn `Abd al-Hakam which has been penetratingly studied by H.A.R. Gibb "The Fiscal Rescript of `Umar II" (Arabica, ii, 1955). As noticed by Gibb, the Rescript avoids the term clients (*mawali*). It is understood that `Umar ibn `Abd al-`Aziz was trying to establish a Muslim community without any discrimination .

According to the rescript, "wherefore, whoever accept Islam, whether Christian or Jew or Magian, of those who are now subject to the *jizyah*, and who forsakes his abode wherein he was before, he shall enjoy all the privileges of the Muslims and shall be subject to all the duties laid upon them; and it is their duty to associate with him and to treat his as one of themselves\(^{19}\)." Muslims apparently had still to pay the land-tax, because otherwise the tax revenue would have been to seriously impaired.\(^{20}\)

`Umar ibn `Abd al-`Aziz was succeeded by Yazid ibn `Abd al-Malik in 101A.H./720A.D., in accordance witj Abd al-Malik's wasiat. But Yazid did not follow Umar ibn Abd al-Aziz's path, but preferred to maintain the old system of Arab domination. The old Sasanian system was still continued and practised in Khurasan during that time according to which there was a tax imposed on the land as well as on trade and other occupations.

There was also a *jizyah* imposed on every person, peasant or city dweller, between the ages of twenty and fifty, graded according to income. The nobility, the warriors, the priests and the civil servants were exempted from the *jizyah*. (poll-tax).\(^{21}\) From the very beginning a land owner, either Arab or non-Arab, Muslim dan non-Muslim was supposed to pay *al-kharaj*, they certainly were not

\(^{18}\) Bosworth, *op. cit.*, p.75.
\(^{21}\) Ibid., p.116.
paying al-Jizyah and that was precisely where the new reform of `Umar ibn `Abd al-`Aziz declared the
equality between the Arab and non-Arab Muslim in Khurasan. As a result, a series of revolts broke out
in Iraq and also in Khurasan. One of the revolts was led by Yazid ibn al-Muhallab. This Yazid had
been imprisoned for debt by `Umar ibn `Abd al-`Aziz, because he was unable to pay off the statutory
fifth of the booty of his last campaign in Gurgan and Tabaristan, but, at the end of `Umar ibn `Abd al-
`Aziz's reign he was able to escape from his imprisonment in Aleppo and came to Basra. From there he
summoned South Arabian kinsmen, and many men from different tribes rallied around him. Tribesmen
from Bakr, Tamim and Qays were among Yazid's supporters. Some of the Syrian troops in Iraq also
sided with him. Yazid's movement gained more momentum when he was able to defeat `Adiyy ibn Art,
the governor of Basra, who personally fell into Yazid's hand.22

Yazid announced jihad against the Umayyads as the enemies of religion; Yazid's revolt was
against the expansionist policies which undertaken by al-Hajjaj and Qutaybah, and the use of Syrian
troops in Iraq. However, there is no clear-cut evidence in our sources to indicate that Yazid's revolt was
an attempt to supplant Umayyad rule by any other member of Bani Hashim, since he did not withdraw
his allegiance from Yazid ibn Abd al-Malik (Yazid II).23 Support was given neither by the tribesmen of
Khurasan nor even Yazid's own kinsmen, Azd, to Yazid's revolt. It is reported that Azdites co-operated
with the Tamimites to drive him from Khurasan.24 Yazid II sent his best general, Maslamah ibn `Abd
al-Malik to battle which took place on August 25, 720 A.H./102 A.D. near the village of al-Aqr between
Wasit and Kufa. The rebels were routed and Yazid ibn al-Muhallab himself killed. A new governor was
appointed to be in charge of Khurasan, Sa`id ibn abd al-`Aziz, who is said to be a weak and easy-going
man. A strong and far sighted governor was needed to rule over Khurasan, especially at this crucial
stage so that the arrival of Sa`id alarmed the Umayyad Government. As already mentioned, the
Umayyad policy in Khurasan did not envisage the possibility of their settling down; Merve was used
only as a winter camp and the rest of the year was spent active on the battlefield.

Marw as a part of the Sasanian empire, the social structure there was the Sasanian class system,
under which the local nobility, daqaqin, enjoyed a very privileged position. The process of assimilation
could hardly be achieved in these circumstances. Although some of the Iranians were converted, their
social status does not seem to have changed because they were not integrated into the Arab community.
The controlling class, daqaqin, still had their own privileges, and the assessment of taxation was in
their hands. The need for settlement for the Arab warriors, muqatilah, on the other hand, and the loss of
status for the local Iranian population on the other, created a menace of internal tension in Khurasan.
`Umar II's policy was aimed at integration of the two communities into one Muslim community,
encouraging settlement and stopping expeditions. Since this policy would have led to the accelerated
assimilation of the `Arab tribesmen in the Iranian population, and ultimately the power of daqaqin,
they adopted a negative step by encouraging the central government to direct the tribesmen towards
the battlefield.

22 M.A. Shaban, op. cit., p. 93.
Sa`id's policy does not deviate much from the policy of `Umar II for he stayed on the defensive. It is reported that although he crossed the oxus twice, he did not advance beyond Samarqand. This, of course was against the Umayyad policy and dahaqin's plans. Sa`id was replaced by other new governors, and eventually Nasr ibn Sayyar was appointed as a general governor of Khurasan during the time of Caliph Hisham. Although he belonged to the small tribe of Khurasan, he had a considerable following in Khurasan, and had the position of chief of Mudar in Khurasan.

The situation in Khurasan was affected by the factional tribal policy of the Umayyad Caliphs. By appointing Nasr ibn Sayyar as governor of Khurasan caliph Hisham was hoping to find a remedy for the serious situation there. Nasr's first action was to creat sub-governors all over Khurasan. The different sub-governors were accompanied by their own clans. Naturally, this plan was strongly opposed by the people of Khurasan who considered it an attempt to establish Arab rule rather than to settle their problems. A new fiscal reform was also introduced by Nasr in order to correct the abuses existing in the old system. Nasr noticed that the dahaqin were using their authority in the assessment and collection of taxes against the Muslims whose burdens of taxation were unjustly increased. He reclassified the kharaj (land tax) and put it in order, and then he assessed the tribute (jizyah) stipulated in the treaty of capitulation.

However, it was too late to reconcile the people to Umayyad rule. After the various experiments of the successive governors, the Arab settlers in Khurasan saw no hope in a complete change in the whole empire. Yusuf ibn `Umar, who was commissioned by Nasr ibn Sayyar to assess the system of taxation was aware of what was going on in the empire and tried to persuade the Caliph Hisham to dismiss Nasr ibn Sayyar. But the caliph continued to keep him in his governorship.

The situation in Khurasan changed after the death of caliph Hisham in 125/743. An apposition group appeared under the leadership of Ali al-Kirmani stationed at Masarjasan. Although Nasr ibn Sayyar won many Yamanites over and appointed them in administrative posts, `Ali al-Kirmani was able to defy his authority. A man of considerable prestige, Ali al-Kirmani is described by our sources as shaykh al-Arab. He commanded a considerable number of followers, mainly Yamanites. When he arrived at Masarjasan, he was joined by other tribesmen from the newcomers of Rabī`ah, Kindah and Mudar. In 126A.H./744A.D. Nasr ibn Sayyar succeeded in imprisoning Ali al-Kirmani and appointed Harb ibn `Amr al-Washiji leader of the Azd, but the latter was not able to cope with the task, and was replaced by Jamil ibn Mu`wan. Meanwhile `Ali al-Kirmani had escaped from prison through a canal with the help of one of his slaves.

It seems that the dismissal of `Ali al-Kirmani by Nasr had gravely alarmed the Arab tribesmen in Khurasan. The Yamanites and their allies the Rabī`aites as well as certain Mudarites joined `Ali al-Kirmani. `Ali al-Kirmani was subsequently recognized as governor of Khurasan by his followers and

25 Ibid., p. 1340.
26 Ibid., p. 1927.
on this occasion he naturally got rid of his rival al-Harith ibn Surayj whom he killed in 128 A.H./746 A.D., under Marwan II, the last of the Umayyad caliph. In 129 A.H./747 A.D., Nasr ibn Sayyar tried to enter Merv by sending successive expeditions from Nishapur, but all were defeated by `Ali al-Kirmani. Suddenly, Abu Muslim al-Khurasani appeared and openly sided with `Ali al-Kirmani, regarding the latter in opposition to the Umayyads.

Abu Muslim, `Abd al-Rahman ibn Muslim al-Khurasani, was one of the loyal Abbasid army commander who belonged to one of the extremist wings of the Shi`a. After proclaiming the revolt in 129 A.H./747 A.D. in the name of the al-rida min Al Muhammad, the Prophet's family who would be acceptable to all, and to establish the Holy Qur'an and the sunnah of the Prophet, Abu Muslim entrenched himself in the Khuzaite village of Safidhanj and sent da`is, propagandists, to the surrounding villages and cities to announce the battle cry of the revolt, and to rally the Abbasid partisans. Significantly, after a month or so he was joined by about 7000 men from Khurasan whose names and their villages registered in the diwan. This is one of the very obvious examples of Abbasid plan to eliminate tribal antagonism among their followers. On Thursday of Jumada II 130 A.H./14 February 748 A.D., Abu Muslim entered Merv and summoned his followers to pay allegiance in public to the Abbasids.

It was at this time that the Abbasid movement suffered a heavy blow through the death of its leader, Ibrahim al-Imam. The question arises as to whether Ibrahim al-Imam had in fact nominated his brother, Abu al-Abbas as his successor. According to a tradition in al-Tabari, the name of Bani al-Abbas was proclaimed when da`is unfurled the banners at the very beginning of the revolts; but the name of Imam was not mentioned. It is also reported in the same source that Ibrahim al-Imam had appointed Abu al-Abbas, Abdullah ibn Muhammad, as his successor shortly before his death. However, Abu Muslim is said to have paid homage to the sons of al-Abbas.

It is worth noting that Shi`ite concept is that the office of the Caliphate must be occupied by an imam, who by then had both secular and religious powers. The Khurasaniiyyah, the Abbasid supporters in Khurasan, envisaged a caliph with very limited religious and secular powers. Finally, the Khurasaniiyyah took matters in their own hands and forced the selection of the Abbasid, Abu al-Abbas al-Saffah as the new Caliph. The latter soon appointed Abu Salamah al-Khallal, the Shi`ite leader, as his wazir, chief minister, but with great anxiety, because it could only mean restrictions on his secular power. It is very easy to understand how the Abbasids were deviating from the Shi`ite perception of caliph.

27 Abu Muslim, `Abd al-Rahman ibn Muslim al-Khurasani was the disciple of the Shi`ite leader, al-Mughira ibn Sa`id. In the year 124/741 he joined the `Abbasid revolutionary movement led by Ibrahim al-Imam and became the most prominent `Abbasid military leader. For detail of the nature of the `Abbasid movement, especially the formative stages of this movement, see Akhbar al-Dawl ah al-`Abbasiiyyah or Akhbar al-`Abbas wa waladihi, anon, Beirut, 1971; B. Lewis, art. “`Abbasids”. Encyclopaedia of Islam, New Edition, Leiden, 1954; M.A. Shaban, op. cit., pp. 138-68.


30 Ibid., p. 42.
The title "al-Saffah", variously taken to mean "the blood thirsty" or "the generous" was used as regional title by Abu al-`Abbas himself - "It was assigned to him by later historians, whose sense of order and propriety that the first Abbasid, like all his successors, should have a regional title of some sort".\textsuperscript{31} Abu al-Abbas's power was very limited and such an assumed title would have added an undesirable shade to his power. The principle of the division of power between the caliph and wazir was certainly an innovation of the Revolution.\textsuperscript{32} When Abu al-`Abbas ordered Abu Muslim to be killed in 132A.H./750A.D., allegedly for attempting to bring about the replacement of the Abbasids by the Alids, it made clear the trends of the Abbasid and their betrayal of the principle. Abu Muslim, after the death of Abu Salamah was still considered an influential personage in the Abbasid house.

The battle of the banks of the Zab in 132A.H./750A.D. in which Marwan II was defeated sealed the fate of the Umayyad Caliphate. He fled to Syria where he tried to organize further resistance, but in vain. The Abbasid army led by `Abdullah ibn `Ali pursued Marwan II into Egypt where he was killed. The authority of the new Abbasid Caliphate was now established all over the Middle East.

Conclusion

In summing up, the social and political justice of Islam applied by the Caliph `Umar ibn `Abd al-`Aziz throughout his reign was exploited by the Abbasids to gain support from the people of Khurasan who were oppressed by the Umayyad rule and revolted. As a result, they succeeded in defying the Umayyads through revolution. The significance of the Abbasid Revolution can be seen clearly in the changes following its victory, mainly the complete assimilation of all members of the Muslim community, Arabs and non-Arabs into the empire. The transfer of the capital from Damascus to Baghdad had its significance namely the intersection of several trade-routes which could give real prosperity to the Abbasid Empire, and subsequently led to the remarkably rapid spread of Islam in the East, including the Malay Archipelago.

\footnote{B.Lewis, “The Regnal Title of the First ‘Abbasid Caliph”, in Dr. Zahir Hussain Presentation Volume, New Delhi, 1968, p. 15.}
\footnote{M.A. Shaban, op., cit., p. 167.}
Notes

7. Hephthalite (*hayatilah*) were the nomadic tribes of Iranian origin from Central Asia. They appeared for the first time in the 4th century among the armies of the later Kushans, helping them against the Aasanians. Soon they became the successors to Kushan.
27. Abu Muslim, `Abd al-Rahman ibn Muslim al-Khurasani was the disciple of the Shi`ite leader, Mughira ibn Sa`id. In the year 124/741 he joined the `Abbasid revolutionary movement led by Ibrahim al-Imam and became the most prominent `Abbasid military leader.
32. M.A. Shaban, *op. cit.*, p. 167
References


Dissociation of Women from Their Selves: Speech Designated as Sophrosyne

Arsev Ayşen Arslanoğlu Yıldırım
Artvin Çoruh University, Artvin, Turkey

Abstract

Since the ancient Greeks, sound production has been considered to be associated with the quality of voice and the use of voice under a general rubric of gender. Female voice has often been thought as an example of deviance from self-control; therefore, a pseudo need for putting a “door on the female mouth” has been constructed by the patriarchal culture. Masculinity in this culture defines itself by its different use of sound, namely the masculine virtue of sophrosyne or self-control. In this understanding, female virtue is coextensive with female obedience to male and the dissociation of women from their own emotions. Silence is seen to be the realm of women, which results in the construction of “otherness” of women’s language, since they are considered to lack the ability to control their speech. Under this condition, female words become some kind of lack of words and require to be channeled into rational discourse that belongs to men. In her essay “The Gender of Sound”, Anne Carson examines how our presumptions about gender affect the way we hear sounds and raises the question if “there might not be another idea of human order than repression. Related to and as an extension of this question, it will be questioned if it may become possible to construct narrative in the feminine in this paper. For this purpose, it will be focused on Carson’s “The Glass Essay” and the question if there is another human essence of self within the context of her views on this subject.

Keywords: gender, gender identity, gendered sounds, masculinities, femininities, Sophrosyne.
Since the ancient Greeks, sound production is evaluated through two elements: use of voice and quality of voice. Interestingly, these elements have also been considered sufficient to distinguish rational from irrational, logos from feeling. These two elements have a determining role in assigning reason to male and feeling to female because female voice and all that belong to female are seen to be deviance that should be kept under control. This stance requires two sides: one to control and the other to be controlled. Since it is male who has the capacity of self-control, he is the one to control female. Accepted as a being unable to control what she says, female may cause some leakages by saying things that should not exist or should not be expressed even if they exist; hence, it becomes a necessity to put a door on the female mouth in patriarchal society: “Putting a door on the female mouth has been an important project of patriarchal culture from antiquity to the present day. Its chief tactic is an ideological association of female sound with monstrosity, disorder and death (Carson “The Gender of Sound, 121). As an extension of this argumentation, the dichotomies such as male/female, rational discourse/irrational discourse, subject/object, active/passive just to name a few are constructed. My aim is to discuss the impasses of this approach and to argue that there may be another idea of human order which is not based on binary thought and which does not privilege either male or female. For this purpose, I will examine Anne Carson’s “The Glass Essay” within the framework of her another essay “The Gender of Sound” with a look at contemporary discussions which attempt at avoiding the shortcomings of binary thought specifically within the psychoanalytic field.

The conception of the feminine as the negative of the masculine lies behind the binary thought. The basic misunderstanding stemming from such a conception is the equation of the feminine to otherness. The feminine, who is supposed to belong to the category of absence, void and negativity, lacks the right for speech, which is a presence in itself. If the feminine is in the realm of absence and silence, then how can we conceptualize it? Besides this major question, how can we formulate female subjectivity if such a formulation is possible? Then, if we can avoid the dichotomies that dominate the culture of the masculine and the feminine, how can we construct another understanding or is it really necessary to replace one thought by another? If silence is the cosmos [good order] of women, how can we place women in the cosmos of the masculine or of logos considered to belong to the masculine?

At this point, I suggest using the theory of complexity the paradigm of which is defined by Edgar Morin (1986). What is stunning about the theory of complexity is that it provides new methods of searching for knowledge which can involve the complexity of the real. It is neither absolute nor totalizing; thus, it always includes uncertainty. Being multi-centered and plural, it rejects one focal explanation and existing binary thought. In her book Deconstructing the Feminine: Psychoanalysis, Gender and Complexity, Glocer Leticia explains the basic logic behind the theory of complexity:

The logic of complexity is not the simple, indifferent acceptance of a multiplicity of elements, but the way to make them work together, in collaboration and conflict at the same time. It means sustaining critical judgment as a way of maintaining the tensions and contradictions without eliminating any of their terms. (8)
Leticia continues her argument by taking attention to the points that “this logic is different from the coexistence of thing representations in the unconscious, where opposites are treated as identical, and representations coexist acritically (Freud, 1938)” (8). Depending on this idea, I will discuss if it may be possible to apply it to the psychoanalytic theories.

When Freudian theory is reviewed, it is seen that there is no primary femininity and the sexual theories are based on the opposition between the phallic and the castrated. Freudian theory argues that children conceive of one genital—phallus—so it sees the girls sexuality as primarily masculine (Freud “The Infantile Genital Organization: An Interpolation into the Theory of Sexuality, 141-145). When one turns her attention to another prominent figure, Jacques Lacan, she sees the claim that Freud could not make a formulation on the issue for historical reasons, but there is a cohesive framework and also development can be achieved by linguistic science. In the Freud that Lacan uses, neither the unconscious nor the sexuality can be pre-given facts, they are constructions. Juliet Mitchell summarizes how Lacan sees the project of psychoanalysis in her “Introduction” to Feminine Sexuality: “… psychoanalysis should not subscribe to ideas about how men or women do or should live as sexually differentiated beings, but instead it should analyze how they come to be such beings” (Lacan 3). Such an analysis requires that psychoanalysis traces the history of human subject in its generality (human history) and its particularity (specific human life). In her “Introduction” to Feminine Sexuality, Jacqueline Rose explains how and why Lacan’s account of subjectivity is always developed by reference to the idea of fiction and construction: “For Lacan, the unconscious undermines the subject from any position of certainty, from any relation of knowledge to his or her psychic processes and history, and simultaneously reveals the fictional nature of the sexual category to which every human subject is none the less assigned” (30).

Here, what is significant for us is the idea of fiction since it supports the claim that femininity and masculinity are indeed constructions that can be used to create a mental space of uncertainty to be explored. The exploration of uncertainty requires working through pre-historic, forgotten and wordless. Then comes the question: How can women explore the construction of femininity if they are prohibited from speech? The construction of femininity is made possible by language but it has been believed since the ancient Greeks that silence is the cosmos [good order] of women because what should be avoided is the female voice but why is it so bad to hear? Anne Carson takes attention to that female voice expresses nothing other than its own sound: “These words [a particular kind of shriek] do not signify anything except their own sound. To utter such cries is a specialized female function” (“The Gender of Sound” 125). This shows us that females are incapable of hiding what should be kept secret; in other words, their speech is far from rational discourse or logos (rationally articulated speech which differentiates male from female. Anne Carson’s description on the issue shows how effective and determining this condition is in the patriarchal society: “Woman is that creature who puts the inside on the outside. By projections and leakages of all kinds—somatic, vocal, emotional, sexual—females expose and expand what should be kept in. Females blurt out a direct translation of what should be formulated indirectly” (“The Gender of Sound” 129).

It is an expected but interesting situation how the axioms of ancient medical theories conform to this point of view. According to these axioms, a woman has two mouths—upper mouth
that utters inarticulated speech and lower mouth which is incapable of controlling ejaculation. As it is seen, both mouths are considered to lack continence or self-control (sophrosyne). It is the major task of the patriarchal culture to remove woman’s incontinence. Not only ancient medical theories undertook this task; psychoanalysis, at the beginning, tried to achieve the same task through hypnosis:

Freud and Breud find themselves able to drain off this pollution by inducing the women under hypnosis to speak unspeakable things. Hypnotized women produce some remarkable sounds. [...] But all are eventually channeled by the psychoanalyst into connected narrative and rational exegesis of their hysterical symptoms. Whereupon, both Freud and Breur claim, their symptoms disappear—cleansed by the simple kathartic ritual of draining off the bad sound of unspeakable things. (“The Gender of Sound” 134)

Anne Carson resembles the patriarchal society to a well-intentioned psychoanalyst to conceive its responsibility as the channeling of unspeakable things into appropriate containers. The patriarchal society takes up this responsibility to such a degree that even women themselves spend effort to provide the continuity of the system. In “The Glass Essay”, the narrator’s observation on her mother shows the reader the interiorized patriarchal view: “She never liked Law much/ but she liked the idea of me having a man and getting on with life” (3). Now it can be asked how feminine position can be defined when even women seem to accept the present order? Can it be talked about female subjectivity in collision? Another significant passage shows the power of this collision. Here what collide and the narrator’s and her mother's views:

You are saying women deserve to get raped
because Sears bathing suit ads
have high-cut legs? Ma, are you serious.
Well someone has to be responsible.
Why should women be responsible for male desire? My voice is high.
Oh, I see you are one of Them
One of Whom? My voice is very high. Mother vaults it. (22-23)

Female subjectivity is generally categorized as impossible to represent or is excluded from the symbolic. If one does not avoid the tautological understanding of the feminine, then it becomes a must to de-center and de-construct it. But this is not an easy task because the problem of avoiding the reduction that feminine can be represented by one certain dichotomy should be solved. What should first be taken into consideration is the relation among female, language and desire: “Language always “belongs” to another person. The human subject is created by a general law that comes to it from outside itself and through the speech of other people, though this speech in its turn must relate to the general Law” (Mitchell 5). It is worth mentioning here that the narrator’s lover in “The Glass Essay” is called Law. The essay as Anne Carson names it or the prose-poem as we may categorize not only shows the narrator’s relation with Law, which is about to end, but also her relation with the-general-law since woman’s relation to patriarchal society is paradoxical: On the one hand, she wants to set free; on the other hand, she does not want to leave the safe shore. The narrator’s evaluation of her relation which is over can well be used to exemplify this paradox: “When Law left I felt so bad I thought I would die/This is not uncommon” (The Glass Essay 8).
These lines can also be examined from a Lacanian perspective since Lacan states desire and sexual desire can only exist by virtue of its alienation within language. Jacqueline Rose mentions that “[t]he “I” with which we speak stands for our identity as subjects in language” (31) so the subject is indeed the subject of speech. When it is considered from this point of view, it is seen that there is a symbolic universe determined long ago. The major problem is how the subject can insert herself into this universe to become a subject. Since the beginning, pre-discourse and an incipient core of symbolization are said to coexist. The presence of one symbolic law in the framework of processes which produce subjectivity has long been examined. While Juliet Mitchell focuses on Sigmund Freud’s views on this issue (“To Freud, if psychoanalysis is phallocentric, it is because human order is patrocentric”, 25), Jacqueline Rose takes one step further and shows how all are related to language (“Language can only operate by designating an object in its absence. Lacan takes this further, and states that symbolization turns on the object as absence”, 32). I will relate Anne Carson’s exploration of female passivity to the concept of desire, which is closely associated with the binary opposition, presence vs. absence. So far I have attempted at developing my discussion in a way that will explain the relation among feminine, language and desire within the patriarchal society; from this point on, I will specifically focus on the Lacanian concept of desire.

As I have already mentioned, the subject is the subject of speech and thus subject to that order in the Lacanian thought. Language can only designate an object in its absence; that is, the signifier refers to an object but we do not know what it refers is actually present or not because the object itself is not there. Therefore, symbolization turns on the object as absence. Lacan claims that “language speaks the loss which lay behind that first moment of symbolization” (32). Before relating it to the problem of representing female desire, I would like to focus on what Lacan means by “desire”. Jacqueline Rose gives us a brief definition in her introduction to Feminine Sexuality: Demand always “bears on something other than the satisfaction which it calls for” (MP, p.80), and each time the demand of the child is answered by the satisfaction of its needs, so “this something other” is relegated to the place of original impossibility. Lacan terms this “desire”. It can be defined as the “remainder” of the subject, something which is left over, but which has no content as such. Desire functions much as the zero unit in the numerical chain—its place is both constitutive and empty. (32) When we review what we have said so far, we see that female, who is identified with silence, absence and passivity may well be evaluated as the object of desire because she is the one left over but is there really anything left over or does the feminine offer, like an oxymoron, representation of something that cannot be represented?

Here the key point is that feminine is always considered as a problem of the limits, which “dissemble and deconstruct unifying concepts by questioning certainties, absolute knowledge, rejection of diversity” (Leticia 50). Limits also involve the speech of the excluded and the inexpressible. Other is rooted in a configuration of the social discourse where “other” is women; on the other hand, the other is the archaic in the construction of subjectivity and the subject becomes identical to a “woman”, thus “other” when he loses sophrosyne. In “The Glass Essay”, the narrator’s father suffers from a kind of dementia, which has no known cause or cure. The tall, proud father, who was a second world war navigator, has turned into a person who uses “a language known only to himself made of snarls and syllables and wild appeals” (26). His condition reminds...
us the position of female whose speech lacks sophrosyne or self-control. He is “degraded” to the position of a woman in other terms. The hospital wing where he stays is for chronic patients. While the hospital workers call it “the golden wing”, the narrator's mother calls it “the last trap”. It is worth noting that what becomes the last trap for men when they lose sophrosyne is a chronic trap for women in the man's world.

As “other”, feminine is a dark continent; by othering feminine, a realm of mystery is created and strengthened by arguments on otherness. While considered something to avoid, feminine is paradoxically the object of desire. Yet, the field of desire results in woman's encounter with certain pitfalls due to its transgressive character: it is based on lack and presence at the same time. The only conversation between the narrator and Law, which is given to us, seems to reflect this paradox:

I don't want to be sexual with you, he said. Everything gets crazy.
But now he was looking at me.
Yes, I said as I began to remove my clothes.
Everything gets crazy. When nude
I turned my back because he likes the back.
He moved onto me. (11)

This is the last time they meet and it is a black September night. The night is like a dark continent where presence and absence, wish and refusal conflict each other. At a first glance, the concept of desire is considered negative because it is based on absence, lack and refusal. However, at a deeper analysis, a generative understanding may be developed if desire is seen productive. This may help us express singularities in the field of subjectivity without being restricted by strict gender assignments. In her book Eros the Bittersweet, Anne Carson points to the contradictory character of desire: “All our desires are contradictory, like the desire for food I want the person I love to love me. If he is, however, totally devoted to me he does not exist any longer and I cease to love him. And as long as he is not totally devoted to me he does not love me enough” (10). Maya Linden observes that “for Carson's women, sexual desire and self-destruction are presented akin to an addiction of 'pure contradiction'. As in almost all of her texts, “the woman is emotionally wounded by the man upon whose beauty and sexual intensity she is masochistically fixated” (230). The narrator’s relation with Law is no exception. Her fantasies after the ended relation are female nudes in disturbing states of annihilation. It is as if war and love, annihilation and presence are side by side not only in these fantasies but in actual people as well. At the end of “The Glass Essay”, the narrator sees a human body:

It was not my body, it was the body of us all.
It walked out of light. (38)

And we can rewrite the same lines as “it was not one specific female subjectivity in collision; it is the subjectivities of us all—be it female or male”. These lines can either be read in a reductive or in a generative way. For a generative reading, we should redefine how desire is understood: “Absence must be constituted. This means that the relation with the object is complex: it is invested and lost at the same time. [...] There is a disparity between an infinite demand and its necessarily and temporary satisfaction” (Leticia 103). How can we reach a positive result in such a complex
condition? What will help us is the fact that the conception of desire, which is not based on lack, does not exclude the existing dichotomies but offers new perspectives on the issue; and this is exactly the point that gives us chance to apply the theory of complexity.

As the theory of complexity “sustains non-synthesizing connections between two contradictory terms and thus proposes to sustain contradictions rather than overcome them” (Leticia 8), we can get complex and plural constructions out of these dichotomies. The critical question is how to relate these constructions to the symbolic thought or whether access to a symbolic universe becomes synonymous with access to universal subjection to phallic order if we do so. In order to avoid such an equality, we should reexamine and go beyond the description and justification of the relation between the symbolic order and the phallic order. If we cannot achieve doing so, the general-law-of-the-father becomes universal and women are placed outside the symbolic. Glocer Leticia mentions “desire in production, with its potential for generating difference, functions in relations of liasion and opposition with the equating conception of desire. And it enables us to think other ways to develop this concept in the field of the feminine” (106). What I question is whether desire in production may sustain a universal conception of women and if the process of access to subjectivity requires thinking through singularities and diversities. My thought exercise still continues since the contradictory character of the conception of desire makes it hard to answer them all at once. But my conclusion for now is that we do not have to choose one pattern and privilege it over the others to get quick answers. Let the questions float over the water and let us continue thinking on them!
References


